



and song genre with femininity make the introduction of a *Mädchencharakter* seem a logical progression. Indeed, it is possible to claim that the interrelated ideas of a *Mädchencharakter* and an impoverished intellect were mutually supportive well into the twentieth century.

A negative influence on Schubert reception, Messing explains, was the popularization of the composer, especially through the operatic potboilers that appeared after the First World War. While Messing recognizes that commercial exploitation played an important part in the myth-making process that modernists were eager to dispel, he keeps discussion of it mostly in the background. His aim of providing an ‘accessible cultural history’ that has wide appeal, including to the ‘lay reader’, makes it curious that he does not go into greater detail on key events of Schubert kitsch, especially the operetta *Das Dreimäderlhaus* (1916). His also misses the opportunity to make a strong connection between Schoenberg and the popularization of Schubert. Although Schoenberg’s Schubert arrangements (including the Overture to *Rosamunde*, *Suleika* I and II and *Ständchen*) appeared before *Das Dreimäderlhaus* and were partly motivated by financial concerns, the modernist composer seemed unashamed to associate himself with repertory that had for generations been criticized as ‘light’ in comparison to the serious repertory of Beethoven. Similarly, Schoenberg had little concern about promoting the pedagogic value of Schubert’s keyboard dances in later years, even though these works appeared in sentimental versions of the composer’s life. Alongside his theoretical writing, Schoenberg’s choice of composition to arrange and teach seems to challenge the intellectual degeneracy that marked the mass-marketing and celebrity status of Schubert in fin-de-siècle Vienna.

The limited attention to the topics mentioned above does not obscure Messing’s primary achievement, namely his focus on the *Mädchencharakter* interpretation and the diversity of its dissemination. With his balanced appraisal of a huge range of evidence, Messing is able to make a compelling case for privileging fin-de-siècle Vienna over the nineteenth century, with the gendered tradition ‘more imaginatively reconceived and radically transformed’ in the former (5). The need for a comprehensive study of the composer’s feminization in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries has received a worthy response.

CAMERON GARDNER



Eighteenth-Century Music 5/2 © 2008 Cambridge University Press
doi:10.1017/S147857060800153X Printed in the United Kingdom

BRIAN ROBINS

CATCH AND GLEE CULTURE IN EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY ENGLAND

Woodbridge and Rochester, NY: The Boydell Press, 2006

pp. ix + 178, ISBN 1 84383 2127

Those with an interest in the history of eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century English music are already greatly indebted to Brian Robins for his monumental edition of John Marsh’s diaries (*The John Marsh Journals: the Life and Times of a Gentleman Composer (1752–1828)* (Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press, 1998)). Partly as a spin-off, he has now constructed a new history of the catch and glee in eighteenth-century England. The repertory produced in these two complementary genres is of interest not only for its intrinsic qualities but also for the club culture that formed such an important element of society in England at that time, and indeed later too. (As Robins points out, musicians may well have regarded membership of catch clubs as an opportunity for social and professional networking.) The core of the book comprises chapters on the various clubs, ranging from the original London Catch Club (commonly referred to as the Noblemen and Gentlemen’s Catch Club) at the House of Lords, and its imitator, the Anacreontic Society of London, to the proliferation of catch clubs in the provinces (here Robins draws on material originally presented in his chapter ‘The Catch and Glee in Eighteenth-Century Provincial England’, in *Concert Life in Eighteenth-Century Britain*, ed. Susan Wollenberg and Simon McVeigh (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004),



141–160). A provincial club of a special kind is not mentioned (but perhaps was beyond Robins's chronological cut-off point) – a 'Glee Party', formed from among members of New College, Oxford in the early decades of the nineteenth century (see Susan Wollenberg, *Music at Oxford in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001)). They met regularly in the college hall for 'Glee Practice' after dinner, and visitors were invited to listen to their 'Glee Concerts'. Robins moves further into the nineteenth century with a brief Epilogue on 'Later Reception of the Eighteenth-Century Catch and Glee' (Chapter 8), considering the assimilation of these genres into the national heritage through a survey of critical and historical writings including those of William Alexander Barrett, author of books on *English Glee and Madrigal Writers* (1877) and *English Glee and Part-Songs* (1886).

Robins pays plentiful attention to the work of his main predecessor in the field, Emanuel Rubin (whose doctoral dissertation of 1968 opened up the subject), while at the same time moving beyond it in matters of detail and breadth. His subject is an attractive one, and he does not neglect its potential for entertaining the reader. The story of the catch and glee is engagingly told here, copiously illustrated by a series of extracts from contemporary diaries, memoirs, letters, and manuscript or published musical collections. (Marsh provides a particularly informative source.) Through these we learn of the 'catch club coat' (98), a smoke-stenched garment that one enthusiast attending a glee meeting kept expressly for the club's musical evenings in a smoke-filled alehouse (clearly not a candidate for 'authentic' reconstruction nowadays), and even outbreaks of violence between musicians. (Marsh relates the tale of 'Capt Mitchell's kicking Burgat [a violinist] down the stairs at the Assembly in Dec'r 1779', whereupon 'the latter sent him a challenge w'ch the other declin'd noticing Burgat determin'd to insult him the 1st. time he met him afterw'ds', a wish that was apparently then fulfilled at the last catch club meeting of the season (101–102), where Burgat was performing a concerto: a fight threatened to ensue, but seems to have been averted by Marsh's selecting 'a full piece w'ch we all played (except Burgat . . .)').

Given the liveliness of the topic, it is surprising that the publishers have not chosen to enhance the effect of Robins's narrative with pictorial illustrations: topographical material, title-pages of glee publications, portraits of musicians who contributed to the repertory, facsimiles of pages from sources, caricatures (there is just one: a cartoon by Gillray, on the dust-jacket). There are so many materials that could surely have been used. Musical examples, too, have been excluded; as a result the technical and analytical comments on the music seem somewhat two-dimensional. Thus page after page of densely and very blackly printed word-text follows without relief. (The print is relatively small, and the footnotes – at least to my eye – microscopic; in some cases in my copy the print from a previous page showed through unattractively on the verso.) The unavoidable conclusion is that the book has not been produced to the generous specifications that it deserved.

The frequent deficiencies in the standard of editing also threaten to spoil the enjoyable reading experience that Robins's work merits. Minor blemishes are scattered throughout the text. Inconsistencies of various kinds (for instance, Harris' and Harris's occurring on the same page), infelicities ('affect' where 'effect' is meant, 'Avison was happy to admit to the merits of . . .' where 'acknowledge the merits of' is probably intended) and anomalies such as non-standard abbreviated forms of reference (*Oxford Biography Dictionary* for the *DNB*), themselves not used consistently, abound, and have an unfortunately jarring effect. 'See below page 37–8' in footnotes – a form of reference used throughout – does not quite convey what it intends. These matters of style should have been ironed out before the book went to print.

Besides the string of amusing anecdotes quoted in the narrative, a series of excerpts from documents treating loftier theoretical and aesthetic matters is included, for example from the writings of William Hayes (pro-glee) and William Jackson (anti-glee). Chapter Seven, devoted to 'Aesthetics, Form and Poetry', gives scope for commentary on a veritable anthology of such writings. (Attention paid by Robins here to Avison and Garth makes it a pity that reference to Roz Southey's *Music-Making in North-East England During the Eighteenth Century* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2006) was presumably not feasible.) This chapter also provides a typology of the repertory, rather as Caroline Jackson-Houlston has done for the poetic texts of the English ballad ("You Heroes of the Day": Ephemeral Verse Responses to the Peace of Amiens and the Napoleonic



Wars', in *Resisting Napoleon: the British Response to the Threat of Invasion, 1797–1815*, ed. Mark Philp (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2006), Chapter 10, Section 3, 184–191).

For much of the book I felt that the political scene and the wider European context were largely lacking; the later chapters, however, explicitly consider the glee against the backdrop of the unsettled times in which it continued to function. Indeed, the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries saw new developments in glee culture, perhaps slightly underplayed by Robins; these include the increased interest in accompanied performance of glees, linked with the cultivation of the piano as an accompanying instrument. As for defining the two core genres, to some extent they might appear to define each other (in that the glee is not a catch, and the catch is not a glee), but this proves not entirely to withstand close examination. Nor can the relationship between them be assumed entirely to be a process of replacement of the catch by the glee (although the catch's popularity had certainly declined by the end of the eighteenth century); the picture is blurred, for instance, by the fact that 'programmes [of the Vocal Concerts] simply took to advertising catches as glees' (122). Subject matter is a factor in differentiating between the two, leading Robins to explore the role of ladies in this culture, with numerous ramifications including their contribution not only as consumers, but also as producers who were involved in performing and even composing. The eighteenth-century trend towards marketing musical publications specifically for ladies extended to the catch and glee; Robins notes as an example Samuel Webbe the Elder's *Ladies Catch-Book, being a collection of Catches, Canons & Glees, the words of which will not offend the nicest delicacy* (c 1775).

Other significant aspects that are examined include the tension between English and foreign (especially Italian) music, and the possibly unique role of the catch and glee in creating 'a species of composition peculiar to the English' (William Gardiner, quoted on page 68); the links with the 'ancient music' movement, Robins noting that many catch and glee composers 'took an interest in music of the past' (136); and the absorption of the glee into performance contexts beyond the catch clubs, including both the public concert platform and private houses, as well as the London pleasure gardens and the theatrical stage (where scenes representing catch club culture itself were featured in dramatic entertainments). Such aspects are primed for further investigation. Meanwhile, Robins has produced a thoroughly researched account of a 'phenomenon' that the jacket blurb claims has been 'largely overlooked by historians'. Certainly historians should find his book a stimulating source of information on the topic; it is an important contribution to cultural history, and deserved a finer edition than this one.

SUSAN WOLLENBERG



EDITIONS

Eighteenth-Century Music 5/2 © 2008 Cambridge University Press
doi:10.1017/S1478570608001541 Printed in the United Kingdom

ANDRÉ CAMPRA

TANCRÈDE: TRAGÉDIE EN MUSIQUE

INTRODUCTION BY ANTONIA L. BANDUCCI

French Opera in the 17th and 18th Centuries, 18

Hillsdale, NY: Pendragon Press, 2006

pp. ix + 417, ISBN 1576470881

Pendragon's facsimile series of French operas in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries began in 1984 with Destouches's *pastorale-héroïque Issé*, edited by Robert Fajon. Seventy-five volumes were projected at that