

Notes

Introduction: why the Lied?

1. LMLR, 20, according to a personal interview with the well-known accompanist Michael Raucheisen.
2. LMLR, 20–21; this reminiscence by Emilie Bittner, a singer and widow of the composer Julius Bittner.
3. Quoted from *Johann Wolfgang Goethe, Gedenkausgabe der Werke, Briefe und Gespräche*, ed. Ernst Beutler (Zurich: Artemis, 1950) V: 146. The passage is from the *Vorspiel auf dem Theater* to *Faust*.
4. Peter Gay, *Weimar Culture: The Outsider as Insider* (New York and London, 1968), 67.
5. *The Critical Edition of the Works of Gioachino Rossini*, under the aegis of the Fondazione Gioachino Rossini, in Pesaro, Italy, and the Center for Italian Opera Studies (CIAO) at the University of Chicago, began publishing this composer's works in 1979. *The Works of Giuseppe Verdi*, published by the University of Chicago Press (and also directed at CIAO), issued its first volume in 1983. The Donizetti Society in London began a series of Donizetti's collected works in the 1970s. A critical edition of Vincenzo Bellini's works, a joint effort between the City of Catania, Italy, and Ricordi BMG, is in the planning stages.
6. Of the three, Schubert has been the subject of greatest controversy in the wake of the suggestion that he may have explored homoeroticism through musical means. For a recent overview of this subject, see my review of Lawrence Kramer's *Franz Schubert: Sexuality, Subjectivity, Song* (Cambridge, 1998) and Brian Newbould, ed., *Schubert Studies* (Aldershot, 1998) in JAMS 54 (2001), 651–61.
7. Although both volumes are in need of updating, the listing of studies devoted to nineteenth-century music in the two following books amply document the explosion of interest in this music: Arthur Bampton Wenk, *Analyses of Nineteenth and Twentieth-Century Music: 1940–1985* (Boston, 1987) and Harold J. Diamond, *Music Analyses: An Annotated Guide to the Literature* (New York, 1991).
8. This is the title, in translation, of Eisler's "Ändere die Welt, sie braucht es," composed for Brecht's play *Die Massnahme*, first performed Berlin, 13 December 1930.
9. The phrase is quoted from Ernst Buske, "Jugend und Volk," in Werner Kindt, *Grundschriften der deutschen Jugendbewegung* (Düsseldorf, 1963), 198.
10. One indication of the role song played in the *Wandervogel* movement is provided by Hans Breuer's compilation of German folk songs, gathered under the title *Der Zupfgeigenhansl*. A runaway best-seller, the song collection attained its tenth edition by 1913.
11. I am not the first to refer to "the modern Lied." As it happens, August Reißmann, *Das deutsche Lied in seiner historischen Entwicklung* (Kassel, 1861), 208, uses exactly this phrase – "das moderne Lied" – to refer to almost the same body of music, extending the boundaries back to "the Lied in the age of Goethe" and up to his own day. In using the phrase here, I do so with the understanding that it begins in the 1740s and continues until at least World War II.
12. Georg Eismann, *Robert Schumann: Ein Quellenwerk über sein Leben und Schaffen*, 2 vols. (Leipzig, 1956), I: 18; my translation.
13. Kant's definition of *Bildung* is perhaps the most to the point. In his well-known essay "What is Enlightenment?" (1784), he answers the question asked in his title as follows: "Enlightenment is man's release from his self-incurred tutelage. Tutelage is the inability to make use of one's understanding without direction from another. Self-incurred is this tutelage when its origin lies not in lack of courage but in lack of resolution to use it without direction from another. *Sapere aude!* Have the courage to use your own reason! – this is the motto of Enlightenment." Quoted after *Kants Werke: Akademie-Textausgabe*, vol. VIII, *Abhandlungen nach 1781* (Berlin, 1968), 35. The centrality of *Bildung* in the history of European and particularly German culture is reflected in a bibliography of ever-growing proportion. A short list of such investigations includes W. H. Bruford, *The German Tradition of Self-Cultivation: Bildung from Humboldt to Thomas Mann* (London and New York, 1975), Franco Moretti, *The Way of the World: the Bildungsroman in European Culture*, new edn. trans. Albert Sbragia (London and New York, 2000), Rolf Selbmann, *Der deutsche*

Bildungsroman, 2nd edn. (Stuttgart, 1994), and Martin Swales, *The German Bildungsroman from Wieland to Hesse* (Princeton, 1978). Oddly, given the concept's significance, its correlation with music has received little sustained attention.

14. As the central character avers in Book V, chapter 3, his life's ambition is "the harmonious development of my personality." *Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship*, ed. and trans. Eric A. Blackall, *Goethe's Collected Works*, vol. IX (Princeton, 1995), 175. The importance of *Bildung* for German culture as it intersects with German song is considered again in chapters 2, 13, and 14.

15. Cited in Walter Wiora, *Das deutsche Lied: Zur Geschichte und Ästhetik einer musikalischen Gattung* (Wolfenbüttel and Zurich, 1971), 15.

16. Meinecke, *The German Catastrophe: Reflections and Recollections*, trans. Sidney B. Fay (Cambridge, MA, 1950 [originally pub. 1946 as *Die deutsche Katastrophe*]), 119–20.

17. Gay, *Weimar Culture*, 68.

18. Quoted from Theodor W. Adorno's "Kulturkritik und Gesellschaft," in *Prisms [Prisms]*, trans. Samuel and Shierry Weber (Cambridge, MA, 1992), 34.

19. *Versuch einer kritischen Dichtkunst für die Deutschen*, 3rd edn. (Leipzig, 1742), 760 and 759.

20. Hagedorn, *Oden und Lieder in fünf Büchern*, book I (Hamburg, 1747), 1.

21. "Zuschrift" to *Vier und zwanzig, theils ernsthafte, theils scherzende, Oden, mit leichten und fast für alle Häuse bequemen Melodien versehen* (Hamburg, 1741).

22. AmZ (25 January 1826), 28. Jahrgang, No. 4, column 56.

23. *Götzen-Dämmerung*, "Sprüche und Pfeile," §33, in *Nietzsche Werke Kritische Gesamtausgabe*, ed. Giorgio Colli and Mazzino Montinari (Berlin, 1969) VI/3: 58 – "Der Deutsche denkt sich selbst Gott lieder-singend." Nietzsche's aphorism in turn is an intentional misreading of a line from Ernst Moritz Arndt's 1813 poem, "Des Deutschen Vaterland." The latter was written at a time when the German-speaking lands were smarting under Napoleon. Divided into nine strophes, the poem begins with the question "Was ist des Deutschen Vaterland?" (What is the German fatherland?). In the sixth strophe, Arndt answers it is the realm that extends from where one hears the sound of German tongues to where "God in heaven sings Lieder": "So weit die deutsche Zunge klingt / Und Gott im Himmel Lieder singt." For Arndt's poem in full, see *Gedichte von Ernst Moritz Arndt*, ed. Heinrich Meisner (Leipzig, 1894): I: 18–21.

1 In the beginning was poetry

1. Dietrich Fischer-Dieskau, *Texte deutscher Lieder: Ein Handbuch* (Munich, 1968).

2. Schubert set seventy poems by Goethe; the next largest number derives from his friend Johann Mayrhofer and totals forty-seven. Schubert's two song cycles to poems by Müller resulted in forty-five individual Lieder. For a convenient listing of Schubert, his poets, and the names and numbers of poems he set, see John Reed, *The Schubert Song Companion* (Manchester, 1985), 461–81.

3. For a discussion of Goethe's centrality to the history of the Lied, see Harry Seelig, "The Literary Context," GLNC, 1–30.

4. For an extended analysis of this issue in Schubert, see my "The Poetry of Schubert's Songs" in *Schubert's Vienna*, ed. Raymond Erickson (New Haven and London, 1997), 183–213.

5. Gottsched, *Versuch*, 82.

6. *Ibid.*, 428.

7. In this respect, Gottsched follows Horace closely. His views on the nature and character of the poet are elaborated at length in chapter 2 of the *Versuch*.

8. This and all subsequent translations are mine except as noted.

9. For a thorough assessment of this issue, see Reinhard Strohm, *Dramma per Musica: Italian Opera Seria of the Eighteenth Century* (New Haven and London, 1997), 23–29.

10. For an extended discussion of simplicity as an ideal in eighteenth-century song, see J. W. Smeed, *German Song and its Poetry, 1740–1900* (London and New York, 1987), 66–81, and chapter 2 below.

11. *Abhandlung über den Ursprung der Sprache* (Berlin, 1770); quoted from *Sturm und Drang: Kritische Schriften*, ed. Erich Loewenthal (Heidelberg, 1963), 404.

12. I describe here the roots in the period for what Lawrence Kramer so compellingly has analyzed as the "convergence" of music and poetry in the Romantic period; see Kramer, *Music and Poetry: The Nineteenth Century and After* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, 1984), 18–24.

13. As Max Kommerell tellingly puts it, every Goethe poem has its "moment of the heart." Quoted from "Das Volkslied und das deutsche Lied," in Kommerell, *Dame Dichterin und andere Essays* (Munich, 1967), 7–64.

14. Although Schubert (and Fischer-Dieskau) use the common title, "Wanderers Nachtlied," the actual title in Goethe's collected poems, where it follows the poem entitled "Wanderers Nachtlied," is "Ein Gleiches" (Another), which nevertheless implies that its speaker is a wanderer.

15. As one moves outside the central repertory the proportion of declamation increases. Reichardt's Goethe settings include not only declamatory poems, but also settings of passages from dramas. Some of Liszt's songs are so declamatory as to verge on melodrama, a popular genre in the nineteenth century. His settings of the songs from Schiller's *Wilhelm Tell*, for example, contrast markedly with the lyricism of Schubert's settings of the same texts.
16. See Eduard Genast, *Aus Weimars klassischer und nachklassischer Zeit: Erinnerungen eines alten Schauspielers*, ed. Robert Kohlrausch (Stuttgart, n.d.), 126–27.
17. *Die Poggenpuhls* (1896) contains a semi-professional performance, *Effi Briest* (1894) a virtuoso one.
18. The tendency to write at least in part for the professional is implicit from the 1790s. In the songs of Reichardt, for example, there is often a strong *Singspiel* influence, a form of north German operetta to be performed by actors who also sang but were not normally trained opera singers.
19. Compare, for example, Smeed, *German Song*, 20–37, Seelig, “The Literary Context,” 1–2.
20. Wordsworth, *Selected Poems and Prefaces*, ed. Jack Stillinger (Boston, 1965), 461.
21. For a useful compendium of German folk-songs with melody, author and composer where known, see Ernst Klusen, ed., *Deutsche Lieder: Texte und Melodien* (Frankfurt am Main, 1980).
22. Discussions of sublimity all go back to Longinus's treatise on the sublime of (probably) the first century AD. It is concerned primarily with the rhetorical devices that enhance the grandeur of conception and emotion in literature. Although he was read with considerable sympathy and interest by neo-classical commentators, in the course of the eighteenth century he was adopted as a figure of classical authority in the accelerating attack on neo-classicism. For a thorough history of this shift in England, see Samuel Holt Monk, *The Sublime: a Study of Critical Theories in Eighteenth-Century England* (Ann Arbor, 1960).
23. This underlying complementarity of the natural and the supernatural constitutes for Meyer H. Abrams the defining quality of Romanticism in his general study of the period, *Natural Supernaturalism: Tradition and Revolution in Romantic Literature* (New York, 1971).
24. The most influential analysis of the Biedermeier period and concept is Friedrich Sengle's monumental three-volume study *Biedermeierzeit: Deutsche Literatur im*

Spannungsfeld zwischen Restauration und Revolution, 1815–1848 (Stuttgart, 1971–1980).

For an excellent analysis of the relation of Biedermeier to Romanticism, see Virgil Nemoianu's *The Taming of Romanticism: European Literature and the Age of Biedermeier* (Cambridge, MA, 1984), 1–40.

25. Wordsworth, *Selected Poems*, 460.

26. See again my “The Poetry of Schubert's Songs,” 188.

27. Wolf, for example, set “Anakreons Grab,” one of Goethe's earliest, and relatively loose, attempts at elegiac form, as lyrical declamation; Reichardt set passages from two of Goethe's elegies, “Alexis und Dora” and “Euphrosyne,” as declamations, grouped with other declamatory songs and passages from dramas. See Reichardt, *Göthes Lieder, Oden, Balladen und Romanzen mit Musik von J. F. Reichardt* [1809], ed. Walter Salmen (Munich, 1964), vol. LVIII, *Das Erbe deutscher Musik*, 86–93. In the settings of both composers, the particular rhythms of the language are lost in the freer rhythms of the declamation.

28. Settings of German sonnets are rare; Seelig, “The Literary Context,” 18–19, lists eighteen in the entire repertory. Even frequently set poets otherwise known for their sonnets, such as Rückert, tend not to be represented by sonnets in the song repertory.

29. Hegel, *Aesthetics: Lectures on Fine Art* [1835], tr. T. M. Knox (Oxford, 1975), II: 1138.

30. Hugo Friedrich, *Die Struktur der modernen Lyrik von Baudelaire bis zur Gegenwart* (Hamburg, 1956), 22.

2 The eighteenth-century Lied

1. Charles Rosen, *The Romantic Generation* (Cambridge, MA, 1995), 124.

2. Edward T. Cone, “Words and Music: The Composer's Approach to the Text,” in *Music: A View from Delft, Selected Essays*, ed. Robert P. Morgan (Chicago, 1989), 115.

3. Lawrence Kramer, “The Schubert Lied: Romantic Form and Romantic Consciousness,” in SCAS, 200.

4. Eric Sams, “Schubert,” *New Grove*, XVI: 774.

5. Charles Rosen, *The Classical Style* (New York, 1972), 454.

6. The secondary literature on the eighteenth-century Lied, although not vast, is too extensive to acknowledge here.

Nevertheless, mention must be made of a study, that, while a century old, remains the starting point for anyone interested in the subject: Max Friedländer's *Das deutsche Lied im 18. Jahrhundert: Quellen und Studien* (Stuttgart and Berlin, 1902). Vol. I is devoted to a

- checklist of 798 song collections published between 1736 and 1799. Vol. II is given over to a survey of the most significant songs arranged according to poets. Other studies include Heinrich W. Schwab's *Sangbarkeit, Popularität und Kunstlied: Studien zu Lied und Liedästhetik der mittleren Goethezeit, 1770–1814* (Regensburg, 1965) and Hans Joachim Moser's *Goethe und die Musik* (Leipzig, 1949). For an overview, see James Parsons, "Lied. § III. c. 1740 – c. 1800," *New Grove* 2, XIV: 668–71.
7. C. P. E. Bach, from the autobiographical sketch first published in German in Charles Burney's *Tagebuch einer musikalischen Reisen*, trans. J. J. C. Bode (Hamburg, 1773), III: 199–209. The relevant passage appears on p. 209.
8. *AmZ*, 16 (12 October 1814), cols. 680–92; quoted from E. T. A. Hoffmann's *Musical Writings*, ed. David Charlton, trans. Martyn Clarke (Cambridge, 1989), 379.
9. (Leipzig, 1834), 98–99.
10. *Discourse on the Origin of Inequality*, in *The Social Contract and Discourses*, trans. G. D. H. Cole (New York, 1950), 157.
11. Trans. Daniel O. Dahlstrom in *Friedrich Schiller Essays*, ed. Walter Hinderer, *The German Library* 17 (New York, 1998), 192.
12. *Schiller Essays*, 180; the remark is from *Über naive und sentimentalische Dichtung*.
13. *Versuch einer kritischen Dichtkunst*, 4th edn. (Leipzig, 1751), 144 and 466. My translation; unless otherwise noted, all translations are mine. For a recent assessment of Gottsched and his place in the history of German literature, see P. M. Mitchell, *Johann Christoph Gottsched (1700–1766): the Harbinger of German Classicism* (Columbia, 1995).
14. *Versuch einer kritischen Dichtkunst*, 13.
15. For more on Hagedorn see Reinhold Münster, *Friedrich von Hagedorn: Dichter und Philosoph der fröhlichen Aufklärung* (Munich, 1999) and Steffen Martus, *Friedrich von Hagedorn: Konstellationen der Aufklärung* (Berlin, 1999).
16. Hagedorn, *Oden und Lieder*, xiv, xii–xiii; quoted from *Des Herrn Friedrichs von Hagedorn Sämtliche poetische Werke*, Dritter Teil (Hamburg, 1757). *The Guardian*, No. 16, 30 March 1713; quoted in *The Guardian*, ed. John Calhoun Stephens (Lexington, 1982), 88–89.
17. Newell E. Warde discusses Uz in greater detail in *Johann Peter Uz and German Anacreonticism: the Emancipation of the Aesthetic* (Frankfurt am Main, 1978); also Helena Rosa Zeltner, *Johann Peter Uz: von der "Lyrischen Muse" zur "Dichtkunst"* (Zurich, 1973).
18. "Horaz," line 125, *Sämtliche poetische Werke*, 72.
19. Scheibe, *Critischer Musikus* 1 (5 March 1737), 3.
20. Thirty years later Hiller would echo Scheibe in the "Vorbericht des Componisten" of his *Lieder für Kinder* (Leipzig, 1769), I: "I have preferred the simple and naturally singable to the bombastic and artistic."
21. Scheibe, *Critischer Musikus* 64 (17 November 1739), 295, 299, and 302. Half a lifetime later, Reichardt repeated the concept almost verbatim. For him, a melody is genuine if it "leaves an impression on one who is not a connoisseur and remains in his memory, this is an unailing proof it is *natural* and *unforced*." Reichardt's *Briefe eines aufmerksamen Reisenden* (1774), in *Source Readings in Music History*, ed. and trans. Oliver Strunk (New York: 1950), 701; the emphasis is Reichardt's.
22. The first two are *Sammlung auserlesener moralischer Oden, zum Nutzen und Vergnügen der Liebhaber des Claviers* and were published by the author in Leipzig in 1740 and 1741; the third, brought out in 1743, retains the start of the title of the first two volumes yet adds: *und des Singen*. An announced fourth volume never was published. For a facsimile, see Lorenz Mizler *Sammlungen auserlesener moralischer Oden*, with afterword by Dragan Plamenac (Leipzig, 1971).
23. Quoted from Plamenac's facsimile edn., 110.
24. Telemann, *Vierundzwanzig, theils ernsthafte, theils scherzende, Oden, mit leichten und fast für alle Häuse bequemen Melodien versehen* (Hamburg, 1741), 3.
25. Quoted from *Des Herrn Friedrichs von Hagedorn poetische Werke in drei Theilen* (Hamburg: Johann Carl Bohn, 1769), I: 34.
26. "Die Schönheit" (lines 22–24), *Sämtliche poetische Werke* (1757), part III, book IV, 82.
27. "Der Morgen" (lines 41–44), *Oden und Lieder*, III: 164.
28. *Oden und Lieder*, III, quoted from *Sämtliche poetische Werke*.
29. "Der Weise auf dem Lande," lines 1–5, *Sämtliche poetische Werke*, 47–48.
30. From the poem "Gott im Frühling," lines 38, 13, 37, and 39, *Sämtliche poetische Werke*, 203–04.
31. *Albrecht von Hallers Gedichte*, ed. Ludwig Hirzel (Frauenfeld, 1882), *Bibliothek älterer Schriftwerke der Deutschen Schweiz und ihres Grenzgebietes* 3, 405; letter of March 1772.
32. *Schillers Werke: Nationalausgabe* [hereafter NA], vol. XX: *Philosophische Schriften*, ed. Benno von Wiese (Weimar, 1962), 472.
33. *Geschichte des Agathon* (Frankfurt and Leipzig, 1766–67), I: 57–58 and 52.

34. Scheibe, *Critischer Musikus* (1745 reprint), 722–23.
35. First published in 1742; quoted from Hagedorn's *Oden und Lieder in fünf Büchern* (Hamburg, 1747), book II, 41–42. Görner's setting was published in the *Sammlung neuer Oden und Lieder* (Hamburg, 1744); vol. I appeared in 1742.
36. Immanuel Kant, *Werke: Akademie-Textausgabe* (Berlin, 1968), III: 520.
37. Wordsworth, *The Recluse, Part First, Book First – Home At Grasmere*, lines 402–03.
38. Herder, *Auszug aus einem Briefwechsel über Ossian und die Lieder alter Völker*, trans. Joyce P. Crick in *Eighteenth-Century German Criticism*, ed. Timothy J. Chamberlain, *The German Library* 11 (New York, 1992), 138; the emphasis is Herder's.
39. Preface to *Die Braut von Messina*, entitled "Über den Gebrauch des Chors in der Tragödie," NA, X: 8.
40. Krause, *Von der musikalischen Poesie* (Berlin, 1753), 92, 2.
41. Although the collection was issued without attributions to either poets or composers, Friedrich Wilhelm Marpurg identified both in his *Historische-Kritische Beyträge zur Aufnahme der Musik* (Berlin, 1754), I: 55–57.
42. Thrasybulos Georgiades, "Lyric as Musical Structure: Schubert's Wanders Nachtlied ('Über allen Gipfeln,' D. 768)," trans. Marie Louise Göllner, in SCAS, 93: "Musical structure is created when language is captured as something real, when it is taken 'at its word.'"
43. Scheibe, *Critischer Musikus* 64 (1738), 295.
44. For reasons presently impossible to determine, either Ramler – the same Ramler who supplied Graun with the libretto for *Der Tod Jesu* – or Graun himself made certain changes in Hagedorn's poem for the *Oden mit Melodien*. Compare the text as included in Example 2.2 with the text given above at the start of the discussion of Hagedorn's *An die Freude*. In stanza 1 Ramler changes "edler Herzen" to "muntrer Tugend" (bright virtue); "dich vergrößern, dir" to "deinen Kindern wohl" ([let the songs that here resound please] thy children). Other changes occur in the second, fourth, and fifth stanzas, while the third is preserved intact.
45. Just what keyboard instrument eighteenth-century Lied composers had in mind is not always an easy question to answer. In an attempt to disentangle this matter, perhaps the first thing to bear in mind is practicality; performers surely would have used whatever instrument – clavichord, harpsichord, and later early piano – they had at hand. This said, in some works it seems certain that a specific instrument is implied. See also below, n. 63.
46. Quoted in Ernst Bücken, *Das deutsche Lied* (Hamburg, 1939), 43.
47. Cited in H. C. Robbins Landon, *The Collected Correspondence and London Notebooks of Joseph Haydn* (London, 1959; hereafter CCLN), 31 and 305.
48. 12 September 1825. SDB, 587; my emphasis.
49. See, for example: *Sing- und Spieloden vor Musikalische Freunde* (1762); the previously mentioned *Musicalische Belustigungen* (1774); *Sammlung größerer und kleinerer Singstücke mit Begleitung des Claviers* (1788); and *Melodien zum Milheimischen Liederbuche für das Piano-Forte oder Clavier* (1799).
50. Issue of 24 October 1759, 16. The song in question is *Der Freundschaftsdienst*.
51. *Berlinische musikalische Zeitung* 1 (1805), 9, trans. *The Critical Reception of Beethoven's Compositions by his German Contemporaries* [hereafter CRBC], ed. Wayne M. Senner (Lincoln, NE, 1999), 220.
52. Mattheson, *Critica musica* (reprint edn., Amsterdam, 1964), II: 311.
53. *Ibid.*, II: 309.
54. *Ibid.*, I: 100.
55. *Poetics of Music* (Cambridge, MA, 1942), 63.
56. Quoting respectively from Hiller, *Lieder mit Melodien* (Leipzig, 1772) preface (unpaginated) and J. A. P. Schulz, "Veränderungen; Variationen," in Johann Georg Sulzer, *Allgemeine Theorie der schönen Künste* [1774]; quoted from rev. edn. (Leipzig, 1793), IV: 637.
57. Heinrich Schwab documents other examples of such variations in his "Die Liednorm 'Strophigkeit' zur Zeit von Joseph Martin Kraus," in *Joseph Martin Kraus in seiner Zeit*, ed. Friedrich W. Riedel (Munich and Salzburg, 1982), 83–100.
58. For an overview see David Montgomery, "Franz Schubert's Music in Performance: A Brief History of People, Events and Issues" in CCS, 272–74. Fn. 6 contains a number of useful references on this subject as it applies to Schubert Lieder.
59. A. Peter Brown, "Musical Settings of Anne Hunter's Poetry: From National Song to Canzonetta," JAMS 47 (1994), 52, fn. 26, reminds us that "Haydn's canzonettas should not be mistaken for English Lieder." Their detailed keyboard parts, length, and expressive depth, he insists, relate to the Viennese Lied tradition.
60. On Viennese Lieder, see Vera Vysloulzilova, "Bei den Anfängen des Wiener Kunstliedes: Josef Antonin Stepan und seine *Sammlung deutscher Lieder*," in *Wort und Ton im europäischen Raum: Gedenkschrift für Robert Schollum* (Vienna,

- 1989), 69–77. The most complete treatment of song in Vienna in its early phase remains Irene Pollak-Schlaffenberg's "Die Wiener Liedmusik von 1778–1789," *Studien zur Musikwissenschaft. Beihefte zu Denkmäler der Tonkunst in Deutschland* 5 (1918), 97–139. Another important study is A. Peter Brown's "Joseph Haydn and Leopold Hofmann's 'Street Songs,'" *JAMS* 33 (1980), 356–83. See also Editha Alberti-Radanowicz, "Das Wiener Lied von 1789–1815," *Studien zur Musikwissenschaft* 10 (1923), 37–76.
61. Haydn to his publisher Artaria, 27 May 1781, trans. CCLN, 27–28.
62. *Musikalischer Almanach* (Berlin, 1796), unpaginated.
63. Zachariae's 1754 poem "An mein Clavier" – "You, echo of my laments, my faithful lyre" – was set to music at least ten times during the century. See DL, II: 48–49. The subject is considered in detail in John William Smeed's "Süssertönendes Klavier: Tributes to the Early Piano in Poetry and Song," *ML* 66 (1985), 228–40. Notwithstanding the completeness of Smeed's article in other details, the thought that Zachariae's poem is a tribute to the early piano needs to be modified in favor of the clavichord; see Annette Richards, *The Free Fantasia and the Musical Picturesque* (Cambridge and New York, 2001), 156–57.
64. The Lied is from Schneider's 1793 collection *Lieder zum Singen am Clavier und Forte Piano* (Mannheim), 2–7. As late as 1837, Schneider's Lieder, according to Gustav Schilling's *Universal-Lexicon der Tonkunst* (Stuttgart, 1837), still were lauded as "true masterpieces of their sort." Quoted in DL, II: 448. The publishing house of Simrock erroneously brought out Schneider's Lied under Mozart's name, a mistake in authorship corrected in the *AmZ* 1 (1795), col. 745.
65. Werner-Joachim Düring, *Erlkönig-Vertonungen: Eine historische und systematische Untersuchung* (Regensburg, 1972), 115–40.
66. Lenz, *Die kleinen*, in *Gesammelte Schriften*, ed. Franz Blei, 5 vols. (Munich, 1909–13), III: 327–28.
67. Johann Wolfgang Goethe, *Münchener-Ausgabe*, I/2, 363.
68. Schiller, NA, XX: 424; the emphasis is Schiller's.
69. Max Hecker, ed., *Der Briefwechsel zwischen Goethe und Zelter* (Leipzig, 1913), II: 59; letter of 20 May 1820.
70. This would remain the venue for Lied performances until the middle of the nineteenth century. Exceptions to this rule caused surprise. In 1813 a Viennese critic, in response to a public performance of Beethoven's *Adelaide*, noted: "As unusual as the appearance of a German vocal piece is at a concert, this nevertheless did not fail to have an effect upon a public that, not prejudiced in favor of particular forms, possesses a general receptivity to everything that is truly beautiful. Text, music, and performance combined to guarantee a splendid artistic enjoyment." The singer was Franz Wild, who, in 1815, was the last performer with whom Beethoven collaborated in a public performance before the latter's deafness prohibited further such appearances, this before the Russian empress, again in *Adelaide*. As the Vienna critic goes on to note about the 1813 performance, "Mr. Wild correctly understood the spirit of the simple, expressive, tenderly nuanced singing. The attempt made thereby to promote German national singing is particularly praiseworthy, although it can be foreseen that Mr. Wild will find few imitators in this matter, for such songs presuppose a full, powerful, resonate voice, which only extremely few of today's singers possess, and the lack of which they try to hide through excessive ornamentations, which, however are not compatible with German national singing at all." *Wiener allgemeine musikalische Zeitung* 1 (1813), 300–01, trans. in CRBC, 222.
71. *Oden mit Melodien*, part I (Berlin, 1753).
72. Heinrich Christoph Koch, "Lied," *Musikalisches Lexikon* (Frankfurt am Main, 1802), col. 901; emphasis added.
73. Cramer's *Magazin der Music* 1 (1783), 456–57.
74. Quoted from Eric A. Blackall, *The Emergence of German as a Literary Language: 1700–1775*, 2nd edn. (Ithaca, 1978), 3–4, 13.
75. *Critischer Musikus*, 1745 reprint, 9.
76. Dedication, Telemann, *24 Oden*.
77. Although I have yet to come across a reference that makes this point unequivocally, the era consistently viewed the public realm as masculine, the private feminine – the latter the Lied's longstanding locale. This bifurcation of male and female spheres is the subject of an extended discussion in the *Conversations-Lexicon oder Handwörterbuch für die gebildeten Stände*, 3rd edn. (Leipzig and Altenburg, 1815), IV: 211. See also Karin Hausen, "Family and Role-Division: The Polarisation of Sexual Stereotypes in the Nineteenth Century – an Aspect of the Dissociation of Work and Family Life," in *The German Family: Essays on the Social History of the Family in Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Germany*, ed. Richard J. Evans and W. R. Lee (London, 1981), 51–83.

78. *Versuch einer Critischen Dichtkunst*, 4th edn., 760 and 759.

79. Quoted in DL, I: 196.

80. “Lieder (Schluß),” NZfM (31 July 1843), 33–35; trans. in *Robert Schumann on Music and Musicians*, 242. Schumann attributes this advancement to developments in German poetry, specifically those by Eichendorff, Rückert, Uhland, and Heine.

81. NZfM 1 (23 October 1834), 234.

3 The Lieder of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach, Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven

1. See Johann Friedrich Reichardt, *Briefe eines aufmerksamen Reisenden die Musik betreffend* (Frankfurt and Leipzig, 1774), I: 124 and *Schreiben über die Berlinische Musik* (Hamburg, 1775), 8, as quoted in Hans-Günter Ottenberg, *C. P. E. Bach*, trans. Philip J. Whitmore (Oxford, 1987), 152. See also Charles Burney, *An Eighteenth-Century Musical Tour in Central Europe and the Netherlands*, ed. Percy A. Scholes (Oxford, 1959), 219.

2. See Friedrich Chrysander, “Eine Klavier-Phantasie von K. P. E. Bach mit nachträglich von Gerstenberg eingefügten Gesangsmelodien zu zwei verschiedenen Texten” in *C. P. E. Bach: Beiträge zu Leben und Werk*, ed. Heinrich Poos (Mainz, 1993), 329–53. Also Ernst F. Schmid, *C. P. E. Bach und seine Kammermusik* (Kassel, 1931), 51–53.

3. For a comparison of C. P. E. Bach with Klopstock see the review of Bach’s fantasies and sonatas in AmZ 3 (1801), 299, as quoted in Schmid, *C. P. E. Bach und seine Kammermusik*, 60.

4. See letter of 14 August 1774 from Johann Heinrich Voß to Ernestine Boie, as quoted in Gudrun Busch, *C. Ph. E. Bach und seine Lieder* (Regensburg, 1957), I: 125, and in Ottenberg, *C. P. E. Bach*, 155.

5. See C. P. E. Bach, *Kantaten und Lieder*, ed. Otto Vrieslander (Munich, 1922), 25–26.

6. See letter of October 1780 from Voß to Schulz, as quoted in Busch, *C. Ph. E. Bach und seine Lieder*, I: 136–37.

7. See the review in *Allgemeine deutsche Bibliothek*, ed. Christoph Friedrich Nicolai (Kiel, 1792), I: 113, as quoted in Busch, *C. Ph. E. Bach und seine Lieder*, I: 203.

8. DL, II: 128–32.

9. The “Göttingen Grove” was a group of poets from that city noted for their allegiance to the poetry of Klopstock as well as to all things German. For a brief discussion of the group, see Nicholas Boyle, *Goethe: the Poet and the Age* (Oxford, 1992), I: 153.

10. See the discussion in David P. Schroeder, *Haydn and the Enlightenment* (Oxford, 1990), 91 and 114; also C. P. E. Bach’s *Selbstbiographie* as included in Burney, *Tagebuch seiner musikalischen Reisen*, III: 199–209.

11. See DL, II: 49.

12. *Ibid.*, I: 242–43.

13. See the preface to C. P. E. Bach, *Herrn Professor Gellerts geistlichen Oden und Lieder mit Melodien* (Berlin, 1758).

14. See Busch, *C. Ph. E. Bach und seine Lieder*, I: 60–61.

15. See C. P. E. Bach, *Geistliche Lieder*, ed. C. H. Bitter (Berlin, 1880), I: 8. In this edition the title of the song is given as *Grüsse Gottes in der Natur*.

16. See the preface to C. P. E. Bach, *Herrn Professor Gellerts geistlichen Oden und Lieder*.

Bach’s abandonment of figured bass in this collection also is discussed in chapter 2.

17. C. P. E. Bach, *Herrn Doctor Cramers übersetzte Psalmen mit Melodien zum Singen bey dem Claviere* (Leipzig, 1774).

18. See Busch, *C. Ph. E. Bach und seine Lieder*, I: 58f.

19. See Ewan West, “The *Musenalmanach* and Viennese Song 1770–1830,” ML 67 (1986), 37–49.

20. Example taken from *Denkmäler der Tonkunst in Österreich*, vol. LIV, ed. Margarete Anson and Irene Schläffenberg (Vienna, 1920), 9.

21. See Cramer’s *Magazin der Musik*, I (1783), 453, as quoted in DL, I: 245.

22. See Haydn’s letter to Artaria of 20 July 1781, as quoted in DL, I: 270–71 and in H. C. Robbins Landon, *Haydn: Chronicle and Works* (Bloomington, 1976), II: 448–49.

23. The text of Hofmann’s *Eilt ihr Schäfer* is given in DL, I: 271–72.

24. The music for both Hofmann and Haydn’s setting of Ziegler’s poem appears in full in Brown, “Joseph Haydn and Leopold Hofmann’s ‘Street Songs,’” JAMS 33 (1980). Hofmann’s is given on pp. 373–74 and Haydn’s on pp. 374–75; in this source Hofmann’s Lied is labeled *Pastorella: An Thyrsis* and Haydn’s is called *An Thyrsis*. Haydn’s Lied also is available in *Joseph Haydn Lieder für eine Singstimme mit Begleitung des Klavier* (Munich, 1982), 10–11.

25. See Cramer, *Magazin der Musik*, I (1783), 456, as quoted in DL, I: 288. See also Robbins Landon, *Haydn: Chronicle and Works*, II: 456–57.

26. See Theodor Göllner, “Vokal und instrumental bei Haydn,” *Bericht über den Internationalen Joseph Haydn Kongress*, ed. Eva Badura-Skoda (Munich, 1986), 104–10.

27. See Haydn's letter to Artaria of 18 October 1781, as quoted in Robbins Landon, *Haydn: Chronicle and Works*, II: 453.
28. *Joseph Haydn Lieder*, 5.
29. *Ibid.*, 4.
30. *Ibid.*, 6 and 28 respectively.
31. *Ibid.*, 14.
32. *Ibid.*, 26–27.
33. *Ibid.*, 21–23.
34. *Ibid.*, 11–13.
35. I derive my examples of Mozart songs from *Lieder für Singstimme und Klavier*, ed. Paul Klengel (Wiesbaden, n.d.). For the reader wishing to collate my discussion with an easily obtainable source, I provide references to the Dover reprint of the Breitkopf & Härtel publication of songs originally published in *Mozart's Werke*, Serie 7, "Lieder und Gesänge mit Begleitung des Pianoforte" (Leipzig, 1881); this source is available as Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart, *Songs for Solo Voice and Piano* (New York, 1993), hereafter cited as *Mozart Songs*. In this source *An Chloe* is given on pp. 44–47.
36. Friedrich Schiller, *Über naive und sentimentalische Dichtung* (Stuttgart, 1978), 30.
37. *Ibid.*, 53 and 57.
38. *Ibid.*, 36. Schiller describes the impression given by "naive" poetry as "immer fröhlich, immer rein, immer ruhig." *Mozart Songs*, 53.
39. *Über naive und sentimentalische Dichtung*, 57–58.
40. *Mozart Songs*, 22–23 and 50–51, respectively.
41. See Maurice J. E. Brown, "Mozart's Songs for Voice and Piano," *MR* 17 (1956), 19–28.
42. *Mozart Songs*, 38–39.
43. *Ibid.*, 26–27.
44. See Paul Nettl, "Das Lied" in *Mozart Aspekte*, ed. Paul Schaller and Hans Kühner (Olten and Freiburg im Breisgau, 1956), 205–27.
45. *Mozart Songs*, 34–37.
46. *Ibid.*, 40–43.
47. For example, Štěpán's setting of *Das Veilchen* as published in the first *Sammlung deutscher Lieder* (Vienna, 1778) erroneously attributed the poem to Gleim. Friberth's setting in the third *Sammlung* of 1780, which was in Mozart's possession, did not give the name of the poet though it seems from the "vom Göthe" written onto Mozart's manuscript that he knew who the true author was. See John Arthur and Carl Schachter, "Mozart's *Das Veilchen*," *MT* 130 (1989), 149–55.
48. See *Beethoven: Letters, Journals and Conversations*, ed. Michael Hamburger (London, 1951), 268.
49. I direct the reader to the following edition of Beethoven's *Lieder*: *Sämtliche Lieder, Beethoven Werke*, part XII, vols. I and II, ed. Helga Lühning (Munich, 1990). Hereafter cited as *Beethoven Lieder*. For Beethoven's *Klage*, see II: 180–81.
50. *Beethoven Lieder*, II: 187–88.
51. See Friedrich Schiller, "Über Matthissons Gedichte," *Sämtliche Werke*, ed. J. Perfaßl (Munich, 1968), 702.
52. *Beethoven Lieder*, I: 25–31.
53. NCGL, 97.
54. *Beethoven Lieder*, I: 83–85.
55. See William Kinderman, *Beethoven* (Berkeley, 1995), 139–40.
56. See Jack Stein, *Poem and Music in the German Lied from Gluck to Hugo Wolf* (Cambridge, MA, 1971), 53–54.
57. *Beethoven Lieder*, I: 14–16.
58. *Ibid.*, I: 38–41.
59. *Ibid.*, I: 100–03.
60. *Ibid.*, I: 46–60.
61. Questions about Beethoven's conception of the ordering of the Gellert songs are raised in the preface to *ibid.*, ix.
62. *Ibid.*, I: 96–99.
63. See Rellstab's account of Goethe giving the manuscript of *Wonne der Wehmut* to Mendelssohn for him to play, as recorded in Romain Rolland, *Goethe and Beethoven*, trans. G. A. Pfister and E. S. Kemp (New York, 1968), 61. For the music, see *Beethoven Lieder*, I: 124–25.
64. See Tieck's views on Beethoven's songs as transmitted in his novella *Musical Sorrows and Joys*, as translated by Linda Siegel, *German Romantic Literature* (Novato, CA, 1983), 113.

4 The Lieder of Schubert

1. Edith Schnapper, *Die Gesänge des jungen Schubert bis zum Durchbruch des romantischen Liedprinzipes* (Bern and Leipzig, 1937). The full text of Vogl's diary passage is given in Andreas Liess, *Johann Michael Vogl: Hofoperist und Schubert-Sänger* (Graz and Cologne, 1954), 153.
2. From Schubert's diary, 14 June 1816; quoted from SDB, 60.
3. Quoted from George Grove, rev. W. H. Hadow, "Franz Schubert," in *Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd edn. (London, 1908), V: 330a.
4. Although recognized by contemporaneous listeners, the aesthetics of musical absolutism shaping musical understanding in the second half of the nineteenth century worked to obscure the degree to which composers relied on *topoi*. Not totally forgotten, their authority was minimized until the second half of the twentieth century. Scholars who have worked to restore a proper understanding of the various *topoi* include: Leonard G. Ratner, *Classic Music: Expression, Form, and Style* (New York, 1980),

- see especially Chapter 2, “Topics”; Wye Jamison Allanbrook, *Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart: Le Nozze di Figaro and Don Giovanni* (Chicago, 1983); and V. Kofi Agawu, *Playing with Signs: A Semiotic Interpretation of Classic Music* (Princeton, 1991).
5. 12 September 1825; quoted from SDB, 458.
 6. Goethe made this pronouncement in a letter to Adalbert Schöpke, 16 February 1818; quoted from *Goethes Briefe* (Weimar, 1904), XXIX: 53–54. The letter also is quoted in *Goethes Leben von Tag zu Tag. Eine dokumentarische Chronik*, ed. Robert Steiger und Angelika Reimann (Zurich and Munich, 1993), VI: 545.
 7. For more detailed examinations, see V. Kofi Agawu, “Schubert’s Harmony Revisited: The Songs ‘Du liebst mich nicht’ and ‘Dass Sie hier gewesen,’” *JMR* 9 (1989), 23–42; Susan Youens, “Schubert and the Poetry of Graf August von Platen-Hallermünde,” *MR* 46 (1985), 19–34; and Kristina Muxfeldt, “Schubert, Platen, and the Myth of Narcissus,” *JAMS* 49 (1996), 480–527.
 8. *AmZ*, 25 April 1827; quoted from SDB, 636; trans. amended.
 9. Hans Georg Nägeli, *Vorlesungen über Musik mit besonderer Berücksichtigung der Dilettanten* ([1826] Darmstadt, 1983), 61–62.
 10. For more on the type of Lied composed in the nearly eighty years before Schubert, see Heinrich W. Schwab, *Sangbarkeit, Popularität und Kunstlied: Studien zu Lied und Liedästhetik der mittleren Goethezeit 1770–1814* (Regensburg, 1965) as well as chapter 2 of this book.
 11. So called by the Viennese reporter for the London music periodical, *The Harmonicon*, April 1826; quoted from SDB, 518.
 12. SDB, 877.
 13. Karl Goedeke, *Schillers Sämtliche Werke* (Stuttgart, 1879), I: viii.
 14. SDB, 353, quoting from the *AmZ*, 24 June 1824; trans. amended.
 15. Gunter Maier, *Die Lieder Johann Rudolf Zumsteegs und ihr Verhältnis zu Schubert* (Göppingen, 1971). In Mozart’s own personal thematic catalogue he indicates that *Die ihr des unermesslichen Weltalls Schöpfer ehrt* was composed in July of 1791 and describes it as “eine kleine teutsche kantata für eine Stim[m]e am klavier” (a little German cantata for voice at the keyboard). See *Mozart’s Thematic Catalogue: A Facsimile. British Library Stefan Zweig MS 63*, introduction and transcription by Albi Rosenthal and Alan Tyson (Ithaca, 1990), 56 and fol. 27v.
 16. See Jack M. Stein, *Poem and Music in the German Lied from Gluck to Hugo Wolf* (Cambridge, MA, 1971), 53–54.
 17. See further Albrecht Riethmüller, “Heine, Schubert und Wolf: ‘Ich stand in dunkeln Träumen,’” *Muzikoloski zbornik* 34 (1998), 69–87.
 18. *AmZ*, 7 October 1829, col. 660.
 19. Paul Mies, *Schubert, der Meister des Liedes. Die Entwicklung von Form und Inhalt im Schubertschen Lied* (Bern, 1928).
 20. Marie-Agnes Dittrich, *Harmonik und Sprachvertonung in Schuberts Liedern* (Hamburg, 1991).
 21. Hans-Joachim Moser, *Das deutsche Lied seit Mozart* (Berlin and Zurich, 1937), 125.
 22. Werner Thomas, “Der Doppelgänger von Franz Schubert,” in *Schubert-Studien* (Frankfurt am Main, 1990), 115–35.
 23. Moser, *Das deutsche Lied*, 125.
 24. Gustav Schilling, “Dis-Moll,” in *Encyclopädie der gesammten musikalischen Wissenschaften, oder Universal-Lexicon der Tonkunst*, ed. Schilling (Stuttgart, 1835–), II: 422–23.
 25. Dorothea Redepenning, *Das Spätwerk Franz Liszts: Bearbeitungen eigener Kompositionen* (Hamburg, 1984).
 26. Diether de la Motte, “Das komplizierte Einfache. Zum ersten Satz der 9. Symphonie von Gustav Mahler,” *Musik und Bildung* 10 (1978), 145–51.
 27. Quoted from Harry Goldschmidt, *Franz Schubert. Ein Lebensbild* (Leipzig, 1964), 180; see also SMF, 334. For a more detailed account of Schubert’s circle and the influence they had on his taste in literature and poetry, see David Gramit, “The Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets of Franz Schubert’s Circle” (Ph.D. dissertation, Duke University, 1987). See also the same author’s “‘The Passion for Friendship’: Music, Cultivation, and Identity in Schubert’s Circle,” in *CCS*, 56–71.
 28. SDB, 128–30.
 29. Walther Dürr, “Lieder für den verbannten Freund. Franz Schubert und sein Freundeskreis in Opposition zum Metternich-Regime,” in *Zeichen-Setzung. Aufsätze zur musikalischen Poetik*, ed. Werner Aderhold and Walburga Litschauer (Kassel, 1992), 135–40.
 30. On the subject of censorship in general in Vienna during the first half of the nineteenth century, see Walter Obermaier, “Zensur im Vormärz,” in *Bürgersinn und Aufbegehren. Biedermeier und Vormärz in Wien 1815–1848*, ed. Selma Trosa (Vienna, 1988), 622–27; see also the same author’s “Schubert und die Zensur,” in *Schubert-Kongress Wien 1978. Bericht* (Graz, 1979), 117–25. On censorship and the Schubert Lied, see Walther Dürr, “Schuberts Lied *An den Tod* (D.518) – zensiert?,” *ÖMz* 38 (1983), 9–17.
 31. For more on Schubert’s settings of Mayrhofer, see SPML, chapter 3, “Chromatic

Melancholy: Johann Mayrhofer and Schubert,” 151–227.

32. The reference to “the Greek bird” is a pun on the name Vogl, as the word *Vogel* in German means bird. Quoted from SDB, 134.

33. For an examination of the latter, see Barbara Kinsey, “Schubert and the Poems of Ossian,” *MR* 34 (1973), 22–29.

34. SDB, 375.

35. *Ibid.*, 250.

36. *Ibid.*, 254.

37. See further SPML, chapter 2, “The Lyre and the Sword: Theodor Körner and the Lied,” 51–150.

38. Walther Dürr, “Die Freundeskreise,” in *Schubert-Handbuch*, ed. Walther Dürr and Andreas Krause (Kassel and Basel, 1997), 19–45. Also Eva Badura-Skoda, Gerold W. Gruber, Walburga Litschauer, Carmen Ottner, eds. *Schubert und seine Freunde* (Vienna, 1999) and Ilija Dürhammer, *Schuberts literarische Heimat. Dichtung und Literaturrezeption der Schubert-Freunde* (Vienna, 1999).

39. Rita Steblin, *Die Unsinnsgesellschaft. Franz Schubert, Leopold Kupelwieser und ihr Freundeskreis* (Vienna, 1998).

40. *NZfM* 41 (1854), 104.

5 The early nineteenth-century song cycle

1. Note Peter Kaminsky’s “The Popular Album as Song Cycle: Paul Simon’s *Still Crazy After All These Years*,” *College Music Symposium* 32 (1992), 38–54.

2. See further David Gramit’s “Lied, Listeners, and Ideology: Schubert’s ‘Aline’ and Opus 81,” *CM* 58 (1995), 28–60.

3. Throughout this chapter, titles translated into English reflect the German distinction between *Gesang* (song) and *Lied* (Lied).

4. For the concept of a generic contract, I am indebted to Jeffrey Kallberg’s “The Rhetoric of Genre: Chopin’s Nocturne in G Minor,” *19CM* 11 (1988), 238–61. John Daverio discusses early nineteenth-century attitudes toward genre and the song cycle in his chapter “The Song Cycle: Journeys Through a Romantic Landscape,” in *GLNC*, 279–312. Although a list of titles relating to genre from the field of literary criticism would be impractical to provide here, those interested may profit from consulting David Duff’s collection of essays, *Modern Genre Theory* (London, 2000); Walter Gobel’s “The State of Genre Theory; or, Towards an Anthropological Approach to Genre,” *Symbolism: An International Journal of Critical Aesthetics* 1 (2000), 327–48; Johan Hoorn’s “How Is a Genre Created? Five Combinatory Hypotheses,” *Comparative Literature and Culture: A WWWeb*

Journal 2, No. 2 (June 2000); and Walter Bernhart’s “Some Reflections on Literary Genres and Music,” in *Word and Music Studies: Defining the Field. Proceedings of the First International Conference on Word and Music Studies at Graz, 1997*, ed. Walter Bernhart, Werner Wolf, and Steven Paul Scher (Amsterdam, 1999).

5. Surely related is the Romantic interest in ruins, a subject frequently at the heart of Caspar David Friedrich’s paintings; his 1825 *Ruine Eldena* affords a well-known example.

6. Susan Youens summarizes Schubert’s contributions in “Franz Schubert: The Prince of Song,” in *GLNC*, 31–74.

7. Helen Mustard, *The Lyric Cycle in German Literature*, Columbia University Germanic Studies No. 17 (Morningside Heights, 1946); and Harry Seelig, “The Literary Context: Goethe as Source and Catalyst,” *GLNC*, 1–30.

8. Friedrich Schlegel, *Kritische Schriften und Fragmente*, ed. Ernst Behler and Hans Eichner, 6 vols. (Munich, 1988), I: 244 (“Kritische Fragmente 1797”), No. 60; VI: 3 (“Zur Poesie. II. Paris. 1802. December.”), No. 19; VI: 11 (“Zur Poesie und Litteratur 1807. I.”), No. 50; and V: 255 (“Zum Roman. Notizen bei der Lektüre 1799.”), No. 237.

9. Goethe’s impact on the German language has been so widely acknowledged and remains so fundamental to studies of the German language and its literature that the idea cannot be attributed to any individual author or authors. The following sources summarize that impact and provide a starting point for those interested: Eric Blackall, *The Emergence of German as a Literary Language 1700–1775*, 2nd edn. (Ithaca, 1978); Nicholas Boyle, *Goethe: The Poet and the Age* (Oxford, 1991); and Seelig, “The Literary Context: Goethe as Source and Catalyst.”

10. Discussions of the history of organicism and its impact on early Romanticism include Giordano Orsini’s “The Ancient Roots of a Modern Idea,” in *Organic Form: The Life of an Idea*, ed. G. S. Rousseau (London, 1972), 7–24; Ruth Solie’s “The Living Work: Organicism and Musical Analysis,” *19CM* 4 (1980), 147–56; Brian Primmer’s “Unity and Ensemble: Contrasting Ideals in Romantic Music,” *19CM* 6 (1982), 97–140; Lotte Thaler’s *Organische Form in der Musiktheorie des 19. und beginnenden 20. Jahrhunderts* (Munich, 1984); Lothar Schmidt’s *Organische Form in der Musik: Stationen eines Begriffs 1795–1850* (Kassel and Basel, 1990); and David Montgomery’s “The Myth of Organicism: From Bad Science to Great Art,” *MQ* 76 (1992), 17–66.

11. Wilhelm Müller, *Vermischte Schriften*, ed. Gustav Schwab (Leipzig, 1830), IV: 118. The

- comment originally was published in *Hermes*, 1827.
12. Barbara P. Turchin, “Robert Schumann’s Song Cycles in the Context of the Early Nineteenth-Century Liederkreis” (Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1981), 69–96.
13. Reichardt’s essay appeared three times between 1801 and 1804: Reichardt, “Etwas über das Liederspiel,” *Leipzig AmZ* 43 (22 July 1801): 709–17; Heinrich Christoph Koch, *Musikalisches Lexikon* (Frankfurt am Main, 1802), “Liederspiel”; and Reichardt, *Liederspiele* (Tübingen, 1804), Introduction. The text and a translation of all three versions appears in Ruth O. Bingham, “The Song Cycle in German-Speaking Countries 1790–1840: Approaches to a Changing Genre” (Ph.D. dissertation, Cornell University, 1993), 251–64.
14. Daverio, “The Song Cycle,” 280, found this to be equally the case in performance: “Complete or near-complete renditions of cycles were not unknown in the first half of the century . . . But the practice of selecting and presenting individual songs was the norm, in both public and private circles.” Perhaps related to this was the concert practice of performing selected opera arias and movements from symphonies or concertos. The early nineteenth-century relationship between the publication or performance of selections and perceptions of the whole needs further study.
15. Schubert’s Opp. 52 and 62 remain popular as individual songs; it is only as cycles they are neglected in both performance and study.
16. “Die Idee, einen ganzen Roman ohne Erzählung, blos durch eine Reyhe Lieder . . . zu liefern ist neu.” Quoted in Turchin, “Robert Schumann’s Song Cycles,” 45 and fn. 2, quoting Meredith Lee, *Studies in Goethe’s Lyric Cycles* (Chapel Hill, 1978), 86. Turchin, 44–47, discusses Göckingk, Wobeser, Schlegel, and the rise of the Liederroman; Mustard, *The Lyric Cycle*, 18–22, discusses Göckingk and his cycle in depth.
17. I am indebted to Ludwig Kraus’s “Das Liederspiel in den Jahren 1800 bis 1830: Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte des deutschen Singspiele” (Ph.D. dissertation, Vereinigte Friedrichs-Universität Halle-Wittenberg, 1921), 6–7, for the particularly apt “Brennpunkt” (flashpoint).
18. “[Vergils] Beispiel veranlasste folgenden Zyklus kleiner idyllischer Lieder . . . Wenn gleich ein leichtes Band von Wechselbeziehungen durch den Zyklus hinläuft: so kann doch jedes einzelne Lied, als ein kleines Ganze, für sich bestehen und ausgehoben werden,” Christoph August Tiedge, *Sämmtliche Werke*, 4th edn., 10 vols. in 3 (Leipzig, 1841), foreword to *Alexis und Ida*.
19. “Wem z.B. könnte es einfallen, die 46 Stücke nach einander weg singen zu wollen; und wer könnte es auch? Wählt man aber für jedes Mal einzelne Stücke, so giebt man ohnehin auf, und vermisst nicht mehr, was die Sammlung zu einem wahren Ganzen machen sollte . . .” *Leipzig AmZ* 17 (1815), 162.
20. A more complete history and discussion of this cycle is in Bingham, “The Song Cycle in German-Speaking Countries,” 134–212; Susan Youens, “Behind the Scenes: *Die schöne Müllerin* before Schubert,” *19CM* 15 (1991), 3–22; and Youens, *Schubert: Die schöne Müllerin* (Cambridge, 1992), 1–11.
21. “Gesellschaftlich” here implies both a cooperative effort and warm fellowship.
22. Numerous studies of Schubert’s cycle address its tonal scheme using one of these approaches. Examples here were drawn from Franz Valentin Damian, *Franz Schuberts Liederkreis Die schöne Müllerin* (Leipzig, 1928); John Reed, “*Die schöne Müllerin* Reconsidered,” *ML* 59 (1978), 411–19; Turchin, “Robert Schumann’s Song Cycles,” 191–94; Christopher Lewis, “Text, Time, and Tonic: Aspects of Patterning in the Romantic Cycle,” *Intégral: The Journal of Applied Musical Thought* 2 (1988), 37–73; and Rita Steblin, *A History of Key Characteristics in the Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries* (Ann Arbor, 1983).
23. Recently, for example, Ernst-Jürgen Dreyer opened his discussion of a cycle that predates Beethoven’s by stating that *An die ferne Geliebte* seemed to have been born “*ex nihilo*” in “Kleine Beiträge: Leopold Schefer und die ‘in die Luft schwebende Musik’: ein Beitrag zur Frühgeschichte des Liederzyklus,” *Mf* 51 (1998), 438.
24. Louise Eitel Peake, “The Song Cycle: A Preliminary Inquiry into the Beginnings of the Romantic Song Cycle and the Nature of an Art Form” (Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1968), 253–55. For a recent discussion of Loewe, Fanny Hensel, Liszt, Franz, and Cornelius, see Jürgen Thym’s “Crosscurrents in Song: Five Distinctive Voices,” in *GLNC*, 153–85.
25. Arthur Komar, for example, uses this definition in his “The Music of *Dichterliebe*: The Whole and Its Parts,” in *Schumann: Dichterliebe: An Authoritative Score* (New York, 1971), 64–66.
26. “Mimesis” here relates to John Neubauer’s use in *The Emancipation of Music from Language: Departure from Mimesis in Eighteenth-Century Aesthetics* (New Haven, 1986).
27. Joseph Kerman, “*An die ferne Geliebte*,” in *Beethoven Studies*, ed. Alan Tyson (New York,

1973), 123–24, and reprinted in Kerman's *Write All These Down: Essays on Music* (Berkeley, 1994), 173–74.

28. "Der Dichter, mag er nun, wie angegeben, heissen, oder nicht . . .," AmZ 19 (1817), 73.

29. Turchin, "Robert Schumann's Song Cycles," 67–69.

30. See Rufus Hallmark's "Robert Schumann: The Poet Sings," GLNC, 75–118, for a more thorough discussion of Schumann's cycles of 1840, as well as of his lesser-known later songs and cycles. For a more specialized consideration of Schumann and the song cycle restricted to a single poet, see David Ferris, *Schumann's Eichendorff Liederkreis and the Genre of the Romantic Cycle* (New York, 2000).

31. This is somewhat of an oversimplification. In his "Robert Schumann: The Poet Sings," 77–79, Hallmark points out several possible reasons why Schumann began composing songs, including Clara Wieck's inspiration, stylistic changes, ambitions to compose an opera, and Mendelssohn's encouragement, in addition to economic reasons. Others who have theorized explanations for Schumann's "conversion" to songs include Fritz Feldman, "Zur Frage des 'Liederjahres' bei Robert Schumann," AfM 9 (1952), 246–69; Leon Plantinga, *Schumann as Critic* (New York, 1976); Eric Sams, "Schumann's Year of Song," MT 106 (1965), 105–07; Stephen Walsh, *The Lieder of Schumann* (London, 1971); and Turchin, "Schumann's Conversion to Vocal Music: A Reconsideration," MQ 67 (1981): 392–404. Daverio, "The Song Cycle," 289 and fn. 34, also notes the connection between Schumann's piano and song cycles and cites Eric Sams's *The Songs of Robert Schumann*, 2nd edn. (London, 1975), 36, which examines the inspiration for the Heine *Liederkreis* in sketches for *Davidsbündlertänze*.

32. Schumann reviewed *Lieder* by Berger, Loewe, Bernhard Klein, Marschner, Ries, and others. Plantinga, *Schumann as Critic*, 164–71, summarizes Schumann's views.

33. See Daverio's section, "After Schumann: Experiments, Dramatic Cycles, and Orchestral Lieder," on the song cycles of Cornelius, Brahms, Wagner, Wolf, Mahler, and Strauss, in GLNC, 293–305.

6 Schumann: reconfiguring the Lied

I should like to thank Ralph Locke for his assistance in reading a draft of this essay and Luca Lombardi and Miriam Meghnagi for their hospitality at the shores of Lago Albano near Rome, where much of this chapter was written during a delightful December visit.

1. Johannes Brahms published three of them in 1893 in a supplement volume to the *Schumann Collected Works Edition* (XIV/1, 34–37).

Universal Edition published six more, edited by Karl Geiringer, *Robert Schumann: Sechs Frühe Lieder*, in 1933; another appeared in the same year as a supplement in the centennial issue of the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik*. Rufus Hallmark saved another from obscurity in 1984; see his "Die handschriftlichen Quellen der Lieder Robert Schumanns," in *Robert Schumann: Ein romantisches Erbe in neuer Forschung* (Mainz, 1984), 99–117, more specifically 101–02. A few others remain manuscripts.

2. The beginnings of *An Anna II* and *Im Herbste* are recycled in the slow movements of the Sonatas in F \sharp minor and G minor, respectively, and the melodic substance of *Hirtenknabe* returns in the *Intermezzo*, Op. 4, No. 4.

3. The ubiquity of strophic song within the history of the eighteenth-century German Lied is considered above in chapter 2; see also Heinrich Schwab, *Sangbarkeit, Popularität und Kunstlied* (Regensburg, 1965) and J. W. Smeed, *German Song and its Poetry: 1740–1900* (London, 1987).

4. Cited in Dietrich Fischer-Dieskau, *Robert Schumann: Wort und Musik. Das Vokalwerk* (Stuttgart, 1981), 25.

5. Schumann, *Briefe: Neue Folge*, ed. F. Gustav Jensen (Leipzig, 1904), 143.

6. Quoted from Wolfgang Boetticher, *Robert Schumann in seinen Briefen und Schriften* (Berlin, 1942), 340.

7. Helma Kaldewey, "Die Gedichtabschriften von Robert und Clara Schumann," in *Robert Schumann und die Dichter*, ed. Josef Kruse (1991), 88–99.

8. Rufus Hallmark, "Die Rückert Lieder of Robert and Clara Schumann," 19CM 14 (1990), 3–30.

9. Among others, John Daverio, in chapter 5 of his *Robert Schumann: Herald of a "New Poetic Age"* (Oxford, 1997), 182–96, discusses the difficult circumstances leading up to the Schumann marriage.

10. Schumann, *Briefe: Neue Folge*, 164.

11. Franz Brendel, "Robert Schumann with Reference to Mendelssohn-Bartholdy and the Development of Modern Music in Germany," trans. Jürgen Thym, in *Schumann and His World*, ed. R. Larry Todd (Princeton, 1994), 317–37, especially 328.

12. Wasielewski, *Robert Schumann: Eine Biographie*, 4th edn. (Leipzig, 1906 [first edn., 1858]), 283.

13. Arnfried Edler, *Robert Schumann und seine Zeit* (Laaber, 1982), 212–13 and Daverio, *Robert Schumann*.

14. See further Fritz Feldmann, "Zur Frage des 'Liederjahres' bei Robert Schumann," *AfM* 9 (1952), 246–69, and Leon Plantinga, *Robert Schumann as Critic* (New Haven, 1967) for an extensive discussion of the biographical and critical issues connected with the *Liederjahr*.
15. Schumann's review of Franz's *Lieder* first was published in the *NZfM* 19 (1843), 34–35; it also is found in Robert Schumann, *Gesammelte Schriften über Musik und Musiker*, ed. Martin Kreisig, 5th edn. (1914), II: 147–48; Schumann, *On Music and Musicians*, 241–42; and Plantinga, *Schumann as Critic*, 176–77.
16. Edler, *Robert Schumann*, 215–16.
17. Wasielewski, *Schumann*, 290, cites a letter by Schumann to Karl Koßmaly, which leaves no doubt that Schumann was aware of his accomplishment as a *Lieder* composer: "In your essay about the *Lied* I was a little saddened that you position me in second class. I would not request to be placed in the first, but I think I have a right to a category of my own, and least of all I like to be seen next to [Carl Gottlieb] Reissiger, [Karl Friedrich] Curschmann, and others. I know that my striving and my means go far beyond those composers."
18. *The Ring of Words: An Anthology of Song Texts*, ed. Philip L. Miller (New York, 1963), provides poems of songs in their original versions and lists textual variants of settings. Schumann clearly gets most of the annotations. See also Hallmark, "Schumanns Behandlung seiner Liedtexte," in *Schumanns Werke: Texte und Interpretationen*, ed. Akio Mayeda and Klaus Wolfgang Niemöller (Mainz, 1987), 20–42.
19. See Herwig Knaus, *Musiksprache und Werkestruktur in Robert Schumanns Liederkreis* (Munich, 1974), for a facsimile of the autograph. For a transcription and interpretation of the various compositional layers, see Barbara Turchin, "Schumann's Song Cycles: The Cycle within the Song," *19CM* 8 (1985), 238–41. See also Hallmark, "Schumann's Revisions of 'In der Fremde,' Op. 39, No. 1," in *Of Poetry and Song: Approaches to the German Lied*, ed. Jürgen Thym (Rochester, forthcoming).
20. Theodor W. Adorno, "Zum Gedächtnis Eichendorff – Coda: Schumanns *Lieder*," in *Noten zur Literatur I* (Berlin, 1958), 134–45. Fuga XXIV from the first volume of Bach's *Well-Tempered Clavier* seems to have been the model for capturing the eerie atmosphere of deception in *Zwielicht*.
21. See Schumann's review of Theodor Kirchner's *Lieder*, Op. 1 in *NZfM* 18 (1843), 120; also in *Gesammelte Schriften*, ed. Kreisig, 123–24.
22. Hallmark, "Rückert *Lieder*," 3–30.
23. Schumann actually composed twenty poems of Heine's *Lyrisches Intermezzo*: the four settings left out when *Dichterliebe* appeared in 1844 were published later as individual songs. See Arthur Komar, ed., *Robert Schumann: Dichterliebe* (New York, 1971) and Hallmark, "The Sketches for *Dichterliebe*," *19CM* 1 (1977), 110–36.
24. Ruth Solie, "Whose Life? The Gendered Self in Schumann's *Frauenliebe* Songs," in *Critical Approaches*, ed. Steven P. Scher (Cambridge, 1992), 219–40. For a different perspective, see Kristina Muxfeldt, "*Frauenliebe und Leben* Now and Then," *19CM* 25 (2001), 27–48.
25. Barbara Turchin, "Schumann's Song Cycles," *19CM* 8 (1985), 233–34.
26. Edler, *Schumann und seine Zeit*, 220.
27. Barbara Turchin, "The Nineteenth-Century Wanderlieder Cycle," *JM* 5 (1987), 498–526.
28. Hallmark, "Rückert *Lieder*," passim.
29. David Ferris, *Schumann's Eichendorff Liederkreis and the Genre of the Romantic Cycle* (Oxford, 2000) and John Daverio, "The Song Cycles: Journey Through a Romantic Landscape," in *GLNC*, 289–90. See also Anthony Newcomb, "Schumann and Late Eighteenth-Century Narrative Strategies," *19CM* 11 (1987), 164–74, and Erika Reiman, "Schumann's Piano Cycles and the Novels of Jean Paul: Analogues in Discursive Strategies" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Toronto, 1999).
30. *Gesammelte Schriften über Musik und Musiker*, ed. Kreisig, I: 272.
31. Jack Stein, *Poem and Music in the German Lied* (Cambridge: MA, 1971), 89–110.
32. See further Edward T. Cone, *The Composer's Voice* (Berkeley, 1974); also Cone, "Poet's Love or Composer's Love," in *Music and Text: Critical Inquiries*, ed. Steven P. Scher (Cambridge, 1992), 177–92.
33. *Music and Poetry* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, 1994), 146–48.
34. For a sensitive reading of this song see Edward T. Cone, "Words into Music: The Composer's Approach to Text," in *Sound and Poetry*, ed. Northrop Frye (New York, 1956), 3–15.
35. Jonathan Bellman, "Aus alten Märchen: The Chivalric Style of Schumann and Brahms," *JM* 13 (1995), 117–35.
36. Schumann, *Briefe: Neue Folge*, 302.
37. See the table of works in Daverio, *Robert Schumann*, 390–91.
38. *Briefe: Neue Folge*, 302.
39. For instance, Eric Sams, *The Songs of Robert Schumann* (New York, 1969) and Steven Walsh, *The Lieder of Robert Schumann* (New York, 1971).

40. Ulrich Mahler, *Fortschritt und Kunstlied: Späte Lieder Robert Schumanns im Licht der liedästhetischen Diskussion ab 1848* (Munich and Salzburg, 1983) and Reinhard Kapp, *Studien zum Spätwerk Robert Schumanns* (Tutzing, 1984).
41. Luigi Dallapiccola uses the last poem in the cycle set by Schumann (*Gebet*) in its Latin original as *Preghiera di Maria Stuarda* in his 1941 *Canti di Prigiona*.
42. Hallmark, "The Poet Sings," in GLNC, 104–08.
43. Fischer-Dieskau, *Robert Schumann*, 184.
44. Hallmark, "The Poet Sings," 109.
45. Daverio, *Schumann*, 463–64.
46. Hallmark, "The Poet Sings," 104.
47. Mahler, *Fortschritt*, 40–82.
48. *Ibid.*, 98–115 and Hallmark, "The Poet Sings," 100–02.

7 A multitude of voices: the Lied at mid century

1. Throughout this essay, I use "Lied" as a generic term for the art song in Germany. See Dahlhaus, NCM, 98, for an all-too-brief differentiation between "Lied" and "Gesang." His contention, based on evidence from the nineteenth century, is that "Gesang" was used for freer compositions. Very few of the pieces under consideration here bear the title "Gesänge."
2. August Reißmann, *Das deutsche Lied in seiner historischen Entwicklung* (Kassel, 1861), 209. My translations, unless otherwise indicated.
3. Reißmann / Mendel, "Deutsches Lied," in *Musikalisches Conversations-Lexicon*, ed. Hermann Mendel (Berlin, 1873) III: 131 and 131–32; here the reference undoubtedly is to Liszt, since his *Lieder* were then the best-known song products of the New German School.
4. Julius Weiss, "Liederschau," *Neue Berliner Musik-Zeitung* 2 (9 February 1848), 41.
5. Wasielewski, "Zwölf Lieder von Klaus Groth . . . von Carl Banck. Op. 68," *Signale für die musikalische Welt* 16 (February, 1858), 91.
6. Jürgen Thym confirms the diversity of the period in his "Crosscurrents in Song: Five Distinctive Voices," GLNC, 153–85; in so doing, he, too, recognizes no central Lied figure at mid century.
7. *Ibid.*, 153–54. These categories were first identified by Heinrich W. Schwab, *Sangbarkeit, Popularität und Kunstlied* (Regensburg, 1965).
8. Ferdinand Simon Gaßner, *Universal-Lexikon der Tonkunst*, neue Ausgabe (Stuttgart, 1849), 542.
9. Hans Michel Schletterer, "L. Spohr's Liedercompositionen," *Musikalisches Wochenblatt* 1 (28 October 1870), 690.

10. On organicism in nineteenth-century music, see above all Ruth Solie, "The Living Work: Organicism and Musical Analysis," 19CM 4 (1980), 147–56; and David Montgomery, "The Myth of Organicism: From Bad Science to Great Art," MQ 76 (1992), 17–66.
11. Julius Schucht, "Lenau's lyrische Gedichte für Componisten," *Rheinische Musik-Zeitung* 2 (5 June 1852), 804–05.
12. Edouard Schuré, *Geschichte des deutschen Liedes* (Berlin, 1870), 379–91. See also Carl Kossmaly's "Zerstreute Bemerkungen über Liedercompositionen," *Neue Berliner Musik-Zeitung* 14 (18 April 1860), 121, and Eduard Hanslick's "Aesthetische Betrachtung über Composition sogenannter unmusikalischer Texte, veranlasst durch Hoven's Composition der *Heimkehr* von H. Heine," *Rheinische Musik-Zeitung* 2 No. 15 (11 October 1851), 531–34 and No. 16 (18 October), 541–43.
13. Schuré, *Geschichte des deutschen Liedes*, 365.
14. Schucht, "Lenau's lyrische Gedichte für Componisten," 803.
15. NCGL, 84; LMLR, 18.
16. George Kehler, ed., *The Piano in Concert* (Metuchen, NJ, 1982), I: 763.
17. LMLR, 18.
18. See Sanna Pederson, "A. B. Marx, Berlin Concert Life, and German National Identity," 19CM 18 (1994), 87–107; and Celia Applegate, "How German Is It? Nationalism and the Idea of Serious Music in the Early Nineteenth Century," 19CM 21 (1998), 274–96. Even Dahlhaus, NCM, does not mention the political implications of the Lied in his sub-chapter on it (pp. 96–105), despite the fact that he discusses nationhood and national awareness of the folksong (pp. 110–11).
19. Brendel, "Zur Anbahnung einer Verständigung: Vortrag zur Eröffnung der Tonkünstler-Versammlung," NZfM I (1859), 265–73.
20. *Dr. Carl Loewe's Selbstbiographie*, ed. Carl Hermann Bitter (Berlin, 1870). The definitive biography is by Henry Joachim Kühn, *Johann Gottfried Carl Loewe: Ein Lesebuch und eine Materialsammlung zu seiner Biographie* (Halle, 1996).
21. *Selbstbiographie*, 10 and 71.
22. *Ibid.*, 71; Thym, "Crosscurrents," 155.
23. Paul Althouse, "Carl Loewe (1796–1869): His Lieder, Ballads, and Their Performance" (Ph.D. dissertation, Yale University, 1971), 48.
24. *Selbstbiographie*, 70–71.
25. Martin Plüddemann, "Karl Loewe," *Bayreuther Blätter* 15 (1892), 328. For a discussion of his literary sources, see Günter Hartung, "Loewes literarische Vorlagen," in *Carl Loewe, 1796–1869: Bericht über die*

- wissenschaftliche Konferenz anlässlich seines 200. Geburtstages vom 26. bis 28. September 1996 im Händel-Haus Halle (Halle, 1997).
26. DL, II: 155. According to Thym, “Crosscurrents,” 155, Schumann disparaged Loewe “as the cultivator of a remote musical island with little wider influence.”
27. Hans Kleemann, *Beiträge zur Ästhetik und Geschichte der Loeweschen Ballade* (Halle, 1913), 32.
28. Walther Dürr, *Das deutsche Sololied im 19. Jahrhundert: Untersuchungen zu Sprache und Music* (Wilhelmshaven, 1984), 204.
29. See Thym, “Crosscurrents,” 159–60, for an appraisal of this singular work.
30. Plüddemann (1854–97) was a Wagnerian who attempted to apply the advances of Wagner to the *Lied* in its most dramatic expression, the ballad.
31. James Parakilas, *Ballads Without Words: Chopin and the Tradition of the Instrumental Ballade* (Portland, 1992), considers the nineteenth-century piano ballad.
32. Given the perception of Loewe in the 1850s as a composer who had already made his mark on the *Lied*, it is not surprising that his later ballads did not receive much attention in the musical press. Em. Klitzsch, “Kammer- und Hausmusik. Lieder und Gesänge,” *NZfM* 33 (13 August 1850), 67.
33. See Marcia Citron, “The Lieder of Fanny Mendelssohn-Hensel,” *MQ* 69 (1983), 570–94; *Fanny Hensel, geb. Mendelssohn Bartholdy: Das Werk*, ed. Martina Helmig (Munich, 1997); and Antje Olivier, *Mendelssohns Schwester Fanny Hensel: Musikerin, Komponistin, Dirigentin* (Düsseldorf, 1997).
34. The letter is dated 9 July 1846. Quoted from *The Letters of Fanny Hensel to Felix Mendelssohn*, trans. Marcia Citron (Stuyvesant, NY, 1987), 349.
35. This support of her husband was not without its darker moments. As Annette Maurer has shown, Fanny’s reduced *Lieder* production from June 1829 through the 1830s and into the 1840s may well have at least partial cause in a dispute with Wilhelm Hensel over her composition of poetry by Gustav Droysen, whom he regarded as a rival. See Maurer’s “Biographische Einflüsse auf das Liedschaffen Fanny Hensels,” in *Fanny Hensel, geb. Mendelssohn Bartholdy: Das Werk*, 33–36.
36. Nancy Reich, “The Power of Class: Fanny Hensel,” *Mendelssohn and his World*, ed. R. Larry Todd (Princeton, 1991), 86.
37. See Marcia Citron, “The Lieder of Fanny Mendelssohn-Hensel,” 577, for a listing of poets.
38. Thym, “Crosscurrents,” 163–64.
39. There are exceptions: some early songs are through-composed for the purpose of text interpretation, and some late songs are strophic settings.
40. Thym, “Crosscurrents,” 166.
41. Reich, “The Power of Class,” 92.
42. Thym does not consider Felix Mendelssohn in his survey of mid-century *Lied* composers. Even Mendelssohn scholars seem reluctant to deal with his songs: the essay collection *Mendelssohn and his World*, ed. R. Larry Todd (Princeton, 1991), makes only one footnote reference to them, despite treatment of virtually every other compositional genre.
43. According to the AmZ, 5 December 1827, Mendelssohn knew Schubert’s music by that date.
44. Wulf Konold, *Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy und seine Zeit* (Laaber, 1984), 251.
45. Konold speculates that Mendelssohn was opposed not to the illustrative element in music, but rather to the purity of the genre, in which drama should play no role (p. 249). See also his letter from July 1831 to his aunt, the Countess Pereira in Vienna, in which Mendelssohn states: “It appears to me totally impossible to compose music for a descriptive poem. The pile of compositions of this type prove my point rather than the contrary, for I know of no successful ones among them.” *Reisebriefe aus den Jahren 1830 bis 1832 von Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy*, ed. Paul Mendelssohn-Bartholdy, in *Briefe*, vol. I, 7th edn. (Leipzig, 1865), 205.
46. Karl Klingemann, ed., *Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdys Briefwechsel mit Legationsrat Karl Klingemann in London* (Essen, 1909), 86.
47. Gisela A. Müller, “‘Leichen-’ oder ‘Blüthenduft?’ Heine-Vertonungen Fanny Hensels und Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdys im Vergleich,” in *Fanny Hensel, geb. Mendelssohn-Bartholdy: Das Werk*, 49.
48. Monika Hennemann, “Mendelssohn and Byron: Two Songs Almost without Words,” *Mendelssohn-Studien* 10 (1997), 131–56, shows how Mendelssohn mediated English cultural values to the German public through his composition of songs to Byron texts.
49. According to Dürr, Mendelssohn was dissatisfied with the song (perhaps because it was atypical of his work), which may explain why he never published it during his lifetime (p. 150). See also Eric Werner, *Mendelssohn: Leben und Werk in neuer Sicht* (Zurich, 1980), 388 and Luise Leven, *Mendelssohn als Lyriker unter besonderer Berücksichtigung seiner Beziehungen zu Ludwig Berger, Bernhard Klein und Adolf Bernhard Marx* (Krefeld, 1927), 20.
50. *Reisebriefe aus den Jahren 1830 bis 1832*, 236.

51. Reinecke was best known for his children's songs; an anonymous writer in the 1849 *Signale* notes how his other Lieder are Mendelssohnian in their "respectable elegance" and "fine expression of emotion," but lack "passion" and "depth." J. B., "Die Compositionen von Carl Reinecke," *Signale für die musikalische Welt* 7 (1849), 258.
52. The two most important films are *Song of Love* (1947) and *Spring Symphony* (1986), with Katherine Hepburn and Nastassia Kinski respectively playing Clara Schumann. Recent fiction and non-fiction biographies (of varying viewpoints) include Joan Chissell, *Clara Schumann: A Dedicated Spirit* (London, 1983); Nancy Reich, *Clara Schumann: The Artist and the Woman*, revised ed. (Ithaca, 2001); Eva Weissweiler, *Clara Schumann: Eine Biographie* (Hamburg, 1990); Susanna Reich, *Clara Schumann: Piano Virtuoso* (New York, 1999); and James Landis, *Longing* (New York, 2000).
53. One of the better scholarly studies of Clara Schumann's songs is the "Vorwort" by Joachim Draheim and Brigitte Höft to each of the two volumes of *Sämtliche Lieder* (Wiesbaden, 1990 and 1992). See also Janina Klassen, "'Mach' doch ein Lied einmal': Clara Wieck-Schumanns Annäherung an die Liedkomposition," *Schumann-Studien* 6 (1997), 13–25.
54. For provocative examinations of the only joint publication between Clara and Robert, see Rufus Hallmark, "The Rückert Lieder of Robert and Clara Schumann," 19CM 14 (1990), 3–30 and, in the same journal, Melinda Boyd, "Gendered Voices: The *Liebesfrühling* Lieder of Robert and Clara Schumann," 23 (1999), 145–62. The latter study examines the Lied through the prism of feminist and gender theories, especially the notion that in terms of the Lied gender roles are transmutable.
55. Reich, "The Power of Class," 239.
56. Berthold Litzmann, *Clara Schumann. Ein Künstlerleben* (Leipzig, 1902), I: 411–12.
57. *Robert Schumann: Tagebücher*, vol. II: 1836–1854, ed. Gerd Nauhaus (Leipzig, 1987), 134.
58. Clara copied poems that struck her as well suited for composition, as did Robert. Again, it is difficult to establish a separate identity for Clara on the basis of Lieder texts.
59. Reich, "The Power of Class," 237.
60. See the review "Robert Schumanns Gesangskompositionen" in the 1842 AmZ, in which the anonymous reviewer refuses to attribute individual songs (44 [19 January 1842], col. 61).
61. Draheim and Höft, "Vorwort," 5.
62. "Robert Schumanns Gesangskompositionen," cols. 61–62.
63. See the anonymous review of Op. 13 in vol. 20, 25 March 1844, p. 97.
64. *Robert Schumanns Briefe: Neue Folge*, ed. F. Gustav Jensen, 2nd edn. (Leipzig, 1904), 431, letter of 23 June 1841. One should not be surprised that Robert would write favorably to a potential publisher about this co-production, which primarily consists of his own works.
65. "Clara Schumann," NZfM 41 (1 December 1854), 252.
66. In keeping with the gradual canonization of Clara Schumann, music appreciation texts of the late twentieth century such as *The Enjoyment of Music* and *Music: An Appreciation* have focused on her instrumental music rather than her songs.
67. See Konrad Sasse, *Beiträge zur Forschung über Leben und Werk von Robert Franz 1815–1892* (Halle, 1986), 78–82. The Händel-Haus in Halle also has encouraged performance of Franz's music.
68. *Robert Franz (1815–1892)*, ed. Konstanze Musketa (Halle, 1993). For a recent dissertation, see Bernhard Hartmann, *Das Verhältnis von Sprache und Musik in den Liedern von Robert Franz*, in *Europäische Hochschulschriften* 36/55 (Frankfurt, 1991).
69. Thym, "Crosscurrents," 173; NCGL, 232.
70. *Robert Franz an Arnold Freiherr Senfft von Pilsach: Ein Briefwechsel 1861–1888*, ed. Wolfgang Golther (Berlin, 1907), 114, letter of 23 October 1871. Franz Liszt observed: "Franz writes Lieder as Schubert did, but [Franz] deviates so significantly from him that the Lied has entered a new phase through his composition." *Robert Franz* (Leipzig, 1872), 10.
71. "Robert Franz: Eine Charakteristik," *Signale für die musikalische Welt* 176 (25 August 1859), 354.
72. Robert Schumann, "Lieder," NZfM 19 (31 July 1843), 33–35. In that year, Franz had solicited commentary about some songs from Schumann, who liked them so much that he recommended the Lieder to one of his own publishers.
73. Alan Walker, *Franz Liszt*, vol. III: *The Final Years, 1861–1886* (New York, 1996), 469. Olga Janina (= Olga Zielinska-Piasecka), an emotionally unsettled Liszt associate, published the first of her antagonistic Liszt memoirs (*Souvenirs d'une cosaque* [Paris, 1874]) under the fictional name "Robert Franz," which caused the infirm composer distress. See Walker, *Liszt*, III: 187–88 for an analysis of her motives behind the pseudonym.
74. *Er ist gekommen in Sturm und Regen* (Op. 4, No. 7) and *12 Lieder* in three volumes:

- (1) *Schilflieder*, Op. 2 (complete); (2) *Der Schalk* (Op. 3, No. 1), *Der Bote* (Op. 8, No. 1), *Meeresstille* (Op. 8, No. 2); (3) *Treibt der Sommer* (Op. 8, No. 5), *Gewitternacht* (Op. 8, No. 6), *Das ist ein Brausen und Heulen* (Op. 8, No. 4), *Frühling und Liebe* (Op. 3, No. 3).
75. August Göllerich, *Franz Liszt* (Berlin, 1908), 90.
76. Thym, “Crosscurrents,” 173.
77. In a remarkable letter of 23 March 1860 to Joachim, who was trying to collect signatures in early 1860 for a published manifesto against the New German School of Liszt and Wagner, Franz makes clear his difficult position. While he is too indebted to Liszt, who “has always shown himself as noble and unselfish towards me,” Franz believed the New German clique deserved the harshest criticism. *Briefe von und an Joseph Joachim*, ed. Joachim and Andreas Moser (Berlin, 1912), II: 82–83.
78. “To my question, whether he considers Liszt to be an important person, totally apart from his compositions, Franz gave a positive response. He has a high opinion of Liszt, and what [Liszt] wrote about him is the best.” Wilhelm Waldmann, *Robert Franz: Gespräche aus zehn Jahren* (Leipzig, 1895), 20.
79. Sasse provides an overview of attempts to periodize Franz’s output. See his *Beiträge zur Forschung über Leben und Werk von Robert Franz 1815–1892* (Halle, 1986), 30–39.
80. Letter to Arnold Freiherr Senfft von Pilsach, 8 July 1877, in *Robert Franz an Arnold Freiherr Senfft von Pilsach*, 270. This is one of Franz’s most informative letters about his perspectives on the Lied.
81. See, respectively, Waldmann, *Franz*, 8 and Thym, “Crosscurrents,” 174.
82. W. K. von Jolizza, *Das Lied und seine Geschichte* (Vienna and Leipzig, 1910), 470.
83. Waldmann, *Franz*, 153.
84. *Ibid.*, 109.
85. Letter to Erich Prieger, 29 January 1882, *Über Dichtung und Musik. Drei Briefe von Robert Franz*, ed. Erich Prieger (Berlin, 1901), 7.
86. See Thym, “Crosscurrents,” 172–73, for a more detailed discussion of Franz’s failure to identify irony, such as the “smiling-through-tears effect” of Schubert’s *Trockene Blumen*. See also Hartmann, *Verhältnis, passim*; Joachim Draheim, “Robert Franz und Robert Schumann – Aspekte einer schwierigen Beziehung,” *Robert Franz (1815–1892)*, ed. Musketa, 163–87; and Gerhard Dietel, “Musikgeschichtliche Aspekte der Liedästhetik bei Robert Schumann und Robert Franz,” in the same volume, 188–95.
87. Letter to Erich Prieger, 27 January 1882, in *Über Dichtung und Musik*, ed. Prieger, 5.
88. Letter to Ludwig Meinardus, October 1850, in Richard Tronnier, *Von Musik und Musikern* (Münster, 1930), 189. His concept of “polyphonic melody” enables harmony and melody to work together in organic relationship. See Waldmann, *Franz*, 25–26.
89. Hartmann, *Verhältnis*, 31. This explains why his melodies are generally such that they do not work well independently of their accompaniment.
90. See Markus Waldura, “Lenaus *Schilflieder* in Vertonungen durch Robert Franz, Peter Heise und Wilhelm Claussen: Ein Vergleich,” in *Robert Franz (1815–1892): Bericht über die wissenschaftliche Konferenz anlässlich seines 100. Todestages* (Halle, 1993), 78–100 and, in the same collection, Dagmar Brazda, “Die *Schilflieder* op. 2,” 302–17.
91. Letter to Arnold Freiherr Senfft von Pilsach, 14 September 1876, in *Robert Franz an Arnold Freiherr Senfft von Pilsach*, 246–47.
92. Waldura, “Lenaus *Schilflieder*,” 92.
93. Gustav Engel, “Recensionen. Robert Franz, Sechs Gesänge . . . Op. 22,” *Neue Berliner Musik-Zeitung* 10 (14 May 1856), 153.
94. There exists an extensive bibliography about Cornelius as song composer; most recently see Karlheinz Pricken, “Peter Cornelius als Dichter und Musiker in seinem Liedschaffen (eine Stiluntersuchung)” (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Cologne, 1951); and Günter Massenkeil, “Cornelius als Liederkomponist,” in *Peter Cornelius als Komponist, Dichter, Kritiker und Essayist*, ed. Hellmut Federhofen and Kurt Oehl (Regensburg, 1977), 159–67.
95. If this tendency in Cornelius calls Wagner to mind, it developed independently from Wagner and before their contact in the 1860s. Cornelius’s poems are partially reproduced by Adolf Stern in *Peter Cornelius: Literarische Werke*, vol. IV: *Gedichte* (Leipzig, 1904). Even other composers, such as Hans von Bronsart, Eduard Lassen, and Alexander Ritter, set poetry by Cornelius to music.
96. Massenkeil, “Cornelius als Liederkomponist,” 161.
97. Thym, “Crosscurrents,” 182.
98. In a letter to Liszt, 7 October 1854, Cornelius summarized the ethos of each song: “The first Lied bespeaks an irreplaceable loss. The second: remembrance. The third: moderation of grief. The fourth: solace in dreams. The fifth: promise of eternal faithfulness. The sixth: elevation to God.” *Peter Cornelius: Literarische Werke*, vol. IV: *Ausgewählte Briefe*, ed. Carl Maria Cornelius (Leipzig, 1904), I: 160–61.

99. Thym, “Crosscurrents,” 180.
 100. Jolizza, *Das Lied*, 478.
 101. Gottfried Schweizer, in his dissertation *Das Liedschaffen Adolf Jensens* (Gießen, 1933), provides a useful chronological chart of Jensen’s Lieder (pp. 6–7), as well as a complete frequency list for song poets (p. 9).
 102. *Hugo Riemanns Musik-Lexikon*, 11th edn., ed. Alfred Einstein (Berlin, 1929), 832.
 103. LMLR, 18.

8 The Lieder of Liszt

1. *Drei Lieder aus Schillers “Wilhelm Tell”* (*Der Fischerknabe* [“Es lächelt der See”], *Der Hirt* [“Ihr Matten lebt wohl!”], *Der Alpenjäger* [“Es donnern die Höh’n”]), orchestrated in the 1840s but only published in 1872; *Jeanne d’Arc au bücher* (A. Dumas, “Mon Dieu! J’étais bergère,” “Scène dramatique”; orchestrated late 1840s, revised 1850s and 1874; published 1877); *Die Loreley* (Heine, “Ich weiss nicht, was soll’s bedeuten,” 1860; published 1863); *Die Vätergruft* (Uhland, “Es schritt wohl auf die Haide,” 1859; published 1860); *Mignons Lied* (Goethe, “Kennst du das Land”; 1860; published 1863); *Die drei Zigeuner* (Lenau, “Drei Zigeuner fand ich einmal,” 1860; published 1872); *Die Allmacht* (Schubert, “Gross ist Jehovah der Herr,” 1871; published 1872); *Zwei Lieder von Francis Korbay* (*Le matin* [Bizet], *Gebet* [Geibel], 1883; unpublished).
2. Liszt turned to the orchestration of his own songs in the late 1850s while completing six Schubert transcriptions for voice and orchestra: *Die junge Nonne*, *Gretchen am Spinnrade*, *Lied der Mignon* (“Kennst du das Land”), *Erlkönig*, *Der Doppelgänger*, and *Abschied*. The last two remain unpublished.
3. For Liszt, in all but a very few cases, once a musical idea engaged him sufficiently to work it out into a full-fledged composition, it rarely lost its viability or continuing interest. Thus we have two, three, and even four distinct settings of a single text. In the case of songs, the act of transposition evidently opened up even further possibilities.
4. Three volumes of Lieder were published by the Franz-Liszt-Stiftung between 1917 and 1922 in *Franz Liszts Musikalische Werke*, edited by Peter Raabe (VII, 1–3). The critical apparatus of these volumes was of a very high standard and can still be used fruitfully, if with care, for information concerning the sources. Breitkopf & Härtel was to have continued the project, bringing out the complete works, but only about one half of Liszt’s musical output was ever published, and the edition ceased in 1936. The *Neue Liszt Ausgabe* (Editio Musica Budapest,

- 1979–) aims to remedy this situation, but thus far only piano music has been issued.
5. The most obvious mistakes are found in the first version of *Mignons Lied* (“Kennst du das Land”), in which the musical/syntactical stress is put on the word “du,” and in *Petrarch Sonnet* No. 123 (“I vidi in terra angelici costumi”), in which the word “soglia” is set as three syllables. It should be noted, however, that in later printed versions these errors are corrected.
 6. It should be clear that my view is diametrically opposed to that of Christopher Headington, whose essay on the songs in *Franz Liszt: The Man and His Music*, ed. Alan Walker (New York, 1970), 221–47, remains the only extended tract concerning these works. Headington writes, “Liszt’s songs, considered as a whole, could hardly be claimed to rank among his greatest achievements” (p. 221).
 7. At this point, Liszt was engaged in transcribing the Beethoven symphonies for solo piano, as well as *An die ferne Geliebte* and the Schubert materials described below. See further Alan Walker, “Liszt and the Schubert Song Transcriptions,” MQ 75 (1991), 248–62 and Thomas Kabisch, *Liszt und Schubert* (Munich, 1984).
 8. See my *Franz Liszt: The Schubert Song Transcriptions for Solo Piano*, Series I (New York, 1995), ix–xiii.
 9. At present there is no thematic catalogue for Liszt’s music that addresses the problems associated with determining the sequence of variants, as well as the multiple settings, in the oeuvre; but one is underway, co-authored by this writer and Mária Eckhardt of Budapest, to be published by Henle Verlag in Munich.
 10. Blandine was born 18 December 1835 in Geneva; the two other children were Cosima (born 24 December 1837 in Bellaggio), and Daniel (born 9 May 1839 in Rome).
 11. The Countess eloped to Switzerland with Liszt in mid-1835, leaving her husband and surviving daughter in their residence at Croissy. Liszt and Marie traveled extensively during the next four years, maintaining a series of residences in Switzerland and Italy through 1840. They separated permanently in 1844.
 12. The 1843 *Sechs Lieder* published by Eck of Cologne included *Morgens steh’ ich auf und frage* (Heine), *Die tote Nachtigall* (Kauffmann), *Du bist wie eine Blume* (Heine), *Bist du* (“Mild wie ein Lufthauch,” Metschersky), *Vergiftet sind meine Lieder* (Heine), and *Dichter, was Liebe sei* (Charlotte von Hagn). The 1848 *Schiller und Goethe Lieder von Franz Liszt* issued by Haslinger in Vienna included the three *Lieder aus Schillers “Wilhelm Tell,”* two versions of *Freudvoll und*

leidvoll (Goethe), *Wer nie sein Brot mit Thränen ass* (Goethe), and *Ueber allen Gipfeln ist Ruh* (Goethe).

13. *Im Rhein, im heiligen Strome* (Heine), *Der du von dem Himmel bist* (Heine), *Die Loreley* (“Ich weiss nicht, was soll’s bedeuten”), *Die Zelle in Nonnenwerth* (“Ach nun taucht die Klosterzelle,” Lichnowsky), *Mignons Lied* (“Kennst du das Land,” Goethe), and *Es war ein König in Thule* (Goethe). Liszt called the piano versions *Buch der Lieder für Piano allein*. For a critical analysis of the very complex Liszt–Heine relationship, see Susan Bernstein, *Virtuosity of the Nineteenth Century: Performing Music and Language in Heine, Liszt, and Baudelaire* (Palo Alto, CA, 1998), 58–151. The tension between the two men was more evident on Heine’s side and had existed since their first acquaintance in Paris in the 1830s. It was exacerbated by Heine’s series of critical reviews of Liszt’s performances, and reached its apogee in the poem entitled *Im August 1849*, one of twenty in the collection *Lazarus*. Here Heine castigated Liszt for apparently having done nothing politically during the August 1849 Hungarian uprising, which had been brutally crushed by the combined Austrian and Russian forces. While Liszt does not appear to have responded to the poem, it is likely that, as usual, he turned inward and to the keyboard to vent his feelings – toward Heine and the Hungarian events – composing the *Funérailles*, No. 7 in the *Harmonies poétiques et religieuses*, which is subtitled “Oktober 1849.”

In the early 1840s, however, Liszt was quite willing to ignore the vituperative language of Heine’s essays and reach beyond for his poetry.

14. The 1840 Rhine Crisis was precipitated by the apparently “expansionist” movement of the French Cabinet, which called into question the Rhine River as France’s easternmost boundary – an aggravation of the ancient Gallic–Teutonic border dispute over the Rhineland provinces (Alsace and Lorraine), which had become increasingly negative as a result of the treaties of 1815 ending the Napoleonic Wars. For France, those treaties were unjust, and as the Napoleonic legend once again took hold in their national imagination, a minor Levantine crisis in Egypt was used as the pretext for much chauvinistic posturing. For Germans, the Rhine could never be anything but wholly German, and the nationalistic fervor that arose in the Germanic Confederation when the French seemed once again to be aggressively inclined culminated in a pronouncement by the King of Bavaria that the Germans should reacquire Strasbourg. Heine, an expatriate resident of Paris since 1831, was an outspoken member of the Young Germany

movement, the *Vormärz*. See Cecelia Hopkins Porter, *The Rhine as Musical Metaphor: Cultural Identity in German Romantic Music* (Boston, 1996); see also the same author’s “The Rheinlieder Critics: a Case of Musical Nationalism,” *MQ* 63 (1977), 74–98.

15. Piano versions of several songs were also transcribed, but all were individually published later and not conceived within sets.

16. *O! quand je dors, Comment disaient-ils, Enfant, si j’étais roi, S’il est un charmant gazon, La tombe et la rose*, and *Gastibelza*. According to Liszt’s letter of 18 March 1843 to Heinrich Schlesinger, in Paris, the Hugo Songs originally had seven or eight numbers; however, only six were published, and the question of what were the missing texts cannot be answered conclusively. It is likely that one of the songs was *Quand tu chantes bercée*, rediscovered in the early 1970s by Istvan Kecskeméti in the autograph album of Mathilde Juva Branca, the famed soprano for whom Rossini had written out aria ornamentation. See Kecskeméti, “Egy ismeretlen Liszt-dal,” *Magyar Zene* 15 (1974), 17–25, and “Two Liszt Discoveries: 1. An Unknown Piano Piece; 2. An Unknown Song,” *MT* 115 (1974), 646–48 and 743–44. The piano transcriptions of the six published Hugo Songs, completed at Princess Carolyne Sayn-Wittgenstein’s estate in Woronince (Ukraine) in October 1847, remained in manuscript until 1985, when they were published in the *New Liszt Edition*, Series ii, vol. XVIII. See Rena Charnin Mueller, “Liszt’s *Tasso* Sketchbook: Studies in Sources and Revisions” (Ph.D. Diss., New York University, 1986), 168 ff.

17. Marie d’Agoult collected texts in all languages for Liszt’s use in all genres; her “Poetisches Album” (Weimar, Goethe- und-Schiller Archiv, MS 60/142), contains selections, among many others, from the works of Byron (*Manfred*), Lichnowsky (*Die Zelle in Nonnenwerth*), Strozzi (*Michelangelo’s ‘La Notte’*), Lenau (*Aus ‘Faust’*), and Rellstab (*Beethoven Fest-Kantate*).

18. “J’aurais aimé t’envoyer aussi une chanson de V.H. ‘Oh! Quand je dors viens auprès de ma couche, Comme à Petrarque, etc.’ . . . [apparaissait Laura.] Merci des volumes de Hugo. Je vais lire.” *Correspondance de Liszt et de la comtesse d’Agoult*, ed. Daniel Ollivier, 2 vols. (Paris 1933–34), II: 198.

19. See Mueller, “Liszt’s *Tasso* Sketchbook,” 144 ff.

20. Haslinger, Vienna. Until recently, it had been thought that the vocal versions came out in 1847. At this point, *Benedetto sia ‘l giorno* was

the second sonnet, preceded by *Pace non trovo* in both the sketches in WRGs MS59/N8 and in the published vocal and keyboard sets. Only later in 1858, when Liszt decided to include the Petrarch Sonnets in the *Années de pèlerinage II (Italie)*, did he reverse the order of the sonnets and place *Benedetto* before *Pace non trovo*.

21. “The Unknown Liszt – The World of his Songs with Piano,” liner notes for *Franz Liszt – Lieder*, performed by Dietrich Fischer-Dieskau, accompanied by Daniel Barenboim (DGG 2740254; 1981).

22. Hamburg, Universitäts- und Stadtbibliothek Liszt Nachlass, MSS II/3 and I/6.

23. Even to this day, the two genres are mixed, since accompanists in Lieder performances often appropriate the cadenzas from the solo piano versions in concert, even though they only appear in the piano text.

24. See Rena Charnin Mueller, “Reevaluating the Liszt Chronology: The Case of *Anfangs wollt ich fast verzagen*,” 19CM 12 (1988), 132–47.

25. Liszt had written about his own Lieder to his friend and fellow composer Joseph Dessauer, criticizing his early works as being “too inflated and sentimental” and questioning whether he would ever return to song. The letter is undated, but clearly comes from the early 1850s, according to corollary evidence. See *Franz Liszts Briefe*, ed. La Mara, 2 vols. (Leipzig, 1893–1905), II: 403, and *Letters of Franz Liszt*, ed. and trans. Constance Bache, 2 vols. (New York, 1968), II: 502.

26. See Mueller, “Liszt’s *Tasso* Sketchbook,” 31–97, for a complete overview of the Weimar scriptorium and its documents. This situation pertains to Liszt’s music in general, and not simply to that of the Lieder.

27. *Isten veled* (P. Horvath, 1847), *Die drei Zigeuner* (“Drei Zigeuner fand ich einmal,” Lenau, 1860; this work contains Hungarian elements, although the poem is in German), *Magyar király-dal* (“Aldott legyen Magyarok királya,” 1883); *Go not happy day* (Tennyson, 1879); *Ne brani menyá, moy drug* (A. Tolstoy, 1866).

28. “die Retterin meiner ‘ersten’ und ‘letzten’ Lieder, für welche Sie keine Zivil-Verdienstmedaille von irgendeinem Konservatorium (noch weniger von der Zunft der Kritik) zu erwarten haben!” Otto Goldhammer, *Nonnenwerth*, facsimile edn., Nationale Forschungs- und Gedenkstätten der klassischen deutschen Literatur in Weimar (Weimar, 1961).

29. Liszt contemplated a number of operatic projects in the 1840s, but only the subject of Byron’s *Sardanapalus* interested him enough to

actually compose music; an incomplete draft is in Weimar, WRGs MS59/N4.

30. The other items include: *Vergiftet sind meine Lieder* (Heine), *Du bist wie eine Blume* (Heine), *Anfangs wollt’ ich fast verzagen* (Heine), *Kling leise, mein Lied* (Nordmann), *Morgens steh’ ich auf und frage* (Heine), *Ihr Auge* (“Nimm einen Strahl der Sonne,” Rellstab), *Dichter, was Liebe sei?* (Charlotte von Hagn), *Comment disaient-ils* (Hugo), *Amaranthe* (“Es muss ein Wunderbares sein,” Redwitz), *Es rauschen die Winde* (Rellstab), *Schwebe, schwebe, blaues Auge* (Dingelstedt), *Die Vätergruft* (Uhland), *Wo weilt er* (Rellstab), *O! quand je dors* (Hugo), *S’il est un charmant gazon* (Hugo), *Lasst mich ruhen* (Hoffmann von Fallersleben), *In Liebeslust* (Hoffmann von Fallersleben), and *Ich möchte hingehn* (Herwegh).

31. For instance, the *Harmonies poétiques et religieuses*, *Années de pèlerinage I (Suisse) and II (Italie)*, and the *Hungarian Rhapsodies*. See further, Mueller, “Sketches, Drafts, and Revisions,” in *Die Projekte der Liszt-Forschung: Bericht über das internationale Symposium Eisenstadt, 19–21 Oktober 1989*, ed. Detlef Altenburg (Eisenstadt, 1991), 23–34.

32. Liszt credited Louis Köhler’s *Melodie der Sprache* (1859) with a substantial influence on his text-setting capabilities, especially his revision of *Ich möchte hingehn* (Herwegh), which he dedicated to Köhler, on the manuscript and in a letter, although it never appeared in print.

33. Kahnt issued a French edition of a number of songs in 1880, and Liszt again revised many, adding *ossia* lines for both voice and piano.

34. Beilage, *Deutscher Musen-Almanach*, ed. Charles Schaad (Würzburg, 1856).

35. While it is correctly thought that Wagner codified much of the practice concerning the double-tonic complex, we see, again, that Liszt was the pioneer in matching relative key areas as points of repose in the same way composers fifty years earlier had equated parallel tonalities. For an example of this process in the symphonic poems, see Mueller, *Introduction to the new edition of Les Préludes*, Editio Musica Budapest (1997). For the primary explanation of Wagner’s usage, see Robert Bailey’s essay “An Analytical Study of the Sketches and Drafts” in Bailey’s edition of *Richard Wagner: Prelude and Transfiguration from Tristan und Isolde* (New York, 1985), 113–46, especially pp. 120–22.

36. Liszt uses a swaying *barcarolle* movement, common to many settings of music dealing with the Rhine.

37. The Henle Urtext Edition of the second *Ballade* in B minor (1996) reproduces all three endings together for the first time.

38. Liszt wrote six melodramas, to texts by Bürger (*Lenore*), F. Halm (*Vor hundert Jahren*), Lenau (*Der traurige Mönch*), Jókai (*Des toten Dichters Liebe*, for which the main theme served as the basis for *Alexander Petofi*, No. 6 of the *Historische ungarische Bildnisse*), A. Tolstoy (*Der blinde Sänger*), and Strachwitz (*Helges Treue*), the latter a substantial revision of a composition by Felix Draeseke.
39. The poem was written June 1840 and first published December 1841 in *La Revue des Deux Mondes*. Musset died in 1857; it is tempting to suggest that Liszt remembered the poem, rather than simply coming across it in the Musset *Oeuvres Complètes* (1866–83).
40. Cosima married Hans von Bülow in 1857; their two daughters, Daniela and Blandine, were born in 1860 and 1863, respectively.
41. Isolde (b. 1865), and Eva (b. 1867); their third child, Siegfried, was born in 1869.
42. His son, Daniel, had died in Berlin in 1859; his eldest daughter, Blandine Ollivier, had died a month after the birth of her only child in 1862.
43. Williams, *Franz Liszt: Selected Letters*, 745.
44. For a study that traces this idea as well as many others through Liszt's late works, see David Butler Cannata, "Perception and Apperception in Liszt's Late Piano Music," *JM* 15 (1997), 178–208.
45. Schoenberg, "Franz Liszt's Work and Being," in *Style and Idea: Selected Writings of Arnold Schoenberg*, ed. Leonard Stein, trans. Leo Black (London, 1975), 442–47.

9 The Lieder of Brahms

1. Elisabeth von Herzogenberg to Brahms on 21–22 May 1885. *Johannes Brahms: The Herzogenberg Correspondence*, trans. Hannah Bryant ([1909], rpt. with an introduction by Walter Frisch [New York, 1987]), 226–27.
2. In addition to the solo songs, Brahms arranged numerous volumes of folk songs. For a complete listing of both Brahms's Lieder and his folk song arrangements, together with dates, poets, and other pertinent details, see Margit L. McCorkle, *Johannes Brahms: Thematisches-Bibliographisches Werkverzeichnis* (Munich, 1984).
3. For a biographical sketch of Jenner, see Richard Schaal, "Jenner," in *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart* (Kassel, 1957), 6: 1882–83.
4. Gustav Jenner, *Johannes Brahms als Mensch, Lehrer und Künstler: Studien und Erlebnisse* (Marburg in Hessen, 1905; 2nd edn. 1930; rpt. Munich, 1989). Jenner's reminiscences first appeared in the 1903 volume of *Die Musik*. Parts of this essay, including most of the section on

songwriting, recently appeared in English translation by Susan Gillespie. These excerpts are included in *Brahms and His World*, ed. Walter Frisch (Princeton, 1990), 185–204. All Jenner references are taken from this English translation.

5. The non-musical books that have survived from Brahms's library are catalogued in Kurt Hofmann, *Die Bibliothek von Johannes Brahms: Bücher- und Musikalienverzeichnis* (Hamburg, 1974).
6. Together with Andreas Kretzschmer, Zuccalmaglio brought out two volumes entitled *Deutsche Volkslieder mit ihren Original-Weisen* (1838, 1840). Both Kretzschmer and Zuccalmaglio contributed essays on folk-related topics for Schumann's NZfM.
7. Stein, *Poem and Music in the German Lied from Gluck to Hugo Wolf* (Cambridge, MA, 1971), 131.
8. See, for example, Clara Schumann's objections to the text of *Willst du, daß ich geh'?*, Op. 71, No. 4, in a letter dated 2 May 1877. *Letters of Clara Schumann and Johannes Brahms 1853–1896*, ed. Berthold Litzmann (New York, 1927), II: 7.
9. Richard Heuberger, *Erinnerungen an Johannes Brahms*, 2nd edn., ed. Kurt Hofmann (Tutzing, 1976), 38. Max Friedländer, *Brahms's Lieder: An Introduction to the Songs for One and two Voices*, English trans. C. Leonard Leese (London, 1928), 23.
10. Hermann Deiters, *Johannes Brahms: A Biographical Sketch*, trans. Rosa Newmarch, ed. John Alexander Fuller-Maitland (London, 1888; photocopy, Austin, 1995), 92.
11. Through the analysis of sketches and autographs, George Bozarth has demonstrated that Brahms transformed early versions of *Agnes*, Op. 59, No. 5, and the duet *Die Schwestern*, Op. 61, No. 2, from simple to modified strophic settings in order to better match the changing tone of the respective poems. George S. Bozarth, "Brahms's Duets for Soprano and Alto, Op. 61: A Study in Chronology and Compositional Process," *Studia Musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae* 25 (1983), 191–210.
12. *Wie Melodien* will not be considered here as its subtleties are described by Austin Clarkson, "Brahms, Song Op. 105 No. 1: A Literary-Historical Approach," and Edward Laufer, "Brahms, Song Op. 105 No. 1: A Schenkerian Approach," in *Readings in Schenker Analysis and Other Approaches*, ed. Maury Yeston (New Haven and London, 1977), 230–53 and 254–72.
13. As reported by Florence May, *The Life of Johannes Brahms* (1905, 2nd edn.; rpt. Neptune City, 1981), 109.

14. Richard Specht, *Johannes Brahms*, trans. Eric Blom (London and Toronto, 1930), 334.
15. The half note falls on the word “bin” and in Brahms’s own lifetime this instance of poor declamation attracted much criticism. Jenner mentions this and reports Brahms’s dismissal of such criticisms.
16. Letter to Brahms, dated 8 November 1877; quoted in *Billroth und Brahms im Briefwechsel: Mit Einleitung, Anmerkungen und 4 Bildtafeln* (Berlin and Vienna, 1935; rpt. 1991), 248–50.
17. Rudolf Gerber provides the best overview of the forms of Brahms’s Lieder, and aside from analyzing modified-strophic pieces, he diagrams various types of expanded ternary forms (see pp. 36–40). Gerber, “Formprobleme im Brahms’schen Lied,” *Jahrbuch der Musikbibliothek Peters*, 29 (1932), 23–42.
18. Eric Sams, *The Songs of Hugo Wolf*, 2nd edn. (London, 1983), 81, translates Horace’s epigraph as: “You ever in tearful strains dwell on Mystes taken away: your loving laments cease not when the evening star rises, nor when it flees the swift sun.” Wolf printed this quotation at the beginning of his setting of the Mörrike poem.
19. See August Langen, “Zum Symbol der Aeolsharfe in der deutschen Dichtung,” *Zum 70. Geburtstag von Joseph Müller-Blattau*, ed. Christoph Hellmut-Mahling (Kassel, 1966), 160–91.
20. Friedländer, *Brahms’s Lieder*, 33.
21. Max Kalbeck, *Johannes Brahms*, 4 vols. (Vienna, Leipzig, and Berlin, 1904–14), II: 141.
22. I explain this effect in greater detail in my article “Unrequited Love and Unrealized Dominants,” *Intégral* 7 (1994), 119–48.
23. I discuss the intricacies of the phrase structure of each stanza in this song in fuller detail in “Text-Music Relationships in the Lieder of Johannes Brahms” (Ph.D. dissertation, Graduate Center of the City University of New York, 1992), 150–60.
24. George S. Bozarth, “The ‘Lieder’ of Johannes Brahms – 1868–1871: Studies in the Chronology and Compositional Process” (Ph.D. dissertation, Princeton University, 1978), 113–14, and Bozarth, “The Musical and Documentary Sources for Brahms’s Lieder: Evidence of Compositional Process,” booklet to Deutsche Grammophon’s *Johannes Brahms Lieder* (Hamburg, 1983), 42–43.
25. Hellmut Federhofer, “Zur Einheit von Wort und Ton im Lied von Johannes Brahms,” in *Kongress-Bericht Gesellschaft für Musikforschung Hamburg 1956*, ed. Walter Gerstenberg, Heinrich Husman, and Harald Heckmann (Kassel, 1956), 97–99. Siegfried Kross, “Rhythmik und Sprachbehandlung bei Brahms,” in *Bericht über den Internationalen Musikwissenschaftlichen Kongress, Kassel 1962*, ed. Georg Reichert and Martin Just (Kassel, 1963), 217–19.
26. See Kristina Muxfeldt, “Schubert, Platen, and the Myth of Narcissus,” *JAMS* 49 (1996), 480–527.
27. Brahms has been criticized for introducing word repetitions because they alter the structure of the original poem, and some authors consider that they are inserted purely for the purpose of extending the melody. See, for example, Eric Sams, *Brahms Songs* (London and Seattle, 1972), 8. Nevertheless, Brahms and most other Lied composers (including Wolf) rarely arbitrarily repeat words; word repetitions usually underscore a particularly important moment in a poem. Thus, in the first stanza of *Ruhe, Süßliebchen* Brahms repeats “ewig” an additional time within the repeat of the final line, emphasizing the depth of Peter’s commitment. See also Edward T. Cone, “Words into Music: The Composer’s Approach to Text,” *Sound and Poetry*, ed. Northrop Frye (New York, 1957), 11–13.
28. See Wolf’s remarks on Brahms’s *Salome*, Op. 69, No. 8. *Hugo Wolf: Letters to Melanie Köchert*, trans. Louise McClelland (New York, 1991), 11.
29. Konrad Giebler offers perhaps the most sustained exploration of Brahms’s declamation, though he seems to consider only the relationship of rhythm and poetic accents, and does not take into account harmonic or melodic emphasis. Giebler, *Die Lieder von Johannes Brahms: Ein Beitrag zur Musikgeschichte des 19. Jahrhunderts* (Münster, 1959).
30. I explain the influence of the Wagner–Wolf style on the reception of Brahms’s Lieder in my essay “The Influence of Hugo Wolf on the Reception of Brahms’s Lieder,” *Brahms Studies* 2 (Lincoln, NE, 1998), 91–111.
31. Ernst Decsey, *Hugo Wolf*, 2nd edn. (Leipzig, 1903), I: 92. Max Kalbeck, *Johannes Brahms*, III: 335–37.
32. Compare the reports of Brahms’s word painting by Elaine Brody and Robert A. Fowkes, *The German Lied and its Poetry* (New York, 1971), 135, with the numerous instances of word painting described by Walter Hammermann, *Johannes Brahms als Liedkomponist: Eine theoretisch-ästhetische Stiluntersuchung* (Leipzig, 1912), 3–4 and 21–27.
33. Ira Braus, “Textual Rhetorical Organization and Harmonic Anomaly in Selected Lieder of Johannes Brahms” (Ph.D. dissertation, Harvard University, 1988), 261–62.
34. Werner Morik, *Johannes Brahms und sein Verhältnis zum deutschen Volkslied* (Tutzing, 1965), 282.
35. The melodic line of this song is full of evocative gestures. The line “Vor Schmerz” is set

off from the surrounding ones and the voice dramatically falls a fifth, forming a rhyme with “ums Herz” of line 1. By contrast, at the beginning of stanza 2 a gently falling melodic line depicts the image of the character laying his head down.

36. See Hermann Deiters’s review of Opp. 46–49 in *AmZ* 4/14 (7 April 1869), 106–08; and Paul Mies, *Stilmomente und Ausdrucksstilformen im Brahms’schen Lied* (Leipzig, 1923). Aside from considering the expressive quality of various chords, Mies considers pedal points, triadic melodies, ornaments, and rhythm. Mies and Erwin Rieger also have discussed the affective role of key characteristics in Brahms’s songs. Mies, “Tonmalerei in den Brahms’schen Werken,” *Die Musik* 26 (1923–24), 184–88, and Rieger, “Die Tonartencharakteristik im einstimmigen Klavierlied von Johannes Brahms,” *Studien zur Musikwissenschaft* 22 (1955), 142–216.

37. George Henschel, *Personal Recollections of Johannes Brahms: Some of His Letters to and Pages from a Journal kept by George Henschel* (1907; rpt. New York, 1978), 22–23. One such analysis of *Mainacht* is by Christian Martin Schmidt, who argues, however, that in Brahms’s *Lieder* the motivic structure is completely independent of the texts. Most other observers refute this conclusion and show that some of the motivic transformations and repetitions are linked to the texts. Schmidt, “Überlegungen zur Liedanalyse bei Brahms’ ‘Die Mainacht,’ Op. 43. 2,” in *Brahms-Analysen Referate der Kieler Tagung 1983*, ed. Friedhelm Krummacher and Wolfram Steinbeck (Kassel, 1984), 47–59.

38. Arnold Schoenberg, “Brahms the Progressive” (1947), *Style and Idea: Selected Writings of Arnold Schoenberg*, ed. Leonard Stein, trans. Leo Black (Belmont, 1975; rpt. Berkeley, 1984), 431–35.

39. Walter Frisch, *Brahms and the Principle of Developing Variation* (Berkeley, 1984; rpt. 1990), 151–56.

40. Eduard Hanslick, “Johannes Brahms’ Erinnerungen und Briefe” in *Musikalische Kritiken und Schilderungen: Am Ende des Jahrhunderts* (2nd edn. Berlin, 1899), 393.

41. George Bozarth, “Synthesizing Word and Tone: Brahms’s Setting of Hebbel’s ‘Vorüber,’” in *Brahms: Biographical, Documentary and Analytical Studies*, ed. Robert Pascall (Cambridge, 1983), 85. Eduard Behm “Studien bei Brahms,” *Allgemeine Musikzeitung*, 64/13–14 (26 March 1937), 183–85.

42. Friedländer, *Brahms’s Lieder*, 58.

10 Tradition and innovation: the *Lieder* of Hugo Wolf

1. Marie Lang, “Hugo Wolfs Entwicklungszeit” in *Die Zeit* (Vienna) for 3 January 1904, cited in Frank Walker, *Hugo Wolf: A Biography* (London, 1968, 2nd edn., rpt. Princeton, 1992), 325.

2. See Susan Youens, *Hugo Wolf: The Vocal Music* (Princeton, 1992); Youens, *Hugo Wolf and his Mörike Songs* (Cambridge, 2000); and Amanda Glauert, *Hugo Wolf and the Wagnerian Inheritance* (Cambridge, 1999).

3. Walker, *Hugo Wolf*, 142–43, recounts a delightful anecdote by the writer (and Wolf roommate) Hermann Bahr from the summer of 1883. Wolf was on vacation in Rinnbach and would regale his friends with scornful readings of bad poetry, probably Richard Kralik von Meyrswalden’s effusions.

4. Wolf made this statement about Schubert’s settings of Goethe’s “Prometheus” and “Ganymed” in a letter of 22 December 1890 to Emil Kauffmann. See Hugo Wolf, *Briefe an Emil Kauffmann* (Berlin, 1903), 25.

5. A letter Wolf wrote to his family on 15 March 1876 (two days after his sixteenth birthday) recounts the meeting with Wagner and is cited in Walker, *Hugo Wolf*, 35–36.

6. On 27 March 1888, Wolf told his friend Friedrich (“Fritz”) Eckstein, “On Saturday I composed, without having intended to do so, ‘Das verlassene Mädlein’, already set to music by Schumann in a heavenly way. If in spite of that I set the same poem to music, it happened almost against my will; but perhaps just because I allowed myself to be captured suddenly by the magic of this poem, something outstanding arose, and I believe that my composition may show itself beside Schumann’s.” See Walker, *Hugo Wolf*, 205–06.

7. Wolf’s exuberant letters to his friends Edmund and Marie Lang, Eckstein, and Josef Strasser are cited in Walker, *Hugo Wolf*, 202–06.

8. Hugo Wolf, *Briefe an Emil Kauffmann*, letter of 5 June 1890, 113–14.

9. See Manfred Koschlig, “Mörikes barocker Grundton und seine verborgenen Quellen: Studien zur Geschichtlichkeit des Dichters,” *Zeitschrift für Württembergische Landesgeschichte* 34–35 (1975–76), 231–323.

10. See Jeffrey Adams, ed., *Mörike’s Muses: Critical Essays on Eduard Mörike* (Columbia, SC, 1990); Renate von Heydebrand, *Eduard Mörikes Gedichtwerk. Beschreibung und Deutung der Formenvielfalt und ihrer Entwicklung* (Stuttgart, 1972); and Peter Lahnstein, *Eduard Mörike: Leben und Milieu eines Dichters* (Munich, 1986).

11. Mörike does not link the poems together, but Wolf imagined that the young

philanderer-in-the-making (“Der Knabe . . .”) would, at some future date, betray the young woman who laments in “Ein Stündlein wohl vor Tag.” See Youens, *Hugo Wolf and his Mörike Songs*, 115–28.

12. For an exemplary discussion of this song, see Deborah J. Stein, *Hugo Wolf's Lieder and Extensions of Tonality* (Ann Arbor and London, 1985), 9–10.

13. The tradition continues. Hanns Eisler uses a very slow dactylic pattern in the piano throughout his Brecht song, “Über den Selbstmord.”

14. See Edmund von Hellmer, *Hugo Wolf: Erlebtes und Erlauschtes* (Vienna and Leipzig, 1921), 137.

15. One of Wolf's earliest manuscripts (1875) is an incomplete setting of Nikolaus Lenau's ballad “Der Raubschütz,” and his first Mörike setting is also a ballad, “Suschens Vogel.”

16. Eduard Hanslick, *Fünf Jahre Musik (1891–1895). Der “Modernen Oper”* (Berlin, 1896), 270–71.

17. Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, *Gedichte*, ed. Erich Trunz (Munich, 1981), 146–47.

18. Cited in Walker, *Hugo Wolf*, 323–24.

19. The poems came from Walter-Heinrich Robert-Tornow, trans., *Die Gedichte des Michelangelo Buonarroti* (Berlin, 1896). The statement to Edmund von Hellmer that “the sculptor must sing bass” is cited in Walker, *Hugo Wolf*, 428.

20. Eric Sams, *The Songs of Hugo Wolf* (New York, 1962), 260.

21. This letter to Oskar Grohe of 27 March 1897 is cited in Walker, *Hugo Wolf*, 428–29.

22. This statement appears in the same letter to Emil Kauffmann of 5 June 1890 cited in n. 8.

23. This is the final line of one of Goethe's *Venetianische Epigramme*: “Werke des Geists und der Kunst sind für den Pöbel nicht da.” See Goethe, *Gedichte*, ed. Trunz, 176.

11 Beyond song: instrumental transformations and adaptations of the Lied from Schubert to Mahler

1. While the present discussion is limited to transformations of Lieder, the larger issue of vocal music's presence within instrumental works has recently received increasing attention from musicologists, especially those interested in narrative strategies; see, for example, Carolyn Abbate's landmark study *Unsung Voices: Opera and Musical Narrative in the Nineteenth Century* (Princeton, 1991).

2. For a brief discussion of Schubert's representative status with respect to the Lied, see

Christopher H. Gibbs, “The Elusive Schubert,” in CCS, 8–9.

3. *Wiener Theaterzeitung* (21 May 1838), 447; the review is excerpted in Otto Brusatti, *Schubert im Wiener Vormärz* (Graz, 1978), No. 86; all translations are my own unless otherwise noted.

4. A review from the AmZ, 40 (1838), 795 f., describes the extraordinary commercial success of Liszt's transcriptions.

5. *Wiener Zeitschrift für Kunst, Literatur, Theater und Mode* (7 December 1839), 1176; translation from Klára Hamburger, *Liszt*, trans. Gyula Gulyás (Budapest, 1980), 46; also cited in Brusatti, *Schubert im Wiener Vormärz*, No. 107, cf. No. 115. The historical importance of Liszt's transcriptions was later acknowledged in Eduard Hanslick's classic study of Vienna's concert life: “Liszt's transcriptions of Schubert Lieder were epoch-making. There was scarcely a concert in which Liszt did not play one or two of them; even when they were not listed on the program they would have to be played. Far be it from me to praise the artistic value of these transcriptions or even to see a glorification of Schubert in them. When one takes away the words and voice from Schubert Lieder, one has not glorified them, but rather impoverished them. Still the fact remains incontestable that Liszt, through these paraphrases, did a great deal for the dissemination of Schubert Lieder. Printed concert programs prove that since the appearance of Liszt's transcriptions of Schubert songs, the originals have been publicly sung more frequently than before: the power of virtuosity proves itself once again and this time served a good cause.” Quoted from *Geschichte des Concertwesens in Wien* (Vienna, 1869), I: 336.

6. Robert Schumann, *Music and Musicians*, ed. Konrad Wolff, trans. Paul Rosenfeld (New York, 1969), 155.

7. *Ibid.*, 154.

8. Peter Raabe, *Lizsts Schaffen* (Tutzing, 1968), II: 5–9; the most thorough study of Liszt's relation to Schubert is Thomas Kabisch, *Liszt und Schubert* (Munich, 1984).

9. See, for example, Brusatti, *Schubert im Wiener Vormärz*, Nos. 86, 91, 94, 108; and Otto Erich Deutsch, *Schubert: Memoirs by His Friends*, trans. Rosamond Ley and John Nowell (London, 1958), 186.

10. The classification of Liszt's Lied reworkings, not just of Schubert's music, is best discussed by Diether Presser in “Studien zu den Opern- und Liedbearbeitungen Franz Liszts” (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Cologne, 1953), 133 ff. See also Alan Walker, “Liszt and the Schubert Song Transcriptions,” MQ 67 (1981), 50–63;

and Humphrey Searle, *The Music of Liszt* (London, 1966).

11. Franz Liszt: *Unbekannte Presse und Briefe aus Wien 1822–1886*, ed. Dezso Legány (Vienna, 1984), 29.

12. We witness the opposite phenomenon from Liszt, who removed words from actual songs, in that words were sometimes later added to Mendelssohn's *Lieder ohne Worte*.

13. Eric Werner, *Mendelssohn: A New Image of the Composer and His Age*, trans. Dika Newlin (London, 1963), 220; see also Christina Tost, *Mendelssohns Lieder ohne Worte* (Tutzing, 1988).

14. *Music and Musicians*, 210. Schumann's own experimentations with the idea of "songs without words" extend the potential even further, as, for example, in the "unsung" middle voice (innere Stimme) in *Humoresk*, Op. 20; for a discussion of this piece and other influences of song and song cycles on Schumann's piano works, see Charles Rosen, *The Romantic Generation* (Cambridge, MA, 1995), chapters 1–3, 12.

15. *The Schubert Song Companion* (New York and London, 1997), 495.

16. See James Parakilas, *Ballads Without Words: Chopin and the Tradition of the Instrumental Ballade* (Portland, OR, 1992).

17. Arrangements of Schubert Lieder are discussed in Christopher H. Gibbs, "The Presence of Erlkönig: Reception and Reworkings of a Schubert Lied" (Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1992); there are at least two other solo violin treatments of this song, by August Möser (c. 1843) and Baptist von Hunyady (1844); *ibid.*, 316–27.

18. See Edward Kravitt, "The Orchestral Lied: An Inquiry into its Style and Unexpected Flowering around 1900," MR 37 (1976), 209–26; also Hermann Danuser, "Der Orchestergesang des Fin de siècle: Eine historische and ästhetische Skizze," Mf 30 (1977), 425–52; concerning orchestrations of Schubert Lieder, see Christopher H. Gibbs, "Haus to Konzerthaus: Orchestrations of Schubert's *Erlkönig* and other Lieder," in *Liber amicorum Isabelle Cazeaux: Symbols, Parallels and Discoveries in Her Honor*, ed. Paul-André Bempéchat (New York, forthcoming). This discussion draws briefly from that article and Gibbs, "The Presence of *Erlkönig*," 327–36.

19. At the behest of the celebrated singer Julius Stockhausen, for example, Brahms orchestrated *An Schwager Kronos*, *Memnon*, *Geheimes*, *Greisengesang*, *Ellens zweiter Gesang*, and *Gruppe aus dem Tartarus* in the 1860s; see McCorkle, *Johannes Brahms: Thematisch-Bibliographisches Werkverzeichnis*, 636–44; and Robert Pascall, "Brahms and Schubert," MT 124 (1983), 289;

and Pascall, "My Love of Schubert – No Fleeting Fancy': Brahms's Response to Schubert,"

Schubert durch die Brille 21 (June 1998), 39–60.

20. *The Beethoven Quartets* (New York, 1967), 191–222.

21. *Beethoven*, revised, 2nd edn. (New York, 1998), 387.

22. About the latter see Carl Dahlhaus, NCM, 153; and also Richard Taruskin's persuasive deconstruction of Dahlhaus's argument in *Defining Russia Musically: Historical and Hermeneutical Essays* (Princeton, 1997), 253–60.

23. Reed, *Schubert Song Companion*, 494; Schwind's remark was made in a letter of 14 March 1824 to Franz von Schober; see SDB, 333.

24. See H. C. Robbins Landon, *Haydn: The Years of 'The Creation' 1796–1800*, vol. IV of *Haydn: Chronicle and Works* (Bloomington, 1977/1994), 271–83; 293–97.

25. An appendix to Reed's invaluable *Schubert Song Companion* lists many of the interconnections between songs and other works by Schubert; pp. 494–98.

26. *Ibid.*, 494.

27. In addition to the appendix to Reed's *Schubert Song Companion* cited above, musical connections among Schubert's works are examined by Maurice J. E. Brown, "Schubert: Instrumental Derivations in the Songs," ML 28 (1947), 207–15; Reinhard van Hoorickx, "Schubert's Reminiscences of His Own Works," MQ 60 (1974), 373–88; and Leo Black, "Oaks and Osmosis," MT 138 (June 1997), 4–15. The most detailed study to date is Michael Raab, *Franz Schubert: Instrumentale Bearbeitungen eigener Lieder* (Munich, 1997).

28. This sort of recycling is not uncommon – we might remember, for example, Beethoven's use of the "Prometheus" theme in a Contredanse (WoO 14, No. 7), in his ballet *Die Geschöpfe des Prometheus*, Op. 43, in the 15 Variations for Piano, Op. 35, and in the *Eroica* Symphony, Op. 55.

29. For a fascinating psychoanalytic investigation of this issue see Theodor Reik, *The Haunting Melody: Psychoanalytic Experiences in Life and Music* (New York, 1953).

30. In most editions Liszt requested that the publishers print the words, either at the beginning of the score or, better, directly above the piano part so that the pianist could easily relate the text to the music. Late in his life Liszt reaffirmed his position taken earlier with the Schubert Lied reworkings and wrote to Breitkopf & Härtel to ask that they include the words below the music: "I wish this, for the sake of the poetical delivery in all of the songs" (*Letters of Franz Liszt*, ed. La Mara, trans. Constance

- Bache [London, 1894, rpt. New York, 1968], II: 263–64).
31. Carl Dahlhaus has observed a similar phenomenon in a reversal in modes of reception between the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Whereas many past audiences sought to add texts to instrumental music, contemporary audiences listen to vocal music as if it were absolute music, often totally oblivious to the meaning of the words, which may in any case be in a foreign language; NCM, 5. Arnold Schoenberg confessed that he realized he had no idea of what the poems were about in certain Schubert Lieder and yet “grasped the real content” of the music in any case; see “The Relation to the Text,” in *Style and Idea: Selected Writings of Arnold Schoenberg*, ed. Leonard Stein, trans. Leo Black (Berkeley, 1984), 141–45.
 32. For more on this period in Schubert’s life see Elizabeth Norman McKay, *Franz Schubert: A Biography* (Oxford, 1996), 164–207; Christopher H. Gibbs, *The Life of Schubert* (Cambridge, 2000), 91–114.
 33. Christoph Wolff, “Schubert’s *Der Tod und Das Mädchen*: Analytical and Explanatory Notes on the Song D531 and the Quartet D 810,” in *Schubert Studies: Problems of Style and Chronology*, ed. Eva Badura-Skoda and Peter Branscombe (Cambridge, 1982), 143–71.
 34. Maurice Brown, “Schubert and Some Folksongs,” *ML* 53.2 (1972), 173–78.
 35. Manfred Willfort, “Das Urbild des Andante aus Schuberts Klaviertrio Es-Dur, D929,” *Österreichische Musikzeitung* 33 (1978), 277–83.
 36. Rufus Hallmark, “Schubert’s ‘Auf dem Strom,’” in *Schubert Studies*, 25–46. There is some debate about the dating of the Trio and its performance history: see Eva Badura-Skoda, “The Chronology of Schubert’s Piano Trios,” in *Schubert Studies*, 277–98.
 37. These two coded tributes to Beethoven suggest that Schubert used songs more often than previously thought, that he did not limit the raw material to his own Lieder, and that such devices can offer hermeneutic keys to certain works and yield important biographical insights. For more on the “secret program” of the trio, see Gibbs, *The Life of Schubert*, 146–48; 157–59; an in-depth study is forthcoming.
 38. Greg Vitercik, *The Early Works of Felix Mendelssohn: A Study in the Romantic Sonata Style* (Philadelphia, 1992), 235–67.
 39. Dillon Parmer, “Brahms, Song Quotation, and Secret Programs,” *19CM* 14 (1995), 161–90.
 40. George S. Bozarth, “Brahms’s *Lieder ohne Worte*: The ‘Poetic’ Andantes of the Piano Sonatas,” in *Brahms Studies: Analytical and Historical Perspectives. Papers Delivered at the International Brahms Conference, Washington, D.C., 5–8 May 1983*, ed. George S. Bozarth (Oxford, 1990), 345–78.
 41. R. Larry Todd, “On Quotation in Schumann’s Music,” *Schumann and His World*, ed. R. Larry Todd (Princeton, 1994), 80–112.
 42. Parmer, “Brahms and Song Quotation,” 181–90.
 43. Nicholas Marston, *Schumann: Fantasie, Op. 17* (Cambridge, 1992), 34–42; Anthony Newcomb, “Schumann and the Marketplace: From Butterflies to *Hausmusik*,” in *Nineteenth-Century Piano Music*, ed. R. Larry Todd (New York, 1990), 295–96; Berthold Hoecker, “Schumann and Romantic Distance,” *JAMS* 50 (1997), 109–32; Nicholas Marston, “Voicing Beethoven’s Distant Beloved,” in *Beethoven and His World*, ed. Scott Burnham and Michael P. Steinberg (Princeton, 2000), 139–42; and Rosen, *The Romantic Generation*, 100–12.
 44. The *Cypresses* are examined in *Rethinking Dvořák: Views from Five Countries*, ed. David R. Beveridge (Oxford, 1996), which contains contributions by four scholars in a section entitled “The Unknown Dvořák: A Mini-Symposium on the Early Song Cycle, *Cypresses*” (pp. 31–70).
 45. Jan Smaczny, “Cypresses: A Song Cycle and its Metamorphoses,” in *Rethinking Dvořák*, 61–67.
 46. See Sigmund Freud, “Remembering, Repeating, and Working-Through (Further Recommendations on the Technique of Psycho-Analysis, II),” in *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud*, ed. James Strachey (London, 1961), XIV: 147–56.
 47. Jan Smaczny speculates on further quotations in “Cypresses and its Metamorphoses,” 67–70.
 48. Jan Smaczny, *Dvořák: Cello Concerto* (Cambridge, 1999), 83–84; and John Clapham, *Antonin Dvořák: Musician and Craftsman* (New York, 1966), 234.
 49. Smaczny, *Dvořák: Cello Concerto*, 54–58, 77–85.
 50. *Mahler: His Life, Work and World*, ed. Kurt Blaukopf and Herta Blaukopf (London, 1991), 204.
 51. From the vast Mahler literature, particularly helpful studies include Monika Tibbe, *Über die Verwendung von Liedern and Liedelementen in instrumentalen Symphoniesätzen Gustav Mahlers* (Munich, 1971); Henry-Louis de La Grange, “Music about Music in Mahler: Reminiscences, Allusions, or Quotations?,” in *Mahler Studies*, ed. Stephen E. Hefling (Cambridge, 1977), 122–68; Constantin Floros, *Gustav Mahler: The*

Symphonies, trans. Vernon and Jutta Wicker (Portland, OR, 1993); and the essential multi-volume studies by Donald Mitchell, *Gustav Mahler: The Early Years*, 2nd edn. (Berkeley, 1980); *Gustav Mahler: The Wunderhorn Years* (Berkeley, 1995); and *Gustav Mahler: Songs and Dances of Death* (Berkeley, 1985); and Henry-Louis de La Grange, *Mahler*, vol. I (New York, 1973); *Gustav Mahler*, vol. II: *Vienna: Years of Challenge (1897–1904)*, (Oxford, 1995); and *Gustav Mahler*, vol. III: *Vienna: Triumph and Disillusion (1904–1907)*, (Oxford, 1999).

52. The First Symphony should also be considered under the spell of the *Wunderhorn* poetry, for although Mahler had not yet set any of the collection, his own poems for the cycle *Lieder eines fahrenden Gesellen*, most especially the first song, share the same themes and language.

53. The most thorough study of the symphony is James L. Zychowicz, *Mahler's Fourth Symphony* (Oxford and New York, 2000).

54. Floros, *Gustav Mahler: The Symphonies*, 109.

55. Natalie Bauer-Lechner, *Recollections of Gustav Mahler*, trans. Dika Newlin (Cambridge, 1980), 153.

56. *Ibid.*

57. Natalie Bauer-Lechner, *Gustav Mahler in den Erinnerungen von Natalie Bauer-Lechner*, 2nd edn., ed. Herbert Killian (Hamburg, 1984), 172; translation adapted from Mark Evan Bonds, *After Beethoven: Imperatives of Originality in the Symphony* (Cambridge, MA, 1996), 183.

58. "Eternity or Nothingness? Mahler's Fifth Symphony," in *The Mahler Companion*, ed. Donald Mitchell and Andrew Nicholson (Oxford, 1999), 236–325.

59. "Mahler's 'Kammerton,'" in *The Mahler Companion*, 217–35.

60. Stephen E. Hefling, *Mahler: Das Lied von der Erde* (Cambridge, 2000); and Donald Mitchell, *Gustav Mahler: Songs and Dances of Death*.

12 The Lieder of Mahler and Richard Strauss

1. Max Kalbeck, *Johannes Brahms*, 4 vols. (Vienna, Leipzig, and Berlin, 1904–14), vol. III, pt. I, p. 109, and vol. I, pp. 171–72; quoted from Mark Evan Bonds, *After Beethoven: Imperatives of Originality in the Symphony* (Cambridge, MA and London, 1996), 1.

2. Kalbeck, *Johannes Brahms*, I: 229.

3. August Reißmann, *Das deutsche Lied in seiner historischen Entwicklung* (Kassel, 1861), 209. James Deaville draws attention to Reißmann's statement at the start of chapter 7. Interestingly, the three composers Reißmann holds up as having perfected the Lied during the century's

first half are Schubert, Mendelssohn, and Schumann. History would seem to have disagreed with him on the inclusion of Mendelssohn.

4. Harold Bloom, *The Anxiety of Influence: A Theory of Poetry* (New York and Oxford, 1973). Bonds, in *After Beethoven* (pp. 3–4), has pointed out that Bloom's theory of influence, in focusing only on the anxiety of influence, disregards a plethora of others. As Bonds (p. 4) states: "While the anxiety of influence may well be manifest in a great many poems [or symphonies or songs], there is nothing to be gained from granting it the status of exclusivity."

5. The five *Wesendonck Lieder* (1857–58), so called because they are settings of texts by Mathilde Wesendonck, are: *Der Engel*, *Stehe still!*, *Im Treibhaus*, *Schmerzen*, and *Träume*. Wagner described two of the songs as "studies for *Tristan und Isolde*"; *Im Treibhaus* adumbrates the prelude to act 3 while *Träume* anticipates the act 2 duet. Wagner's own arrangement of the latter song, for solo violin and chamber orchestra, was performed for Mathilde's birthday under Wagner's direction on 23 December 1857. In addition to Mottl's orchestral version of the other four songs, another exists by Hans Werner Henze (1976).

6. Such was the case when the Munich critic Rudolf Louis, as late as 1909, in his *Die deutsche Musik der Gegenwart* (Munich, 1909), 237, decried "the disturbing incongruity between the intimate content of the text and the demands for intensity made today upon [orchestral] media." For more on the orchestral Lied see Edward Kravitt, "The Orchestral Lied: An Inquiry into its Style and Unexpected Flowering around 1900," MR 37 (1976), 209–26; Hermann Danuser, "Der Orchestergesang des fin de siècle: Eine historische und ästhetische Skizze," Mf 30/4 (1977), 425–52; and Hans-Joachim Bracht, "Nietzsches Theorie der Lyrik und das Orchesterlied: Ästhetische und analytische Studien zu Orchesterliedern von Richard Strauss, Gustav Mahler und Arnold Schönberg" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Mainz, 1991). Elisabeth Schmierer devotes a study specifically to Mahler's orchestral Lieder in *Die Orchesterlieder Gustav Mahlers* (Kassel, 1991).

7. Georg Göhler, "Gustav Mahlers Lieder," *Die Musik* 10 (1911), 357.

8. *Gustav Mahler Briefe 1879–1911*, ed. Alma Mahler (Vienna, 1924), no. 230, and *Gustav Mahler Briefe*, rev. and enlarged edn., ed. Herta Blaukopf (Vienna, 1983), 341.

9. As noted above, Mahler sometimes took liberties with his poetical sources; in this case, he used two different *Wunderhorn* poems and

conflated them for his own purposes. The two poems in question are: “Wer hat dies Liedlein erdacht?!” and “Wer Lieben erdacht.”

10. Analysts who opt for B♭ Phrygian follow the lead of Fritz Egon Pamer, author of the first dissertation on Mahler’s songs, “Gustav Mahlers Lieder: eine stilkritische Studie” (University of Vienna, 1922). A shorter form of this investigation was posthumously published as “Gustav Mahlers Lieder,” *Studien zur Musikwissenschaft* 16 (1929), 116–38 and 17 (1930), 105–27; the reference here derives from this latter source, vol. 16, p. 120. See also William Eastman Lake, “Hermeneutic Musical Structures in *Das irdische Leben* by Gustav Mahler,” *In Theory Only* 12 (1994), 1–14.
11. Bonds examines the influence of Beethoven and his Ninth Symphony on subsequent composers in his *After Beethoven*; his discussion of the Ninth’s influence on Mahler’s Fourth Symphony appears on pp. 175–200. For a discussion of the Lied-like character of the principal theme of the Ninth’s Choral Finale, see James Parsons, “‘*Deine Zauber binden wieder*’: Beethoven, Schiller, and the Joyous Reconciliation of Opposites,” *Beethoven Forum* 9 (2002), 1–53, esp. 16–21. For a discussion of Mahler’s Fourth Symphony, see James L. Zychowicz, *Mahler’s Fourth Symphony* (Oxford and New York, 2000).
12. Natalie Bauer-Lechner, *Gustav Mahler in den Erinnerungen von Natalie Bauer-Lechner*, ed. Herbert Killian (Hamburg, 1984), 35.
13. Of the modern editions of *Des Knaben Wunderhorn*, see the essentially *Urtext* version edited by Willi A. Koch (Munich, 1957; rev. edn., 1984) published in one volume; and also the annotated one edited by Heinz Rölleke (Stuttgart, 1987), published in three volumes, each with a critical commentary.
14. Bethge based his *Die chinesische Flöte* on a work by Hans Heilmann, which in turn is based on two French translations by Le Marquis d’Hervey de Saint-Denys and Judith Gautier; see also Stephen E. Hefling, *Mahler: Das Lied von der Erde* (Cambridge and New York, 2000), 36. For a highly instructive example of the “thrice removed” source Mahler used in *Das Lied von der Erde*, see the table included in Hefling, *Mahler: Das Lied von der Erde*, pp. 38–42.
15. Arthur Wenk, “The Composer as Poet in *Das Lied von der Erde*,” *19CM* 1 (1977): 33–47 and Hefling, *Das Lied von der Erde*, 36–43.
16. Henry-Louis de La Grange, *Mahler*, vol. I (Garden City, NY, 1973), 741. The two Lieder Mahler planned to compose for the set of six are *Die Sonne spinnt* and *Die Nacht blickt mild*,

which would have used poems by Mahler himself.

17. Susan Youens, “Schubert, Mahler and the Weight of the Past: ‘Lieder eines fahrenden Gesellen’ and ‘Winterreise,’” *ML* 67 (1986), 256–68.
18. Natalie Bauer-Lechner, *Erinnerungen an Gustav Mahler*, ed. and annotated Knud Martner (Hamburg, 1984), 136; trans. Dika Newlin as *Recollections of Gustav Mahler*, ed. and annotated Peter Franklin (New York, 1980), p. 130.
19. La Grange, *Gustav Mahler*, vol. II: *Vienna: The Years of Challenge (1897–1904)* (Oxford and New York, 1995), 730–31.
20. Quoted after La Grange, *Mahler*, II: 774.
21. Quoted by Hans Moldenhauer and Rosaleen Moldenhauer, *Anton von Webern: A Chronicle of His Life and Work* (New York, 1979), 75.
22. Donald Mitchell, *Gustav Mahler: Songs and Symphonies of Life and Death* (London, 1985), 68.
23. Theodor Wiesengrund Adorno, “Zu einer imaginären Auswahl von Liedern Gustav Mahlers,” in *Impromptus, Gesammelte Schriften* (Frankfurt, 1982), XVII: 189.
24. For a thorough examination of this subject, see Christopher Lewis, “On the Chronology of the Kindertotenlieder,” *Revue Mahler Review* 1 (1987), 21–45.
25. On Mahler’s harmonic usage in the song cycles, see further V. Kofi Agawu, “Mahler’s Tonal Strategies: A Study of the Song Cycles,” *JMR* 6 (1986), 1–47.
26. La Grange, *Mahler*, II: 836.
27. V. Kofi Agawu, “The Musical Language of the *Kindertotenlieder* No. 2,” *JM* 2 (1983), 81–93.
28. For a useful discussion of the symphony and song cycle as they helped to inform this work, see Hermann Danuser, *Gustav Mahler: Das Lied von der Erde* (Munich, 1986), 28–36.
29. *Gustav Mahler: Briefe*, ed. Blaukopf, no. 400.
30. While it generally is agreed that the voices are a tenor and a contralto, a case has been made for tenor and baritone. The composer’s autograph bears the subtitle “Eine Sinfonie für eine Alt- und eine Tenorstimme und Orchester” (A symphony for tenor and contralto and orchestra). Since Mahler neither saw the work into print nor heard it in performance, questions have been raised about his intentions, especially given that the manuscript for voice and piano appears to leave the matter open-ended in the designation “Singstimme,” that is, voice. See also Hefling, “Das Lied von der Erde,” 52–53.
31. As Hefling observes, *Mahler: Das Lied von der Erde*, 81, the keys of A and C are “probably not coincidentally . . . also the principal key areas

in the first act of *Tristan und Isolde*, Mahler's favorite work of musical theatre."

32. Letter from Britten to Henry Boys, June 1937, in *Letters from a Life: The Selected Letters and Diaries of Benjamin Britten, 1913–1976*, ed. Donald Mitchell, 2 vols. (Berkeley, 1991), I: 493.

33. Quoted after La Grange, *Mahler*, II: 769.

34. See E. H. Mueller von Asow, *Richard Strauss: Thematisches Verzeichnis* (Vienna, 1955–74) and Franz Trenner, *Richard Strauss Werkverzeichnis* (Vienna, 1985). See also the valuable discussion of Strauss the Lied composer by Alan Jefferson, *The Lieder of Richard Strauss* (London, 1971) and Barbara A. Petersen, "Ton und Wort": *The Lieder of Richard Strauss* (Ann Arbor, 1980); this last work was updated in Petersen, "Richard Strauss: A Lifetime of Lied Composition," in *GLNC*, 250–78.

35. Suzanne Marie Lodato, "Richard Strauss and the Modernists: A Contextual Study of Strauss's fin-de-siècle Song Style" (Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1999).

36. This last song, *Malven*, for voice and piano, came to light only in 1984, after the death in 1982 of its dedicatee, Maria Jeritza, the soprano who participated in the first performances of *Ariadne auf Naxos* (both versions) and *Die Frau ohne Schatten*.

37. See further Ursula Lienenlücke, "Die Vertonungen zeitgenössischer Lyrik" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Cologne, 1976).

38. Timothy Jackson, "Ruhe, meine Seele! and the *Letzte Orchesterlieder*," in *Richard Strauss and His World*, ed. Bryan Gilliam (Princeton, 1992), 90–137.

39. See Marie Rolf and Elizabeth West Marvin, "Analytical Issues and Interpretive Decisions in Two Songs by Richard Strauss," *Intégral* 4 (1990), 67–103.

40. A shortlist of nineteenth-century melodramas includes Schubert's 1820 *Die Zauberharfe* (D644), six by Liszt, and Wagner's *Melodram Gretchens*, from his *Sieben Kompositionen zu Goethes Faust*, Op. 5, No. 6 (1832); the six by Liszt are provided in fn. 38, chapter 8.

41. Hellmut Federhofer considers these songs in fuller detail in "Die musikalische Gestaltung des 'Krämerspiegels' von Richard Strauss," in *Musik und Verlag: Karl Vötterle zum 65. Geburtstag*, ed. Richard Baum and Wolfgang Rehm (Kassel and New York, 1968), 260–67.

42. Timothy Jackson, "Ruhe, meine Seele! and the *Letzte Orchesterlieder*," 90–131.

43. As Norman Del Mar has commented, III: 167–68, "there seems to have been more than a little self-identification on Strauss's part with the

Jupiter of these closing pages [of the opera *Die Liebe der Danae*]."

44. Aubrey S. Garlington, Jr. discusses Strauss's four final songs in precisely this way, as Strauss's musical last will and testament to German Romanticism; see his "Richard Strauss's *Vier letzte Lieder*: The Ultimate Opus Ultimum," *Musical Quarterly* 73 (1989), 79–93. Other studies of the *Vier letzte Lieder* include John Michael Kissler, "The Four Last Songs by Richard Strauss: A Formal and Tonal Perspective," *MR* 50 (1989), 231–39 and Timothy L. Jackson, "The Last Strauss: Studies in the *letzte Lieder*" (Ph.D. dissertation, City University of New York, 1988).

13 The Lied in the modern age: to mid century

1. Strauss alters Eichendorff's text at this crucial moment, substituting "dies" (this) for the more general "das" (that). Throughout this essay, all translations are my own unless otherwise noted.

2. The title *Vier letzte Lieder* is not Strauss's. Timothy Jackson argues that the entire set owes its existence to a generating idea from the 1894 "Ruhe, meine Seele!" Op. 27, No. 1. From this Jackson concludes that the early and the four late songs form a coherent whole. See "Ruhe, meine Seele! and the *Letzte Orchesterlieder*," in *Richard Strauss and His World*, ed. Bryan Gilliam (Princeton, 1992), 90–137.

3. Paul Griffiths, "V. Lieder. The Twentieth century," *New Grove* 2, XIV: 680.

4. *MLR*, 245.

5. As true as this statement is, George Steiner makes a point equally worth bearing in mind: "in Romantic pastoralism there is as much of a flight from the devouring city as there is a return to nature." Quoted from Steiner, *In Bluebeard's Castle: Some Notes Toward the Redefinition of Culture* (New Haven, 1971), 20; the emphasis is Steiner's.

6. The poem is Goethe's "Mailied." Quoted from Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, *Sämtliche Werke nach Epochen seines Schaffens*, ed. Karl Richter (Munich, 1987), IX: 43.

7. Quoted from Robert L. Herbert, *Impressionism: Art, Leisure and Parisian Society* (New Haven, 1988), 4; quoting in turn from Maxime Du Camp, *Les chants modernes* (Paris, 1855), preface, p. 5.

8. Marx, *The Machine in the Garden: Technology and the Pastoral Ideal in America* (Oxford and New York, 2000 [1964]).

9. As a recent exhibition of paintings, prints, and photographs in Berlin at the Martin-Gropius-Bau amply document, the spread of industry into the countryside and within the city has been a subject of enduring

artistic concern. See the copiously illustrated catalogue, *Die zweite Schöpfung: Bilder der industriellen Welt vom 18. Jahrhundert bis in die Gegenwart*, ed. Sabine Beneke and Hans Ottomeyer (Berlin, 2002).

10. Part II (Scene six), piano vocal score, p. 111; the words are sung by the character of Anita: “Das Leben, das du nicht verstehst, es ist Bewegung, und darin ist das Glück. Darin du selbst sein, das ist alles! In jedem Augenblick du selbst sein, in jedem Augenblick es ganz sein, und jeden Augenblick leben, als ob kein anderer käme weder vorher, noch nachher, und sich doch nicht verliehren.”

11. See, respectively, Hugh Kenner, *The Pound Era* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, 1971) – the quotation “patterned energies” derives from p. 153 – and “Notes Toward an Anatomy of ‘Modernism,’” in *A Starchamber Quiry: A James Joyce Centennial Volume, 1882–1982*, ed. Hugh Kenner and Edmund L. Epstein (London and New York, 1982), quoting from 4–5 and 28.

12. Marshall Berman, *All That is Solid Melts into Air: The Experience of Modernity* (New York, 1982), 16.

13. LMLR, vii–ix; my occasional disagreements with Kravitt notwithstanding, his book is essential reading for anyone wishing to understand how German song from this period relates to that in the century’s second half.

14. Dahlhaus, NCM, 330 and 370.

15. From Schoenberg’s program notes for the work’s first performance, as quoted in Willi Reich, *Schoenberg: A Critical Biography*, trans. Leo Black (New York, 1971), p. 49. The study’s original German title is worth citing: *Arnold Schönberg, oder Der konservative Revolutionär* (Vienna, 1968).

16. This last point is derived from Walter Frisch’s *The Early Works of Arnold Schoenberg: 1893–1908* (Berkeley, 1993), chapter 10, pp. 258–72.

17. Hermann Kretzschmar, “Das deutsche Lied seit dem Tode Richard Wagners,” *Aufsätze aus den Jahrbüchern der Musikbibliothek Peters* (Leipzig, 1911), 285.

18. I discuss the ties of the so-called “Freude tune” in the finale of Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony in my “*Deine Zauber binden wieder*: Beethoven, Schiller, and the Joyous Reconciliation of Opposites,” *Beethoven Forum* 9/1 (2002), 1–53.

19. Franz Waxman (1906–67) fled Berlin in 1935 to settle in Hollywood where later he would go on to compose two Academy Award winning film scores (*Sunset Boulevard* [1950] and *A Place in the Sun* [1951]). In his last composition, he turned to poetry written by

children imprisoned at Theresienstadt. Waxman described the resulting work, the song cycle *Das Lied von Terezin*, as his “most dramatic musical composition.”

20. Walter Niemann, *Die Musik der Gegenwart und der letzten Vergangenheit bis zu den Romantikern, Klassizisten und Neudeutschen* (Berlin, 1921), 159.

21. Grete Wehmeyer, *Max Reger als Liederkomponist: Ein Beitrag zum Problem der Wort-Ton-Beziehung* (Regensburg, 1955), 261.

22. Ruldolf Louis, *Die deutsche Musik der Gegenwart*, 2nd edn. (Munich, 1909), 212 and 214 ff. Quoted after LMLR, 3–4; trans. amended.

23. Niemann, *Die Musik der Gegenwart*, 190–91.

24. *Ibid.*

25. Riemann, *Große Kompositionslehre* (Stuttgart, 1913), III: 236.

26. Fritz Stein, *Max Reger* (Potsdam, 1939), 128.

27. Brinkmann, “The Lyric as Paradigm: Poetry and the Foundation of Arnold Schoenberg’s New Music,” in *German Literature and Music: An Aesthetic Fusion 1890–1989*, ed. Claus Reschke and Howard Pollack (Fink, 1992), 115. Earlier in the essay Brinkmann explores this concept in greater scope. On p. 112, he writes: “*Die Moderne* is defined as a form of art that forgoes a merely illustrative relationship to a preceding reality and, in fact, seems to abandon completely the mimetic character of poetry; an art that displays a new consciousness of form penetrated by reflection . . . and, above all, an art that reflects itself in itself . . . The work of art of *Die Moderne* is self-referential and culminates in the concept and the realization of the ‘absolute poem.’”

28. Schoenberg acknowledges Reger’s standing in general and influence on his own music in a number of publications. In his “Criteria for the Evaluation of Music” (1946), he groups Reger with Mahler and himself as pioneers of a “new technique,” namely that of “developing variation.” In his essay “National Music (2)” (1931), Schoenberg declares that he learned a great deal from Reger, along with Schubert, Mahler, and Strauss. Both essays are included in *Style and Idea: Selected Writings of Arnold Schoenberg*, ed. Leonard Stein, trans. Leo Black (London, 1975), respectively 129–30 and 174.

29. On Reger’s admiration for Brahms in general, see Helmut Wirth, “Johannes Brahms und Max Reger,” *Brahms-Studien* 1 (1974), 91–112.

30. Werner Diez, *Hans Pfitzners Lieder. Versuch ein Stilbetrachtung* (Regensburg, 1968), 1.

31. Hans Rectanus, “Die musikalischen Zitate in Hans Pfitzners *Palestrina*,” in *Festschrift aus Anlaß des 100. Geburtstags . . . von Hans Pfitzner*, ed. Walter Abendroth (Munich, 1969), 23–27.

32. Pfitzner, “Die neue Ästhetik der musikalischen Impotenz,” *Gesammelte Schriften* (Augsburg, 1926), II: 212.
33. Alex Ross, “The Devil’s Disciple,” *The New Yorker*, 21 July 1997, 77.
34. Kretzschmar, “Das deutsche Lied,” 201.
35. Quoted in Hugh Frederick Garten, *Modern German Drama* (Fair Lawn, NJ, 1959), 173.
36. For more on this concept see Jost Hermand, “Unity within Diversity? The History of the Concept ‘Neue Sachlichkeit,’” in *Culture and Society in the Weimar Republic*, ed. Keith Bullivant (Manchester, 1977), 162–82. See also Fritz Schmalenbach, “The Term *Neue Sachlichkeit*,” *The Art Bulletin* 22 (1940), 161–65.
37. *Es liegt in der Luft*, a “Revue in vierundzwanzig Bildern,” first performed 15 May 1928. The theme song, first heard in the revue as the act 1 finale, is repeated at the end of the last act, act 2. Quoted here from a typed copy of the stage manuscript in the Stiftung Archiv der Akademie der Künste, Archivabteilung Darstellende Kunst und Film, Berlin, [Spoliansky 65] entitled *Es liegt in der Luft*, von *Marcellus Schiffer und Max Colpet*, *Musik: Mischa Spoliansky* (Berlin: Verlag für Bühne Film Funk, n.d.), 41–43. Other sources and indexes at the Akademie der Künste do not list Colpet as a contributor.
38. For a recent examination of both operas, see Frank Mehring, “Welcome to the Machine! The Representation of Technology in *Zeitopern*,” *Cambridge Opera Journal* 11 (1999), 159–77. For a broader examination of the subject, see Susan C. Cook, *Opera for a New Republic: The Zeitopern of Krenek, Weill, and Hindemith* (Ann Arbor, 1988).
39. Schmalenbach, “The Term *Neue Sachlichkeit*,” 164, fn. 22.
40. *Wilhelm Meister’s Apprenticeship*, ed. and trans. Eric A. Blackall, *Goethe’s Collected Works*, vol. IX (Princeton, 1995), 175. For the German, see Johann Wolfgang Goethe, *Gedenkausgabe der Werke, Briefe und Gespräche*, ed. Ernst Beutler (Zurich, 1949), VII: 313.
41. Klaus Pringsheim, “Der Zustand heutiger Musik,” *Der Querschnitt* 10 (April 1930), 215–19.
42. Ernst Krenek, “Self-Analysis,” *The University of New Mexico Quarterly* 23 (Spring 1953), 23.
43. Friedrich Schiller, “Über Bürgers Gedichte” (1791), trans. Timothy J. Chamberlain in *Eighteenth-Century German Criticism: Herder, Lenz, Lessing, and Others*, ed. Timothy J. Chamberlain (New York, 1992), 263; the emphasis is Schiller’s.
44. Heinrich Kreissle von Hellborn, *Franz Schubert* (Vienna, 1865).
45. *Schillers Werke: Nationalausgabe*, ed. Lieselotte Blumenthal (Weimar, 1961), XX: 428.
46. Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, *Phenomenology of Spirit*, trans. A. V. Miller (Oxford, 1977), 15–16.
47. Thomas Mann, in a concluding “Author’s Note” to his 1948 novel *Doctor Faustus*, described the twelve-tone technique as Schoenberg’s “intellectual property.” As Krenek noted in 1934, “perhaps at first one fears that the use of the twelve-tone system would automatically result in the “Schönberg style” . . . But even one’s first attempt proves this is not the case. The row-principle is not some sort of ‘ideological superstructure’ to justify theoretically the expressive habits of a particular master. Instead, it allows each composer his own **individual**, characteristic tone-speech.” Quoted from Krenek, “Erfahrungen mit dem “Zwölftonsystem,”” *Vossische Zeitung*, 3 March 1934, *Musikblatt*. The *Sperrdruck* emphasis is Krenek’s.
48. George Steiner, *Errata: An Examined Life* (New Haven and London, 1997), 75.
49. For an excellent overview of Schoeck the song composer, see Derrick Puffett, *The Song Cycles of Othmar Schoeck* (Bern and Stuttgart, 1982). See also Theo Hirsbrunner, “Othmar Schoeck: Zwischen Romantik und Moderne,” *Musica* 35 (1981), 246–49.
50. A short list of the most outstanding German-speaking Swiss authors includes Gottfried Keller, Meyer, Hesse, Carl Spitteler, Jeremias Gotthelf (pseudonym of Albert Bitzjus), Max Frisch, and Friedrich Dürrenmatt. Meyer is the poet to whom Schoenberg turned for his Op. 13 *Friede auf Erden*, for mixed a cappella chorus, a setting of a Christmas poem Meyer had written in 1886.
51. Quoted from *Sämtliche Werke des Freiherrn Joseph von Eichendorff Historisch-Kritische Ausgabe*, ed. Harry Fröhlich and Ursula Regener (Stuttgart, Berlin, and Cologne, 1993), I: 282.
52. See Hans Corrodi, *Othmar Schoeck: Bild eines Schaffens* (Frauenfeld, 1956); this is an enlarged new edition of the same author’s *Othmar Schoeck: eine Monographie* (1st edn. Frauenfeld and Leipzig, 1931 and 2nd edn. 1936).
53. Four years before Schoeck composed his Hesse songs, Rainer Maria Rilke revealed that in his *Duino Elegies* “affirmation of life and affirmation of death are shown to be one.” See Rilke, letter of 13 November 1925 in *Briefe*, ed. Karl Altheim (Wiesbaden, 1950), II: 480.
54. Ernst Krenek, “Anton von Webern: A Profile,” *Anton von Webern: Perspectives*, ed. Hans Moldenhauer and Demar Irvine (London, 1967), 4.

55. Anton Webern, *The Path to New Music*, ed. Willi Reich, trans. Leo Black (Bryn Mawr, 1963), 44.
56. Julian Johnson, *Webern and the Transformation of Nature* (Cambridge and New York, 1999), 31.
57. Shreffler, “*Mein Weg geht jetzt vorüber*: The Vocal Origins of Webern’s Twelve-Tone Composition,” *JAMS* 47 (1994), 279.
58. Johnson, *Webern*, 7.
59. Shreffler “*Mein Weg*,” 329.
60. Quoted from Hanns Eisler, *Materialien zu einer Dialektik der Musik* (Leipzig, 1976), 39.

14 The circulation of the Lied

1. Although relatively infrequent within musicology, studies of media and modes of circulation figure significantly in a variety of other disciplines. From a vast literature, see Roger Chartier, “Texts, Printings, Readings,” in *The New Cultural History*, ed. Lynn Hunt, *Studies on the History of Society and Culture* (Berkeley, 1989), 154–75; Chartier, *Forms and Meanings: Texts, Performances, and Audiences from Codex to Computer*, *New Cultural Studies* (Philadelphia, 1995); Friedrich A. Kittler, *Discourse Networks 1800/1900*, trans. Michael Metteer, with Chris Cullens (Palo Alto, CA, 1990); Kittler, *Gramophone, Film, Typewriter*, trans. Geoffrey Winthrop-Young and Michael Wutz, *Writing Science* (Palo Alto, CA, 1999). For an overview of attempts (more prevalent for recent and especially for popular music) to consider musicology in this light, see Helmut Rösing and Alenka Barber-Kersovan, “Musikvermittlung in der modernen Mediengesellschaft,” in *Musikwissenschaft: Ein Grundkurs*, ed. Herbert Bruhn and Rösing, *Rowohlts Enzyklopädie* (Reinbek bei Hamburg, 1998), 364–89. The recent appearance of Kate van Orden, ed., *Music and the Cultures of Print* (New York and London, 2000), however, suggests that topics of media and circulation may be beginning to receive attention within historical music as well.
2. John Reed, *Schubert* (London, 1987), 31. For a more recent and nuanced exploration of Schubert’s revolutionary creative act, see Lawrence Kramer, *Franz Schubert: Sexuality, Subjectivity, Song* (Cambridge and New York, 1998), especially 9–10.
3. Cited in SDB, 57.
4. Elizabeth Norman McKay, *Franz Schubert: A Biography* (Oxford, 1996), 58.
5. SDB, 62–63.
6. Maurice J. E. Brown, for instance, wrote that Schubert’s letter was “another example of his

inability to estimate fully the merits of his own work, for this song, an extremely long one, is an unequal piece of writing with ‘two grains of corn hid in two bushels of chaff.’” Brown, *Schubert: A Critical Biography* (London, 1958; rpt. New York, 1988), 91.

7. *Erlafsee*, D586, had appeared in the *Mahlerisches Taschenbuch für Freunde interessanter Gegenden, Natur- und Kunst-Merkwürdigkeiten der Österreichischen Monarchie* (Vienna, 1818).
8. SDB, 155. Deutsch notes that the appearance of two of Schubert’s *Lieder* in periodicals by that time rendered the author’s statement inaccurate in the strictest terms, but this differentiation merely highlights the distinction between the publication of ephemera and the appearance of the *works* (opera) that established a composer’s identity.
9. Review of *Franz Schuberts nachgelassene musikalische Dichtungen für Gesang und Pianoforte. Ossians Gesänge*, V Hefte, *Iris im Gebiete der Tonkunst* 1/39–40 (12 November 1830) (no pagination in original): “kein einziges der Stücke eine Gestalt hat; wir haben einige Zeilen Recitativ, dann einige Takte Arioso, endlich einen Satz, der fast durchaus melodisch genannt werden kann, sich aber dennoch nicht zu einer bestimmten Form gestaltet, kurz eine Häufung von Gedanken und Einzelheiten, ohne ein Ganzes daraus zu Gestalten.”
10. For a consideration of Schubert’s poets, see Susan Youens’s “Schubert and his Poets: Issues and Conundrums,” in *CCS*, 99–117, and her SPML.
11. Joseph Kerman, “A Romantic Detail in Schubert’s *Schwanengesang*,” *MQ* 48 (1962), 36–49; revised in *SCAS*, 48–64.
12. *Ibid.*, 50.
13. Even Schubert’s earliest independent publications show awareness of this process. *Opp.* 1 and 2, *Erlkönig* and *Gretchen am Spinnrade*, are each introduced (albeit the latter very briefly), and although each of the subsequent three works includes songs lacking introductions, after *Op.* 3 they occupy the later positions within the opus; the first two songs of *Opp.* 4 and 5 each begin with introductions. After *Op.* 5, songs without introductions no longer occur at all, but even before, the work as a whole is given the weight and separation provided by an introduction.
14. This formulation draws on Foucault’s concept of an “author function.” See Michel Foucault, “What Is an Author?” in *The Foucault Reader*, ed. Paul Rabinow (New York, 1984), 101–20, esp. 107–09.

15. Richard Kramer also has thematized the transformation of Schubert's songs through publication, although he views it rather as a process through which their original significance was lost. Although this perspective conflicts with the one presented here, it does recognize the crucial role of changing media. See Kramer, *Distant Cycles: Schubert and the Conceiving of Song* (Chicago, 1994), esp. chapter 1, "In Search of Song," 3–21.
16. Rolf Wilhelm Brednich, "Das Lied als Ware," *Jahrbuch für Volksliedforschung* 19 (1974), 11–20.
17. Ann Le Bar, "The Domestication of Vocal Music in Enlightenment Hamburg," *JMR* 19 (2000), 97–134. Quotations from 126.
18. Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, revised edn. (London, 1991), 37–46. Quotation from 44.
19. See David Gramit, *Cultivating Music: The Aspirations, Interests, and Limits of German Musical Culture, 1770–1848* (Berkeley, 2002), 65–73. The quotation is from Schulz's preface to the second edition of his *Lieder im Volkston* (Berlin, 1785): "mehr volksmäßig als kunstmäßig." Schulz outlined his ideals for music education in his *Gedanken über den Einfluß der Musik auf die Bildung eines Volks, und über deren Einführung in den Schulen der königl. Dänischen Staaten* (Copenhagen, 1790).
20. Schulz, *Lieder im Volkston*, Vorrede: "Der Beyfall, womit das Publikum meine bisherigen Liederkompositionen aufgenommen hat, muntert mich auf eine angenehme Art auf, dieser neuen Ausgabe meiner sämtlichen **Lieder im Volkston** alle diejenige Vollkommenheit zu geben, die von meinen Fähigkeiten abhängt. Sie wird demnach aus mehreren Theilen bestehen. . . . Die ausgelassenen Theater-Gesänge werden nebst den besten Volksliedern aus meinen **Gesängen am Klavier** einen mit manchen neuen Liedern vermehrten zweyten Theil ausmachen, auf den ich, so bald eine hinlängliche Anzahl guter Liedertexte mich in den Stand setzen wird, sie mit solchen Melodien, die ich dem Publiko anbieten zu können glaube, zu versehen, nach und nach mehrere Theile von gleicher Stärke folgen zu lassen gesonnen."
- The unfamiliarity of this passage is due not only to its contents, but also to its appearing only in summary form in Max Friedlaender, DL, while the rest of the preface appears in full (I: 256–57).
21. On the separation of producers and consumers brought about through the development of impersonal modes of commodity circulation, see Ingeborg Cleve, *Geschmack, Kunst und Konsum: Kulturpolitik als Wirtschaftspolitik in Frankreich und Württemberg (1805–1845)*, *Kritische Studien zur Geschichtswissenschaft* 111 (Göttingen, 1996), esp. 10.
22. Reichardt, "An junge Künstler," *Musikalisches Kunstmagazin* 1 (1782), 6: "Ein geschriebenes Blatt was mir mancher wahre Künstler auf meinen Reisen aus seinem verborgnen Schatze gab, war oft unendlich mehr werth als zwanzig gestochene und gedruckte Werke desselben Mannes, zubereitet für das enge Herz seiner gnädigen Käufer und den Eisenkrämereien seines Notenverlegers."
23. From Schubert's letter to Leopold Kupelwieser of 31 March 1824, cited in SDB, 339.
24. See Franz Lachner's account of a violinist who dismissed Schubert's variations on *Der Tod und das Mädchen* in the String Quartet, D810: "My dear fellow, this is no good, leave it alone; you stick to your songs!" Cited in Deutsch, ed., *Schubert: Memoirs by His Friends* (London, 1958), 289. For attempts to defend Schubert against a superficial public, see the statements of Josef Kenner and Josef von Spaun, 82, 86, and 140. On Schubert as too focused on song to rank as a truly great composer, see Leopold von Sonnleithner (112) and Josef Hüttenbrenner's account of the singer Ludwig Tietze (191).
25. *Robert Schumanns Briefe: Neue Folge*, ed. Gustav Jansen (Leipzig, 1886), 143: "sind Sie vielleicht wie ich, der ich Gesangskomposition . . . nie für eine grosse Kunst gehalten?" Rufus Hallmark, "Robert Schumann: The Poet Sings," in GLNC, 78–79, discusses possible reasons for Schumann's turn to a genre he had so recently resisted, including the possibility of economic gain from song composition.
26. See, for instance, Rudolf Schenda, *Volk ohne Buch: Studien zur Sozialgeschichte der populären Lesestoffe, 1770–1910*, *Studien zur Philosophie und Literatur des neunzehnten Jahrhunderts* 5 (Frankfurt am Main, 1970); Rolf Engelsing, *Der Bürger als Leser: Lesergeschichte in Deutschland 1500–1800* (Stuttgart, 1974); and Martha Woodmansee, *The Author, Art, and the Market: Rereading the History of Aesthetics* (New York, 1994).
27. Dahlhaus, NCM, 102–04; quotation from 102.
28. Wilhelm von Humboldt, document of 8 July 1809, cited in Wilhelm Dilthey and Alfred Heubaum, "Ein Gutachten Wilhelm von Humboldts über die Staatsprüfung des höheren Verwaltungsbeamten," *Jahrbuch für Gesetzgebung, Verwaltung und Volkswirtschaft im Deutschen Reich* 23 (1899), 253. Cited and trans. in Kittler, *Discourse Networks*, 59.

29. For a more detailed discussion of the role of the Lied in *Bildung*, see David Gramit, “Schubert’s Wanderers and the Autonomous Lied,” *JMR* 14 (1995), 147–68. Lawrence Kramer (see especially *Franz Schubert*) considers the Lied’s construction of bourgeois subjectivity with emphasis on its potential to express socially deviant rather than normative subjectivity. My account stresses rather the ability of normative culture to recuperate those potentially disruptive meanings.
30. For a discussion of the *volkstümliches Lied* as a compositional genre, see LMLR, 113–23. Popular collections of Lieder including folksongs as well as simpler songs by composers ranging from Reichardt and Zelter through Lortzing and Silcher to Beethoven, Schubert, and Mendelssohn went through numerous often quite large editions throughout the later nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. See, for example, Ludwig Erk, ed., *Erk’s Deutscher Liederschatz* (Leipzig, n.d.); and Kurt Thiele, ed., *Deutschlands Liederschatz* (Halle, n.d.), the eighteenth printing of which (after 1924) consisted of the 105,000th through 108,000th exemplars of the collection.
31. Deutsch, ed., *Memoirs*, 297–98.
32. For more on this point, see Gramit, “Schubert’s Wanderers,” and, more generally, Kittler, *Discourse Networks*.
33. From an 1868 essay on Robert Volkmann, cited and trans. in Margaret Notley, “Late-Nineteenth-Century Chamber Music and the Cult of the Classical Adagio,” *19CM* 23 (1999), 59.
34. For an overview of women as composers of Lieder, see Marcia J. Citron, “Women and the Lied, 1775–1850,” in *Women Making Music: The Western Art Tradition 1150–1950*, ed. Jane Bowers and Judith Tick (Urbana, 1986), 224–48.
35. On concert performance of Lieder in the late nineteenth century, see Kravitt, LMLR, 18–26.
36. Arnold Schoenberg, “The Relationship to the Text,” in *Style and Idea: Selected Writings*, ed. Leonard Stein, trans. Leo Black (London, 1975), 141–46; quotation from 144.
37. For a consideration of Schoenberg’s relationship to bourgeois culture and its view of art, see Carl E. Schorske, “Explosion in the Garden: Kokoschka and Schoenberg,” in *Fin-de-Siècle Vienna: Politics and Culture* (New York, 1981), 322–66.
38. On cabaret in relation to *Pierrot lunaire*, see Jonathan Dunsby, *Schoenberg: Pierrot lunaire* (Cambridge, 1992), 4–5.
39. For instance, in J. B. Steane, *The Grand Tradition: Seventy Years of Singing on Record* (London, 1974), only a single chapter of twenty considering pre-LP recordings treats Lieder; the remainder is almost entirely devoted to opera. Similarly, “Opera recordings” and “Orchestra recordings” both have extended entries in Guy A. Marco, ed., *Encyclopedia of Recorded Sound in the United States* (New York, 1993), while the Lied has none (Dietrich Fischer-Dieskau’s entry does mention his Lied recordings, but Gerald Moore, for instance, has no entry).
40. On the Hugo Wolf Society recordings, see Timothy Day, *A Century of Recorded Music: Listening to Music History* (New Haven, 2000), 69–70.
41. On the early history of attempts to disseminate classical music, see Mark Katz, “Making America More Musical through the Phonograph, 1900–1930,” *American Music* 16 (1998), 448–75.
42. London, 1936. The performer’s priority also further minimizes the generic distinction between Lied and operatic aria, which are marketed in essentially similar ways.
43. Roland Barthes, “The Grain of the Voice” (1972), in *The Responsibility of Forms: Critical Essays on Music, Art, and Representation*, trans. Richard Howard (New York, 1985), 267–77.
44. “The Romantic Song” (1976), in *ibid.*, 286–92; quotations from 289 and 292.
45. Robert Fink, “Elvis Everywhere: Musicology and Popular Music Studies at the Twilight of the Canon,” *American Music* 16 (1998), 135–79; quotation from 139. For a sociological study of musical taste that supports this conclusion, see Richard A. Peterson and Albert Simkus, “How Musical Tastes Mark Occupational Status Groups,” in Marcel Fournier and Michèle Lamont, *Cultivating Differences: Symbolic Boundaries and the Making of Inequality* (Chicago, 1992), 152–86. On the broadening of available classical works, see Michael Chanan, *Repeated Takes: A Short History of Recording and Its Effects on Music* (London, 1995), 12–14.
46. Simon Frith, “Art versus Technology: The Strange Case of Popular Music,” *Media, Culture, and Society* 8 (1986), 269.
47. This is by no means to suggest, however, that composers have not continued to find the Lied a genre worth cultivating, or that twentieth-century Lieder are of less musical or aesthetic interest than their predecessors. Indeed, as chapter 13 shows, this is far from the case. My argument concerns rather the visibility and impact of those Lieder within society.
48. Fink, “Going Flat: Post-Hierarchical Music Theory and the Musical Surface,” in *Rethinking Music*, ed. Nicholas Cook and Mark Everist (Oxford, 1999), 121. Jameson’s position is

developed at length in his *Postmodernism, or the Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism* (Durham, NC, 1991).

49. See Chanan, *Repeated Takes*, 116–21, for a survey of commentators who have stressed the tendency of recordings to privilege the musical surface. The retrospective (and socially privileged) character of Barthes's musical

writings is discussed in Pierre Bourdieu, *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*, trans. Richard Nice (Cambridge, 1984), 76.

50. Dietrich Fischer-Dieskau, "German Song," in *The Fischer-Dieskau Book of Lieder*, trans. George Bird and Richard Stokes (New York, 1984), 27.