

BBIS

Behavioral & Brain Sciences

An International journal of current research and theory
with open peer commentary
Volume 36 | Issue 6 | December 2013 | ISSN: 0140-525X

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editors

Paul Bloom
Barbara L. Finlay

URL: <http://www.editorialmanager.com/bbs>

E-mail: bbsjournal@cambridge.org

Behavioral and Brain Sciences
Journals Department
Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of The Americas
New York, NY 10013-2473, U.S.A.

Managing Editor

Gennifer Levey

Chief Copy Editor

Sumitra Mukerji

Proofreaders

Sylvia Elvin
Rashidah Ismaili AbuBakr

Editorial Board

Affective Neuroscience

Stephanie D. Preston/U. of Michigan

Atypical Neurodevelopment

Simon Baron-Cohen/Cambridge U.

Behavioral Neurogenetics

Wim E. Crusio/CNRS UMR

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/Rutgers U.

Cognitive and Decision Sciences

Nick Chater/University College London

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/Birbeck College

Cognitive Neuroscience

Moshe Bar/Harvard Medical School

Computational Neuroscience

Nestor A. Schmajuk/Duke U.

Evolution of Brain and Cognition

Dean Falk/Florida State U.

Evolution of Cognition

Celia Heyes/Oxford U.

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics

Robert A. Freidin/Princeton U.

Perception

Bruce Bridgeman/U. of California, Santa Cruz

Philosophy of Science

Massimo Piattelli-Palmarini/U. of Arizona

Primate Cognition

Laurie R. Santos/Yale U.

Social Cognition

Mahzarin R. Banaji/Harvard U.

Social Cognitive Neuroscience

Rebecca Saxe/MIT

Vision, Language and Computation

Shimon Edelman/Cornell U.

FOUNDING EDITOR (1978–2001)

Stevan Harnad

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See Instructions for Authors and Commentators, inside back cover and also at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst>) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project (see <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/BBSAssoc>).

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to view the full instructions for joining at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst/Assoc> and then email bbsjournal@cambridge.org.

© Cambridge University Press 2013. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published bimonthly in February, April, June, August, October, and December. The subscription price of Volume 37 (2014) for *institutions* is US \$1391.00 for print and online and US \$1118.00 for online only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £820.00 for print and online and UK £661.00 for online only elsewhere. The subscription price for *individuals* is US \$392.00 for print and online and US \$353.00 for online only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £229.00 for print and online and UK £208.00 for online only elsewhere. For *BBS Associates*, with proof of eligibility with order, US \$139.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £87.00 elsewhere. For *students*, with proof of eligibility with order, \$116.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £68.00 elsewhere. Subscription price includes surface postage. Single parts cost US \$263.00 (UK £131.00) plus postage. *Institutional* orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of The Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 email: journals_subscriptions@cambridge.org; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England, e-mail: journals_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk. *Individuals* must order direct from the Press. You may also subscribe through the Cambridge Journals website, <http://journals.cambridge.org/bbs>.

Postmaster: Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, U.S.A. Send address change elsewhere to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England.

Online availability *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* is part of the Cambridge Journals Online (CJO) service at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

Institutional subscribers: Access to full-text articles online is currently included with the cost of the print subscription. Subscription must be activated; see <http://cambridge.journals.org>.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the "CA Comment" service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 36:6 December 2013

Llewellyn, S. Such stuff as dreams are made on? Elaborative encoding, the ancient art of memory, and the hippocampus	589
Open Peer Commentary:	
Axmacher, N. & Fell, J. The analogy between dreams and the ancient art of memory is tempting but superficial	607
Bimler, D. L. Some Renaissance, Baroque, and contemporary cultural elaborations of the art of memory	608
Blagrove, M., Ruby, P. & Eichenlaub, J.-B. Dreams are made of memories, but maybe not for memory	609
Cheng, S. & Werning, M. Composition and replay of mnemonic sequences: The contributions of REM and slow-wave sleep to episodic memory	610
Cicogna, P. & Occhionero, M. Such stuff as NREM dreams are made on?	611
D'Agostino, A. & Scarone, S. Such stuff as psychoses are made on?	612
Deliens, G., Schwartz, S. & Peigneux, P. Don't count your chickens before they're hatched: Elaborative encoding in REM dreaming in face of the physiology of sleep stages	613
Desseilles, M. & Duclos, C. Dream and emotion regulation: Insight from the ancient art of memory	614
DeYoung, C. G. & Grazioplene, R. G. "They who dream by day": Parallels between Openness to Experience and dreaming	615
Dominey, P. F. A hippocampal indexing model of memory retrieval based on state trajectory reconstruction	615
Dresler, M. & Konrad, B. N. Mnemonic expertise during wakefulness and sleep	616
Erdelyi, M. H. Beware of being captured by an analogy: Dreams are like many things	617
Girard, T. A. The seahorse, the almond, and the night-mare: Elaborative encoding during sleep-paralysis hallucinations?	618
Globus, G. Ontological significance of the dream world	619
Greenberg, R. A three-legged stool needs a stronger third leg	620
Hobson, A. The ancient art of memory	621
Kirov, R. REM sleep and dreaming functions beyond reductionism	621
Markowitsch, H. J. & Staniloiu, A. The spaces left over between REM sleep, dreaming, hippocampal formation, and episodic autobiographical memory	622
Mattei, T. A. The secret is at the crossways: Hodotopic organization and nonlinear dynamics of brain neural networks	623
Nielsen, T. The method of loci (MoL) and memory consolidation: Dreaming is not MoL-like	624
Pearlmutter, B. A. & Houghton, C. J. Dreams, mnemonics, and tuning for criticality	625
Porte, H. S. From Freud to acetylcholine: Does the AAOM suffice to construct a dream?	626
Schredl, M. Studying the relationship between dreaming and sleep-dependent memory processes: Methodological challenges	628
Solms, M. Dreaming is not controlled by hippocampal mechanisms	629
Spoormaker, V. I., Czisch, M. & Holsboer, F. REM sleep, hippocampus, and memory processing: Insights from functional neuroimaging studies	629
van Heugten-van der Kloet, D., Merckelbach, H. & Lynn, S. J. Dissociative symptoms and REM sleep	630
Westermann, S., Paulus, F. M., Müller-Pinzler, L. & Krach, S. Elaborative encoding during REM dreaming as prospective emotion regulation	631
Windt, J. M. Minding the dream self: Perspectives from the analysis of self-experience in dreams	633
Author's Response:	
Llewellyn, S. Such stuff as REM and NREM dreams are made on? An elaboration	634

Kurzban, R., Duckworth, A., Kable, J. W. & Myers, J. An opportunity cost model of subjective effort and task performance

661

Open Peer Commentary

Ainslie, G. Monotonous tasks require self-control because they interfere with endogenous reward 679

Bonato, M., Zorzi, M. & Umiltà, C. Difficulty matters: Unspecific attentional demands as a major determinant of performance highlighted by clinical studies 680

Bruyneel, S. D. & Dewitte, S. An addition to Kurzban et al.'s model: Thoroughness of cost-benefit analyses depends on the executive tasks at hand 681

Brzezicka, A., Kamiński, J. & Wróbel, A. Local resource depletion hypothesis as a mechanism for action selection in the brain 682

Carter, E. C. & McCullough, M. E. Is ego depletion too incredible? Evidence for the overestimation of the depletion effect 683

Charney, E. Can tasks be inherently boring? 684

Cohen, D. B. & Saling, L. L. Maximising utility does not promote survival 685

Craig, A. D. An interoceptive neuroanatomical perspective on feelings, energy, and effort 685

Gendolla, G. H. E. & Richter, M. Opportunity cost calculations only determine *justified* effort – Or, What happened to the resource conservation principle? 686

Hagger, M. S. The opportunity cost model: Automaticity, individual differences, and self-control resources 687

Harrison, J. M. D. & McKay, R. Give me strength or give me a reason: Self-control, religion, and the currency of reputation 688

Harvey, N. Depletable resources: Necessary, in need of fair treatment, and multi-functional 689

Hennecke, M. & Freund, A. M. Competing goals draw attention to effort, which then enters cost-benefit computations as input 690

Hillman, K. L. & Bilkey, D. K. Persisting through subjective effort: A key role for the anterior cingulate cortex? 691

Hofmann, W. & Kotabe, H. On treating effort as a dynamically varying cost input 692

Holroyd, C. B. Theories of anterior cingulate cortex function: Opportunity cost 693

Huizenga, H. M., van der Molen, M. W., Bexkens, A. & van den Wildenberg, W. P. M. Formal models of “resource depletion” 694

Inzlicht, M. & Schmeichel, B. J. Beyond simple utility in predicting self-control fatigue: A proximate alternative to the opportunity cost model 695

Iran-Nejad, A. & Zengaro, S. A. Opportunity prioritization, biofunctional simultaneity, and psychological mutual exclusion 696

Kool, W. & Botvinick, M. The intrinsic cost of cognitive control 697

Malecek, N. J. & Poldrack, R. A. Beyond dopamine: The noradrenergic system and mental effort 698

Molden, D. C. An expanded perspective on the role of effort phenomenology in motivation and performance 699

Monterosso, J. & Luo, S. Willpower is not synonymous with “executive function” 700

Navon, D. Effort aversiveness may be functional, but does it reflect opportunity cost? 701

Nicolle, A. & Riggs, K. The costs of giving up: Action versus inaction asymmetries in regret 702

Prudkov, P. N. Mental effort and fatigue as consequences of monotony 702

Tops, M., Boksem, M. A. S. & Koole, S. L. Subjective effort derives from a neurological monitor of performance costs and physiological resources 703

Westbrook, J. A. & Braver, T. S. The economics of cognitive effort 704

Wright, R. A. & Pantaleo, G. Effort processes in achieving performance outcomes: Interrelations among and roles of core constructs 705

Zayas, V., Günaydin, G. & Pandey, G. Persistence: What does research on self-regulation and delay of gratification have to say? 706

Authors' Response:

Kurzban, R., Duckworth, A., Kable, J. W. & Myers, J. Cost-benefit models as the next, best option for understanding subjective effort 707

BBS Associateship 2013

727