there was certainly some philosophical engagement with his insights, but by and large he was still associated exclusively with certain positions in the philosophy of religion and metaphysics. The fruit of twentieth-century historical research into the medieval theologian, however, has helped give a more rounded picture of the Dominican friar as one who worked fundamentally as a biblical scholar. Aquinas' scriptural commentary has recently won much deserved attention, with works like his *Commentary on John's Gospel* now being perceived as on a par with the *Summa* and other systematic works for a proper grasp of his overall thought.

A further rounding out of this picture of Aquinas as a biblically based theologian is now set to emerge in the twenty-first century from a more thorough study of his sermons. In 2014 the Dominican Order's Leonine Commission, which is in process of editing the complete works of Aquinas, published a critical edition of the sermons by L. J. Bataillon OP, and the same year there appeared a French translation of the sermons by Aquinas' leading biographer, J.-P. Torrell OP. In English there was already a translation by M.-R. Hoogland CP, and his and Smith's work are excellent companion volumes to one other for anyone who now wishes to explore the riches of Aquinas' preaching.

The main purpose of the book, which is executed methodically and precisely, is to provide the tools needed for one to appreciate the genre in which Aquinas' preaching falls, and so recognise Aquinas' own artistry as a preacher. While useful analytic outlines of the sermons can be found in the appendices, as well as indications of their relation to the Dominican lectionary, Smith helpfully introduces Aquinas' style in his first chapter with an examination of one particular sermon. Through this concrete example the reader can become acquainted with the salient features of one important way the construction of sermons had been developing in the thirteenth century. The remaining chapters provide considerable detail on how preachers were trained in this *sermo modernus*, and how such preaching proceeds through different stages, *thema*, *prothema*, *divisio* and *dilatatio*. Especially illuminating is Smith's explanation of how a biblical text is used as the starting-point for the theological themes that unfold in the sermon, and how preaching is thus related to the use of memory and recollection. While Aquinas' method is hardly one that would be favoured by any scriptural preacher today, the reader is left is no doubt that it was in its own way thoroughly biblical and that Aquinas was in full command of his art.

doi:10.1017/S0036930619000383

Hugh Ross Mackintosh, *God in Experience: Essays of Hugh Ross Mackintosh*

ed. Paul K. Moser and Benjamin Nasmith (Eugene, OR: Pickwick Publications, 2018), pp. viii + 231. $29.00.

Craig Meek

New College, University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh (s1772679@sms.ed.ac.uk)

With this collection of essays, Moser and Nasmith draw attention to an important but often overlooked figure of the early twentieth century. Hugh Ross Mackintosh was

Professor of Systematic Theology at New College in Edinburgh from 1904 to 1936, his thought shaping a generation of students that included John and Donald Baillie as well as T. F. Torrance. He worked constructively at the intersection of German and Scottish theology, reviewed and translated into English important nineteenth-century German works, and was one of the first Scottish voices engaging with the dialectical theologians of the 1920s that included Karl Barth and Emil Brunner. Given Mackintosh's résumé and widespread influence, Moser and Nasmith have done a good service in organising a collection that spans his career and demonstrates his theological acumen.

Following a short preface and an introduction, the book is laid out in four main parts, three of which correspond to central themes in Mackintosh's constructive theology: revelation, redemption and atonement, and christology. The fourth section includes essays on the 'Spirit and spirituality' and is followed by an appendix that entails two of Mackintosh's sermons. On the whole, the book contains some of Mackintosh's finest work, such as 'The Unio Mystica as a Theological Conception' which defends 'union with Christ' as a uniquely moral and profoundly metaphysical concept that is essential to the Christian doctrine of redemption. Additionally, the editors provide helpful references for many of Mackintosh's quotations that are missing in the original versions of essays.

The preface introduces Mackintosh's conception of God as a personal and moral agent who encounters individuals *in* human experience. Thus, the editors suggest, Mackintosh's theological method involves '[looking] for features of human experience that serve as experiential evidence of God's active moral character' (p. vii). While this description rightfully highlights the importance of human experience in Mackintosh's thought, it also risks presenting Mackintosh's thought as more subjective than it actually is. For Mackintosh, humans neither search their experiences for God nor does God exist *in* one's experience; rather, God is known *through* human experience. Encountering humans as a personal and moral agent, God prompts individuals to look beyond one's experience towards the object of its cause; that cause is God self-revealed in the person, life and work of Jesus Christ, as recorded in the scriptures and proclaimed in the life and witness of the Church. In other words, human experience is the medium through which God self-reveals rather than any sort of end in itself. (See, for example, 'The Ritschlian Doctrine of Theoretical and Religious Knowledge' or the essay 'History and the Gospel' in this collection.) While much more might be said by way of explanation, the point is that, though Moser and Nasmith rightfully highlight human experience as a vital aspect of Mackintosh's thought, they have overlooked the nuances that keep it from falling into subjectivity.

The introduction discloses the main argument of the book. Aligning him with Wilhelm Herrmann and emphasising his sympathies with the nineteenth-century German liberal tradition, Moser and Nasmith use Mackintosh as a foil to critique the theology of Karl Barth. Though this view does well to recognise the affinity between Mackintosh and Herrmann, it does not address Mackintosh's later enthusiasm for Barth's theology. For example, Mackintosh's 1933 Croall Lectures, posthumously published in 1937 as *Types of Modern Theology*, present a mostly positive overview of Barth's theology to date, thus demonstrating more solidarity with him than Moser and Nasmith allow.

Perhaps a more helpful introduction to Mackintosh's work would involve better highlighting his Scottish background and influences, individuals such as John McLeod Campbell and Andrew Seth Pringle-Pattison, alongside his German conservation partners. Though Mackintosh engages deeply with German theology, he does so from a distinctively Scottish perspective that prevents him from belonging to any particular German theological school and facilitates his rather unique theological outlook.

Overall, this collection of essays presents readers with an excellent introduction to Mackintosh's thought. Moser and Nasmith should be commended for this compilation, as it provides a central perch from which one might survey the landscape of Mackintosh's theology and begin to discover both its complexity and its richness. One can only hope that these essays spark a wider reception and reading of Mackintosh's work, as he deserves far greater attention than the past century of theologians have paid him.

doi:10.1017/S0036930619000267

Michael Mawson, *Christ Existing as Community: Bonhoeffer's Ecclesiology*

(Oxford: OUP, 2018), pp. xii + 199. £65.00.

Barry Harvey

Department of Religion, Baylor University, Waco, TX (Barry_Harvey@Baylor.edu)

Of all the works in the corpus of Dietrich Bonhoeffer, *Sanctorum Communio* is frequently overlooked by scholars otherwise interested in his thought, and it has been criticised by social scientists who object to the way he uses social theory. But when read as part of a study of the church and not as an attempt to open up an academic dialogue with social theorists, claims Michael Mawson, it not only makes sense theologically, but makes a valuable contribution to contemporary ecclesiology.

Mawson notes that Bonhoeffer's theological engagement with social theory is framed by the thought of Ernst Troeltsch, who maintains that Christianity originally had little interest in the social world around it, and Karl Barth, who offers a dialectical understanding of revelation that preserves an 'absolute qualitative distinction' between God and all creaturely reality, and which is experienced solely as a negation of humanity's finitude and sinfulness. Bonhoeffer rejects Troeltsch's historicist conception of Christianity as a set of religious ideals essentially unrelated to social expression, and faults Barth for failing to reckon with the fact that human persons and communities are historical all the way down. Bonhoeffer's starting point is the church, which he claims is not 'accidental' to revelation, but the fully human, historical medium in which the crucified and risen Christ encounters humanity.

The lynchpin of Bonhoeffer's engagement with social theory, states Mawson, is the dialectic of the primal state (creation), sin and reconciliation. There is thus no abstract understanding of the human being; women and men exist concretely before God as those who are created, fallen and reconciled by Christ. Social reality and human persons are not conceivable as unified wholes, but stand fragmented before God and in isolation from one another, and must be examined in this threefold manner.

A Christian concept of the person and its basic social relations is key to the dialectical reworking of social-philosophical and sociological concepts. According to Mawson, Bonhoeffer contests the atomistic social philosophy of idealism, arguing that its construal of the reasoning subject is unable to acknowledge the freedom of God or preserve both the otherness and concreteness of other human beings. He offers instead a