aspects of Buddhism (for instance, dukkha, the Refuges, and the three characteristics of reality) in non-Buddhist terms, whether drawing on the Bible, other Christian texts, or the familiar anxieties of consumerist, workaholic culture. That said, at times more analysis would be needed to fully support the bridges built between Zen and the Bible, such as when the text identifies the divine "refuge and strength" of the psalms with the Three Refuges of Buddhism (6), or the self with the biblical I Am (e.g., 76, 104). Similarly, the first two chapters rely on Zen Master Norman Fischer's "Zen Inspired Translations of the Psalms" (187). These translations invite readers to encounter these familiar texts with fresh eyes, but some readers may feel as though they tilt the book too far to the "Zen" side of "Zen and the Bible," making the interreligious project more seamless than they'd like.

The book will likely be most helpful to spiritual seekers with some background in both Zen and the Bible, and it could be used in courses in spiritual formation or comparative spirituality that provide that background. Those who join Habito in this provocative koan-based approach to biblical spirituality will find him a most congenial companion. Given how helpfully the path is set out in the conclusion and appendix, though, they just might want to put the last first.

ANITA HOUCK
Saint Mary's College, Notre Dame, Indiana

On Music, Sense, Affect, and Voice. By Carol Harrison. New York: Bloomsbury T & T Clark, 2019. 172 pages. $24.95 (paper).
doi: 10.1017/hor.2020.84

Oxford professor and canon Carol Harrison's masterful study, the latest volume in Bloomsbury's Reading Augustine series, navigates a familiar dilemma in Augustine's faith journey and in the history of Christian spirituality. "What can we legitimately enjoy and what should we use? Is there a way of using and enjoying which does not take the object—however delightful—as an end in itself?" (106). Although Augustine is famously wary of the dangers of "sensuous gratification," Harrison persuasively charts across three key texts—*De Musica*, the *Confessions*, and the *Homilies on the Psalms*—the birthing in Augustine of a profoundly sacramental affirmation of the effects of music on the soul's journey from and back to God. In Augustine we find an emerging "theology of music," novel in the ancient church, grounded in God's own singing speech that gives birth to the material creation (40–44, 136–38).

In three carefully argued chapters—"The Conversion of the Senses," "The Conversion of the Affections," and "The Conversion of the Voice"—Harrison

https://doi.org/10.1017/hor.2020.84 Published online by Cambridge University Press

shows how the ineffable memories and sense impressions left on Augustine's heart by music lead him finally to endorse its use—to permit our "playing with fire, as it were" (106)—despite its potential dangers. By evoking what Harrison describes as "affective cognition" (107), music can inspire devotion in the listener "more ardently" than rational or discursive knowledge. Above all, it is the enduring impact of his teacher Ambrose's innovative church hymns that leads Augustine not only to "run after" and "gasp" for God but climactically to weep with joy, for "now at last I breathed your fragrance" (84). As Harrison comments, "If we weep because we are overcome by beauty, feel it as the overwhelming grace of God, and respond in faith, hope, and love, then the tears may still be involuntary and irrational but they are *good* tears" (84).

That music holds enormous capacity to convey a "felt" knowledge of God (107), not least in the "unlettered" majority of the faithful (23, 35), is a lesson I first experienced at the piano as a child, and which I carried into my first job as a high school theology teacher. Nothing prepared my students more felicitously for the terms and mysteries of formal theology, I found, than a well-chosen song or piece of instrumental music, contemplatively pondered together. What Harrison's study affirms is what many of us already know experientially, though we may not have the rational or discursive means to explain it. As Augustine came to believe, what "the generosity of God has granted music" (137) need not be feared but need only be lovingly channeled back in the direction from which it came. God's grace and God's majesty at once "render us speechless," concludes Harrison, and "propel song to take flight in wordless shouts of joy" (136). Because God *is Love*, God is known in the "cry of the heart" (139) that music stirs within us.

To affirm our capacity to know God palpably through the senses awakened by music, and further, that in so tasting God's sweetness we grasp something of that eternal love that sustains all of creation, is no small gift for people who may feel themselves adrift in an uncaring universe. As Harrison meticulously, often poignantly demonstrates, music by its very nature is "heavy with theological content" (36), and here, we may add, *teleological* content, if it is true that "becoming the music while the music lasts is the joy that awaits us in the life to come" (54). Helping others to hear that faith-content resound in the depths of the heart is Augustine's—and here Harrison's—enduring gift to the church. Music "in a very real sense democratized the Church: it conveyed the truths of faith to all, regardless of age, gender, education or social standing" (3). For this point alone, and for many others, Harrison's case for an

https://doi.org/10.1017/hor.2020.84 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Augustinian theology of music merits careful study, and perhaps even, if we dare, singing celebration.

CHRISTOPHER PRAMUK
Regis University

Spirituality without God: A Global History of Thought and Practice. By Peter Heehs. London, UK: Bloomsbury, 2019. 286 pages. $32.95 (paper).
doi: 10.1017/hor.2020.96

Readers of *Horizons*, whose personal lives, professional lives, and livelihoods are likely to be bound with organized religion, are unlikely to be approving of the "spiritual but not religious" phenomenon. The phrase probably brings to mind people who have no commitment to a practice or a community, but who claim a vague sense of connection to spiritual reality and who look down on religious practitioners as people with refined aesthetic tastes might look down on those with lesser tastes. The phenomenon might also look like robbery, as people freely take practices from various traditions without committing themselves to those traditions nor giving anything back to those communities. It might seem self-indulgent, as one mixes a "cocktail" of beliefs and practices "according to my own taste," as Raimundo Panikkar once expressed the matter. For good or for ill, however, the "spiritual but not religious" phenomenon is growing, and it behooves readers of this journal to learn more about it.

Peter Heehs took on the task of tracing the historical origins of the phenomenon. Heehs is an archivist and resident at the Aurobindo Ashram in Pondicherry, India. He is a historian of thought, of domestic terrorism and communal violence in India, and of the Indian spiritual leader, Aurobindo Ghose (1872–1950). His 2008 biography, *The Lives of Sri Aurobindo*, generated nationwide controversy in India and caused, or at least contributed to, profound fissures in the community at the Aurobindo Ashram. Those controversies, which continue somewhat today, are akin to the controversies in the West generated by the quest for the historical Jesus. There is the Aurobindo or Jesus of devotion, and the Aurobindo or Jesus that historical scholarship portrays.

The first chapter of *Spirituality without God* considers proof of the existence of God. Heehs concludes that God is a dubious concept, although he takes an agnostic stance. The aim of the next three chapters is to give a comprehensive, global history of theistic and nontheistic spiritualities. The fifth chapter shows the critical role of the Enlightenment in loosening the hold of organized religion in the West. The final two chapters survey some of the

https://doi.org/10.1017/hor.2020.84 Published online by Cambridge University Press