Journal of Hellenic Studies 141 (2021) 54–73 doi:10.1017/S0075426921000057

IMAGINARY PHRYGIANS: COGNITIVE CONSONANCE AND THE ASSUMED PHRYGIAN ORIGIN OF GREEK ECSTATIC CULTS AND MUSIC

YULIA USTINOVA
*Ben-Gurion University of the Negev**

Abstract: While Greeks called the ecstatic musical mode 'Phrygian', there is no evidence of high-arousal musical performances in Phrygia, and the musical characteristics of this mode were distinctively Greek. The image of wide-ranging excited celebrations practised in Phrygia seems to have existed only in the imagination of the Greeks and Romans. This paper suggests that the uneasiness felt by some Greeks facing high-arousal cults was assuaged by attributing them foreign origin, which was often fictitious. By culturally dissociating themselves from the ecstatic practices, the Greeks resolved the cognitive inconsistency between their self-perception as citizens of the decorous civilized world and their surrender to the irresistible allure of high-arousal cults and music. These false attitudes allowed cognitive consonance and attained the status of indubitable truth. Upheld throughout antiquity, they persuaded many modern scholars, who still mistakenly consider the Phrygian musical mode as an Oriental borrowing.

Keywords: Phrygian mode, ecstatic cults, Cybele, Magna Mater, cognitive consonance

I. Introduction

The notion that the Greeks 'took on [Phrygian] cults that were alluring and excitingly awesome, notably that of the Megale Meter'[1] is widespread in contemporary research. The great scholars of the early 20th century were convinced that ecstatic, savage and repulsive aspects of Greek cult, of which the rites of Cybele were the supreme incarnation, all arrived in Greece from the decadent amorphous Orient.[2] Although the Greeks succumbed to these cults, they were apparently adamant in their rejection of the Oriental rite of castration: 'repugnant to the Hellenic spirit'.[3] Nowadays this extreme version of Orientalism is difficult to find, and many researchers emphasize the lack of evidence on ecstatic rites in Hittite and early Phrygian materials.[4] However, if not the Hittites and the Phrygians, then the Thracians who migrated to Phrygia in the early first millennium BC are declared 'without doubt responsible for the orgiastic tendency in the Cybele cult'.[5] As to the origin of high-arousal music, most scholars adopt the Greek belief associating both the musical style and the instruments used by its performers with Phrygia.[6] Thus, Orientalist stereotypes still linger, and need to be reassessed.

In this paper, I will demonstrate that the ecstatic practices attributed to the Phrygians were developed by the Greeks and had almost nothing to do with Phrygia. My argument will consist of four points. I contend that there is no proof of ecstatic practices in the Phrygian cult of Meter; that there is no evidence of rapturous music in Phrygia; that musical instruments associated in Greece with ecstatic music were either indigenous to Greece or arrived there at a very early date from places other than Phrygia; and, finally, that musicological research has failed to find a fundamental difference between the Phrygian and the Greek modes. I suggest that the reason for the attribution

* yulia@bgu.ac.il. I am very grateful to the anonymous reviewers of this paper for their insightful comments, and to Carolyn Gross-Baruch for polishing my English.

[1] Levick (2013) 44.

[2] Cumont (1929) 45–47.

[3] Graillot (1912) 21; Versnel (1990) 107–08.

[4] Laroche (1960) 127; Naumann (1983) 38; Roller (1999) 20–22; Bøgh (2007) 310.

[5] Vermaseren (1977) 20.

[6] Thiemer (1979); West (1984) 219; (1992) 181; Comotti (1989) 18–20; Battezzato (2005); Munn (2006) 171; Griffith (2013) 24–25; Marek (2016) 110.

of ecstatic music and cults to foreign peoples ensued from the prejudice of Greek elites against these practices. Ancient experts who claimed that ecstatic rites and music were invented by the Phrygians convinced many modern researchers, for two reasons: our underestimation of the bias of ancient sources and the implicit perception of the Orient as non-rational and self-indulgent, still present in scholarship.

II. Phrygian Cybele and the Greek Megale Meter: whose cult was ecstatic?

Since the ecstatic elements in the Greek cult of Cybele the Mountain Mother are attributed to her Oriental origin, I will start with an examination of this assumption and reassess the evidence on the Asian predecessors of the goddess.

(a) The Hittite Kubaba, Phrygian Cybele and Lydian Kybebe

The Hittites were the immediate predecessors of the Phrygians in Asia Minor. High-arousal rites appear to have been marginal in the Hittite world, and are not attested to in the cult of Kubaba, a minor goddess of the Hittite pantheon,[7] who attained prominence as a patron of wild nature in the late Hittite period, at the beginning of the first millennium.[8] Only in Carchemish is there a stele representing Kubaba as the heavenly protector of the state featuring a procession of musicians, holding a tympanum, a horn and *auloi*.[9] This monument remains isolated, and may be attributed to the significant Mesopotamian influence evident in Carchemish. At any rate, the tympanum appears in the iconography of Cybele only in the late sixth to early fifth century in Ephesus.[10]

Judging by the archaeological evidence, the cult of the Mother Goddess was established in Phrygia by the eighth century, and spread to the western coast of Asia Minor.[11] In several Palaeo-Phrygian inscriptions on rock monuments associated with the goddess' cult, the word *matar,* meaning 'mother', occurs; in some it is accompanied by the word *kubileya*, interpreted as a divine epithet and regarded as deriving from a feature of the landscape, perhaps a mountain. Thus, *matar kubileya* was probably the Mountain Mother.[12] The connection between the names Kubaba/Kybebe and Cybele is questionable, and Kubaba and the Phrygian Mountain Mother differ in many respects.[13]

The Mountain Mother possessed several distinctive characteristics and she was the most prominent deity of the Phrygians. Constantly accompanied by predators, usually lions, conveying the idea of her power and control over nature, she was also the supreme patron of the state. Only in a few exceptional cases is the Mountain Mother depicted with human-like attendants; these are always male and smaller than her own image. It is unclear whether these are divine companions or mortal worshipers. Her sculptural monuments, altars and rock reliefs, often shaped as façades, were located in the mountains or near city gates,[14] and she was the only deity of the Phrygian pantheon who had anthropomorphic images.[15] Some of the dedications are addressed to her and the king, hinting at the possibility that the latter was honoured jointly with the goddess or served as her high priest.[16] Crucially, there is no evidence of either a divine consort of the Phrygian Mother or high-arousal rites associated with her cult.[17]

[7] Laroche (1960) 127; Naumann (1983) 38; de Martino (1995); Roller (1999) 114; Bryce (2002) 149; Borgeaud (1996) 5–6.

[8] Naumann (1983) 22, 36; Roller (1999) 44. All the dates in the paper are BC, unless indicated otherwise.

[9] Laroche (1960) 120; Naumann (1983) 28, 36.

[10] Naumann (1983) 136.

[11] Roller (1999) 19.

[12] Brixhe (1979); Borgeaud (1996) 6; Roller (1999) 65–68; Munn (2006) 74–76.

[13] Brixhe (1979) 45; Graf (1984) 119, considering Kybebe as an exclusively Lydian goddess; Sfameni Gasparro (1985) 3; Roller (1999) 42–53; Bøgh (2007) 315. Association of the names: Laroche (1960); Munn (2008).

[14] Roller (1999) 63–108.

[15] Naumann (1983) 39–91.

[16] Roller (1999) 111–12; Berndt-Ersöz (2006) 126–34; Munn (2006) 77.

[17] Naumann (1983) 39–91; Roller (1999) 114.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0075426921000057 Published online by Cambridge University Press

The earliest evidence of the existence of Attis, the goddess' consort, is dated to the fourth century and originates from Attica.[18] Cybele's most prominent sanctuary in Phrygia was at Pessinus, and the cult of Attis appeared there hundreds of years later than in Greece:[19] we may therefore assume that this cult moved from west to east. The title Ates, which in the early first millennium appears to have designated royal priests of the goddess, was probably transferred to the goddess' newly invented consort as a result of a misinterpretation by the Greeks.[20] The image of the emasculated Attis is a latecomer and a Greek creation, reflecting the Greek perception of the Phrygians as effeminate, rather than Phrygian cultic realities or iconography.[21]

In addition, there is no evidence of the tradition of eunuch priests, long regarded as the quintessential symbol of Oriental orgiastic frenzy, in Asia Minor before the Hellenistic period.[22] Self-castration became a dominant feature of the Magna Mater's cult only in Roman times.[23] The extent of self-lacerating, spinning dancing and transgender cultic practices in the Anatolian cult of Cybele is also obscure.[24] Thus, ecstatic elements in the cult of Cybele in Phrygia can be confirmed only for the Hellenistic period, many centuries later than the debut of the Phrygian goddess in Greece.

In Lydia, Kybebe was a local name for a Syro-Hittite goddess, attested by a graffito from Sardis that is dated to 600–570 and refers to *Kuvav*.[25] Although Kybebe was not the 'great goddess' of the city, she did possess a sanctuary there.[26] An Archaic temple model from Sardis represents the goddess holding a lion and flanked by two snakes, while the other sides of the model feature dancing women and men carrying wine bags.[27] The god Baki, Lydian Bacchus, is first attested in a dedication from 350, but his worship was probably much more ancient, although Greek influence cannot be excluded, given the increasing connections between Lydia and the Greeks.[28] Whatever the case may be, the iconography of the temple model attests to a cult visibly different from the Phrygian cult of the Mother, who was never portrayed with snakes or associated with dancing.[29]

In sum, the Hittite Kubaba may have been linked in some manner to the Phrygian Cybele and the Lydian Kybebe, but the three goddesses were far from being identical. Neither the Hittite nor the pre-Hellenistic Phrygian goddess appear to have been worshipped in orgiastic rituals and only the Lydian Kybebe was associated with wine drinking and dancing. The cults of the Phrygian Cybele and the Lydian Kybebe were quite distinct.

(b) The Greek Megale Meter and Cybele

Cybele arrived in Greece well before the sixth century, when evidence suggests that her cult was present across the entire Mediterranean area, from western Asia Minor to Massalia.[30] The earliest archaeological finds from Italy, most notably the Locrian inscription mentioning *Kubala*, are dated to the seventh century,[31] implying that the goddess came to the Greek cities of Asia Minor even

[18] Roller (1994); (1999) 114; Borgeaud (1996) 34.

[19] Roller (1994); (1999) 177–82; Lancelotti (2002) 42–49.

[20] Borgeaud (1996) 34; Roller (1999) 113; Lancelotti (2002) 32–52; Dubosson-Sbriglione (2018) 60.

[21] Roller (1994) 246; (1999) 237–59.

[22] Roller (1999) 228–29; Bøgh (2007) 323; Dubosson-Sbriglione (2018) 140–43.

[23] Roller (1999) 318.

[24] It is impossible to define when self-castration, in particular in ritual, began to be practised in Anatolia; the earliest clear evidence is from the third century: Lancelotti (2002) 48–49. If performed at all, self-castration in Anatolia seems to have been very limited and aimed at attaining chastity: Roller (1999) 252, 318, 324. For *Galloi* (eunuch priests of Cybele), their origin and assessment of different forms of self-abasement, see Lane (1996); Smith (1996); Alvar (2008) 246–61. For an analysis of the meagre evidence on ecstatic practices in the Anatolian cult of Cybele, see Roller (1999) 105; Taylor (2008).

[25] Hanfmann (1983) 92; *cf.* Hdt. 5.102; Hipponax 127 West.

[26] Hanfmann (1983) 91.

[27] Hanfmann (1983) 92, figs 150–52.

[28] Herodotus (5.102) calls the goddess of Sardis Cybele, and it is suggested that the Phrygian *Matar* was associated with Kybebe by the Lydians themselves and that her cult arrived in Sardis between 1100 and 700: Hanfmann (1983) 92; Munn (2008). Munn (2006) 120–29 assumes virtual identity of Cybele and Kybebe.

[29] Roller (1999) 46–53.

[30] Graf (1984).

[31] Guarducci (1970).

earlier.[32] Most common among the sixth-century testimonies are offerings in the form of a *naiskos*, featuring the sitting goddess, sometimes holding a lion, or reliefs portraying the goddess standing. Both iconographic types find parallels in Phrygia.[33] No symbols or attributes hinting at high-arousal cultic activities appear in the iconography of Cybele before the late sixth century, and they only became common in the fifth century, after over a hundred years of interaction between the Phrygian and Greek practices.

In Greece, Cybele merged with Rhea, the Mother of the Gods.[34] On Crete, the birth place of Zeus was identified as a cave, and the site, the Idaean cave, was a location of a ritual involving the use of tympana, cymbals and shields; all these objects executed in bronze during the Geometric period have been discovered there as offerings.[35] The Idaean cave, known already to Hesiod, seems once to have been the shrine of the Mother, who was gradually superseded by her great son.[36] The protectors of the infant Zeus, known as the Curetes, were also worshipped there, and in the *Catalogue of Women* the Cretan Curetes are called 'sportive dancers'.[37] Hence, the cult of the Mother on Crete was associated at a very early date with emphatically high-arousal rites, involving noisy rhythmic music and dancing.

The sixth-century *Homeric Hymn to the Mother of the Gods*,[38] not yet called Cybele, is remarkable, as it dedicates all of its six lines exclusively to the depiction of the soundscape pleasing to the goddess. The sounds are subdivided into two categories: natural noises, such as the cries of lions and wolves, as well as the echoes in the mountains; and noises produced by humans, namely the sounds of tambourines, pipes and rattles. If this hymn attests to the amalgamation of the traits of the Phrygian goddess and the Greek Mother of the Gods or Rhea, then the natural sounds are recognisably Phrygian, but the music belongs to the established Greek cultic tradition. I will return to this crucial testimony below.

Even in the fifth century, in his story of the tragic fate of Anacharsis, Herodotus attributed the nocturnal ritual that Anacharsis performed for the Mother of the Gods near Olbia Pontica to the Cyzikenes, and maintained that he was punished for an attempt to introduce a Hellenic rite to Scythia.[39] The goddess of this clearly ecstatic rite, which involved beating a tympanum, retained her Greek appellation. Meter was literally at home with the arch-conservative Pindar, who founded a sanctuary for Cybele and Pan in his own house and exalted this goddess in hymns listing the mind-altering attributes of her cult.[40] The link between Meter and the Corybantes and their frantic rites is no less conspicuous.[41] The ability of the goddess to invade the minds of mortals was articulated by the term *mētrolēptos*, 'possessed by the Mother'.[42]

The emphatically ecstatic traits of this goddess, such as nocturnal rites defined as *orgia* or *teletai* and association with Dionysus and ecstatic dancing, are noticeable in art and exemplified by the Ferrara krater featuring a goddess holding a lion and seated beside Dionysus.[43] In addition,

[32] Graf (1984) 120.

[33] Graf (1984) 117–18; on lions in the iconography of the Phrygian goddess, see Roller (1999) 85–86.

[34] I avoid using the term 'syncretism' as it is problematic; for a discussion of this, see Martin and Leopold (2008); Larson (2016) 326–27.

[35] Robertson (1996) 248, 252; Roller (1999) 173; Xagorari-Gleissner (2008) 12–16.

[36] Robertson (1996) 252; *cf.* Xagorari-Gleissner (2008) 54–68.

[37] Hes. *Cat. fr*. 10a, lines 17–19; Robertson (1996) 294. In Euripidean tragedy, tambourines and pipes are attributed to Rhea and Cybele: Eur. *Bacch*. 120–31; Roller (1999) 171.

[38] For this date, see Roller (1999) 123; Munn (2006) 96. For the assignment of the shorter Homeric hymns to the time span 700–500, see Janko (1982) 186–87; Faulkner (2011) 15.

[39] Hdt. 4.76; Vinogradov and Kryžickij (1995) 115; Robertson (1996) 282. In particular, the cult of the Mother of the Gods in Hylaea, where Anacharsis performed his ecstatic rites, is attested by a sixth-century ostracon from Olbia: *SEG* 42.710.

[40] Pind. *Dith*. 2, van der Weiden *fr*. 70B; *Pyth.* 3.77–79; *fr*. 80 Snell; Paus. 9.25.3; Henrichs (1976) 256.

[41] Ustinova (2018) 118–22.

[42] For example, Eur. *Hipp*. 141–44; on the term, see Hermias in Lucarini and Moreschini (2013) 91; on the terminology of possession, see Ustinova (2018) 3.

[43] Roller (1999) 152–56. *Attēs* was evocated by the members of the Dionysiac-Sabaziac ecstatic *thiasos* led by Aeschines' mother and mocked by Demosthenes:

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0075426921000057 Published online by Cambridge University Press

the Mother merged with Demeter, and both were attributed a predisposition for raucous music.[44] The association with Dionysus, Sabazius, the Corybantes and Demeter was probably conducive to the notion of Meter's own mystery initiations.[45]

In Greek literature, the name Cybele is first attested in the early fifth century.[46] Cybele's cult probably arrived in Greece directly from Phrygia, before the rise of the Lydian Mermnad dynasty in the seventh century made the dissemination of the Lydian cult of Kybebe feasible.[47] It does not seem probable that, when the Greeks came to the coast of Anatolia, they identified their Mother of the Gods with the Phrygian Cybele and the Lydian Kybebe, were struck by the likeness of these goddesses and started linking their own Mother with the indeterminate East,[48] as the early cult of Cybele does not reveal any recognizable Lydian traits. It was only in the fifth century that Cybele began to be associated with Lydia alongside Phrygia,[49] but Phrygia incomparably prevailed as Cybele's homeland throughout antiquity.

In summary, early (seventh to early sixth century) monuments of the Greek cult of Cybele indicate her Phrygian connections; association with the Lydian Kybebe was rarely mentioned, and even then, only at a much later date. Proof of orgiastic rites in the Phrygian cult of Cybele is minimal or non-existent.[50] In fact, many elements in the divine personality of Classical Cybele were probably Greek. In Greece, Cybele merged with Rhea the Mother of the Gods, whose cult involved high-arousal rites[51] and who often appeared along with ecstatic Bacchic and Corybantic practices.

III. 'Ecstatic' musical instruments in Greece

Ecstatic rites were routinely associated with *auloi* (pipes, sometimes inaccurately called double flutes) and percussion instruments, such as clappers, cymbals (*krotala*) and tambourines (*tumpana*). Quite remarkably, these instruments have been regarded constantly as Phrygian, by both ancient and modern authors. However, the evidence for this identification is deficient, and the concept appears to be based on later, post-Classical views.

(a) *Auloi*

The rich sound produced by the *aulos* is similar to the human voice,[52] and therefore this instrument was considered to have magical effects on humans and animals,[53] and was referred to in conjunction with ecstatic rites.[54] More than any other instrument, *auloi* were believed to be enchanting; the verb *kataulein* means simply 'to cast a spell' and the instrument was considered especially dangerous in the hands of an accomplished musician.[55] A scene in Plutarch's *Quaestiones Convivales* demonstrates the mixture of fear and disgust instilled by a talented *aulos*-player[56] in the Greek Puritans, who were shocked by the view of the listeners wishing to be 'piped down' (*kataulein*) by the thrilling music and abandoning themselves to lascivious dancing; the author defines the state of mind of these effeminate revellers as *mania*.[57]

Dem. 18.259–60; Jeanmaire (1970) 94–97; Versnel (1990) 114–15; Borgeaud (1996) 26; Ustinova (2018) 118–22.

[44] Pind. *Isthm.* 7.3–4; Eur. *Hel.* 1301–65; Borgeaud (1996) 18–20; Roller (1999) 174–75; Munn (2006) 56.

[45] Roller (1999) 164, 182.

[46] For example, Simon. *Anth. Graec.* 6.217; Pind. *fr.* 80 Snell; Ar. *Av.* 877; Eur. *Bacch.* 78; Henrichs (1976) 253; Naumann (1983) 17; Munn (2006) 73.

[47] Graf (1984) 120; Roller (1999) 138–39.

[48] Robertson (1996) 303.

[49] For example, Eur. *Bacch.* 55–60; Charon of Lampsacus, *FGrH* 262 F5; Roller (1999) 12, 127.

[50] Roller (1999) 114; Taylor (2008). Crucially, the Phrygian Mother had no divine Attis-like consort: Borgeaud (1996) 34.

[51] Naumann (1983) 136; Robertson (1996) 248, 252.

[52] Arist. [*Pr.*] 19.43; Pl. *Resp.* 399d; Carastro (2006) 122. On various types of *auloi* and the art of the *aulētēs* (*aulos*-player), see Ath. 174F–85A, 633E–36F.

[53] Plut. *Mor.* 704E–05A; Carastro (2006) 127.

[54] Bélis (1986b) 40.

[55] Hoffmann (1997) 29; West (2000) 254; Wallace (2015) 26.

[56] Barker (2018a) 251.

[57] Plut. *Mor.* 704C–06E; Barker (2018a).

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0075426921000057 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Written sources attribute the invention of all *auloi* to the Phrygians.[58] In particular, *auloi* with pipes of unequal length, called *elumoi auloi* and considered Phrygian *par excellence*, were reserved exclusively for the rites of Cybele, Rhea and Dionysus.[59] However, it would be a mistake to assume that *auloi*[60] arrived in Greece from Phrygia or any other foreign country, as they were known in the Aegean from prehistory. A Cycladic statuette of an *auloi* player from Keros is dated to 2200–2000.[61] The procession depicted on the famous sarcophagus from Hagia Triada (*ca*. 1400) features a musician playing two long pipes, the left-hand pipe curving upward.[62] Paradoxically, this instrument, closely resembling the *elumoi auloi* that were regarded as Phrygian in the fifth century, is one of the earliest pipes found in the Aegean.

There is no Mycenaean evidence of *auloi*.[63] *Auloi* are mentioned in Homer, where the word designates tubes of uncertain type, but in two instances only does it refer to musical instruments.[64] *Auloi* and *suringes* (pan pipes) are, however, mentioned in the Hesiodic *Shield of Heracles*.[65] In Attic art *auloi* appear towards the end of the eighth century.[66] An eighth-century bronze vase from Idalion (Cyprus) features an *aulos* together with a lyre and a tambourine.[67] The sophisticated early *aulos* implies a long history of development,[68] and therefore this instrument must have been known to the Greeks well before the eighth century, notwithstanding the gap of the Dark Ages. Thus, it is quite clear that the *auloi* could not have been 'invented' by the Phrygians.

In addition to the misrepresentation of its origin, the perception of the actual use of the *aulos* was also distorted. Although the *aulos* was often associated with Dionysiac rites and high arousal, this connection was not exclusive, and pipes could be used in various situations.[69] Obviously, these instruments were quite prominent in theatrical performances and lamentations, with their Bacchic and chthonic associations and an emphasis on the expression of strong emotions.[70] The reference to *auloi* accompanying a male choral dance in the *Iliad* and the depiction of an *aulētēs* (*aulos* player) accompanying a round dance on an eighth-century Attic vase attest to the use of this instrument in respectable male activities.[71] From the Archaic period, pipers marched into battle together with soldiers and *triēraulētai* were employed on battleships to set the rowing rhythm; athletes exercised in the gymanasia to the sound of *auloi*.[72] Any other activity requiring rhythmical action could be accompanied by the pipes.[73] *Auloi* were also used in solemn rites performed for Athena, Apollo and other gods.[74] As to the iconography of the performers, it is usually easy to distinguish between the *aulos*-players solemnly moving in sacrificial processions or performing in contests[75] and mischievous satyrs or maenads, who are unquestionably Bacchic.

[58] *Marm. Par.* 19–21; Plut. *Mor.* 1132F, 1133D–F (deriving from Aristoxenus and Heraclitus); Ath. 625E–F; Bélis (1986b) 37–39. An alternative, and rare, version connects the *aulos* to Libya and looks like a nomad myth: Barker (2018b). In any case, all *auloi* were considered foreign inventions.

[59] Ath. 181F; Anderson (1966) 8; (1994) 17; Bélis (1986b) 34; Barker (1989) 1.267; West (1992) 91–92.

[60] Anderson (1966) 22–25; West (1992) 81–122; Landels (1999) 24–46; Zschätzsch (2002) 1–14, 18–20, 44–61.

[61] Anderson (1994) 18, fig. 15; Landels (1999) 25; Brand (2000) 15–16, pl. 1.2.

[62] Anderson (1966) 8; (1994) 17; Bélis (1986b) 34; see also West (1992) 91–92.

[63] West (1992) 82; Bundrick (2005) 34.

[64] Hom. *Il.* 10.13, 18.495; for a discussion of the word, see Gerhard (1955). In *Il*. 17.297 and *Od*. 19.227 the word does not refer to musical instruments (Gerhard (1955) 1557; Brand (2000) 60) and the reference in *Il.* 10.13 may also be problematic (Anderson (1994) 32–33).

[65] [*Sc*.] 270–85.

[66] Gerhard (1955) 1556; Anderson (1994) 34–35; Brand (2000) 59–60, fig. 4.

[67] Gerhard (1955) 1556.

[68] Anderson (1994) 25.

[69] Anderson (1994) 35; Pirenne-Delforge and Papadopoulou (2001); Franklin (2011) 122.

[70] Wilson (1999) 76–80.

[71] *Il*. 18.495; Brand (2000) 59–60, fig. 4.

[72] Ath. 627D; Hdt. 1.17; Thuc. 5.70; Bélis (1999) 75–79; Landels (1999) 8, fig. 1.6; Martin (2003) 171–73.

[73] West (1992) 28.

[74] Wilson (1999) 69–85; Pirenne-Delforge and Papadopoulou (2001).

[75] For example, Zschätzsch (2002) 46 pl. 5, 182 pl. 17.2.

Written evidence, however, refers as a rule to *aulos* music as instilling the audience with *enthusiasmos*. To cite the most eminent examples, in Plato's *Symposium* Marsyas' (that is, foreign) piping singularly 'induces the state of possession' and Socrates is depicted as being as enchanting with his words as the ultimate *aulētēs* is with his *aulos*.[76] In the *Republic*, the *aulos* and other 'panharmonic' instruments are proscribed, but Plato stops short of forbidding the Phrygian mode, mistakenly, according to Aristotle.[77] The tension between the serene Athena who rejected the *aulos* and the semi-bestial Marsyas, obsessed with this instrument, is best embodied in Myron's *Athena and Marsyas* (457–47): the upsetting instrument is discarded from the Acropolis.[78] In the words of Peter Wilson, 'the *aulos* was a danger: it threatened self-control; it marred the aesthetics of the body; it introduced the allure of the alien'.[79]

Aulos-players in Athens were represented predominantly as marginal, foreigners, women or slaves.[80] Another artistic profession may serve as an analogy: many potters and painters were slaves or metics and bore non-Greek names, but no one would argue that, because of this, Greek vase production was developed predominantly by foreigners or that images of sirens and sphinxes on Corinthian pottery make the vases 'Oriental' rather than Greek, being decorated with some Oriental motifs. Thus, the considerable proportion of 'barbarians' among *aulos*-players and the myths on the Phrygian origin of the first pipers, to be discussed shortly, cannot be considered as evidence that the instrument arrived in Greece from Phrygia. The perception of the *aulos* was a matter of class and fear of loss of control: within democratic Athenian society, the conservative minority cultivated an aversion to this instrument.[81] However, even those who did not reject the pipes in principle perceived it through the prism of the inherited cultural bias.

In summary, the perception of *auloi* as exclusively ecstatic and Oriental did not reflect real knowledge of its origin or acquaintance with its actual use. The instrument was known in Greece for centuries, but still considered as Phrygian. Notwithstanding the versatility of the *auloi*, the psychagogic quality of pipe music was dominant in the cultural image of this instrument. Thus, the *aulos* provoked a twofold bias, in respect to both its origin and function.

(b) Percussion instruments

Percussion instruments were rarely used in Greek vocal or instrumental music. They were symbolic of foreign ecstatic rites and remained there almost exclusively.[82] The tambourine became Cybele's attribute and appeared on innumerable objects featuring the goddess or ceremonies in her honour.[83] It was even mentioned in the *sumbolon* of the Metroac initiations: 'I ate from the *tumpanon*, I drank from the cymbal, I carried the *kernos*, I stole into the inner chamber'.[84] *Tumpana* and *krotala* were also prominent in Dionysiac imagery. The Corybantes and Sabazius belonged to the same group of divine beings whose rites included unequivocal ecstatic experiences and whose cults involved the use of percussion instruments.[85] The only deity who was not involved in ecstatic initiations but was still represented with a *tumpanon* was Aphrodite,[86] for two apparent reasons: she was Oriental, and notorious for her ability to visit *mania* upon unsuspecting humans.[87]

[76] Pl. *Symp.* 215BC; Wilson (1999) 90–91.

[77] Pl. *Resp.* 399a–d; Arist. *Pol.* 1342a30; Moutsopoulos (1959) 68–73.

[78] Arist. *Pol.* 1341b; Leclercq-Neveu (1989); Wilson (1999) 60–62.

[79] Wilson (1999) 58.

[80] [Plut.] *Mor*. 1132A–37C; Ath. 624B; Barker (1989) 1.50; Bélis (1999) 42–44, 73–74; Wilson (1999) 74. On *aulētrides* (female *aulos*-players) at the symposium, see Davidson (1997) 81–82; Lynch (2018). The attitude of the Athenian elite to *aulos*-players is conveyed in a condensed form in the anecdote on Antisthenes: Plut. *Per.* 1; *cf.* Ath. 337E, 624B.

[81] Martin (2003).

[82] West (1984) 124; (1992) 123; Menier (2001) 236; Graf and Johnston (2007) 146.

[83] Pind. Maehler *fr*. 70b; West (1992) 124; in art, see Bundrick (2005) 47–48.

[84] Clem. Al. *Protr.* 2.15; Firm. Mat. 18.1; *cf.* Eus. *Praep. evang.* 2.3.18; Schol. Pl. *Gorg.* 497C.

[85] Ustinova (2018) 118–26, 134.

[86] West (1992) 122; Zschätzsch (2002) 75–77.

[87] On passionate love as madness, see Ustinova (2018) 298–302; on Oriental associations, see Burkert

Yet it was in Ionia that Cybele was first represented with a tambourine.[88] A marble statuette from Ephesus dated to the late sixth to early fifth century shows a tambourine near the seated goddess' knee.[89] This instrument occurs on sixth-century representations of Cybele from Apollonia Pontica and Thasos,[90] and became common in the mid-fifth century.[91] The word *tumpanon* is first attested in the sixth-century *Homeric Hymn to the Mother of the Gods.*

While later authors attributed howling and making noise with tambourines and cymbals to the Phrygians, the early literary evidence (cited above) attests to the Greek practice of ecstatic music-making. Bronze cymbals existed in Minoan Crete; they probably arrived in Greece from Mesopotamia and are often mentioned together with drums.[92] The earliest depiction of the *tumpanon* in Greek art is on an eighth-century bronze disc from Crete.[93] The objects held by two men seated opposite *phorminx*-players on Geometric vases belonging to the so-called 'rattle group' are presumably *rhomboi*, which produce a roaring vibrato sound, and so it is evident that instruments accentuating rhythm were known in Greece at an early date.[94]

Percussion instruments are attested also throughout the ancient Middle East, although the interpretation of words designating such objects as musical instruments is often controversial.[95] In Istanuwa, an area in southwestern Anatolia, a number of Bronze Age (14th-century) Luwian texts describe a festival during which a group of people designated as the Men of Lallupiya first beat a musical instrument called a *huhupal*, interpreted as either a drum or a metallic cymbal, and then drank from it, while the head of the group sang 'like a woman'.[96] Drums were conspicuous in Mesopotamian rituals, beginning from Sumerian times, and tambourines are well attested in Mesopotamian art.[97]

Paradoxically, tambourines and other percussion instruments are not found in the Phrygian evidence.[98] Given the wide distribution of percussion instruments elsewhere in the Near East, this strongly suggests that the Phrygians did not employ them, at least not in their state-supported cult of the Mountain Mother. The absence of percussion instruments from the homeland of Cybele demonstrates that the connection of the goddess to her dominant attribute happened elsewhere, presumably in Greece.

To recapitulate, *auloi* and percussion instruments were well known in the Aegean, in Greece in particular, centuries before the arrival of Cybele in this area, and their attribution to the Phrygians is contradicted by both the archaeological and written evidence.

IV. The Phrygian mode

(a) Ecstatic music in Phrygia?

Music is a more effective tool than language for arousing emotional states.[99] Sound brings about physical sensations and creates an impetus towards moving, and audial performance is often accompanied by dancing, which amplifies its impact. Music, singing and dancing are time-honoured techniques that serve to manipulate consciousness around the globe.[100] The power of

(1985) 152–56; Pirenne-Delforge (2010) 10–12. In addition, Aphrodite was identified with Kybebe in Phrygia and Lydia: Charon *FGrH* 262 F5).

[88] Naumann (1983) 136.

[89] Naumann (1983) no. 64.

[90] Alexandrescu Vianu (1980) 262–63; Naumann (1983) 136; Chiekova (2008) 145.

[91] Naumann (1983) 139.

[92] West (1992) 125.

[93] Roller (1999) 173.

[94] Brand (2000) 60, pl. 5.1.

[95] Taylor (2008) 177; Gabbay (2014); Mirelman (2014) 148.

[96] On percussion instruments of the Hittites, see de Martino (1995) 2662. Taylor (2008) 175–76 suggests a continuity between Bronze Age Luwian and Graeco-Roman rites, but does not indicate a way to bridge the chronological and geographical voids. On *huhupal*, see Güterbock (1995).

[97] Franklin (2008) 193; Gabbay (2014) 134; Mirelman (2014).

[98] Naumann (1983) 79; Roller (1999) 110, 139, 148; Berndt-Ersöz (2006) 169, 172; Bøgh (2007) 316–17.

[99] Levitin (2006) 191, 267.

[100] Rouget (1990); Jourdain (1997) 309–24; Fachner (2011); Scherer and Coutinho (2013).

music to induce *mania* was common knowledge in Greece,[101] and therefore the prominence of music in ancient and modern discussions of ecstatic cults comes as no surprise. Usually, high-arousal rites were considered to be accompanied, and their peak moments brought about, by Phrygian music. However, although Phrygian sources on music are very different from the Greek materials, the extant evidence plainly contradicts the supposition that Greek ecstatic music originated from Phrygia.

As we have just seen, percussion instruments are not attested in Phrygia, archaeologically or iconographically, before the period of intensive contact with the Greek world, beginning from the eighth century. Double pipes are depicted on objects from a few Neo-Hittite sites, but they are quite rare in Anatolian art.[102] A pipe is represented on an early sixth-century statue of the Phrygian Mother from the citadel of Hattusa (modern Boğazköy) depicting a goddess, supposedly the Mountain Mother, flanked by two small figures of young beardless musicians, holding a pipe and a lyre.[103] As Friederike Naumann observes, the pipes in conjunction with the lyre were instruments of harmonious, rather than ecstatic music.[104] One may even venture a conjecture that this monument might reflect Greek influence on the Phrygians.[105] In fact, there is no internal evidence of ecstatic musical performances in Phrygia.[106]

(b) Phrygian mode in Greece

Despite the lack of evidence, ancient Greek laymen constantly associated ecstatic music with Phrygia, and experts regarded the musical style labelled Phrygian as instilling frenzy in the audience. It is unclear what exactly different authors mean when they used the terms 'Phrygian *tropos*' or 'Phrygian *harmonia*', since the history of Greek musical modes and their evolution remains obscure and controversial.

Ancient writers subdivided musical styles according to scales, progressions of notes and intervals arranged in a set order. In the fifth and fourth centuries, these patterns were articulated as *tropoi* or *harmoniai*, and are usually called modes in contemporary research on ancient culture.[107] Each mode was associated with different Greek or foreign people, and, in the Classical period, modes were very often simply designated with descriptors, such as *dōristi* (in the Doric manner) or *phrygisti* (in the Phrygian manner), that underscored the ethnic connotations of the *tropoi*.[108]

This classification evolved gradually. In the Archaic period, a traditional melodic pattern was called *nomos*, 'an epitome of stylised song'.[109] Other terms were also used, for instance the 'Phrygian melody', *Phrugion melos*, was familiar to Alcman and Stesichorus, which implies that the association of a particular musical style or styles with Phrygia was current in the seventh century.[110] The word *harmonia* was first employed in the sixth century, but a systematic classification of scales was put forward only in the fifth century, probably by the Athenian Damon, who is tradi-

[101] Aesch. Radt *TGF fr*. 57; Eur. *Bacch.* 125–35; Arist. *Pol.* 1342a–b; Theophr. Wehrli *frs* 87, 88; Iambl. *Myst.* 3.9.

[102] de Martino (1995) 2662; Roller (1999) 110.

[103] Naumann (1983) pl. 7.1; Roller (1999) fig. 10; Bøgh (2007) 323.

[104] Naumann (1983) 79–80; Roller (1999) 119; Bøgh (2007) 329.

[105] Vermaseren (1977) 20.

[106] Naumann (1983) 79–80; Roller (1999) 110. The assertion of Berndt-Ersöz (2015) that the Phrygians conducted noise rituals rests entirely on the later Greek attribution of such rituals to the Phrygians. The paucity of early Phrygian archaeological evidence on musical practices is in marked contrast to the wealth of sources elsewhere in the Near East, in particular in Mesopotamia. The publication of cuneiform musical tablets and the abundant archaeological data sustain the research on Graeco-Mesopotamian musical interaction and even the relatively sparse Lydian material allows cautious reconstructions of Graeco-Lydian musical contacts (Franklin (2008)), but only dramatic changes in the state of the sources can substantiate the idea of considerable Phrygian impact on Greek music.

[107] Winnington-Ingram (1936); Barker (1989) 1.163–68, 2.14–17; West (1992) 177–89; Landels (1999) 95–109. This term has quite a different meaning in modern Western music; as a consequence, some scholars shun it, for instance Bélis (2003) 172.

[108] Bélis (2003) 173.

[109] Winnington-Ingram (1936) 81.

[110] Page, *PMG* 126, 35; West (1992) 177.

tionally attributed the systematization of six *harmoniai*.[111] The 'basic triad' included the Dorian, Lydian and Phrygian scales.[112] In later Classical literature references to *harmoniai* become quite common, and the most important source on the subject is the tract *Elements of Harmonics* by Aristotle's disciple Aristoxenus, which has survived in extensive quotations.[113] Due to Aristoxenus and his follower Cleoneides, the sequences of intervals constituting the Greek scales are known to us.[114] However, as M.L. West points out, 'no doubt there were other differential characteristics that do not appear from the bare scales', such as distinct types of rhythm and melody.[115] Modes were not confined to particular genres: for instance, the Dorian *harmonia* could be used in processionals, paeans and love songs, and the Lydian mode occurred in sympotic singing, celebratory odes and tragedy. The Phrygian mode was characteristic of dithyramb and tragedy,[116] that is, music associated with Dionysus, 'the mad (*mainomenos*) god'.[117] In post-Classical times, *harmoniai* were replaced with *tonoi* (keys or pitches), with the ensuing emphasis on scale only, disregarding the distinction of melody, ambitus and other features.[118] Thus, the same ethnic names, or their variations, seem to have been used initially for melodic structures, later for species of scales combined with additional characteristics and, finally, for keys.[119] Notwithstanding the ongoing controversy about many details, one conclusion is fairly clear: there was no inherent gap between different scales; they were compatible and belonged to the same musical tradition.[120]

Some ancient musicologists emphasize this point. In his tract *On Music*, Heracleides of Pontus claims that 'the Phrygian *harmonia* should not be referred to as Phrygian any more than Lydian; for there are three scales, inasmuch as there are three types of Greeks: Dorians, Aeolians, and Ionians'.[121] In contrast, myths attribute the invention of the Phrygian *harmonia* to the Phrygians, the satyr Marsyas and his father or teacher Hyagnis, whereas the auletic nome, a ritual solo for the *aulos*, is ascribed to Olympus, the disciple of Marsyas.[122] Another version attributes such music to Marsyas himself.[123] Several authors credit Athena with either inventing or finding the *aulos*.[124] Athenaeus insists that the Phrygian and Lydian scales 'originated with the barbarians'. He also maintains that the Phrygians who accompanied Pelops taught their pipe music to the Greeks and were, according to Telestes of Selinus, 'the first to sing a Phrygian tune in honour of the Mountain Mother'; these tunes (*nomoi*) were played on Phrygian *auloi*.[125]

It is unclear how much educated Greeks believed in the literal meaning of these myths, and we can only speculate whether Aristoxenus, who attributes the invention of the Phrygian scale to Hyagnis of Phrygia,[126] or Plato's Alcibiades, who mentions the pipe-playing of Olympus, the disciple of Marsyas,[127] regarded all these personages as historical figures; nonetheless, they cite these myths as indicating that the Phrygian mode actually arrived from Phrygia. In addition to myths, Athenaeus observes that 'the Phrygians invented and developed this scale, which is why the pipe-players in Greece are Phrygians or have names appropriate for slaves'.[128] In short, from the point of view of educated Greeks, a certain musical style, its performers and the instruments they used all came from Phrygia.

[111] Barker (1989) 2.431; West (1992) 174; Wallace (2015) 5.

[112] West (1981) 118.

[113] For a commentary and English translation, see Barker (1989) 2.119–89; see also Bélis (1986a).

[114] Landels (1999) 96–99.

[115] West (1992) 178.

[116] Arist. *Pol.* 1342b; West (1992) 180–82; Anderson (1994) 121.

[117] Hom. *Il.* 6.132; Ustinova (2018) 169.

[118] West (1992) 185.

[119] Landels (1999) 98.

[120] Lasserre (1954) 38–40; West (1981) 118, 126; (1984) 219; Anderson (1994) 49; Landels (1999) 102–03; Menier (2001) 238.

[121] Wehrli *fr*. 163; cited in Ath. 624C.

[122] *Marm. Par.* 19–21; Pl. *Symp.* 215BC; *Minos* 318B; [Plut.] *Mor.* 1134F–35A, 1136C, 1141B; Ath. 624B; Barker (1989) 1.210; Leclercq-Neveu (1989) 153–59; Landels (1999).

[123] Paus. 10.30.8–9.

[124] Pind. *Pyth*. 12.18–27; Plut. *Mor*. 456B–C; Leclercq-Neveu (1989) 254.

[125] Ath. 625E–F, *PMG* 810, tr. Olson (2011); Paus. 10.30.9; Robertson (1996) 295–96; Bélis (1986a) 29.

[126] Ath. 624B Wehrli *fr.* 78.

[127] Pl. *Symp.* 215b–c.

[128] Ath. 624B, tr. Olson (2011).

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0075426921000057 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Modern scholarship struggles to bridge the gap between the congruity of Greek musical modes and the ethnic connotations of their names, in particular the Phrygian *harmonia*. West supposes that the Phrygian mode received its name due to the 'superficial resemblance' of the essentially Greek mode to the Phrygian style of music, and because the instruments and the performers came from abroad: the first pipers were indeed, in his opinion, Phrygians.[129] Giovanni Comotti assumes 'the presence *ab antiquo* in Greece of auletic melodies of Phrygian origin'.[130] J.G. Landels is more cautious: in his opinion, there must have been 'some recognizable connection' between the ethnic names and the species of the octave.[131] Admitting that 'music composed in the Lydian or Phrygian *harmonia* may well have sounded in some way "eastern" or foreign to the Greek ear', he notes that the Chorus in the *Bacchae* have to remind the audience that it sings in a foreign mode, which probably indicates that its stylistic characteristic were not easily discernible. Thus, 'it could be argued … that Greek music in the Lydian *harmonia* was no closer to genuine Lydian music than Tchaikovsky's Arab Dance … is to genuine Arabic music'. It was simply Greek music 'with a Lydian flavour'.[132] W.D. Anderson supposes that the Phrygian and Lydian modes were developed by the Greeks, specifically by Aeolians who established their new homes in Phrygia and Ionians in Lydia.[133] In any event, due to the nature of the extant sources, the characteristics of the Phrygian 'flavour' and its connection to actual Phrygian musical practices remain obscure.

As to the large number of Phrygians among the pipers: this is not surprising. Apparently, pipe music, generally considered less respectable than cithara recitals, was performed often by slaves, barbarians and even women of dubious behaviour.[134] However, Phrygian musicians did not necessarily use their traditional styles or techniques in performances for the Greek public. Even if some exotic elements in basically Greek pieces were discerned by sensitive ears and perceived as Phrygian, it was not this admixture that turned dignified melodies into the rapturous tunes that are usually described as Phrygian. Given the inconsistency between the myth and the extant evidence on both Greek and Phrygian music, mythical tradition is open to debate. Could these myths be aetiological? That is, could they have evolved as an explanation of, rather than being the reason for, the association of a Greek musical style with a barbarian name?

The emotional, educational and social connotations of music attracted much more attention from the Greek authors than purely musical characteristics. Damon developed the ethos theory, investigating how different kinds of music influenced the mood and emotions, and this part of his research supposedly attracted the particular interest of his pupil, Pericles.[135] This manner of thinking probably originated before Damon; in any case, according to ancient tradition, the Pythagoreans and the Platonists associated musical modes with ethos, attributing particular ways of affecting the soul and body to each style.[136] Very similar anecdotes told of Damon and Pythagoras[137] suggest that these thinkers held the conviction that the Phrygian mode induced madness: when a wise man, either Pythagoras or Damon, saw young people behaving madly, incited by a Phrygian tune, he told them to switch to the Dorian mode, and they immediately ceased their improper behaviour. Even if fictional, this story underscores the moral contrast between the two modes: Dorian was respected as noble; Phrygian was maddening and indecorous.[138]

[129] West (1984) 219; Marek (2016) 110.
[130] Comotti (1989) 18, 20.
[131] Landels (1999) 95.
[132] Landels (1999) 102–03.
[133] Anderson (1966); (1994) 49.
[134] See above, n.80.
[135] West (1992) 247; Wallace (2004); (2015) 6, 101.
[136] Anderson (1966) 26–27; Wilson (1999) 92; Wallace (2015) 23–49, 98–99. For an overview and criticism of the scholarship attributing ethos theories to the early Pythagoreans, see Wallace (2015) 194–200.
[137] Damon: Gal. *de Hipp. et Plat*. 9.5; Pythagoras: Sext. Emp. *Math.* 6.8; Iambl. *VP* 112; Wallace (2015) 34, 154–55.
[138] Wilson (1999) 92; Spinelli (2016) 314.

The impact of *harmoniai* on the ethos is scrutinized by Athenaeus, who cites the influential opinion that 'the Doric scale … expresses masculinity and ostentation, and is neither frivolous or light-hearted but fierce and serious'.[139] The Aeolic character is regarded as 'haughty and bombastic', while 'the Ionian type is neither exuberant nor cheerful, but harsh and austere, and features a rather noble dignity'.[140] As mentioned above, the Phrygian *harmonia* is represented as an arrival from overseas and associated with the foreign Metroac cult.[141] Thus, musical scales deemed native Greek were considered as noble, serious and manly, whereas Phrygian music was not only purportedly barbarian in origin, but also performed by slaves and associated with an ambiguous ecstatic cult imported from abroad.

Athenaeus reiterates ideas put forward by earlier thinkers. Plato praises Damon's approach to music and its educational role,[142] and elaborates on this theme in the *Republic* and the *Laws*.[143] In particular, Damon's appreciation of the social and political importance of musical styles is fully shared by Plato, who has Socrates observe: 'the modes (*tropoi*) of music are never disturbed without unsettling the most fundamental conventions (*nomoi*) of the city, as Damon affirms and as I am convinced'.[144] Although he regards the Dorian *harmonia* as the only true Hellenic mode, with which manly life is in concord, the Phrygian mode is also allowed in the ideal state, as the most fitting for the purpose of persuasion of gods or men, while all the other *harmoniai* are banned.[145] That, of all the modes, Plato chose to leave the Phrygian alongside the Dorian is perplexing in the opinion of many scholars.[146] Plato probably allows Phrygian music as a part of the cult of Dionysus, which he respected, in particular because of its prominence in Delphi.[147] He could, in fact, have valued the Phrygian *harmony* precisely because of its association with religious ecstasy. In his commentary on the *Republic*, Proclus observes that the Phrygian mode suits 'rites and occasions of divine infilling, as being an ecstatic mode'.[148] Plato's (and his Socrates') recognition of *baccheia* as a blessing and reverence for the Bacchic rites[149] logically lead to the acceptance of the music that triggers them.[150]

Many years after he had penned the *Republic*, Plato associated Bacchic ecstasy with pleasure-seeking in the *Laws* and censored the New Music as inspiring pleasure and democratic contempt for authority instead of aristocratic moral standards.[151] The emphasis in the *Laws* is on Plato's anti-democratic feelings, and Bacchic jubilation is lumped together with other symptoms of abandonment of traditional values. *Laws* 700d–01a refers to musical innovation in general, rather than to a particular musical mode, and *baccheia* here is presented as negative because it is experienced inappropriately, outside the customary cultic context.

Aristotle discusses the psychology of music at length,[152] beginning with the capacity of music to inspire souls with ecstasy.[153] In Aristotle's view, music causes a change in the listeners' state of

[139] Ath. 624D, tr. Olson (2011).

[140] Ath. 625C, tr. Olson (2011).

[141] Ath. 625E–26A; [Plut.] *Mor.* 1137D, 1141B. Athenaeus cites Telestes of Selinus as the authority on this subject; see above, n.124.

[142] Pl. *Lach.* 200A.

[143] Pl. *Resp.* 399a–404a; *Leg.* 700d–01a.

[144] Pl. *Resp.* 424c, tr. Shorey (1969), modified; Wallace (2004) 258.

[145] Pl. *Lach.* 188d; *Resp.* 399a; Lynch (2018)

[146] Barker (1989) 1.168; West (1992) 180. It is suggested that by banishing the *aulos* from his state, Plato made Phrygian a cithara mode (Anderson (1966) 10) or that he valued the pieces by Olympus as inspiring (West (1992) 181). In fact, Aristoxenus attributes to Olympus the invention of a most dignified musical style based on the Dorian mode: [Plu.] *Mor.* 1134F–35A.

[147] Anderson (1966) 107–08, citing Eur. *Bacch*. 159 as the most obvious example; Barker (1989) 1.149; Lynch (2020) 137–41.

[148] Procl. *In R.* 399a, tr. Anderson (1966); Anderson (1966) 295.

[149] Pl. *Symp.* 218b; *Phd.* 69c–d; Ustinova (2018) 315.

[150] In *Republic* 399a the Phrygian mode is represented not as ecstatic, but as ordinary and persuasive (*peithōn*). Could the latter word hint at 'enchanting'? Only below, at 400B, does the discussion of music inspiring madness begin.

[151] Pl. *Leg.* 700d–01a; Csapo (2004); Budelmann and LeVen (2014).

[152] Arist. *Pol.* 1339a–42b.

[153] Arist. *Pol.* 1340a.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0075426921000057 Published online by Cambridge University Press

mind, which he describes in terms common to the discourse on ecstatic cults. He mentions 'enthusiastic excitement' that brings about cure and purification (*katharsis*), as well as feelings of relief and delight.[154] In his eyes, the nature of the Phrygian mode is to induce trance,[155] and the harmless joy aroused by this music is to be tolerated. Nevertheless, in the sphere of education, the *aulos*, innately linked to the Phrygian mode, is undesirable for three reasons: it is mimetic; impedes *logos*, speech, and therefore discourse and thought; and is banausic, since its technique requires too much learning.[156] Most significantly, according to Aristotle, the role of the Phrygian mode (*phrugisti*) among the musical modes corresponds to that of the *aulos* among the instruments, because they have the same power (*dunamis*) and both are orgiastic and passionate (*orgiastika kai pathētika*).[157]

Aristoxenus claims that Sophocles was 'the first of the poets from Athens to borrow the Phrygian manner of composition (*tēn Phrugian melopoiian*) for his arias and to use the admixture of dithyrambic style'.[158] In fact, in the *Women of Trachis* the *aulos*, unmistakeably associated with Phrygia, is clearly meant to be central in a scene of Bacchic jubilation.[159] However, since the Dionysiac ritual in Athens could be quite serene,[160] other scenes based on 'Phrygian' music did not need to mimic the Bacchic revel. Even so, Lucian straightforwardly calls the Phrygian mode 'ecstatic' (*entheon*).[161]

Modern scholarship usually attributes the correlation between musical modality and effect on human mood, spirit and behaviour to the insight of fifth- and fourth-century intellectuals, but it appears that Damon and his successors only developed popular beliefs associating distinct melodic patterns with their psychological effects. From time immemorial, the Greeks were doubtlessly aware of the spectrum of compelling feelings, from pleasure to painful sadness, induced by music, and of the correlation between music and physical sensations and conduct. Before Damon, Pindar described hymns as 'charm on spirit' (*philtron en thumōi*), Aeschylus called them 'spells' (*desmios*) and thought that the Phrygian *bombux* (a type of *aulos*) instilled *mania.*[162] Incantations were used in medicine, and warlike music inspired soldiers marching into battle.[163] Everyone knew that different tunes and instruments produced different effects; Greek intellectuals adopted and articulated these traditional notions, but they did not invent them.

In summary, whatever the exact ancient understanding of Greek musical categories might have been, they were consistently linked with basically the same set of ethnic labels. Ecstatic or passionate music was regarded as Phrygian, and the playing of the *aulos*, a dangerous mind-changing instrument, was perceived as imported from abroad.[164]

V. False foreign cults and cognitive harmony

Marsyas, an accomplished musician, was believed to have played not only the *aulos*, but the cithara as well. The story of the contest between Marsyas and Apollo, which ended in Marsyas' defeat and horrible death,[165] may certainly be construed along xenophobic lines,[166] as a victory of the Greek Apollo over the barbarian Marsyas. In addition, it was a competition between the controlled tunes of the cithara and the wild music of the *aulos*. Furthermore, Marsyas was a satyr, and therefore this myth stresses the rivalry between a god and an inferior semi-bestial figure.[167] Finally, Marsyas was probably attributed Phrygian origin, because, as a satyr, he belonged with the retinue

[154] Arist. *Pol.* 1342a; Kraut (1997) 208–12; Halliwell (2011) 242–52.

[155] Arist. *Pol.* 1349b, 1342a; Menier (2001) 237.

[156] For an analysis, see Martin (2003) 156–58.

[157] Arist. *Pol.* 1342b.

[158] Wehrli *fr.* 79 (*Life of Sophocles* 23), tr. Anderson (1994); West (1992) 181; Anderson (1994) 120.

[159] Soph. *Trach.* 217–21; Anderson (1994) 121.

[160] Anderson (1966) 47.

[161] Lucian *Harm*. 1.

[162] Pind. *Pyth* 3.64; Aesch *Eum.* 306; Radt, *TGF fr.* 57; Wallace (2004) 262; Figari (2006); for a discussion of music as magic, see Carastro (2006) 101–40.

[163] Figari (2006); Provenza (2016).

[164] Anderson (1994) 53; Wilson (1999) 58.

[165] Hdt. 7.26; Apollod. 1.4.2; Pl. *Resp.* 399E; Leclercq-Neveu (1989) 257–60.

[166] For the sharp contrast between the Greeks and the rest of humanity and the attitude that all *barbaroi* were inferior, see Hall (1989).

[167] Landels (1999) 157.

of Dionysus, the newcomer from Asia.[168] Plato's dictum that 'we are doing nothing new preferring Apollo and his instruments rather than Marsyas and his instruments',[169] articulates the age-old dichotomy between Greek, human-like, civilized and rational, on the one hand, and barbarian, semi-bestial, wild and sensual, on the other hand.[170]

In book 8 of the *Politics,* Aristotle establishes the opposition between virile and dignified versus non-virile and undignified subjects in education. In this context, he associates the Phrygian mode (and *aulos*) with ecstatic and indecorous behaviour.[171] Not only was Phrygian music regarded as corrupting, but its creators were also inherently corrupt: Aristotle cites the opinion of unnamed 'followers of Damon' who claimed that 'free and beautiful [souls] create [songs and dances] of the same nature, and the opposite souls create the opposite music'.[172] Consequently, the servile and/or foreign and effeminate souls of *aulos*-players were supposedly prone to creating undignified and unmanly music. The *aulos* therefore 'symbolized the conflict between indigenous and Oriental patterns of culture, between sobriety and ecstasy, reason and unreason'.[173]

It is noteworthy that the dichotomy between masculine and indigenous music, on the one hand, and effeminate and foreign music, on the other hand, was not unique to Greece. The Akkadian system, current from the mid-second to mid-first millennium, consisted of seven scales. In Sumer, the tuning regarded as 'open' and 'tender' was used in royal hymns, while the 'effeminate' and 'convivial' scale, similar to the one labelled as Lydian by the Greeks, was considered foreign and employed exclusively in Hurrian, that is, non-Sumerian and non-Semitic, cultic music.[174] It is particularly important that music, especially pipe music, was perceived as magical, enchanting and possessing, as in many ancient societies magic and sorcery were considered foreign and often attributed to women.[175] Thus, an intuitive perception of musical modes in ethical terms, as virile, native and morally commendable, in contrast to womanly, imported and decadent, existed in ancient cultures beyond Greece.

Conceptual domains or mental spaces inside cultures, like those discussed above, can blend or conjoin, thus restructuring these domains and creating new ones.[176] In the ethnocentric ancient societies, which maintained the stereotyped opposition of virile self-restrained natives versus effeminate self-indulgent foreigners,[177] qualities belonging to various realms, including cult and music, could easily blend with each of these opposites. The resulting conceptual blend was structured by two domains: perception of race and perception of cultural activities. In ancient Greece, the new domain that developed from this blend was the concept of Phrygian high-arousal cults and music, as opposed to proper Greek cults and the Dorian mode.

Conceptual blending, stereotype formation and activation are closely related. People's attitudes are largely conditioned by their culture, and the association between an object or phenomenon and their evaluation, known as the activation of attitudes, is, to a considerable extent, automatic and implicit; this association is enhanced when highly emotional.[178] Clustering along the lines of the opposite characteristics (dignified–virile–native vs undignified–effeminate–foreign) is facilitated by their evaluative congruency.

[168] See n.189.

[169] Pl. *Resp.* 399e.

[170] The binary oppositions are expounded by Aristotle in *Metaphysics* 986a22–b2; the controversy regarding their Pythagorean origin still continues (Goldin (2015)), but whatever the contribution of Pythagoras to the definition of this notion, it seems to be firmly embedded in Greek culture (Vernant (1980) 183–201).

[171] Rouget (1990) 405–07; Menier (2001) 239.

[172] Ath. 628C: καὶ αἱ μὲν ἐλευθέριοι καὶ καλαὶ ποιοῦσι τοιαύτας, αἱ δ' ἐναντίαι τὰς ἐναντίας. *Cf.* Wallace (2015) 170.

[173] Anderson (1966) 9.

[174] Kilmer (1995) 2608.

[175] Graf (1995) 36.

[176] For the theory of conceptual blending, see Fauconnier and Turner (2002); Fauconnier (2018) 24–51.

[177] Hippoc. *Aer.* 14 exemplifies this Greek stereotype in a condensed form. On inter-group relations and prejudice, see Jackson (2011) 103–16.

[178] Fiske and Taylor (2013) 271–75. On blending and emotions, see Fauconnier and Turner (2002) 66–67; on implicit and explicit processes of social perception that define stereotyping and preconception, see Devine

Inconsistences between cognitions and behaviours create cognitive dissonance, which is a mental discomfort experienced by individuals maintaining contradictory views or beliefs or feeling that their behaviour does not suit social norms or expectations. Cognitive dissonance results in stress, which can be alleviated or reduced by rearranging its components or modifying one's behaviour. Reducing the inconsistency brings back cognitive consonance, along with the resulting feeling of harmony and well-being.[179] Changing a behaviour requires much determination, and it is often easier to appease one's mind by modifying the cognition and bringing it in line with the practised or desired behaviour. Among other possibilities, cognitive dissonance theory predicts selective perception and memory, implying that our minds avoid perceiving and recalling facts that disturb our cognitive harmony.[180] In the domains of stereotyping and prejudice, implicit attitudes are especially forceful, and effortless heuristic processing is sufficient for many people in order to accept deficient information as persuasive.[181] In terms of cognitive dissonance theory, when faced with the conflict between stereotyped social self-identification and participation in ambiguous but captivating practices, the Greeks avoided dissonance by selectively reshaping the information on these practices and disidentifying from them culturally. This process was most likely differentiated socially, as the opposition to Dionysus in the mythological past and to the revolutionary New Music in Classical Athens was limited to the minority of upper-class males.[182]

The actual Phrygian connections of the cult of Cybele easily prompted the perception of its ecstatic aspects, and in particular its soundtrack, as imported. The *Homeric Hymn to the Mother of the Gods* suggests the stages of this process: the Greek Mother of the Gods was worshipped in sonorous rites, which were regarded as the most prominent feature of her cult, receiving exclusive attention in her hymn; when the Mother of the Gods was merged with the Mountain Mother *kubileya*, the rapturous music and the rites during which it was performed were assigned to the Phrygian goddess, and then started to be considered as originally coming with her from Phrygia; the oral mythological tradition easily adopted and spread these new representations in the disguise of traditional knowledge.

The notion that foreigners and their music, rather than the Greeks themselves, were responsible for the mind-changing effects sought by many people, was a winner in terms of cultural epidemiology,[183] tailored to be believed and speedily diffused in the Hellenic world. Myths of the Phrygian origins of high-arousal cults and associated practices offered a solution to the embarrassment created by their irresistible attraction.[184] Educated philosophers happily embraced views on music current among the boors, almost never questioning them (Heracleides is a rare exception). The adoption of prejudiced beliefs by Greek intellectuals resulted from the common human propensity for 'illusory correlations', based on semantic associations and in direct conflict with strong contradictory data.[185] Moreover, philosophers supported these biased views with a theoretical foundation, clustering the Phrygian *tropos* and ecstatic behaviour together with negative phenomena, in the opposition between virile–non-virile, dignified–undignified, etc., which articulated traditional attitudes.[186]

(1989); on beliefs conditioning perception and data characterizing, see Nisbett and Ross (1980) 65–89; on neurological evidence and stereotyping, see Ito et al. (2007); Jackson (2011) 122–27. Payne (2001) provides particularly striking examples of the impact of prejudice on perception.

[179] Festinger (1957); Gawronski and Strack (2012).

[180] Fiske and Taylor (2013) 233–42; Siegel (2017) 163–65.

[181] Jackson (2011) 117–36; Fiske and Taylor (2013) 259, 273.

[182] On royals fighting Dionysus, see Ustinova (2018) 170–74; on attitudes to the New Music, see Csapo (2004); Budelmann and LeVen (2014); on politics and *auloi*, see Cordano (2004); Wilson (2007).

[183] Sperber (2006); Heintz (2011).

[184] For the natural tendency of human beings to seek alteration of consciousness and tolerance or even endorsement of ecstatic cults in Greece, see Ustinova (2018) 371–73.

[185] Nisbett and Ross (1980) 93–94.

[186] Wilson (1999) 92; Menier (2001) 239. 'Phrygian' probably became synonymous with 'Asian' by the early fifth century: Hall (1988).

Thus, music accompanying high-arousal rites was probably symbolically associated with the foreign land of Phrygia because of its capability to induce trance, and not because of historical or musicological considerations.[187] The choice of Phrygia, of all neighbouring countries, was prompted by the prominence of ecstatic music in the cult of the Mother of the Gods, combined with the Phrygian Cybele.

A similar mode of thought seems to have brought about the dis-identification of Dionysus, the native Greek god, whose name is first recorded on Linear B tablets. In myth and cult, Dionysus is often represented as 'the god who comes'.[188] This god was indeed a stranger in the milieu of warrior aristocrats: he is mentioned no more than four times in the entire Homeric epos.[189] Aetiological myths presenting Dionysus as a foreigner may have helped to ease the tension between vine-tending peasants and an aristocracy whose interest in wine ended in its consumption, and to provide an explanation for the ritual reversal of normality in Dionysus' cult.[190] In particular, Dionysus' alterity probably derives from the fact that his most conspicuous votaries were chiefly ecstatic women. Dionysus' arrival from abroad is representative of the god's status as an 'outsider', rather than his being an actual newcomer to Greece.[191]

Following this logic, I suggest that the merging of the Greek Mother of the Gods with the Phrygian Cybele was sufficient to regard the goddess' ecstatic rites as foreign in origin, and similar practices prompted the connection of this apparently foreign goddess with another 'newcomer', Dionysus.[192] Elated emotional states were attained inside a soundscape consisting of distinguishable tunes that were associated with the rites, and therefore ecstatic music was perceived as foreign, as well. High-arousal rites and their soundscape were less embarrassing when regarded as imported; thus, popular thinking was 'ecstatic, hence foreign'. The Phrygians in particular were regarded by the Greeks as quintessentially Oriental, that is, effeminate and emotional, the complete opposite of the ideal virile Greeks.[193]

Previously held opinions, and especially stable stereotypes, influence our perception and attitudes: expectations condition behaviour.[194] In Greece, people who saw the instrument considered as foreign (the *aulos*) and were told that the tune they heard was Phrygian, were predisposed to perceive the music as foreign and prepared to feel excited, 'maddened' with the tune, and, as a result, prone to enter a mood of 'engoddedness', *enthousiasmos*. Thus, the myth of the Phrygian mode not only passed from generation to generation, but gained further endorsement as each age became even more convinced that the music was indeed alien and ecstatic: people felt what they expected to feel.

VI. Conclusions

Participating in ecstatic rites was a part of being Greek. In abandoning themselves to Dionysus, and allowing this abandon to their wives, some Greek males felt ill at ease and found a way to preserve their peace of mind by imagining Dionysus as alien and telling myths of unsuccessful attempts to resist the foreign god. As we know today, Dionysus was Greek, and his visitations were integral to the ecstatic cult. Cybele the Mountain Mother required even less cognitive effort

[187] Menier (2001) 240; citing Rouget (1990) 397–408.

[188] This is the concept of Dionysus as 'der kommende Gott' put forward by Otto (1933) and widely accepted nowadays (Detienne (1986); Versnel (1990) 133), although some elements of the Bacchic cult may have been imported to Greece (Burkert (1985) 162). For the god's rites of advent, see Sourvinou-Inwood (2005) 151–61.

[189] *Il.* 6.132, 14.325; *Od.* 11.325, 24.74; Burkert (1985) 31, 162; Wathelet (1991) 62.

[190] On Dionysus as the god of the margins, see Seaford (1994) 238–51; on Dionysus as a paradox and Dionysiac ambiguities, see Versnel (1990) 96–205.

[191] Ustinova (2018) 168–216.

[192] Roller (1999) 172; Bøgh (2007) 307.

[193] Hall (1989) 73–74, 113–14.

[194] Nisbett and Ross (1980) 231–32; Ariely (2008) 156–72.

to deal with, since her name and many traits did indeed arrive in Greece from Phrygia, but not the ecstatic rites and accompanying music, which are not attested in the latter land. Both Bacchic and Metroac rites were associated with the mind-altering music of *auloi* and tambourines, instruments familiar to the Greeks well before the advent of Cybele. Nevertheless, these instruments and their enchanting tunes were regarded as Phrygian. The Phrygian mode was compatible with other Hellenic scales, but the music and the instruments that seized one's psyche were perceived as ambivalent, divine and dangerous, an inevitable part of actuality, as were the barbarous, the feminine, the wild: all notions categorized as negative. Thus, the ecstatic features of Cybele's rites, the rapturous music and the instruments used in the performance were all perceived as Phrygian, while in reality they barely existed in that land and so could hardly have been exported from there. Phrygian ecstasy and music, despite their names, were born and bred in Greece.

Bibliography

Alexandrescu Vianu, M. (1980) 'Sur la diffusion du culte de Cybèle dans le bassin de la Mer Noire à l'époque archaïque', *Dacia* 24, 261–65

Alvar, J. (2008) *Romanising Oriental Gods: Myth, Salvation, and Ethics in the Cults of Cybele, Isis, and Mithras* (Leiden)

Anderson, W.D. (1966) *Ethos and Education in Greek Music* (Cambridge MA)

— (1994) *Music and Musicians in Ancient Greece* (Ithaca)

Ariely, D. (2008) *Predictably Irrational: The Hidden Forces that Shape our Decisions* (New York)

Barker, A. (1989) *Greek Musical Writings* (Cambridge)

— (2018a) 'Disreputable music: a performance, a defence, and their intertextual and intermedial resonances (Plutarch *Quaest. conv.* 704c4–705b6)', in T. Phillips and A. D'Angour (eds), *Music, Text, and Culture in Ancient Greece* (Oxford) 233–55

— (2018b) 'Migrating musical myths: the case of the Libyan *aulos*', *GRMuS* 6.1, 1–13

Battezzato, L. (2005) 'The new music of the Trojan women', *Lexis* 23, 73–104

Bélis, A. (1986a) *Aristoxène de Tarente et Aristote: le traité d'harmonique* (Paris)

— (1986b) 'L'aulos phrygien', *RA*, 21–40

— (1999) *Les musiciens dans l'Antiquité* (Paris)

— (2003) 'Harmonics', in J. Brunschwig and G.E.R. Lloyd (eds), *The Greek Pursuit of Knowledge* (Cambridge MA) 161–76

Berndt-Ersöz, S. (2006) *Phrygian Rock-Cut Shrines: Structure, Function, and Cult Practice* (Leiden)

— (2015) 'Noise-making rituals in Iron Age Phrygia', in K. Sporn, S. Ladstätter and M. Kerschner (eds), *Natur-Kult-Raum: Akten des internationalen Kolloquiums Paris-Lodron-Universität Salzburg* (Vienna) 29–44

Bøgh, B. (2007) 'The Phrygian background of Kybele', *Numen* 54, 304–39

Borgeaud, P. (1996) *Mother of the Gods: From Cybele to the Virgin Mary* (Baltimore)

Brand, H. (2000) *Griechische Musikanten im Kunst: von der Frühzeit bis zum Beginn der Spätklassik* (Dettelbach)

Brixhe, C. (1979) 'Le nom de Cybèle', *Die Sprache* 25, 40–45

Bryce, T. (2002) *Life and Society in the Hittite World* (Oxford)

Budelmann, F. and LeVen, P. (2014) 'Timotheus' poetics of blending: a cognitive approach to the language of the New Music', *CPh* 109, 191–210

Bundrick, S.D. (2005) *Music and Image in Classical Athens* (Cambridge)

Burkert, W. (1985) *Greek Religion* (Cambridge MA)

Carastro, M. (2006) *La cité des mages: penser la magie en Grèce ancienne* (Grenoble)

Chiekova, D. (2008) *Cultes et vie religieuse des cités grecques du Pont Gauche (VIIe–Ier siècle av. J.-C.)* (Bern)

Comotti, G. (1989) *Music in Greek and Roman Culture* (Baltimore)

Cordano, F. (2004) 'La musica e la politica, ovverto gli auloi ad Atene', *Quaderni di acme* 68, 309–25

Csapo, E. (2004) 'The politics of the New Music', in P. Murray and P. Wilson (eds), *Music and the Muses: The Culture of Mousike in the Classical Athenian City* (Oxford) 207–48

Cumont, F. (1929) *Les religions orientales dans le paganisme romain* (Paris)
Davidson, J. (1997) *Courtesans and Fishcakes: The Consuming Passions of Classical Athens* (London)
de Martino, S. (1995) 'Music, dance, and processions in Hittite Anatolia', in J.M. Sasson (ed.), *Civilizations of the Ancient Near East* 4 (New York) 2661–69
Detienne, M. (1986) 'Dionysos et ses parousies: un dieu épidémique', *L'assocition dionysiaque dans les sociétés anciennes* (Rome) 53–83
Devine, P.G. (1989) 'Stereotypes and prejudice: their automatic and controlled components', *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 56, 5–18
Dubosson-Sbriglione, L. (2018) *Le culte de la Mère des dieux dans l'Empire romain* (Stuttgart)
Fachner, J.C. (2011) 'Time is the key: music and altered states of consciousness', in E. Cardeña and M. Winkelman (eds), *Altering Consciousness: Multidisciplinary Perspectives* 1: *History, Culture, and the Humanities* (Santa Barbara) 355–76
Fauconnier, G. (2018) *Ten Lectures on Cognitive Construction of Meaning* (Leiden)
Fauconnier, G. and Turner, M. (2002) *The Way We Think: Conceptual Blending and the Mind's Hidden Complexities* (New York)
Faulkner, A. (2011) 'Introduction', in A. Faulkner (ed.), *The Homeric Hymns: Interpretative Essays* (Oxford) 1–25
Festinger, L. (1957) *Theory of Cognitive Dissonance* (Evanston)
Figari, J. (2006) 'Musique et médicine dans la philosophie présocratique', in O. Mortir-Waldschmidt (ed.), *Musique et antiquité* (Paris) 121–45
Fiske, S.T. and Taylor, S.E. (2013) *Social Cognition: From Brains to Culture* (London)
Franklin, J.C. (2008) '"A feast of music": the Greco-Lydian musical movement on the Assyrian periphery', in B.J. Collins, M.R. Bacharova and I.C. Rutherford (eds), *Anatolian Interfaces: Hittites, Greeks and Their Neighbours* (Oxford) 191–201
— (2011) 'Aulos', in M. Finkelberg (ed.), *The Homer Encyclopedia* (Chichester and Malden MA) 119–20
Gabbay, U. (2014) 'The balaĝ instrument and its role in the cult of ancient Mesopotamia', in J.G. Westenholz, Y. Maurey and E. Seroussi (eds), *Music in Antiquity: The Near East and the Mediterranean* (Berlin and Jerusalem) 129–47
Gawronski, B. and Strack, F. (2012) 'Cognitive consistence as a basic principle of social information processing', in B. Gawronski and F. Strack (eds), *Cognitive Consistence: A Fundamental Principle in Social Condition* (New York and London) 1–16
Gerhard, Y. (1955) 'Aulos', in B. Snell (ed.), *Lexikon des frügriechischen Epos* 1 (Göttingen) 1555–57
Goldin, O. (2015) 'The Pythagorean table of opposites, symbolic classification, and Aristotle', *Science in Context* 28.2, 171–93
Graf, F. (1984) 'The arrival of Cybele in the Greek East', in J. Harmatta (ed.), *Proceedings of the VIIth Congress of the International Federation of the Societies of Classical Studies* 1 (Budapest) 116–24
— (1995) 'Excluding the charming: the development of the Greek concept of magic', in M. Meyer and P. Mirecki (eds), *Ancient Magic and Ritual Power* (Leiden) 29–60
Graf, F. and Johnston, S.I. (2007) *Ritual Texts for the Afterlife: Orpheus and the Bacchic Gold Leaves* (London and New York)
Graillot, H. (1912) *Le culte de Cybèle, Mère des dieux, à Rome et dans l'Empire romaine* (Paris)
Griffith, M. (2013) 'Cretan harmonies and universal morals: early music and migrations of wisdom in Plato's *Laws*', in A.-E. Peponi (ed.), *Performance and Culture in Plato's* Laws (Cambridge) 15–66
Guarducci, M. (1970) 'Cibele in un' epigrafe arcaica di Locri Epizefiri' *Klio* 52, 133–38
Güterbock, H.G. (1995) 'Reflections on the musical instruments *arkammi*, *galgalturi*, and *huhupal* in Hittite', in T.P.J. van den Hout and J. de Roos (eds), *Studio historiae ardens: Ancient Near Eastern Studies Presented to Philo H.J. Houwink ten Cate on the Occasion of His 65th Birthday* (Leiden) 57–72
Hall, E. (1988) 'When did the Trojans turn into Phrygians?' *ZPE* 73, 15–18
— (1989) *Inventing the Barbarian: Greek Self-Definition through Tragedy* (Oxford)
Halliwell, S. (2011) *Between Ecstasy and Truth: Interpretations of Greek Poetics from Homer to Longinus* (Oxford)
Hanfmann, G.M.A. (1983) *Sardis from Prehistoric to Roman Times* (Cambridge MA)
Heintz, C. (2011) 'Cognitive history and cultural epidemiology', in L.H. Martin and J. Sørensen (eds), *Past Minds: Studies in Cognitive Historiography* (London) 11–28

Henrichs, A. (1976) 'Despoina Kybele: ein Beitrag zur religiösen Namenkunde', *HSPh* 80, 253–86
Hoffmann, H. (1997) *Sotades: Symbols of Immortality on Greek Vases* (Oxford)
Ito, T.A., Willadsen-Jensen, E. and Correll, J. (2007) 'New perspectives on categorization, prejudice, and stereotyping', in E. Harmon-Jones and P. Winkielman (eds), *Social Neuroscience: Integrating Biological and Psychological Explanations of Social Behavior* (New York and London) 401–21
Jackson, L.M. (2011) *The Psychology of Prejudice: From Attitudes to Social Action* (Washington DC)
Janko, R. (1982) *Homer, Hesiod and the Hymns: Diachronic Development in Epic Diction* (Cambridge)
Jeanmaire, H. (1970) *Dionysos: histoire du culte de Bacchus* (Paris)
Jourdain, R. (1997) *Music, the Brain, and Ecstasy: How Music Captures our Imagination* (New York)
Kilmer, A.D. (1995) 'Music and dance in ancient Western Asia', in J.M. Sasson (ed.), *Civilizations of the Ancient Near East* 4 (New York) 2601–13
Kraut, R. (1997) *Aristotle:* Politics *Books VII and VIII* (Oxford)
Lancelotti, M.G. (2002) *Attis: Between Myth and History: King, Priest and God* (Leiden)
Landels, J.G. (1999) *Music in Ancient Greece and Rome* (London)
Lane, E.N. (1996) 'The name of Cybele's priests the "Galloi"', in E.N. Lane (ed.), *Cybele, Attis, and Related Cults: Essays in Memory of M.J. Vermaseren* (Leiden) 117–34
Laroche, E. (1960) 'Koubaba, déesse anatolienne, et le problème des origines de Cybèle', in *Éléments orientaux dans le religion grecque ancienne: colloque de Strasboug* (Strasbourg) 113–28
Larson, J. (2016) *Understanding Greek Religion: A Cognitive Approach* (London)
Lasserre, F. (1954) *Plutarque,* De la musique: *texte, traduction, commentaire précédés d'une étude sur l'éducation musicale dans la Grèce antiquen* (Lausanne)
Leclercq-Neveu, B. (1989) 'Marsyas, le martyr de l'aulos' *Métis* 4, 251–68
Levick, B. (2013) 'In the Phrygian mode: a region seen from without', in P. Thonemann (ed.), *Roman Phrygia: Culture and Society* (Cambridge) 41–54
Levitin, D. (2006) *This is Your Brain on Music: Understanding a Human Obsession* (London)
Lucarini, C.M. and Moreschini, C. (eds) (2013) *Hermias,* In Platonis Phaedrum Scholia (Berlin)
Lynch, T. (2018) 'The seductive voice of the *aulos* in Plato's *Symposium*: from the dismissal of the *auletris* to Alcibiades' praise of Socrates-*auletes*', in A. Baldassarre and T. Markovic (eds), *Music Cultures in Sounds, Words and Images* (Vienna) 709–23
— (2020) '"Tuning the lyre, tuning the soul": harmonia, justice and the kosmos of the soul in Plato's *Republic* and *Timaeus*', *GRMuS* 8.1, 111–55
Marek, C. (2016) *In the Land of a Thousand Gods* (Princeton)
Martin, L.H. and Leopold, A.M. (2008) 'New approaches to the study of syncretism', in P. Antes, A.W. Geertz and R.R. Warne (eds), *New Approaches to the Study of Religion*' (Berlin and New York) 93–107
Martin, R.P. (2003) 'The pipes are brawling: conceptualizing musical performance in Athens', in C. Dougherty and L. Kurke (eds), *The Cultures within Ancient Greek Culture* (Cambridge) 153–80
Menier, T. (2001) 'L'étrangeté dionysiaque', in P. Brulé and C. Vendries (eds), *Chanter les dieux: musique et religion dans l'Antiquité grecque et romaine* (Rennes) 233–41
Mirelman, S. (2014) 'The *ala*-instrument: its identification and role', in J.G. Westenholz, Y. Maurey and E. Seroussi (eds), *Music in Antiquity: The Near East and the Mediterranean* (Berlin and Jerusalem) 148–71
Moutsopoulos, E. (1959) *La musique dans l'oeuvre de Platon* (Paris)
Munn, M. (2006) *The Mother of the Gods, Athens, and the Tyranny of Asia: A Study of Sovereignty in Ancient Religion* (Berkeley and Los Angeles)
— (2008) 'Kybele as Kubaba in a Lydo-Phrygian context', in B.J. Collins, M.R. Bacharova and I.C. Rutherford (eds), *Anatolian Interfaces: Hittites, Greeks and Their Neighbours* (Oxford) 159–64
Naumann, F. (1983) *Die Ikonographie der Kybele in der phrygischen und der griechischen Kunst* (Tübingen)
Nisbett, R. and Ross, L. (1980) *Human Inference: Strategies and Shortcomings of Social Judgement* (Englewood Cliffs)
Olson, S.D. (2011) *Athenaeus:* The Learned Banqueters 7 (Cambridge MA)
Otto, W.F. (1933) *Dionysos: Mythos und Kultus* (Frankfurt)
Payne, B.K. (2001) 'Prejudice and perception: the role of automatic and controlled processes in misperceiving a weapon', *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 81, 181–92
Pirenne-Delforge, V. (2010) 'Flourishing Aphrodite: an overview', in A.C. Smith and S. Pickup (eds), *Brill's Companion to Aphrodite* (Leiden) 3–16

Pirenne-Delforge, V. and Z. Papadopoulou (2001) 'Inventer et réinventer l'*aulos*: autour de la XIIe *Pythique* de Pindare', in P. Brulé and C. Vendries (eds), *Chanter les dieux: musique et religion dans l'Antiquité grecque et romaine* (Rennes) 37–58
Provenza, A. (2016) *La medicina delle Muse: la musica come cura nella Grecia antica* (Rome)
Robertson, N. (1996) 'The ancient Mother of Gods: a missing chapter in the history of Greek religion', in E.N. Lane (ed.), *Cybele, Attis, and Related Cults* (Leiden) 239–304
Roller, L.E. (1994) 'Attis on Greek votive monuments: Greek god or Phrygian?', *Hesperia* 63, 245–62
— (1999) *In Search of God the Mother: The Cult of Anatolian Cybele* (Berkeley and Los Angeles)
Rouget, G. (1990) *La musique et la trance* (Paris)
Scherer, K.R. and Coutinho, E. (2013) 'How music creates emotion: multifactorial process approach', in T. Cochrane, B. Fantini and K.R. Scherer (eds), *The Emotional Power of Music: Multidisciplinary Perspectives on Musical Arousal, Expression, and Social Control* (Oxford) 121–45
Shorey, P. (1969) *Plato,* Republic 5 and 6 (Cambridge MA and London)
Seaford, R. (1994) *Reciprocity and Ritual: Homer and Tragedy in the Developing City-State* (Oxford)
Sfameni Gasparro, G. (1985) *Soteriology and Mystic Aspects in the Cult of Cybele and Attis* (Leiden)
Siegel, S. (2017) *The Rationality of Perception* (Oxford)
Smith, J.O. (1996) 'The high priests of the temple of Artemis at Ephesus', in E.A. Lane (ed.), *Cybele, Attis, and Related Cults: Essays in Memory of M.J. Vermaseren* (Leiden) 323–36
Sourvinou-Inwood, C. (2005) *Hylas, the Nymphs, Dionysus and Others* (Stockholm)
Sperber, D. (2006) 'The epistemology of beliefs: a naturalistic approach', in D.J. Slone (ed.), *Religion and Cognition: A Reader* (London) 36–53
Spinelli, E. (2016) '"Are flute-players better than philosohers?" Sextus Empiricus on music, against Pythagoras', in A.-B. Renger and A. Stavru (eds), *Pythagorean Knowledge from the Ancient to the Modern World: Askesis, Religion, Science* (Wiesbaden) 305–18
Taylor, P. (2008) 'The GALA and the Gallos', in B.J. Collins, M.R. Bacharova and I.C. Rutherford (eds), *Anatolian Interfaces: Hittites, Greeks and Their Neighbours* (Oxford) 173–80
Thiemer, H. (1979) *Der Einfluß der Phryger auf die altgriechische Musik* (Bonn and Bad Godesberg)
Ustinova, Y. (2018) *Divine Mania: Alteration of Consciousness in Ancient Greece* (London)
Vermaseren, M.J. (1977) *Cybele and Attis: The Myth and the Cult* (London
Vernant, J.-P. (1980) *Myth and Society in Ancient Greece* (Brighton)
Versnel, H.S. (1990) *Ter Unus: Isis, Dionysos, Hermes: Three Studies in Henotheism* (Leiden)
Vinogradov, J.G. and Kryžickij, S.D. (1995) *Olbia* (*Mnemosyne* Supplement 129) (Leiden)
Wallace, R.W. (2004) 'Damon of Oa: a music theorist ostracised', in P. Murray and P. Wilson (eds), *Music and the Muses: The Culture of Mousike in the Classical Athenian City* (Oxford) 249–67
— (2015) *Reconstructing Damon: Music, Wisdom Teaching, and Politics in Pericles' Athens* (Oxford)
Wathelet, P. (1991) 'Dionysos chez Homère ou la folie divine', *Kernos* 4, 61–82
West, M.L. (1981) 'The singing of Homer and the modes of early Greek music', *JHS* 101, 113–29
— (1984) 'Music in Archaic Greece', in J. Harmatta (ed.), *Proceedings of the VIIth Congress of the International Federation of the Societies of Classical Studies* 1 (Budapest) 213–20
— (1992) *Ancient Greek Music* (Oxford)
— (2000) 'Music therapy in antiquity', in P. Horden (ed.), *Music as Medicine: The History of Music Therapy since Antiquity* (Aldershot) 51–68
Wilson, P. (1999) 'The *aulos* in Athens', in S. Goldhill and R. Osborne (eds), *Performance Culture and Athenian Democracy* (Cambridge) 58–95
Wilson, P. (2007) 'Pronomos and Potamon: two pipers and two epigrams' *JHS* 127, 141–49
Winnington-Ingram, R.P. (1936) *Mode in Ancient Greek Music* (Cambridge)
Xagorari-Gleissner, M. (2008) *Meter Theon: die Göttermutter bei den Griechen* (Ruhpolding)
Zschätzsch, A. (2002) *Verwendung und Bedeutung griechischer Musikinstrumente in Mythos und Kult* (Rahden)