

sector in rural Botswana, as wealthier cattle owners monopolised the access to boreholes drilled after independence. Furthermore, the livestock sector has already been in crisis for many years because foot and mouth disease is out of control, leading to the loss of access to export markets. These considerations suggest the crucial limitations of econometric-inspired studies and raise challenges for further research. One can learn much from analysing macroeconomic statistics, but the real understanding of economic life in Africa needs the study of what paradoxically is called the real economy: studies of the livestock sector in Botswana or the tobacco sector in Malawi. These volumes are valuable as inspiration for further research, but the new insights to be gained into African economies are limited.

JAN KEES VAN DONGE
Afrikastudiecentrum, Leiden

Moving People in Ethiopia: development, displacement and the state

edited by A. PANKHURST and F. PIGUET

Woodbridge: James Currey, 2009. Pp. 301, £45 (hbk).

doi:10.1017/S0022278X10000789

Ethiopia is known for the staggering scale of its planned resettlement schemes, in which the government is conservatively estimated to have moved 1.2 million people over 30–5 years. The 1980s schemes are already known to have had disastrous consequences environmentally, socially and economically. What is less well known is that there have been similar initiatives in the last decade. Pankhurst and Piguet's edited volume compares these two resettlement experiences, but goes much further to bring together detailed descriptions and analysis of state-run planned resettlement with other forms of displacement such as development-induced displacement and displacement by war. A powerful case is made that much can be learnt from considering these different forms of displacement together, empirically, analytically, and for policy purposes.

The cases are written mostly by Ethiopian and international anthropologists who have rich local knowledge and years of engagement with their subject areas. Overall, the story that emerges is depressing: the experiences are of 'untold suffering' (p. 247); Gebre Yntiso summarises: 'When resettlements are envisaged, their intentions often appear noble and honourable. The contradiction is that the outcomes are often contrary to expectations' (p. 125). The first set of contributions considers development-induced displacements. Chapters by Kassahun Kebede, Ayalew Gebre, Getachew Kassa, Melesse Getu, Tadesse Berisso and Feleke Tadele illustrate the impacts of displacement by dams, irrigation projects, commercial agriculture, wildlife parks and urban expansion. Together these papers illustrate the presuppositions underpinning these development projects, which share a 'mindset' that pastoralists, agro-pastoralists and 'peasants' have lifestyles that are 'primitive' and outdated, and/or that they can simply move elsewhere onto other supposedly 'unused' or underused land. The planners' discourses are characterised by large-scale problems and solutions, and by ideas of 'progress' and economic efficiency. Customary rights to natural resources are not respected. Tadesse Berisso's case also reveals a political undercurrent

to some of these policies, in which those displaced have often been seen as politically inconvenient in their former areas. The result of all these ‘development’ projects has tended to be environmental degradation, livelihood insecurity and conflict.

The cases described by Gebre Yntiso, Wolde-Selassie Abbute and Alula Pankhurst review the experiences of the state-planned resettlement. Pankhurst assesses how, in the 2000s, resettlement could be returned to not only as a ‘viable’ option but also as a ‘necessary’ one. He makes clear that, although the planning and the voluntary nature of the programmes have improved some outcomes, there is a large gap between plans and practice. Drawing on Gebre Yntiso’s work, he also shows that there is no simple dichotomy between voluntary and forced resettlers, and that more nuanced categories are required to analyse these situations (see also the chapter by Turton).

The final set of cases explores the experiences of those displaced by war. The studies by Lewis Apteker and Behailu Abebe contain vivid descriptions of personal experiences of displacement. They powerfully critique the Maslow pyramid hypothesis to show that psychological well-being is far from a luxury to be secured after material needs have been met: psychological health is a resource without which people cannot make use of economic opportunities. Similarly, many of the chapters in this edition (such as those by Wolde-Selassie Abbute, Kassahun Berhanu, Feleke Tadele and others) demonstrate the importance of social networks or social capital to people’s livelihoods. In addition, the differential impact of displacement on societies is demonstrated by many papers. Yisak Tefere’s study, which looks at the very differential experiences of male and female demobilised soldiers, illustrates this theme well.

In many ways this is a landmark text which is also a rallying cry for more attention to be paid to the subject of displacement and migration, as well as to the rights of the displaced and their hosts. The message is that displacement should not be seen as a one-off aberrational event, but as part of wider, on-going processes of migration. Resettlement is far from a technical process requiring technical inputs and solutions; it is social and political. The edited volume is also an excellent example of a combination of detailed anthropological description and analysis with real attempts to develop better policies and to influence policy makers. Some of the processes highlighted in this volume are unique to Ethiopia: the scale of the government’s resettlement scheme, the particular relations between highlanders and lowlanders, the very poor history of community participation in development planning and practice, particularly where wildlife conservation is concerned. And yet there is much of wider relevance too: the chapters by Cernea, Turton and de Wet connect the country-specific findings to wider processes elsewhere, and show that this volume and the community of scholars with Ethiopia-based analyses are setting an agenda for other scholars, policy makers and countries to follow.

ELIZABETH WATSON
University of Cambridge