

to clarify the meaning of martyrdom in modern Catholicism, not only in a chronological sequence that goes from the execution (1597) to the different forms of public celebration (1750), through their beatification (1627), but also by taking into account the location. Why was it possible for Christian martyrdom to take place in Japan? Because, in short, Europe wanted it that way. Not only did the missionaries come from Europe, but it was also Europe that developed the political representation of Japan. Thus, the death of the missionaries can be described as a martyrdom, making Japan a cultured country ruled by tyrants for a long time to come.

The merit of this book, which is a bit burdened with repetitions, is that it combines a deconstruction of the European image of Japan, using the country's political archives to trace these murders, with a rich attention to the way in which early modern Europe put the crucifixion of its martyrs into images, particularly in Jesuit schools and their theatres, finally outlining the critique of martyrdom in European society.

CENTRE SÈVRES- FACULTÉS JÉSUITES DE PARIS

PATRICK GOUJON

The persistence of mysticism in Catholic Europe. France, Italy, and Germany, 1500–1675.

Part 3. By Bernard McGinn. (The Presence of God: A History of Western Christian Mysticism, VI/3.) Pp. xvi + 591. New York: Crossroads Publishing Company, 2020. £78.50. 978 0 8245 8900 4

JEH (73) 2022; doi:10.1017/S0022046921001871

This is the latest volume in Bernard McGinn's ambitious *The presence of God* series. Never has such a wide-ranging and deeply researched series on western Christian mysticism been published in the English language. The first volume, published in 1991, conceived of the project as a four-volume set. Three decades later the publication of this book, marked as 'Volume 6, Part 3', reveals just how much the project has, through necessity, escaped McGinn's original vision, and highlights the vast richness of the tradition explored through the series.

This book serves as the final volume within a three-part set. The first two volumes discussed mysticism in the Reformation, as well as in the 'golden age of Spain'. Whereas those two volumes covered the period 1500 through to 1650, McGinn expands the end date in this volume to 1675. This allows his narrative to highlight events up to the emergence of Quietism, a series of religious movements which he rightly believes mark 'a real, indeed decisive, break in the story of Western Christian mysticism' (p. xiv) and as a result receive their own focus in the next volume in the series. *The persistence of mysticism* is split into two major sections entitled, 'Mysticism in France' and 'Mysticism in Other Catholic Areas', with discussions about France taking up around two-thirds of the book's length.

McGinn justifies this division due to the 'veritable explosion of mystical piety' (p. xiv) which emerged after the French Wars of Religion. Chapter i examines the 'Hegemony of France', exploring historical events and religious developments as well as sources for French mysticism, including a survey of previous mystical accounts available in print and manuscript. Chapter ii engages in a closer analysis of French mysticism, beginning with figures such as the Benedictine Louis de Blois, the wealthy laywoman Barbe Acarie and the Capuchin Benet of Canfield. The

analysis of Barbe Acarie is particularly interesting. Madame Acarie was born into an affluent Parisian family in 1566, marrying another wealthy aristocrat in 1582. She began experiencing lengthy ecstasies both at home and while attending mass, but like many women who claimed to have mystical experiences, she faced mounting criticism. Despite this, Acarie influenced many key spiritual movements in Paris. As McGinn notes, 'the introduction of Teresa's reformed Carmelites in France, the spread of the Ursulines to northern France, the reform of female Benedictine convents, and the establishment of Oratorians all had roots in or connections with the apostolic action of Madame Acarie and her friends' (p. 44).

More well-known figures, Francis de Sales and Pierre de Bérulle, were also part of this influential circle, and these two important mystical writers are the focus of chapters iii and iv respectively. McGinn situates both figures within their historical contexts, describing their writings, the sources available to them, their impact on religious events and their extant writings. The writings and key spiritual characteristics of Francis de Sales are given a particularly in-depth treatment, with McGinn describing him as 'the most important French-language mystic of the seventeenth century' (p. 155). Chapter v completes part I of the volume by discussing 'Other French mystics of Le Grand Siècle' including Jesuit, Carmelite and Ursuline mystical writers.

As with any survey work of this size and scope, some nuances of the historiography are lost. One particular example of this can be seen in chapter vi, 'English recusant mysticism', where McGinn repeatedly refers to 'the recusants', 'recusant colleges and religious houses' and 'English recusant spirituality' (pp. 348–9). Scholars of English Catholicism in recent decades have moved away from the term 'recusant' as an inherently political and polemical way of describing English Catholics, defining them largely in opposition to Protestant recusancy laws. While McGinn cites key works by John Bossy and John Aveling published in 1976, the field has undergone key revisions in the decades since concerning the way scholars research and conceptualise English Catholicism. Despite this, McGinn's analysis of Augustine Baker and his disciples, as well as the poet Richard Crashaw, is solid and engages with key historiographical works in its exploration of the important themes of their writings.

Chapter vii discusses key Italian mystical writers. McGinn begins by exploring the relationship of Isabella Berinzaga and her confessor and scribe, the Jesuit theologian Achille Gagliardi. Their fruitful relationship resulted in 'a mystical classic' (p. 414), *The brief compendium of Christian perfection*, which was widely read in the period. Yet conflicts within the Jesuit order concerning mysticism and the interior life resulted in Gagliardi's access to Berinzaga being restricted, and both were commanded to 'eternal silence' by the papacy around the turn of the seventeenth century. McGinn devotes the rest of the chapter to discussing other Italian women with 'paranormal mystical gifts' (p. 429), including Caterina de'Ricci, Maria Domitilla Galluzzi and Maria Maddalena de'Pazzi.

In the final chapter McGinn turns his attention to Germany and the Low Countries. He begins with a discussion of the Jesuits who, despite not producing 'the rich mystical literature that characterized the French followers of Ignatius' (p. 473), still made contributions to mysticism. A larger focus is given to Angelus Silesius, whose *The cherubic pilgrim* is hailed as being 'among the most original

mystical texts of the seventeenth century' (pp. 481–2). It is clear why, with Silesius harnessing the Protestant alchemical mysticism of Jacob Boehme, as well as Catholic authors such as Bonaventure, Bridget of Sweden, John Tauler and John of the Cross, to produce a work of 'kaleidoscopic character' (p. 490).

Overall, those following McGinn's decades-long ambition to document the western Christian mystical tradition will find much to enjoy here, and McGinn's accessible style introduces figures perhaps unknown to many in an understandable fashion. Those more specifically focused on the period the volume addresses will also find much of value, as McGinn's forensic and focused approach to mysticism brings new perspective to events and figures across western Catholicism in the period, highlighting the rich mystical heritage many figures in the early modern period inherited, adapted and responded to.

DURHAM UNIVERSITY

LIAM PETER TEMPLE

Müntzerbild und Müntzerforschung vom 16. bis zum 21. Jahrhundert, I: 1519 bis 1789.

By Günter Vogler. Pp. 535. Berlin: Weidler Buchverlag, 2019. €75 (paper).
978 3 89693 734 6

Müntzerbild und Müntzerforschung vom 16. bis zum 21. Jahrhundert, II: 1789 bis 2017.

By Günter Vogler. Pp. 551. Berlin: Weidler Buchverlag, 2021. €75 (paper).
978 3 89693 734 4

JEH (73) 2022; doi:10.1017/S0022046921002128

It is fifty years since Max Steinmetz produced his large-scale historiographical survey of images and interpretations of Thomas Müntzer from Martin Luther to Friedrich Engels. Since then, the German Democratic Republic, in its self-proclaimed role as the champion of Müntzer's legacy, has disappeared and with it studies which saw Müntzer as a precursor of what Marxists termed the 'early bourgeois revolution'. In the meantime there have been several brief bibliographical updates, notably by James Stayer, Hans-Jürgen Goertz and Peter Matheson. Now Günter Vogler, formerly professor at the Humboldt University in Berlin and author of many specialised studies on Müntzer, has provided a magisterial two-volume compendium taking the narrative to 2017. In this review only a selection of salient themes can be presented.

Melanchthon's *Histori Thome Muntzer* remained the principal source until the age of Pietism. Gottfried Arnold recognised Müntzer's debt to spiritualism: he edited the *Theologia Deutsch* and works by Thomas à Kempis and Johannes Tauler (though not Müntzer's own writings). In the early sixteenth century the Lutheran pastor Justus Menius was the first to posit a link between Müntzer and Anabaptism, but for the next two centuries the relationship was assumed rather than seriously explored. A more nuanced approach had to wait for the Enlightenment, which fed into Wilhelm Zimmermann's positive study of the German Peasants' War, first published in 1841 which, together with Engels's tract, remained the bedrock of Marxist interpretations until very recently. Early (that is, pre-Marx) communists, however, had already acknowledged Müntzer's commitment to community of goods (*omnia sunt communia*) from a Christian perspective.