

# International and Comparative Law Quarterly

(incorporating the *Quarterly* of the Society of Comparative Legislation  
and International Law and the *Transactions* of the Grotius Society)

VOLUME 48

LONDON

THE BRITISH INSTITUTE OF INTERNATIONAL AND  
COMPARATIVE LAW

1999

# International and Comparative Law Quarterly

(incorporating the *Quarterly* of the Society of Comparative Legislation  
and International Law and the *Transactions* of the Grotius Society)

## BOARD OF EDITORS

*General Editor:* ALAN BOYLE

*Assistant General Editor:* JOE MACDONALD HILL

JOHN BELL

P. B. CARTER

LAWRENCE COLLINS

HAZEL FOX

PIERS GARDNER

JOHN A. USHER

# The British Institute of International and Comparative Law

## COUNCIL OF MANAGEMENT

*Vice-President:* SIR MAURICE BATHURST, C.M.G., C.B.E., Q.C., D.C.L., LL.D.

*Chairman:* THE RT. HON. THE LORD GOFF OF CHIEVELEY, D.C.L., F.B.A.

*Chairman of the Executive Committee:* MICHAEL HUTCHINGS

M. P. S. Barton	The Rt. Hon. the Lord Hope of Craighead
Sir Franklin Berman, K.C.M.G., Q.C.	Advocate General Francis Jacobs
The Hon. Sir Nicolas Bratza	H.E. Judge Sir Robert Jennings, Q.C.
Professor Ian Brownlie, C.B.E., Q.C., F.B.A., D.C.L.	*The Rt. Hon. Antonio Lamer
Jeremy Carver, C.B.E.	Jeremy Lever, Q.C.
Dr. Lawrence Collins, Q.C., LL.D., F.B.A.	Professor B. S. Markesinis, D.IUR, LL.D., D.IUR (H C)
Professor J. Crawford, S.C.	The Rt. Hon. the Lord Neill of Bladen, Q.C.
Lloyd N. Cutler	Sir Peter North, C.B.E., D.C.L., F.B.A.
Professor A. L. Diamond, Q.C., LL.M., HON. D.C.L., HON. M.R.C.P.	D. A. G. Sarre
Sir Vincent Evans, G.C.M.G., M.B.E., Q.C.	R. L. Sigmon
Lady Fox, Q.C.	Sir Ian Sinclair, K.C.M.G., Q.C.
N. Fox Bassett	The Rt. Hon. the Lord Slynn of Hadley
Professor R. M. Goode, C.B.E., Q.C. LL.D., F.B.A.	David Vaughan, Q.C.
H.E. Judge Rosalyn Higgins, D.B.E., Q.C.	Sir Arthur Watts, K.C.M.G., Q.C.
The Rt. Hon. the Lord Hoffmann	

## ADVISORY BOARD

### Public International Law Section

*Chairman:* H.E. JUDGE ROSALYN HIGGINS, D.B.E., Q.C.

### Private International Law Section

*Chairman:* LAWRENCE COLLINS, Q.C., LL.D., F.B.A.

### European Community Law Section

*Chairman:* THE RT. HON. THE LORD SLYNN OF HADLEY

## DIRECTOR

J. P. GARDNER

\*Commonwealth Member

*Published by the British  
Institute of International  
and Comparative Law;  
typeset by Mendip Com-  
munications Ltd and  
printed in the United King-  
dom by Bell and Bain Ltd,  
Glasgow.*

© 1999

**British Institute of International and Comparative Law**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

(an alphabetical list of contributors, a subject index, an index of cases noted and an index of book reviews and reviewers will be found at the end of this volume)

### ARTICLES

	PAGE
THE 1996 NUCLEAR WEAPONS ADVISORY OPINION AND <i>NON LIQUET</i> IN INTERNATIONAL LAW <span style="float: right;"><i>Mariano J. Aznar-Gómez</i></span>	3
THE SWEDISH EXPERIENCE OF THE ECHR SINCE INCORPORATION <span style="float: right;"><i>Iain Cameron</i></span>	20
HORIZONTAL RIGHTS, THE HUMAN RIGHTS ACT AND PRIVACY: LESSONS FROM THE COMMONWEALTH? <span style="float: right;"><i>Ian Leigh</i></span>	57
A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THE FUNDAMENTAL ELEMENTS OF CHINESE AND ENGLISH COMPANY LAW <span style="float: right;"><i>Kingsley T. W. Ong &amp; Colin R. Baxter</i></span>	88
TWO LEGAL ORDERS: DIVERGENT OR CONVERGENT? <i>Eileen Denza</i>	257
WHY PROCEDURE IS MORE IMPORTANT THAN SUBSTANTIVE LAW <span style="float: right;"><i>Jeremy Lever</i></span>	285
PROVISIONAL AND PROTECTIVE REMEDIES: THE BRITISH EXPERIENCE OF THE BRUSSELS CONVENTION <span style="float: right;"><i>Gerry Maher and Barry J. Rodger</i></span>	302
LENDER OF LAST RESORT: AN INTERNATIONAL PERSPECTIVE <span style="float: right;"><i>Rosa Maria Lastra</i></span>	340
THE <i>ERITREA-YEMEN</i> ARBITRATION: FIRST STAGE—THE LAW OF TITLE TO TERRITORY RE-AVERRED <span style="float: right;"><i>Nuno Sérgio Marques Antunes</i></span>	362
RESERVATION CLAUSES IN TREATIES CONCLUDED WITHIN THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE <span style="float: right;"><i>Sia Spiliopoulou Åkermark</i></span>	479
PROTECTION AGAINST <i>REFOULEMENT</i> IN EUROPE: HUMAN RIGHTS COMES TO THE RESCUE <span style="float: right;"><i>Hélène Lambert</i></span>	515
DEMOCRATIC LEGITIMACY AND THE RECOGNITION OF STATES AND GOVERNMENTS <span style="float: right;"><i>Sean Murphy</i></span>	545
UN SANCTION IN EU AND NATIONAL LAW: THE <i>CENTRO-COM</i> CASE <span style="float: right;"><i>Riccardo Pavoni</i></span>	582
LIABILITY FOR DANGEROUS ACTIVITIES: A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS <span style="float: right;"><i>Elsbeth Reid</i></span>	731
<i>OSMAN V. UK</i> —TRANSFORMING ENGLISH NEGLIGENCE LAW INTO FRENCH ADMINISTRATIVE LAW <span style="float: right;"><i>Giorgio Monti</i></span>	757
DEMOCRATIC LEGITIMACY AND THE RECOGNITION OF STATES AND GOVERNMENTS <span style="float: right;"><i>Christine Von den Wyngaert &amp; Guy Stessens</i></span>	779
MODELS AND DOCUMENTS: NOTES ON SOME ARTIFACTS OF INTER- NATIONAL LEGAL KNOWLEDGE <span style="float: right;"><i>Annelise Riles</i></span>	805

THE FOREST FIRES OF INDONESIA: STATE RESPONSIBILITY AND INTERNATIONAL LIABILITY	<i>Alan K. J. Tan</i>	826
ENFORCING AWARDS ANNULLED IN THEIR STATE OF ORIGIN UNDER THE NEW YORK CONVENTION	<i>Georgios C. Petrochilos</i>	856

### SHORTER ARTICLES, COMMENTS AND NOTES

International Child Abduction—The English Experience	<i>Nigel Lowe and Alison Perry</i>	127
The Interpretation of Article 30 of the EC Treaty and the “Dormant” Commerce Clause by the European Court of Justice and the US Supreme Court	<i>Georg Haibach</i>	155
Foreign Orders and Local Law: The Caribbean Gets its Own Version of <i>Duke v. Andler</i>	<i>Winston Anderson</i>	167
Aboriginal Rights and Sustainable Development in Canada	<i>Jane Matthews Glenn and Ann C. Drost</i>	176
The Statute of the International Criminal Court	<i>Danesh Sarooshi</i>	387
Competition between National Legal Systems: A Contribution of Economic Analysis to Comparative Law	<i>Anthony Ogus</i>	405
The Harmonisation of European Product Liability Rules: French and English Law	<i>Simon Taylor</i>	419
Jurisdiction to Grant an Interim Freezing Order: Anglo-Japanese Comparison	<i>Koji Takahashi</i>	431
Tax Compliance and The Revenue Rule in Prosecutions for Wire and Mail Fraud	<i>Robert B. Chapman</i>	437
A constitutional Duty to Negotiate Amendments: <i>Reference Re Secession of Quebec</i>	<i>David P. Haljan</i>	447
The Notion of “Reasonable” in International Law: Legal Discourse, Reason and Contradictions	<i>Olivier Corten</i>	613
Mass Property Claim Resolution in a Post-war Society—The Commission for Real Property Claims in Bosnia and Herzegovina (CRPC)	<i>Hans van Houtte</i>	625
The Margin of Appreciation Doctrine in the European Court of Human Rights	<i>Michael R. Hutchinson</i>	638
National Judges and Judges Ad Hoc of the International Court of Justice	<i>Stephen M. Schwebel</i>	889
The Interaction of Treaties and Soft Law	<i>Alan E. Boyle</i>	901
Constitutional Judiciary in Central Europe and the Europe Agreement: Decision 30/1998 (VI.25) AB of the Hungarian Constitutional Court	<i>Alan F. T. Tatham</i>	913
Service of Process in England on Overseas Companies and Article 5(5) of the Brussels Convention	<i>Nelson E. Enonchong</i>	921

### CURRENT DEVELOPMENTS: EUROPEAN COMMUNITY LAW, PRIVATE AND PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW

The First <i>Pinochet</i> Case: Immunity of a Former Head of State	<i>Hazel Fox</i>	207
Free Movement of Goods	<i>Stephen Weatherill</i>	217
European Court of Justice and Jurisdiction and Enforcement of Judgments in Civil and Commercial Matters	<i>Paul Beaumont</i>	223

*Table of Contents*

vii

Transport	<i>Rosa Greaves</i>	229
Ospar Decision 98/3 and the Dumping of Offshore Installations	<i>Elizabeth A. Kirk</i>	458
The Treaty of Amsterdam	<i>Wendy Kennett</i>	465
The Brussels II Convention	<i>Wendy Kennett</i>	467
The Pinochet Case No. 3	<i>Hazel Fox</i>	687
Constitutional Aspects	<i>Sophie Boyron</i>	703
Company Law and Trade in Securities	<i>Takis Tridimas</i>	707
Intellectual Property	<i>Catherine Seville</i>	710
External Relations	<i>Eileen Denza</i>	716
The Future of Former Head of State Immunity after <i>ex parte Pinochet</i>	<i>J. Craig Barker</i>	937
<i>Ex parte Pinochet</i> : Lacuna or Leap?	<i>Eileen Denza</i>	949
Extradition Law Aspects of <i>Pinochet 3</i>	<i>Colin Warbrick</i>	958
Jurisdiction; Antisuit Injunctions; Provisional Measures under the Brussels Convention; Recognition of Judgments and Authentic Instruments under the Brussels Convention; Recognition of Arbitral Awards; The Treaty of Amsterdam	<i>Wendy Kennett</i>	966

**DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS**

The <i>M/V Saiga</i> : The First Case in the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea	<i>Vaughan Lowe</i>	187
Extraterritorial Shrimps, NGOs and the WTO Appellate Body	<i>Asif Qureshi</i>	199

**INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE: RECENT CASES**

The Land and Maritime Boundary Case ( <i>Cameron v. Nigeria</i> ), Preliminary Objections	<i>J. G. Merrills</i>	651
Case Concerning Question of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention Arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie ( <i>Libyan Arab Jamahiriya v. United Kingdom: Libyan Arab Jamahiriya v. United States</i> ), Preliminary Objections. Judgment of 27 February 1998	<i>Fiona Beveridge</i>	658
The Fisheries Jurisdiction Case ( <i>Spain v. Canada</i> ), Judgment on Jurisdiction of 4 December 1998	<i>Louise De La Fayette</i>	664
Vienna Convention on Consular Relations ( <i>Paraguay v. United States of America</i> ) (“ <i>Breard</i> ”) and Lagrand ( <i>Germany v. United States of America</i> ), Applications for Provisional Measures	<i>Michael K. Addo</i>	673

BOOK REVIEWS	237, 473, 721, 978
BOOKS RECEIVED	252, 477, 728, 984

**INDEX FOR VOLUME 48**

Contributors of Articles, Shorter Articles, Comments and Notes	987
Subject Index	989
Index of Cases Noted	993
Index of Book Reviews and Reviewers	995

## CONTRIBUTIONS

The I.C.L.Q. welcomes the submission of contributions for consideration by the editors with a view to publication. They should be sent to:

The General Editor  
*International and Comparative Law Quarterly*  
British Institute of International and Comparative Law  
17 Russell Square  
London WC1B 5DR

as should all correspondence, books for review and other communications.

The Board of Editors will only consider material which complies with the following:

1. The submission is an original, unpublished work which is not being submitted for publication elsewhere.
2. It should not exceed 25 printed I.C.L.Q. pages. State the number of words used.
3. The manuscript must be typed, double-space, on one side only of a uniform sized paper. *It is most important that footnotes be double-spaced.*
4. Footnotes must be numbered consecutively through the article and typed as a separate section at the end of the manuscript.
5. A submission of less than 4,000 words may be considered for the "Shorter Articles, Comments and Notes" section, which may secure earlier publication.

Authors are asked to refer to past issues of the I.C.L.Q. for style. More detailed guidance will be sent on request.



# CAMBRIDGE

## International Law, the International Court of Justice and Nuclear Weapons

Laurence Boisson de Chazourmes and Philippe Sands

On 8 July 1996 the International Court of Justice handed down two Advisory Opinions on the legality of nuclear weapons. In this volume, over thirty internationally respected experts contribute their analyses of the status of nuclear weapons in international law across all its sectors: use of force, humanitarian law, environment and human rights. The contributions also assess the implications of the opinions for international organisations and the international judicial function. Contributors include lawyers, academics, diplomats and advisors to international bodies.

£60.00 HB 0 521 65242 1 616pp  
£24.95 PB 0 521 65480 7

## The Power of Human Rights

*International Norms and Domestic Change*

Thomas Risse, Stephen C. Ropp and Kathryn Sikkink

This book celebrates the fiftieth anniversary of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights by showing how global human rights norms have influenced national government practices in eleven different countries around the world. The authors argue that global pressures have made a significant difference in bringing about improvements in human rights.

£37.50 HB 0 521 65093 3 334pp  
£13.95 PB 0 521 65882 9



## Refugee Rights and Realities

*Evolving International Concepts and Regimes*

Frances Nicholson and Patrick Twomey

This collection examines the evolving refugee definition, the contrast of the rights of refugees as set out in international law with the often contrasting realities of state practice. It also assesses the role of UNHCR, states and the EU in developing the evolving international refugee regime.

£45.00 HB 0 521 63282 X 424pp

Cambridge books are available from good bookshops. Alternatively you may order direct using your credit card, phone UK +44 (0)1223 326050, fax UK +44 (0)1223 326111, or e-mail [directcustserve@cup.cam.ac.uk](mailto:directcustserve@cup.cam.ac.uk)



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building  
Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK  
[www.cup.cam.ac.uk](http://www.cup.cam.ac.uk)

---

# HUMAN RIGHTS AS GENERAL NORMS AND A STATE'S RIGHT TO OPT OUT : RESERVATIONS AND OBJECTIONS TO HUMAN RIGHTS CONVENTIONS

---

*Chinkin and Others - Ed. J.P. Gardner*

This book analyses one of the most pressing problems of human rights and treaty law: how is the protection of universal individual human rights to be reconciled with the right of States to qualify their treaty obligations by reservations?

The development of treaties protecting fundamental human rights in clear terms is one of the major achievements of public international law in the second half of the twentieth century. They create a network of individual rights recognised and accepted by States and subject to a variety of independent mechanisms of reporting review and adjudication.

These treaties are nevertheless established under a regime of public international law which recognises the sovereignty of States and their concomitant right to limit their obligations by the extent of their consent.

This tension creates conceptual, policy and practical problems which at either extreme of the argument seem to threaten the two vital premises that human rights are a fundamental minimum on the one hand and that States are sovereign to determine the scope of their obligations on the other.

These problems have been brought into sharp relief by the welcome increase in the number of ratifications of human rights treaties which offers the prospect of universal protection for the first time, and the accompanying growth in reservations entered by the new parties.

The contributors to this volume review the interplay of these conflicting principles in the practical operation and interpretation of the eight principal human rights treaties and, with an authoritative introduction by HE Judge Rosalyn Higgins, make a first coherent analysis of this important issue in the protection of human rights and the operation of treaty law.

ISBN 0 903067 50 1 Hdbk xxix + 207 pp. £30

◆ **Orders to:** Publications Department, The British Institute of International and Comparative Law, Charles Clore House, 17 Russell Square, London WC1B 5DR. Tel: 0171.636.5802 Fax: 0171.323.2016 Email: [ad534@dial.pipex.com](mailto:ad534@dial.pipex.com)

# International and Comparative Law Quarterly

(incorporating the *Quarterly* of the Society of Comparative Legislation  
and International Law and the *Transactions* of the Grotius Society)

## BOARD OF EDITORS

*General Editor:* ALAN BOYLE

*Assistant General Editor:* JOE MACDONALD HILL

JOHN BELL

P. B. CARTER

LAWRENCE COLLINS

HAZEL FOX

PIERS GARDNER

JOHN A. USHER

# International and Comparative Law Quarterly

Volume 48

January 1999

Part 1

ARTICLES	PAGE
THE 1996 NUCLEAR WEAPONS ADVISORY OPINION AND <i>NON LIQUET</i> IN INTERNATIONAL LAW <i>Mariano J. Aznar-Gómez</i>	3
THE SWEDISH EXPERIENCE OF THE ECHR SINCE INCORPORATION <i>Iain Cameron</i>	20
HORIZONTAL RIGHTS, THE HUMAN RIGHTS ACT AND PRIVACY: LESSONS FROM THE COMMONWEALTH? <i>Ian Leigh</i>	57
A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THE FUNDAMENTAL ELEMENTS OF CHINESE AND ENGLISH COMPANY LAW <i>Kingsley T.W. Ong &amp; Colin R. Baxter</i>	88

## SHORTER ARTICLES, COMMENTS AND NOTES

International Child Abduction — The English Experience <i>Nigel Lowe and Alison Perry</i>	127
The Interpretation of Article 30 of the EC Treaty and the “Dormant” Commerce Clause by the European Court of Justice and the US Supreme Court <i>Georg Haibach</i>	155
Foreign Orders and Local Land: The Caribbean Gets its Own Version of <i>Duke v. Andler</i> <i>Winston Anderson</i>	167
Aboriginal Rights and Sustainable Development in Canada <i>Jane Matthews Glenn and Anne C. Drost</i>	176

## DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

ITLOS: <i>The M/V Saiga</i> : The First Case in the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea <i>Vaughan Lowe</i>	187
WTO: Extraterritorial Shrimps, NGOs and the WTO Appellate Body <i>Asif Qureshi</i>	199

## CURRENT DEVELOPMENTS: PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW

The First <i>Pinochet</i> Case: Immunity of a Former Head of State <i>Hazel Fox</i>	207
--	-----

## CURRENT DEVELOPMENTS: EUROPEAN COMMUNITY LAW

I. Free Movement of Goods <i>Stephen Weatherill</i>	217
II. European Court of Justice and Jurisdiction and Enforcement of Judgments in Civil and Commercial Matters <i>Paul Beaumont</i>	223
III. Transport <i>Rosa Greaves</i>	229

## BOOK REVIEWS

TALMON, STEFAN. <i>Recognition of Governments in International Law With Particular Reference to Governments in Exile</i> (J. Craig Barker) .....	237
FRANCK, THOMAS M. <i>Fairness in International Law and Institutions</i> (Christopher Ward) .....	237
CHENG, BIN. <i>Studies in International Space Law</i> (Sylvia Maureen Williams).....	238
RINGBOM, HENRIK (Ed.). <i>Competing Norms in the Law of Marine Environmental Protection—Focus on Ship Safety and Pollution Prevention</i> (David M. Ong).....	241
QURESHI, ASIF H. <i>The World Trade Organization, Implementing International Trade Norms</i> (Thomas J. Schoenbaum) .....	242
ALEXANDROV, STANIMIR A. <i>Self-defense against the Use of Force in International Law</i> (Colin Warbrick).....	243
KORMAN, SHARON. <i>The Right of Conquest: The Acquisition of Territory by Force in International Law and Practice</i> (Lindsay Moir).....	244
MÜLLERSON, REIN. <i>Human Rights Diplomacy</i> (G. S. Hand) .....	245
EVANS, MALCOLM D. <i>Religious Liberty and International Law in Europe</i> (Brice Dickson) .....	245
POGANY, ISTVAN. <i>Righting Wrongs in Eastern Europe</i> (Malgosia Fitzmaurice) .....	246
KEMPES, PETER (Ed.). <i>A Systematic Guide to the Case-law of the European Court of Human Rights 1960–1994</i> (Loveday Hodson) .....	247
JACOB, ROBERT (Ed.). <i>Le juge et le jugement dans les traditions européennes: Etudes d'histoire comparée</i> (L. Neville Brown).....	248
BEATSON, JACK, FORSYTH, CHRISTOPHER and HARE, IVAN (Eds). <i>Constitutional Reform in the United Kingdom: Practice and Principles</i> (Adam Tomkins) .....	249
CALDWELL, PETER C. <i>Popular Sovereignty and the Crisis of German Constitutional Law—The Theory and Practice of Weimar Constitutionalism</i> (Sven Reckewerth) .....	251
AL BAHARNA, HUSAIN M. <i>British Extra-Territorial Jurisdiction in the Gulf 1913–1971: An Analysis of the System of British Courts in the Territories of the British Protected States of the Gulf During the Pre-Independence Era</i> (Matthew Happold) .....	251

## BOOKS RECEIVED

252

## CONTRIBUTIONS

The I.C.L.Q. welcomes the submission of contributions for consideration by the editors with a view to publication. They should be sent to:

The General Editor

*International and Comparative Law Quarterly*

British Institute of International and Comparative Law

17 Russell Square

London WC1B 5DR

as should all correspondence, books for review and other communications.

The Board of Editors will only consider material which complies with the following:

1. The submission is an original, unpublished work which is not being submitted for publication elsewhere.
2. It should not exceed 25 printed I.C.L.Q. pages. State the number of words used.
3. The manuscript must be typed, double-spaced, on one side only of a uniform sized paper. *It is most important that footnotes be double-spaced.*
4. Footnotes must be numbered consecutively through the article and typed as a separate section at the end of the manuscript.
5. A submission of less than 4,000 words may be considered for the "Shorter Articles, Comments and Notes" section, which may secure earlier publication.

Authors are asked to refer to past issues of the I.C.L.Q. for style. More detailed guidance will be sent on request.

## SUBSCRIPTIONS

Subscriptions, orders and inquiries should be sent to the British Institute of International and Comparative Law, 17 Russell Square, London WC1B 5DR, telephone 0171-636 5802. The subscription to the I.C.L.Q. for 1999 is £80 (\$150), air mail postage extra. Back issues of all volumes are now available at the current cover price (casebound extra).

Contributions to the *International and Comparative Law Quarterly* express the views of their authors and not necessarily the views of the Board of Editors or of the British Institute of International and Comparative Law.

© 1999

British Institute of International and Comparative Law

Typeset by MFK Information Services Limited, Hitchin, Hertfordshire  
Printed in the United Kingdom by Bell and Bain Ltd., Glasgow

### **The Rt Hon the Lord Denning OM**

This issue of the *International and Comparative Law Quarterly* appears in the month of the one hundredth anniversary of Lord Denning's birth.

On this occasion it is appropriate to record Lord Denning's special connection with the *Quarterly*, reflected in his Foreword to the first issue published in 1952 by the Society of Comparative Legislation, of which he was then Chairman of the Executive Committee. The close involvement continued with the creation in 1958 of the British Institute of International and Comparative Law, whose journal the *Quarterly* became, and of which Lord Denning was an original subscriber, the first Chairman (1958–86) and of which he continues to be President.

