

what extent the Custody was a particular institution which had to mediate Catholic access to places under Ottoman control.

In chapter iii Armstrong explores the meaning of the Holy Land to early modern Catholics by focusing on the role played by the Order of the Holy Sepulchre. Through the lens of their writings the author demonstrates how the image, and the legacy of the Holy Land still had a central role in the thorny Reformation debates on the efficacy of pilgrimages. The fourth chapter explores the involvement of the French monarchy and its subsequent conflict with the Franciscan Brothers of the Holy Land over the administration of the Custody. It unveils how French plans to rule this institution were part of a broader strategy which aimed to confirm France as the main protector of Catholic orthodoxy.

The fifth chapter investigates the relations which developed between the Franciscans and the Sacred Congregation of Propaganda, founded in 1622 to oversee missionary activities in non-Catholic and Protestant areas. Using the congregation's archives, Armstrong sheds light on Propaganda's efforts to contrast and weaken the friars' power in the Holy Land with the key aim of strengthening the global role of the Holy See.

In the last chapter the author looks at how the Franciscans were involved in a harsh struggle with the reformed branches of the Franciscan order, like the Capuchins, Recollects and *Riformati*, who progressively began to arrive in the Holy Land. Even in this case, the book uses such disputes as an avenue to demonstrate the crucial importance of the Holy Land for the Franciscan order.

Though the book is well-organised and well written, there are some gaps. Indeed, the author has neglected to use the material preserved in the Archives of the Holy Office, and the General Archives of the Order of Friars Minor. Both repositories contain a number of sources on the Custody of the Holy Land and its relations with the Curia as well as with the various branches of the Franciscan order. Moreover, the Archives of the Holy Office have a remarkable number of files on the thorny theological disputes which hampered the activity of the Franciscans and the different orders that operated in that area. A further gap in the bibliography is the omission of Cesare Santus' *Trasgressioni necessarie* which has unveiled the practical and theological problems faced by Catholic missionaries in the Ottoman Empire. Despite these shortcomings, Armstrong's book is an admirable effort at understanding the multi-layered facets of Catholicism within the context of the complex and entangled area that was the Holy Land during the early modern period.

UNIVERSITÀ PER STRANIERI DI SIENA

MATTEO BINASCO

Sacred journeys in the Counter-Reformation. Long-distance pilgrimage in northwest Europe.

By Elizabeth C. Tingle. (Research in Medieval and Early Modern Culture XXVII, LXXIII.) Pp. xiv + 246 incl. 12 ills and 2 tables. Berlin–Boston: De Gruyter, 2020. €79. 978 1 5015 1851 5

JEH (73) 2022; doi:10.1017/S0022046921002098

This volume by Elizabeth Tingle is the culmination of many years of research on the subject of early modern long-distance pilgrimage, and it builds on two significant articles in *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society* and the *Journal of Religious*

History respectively (both published in 2018). Her task is to discover what happened to the tradition of international pilgrimage in the Atlantic region of Europe during the period of the Reformations, with its primary focus being on pilgrims from France and the British Isles. While Tingle also adverts to a number of smaller shrines, she directs her attention, in the main, to three major sites: Compostela, Mont Saint-Michel and St Patrick's Purgatory, Lough Derg, in the north-west of Ireland.

The sixteenth century, her period of departure, witnessed a number of monumental challenges to the tradition of late medieval pilgrimage, and not just from Protestant reformers. Tingle recalls, for instance, how there were no canonisations between 1523 and 1588, and also how many saints' *Lives* were shorn of their more dubious or fantastical elements. St James of Compostela himself would get caught in the cross-hairs of this development when the new Roman Breviary issued by Pius v in 1568 stuck largely to biblical texts and omitted details of the legendary journey of St James to Spain with nine disciples, on which the cult of Santiago was based (p. 27). There were also works such as Cristóbal de Villalón's *Viaje de Turquía* (1557) which concluded that the devout are better off staying at home rather than visiting the saint. This is essentially the point of Erasmus' fictional character Menedemus when he asks Ogygius why he feels the need to travel from Antwerp to England to visit a shrine of the Virgin: 'But could not our Virgin *Mary* have done as much for you here?' For de Villalón, the Ten Commandments are the road that leads to heaven, rather than any other penitential *camino* (p. 45). Moreover, by the sixteenth century, ecclesiastical or secular courts were rarely imposing long-distance pilgrimages on those who came before them (p. 55).

And yet international pilgrimage experienced a revival in the late 1500s, and more particularly, from the early seventeenth century. Tingle proposes three factors that help explain why: pilgrimage's link to confessional identity and an explicit rejection of Protestantism; its masculine nature; and its validation of a sacally charged universe. Regarding the first of these, Tingle cites an interesting example of how the destruction of shrines and relics during the sixteenth century could be interpreted (spun) in ways that reinforced, rather than weakened Catholic identity in the face of iconoclasm. In the case of the destruction of the shrine and relics of St Martin of Tours in 1562, local clergy came to view this as a providential act – here God was using the actions of heretics to bestow upon the saint the crown of martyrdom (pp. 61–2). The pursuit of pilgrimage as a self-conscious act of confessional defiance is borne out in the account of Domenico Laffi, the Italian priest who visited Compostela three times in the 1660s and 1670s. One of the incidents Laffi mentions on his journey to the shrine has a very sharp confessional edge. In describing the Corpus Christi procession at Orthez, 'a village full of heretics', Laffi makes mention of 'heretic scoundrels ... laughing like lunatics while the procession passed'.

With the revival of pilgrimage in the 1600s and 1700s also came increasing regularisation, greater scrutiny from clergy and secular rulers, and a reconceptualisation of what lay at the heart of the exercise. For one thing, the amount of paperwork required increased. Philip II of Spain, in a bid to curb the activities of false pilgrims, introduced a licence for all pilgrims visiting Spain. Later, under Louis XIV of France, pilgrims were faced with needing a certificate from their

parish priest, authorisation from their bishop and likewise from a local royal officer. Meanwhile, some ecclesiastical authorities moved to discourage overnight pilgrimages, which could lead to sinful behaviour. In 1660 Bishop Lescot of Blois prohibited all processions that could not be accomplished between sunrise and sunset on a single day (p. 7). They also made every effort to eliminate pilgrimage practices that they deemed ‘superstitious’ (p. 42). The advent of the pilgrimage booklet would assist in the effort to purify pilgrimage from persistent practices no longer considered fitting in this new age (p. 148).

Furthermore, the very *raison d'être* of pilgrimage was to be the focus of efforts towards reform. Tingle cites Dominique Julia who writes of an effort to redefine the emotional engagement with the sacred from touching towards sight—the ‘devotional gaze’ rather than the ‘panicky and wild touching’ of the relic (p. 115). But there was also an interior shift in emphasis; in Tingle’s words, from pilgrimage as a response to an ‘emergency’ to pilgrimage as a devotional exercise (p. 9). The new literature available to pilgrims increasingly emphasised traversing an inner landscape (often modelled on the narrative of Christ’s passion) just as much as an outer, geographical one (p. 92). Furthermore, reception of the sacraments, *en route* to the shrine, and at the shrine itself—not just confession, but communion as well—now became a much more regular feature of pilgrimage practice, increasingly tied to the acquisition of plenary indulgences. These practices were later reinforced when the pilgrim returned home through membership of the large number of confraternities that were founded during this period. There were also changes to the interiors of some churches, the re-location of relics at a remove from the high altar and the increasing importance of the reliquary itself in which they were housed. Tingle is careful to note, however, that these new Catholic practices ‘were not imposed from above, but adopted and popularised because they were valued for their display and, above all, efficacy at the grassroots level’ (p. 217).

While Tingle cites Phillipe Martin’s observation that pilgrimage was a ‘sufficiently malleable activity to be reinvented in all periods’ (p. 220), what I am nevertheless more often struck by is not so much the evolution of pilgrimage practices (which, as we have just seen, is well documented), but the resilience and persistence of attitudes, gestures and behaviours over the *longue durée*, even down to our own day. In 1668 Robert Quatremaire’s pamphlet *L’Histoire abrégée du Mont Saint-Michel* warned pilgrims not to get too caught up with the surrounding physical landscape of their journeys, cautioning against ‘the motive of satisfying human curiosity when on such a holy journey’; in Tingle’s words, ‘visiting such a place was not about sight-seeing’ (p. 92). I smiled as I read this, recalling how many times I have heard similar cautionary words being uttered by zealous spiritual directors on pilgrimages to European shrines in the 1980s and 1990s. Likewise, Tingle notes the persistence of *ex-votos*, what Mary Laven calls ‘archives of miracles’, at shrines during this period (p. 157). In this, the Bavarian shrine of Altötting in Bavaria is a good example of where one can view *ex-votos* dating from the seventeenth to the twenty-first centuries. Another form of votive was graffiti, such as on the walls of the cathedral at Oviedo from the 1600s (p. 160). This practice, of course, persists to the present day in some shrines, as, for instance, at the mountain village shrine of Our Lady of Letnica in Kosovo where they can still

be seen on the walls behind the sanctuary. In these respects, as in many others, *plus ça change ...*

Elizabeth Tingle has written an important book. It will be required reading for all who are interested in religious belief in the early modern period. Besides its central arguments, it also offers some fascinating asides that will either delight, or horrify, depending on your tastes. For the account of how pilgrims visiting the shrine of Saint-Hubert in the Ardennes were relieved of animal bites (not for the squeamish) it is alone worth consulting the book in your university library; or better still, ordering your own copy.

ST PATRICK'S COLLEGE,
MAYNOOTH

SALVADOR RYAN

Philip Howard. Cardinal protector of England. By Godfrey Anstruther OP (edited by Gerard Skinner, foreword Judith Champ). Pp. xiv + 306 incl. frontispiece and 4 ill. Leominster: Gracewing, 2020. £20 (paper). 978 085244 953 0
JEH (73) 2022; doi:10.1017/S0022046921001512

The work of Godfrey Anstruther, who died in 1988, laid essential foundation stones for modern studies of post-Reformation English Catholicism. His four-volume 'dictionary' of *The seminary priests, 1558–1850* (1968–77) remains a magisterial anatomy of the English secular clergy: a crucial resource for insights into the mission and its place within recusant society. Scholars will welcome the publication of Anstruther's manuscript on the life of his fellow Dominican, Cardinal Philip Howard; surprisingly, one of only two full-length biographies of a figure integral to our understanding of Catholicism in later seventeenth-century England. Howard's quiet ministration was central to the surge in Catholic political ambitions that followed the 1660 Restoration, and the hopes that coalesced around the household of Queen Catherine of Braganza. As grand almoner to the queen, he became an active participant in contestation over the internal ordering of a mission. Simultaneously, he was drawn into the question of how to present a case for Catholic liberties before the Protestant public domain. In 1675 his appointment to the cardinalate fronted an attempt to increase English agency within the international Church, when European rivalries and alliances drew the court of Charles II deeper into the realm of intramural Catholic diplomacy. Yet, by the later 1670s, Howard sat in tension with the political direction of the court, and its drift towards association with Louis XIV—offensive to the cardinal's temperament at once by dint of his militancy, and his 'Gallican' challenges to papal authority. Anstruther's biography draws together all of these worlds: built upon formidable command of manuscript material drawn out of dispersed holdings in England, Rome, Florence and Brussels (Howard's own papers were destroyed at his own instruction). Immaculately presented in the hands of its editor, Gerard Skinner, it anticipates many current preoccupations in the study of English Catholicism—the role played by English Catholics as participants in European theological and political controversies, and the influence of London chapels and embassies as points of connection between recusancy and the greater international Church.