

Phenomenology and Naturalism

Royal Institute of Philosophy Supplement: 72



Edited by Havi Carel and Darian Meacham

Royal Institute of Philosophy Supplements

The Royal Institute of Philosophy Supplements are published twice a year. Institutional subscribers to the journal *Philosophy* receive the supplements as part of their subscription. The following supplements are available to purchase as books.

Volume 38	1995	Philosophy and Technology	(ISBN 0521558166)
39	1995	Karl Popper: Philosophy and Problems	(ISBN 0521558158)
40	1996	Philosophy and Pluralism	(ISBN 0521567505)
41	1996	<i>Verstehen and Human Understanding</i>	(ISBN 0521587425)
42	1997	Thought and Language	(ISBN 0521587417)
43	1998	Current Issues in Philosophy of Mind	(ISBN 0521639271)
44	1999	German Philosophy since Kant	(ISBN 0521667828)
45	1999	Philosophy and Public Affairs	(ISBN 0521667844)
46	2000	Logic, Cause & Action	(ISBN 0521785103)
47	2000	Philosophy, the Good, the True and the Beautiful	(ISBN 0521785111)
48	2001	Philosophy at the New Millennium	(ISBN 0521005086)
49	2001	Naturalism, Evolution and Mind	(ISBN 0521003733)
50	2002	Time, Reality & Experience	(ISBN 0521529670)
51	2002	Logic, Thought and Language	(ISBN 0521529662)
52	2003	Philosophy and the Emotions	(ISBN 0521537347)
53	2003	Minds and Persons	(ISBN 0521537339)
54	2004	Modern Moral Philosophy	(ISBN 0521603269)
55	2004	Agency and Action	(ISBN 0521603560)
56	2005	Philosophy, Biology and Life	(ISBN 0521678455)
57	2005	The Philosophy of Need	(ISBN 0521678447)
58	2006	Political Philosophy	(ISBN 0521695597)
59	2006	Preferences and Well-Being	(ISBN 0521695589)
60	2007	Narrative and Understanding Persons	(ISBN 9780521714099)
61	2007	Philosophy of Science	(ISBN 9780521718967)
62	2008	Being: Developments in Contemporary Metaphysics	(ISBN 9780521735445)
63	2008	Kant and Philosophy of Science Today	(ISBN 9780521748513)
64	2009	Epistemology	(ISBN 9780521138581)
65	2009	Conceptions of Philosophy	(ISBN 9780521138574)
66	2010	Philosophy as Therapeia	(ISBN 9780521165150)
67	2010	The Metaphysics of Consciousness	(ISBN 9780521173919)
68	2011	Philosophy and Religion	(ISBN 9781107615984)
69	2011	Philosophy and the Environment	(ISBN 9781107696075)
70	2012	Human Nature	(ISBN 9781107651975)
71	2012	Philosophy and the Arts	(ISBN 9781107661745)

From Volume 13 onwards the Series is published by Cambridge University Press and some earlier titles are also available.

This journal issue has been printed on FSC-certified paper and cover board. FSC is an independent, non-governmental, not-for-profit organization established to promote the responsible management of the world's forests. Please see www.fsc.org

Phenomenology and Naturalism

Examining the Relationship between
Human Experience and Nature

ROYAL INSTITUTE OF PHILOSOPHY SUPPLEMENT: 72

EDITED BY

Havi Carel and Darian
Meacham

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, CB2 1RP,
United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, United Kingdom
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013–2473, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
C/Orense, 4, planta 13, 28020 Madrid, Spain
Lower Ground Floor, Nautica Building, The Water Club, Beach Road,
Granger Bay, 8005 Cape Town, South Africa

© The Royal Institute of Philosophy and the contributors 2013

Printed in the United Kingdom at MPG Printgroup Limited.
Typeset by Techset Composition Ltd, Salisbury, UK

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 9781107699052

ISSN 1358-2461

Contents

Notes on Contributors	v
Phenomenology and Naturalism: Editors' Introduction HAVI CAREL AND DARIAN MEACHAM	1
Naturalized Phenomenology: A Desideratum or a Category Mistake? DAN ZAHAVI	23
The Body as a 'Legitimate Naturalization of Consciousness' RUDOLF BERNET	43
Phenomenology, Naturalism and the Sense of Reality MATTHEW RATCLIFFE	67
'Let's Look at It Objectively': Why Phenomenology Cannot be Naturalized DERMOT MORAN	89
Naturalism, Objectivism and Everyday Life ERAN DORFMAN	117
Science Friction: Phenomenology, Naturalism and Cognitive Science MICHAEL WHEELER	135
Nature's Dark Domain: An Argument for a Naturalized Phenomenology DAVID RODEN	169
Merleau-Ponty's Phenomenological Critique of Natural Science THOMAS BALDWIN	189
Naturalistic and Phenomenological Theories of Health: Distinctions and Connections FREDRIK SVENAEUS	221
Cultivating Virtue JONATHAN WEBBER	239
Science, Ethics and Observation JAMES LENMAN	261
Kant and Kierkegaard on Freedom and Evil ALISON ASSITER	275

The Universe in the Universe: German Idealism and the Natural History of Mind	297
IAIN HAMILTON GRANT	
From the Nature of Meaning to a Phenomenological Refiguring of Nature	317
DAVID MORRIS	

Notes on Contributors

ALISON ASSITER

Alison Assiter is Professor of Feminist Theory in Philosophy at the University of the West of England, Bristol. She has published a number of books and articles on feminist philosophy and political philosophy, including *Althusser and Feminism* (Pluto Press 1990) and *Enlightened Women* (Routledge 1996). Recently she has been working on Kant and Kierkegaard and published a monograph, *Kierkegaard, Metaphysics and Political Theory* (Continuum 2009) and a co-edited volume, *Kierkegaard and the Political* (Cambridge Scholarly Press 2012).

THOMAS BALDWIN

Thomas Baldwin is a Professor of Philosophy at the University of York. He edited Maurice Merleau-Ponty: *basic writings* (Routledge 2004) and *Reading Merleau-Ponty* (Routledge 2007). He has also published extensively on topics in analytic philosophy and its history, especially G.E. Moore, and (along with Consuelo Preti) recently produced an edition of Moore's *Early Philosophical Writings* (Cambridge University Press 2011). He is currently editor of *Mind*.

RUDOLF BERNET

Rudolf Bernet is Emeritus Professor of Philosophy at the University of Leuven and President of the Husserl Archives. He is a former President of the Deutsche Gesellschaft für phänomenologische Forschung and has taught as visiting professor at the universities of Nice, Copenhagen, Rome, Boston College, Stony Brook, and The Chinese University of Hong Kong. In 2008 he was awarded the *Alexander von Humboldt-Forschungspreis*. He has prepared critical editions of Husserl's posthumous writings on time (Meiner 1985, Kluwer 2001) and published more than 200 articles in French, German, English and Dutch on phenomenology, psychoanalysis and contemporary philosophy. He is the co-editor of *Edmund Husserl: Critical Assessments of Leading Philosophers* (Routledge 2005, 5 volumes). His books include: *An Introduction to Husserlian Phenomenology* (with I. Kern and E. Marbach) (Northwestern University Press 1993), *La vie du sujet* (PUF 1994) and *Conscience et existence* (PUF 2004).

Notes on Contributors

HAVI CAREL

Havi Carel is Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Bristol. She is currently a British Academy Fellow, writing a monograph on the phenomenology of illness for Oxford University Press. She is the author of *Illness* (2008) and *Life and Death in Freud and Heidegger* (2006) and the co-editor of *Health, Illness and Disease* (2012), *New Takes in Film-Philosophy* and *What Philosophy Is* (2004). In 2009–11 Havi led an AHRC-funded project on the concepts of health, illness and disease and in 2011–12 she was awarded a Leverhulme Fellowship.

ERAN DORFMAN

Eran Dorfman is Senior Lecturer in Philosophy and French Studies at Tel Aviv University and Program Director at the Collège International de Philosophie, Paris. He is the author of *Learning to See the World Anew: Merleau-Ponty Facing the Lacanian Mirror* (Phaenomenologica series, Springer, 2007, in French) and the co-editor of *Sexuality and Psychoanalysis: Philosophical Criticisms* (Leuven University Press, 2010). He has published numerous articles on phenomenology and is currently completing a book entitled *Foundations of the Everyday*.

IAIN HAMILTON GRANT

Iain Hamilton Grant is the author of *Philosophies of Nature after Schelling* (2006), co-author of *Idealism: History of a Philosophy* (2011), and of several papers on Schelling, idealism and the philosophy of nature. He is Senior Lecturer in and founding member of the department of philosophy at UWE Bristol.

JAMES LENMAN

James Lenman was educated at Oxford and St Andrews. He has previously held teaching positions at Lancaster and Glasgow and a fellowship at Harvard. He is now Professor of Philosophy at the University of Sheffield. He has published on a wide range of topics in ethics and metaethics.

DARIAN MEACHAM

Darian Meacham received his PhD in Philosophy from the Husserl Archives, University of Leuven and is currently Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of the West of England. His interests are primarily in phenomenology, bioethics, and political philosophy. He is the author of many

Notes on Editors and Contributors

papers in phenomenology including, most recently, an article on Husserl's relation to biology, 'Biology, The Empathic Science: Husserl's *Beilage XXIII* of the *Krisis*', *Journal of the British Society for Phenomenology* 44:1 (2013). He is also the editor of the forthcoming *Medicine in Society, New Continental Perspectives* (Springer).

DERMOT MORAN

Dermot Moran is Professor of Philosophy (Metaphysics & Logic) at University College Dublin and Member of the Royal Irish Academy. He has published widely on medieval philosophy and contemporary European philosophy, especially phenomenology. His books include *The Philosophy of John Scottus Eriugena* (Cambridge 1989; reissued 2004), *Introduction to Phenomenology* (Routledge 2000), *Edmund Husserl* (Polity 2005), *Husserl's Crisis of the European Sciences: An Introduction* (Cambridge University Press 2012), and, co-authored with Joseph Cohen, *The Husserl Dictionary* (Continuum 2012). He has edited Husserl's *Logical Investigations*, 2 vols. (Routledge 2001) and *The Routledge Companion to Twentieth Century Philosophy* (Routledge 2008). He is Founding Editor of the *International Journal of Philosophical Studies*.

DAVID MORRIS

David Morris received his PhD in Philosophy from the University of Toronto, and is Professor of Philosophy at Concordia University, Montreal. His main interests are in phenomenology (esp. Merleau-Ponty) with a focus on the philosophy of the body, mind and nature, in relation to current biology and cognitive science. He is currently working on the problem of the genesis of meaning and sense, in relation to living and perceptual phenomena. He is the author of *The Sense of Space* (SUNY Press, 2004).

MATTHEW RATCLIFFE

Matthew Ratcliffe is Professor of Philosophy at Durham University, UK. Most of his recent work addresses issues in phenomenology, philosophy of psychology and philosophy of psychiatry. He is author of *Rethinking Commonsense Psychology: A Critique of Folk Psychology, Theory of Mind and Simulation* (Palgrave, 2007) and *Feelings of Being: Phenomenology, Psychiatry and the Sense of Reality* (Oxford University Press, 2008).

Notes on Contributors

DAVID RODEN

David Roden completed his PhD at Cardiff University in 1999. Since 2002 he has worked for the Open University as a lecturer and associate lecturer and is a member of the Open University mind, meaning and rationality research group. He has written a chapter for the forthcoming Springer Frontiers volume *The Singularity Hypothesis: A Scientific and Philosophical Assessment* and is currently completing *Posthuman Life: Philosophy at the Edge of the Human* to be published by Acumen in 2013.

FREDRIK SVENAEUS

Fredrik Svenaeus is professor at the Centre for Studies in Practical Knowledge, Södertörn University, Sweden. His main research areas are philosophy of medicine, bioethics, medical humanities, and philosophical anthropology. He has published a number of articles and books on these subjects, most often from a phenomenological point of view. Two recent examples are 'Organ Transplantation and Personal Identity: How Does Loss and Change of Organs Affect the Self?', *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy*, **37**: 139–158, 2012; 'The Relevance of Heidegger's Philosophy of Technology for Biomedical Ethics', *Theoretical Medicine and Bioethics*, in press 2013.

JONATHAN WEBBER

Jonathan Webber is Reader in Philosophy at Cardiff University. He is the author of *The Existentialism of Jean-Paul Sartre* (Routledge, 2009), editor of *Reading Sartre: on Phenomenology and Existentialism* (Routledge, 2011), and translator of Sartre's book *The Imaginary* (Routledge, 2004). He has published papers on moral psychology and virtue ethics in leading philosophy journals, including *European Journal of Philosophy*, *Journal of Moral Philosophy*, *Mind*, and *Philosophical Quarterly*.

MICHAEL WHEELER

Michael Wheeler is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Stirling. His primary research interests are in philosophy of science (especially cognitive science, psychology, biology, artificial intelligence and artificial life) and philosophy of mind. He also works on Heidegger, and is particularly interested in developing philosophical ideas at the interface between the analytic and the continental traditions. His first book, *Reconstructing the Cognitive World: the Next Step*, was

Notes on Editors and Contributors

published by MIT Press in 2005. He is just completing a new book, on the extended mind hypothesis, called *Thinking Without the Box: the Case for Extended Cognition*.

DAN ZAHAVI

Dan Zahavi is Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Center for Subjectivity Research at the University of Copenhagen. He obtained his PhD from Katholieke Universiteit Leuven in 1994 and his Dr.phil. (Habilitation) from University of Copenhagen in 1999. He has served as president of the *Nordic Society for Phenomenology* in the years 2001–2007, and is currently co-editor in chief of the journal *Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences*. In his systematic work, Zahavi has mainly been investigating the nature of selfhood, self-consciousness and intersubjectivity. His most important publications include *Husserl und die transzendente Intersubjektivität* (Kluwer 1996), *Self-awareness and Alterity* (Northwestern University Press 1999), *Husserl's Phenomenology* (Stanford University Press 2003), *Subjectivity and Selfhood* (MIT Press 2005), and together with Shaun Gallagher *The Phenomenological Mind* (Routledge 2008).