

Notes

1 The technique of conducting

1. Discussion of the rise of conducting technique and of the disagreements about technique and training can be found in chapter 6 (The rise of conducting), chapter 17 (Conducting early music), and chapter 18 (Training conductors).
2. Henry Wood, *About Conducting* (London: Sylvan Press, 1945), p. 70.
3. John Barbirolli, "The Art of Conducting," *Penguin Music Magazine* 2 (1947), p. 17.
4. Max Rudolf, *The Grammar of Conducting* (New York: G. Schirmer Inc., 1950), p. 3.
5. Jean Vermeil, *Conversations with Boulez: Thoughts on Conducting* (Paris, 1989); tr. Camille Naish (Portland: Amadeus Press, 1996), p. 65.
6. Leopold Stokowski, *Music for Us All* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1943), p. 216.
7. Bruno Walter, *Von der Music und vom Musizieren* (Leipzig: S. Fischer Verlag, 1957); *Of Music and Music-Making*, tr. and ed. Paul Hamburger (New York: W. W. Norton, 1961), p. 88.
8. Walter, *Of Music*, pp. 88–9.
9. Leonard Bernstein, "The Art of Conducting," in *The Joy of Music* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1960), p. 150.
10. *Conversations with Klemperer*, ed. Peter Heyworth (London: Faber and Faber, 1985), p. 111.
11. Wilhelm Furtwängler, *Furtwängler on Music*, ed. and tr. Ronald Taylor (Aldershot: Scholar Press, 1991), p. 19.
12. Bernstein, "The Art," p. 150.
13. Private conversation with the author, London, 1979.
14. Richard Strauss, *Recollections and Reflections*, ed. Willi Schuh, tr. L. J. Lawrence (London: Boosey and Hawkes, 1953), p. 44.
15. Hermann Scherchen, *Lehrbuch des dirigierens* (Leipzig: J. J. Weber, 1929); *Handbook of Conducting*, tr. M. D. Calvoceressi (London: Oxford University Press, 1933), pp. 187–8.
16. Richard Wagner, *My Life*, tr. Andrew Gray, ed. Mary Whittall (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), p. 283.
17. Stokowski, *Music for Us All*, p. 214.
18. Walter, *Of Music*, pp. 132–3.
19. *The Art of Conducting: Great Conductors of the Past* (Teldec Video 4509–95038–3, 1994).

20. Adrian Boult, *Boult on Music* (London: Toccata Press, 1983), pp. 103–4.
21. Richard Osborne, *Conversations with Karajan* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1989), p. 105.
22. *Ibid.*
23. See chapter 7 for more on this subject from the players' point of view.
24. Walter, *Of Music*, p. 131.
25. *Ibid.*
26. William R. Trotter, *Priest of Music: The Life of Dimitri Mitropoulos* (Portland: Amadeus Press, 1995), p. 112.
27. *Ibid.*
28. Barbirolli, "The Art," pp. 17–18.
29. Walter, *Of Music*, pp. 83–4.
30. Barbirolli, "The Art," p. 18. See chapter 18 (Training conductors) for an argument against this thesis.
31. Bernstein, "The Art," p. 151.

2 Conductors in rehearsal

1. Both the *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, second edn., 29 vols., ed. Stanley Sadie and John Tyrrell (London: Macmillan, 2000), and Vincent H. Duckles and Michael A Keller, *Music Reference and Research Materials: An Annotated Bibliography* (New York: Schirmer Books, 1994), often referred to simply as "Duckles," can direct conductors to the sources (often other printed editions or copies of manuscripts) of the printed editions available.
2. The *Journal of the Conductors' Guild* often publishes such lists. They are invariably the result of the practical experience of their working members.
3. Some publishing houses, having acquired scores under odd circumstances, appear to have disfigured them with error in order to cover their tracks. There is a rather famous twentieth-century score, widely performed, which is available at a cheap price. It contains more than sixty obvious blunders, all of which must be corrected before it can be played. Even an audience of hearing-impaired rock stars would know something was wrong. One can only wonder how (and why) such obvious errors came to exist.
4. *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, supplement of December 17, 1817.

5. Chapters 1 and 21 contain suggestions about varying approaches to space and type of orchestra.
6. George Houle, *Meter in Music, 1600–1800: Performance, Perception, and Notation* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1987).
7. Muti's rehearsals of Dvořák's Symphony No. 5 with the Bavarian RSO in 1993, and of Spontini's *La Vestale* at La Scala in the same year, are especially outstanding examples of this rehearsal technique. These films are not commercially available, but may be viewed in the Conductors on Film Collection at the Stanford University Archive of Recorded Sound.
8. Go first to Furtwängler's astonishing Brahms Symphony No. 1, recorded with the Berlin Philharmonic, Titania Palast, February 10, 1952 (DGG 415.662–2, among other releases).
9. Daniel Gillis, *Furtwängler Recalled* (Zürich: Atlantis Verlag; New York: Meredith Press, 1965) p. 65.
10. *Ibid.*
11. See, for example, Elizabeth A. H. Green, *Orchestral Bowings and Routines*, second edn, rev. and enl. (Ann Arbor, MI: Ann Arbor Publishers, 1957), a standard entry-level text, and Murray Grodner (ed.), *Concepts in String Playing: Reflections by Artist-Teachers at the Indiana University School of Music* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1979). For younger players, investigate Dorothy A. Straub et al., *Strategies for Teaching Strings and Orchestra* (Reston, VA: Music Educators' National Conference, 1996).
12. Further discussion of when and how to mark parts can be found in chapters 1, 4, 5, 6, 7, 18, 19, and 21.
13. Study the film originally broadcast as *One Man's Triumph*, Bell Telephone Hour, 1966 and now marketed as *The Cleveland Orchestra: A Portrait of George Szell* (Kultur, 1393). The Stanford Collection also includes a private copy of Szell rehearsing Brahms's Symphony No. 3 at Severance Hall in 1957, originally filmed by WEWS-TV.
14. See chapter 17 for a further discussion of conducting early music.
15. There is further discussion in chapter 3 of seating and the ways in which the studio provides ways to overcome the acoustic and physical compromises necessary in the concert hall.
16. More on conductors who talk in rehearsal can be found in chapters 7 and 21.
17. This video, made in 1965, was produced by Unitel Deutsches Grammophon, DGG 440.072.291-3, and is commercially available at the time of writing.
18. This film, made in 1970 with RSO Stuttgart, is not commercially available, but may be viewed at Stanford.
19. See his rehearsal film at Lincoln's Inn, and his conversations with Sir Peter Brook on this subject (*Sir Thomas Beecham at Lincoln's Inn*, Granada Television program, 1958, with the Royal Philharmonic Orchestra). Excerpts were included in the *Art of Conducting*, IMG/BBC television documentary, January 1994, still commercially available on video and laserdisc (Teldec, 4509-95038-6).
20. In the Stanford collection, we have a remarkable film of Stokowski, at age eighty-eight, rehearsing his American Symphony Orchestra in the Rakhmaninov *Rhapsody on a Theme of Paganini*, with Jerome Lowenthal. This document is not commercially available at this writing.
21. The same advice is elaborated upon from the player's perspective in chapter 7.
22. He describes this himself in chapter 6.
23. For a superb example of this art, see Pierre Monteux in 1961 conducting the Chicago Symphony (VAI 69604) in Berlioz's *Roman Carnival Overture*. Or examine the discreetly economical but deeply musical accompaniment he provides to Rudolph Firkusny in Beethoven's Piano Concerto No. 3, with the London Symphony Orchestra in the same year. This film, made in London on October 24, is not commercially available but may be viewed at Stanford.

5 Choral conducting

1. In conversation with Margaret Hillis, Conductor, Chicago Symphony Chorus, c.1969. William Byrd is responsible for another great quote: "Since singing is so good a thing, I wish all men would learn to sing," from the "Preface" to *Psalms Sonnets and Songs* (London: Thomas East, 1588).
2. With the *Virtuose Musik* (EMI, 1971) and *Europäische Chormusik aus fünf Jahrhunderten* (EMI, 1972), reissued 1994, reissued by Collegium USA (Clarion, 2002), for example, Eric Ericson made the choral world aware not only of his chorus, but of Scandinavian choral music. Gary Anderson in the *International Choral Bulletin* 22/2 called it "The Swedish choral culture" (January, 2002). The Dale Warland Singers have spread that culture throughout the US with their performances and recordings.
3. Christoph Wolff, *Bach, The Learned Musician* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2000), pp. 170–1. Wolff discusses Bach's personal development in contrapuntal writing, and the influence of

Vivaldi's Italian Concertos in bringing about changes in his musical thinking, language and design, from which he created a genuinely personal style.

4. Julius Herford, workshop on *Ein deutsches Requiem*, fourth movement, San Diego State University, 1955. There is also an analysis of the first movement in Julius Herford and Harold Decker, eds., *Choral Conducting, A Symposium*, second edn, (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1973), pp. 217–24.
5. Vance George, San Francisco Symphony Chorus, 2001.
6. For a useful analysis of each vocal line see Walter Gray, *The Sacred Motets of William Byrd*, Ph.D., dissertation, University of Wisconsin, pp. 89–91.
7. Robert Craft, *Dialogues* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982), p. 46.
8. Robert Shaw in rehearsal, Blossom Festival School of the Cleveland Orchestra, at Kent State University, Ohio, 1971–8. Singing pitches and counting rhythms simultaneously was a device Shaw used throughout his life.
9. John Moriarty, *Diction* (Boston: Schirmer, 1975). Part I is published for choruses, including vowels and consonants in four languages with eighty-one exercises. Another fine reference is David Adams, *A Handbook for Diction for Singers* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999) covering Italian, German, and French.
10. This is an exercise and concept from Paul Salamunovich, former Director of the Los Angeles Master Chorale, used in workshops and rehearsals.
11. James Fankhauser, "Choral/Orchestral Balance," *Choral Journal* (August 1969), pp. 5–7.
12. Robert Page often used the term "in the hum" with his Cleveland Orchestra Chorus (1973–82). It is effective in creating a warm, hushed effect.
13. Bobby McFerrin used this metaphor for hushed singing in a Chorus America Convention in Denver, Colorado on June 7, 2002.
14. The brackets, slurs, accents, and pauses help the eye group the patterns, and the "d" consonants, and crescendos and decrescendos help the voice articulate those patterns. These articulation concepts are a combination of Baroque keyboard techniques and vocal ideas Robert Shaw used for Bach's Mass in B minor in 1962.
15. Robert Page in rehearsal, Cleveland Orchestra Chorus, 1975–83.
16. Robert Shaw in rehearsal, Kent, Ohio, 1971.
17. Robert Shaw in rehearsal, Kent, Ohio, 1971.
18. See Robert W. Demaree Jr. and Don V. Moses, *The Complete Conductor* (Englewood

Cliffs: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1995), pp. 109–15, for advice on auditions. This is perhaps the best book on the myriad aspects of conducting in print. It is comprehensive, detailed and full of information for all conductors.

19. For more exercises, see K. Phillips, *Teaching Kids To Sing* (New York: Schirmer Books, Macmillan Inc., 1992)
20. Margaret Hillis, *At Rehearsals* (Barrington, IL: American Choral Foundation, The Letter Shop, 1969). This booklet contains standard markings and language guides. Tip: to sound authentically German use an "ee" [i] tongue position, the middle of the tongue arching to the middle of the upper teeth, the tip of the tongue resting on the inside of the lower teeth. German is spoken with a floating tongue. English speakers who relax the tongue flat on the floor of the mouth will sound under pitch, not genuinely German. This is helpful for the choral chamber music of Schubert, Schumann, and Brahms.
21. There is considerable advice on bowing, balance, part marking, and working with orchestras in chapters 1, 2, and 5 of *The Complete Conductor*. Don V. Moses, Robert W. Demaree, Jr., and Allan F. Ohmes, *Face to Face with an Orchestra* (Princeton, NJ: Prestige Publications, Inc., 1987) is currently out of print but a second edition is in preparation. It includes excellent discussions of choral/orchestra issues and ideas for preparing Handel's *Messiah*, Bach's Magnificat and Vivaldi's Gloria.
22. Igor Markevich in conversation with Otto Werner-Mueller, Head of Conducting Department, Curtis Institute of Music. Marking of parts is also discussed in chapters 1, 2, 4, 6, 7, 18, 19, and 21 of this volume.
23. See Demaree and Moses, *The Complete Conductor*, pp. 115–16, for more ideas on seating singers and seating arrangements for orchestra.
24. Thomas Lloyd, "When the Orchestra Arrives," *Choral Journal* (December 1999), pp. 35–45. "An imaginary plane across the middle of your body" comes naturally to most conductors. This and many other ideas regarding choral/orchestral preparation are clearly expressed in this article.
25. See Demaree and Moses, *The Complete Conductor*, pp. 278–82, for examples.

8 The rise of conducting

1. Professor Murchard, "Discovery of Ancient Greek Tablets Relative to Music," *Harmonicon* 3 (April–May 1825), pp. 56, 76; cited from Elliott W. Galkin, *A History of Orchestral Conducting in Theory and Practice* (New York: Pendragon Press, 1986), pp. 245, 487–8.

2. See Pierre Bourdelot and Pierre Bonnet, *Historie de la musique et de ses effets* (1715) in Othmar Wessely, ed., *Die grossen Darstellungen der Musikgeschichte in Barok und Aufklärung*, 4 vols. (Graz: Akademische Druck, 1966), vol. III, pp. 175–6.
3. This practice is known as cheironomy (from the Greek *cheir*: “hand”) and was practiced in ancient Egypt, India, China, and Israel. See Curt Sachs, *The Rise of Music in the Ancient World: East and West* (New York: W. W. Norton and Co., 1943), p. 216.
4. The melodic formulas used by Jews to chant the Bible were initially indicated with right-hand signals (*Talmud*, Berakhot 62a), which became the basis for the symbols added to the written text by the Masorites (AD 500–1000). See Abraham Zvi Idelsohn, *Jewish Music and Its Historical Development* (New York: Schocken Books, 1967); rept. (New York: Dover, 1992), p. 67. The Christian transition to neumes (from the Greek *neuma*: “gesture”) is harder to document since the practice of cheironomy did not survive.
5. It became standard to conduct choral works with orchestra using a baton, but the use of the baton also indicates that the orchestra conductor, and not the choir master, is the real leader. In chapter 5 of this volume, Vance George encourages all choral conductors to use a baton.
6. Heinrich Christoph Koch, *Musiklexikon* (Frankfurt am Main: Johann Hermann dem Jungern, 1802), s.v. *Niederschlag* (Greek: *Thesis*) (downbeat). “This beat has been named ‘down-beat,’ because one moves the hand downward when one is to give the beat in this part of the measure.”
7. Jean-Jacques Rousseau, *Dictionnaire de musique* (Paris: Chez la veuve Duchèsne, 1768), s.v. “*frappe*” (downbeat).
8. Thomas Balthasar Janowka, *Clavis ad Thesaurum Magna Artis Musicae* (Prague: In Magno Collegio Carolino Typis Georgij Labaun, 1701), s.v. *tactus*.
9. Galkin gives examples from Westminster to Rome from the sixteenth through the nineteenth century. Galkin, *History of Orchestral Conducting*, pp. 437–9. France seems to be an exception where divided leadership was used in church.
10. Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach, *Versuch über die wahre Art das Clavier zu spielen* (Berlin, 1753–62); tr. William J. Mitchell (New York: W. W. Norton, 1949), pp. 34–5.
11. See Johann Joachim Quantz, *Versuch einer Anweisung die Flöte transersière zu spielen* (Berlin: J. F. Voss, 1752), s.v. *Anführer*, and Leopold Mozart, *A Treatise on the Fundamental Principles of Violin Playing*, tr. Editha Knocker (London: Oxford University Press, 1948), pp. 216, 224.
12. The French violin-bow conductors, including François-Antoine Habeneck (1781–1849), and the unusual audible time-beating at the opera are both covered in chapter 10 (The French tradition).
13. Wilhelm Joseph von Wasielewski, *Aus siebzig Jahren: Lebenserinnerungen* (Stuttgart: Deutsche Verlags-Anstalt, 1897), p. 92.
14. In describing the Gewandhaus before Mendelssohn, for example, Wilhelm Adolf Lampadius makes no mention at all of these conductors and reports only that “the symphonies had always been directed by the first violinist standing at his desk.” Wilhelm Adolf Lampadius, *Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy. Ein Gesamtbild seines Lebens und Wirkens*. (Leipzig: F. E. C. Leuckart, 1886), p. 207.
15. Richard Wagner, *Mein Leben* (Munich: Paul List Verlag, 1963), p. 72; *My Life*, tr. Andrew Gray, ed. Mary Whittall (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), pp. 56–7.
16. In practice, the composer was often given this honor. Hiller reports that Ferdinand David allowed him to conduct his G minor concerto in 1843, even though it was still David’s duty. Ferdinand Hiller, *Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy, Briefe und Erinnerungen* (Cologne: M. Du Mont-Schauberg’schen Buchhandlung, 1874); second edn. (Cologne, 1878), pp. 187.
17. See Charles Burney, *An Account of the Musical Performance in Westminster Abbey, and the Pantheon in Commemoration of Handel* (Dublin: n.p., 1785), pp. 10–11. As was the French practice for large ensembles, three *chefs d’attaque* were also used as deputy conductors.
18. See H. C. Robbins Landon, *The Symphonies of Joseph Haydn* (London: Universal Edition and Rockliff, 1955), pp. 435–551.
19. George Hogarth, *The Philharmonic Society of London* (London, 1862). Cited from Miles Birket Foster, *The History of the Philharmonic Society of London, 1813–1912* (London: John Lane, The Bodley Head, 1912), p. 6, and Robert Elkin, *Royal Philharmonic: The Annals of the Royal Philharmonic Society* (London: Rider and Company, 1942), p. 15.
20. Orchestras and conductors have always battled over the number of rehearsals. While Mendelssohn often got additional rehearsals from his players, two rehearsals remained standard at the Gewandhaus until the twentieth century. Fürtwangler, being unable to get more rehearsals in 1922, simply gave fewer concerts. From 1875 on, one of the Gewandhaus rehearsals became open to the public. Reinecke writes, that from then on there was “really no

- longer a concert with two rehearsals, but a rehearsal with two concerts.” Cited from Fritz Hennenberg, *The Leipzig Gewandhaus Orchestra* (Leipzig: Veb Edition, 1962), p. 19.
21. See the *Spectator* (London) July 2, 1842, which complains that “the bills of the present season are not only, substantially, those of the last, but of every season for the last twenty years.”
22. Chorley is comparing the Philharmonic to the Paris Conservatoire orchestra under Habeneck. Henry F. Chorley, *Music and Manners in France and Germany*, 3 vols. (London: Longman, 1841); repr. (New York: Da Capo, 1984), vol. III, p. 66.
23. Spohr’s three accounts are (1) a letter to Wilhelm Speyer, April 14, 1820, in E. Speyer, *Wilhelm Speyer, der Liedercomponist, 1790–1878* (Munich, 1925), which seems to indicate that he bowed to tradition (see Adam Carse, *The Orchestra from Beethoven to Berlioz* [Cambridge: W. Heffer and Sons Limited, 1948]; repr. [New York: Broude Brothers, 1949], p. 319), (2) an article published a few months later, “Musikalische Notizen/ gesammelt von Louis Spohr während seines Aufenthalts in London vom Ende Februars Juny 1820,” *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung* 22/31 (Leipzig, 1820), col. 524, and (3) the longest account written decades later in his autobiography, Ludwig Spohr, *Selbstbiographie* (Kassel and Göttingen, 1860–1); tr. Anon., *Autobiography* (London: Longman and Green, 1865), vol. II, pp. 82–3. The story was sanctioned by George Hogarth, who was also the Society Secretary from 1850–64 and wrote an official history of the Society: *The Philharmonic Society of London* (see note 19 above). Hogarth, though, did not arrive in London until 1830 (when he became a prominent critic). The passages about Spohr’s introduction of the baton, however, are directly quoted in Foster’s and Elkin’s histories of the Philharmonic (also cited in note 19). From the mention of F. Ries as the conductor, in Spohr’s longest version, Adam Carse deduced that the date must have been May 8, and not April 10. When Arthur Jacobs found no supporting evidence, he decided it was all “the failing memory of an aging man.” Arthur Jacobs, “Spohr and the Baton,” *Music and Letters* 21/4 (1950), p. 307.
24. Spohr, *Autobiography*, vol. II, p. 83.
25. Ignaz Moscheles, *The Life of Moscheles with selections from his Diaries and Correspondence*, tr. A. D. Coleridge, 2 vols. (London: Hurst and Blackett, 1873), vol. I, p. 76.
26. Letter from London, May 26, 1829. Sebastian Hensel, *Die Familie Mendelssohn* (Berlin: 1879); 14th edn. (Berlin: Verlag von Georg Reimer, 1911), vol. I, p. 209; *The Mendelssohn Family (1729–1847): Letters and Journals*, tr. Carl Klingemann (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1882), vol. I, p. 184. This letter to his sister Fanny, written after he made his London debut on May 25, 1829, includes the information that Mendelssohn had his white stick “made for the purpose (the maker took me for an Alderman and would insist on decorating it with a crown).” This confirms that the baton was viewed primary a symbol of authority and not a musical instrument.
27. *Morning Post* (London), May 27, 1829. The *Morning Post* critic probably overstates the case a bit. In 1829 many continental orchestras still had some form of divided or alternating leadership.
28. John Ella recalls the “frowns of the Fiddlers, whose authority Mendelssohn’s baton so completely usurped.” Supplement to *Musical Union Record* (London), June 11, 1867.
29. The history of English conducting from this point is continued in chapter 13: The English tradition.
30. George R. Marek, *Gentle Genius: The Story of Felix Mendelssohn* (New York: Funk and Wagnalls, 1972), p. 219. Marek claims this is a recent discovery.
31. Johannes Forner, et al., *Die Gewandhauskonzerte zu Leipzig 1781–1981* (Leipzig: VEB Deutscher Verlag für Musik, 1981), p. 68.
32. Carse, *The Orchestra*, p. 297.
33. Charles Hallé, *The Autobiography of Charles Hallé with Correspondence and Diaries*, ed. Michael Kennedy (London: Paul Elek Books, 1972); (New York: Barnes and Noble, 1973), p. 116.
34. Robert Schumann’s review of Mendelssohn’s first concert at the Gewandhaus, October 4, 1835. Schumann, *Schumann on Music: A Selection from the Writings*, tr., ed. and annot. Henry Pleasants (New York: Dover Publications, Inc., 1988), p. 66.
35. Ercole Bottrigari, *Il Desiderio, or Concerning the Playing Together of Various Musical Instruments*, tr. Carol MacClintock (Rome: American Institute of Musicology, 1962), p. 58; also in *Women in Music: An Anthology of Source Readings*, ed. Carol Neuls-Bates, rev. edn. (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1996), p. 46.
36. H. Bertram Cox and C. L. E. Cox, *Leaves from the Journals of Sir George Smart* (London: Longmans Green and Co., 1907); (New York: Da Capo, 1973), p. 212.
37. Letter of November 12, 1838. Moritz Hauptmann, *The Letters of a Leipzig Cantor*

- being the Letters of Moritz Hauptmann to Franz Hauser, Ludwig Spohr, and Other Musicians, 2 vols., ed. Alfred Schöne and Ferdinand Hiller, tr. and arr. A. D. Coleridge (London and New York: Novello, Ewer and Co, Richard Bentley and Son, 1892); repr. (New York, 1972), vol. I, p. 189.
38. England sent eight music critics from as many papers and Mr. Robertson drew for the *Illustrated London News*. Even more were sent to cover the visit of Queen Victoria and Albert to Germany. Many other musicians, like Smart, Hallé, and Berlioz, attended and left memoirs. The collected reports of Spohr's and Liszt's conducting are forthcoming in Bowen, "Reports of the Bonn Beethoven Festival."
39. *Musical World* (London), September 4, 1845, p. 422.
40. Cox, *Smart*, p. 312.
41. "Notes on the Beethoven Festival," *The Athenaeum* (London), August 16, 1845, p. 815, and "Beethoven Festival at Bonn," *Morning Post* (London), August 15, 1845. While both are unsigned, Chorley wrote in the *Athenaeum* and Morris Barnett corresponded for the *Post*.
42. Max Maria von Weber [son of Carl], *Carl Maria von Weber, Ein Lebensbild* (Leipzig: E. Keil, 1864); tr. J. Palgrave Simpson, *Carl Maria von Weber, the Life of an Artist* (London: Chapman and Hall, 1865), vol. I, p. 354.
43. Cox, *Smart*, p. 140.
44. Berlioz, Hector, *Mémoires*, (Paris, 1870); tr. and ed. David Cairns, (New York: W. W. Norton and Co., 1975), p. 306.
45. Letter from Weber to Ferdinand Praeger, "About the Interpretation of Euryanthe." Anton Schindler says this letter was published in the *Berliner MusikZeitung*, No. 28, 1827. (Anton Schindler, *Beethoven as I Knew Him*, tr. Constance S. Jolly and annot. Donald W. MacArdle from the 3rd edn. of 1860 [Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1966], p. 410.) It is cited most often from Felix Weingartner, *On Conducting*, tr. Ernest Newman (New York: Edwin Kalmus, 1934), p. 35, but is cited here from a longer passage in Carl Bamberger (ed.), *The Conductor's Art* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1965), pp. 19–20.
46. Bamberger, *Conductor's Art*, p. 20. For more on the history of the ideology of interpretation and its relationship to tempo, see José Bowen, "The Conductor and the Score; The Relationship between Interpreter and Text in the Generation of Mendelssohn, Berlioz and Wagner," Ph. D. dissertation, Stanford University, 1994.
47. Moritz Hanemann, *Aus der Musikerwelt* (Berlin, 1875), p. 90, cited from Carse, *The Orchestra*, p. 345.
48. Richard Wagner, "Erinnerungen an Spontini," *Gesammelte Schriften*, 14 vols., ed. Julius Kapp (Leipzig: Hesse & Becker Verlag, 1914), vol. V, p. 116; *Prose Works*, 8 vols., tr. William Ashton Ellis (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul Ltd., 1892), vol. III, p. 130.
49. Wagner, "Spontini," p. 134.
50. J. T., "Notes of a Musical Tourist," *Harmonicon* 8 (Jan. 1830), p. 5. "J. T." is the only indication of authorship for this article.
51. Footnote to J. T., "Notes of a Musical Tourist."
52. Daniel J. Koury, *Orchestral Performance Practices in the Nineteenth Century* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1986), p. 35.
53. "The Oratorios," *Harmonicon* 40 (Apr. 1826), p. 85.
54. Eduard Devrient, *Meine Erinnerungen an FMB und Seine Brief an mich* (Leipzig: J. J. Weber, 1869), p. 63; *My Recollections of FMB and His Letters to Me*, tr. Natalie Macfarren (London: P. Bentley, 1869), p. 59. See also Ferdinand Hiller, *Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy, Briefe und Erinnerungen* (Cologne: M. Du Mont-Schauberg'schen Buchhandlung, 1874); second edn. (Cologne, 1878), vol. I, p. 134, and Charles Salaman, "Pianists of the Past: Personal Recollections by the late Charles Salaman," *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* 170/1031 (Sept. 1901) (Edinburgh: William Blackwood; London: T. Cadell and W. Davis, 1817–1905), p. 308.
55. Cox, *Smart*, p. 310.
56. See Koury, *Orchestral Performance Practices*, p. 80.
57. Carse, *The Orchestra*, p. 345.
58. Wagner, "Spontini," p. 124.
59. Devrient, *Meine Erinnerungen an FMB*, p. 71.
60. Berlioz, *Mémoires*, p. 297.
61. Elise Polko, *Erinnerungen an Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy* (Leipzig, 1868), p. 78.
62. *Athenaeum* (London), May 18, 1844.
63. *Morning Post* (London), May 14, 1844.
64. Wilhelm Adolf Lampadius, *Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy. Ein Gesamtbild seines Lebens und Wirkens* (Leipzig: F. E. C. Leuckart, 1886), p. 373; tr. W. L. Gage, *The Life of Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy* (Boston: Oliver Ditson, 1887), p. 329.
65. *Spectator* (London), May 18, 1844.
66. The "treatise" is actually an appendix, *L'Art du chef d'orchestre*, which Berlioz added to the second edition of his *Grand Traité d'instrumentation et d'orchestration modernes* in 1855; tr. Mary Clarke, *A Treatise of Modern Instrumentation and Orchestration to which is appended The [sic] Chef d'orchestre* (London and

- New York: J. L. Peters, 1858); rev. edn. Joseph Bennett (London and New York: Novello, Ewer and Co., 1882), p. 246. Berlioz the conductor is discussed in chapter 10.
67. Berlioz, *Chef d'orchestre*, p. 245.
68. *Times* (London), March 25, 1852.
69. *Illustrated London News*, June 18, 1842.
70. *Letter*, April 3, 1835. Moritz Hauptmann, *The Letters of a Leipzig Cantor being the Letters of Moritz Hauptmann to Franz Hauser, Ludwig Spohr, and Other Musicians*, 2 vols., ed. Alfred Schöne and Ferdinand Hiller, tr. and arr. A. D. Coleridge (London and New York: Novello, Ewer and Co, Richard Bentley and Son, 1892); repr. (New York, 1972), vol. I, pp. 123–4.
71. Franz Liszt, “The *Perseus* of Benvenuto Cellini,” letter from Florence, November 30, 1838, *Revue et Gazette musicale de Paris*, January 13, 1839, pp. 14–15; *Lettres d'un bachelier ès musique 1835–1841*; tr. and annot. Charles Suttoni as *An Artist's Journey* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1989), p. 156.
72. David Lloyd-Jones, “Borodin on Liszt,” *Music & Letters* 42 (1961), p. 118.
73. *Morning Post* (London), June 7, 1824, cited from Adrian Williams, *Portrait of Liszt by Himself and His Contemporaries* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990), p. 18.
74. Letter to Pierre Wolff, May 2, 1832 in Franz Liszt, *Briefe*, ed. La Mara [Marie Lipsius]. (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1893); *Letters of Franz Liszt*, tr. Constance Bache, 2 vols. (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1894); repr. (New York: Greenwood Press, 1969), vol. I, pp. 8–9.
75. John Knox Laughton, *Memoirs of the Life and Correspondence of Henry Reeve, C.B., D.C.L.*, 2 vols. (London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1898), p. 49.
76. Wilhelm von Lenz, *Die grossen Pianoforte-Virtuosen unserer Zeit* (Berlin, 1872); tr. Madeleine Baker, *The Great Piano Virtuosos of our Time* (New York: G. Schirmer, 1899); rev. edn. tr. Philip Reder (London and New York: Regency Press, 1971), p. 7.
77. Franz Liszt, full score of *Die Legende von der Heiligen Elisabeth* (Leipzig, C. F. Kahnt, 1870), p. 69.
78. *Figaro* (Berlin), February 18, 1843, cited from Peter Raabe, *Franz Liszt: Leben und Schaffen*, 2 vols. (Stuttgart, 1931); rev. edn. in one vol. (Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 1968), p. 254, fn. 165.
79. Franz Liszt, “Letter on Conducting,” to Richard Pohl, November 5, 1853, cited from Ernst Burger, *Franz Liszt: A Chronicle of his Life in Pictures and Documents*, tr. Stewart Spencer (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1989), p. 341.
80. *Ibid.* “Nous sommes pilotes, et non manoeuvres.”
81. Hermann Uhde writing after he saw Liszt conduct Beethoven's Ninth in 1870, *Musica sacra* 11 (1910), p. 131, cited from Raabe, *Franz Liszt*, p. 255, fn. 165; the translation is adapted from Hugh Macdonald's in his “Liszt the Conductor,” *Journal of the American Liszt Society* 38 (July–December 1995), p. 85. It appears in the original language along with many other contemporary reports in José Bowen, “The Missing Link: Franz Liszt the Conductor,” *Basler Jahrbuch für Historische Musikpraxis* 24, 2000 (Basel: Schola Cantorum Basiliensis, 2002), pp. 125–50.
82. *Illustrated London News*, June 12, 1852.
83. Richard Wagner, *Briefe an Uhlig von Zürich*, February 13, 1852, in *Selected Letters of Richard Wagner*, tr. and ed. Stewart Spencer and Barry Millington (London: J. M. Dent and Sons Ltd., 1987), p. 250.
84. Richard Wagner, “Über Schauspieler und Sänger,” in vol. XII of *Gesammelte Schriften*, p. 376.
85. Wagner, *Uhlig*, p. 250.
86. Richard Wagner, *Über das Dirigieren*, in vol. IX of *Gesammelte Schriften*, p. 164; “On Conducting,” in *Three Wagner Essays*, tr. Robert L. Jacobs (London: Ernst Eulenburg Ltd., 1979), p. 57.
87. See José Bowen, “Mendelssohn, Berlioz and Wagner as Conductors: The Origins of ‘Fidelity to the Composer,’” *Performance Practice Review* 6/1 (Spring 1993), pp. 77–88; rept. *Journal of the Conductors' Guild* 18/2 (Summer/Fall 1997), pp. 76–84.
88. Wagner, *Dirigieren*, p. 66.
89. *Morning Post* (London), March 13, 1855.
90. *Musical World* (London), March 17, 1855.
91. Wagner, *Dirigieren*, pp. 77 and 67.
92. Mr. Gericke cited in Anton Seidl, *On Conducting* (New York, 1899), p. 68. (This would be an enormous change and nothing recorded in the twentieth century comes close.)
93. *Sunday Times* (London), June 17, 1855.
94. *Sunday Times* (London), June 3, 1855. For more on the living tradition of slowing for cantabile themes, see José Bowen, “Tempo Duration and Flexibility: Techniques in the Analysis of Performance,” *Journal of Musicological Research* 16/2 (July 1996), pp. 111–56.

9 The Central European tradition

1. Christopher Fifield, “Conducting Wagner: the Search for Melos,” in Barry Millington and

- Stewart Spencer (eds.), *Wagner in Performance* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1992), p. 4.
2. Felix von Weingartner, *Buffets and Rewards*, tr. Marguerite Wolff (London: Hutchinson, 1937), p. 162.
 3. Richard Strauss, *Recollections and Reflections*, tr. L. J. Lawrence (London: Boosey and Hawkes, 1953), p. 118.
 4. A more detailed history and analysis of the performance styles of Bülow and other conductors considered in this chapter is given in Raymond Holden, *The Virtuoso Conductor: A Central European Tradition* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, forthcoming).
 5. Weingartner, *Buffets*, p. 135.
 6. *Ibid.*
 7. Bruno Walter, *Theme and Variations*, tr. James Galston (London, 1947); (Knopf: New York, 1968), p. 210.
 8. Walter Damrosch is discussed in chapter 12.
 9. Christopher Fifield, *True Artist and True Friend: A Biography of Hans Richter* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993), p. 60.
 10. Much of his famous *Parsifal* was captured by Columbia and HMV (1927–9) and reissued as Opal CD 9843.
 11. The implications of this legacy for American conducting are considered in chapter 12.
 12. The basis for these reforms are set out in Possart's article, "Ueber die Neueinstudierung und Neuinszenierung des Mozart'schen Don Giovanni (Don Juan) auf dem kgl. Residenztheater zu München" (Munich, 1896).
 13. Cf. Bernhard Paumgartner, *Gustav Mahlers Bearbeitung von Mozarts "Cosi fan tutte" für seine Aufführungen an der Wiener Hofoper* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1968).
 14. Felix von Weingartner, *Ratschläge für Aufführungen der Symphonien Beethovens* (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1906); *On the Performance of Beethoven's Symphonies*, tr. Jessie Crossland (London, 1907); repr. in *Weingartner on Music and Conducting* (New York: Dover Books, 1969), pp. iii–viii.
 15. *Famous Composers Playing Their Own Works*, sleeve notes (Teldec CD 4509–95354–2, 1971, © 1971, © 1994).
 16. The Introduction's opening speed ($\varepsilon=96$) is linked to that of the first movement's second subject ($\eta=48$) and the overall tempo of the last movement ($\theta=144$). Further, the speed of the Introduction at bar 21 ($\varepsilon=104$) is linked to both the first movement's first subject ($\eta=52$) and the tempo of the second movement's bridge passage ($\varepsilon=104$). Cf. Raymond Holden, "Richard Strauss: The Mozart Recordings," *Richard Strauss-Blätter* 35 (Vienna, June 1996), pp. 39–56, and Raymond Holden, "Richard Strauss, an Organised Mozartian," *Richard Strauss-Blätter* 46 (Vienna, December 2001), pp. 119–84.
 17. Raymond Holden, "Recording *Don Juan*: The Composer's Perspective," *Richard Strauss-Blätter* 40 (Vienna, December 1998), pp. 52–70.
 18. Arthur Schnabel, *My Life and Music* (New York: Dover, 1988), pp. 154–5.
 19. Klaus Kropfinger, "Gerettete Herausforderung: Mahlers 4. Symphonie – Mengelbergs Interpretation," in R. Stephan (ed.), *Mahler-Interpretation: Aspekte zum Werk und Wirken von Gustav Mahler* (Mainz and London: Schott, 1975), pp. 111–75.
 20. Bruno Walter, *Von der Music und vom Musizieren* (Leipzig: S. Fischer Verlag, 1957); tr. Paul Hamburger, *Of Music and Music-Making* (London: Faber and Faber, 1961); reprint edn. (New York: Norton, 1961), pp. 76–7.
 21. Daniel Gillis, *Furtwängler Recalled* (Zürich: Atlantis-Verlag, 1965); (New York: Meredith Press, 1965), p. 57. For an empirical study of tempo fluctuation on recordings see José Bowen, "Tempo Duration and Flexibility: Techniques in the Analysis of Performance," *Journal of Musicological Research* 16/2 (July 1996), pp. 111–56.
 22. Walter, *Of Music*, pp. 136–8.
 23. *Ibid.*, p. 140.
 24. Otto Klemperer, *Minor Recollections* (London: Dobson, 1964), p. 26.
 25. Wilhelm Furtwängler, *Notebooks 1924–1954*, tr. Shaun Whiteside, ed. Michael Tanner (London: Quartet Books, 1989); repr. (London 1995), pp. 46–7.
 26. Beethoven's Symphony No. 5 (1937), Bach's Brandenburg Concerto No. 3 (1929), Strauss's *Till Eulenspiegel* (1930), Mozart's *Eine kleine Nachtmusik* (1936–7), and Tchaikovsky's Symphony No. 6 (1938).
 27. Karajan joined the Nazi Party twice, at Aachen on April 8, 1933 and, again, at Ulm in May 1933, and not in 1935 as he claimed. See R. Vaughan Moor, *Herbert von Karajan: A Biographical Portrait* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1986), and Fred K. Prieberg, *Kraftprobe: Wilhelm Furtwängler im dritten Reich* (Wiesbaden: F. A. Brockhaus, 1986), and Prieberg, *Trial of Strength*, tr. Christopher Dolan (London: Quartet Books, 1991); (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1994) for extensive evidence about this Nazi record.
 28. Bernard Holland, "How von Karajan Sees His Conducting Success" *New York Times*, October 22, 1982.
 29. Erich Leinsdorf, *The Composer's Advocate: A Radical Orthodoxy for Musicians* (New Haven

and London: Yale University Press, 1981), p. 201.

30. Until recently, the story of American conducting has been largely one of immigrants, and their activities are described fully in Chapter 12.

10 The French tradition

1. Cited from D. Kern Holoman, “The Emergence of the Orchestral Conductor in Paris in the 1830s,” in *Music in Paris in the Eighteen-Thirties*, ed. Peter Bloom, vol. IV of *Musical Life in 19th-Century France* (Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press, 1987), p. 390, fn. 6.

2. *Berliner allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, June 27, 1829, repr. in *La Critique musicale d’Hector Berlioz, 1823–1863*, ed. H. Robert Cohen and Yves Gérard, vol. I (Paris: Editions Buchet/Chastel, 1996), pp. 29–30.

3. *The Letters of Mozart and His Family*, tr. and ed. Emily Anderson (London: Macmillan, 1938); rev. edn. (London: Macmillan, 1985), pp. 557–8.

4. David Cairns, “The Operas of Berlioz,” in Alan Blyth (ed.), *Opera on Record 2* (London: Hutchinson, 1983), p. 162: a review of the mutilated, two-disc version of Berlioz’s *Les Troyens* conducted by Georges Prêtre (1965), with Régine Crespin and the orchestra and chorus of the Paris Opéra.

5. *Notes de musique*, (Paris: Charpentier et Cie 1875), p. 63.

6. “Ce bufle de Padeloup.” See *Correspondance générale d’Hector Berlioz*, vol. VII, ed. Hugh Macdonald (Paris: Flammarion, 2001), p. 681.

7. In *The World*, January 13, 1892; repr. in *Shaw’s Music*, ed. Dan H. Laurence (London: Max Reinhardt, The Bodley Head, 1981), vol. II, p. 519.

8. Though frequently disputed, the incident is attested by independent witnesses.

9. See Jean-Michel Nectoux, “Trois Orchestres Parisiens en 1830,” in Bloom, *Music in Paris* p. 480.

10. Repr. “Dixième Soirée” in Hector Berlioz, *Les soirées dans l’orchestre* (Paris: Michel Levy Frères, 1852).

11. Hector Berlioz, *Grand Traité d’instrumentation et d’orchestration modernes: nouvelle édition augmentée de l’Art du chef d’orchestre*, (Paris: Schonenberger [1855]), p. 308.

12. Edouard Marie Ernest Deldevez, *L’Art du chef d’orchestre* (Paris: Firmin-Didot, 1878), pp. 3, 76.

13. Georges Kastner, “Des qualités à exiger des artistes d’un orchestre, et d’un chef lui-même,” supplement to Kastner’s *Cours d’instrumentation* (Paris, rev. 1844).

14. Deldevez, *L’Art* pp. 140–1.

15. Letter to Zelter, Feb. 15, 1832, *Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy Briefe*, ed. Rudolf Elvers (Frankfurt/Main: Fischer Taschenbuch Verlag GmbH, 1984).

16. See D. Kern Holoman, *The Société des Concerts du Conservatoire (1828–1967): Chronicle of the Paris Conservatory Orchestra after Documents in its Archive* (Berkeley: University of California Press, forthcoming).

17. Cited from Holoman, *Société des Concerts*.

18. Antoine Elwart, *Histoire de la Société des Concerts du Conservatoire Impérial de Musique* (Paris, 1860), pp. 5, 12.

19. Richard Wagner, *Über das Dirigieren* (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1869); *Gesammelte Schriften*, 14 vols., ed. Julius Kapp (Leipzig: Hesse & Becker Verlag, 1914), vol. IX, pp. 163–4.

20. Mikhail Glinka, *Memoirs*, tr. Richard B. Mudge, (Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press, 1963), p. 192.

21. See Louis Engel, *From Mozart to Mario* (London, 1886), vol. I, p. 68.

22. Cited from David Cairns, *Berlioz: Servitude and Greatness* (London: Allen Lane, The Penguin Press, 1999), p. 407.

23. *Life and Letters of Sir Charles Hallé* (London: Smith, Elder and Co, 1896), pp. 64, 68.

24. Cited from Vladimir Stasov, *Selected Essays on Music*, tr. Florence Jonas (London: Barrie and Rockliff, The Cresset Press, 1968), p. 166.

25. See *Correspondance générale d’Hector Berlioz*, ed. Pierre Citron (Paris: Flammarion, 1978), vol. III, p. 138.

26. *Briefwechsel zwischen Franz Liszt und Hans von Bülow*, ed. La Mara (Leipzig, 1898), pp. 76–9.

27. Paul Smith, “Revue de l’année 1850,” in the *Revue et gazette musicale* (Jan. 5, 1851).

28. See Cairns, *Servitude*, p. 776 (Cornelius), pp. 289–90 (Gripenkerl), p. 522 (Singakademie ladies).

29. Charles Gruneisen in the *Illustrated London News* (May 15, 1852).

30. *Musical World*, June 5, 1852.

31. Romain Rolland, *Musiciens d’aujourd’hui*, ninth edn. (Paris: Librairie Hachette, 1921), p. 237.

32. The Monteux and Munch Boston years are discussed in chapter 12.

33. Holoman, *Société des Concerts*.

34. See Roger Nichols, *The Harlequin Years: Music in Paris 1917–1929* (London: Thames and Hudson, 2002), p. 46.

35. Boulez and his conducting of modern music are also discussed in chapter 19.

36. See for example *Illustrated London News*, May 15, 1852, where Gruneisen recalls that the choral part of Beethoven's Ninth was always "very deficiently done" at the Conservatoire concerts.

11 The Italian tradition

1. Charles de Brosses, *Lettres familières sur l'Italie*, ed. Yvonne Bezar, 2 vols. (Paris: Firmin-Didot, 1931), vol. II, pp. 357 and 356.
2. Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, *Italian Journey*, tr. W. H. Auden and Elizabeth Mayer (London: Collins, 1962), pp. 67–8.
3. Charles Santley, *Student and Singer* (London: Edward Arnold, 1892), p. 100.
4. De Brosses, *Lettres familières*, vol. II, pp. 337–8.
5. Louis Spohr, *Autobiography*, tr. Anon., 2 vols. (London: Longman, Green, Longman, Roberts and Green, 1865), vol. I, p. 259.
6. Spohr, *Autobiography*, vol. II, p. 13.
7. Hector Berlioz, *Mémoires* (Paris: 1870); tr. David Cairns, second edn. (London: Gollancz, 1977), p. 196.
8. Felix Mendelssohn, *Letters from Italy and Switzerland*, tr. Lady Wallace (London: Longman, Green, Longman and Roberts, 1862), p. 150.
9. Henry Wood, *My Life of Music* (London: Gollancz, 1938), p. 82.
10. Stendhal, *Life of Rossini*, tr. Richard N. Coe (London: John Calder, 1956), p. 289.
11. *Rivista teatrale* (Rome) 1834, cited from David Kimbell, *Italian Opera* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991), p. 422.
12. Spohr, *Autobiography*, vol. I, pp. 308–9.
13. Guido Zavadini, *Donizetti, vita, musiche, epistolario* (Bergamo: Istituto italiano d'arti grafiche, 1948), p. 343.
14. Spohr, *Autobiography*, vol. I, p. 258.
15. *Musical World* (London), April 18, 1846, p. 179.
16. John Rosselli, *Music and Musicians in Nineteenth Century Italy* (London: Batsford, 1991), p. 51.
17. For Spontini's activities in Berlin see chapter 8, The rise of conducting.
18. For which see chapter 13, The English tradition.
19. Ignaz Moscheles, *The Life of Moscheles with Selections from his Diaries and Correspondence*, tr. A. D. Coleridge, 2 vols. (London: Hurst and Blackett, 1873), vol. II, p. 202.
20. *I copialettere di Giuseppe Verdi*, ed. Gaetano Cesari and Alessandro Luzio (Milan, 1913), p. 256, note.
21. James W. Davison, *From Mendelssohn to Wagner* (London: Wm Reeves, 1912), p. 30.

22. Bernard Shaw, *London Music in 1888–89* (London: Constable, 1937), p. 191.
23. Angelo Mariani, ms autobiography, cited in Frank Walker, *The Man Verdi* (London: J. M. Dent, 1962), p. 291.
24. Antonio Ghislanzoni, "Angelo Mariani," in *Libro serio* (Milan: Tip. Ed. Lombarda, 1879), p. 30.
25. Walker, *Man Verdi*, p. 339.
26. Ghislanzoni, "Mariani," p. 45.
27. Franco Abbiati, *Giuseppe Verdi*, 4 vols. (Milan: Ricordi, 1959), vol. III, p. 249.
28. "Lettres inédites de G. Verdi à Léon Escudier," *Rivista musicale italiana* 35 (1928), p. 526.
29. *Copialettere di G. Verdi*, p. 256, note.
30. *Copialettere di G. Verdi*, p. 256–7.
31. Santley, *Student*, p. 236.
32. Cited from Kimbell, *Italian Opera*, p. 573.
33. Notices in *La patrie* and *Le Gaulois*, cited from Raffaello de Rensis, *Franco Faccio e Verdi* (Milan: Treves, 1934), p. 163.
34. Shaw, *London Music*, p. 161.
35. Walker, *Man Verdi*, p. 342.
36. Toscanini's work in America is discussed in chapter 12.
37. Wilhelm Furtwängler, *Notebooks 1924–1954* (London: Quartet Books, 1989), pp. 45–6.
38. Alma Mahler, *Gustav Mahler, Memories and Letters*, ed. Donald Mitchell (London: Murray, 1968), p. 146.
39. Bernard Shore, *The Orchestra Speaks* (London: Longmans and Green, 1938), p. 165.
40. *Conductors in Conversation*, ed. Robert Chesterman (London: Robson, 1990), pp. 137 and 135.
41. *Ibid.*, p. 73.

12 The American tradition

1. Richard Crawford, *America's Musical Life: A History* (New York: W. W. Norton and Co., 2001), pp. 272–81, and Margret Hindle Hazen and Robert M. Hazen, *The Music Men: An Illustrated History of Brass Bands in America, 1800–1920* (Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1987), p. 118.
2. W. Porter Ware and Thaddeus C. Lockard Jr., *P. T. Barnum Presents Jenny Lind: The American Tour of the Swedish Nightingale* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1980), p. 54.
3. Joseph Horowitz, *Understanding Toscanini: A Social History of American Concert Life* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987), p. 28, and Howard Shanet, *Philharmonic: A History of New York's Orchestra* (Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1975), pp. 35–7, 109–10.
4. John H. Mueller, *The American Symphony Orchestra: A Social History of Musical Taste*

(Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1951), p. 25.

5. Theodore Thomas, *A Musical Autobiography*, ed. George P. Upton, 2 vols. (Chicago, 1905), vol. I, pp. 24–5, cited from Lawrence W. Levine, *Highbrow Lowbrow: The Emergence of Cultural Hierarchy in America* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988), p. 113. Levine called this process of separation and purification of the orchestral world “sacralization.”

6. H. Earle Johnson, *Symphony Hall, Boston: With a List of Works Performed by the Boston Symphony Orchestra, Compiled by Members of the Staff of Symphony Hall* (Boston, 1950), pp. 47, 52, cited from Levine, *Highbrow Lowbrow*, p. 137.

7. Mueller, *The American Symphony Orchestra*, p. 24.

8. For more on Jullien, see chapter 13 or Adam Carse, *The Life of Jullien, Adventurer, Showman, Conductor* (Cambridge: Heffer, 1951).

9. Ezra Schabas, *Theodore Thomas, America’s Conductor and Builder of Orchestras, 1835–1905* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1988), pp. 36–8.

10. Theodore Thomas, “Musical Possibilities in America,” *Scribner’s Monthly* 21 (March 1881), pp. 777–8, 780; *Theodore Thomas: A Musical Autobiography*, ed. George P. Upton (Chicago: McClurg, 1905); (Da Capo, 1964).

11. M. A. Dewolfe Howe, *The Boston Symphony Orchestra, 1881–1931* (Boston, 1931), pp. 62–6, cited from Levine, p. 125.

12. Howe, *The BSO*, pp. 62–6, Mueller, *The American Symphony Orchestra*, p. 363, and Levine, *Highbrow Lowbrow*, 125.

13. Muck’s European career is discussed in chapter 9.

14. Monteux’s earlier French career is discussed in chapter 10.

15. The orchestra was founded in 1891 as the Chicago Orchestra. In 1905, it changed its name to the Theodore Thomas Orchestra, in honor of its founding director. In 1913, it assumed its present name, the Chicago Symphony Orchestra.

16. For more on symphony choruses, see chapter 5.

17. See Herbert Kupferberg, *Those Fabulous Philadelphians: The Life and Times of a Great Orchestra* (New York: Charles Scribner’s Sons, 1969).

18. Olga Samaroff Stokowski, *An American Musician’s Story* (New York: Norton, 1939).

19. Mueller, *The American Symphony Orchestra*, p. 128.

20. Even today, the orchestra touts its status as the city’s “Premiere International Ambassador”: “Such performances remind listeners

throughout the world each year of the Orchestra’s renowned ‘Philadelphia Sound’ while also bringing attention to the ensemble’s hometown.”

http://www.philorch.org/fs_poa.htm. Accessed on Nov. 15, 2002.

21. Roland Gelatt, *The Fabulous Phonograph, 1877–1977* (New York: Collier Books, 1977), p. 230.

22. See Horowitz, *Understanding Toscanini* (and other articles) for the argument, and Harvey Sachs, “Misunderstanding Toscanini,” in *Reflections on Toscanini* (New York: Grove Weidenfeld, 1991) for the counterargument.

23. Mortimer H. Frank, *Arturo Toscanini: The NBC Years* (Portland: Amadeus, 2002), p. 16.

24. Toscanini’s life and work are discussed at length in chapter 11.

25. See, for example, Harvey Sachs, *Letters of Arturo Toscanini* (New York: Knopf, 2002), p. 200.

26. Howard Taubman, *The Maestro: The Life of Arturo Toscanini* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1951), p. 231.

27. William R. Trotter, *Priest of Music: The Life of Dimitri Mitropoulos* (Portland: Amadeus, 1995), pp. 401–22.

28. Humphrey Burton, *Leonard Bernstein* (New York: Doubleday, 1994), pp. 390–7.

29. Bernstein is often credited with reviving Mahler’s music, and more recently with not deserving that accolade. In truth, Walter, Klemperer, and Mitropoulos, among others, performed Mahler well before Bernstein did. But he was the first to record all nine of the composer’s symphonies, which he regularly programmed in concert as well, and his fame certainly brought greater exposure to the Viennese composer.

13 The English tradition

1. George Bernard Shaw (unsigned), “Vocalists of the Season: Sir Michael Costa,” *The Hornet*, August 1, 1877. Cited from *Shaw’s Music: The Complete Musical Criticism of Bernard Shaw*, 3 vols., ed. Dan H. Lawrence (London: Bodley Head, London, 1981), vol. I, p. 169.

2. *Shaw’s Music*, vol. I, p. 170.

3. Ralph Vaughan Williams, “Conducting,” in *Grove’s Dictionary of Music and Musicians* (London, Macmillan, 1906), vol. I, p. 587.

4. Shaw (*Shaw’s Music*, vol. I, p. 170) describes Costa “presumptuously reinforcing the brass parts with trombones” in Beethoven, while Berlioz writes that “In London you hear *Don Giovanni*, *Figaro*, and *The Barber of Seville* with additional parts for bass drum, trombones and

- ophicleide supplied by Costa.” Hector Berlioz, *Mémoires*, (Paris: 1870); tr. David Cairns (London: Gollancz, 1969), p. 92.
5. Gerald Norris, *Stanford, the Cambridge Jubilee and Tchaikovsky* (Newton Abbot: David and Charles 1980), p. 117.
 6. Ignaz Moscheles, *Recent Music and Musicians*, ed. Charlotte Moscheles, ed. and tr. A. D. Coleridge (New York: Henry Holt and Co, 1873), pp. 291–2.
 7. A. H. W. (Mrs. Edmond Wodehouse), “Jullien,” in *Grove’s Dictionary* (1906), vol. II, p. 552.
 8. J. A. Fuller Maitland, “Charles Hallé,” in *Grove’s Dictionary* (1906), vol. II, p. 276.
 9. Ralph Vaughan Williams, in *Grove’s Dictionary* (1906), vol. I, p. 588.
 10. Richard Wagner, “On Conducting,” *Prose Works*, 8 vols., tr. William Ashton Ellis (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul Ltd., 1892), vol. IV, pp. 306–7.
 11. George Bernard Shaw, “Herr Richter and his Blue Ribbon,” *The Dramatic Review*, February 8, 1885. Cited from *Shaw’s Music*, vol. I, pp. 208–9.
 12. Hubert Parry, Diary, May 4, 1877, cited from Christopher Fifield, *True Artist and True Friend: A Biography of Hans Richter* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993), p. 123.
 13. Shaw, “Herr Richter and his Blue Ribbon.”
 14. Arnold Bennett, *The Journal of Arnold Bennett* (London, 1933), October 24, 1899.
 15. Claude Debussy, “London Letters: 29 April 1903,” cited from *Debussy on Music*, tr. and ed. Richard Langham Smith (London: Secker and Warburg, 1977), p. 189.
 16. Vaughan Williams, *Grove’s Dictionary* (1906), vol. I, p. 588.
 17. Cited from Arthur Jacobs, *Henry J. Wood Maker of the Proms* (London: Methuen, 1994), p. 136.
 18. Jacobs, *Wood*, p. 142.
 19. Adrian Boult, *Boult on Music* (London: Toccata Press, 1983), p. 108.
 20. Bernard Shore, *The Orchestra Speaks* (London: Longmans Green, 1938), p. 189.
 21. Boult, *Boult on Music*, p. 111.
 22. Neville Cardus, *Sir Thomas Beecham: A Memoir* (London: Collins, 1961), p. 71.
 23. *Ibid.*, p. 106.
 24. *Beecham Stories*, ed. Harold Atkins and Archie Newman (London: Robson, 1978), p. 49.
 25. *Beecham Stories*, p. 59.
 26. Charles Reid, *Thomas Beecham: An Independent Biography* (London: Gollancz, 1962), p. 240.
 27. Cardus, *Beecham*, p. 83. Cardus calls this remark “rich.”
 28. Shore, *Orchestra*, pp. 39.
 29. *Ibid.*, pp. 116–17.
 30. Reid, *Beecham*, p. 192.
 31. Thomas Russell, *Philharmonic* (London: Hutchinson, 1942), p. 60.
 32. Reid, *Beecham*, p. 195.
 33. *Morning Post* (London), October 23, 1930, cited from Nicholas Kenyon, *The BBC Symphony Orchestra (1930–1980)* (London: BBC Publications, 1981), p. 55. Kenyon quotes four other reviews, and notes their “rare unanimity.” The critic of the *Daily Mail* also praises the performance of the National Anthem!
 34. Boult, *Boult on Music*, p. 95.
 35. From 1930 to 1942 Boult combined the functions of chief conductor of BBC Symphony Orchestra and director of music for the BBC.
 36. Shore, *Orchestra* p. 59.
 37. Harold C. Schonberg, *The Great Conductors* (London: Gollancz, 1968), p. 299.
 38. *Beecham Stories*, p. 61.
 39. The orchestra was reformed the same year as a self-governing body, under Klemperer’s direction, as the “New Philharmonia Orchestra.” Klemperer is also discussed in chapter 9.
 40. *Conversations with Klemperer*, ed. Peter Heyworth (London: Gollancz, 1973), pp. 111–12.
 41. *Times* (London), December 6, 1960, cited from Peter Heyworth, *Otto Klemperer: His Life and Times* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), vol. II (ed. John Lucas), p. 287.
 42. Stephen Johnson. “Music We Thought We Knew,” interview in *Gramophone* (April 1989), p. 1553. It is arguable that something of this Beechamesque spirit has been a part of the British historical performance movement from early on. In his seminal study *The Interpretation of Music* (London: Hutchinson, 1954), harpsichordist and musicologist Thurston Dart (1921–71) gave this advice to scholar-performers: “Perhaps the best present-day examples of mannered performance may be found in jazz music . . . The student of the history of performance will find much to interest him here; many of these devices are debased or improved versions of the mannered styles used in ‘classical’ music at various stages of its development” (p. 78, fn.).
 43. Cited from Roy Jenkins, *Churchill* (London: Macmillan, 2001), p. 743.
 44. Cited from Nicholas Kenyon, *Simon Rattle: From Birmingham to Berlin* (London: Faber, 2001), p. 321.

14 The Russian tradition

1. Alexander Serov, quoted from Nikolay Andreyevich Rimsky-Korsakov, *My Musical Life*,

- ed. Carl van Vechten, tr. Judah A. Joffe (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1923); rept. (London: Faber and Faber, 1989), p. 102 (fn. 9).
2. Vladimir Stasov, "Musical Events of the Year 1847," in *Selected Essays on Music*, tr. Florence Jonas (London: Barrie and Rockliff, 1968), p. 25.
 3. Hector Berlioz, letter to Ernest Reyer, January 23, 1868, quoted in David Cairns, *Berlioz: Servitude and Greatness* (Berkeley and London: University of California Press, 1999), p. 766.
 4. Richard Wagner, letter to Josef Standhartner, February 15, 1863, quoted in Rosamund Bartlett, *Wagner and Russia* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), p. 21.
 5. Pyotr Tchaikovsky, letter to Nadezhda von Meck, March 28, 1879, quoted in Bartlett, *Wagner and Russia*, p. 23.
 6. Tchaikovsky quoted in Alexandra Orlova, *Tchaikovsky: A Self-Portrait* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990), p. 321.
 7. *Ibid.*, p. 87.
 8. Sergey Prokofiev, letter to his father, December 14, 1902, quoted in Prokofiev, *Autobiografiya* (Moscow: Sovetskii Compositor, 1973), pp. 125–6.
 9. Prokofiev, letter to Vasily Morolev, July 28, 1907, quoted in *Prokofiev by Prokofiev: A Composer's Memoir*, tr. Guy Daniels (New York: Doubleday and Co., 1979), p. 205.
 10. Nikolay Medtner, quoted in Sergey Bertensson and Jay Leyda, *Sergei Rachmaninoff: A Lifetime in Music* (London: Allen and Unwin, 1965), pp. 108–9. Martyn Brabbins makes much the same point about Rakhmaninov's conducting of his own work in chapter 19.
 11. Nikolai Malko, *A Certain Art* (New York: William Morrow and Co., 1966), p. 79.
 12. Koussevitzky's years in Boston are discussed in chapter 12.
 13. *Prokofiev by Prokofiev*, p. 218.
 14. Nicolai Malko, *The Conductor and his Baton* (Copenhagen: Wilhelm Hansen, 1950).
 15. Sergey Prokofiev, *Soviet Diary 1927 and Other Writings*, ed. and tr. Oleg Prokofiev (London: Faber and Faber, 1991), p. 16.
 16. David Nice, "Russian Opera," interview with Valery Gergiev, *Gramophone* 70 (June 1992), p. 32.

15 The conductor as artistic director

1. Arthur Jacobs, *Henry J. Wood Maker of the Proms* (London: Methuen, 1994), p. 355.
2. Nicholas Kenyon, *Simon Rattle: From Birmingham to Berlin* (London: Faber and Faber, 2001).
3. The reduced residency of modern conductors is discussed in chapter 20, Managers and the business of conducting.

4. See chapter 8.
5. See José Bowen, "The Missing Link: Franz Liszt the Conductor," *Basler Jahrbuch für historische Musikpraxis* 24, 2000 (Schola Cantorum Basiliensis: Basel, Switzerland, 2002), pp. 125–50, and Alan Walker, *Franz Liszt, Volume 2: The Weimar Years* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1989), pp. 270–99. More on both Mendelssohn and Liszt as conductors can be found in chapter 8.
6. Two contrasting and noteworthy exceptions, Leonard Bernstein (New York Philharmonic, 1957–69) and Pierre Boulez (New York Philharmonic, 1971–8), are discussed in chapter 19.
7. Robert Sunter, *International Journal of Arts Management* 2/1 (HEC Montréal, 2000).
8. Richard Turner, principal harp, Winnipeg Symphony Orchestra, Canada, interview with the author, 2002.
9. Sir Adrian Boult, *My Own Trumpet* (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1973).
10. Leon Botstein also discusses programming and curating in chapter 21.
11. Interview with Joan Peyser, *New York Times*, January 12, 1969, quoted in Joan Peyser, *Leonard Bernstein: A Biography* (New York: Ballantine Books, 1987). Incidentally, Humphrey Burton re-quotes Peyser (whose book was loathed by Bernstein) in his biography *Leonard Bernstein* (New York: Doubleday, 1994). Both authors include a tasteless story where Bernstein, attempting to keep the orchestra's attention during rehearsal, holds a limerick competition beginning "There was a composer named Babbitt/Who had the peculiar habit . . ." The personal style of Boulez (who succeeded Bernstein in 1971) would have been a refreshing antidote to this kind of atmosphere.
12. Hector Berlioz, *Mémoires*, Paris: 1870; *Memoirs of Hector Berlioz*, tr. David Cairns (New York: W. W. Norton, 1975).
13. Walt Whitman, "Passage to India," in *Complete Poetry and Selected Prose and Letters* (London: Nonesuch Press, 1967), p. 372.
14. This relationship is further discussed in chapter 19.

16 Women on the podium

1. Elias Canetti, *Masse und Macht* (Hamburg: Claassen, 1960; also Munich: Carl Hanser, 1960); tr. Carol Stewart, *Crowds and Power* (New York: The Viking Press, 1962), p. 394.
2. Christine Battersby, *Gender and Genius: Towards a Feminist Aesthetics* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1990); Norman Lebrecht, *The Maestro Myth: Great Conductors in Pursuit of Power* (New York: Birch Lane Press

- Book published by Carol Publishing Group, 1991).
3. Christopher Porterfield, "At the Juilliard, Conducting Course Plays Molto Vivace," *Smithsonian* 15 (September 1984), Expanded Academic ASAP [online database].
 4. Andrea Quinn quoted by Malcolm Hayes, "Future of Music: Women Conductors: Waving, Not Drowning," *Classic CD* 108 (Feb. 1999), p. 26.
 5. The description is cited in chapter 8 (fn. 35), Ercole Bottrigari, *Il Desiderio, or Concerning the Playing Together of Various Musical Instruments*, tr. Carol MacClintock (Rome: American Institute of Musicology, 1962), p. 58, also in *Women in Music: An Anthology of Source Readings from the Middle Ages to the Present*, ed. Carol Neuls-Bates rev. edn. (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1996), p. 46.
 6. Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy, *Reisebriefe von Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy aus den Jahren 1830 bis 1832*, ed. Paul Mendelssohn Bartholdy (Leipzig: Verlag von Hermann Mendelssohn, 1862), [vol. 1], p. 297; Françoise Tillard, *Fanny Mendelssohn*, trans. Camille Naish (Portland: Amadeus, 1996), pp. 203–4. The German phrase Felix used to describe her conducting is "mit Umsicht," which seems less glowing in its evaluation than Tillard's translation. Further, Tillard unjustifiably assumes that Felix's comment indicates that "her conducting was precise and effective, like her brother's, with no showy effects" (p. 206).
 7. *Fanny Mendelssohn: Italienisches Tagebuch*, ed. Eva Weissweiler (Darmstadt: Luchterhand, 1985), p. 11, as quoted in translation by Tillard, *Fanny Mendelssohn*, p. 328. Kinkel led the Bonn Gesangverein as a young woman and re-established the chorus after her return to Bonn from study in Berlin (Ann Willison Lemke, "Kinkel, Johanna," *The New Grove Dictionary of Music Online*, ed. Laura Macy, <http://www.grovemusic.com> [accessed July 26, 2002]).
 8. Sebastian Hensel, *The Mendelssohn Family (1729–1847) from Letters and Journals*, second rev. edn., tr. Carl Klingemann (1882); rept., (New York: Greenwood Press, 1968), vol. II, p. 334, or *Die Familie Mendelssohn. 1729–1847. Nach Briefen und Tagebüchern* (Berlin: B. Behr's Verlag, 1888), vol. II, p. 376.
 9. Material for this paragraph from Carol Neuls-Bates, "Steiner, Emma Roberto," *The New Grove Dictionary of Music Online*, ed. Laura Macy, <http://www.grovemusic.com> (accessed August 1, 2002); Christine Ammer, *Unsung: A History of Women in American Music* rev. edn. (Portland: Amadeus, 2001), pp. 196–8. Steiner's death date is clearly established by the obituary in the *New York Times* (February 28, 1929, p. 27); however, according to Ammer, her birth date and other biographical details are inconsistent in the sources (p. 335, n. 11).
 10. "Leginska to Retire from Concert Stage," *New York Times*, Apr. 22, 1926, p. 23.
 11. Beth Abelson Macleod, *Women Performing Music: The Emergence of American Women as Instrumentalists and Conductors* (Jefferson NC: McFarland, 2001), p. 117.
 12. *Antonia: A Portrait of the Woman*, codirected by folk singer Judy Collins [a former student of Brico] and Jill Godmilow, 1973.
 13. Macleod, *Women Performing Music*, p. 132.
 14. Olin Downes, "Music in Review: Brico and Musicians' Symphony," *New York Times*, Feb. 8, 1933, p. 17.
 15. Transcription from interview on "Instrumental Women: Conducting Business," produced by Public Radio International (PRI) by Lauren Rico; first broadcast on Mar. 4, 2002; hour 1 at 3:20. http://music.mpr.org/features/instrumentalwomen/rafiles/iw2002_2.ram. See also <http://www.ktamarin.com>
 16. The first woman performer joined the New York Philharmonic in 1966.
 17. Founded by Leopold Stokowski in 1962, this orchestra included a significant number of women, African-Americans and members of other minority groups (Ammer, *Unsung*, p. 250).
 18. H. T., "Women's Group in Recital," *New York Times*, Nov. 5, 1935, p. 33.
 19. Howard Klein, "4,500 Hear Concert at Riverside Park," *New York Times*, June 25, 1963, p. 23.
 20. Raymond Ericson, "Federique Petrides Conducts Orchestral Concerts in the Park," *New York Times*, July 30, 1975, p. 17.
 21. Jeanice Brooks, "Nadia Boulanger and the Salon of the Princesse de Polignac," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 46/3 (Fall 1993), p. 421. In "Noble et grande servante de la musique: Telling the Story of Nadia Boulanger's Conducting Career," *Journal of Musicology* 14/1 (Winter 1996), pp. 92, 97, Brooks clarifies that the Royal Philharmonic is the standing orchestra of the Royal Philharmonic Society. Boulanger's recording is reissued on CD, EMI Classics Import CDH 61025 (2001), and was previously available on Pearl GEMM CD 9994 (1992), where Monteverdi was paired with the Brahms *Liebeslieder Walzer*, Op. 52, with Boulanger and Dinu Lapatti at the piano.
 22. Brooks, "Noble et grande servante," p. 93.
 23. The origins of the baton as a symbol of power are discussed in chapter 8.

24. Brooks, "Noble et grande servante," p. 108.
25. Lucien Mainssieux, *République de l'Isère*, March 1936, cited in translation from Brooks, "Noble et grande servante," p. 115.
26. Brooks, "Noble et grande servante," p. 114.
27. See <http://www.marinalsop.com> for additional information.
28. See J. Michele Edwards, "Conductor's Profile: Congratulations to JoAnn Falletta!" *IAWM Journal* 4/3 (Fall 1998), pp. 16–7, which includes a discography and biographical material.
29. Although ASOL includes a few Canadian and other international members, none of those orchestras have had a woman as music director or principal conductor.
30. For information on the orchestra's recent financial difficulty, see Tom Buckham, "Success Isn't Enough, Financially," *Buffalo News*, July 4, 2002.
31. See, for example, Geoffrey Norris, chief music critic of London's *Daily Telegraph*, on Alsop as quoted by M. S. Mason, "Conducting Energy," *Christian Science Monitor*, Apr. 19, 2002, and Daniel Cariaga on Falletta in "A Masterful Season Opener by the Long Beach Symphony," *Los Angeles Times*, Oct. 18, 1999, p. F5.
32. Mark Swed has called Ben-Dor "a star on the rise and very much ready for prime time" in "A Big-Time Opener for Little Festival," *Los Angeles Times*, Jan. 12, 1998, p. F3. See <http://www.giseleben-dor.com> for much relevant information.
33. See Sharon McDaniel, "Check Your Preconceived Ideas at the Door," *Palm Beach Post*, Nov. 25, 2001, p. J1.
34. Fiona Maddocks, "May the Forceful Conductor Be with You: The Star Wars Look Does Figaro Few Favours – but Jane Glover Overcomes All Obstacles," *The Observer* (London), Nov. 11, 2001, review pages, p. 11.
35. Niki Sommer, "Jetzt geben Frauen den Takt an," *SonntagsZeitung*, Feb. 8, 1998, p. 61.
36. Norman Lebrecht, "A Maestro Need Not Be a Mister: The Treatment of Female Conductors is Unfair, Counterproductive and Must Stop," *Daily Telegraph* (London), June 29, 2000, p. 26.
37. Interview by Sara Jobin, "Maestra: Five Female Orchestral Conductors in the United States," (BA honors paper, Harvard University, 1992), p. 114.
38. Stefan Siegert, "Der Kampf um den Taktstock," [The battle over the baton], *Die Woche*, May 12, 2000, Kultur, p. 54.
39. *Ibid.*, author's translation.
40. Laurie Neeb, "An Interview with Germany's Only Woman Conductor," *The School Musician* 53/8 (Apr. 1982), pp. 38–9.
41. *Swan Flight*, Finlandia 8573–89876. See Christopher Thomas, *Classical Music Web*, June 2002, http://www.musicweb.uk.net/classrev/2002/Jun02/Swan_Flight.htm (accessed Aug. 1, 2002).
42. Anthony Tommasini, "Music Rarity: One Woman Wielding a Baton," *New York Times*, Apr. 9, 1996, p. C13.
43. "Opera Wars," *The Age*, Sept. 18, 2002 <http://www.theage.com.au/articles/2002/09/16/1032054745393.html> (accessed Sept. 17, 2002); Anne Summers, "'Tis Suits, Not Genius, That Strut the Stage," *Sydney Morning Herald*, Oct. 7, 2002, p. 17; Andrew Hornery and Ben Wyld, "Spike: Drumming up a Baton Charge," *Sydney Morning Herald*, Sept. 24, 2002, p. 24; Kathy Marks, "Australian Opera Turned Upside Down by Director's Sacking," *Independent* (London), Oct. 1, 2002, p. 15; www.keepsimone.com
44. Family names appear first in Japanese and Chinese.
45. Artist profile by Kajimoto Concert Management Co., Ltd. http://www.kajimotomusic.com/artists-e/matsuo_yoko-e.html (accessed July 31, 2002); Angela Jeffs, "Conductor Says Yes to Noh Style 'Don Giovanni,'" *Japan Times*, May 28, 2000
46. Biography from the Asia Society <http://www.asiasource.org/arts/unbreaksprts/Daughter.cfm> (accessed July 31, 2002); "In Xiamen, China, a Fledgling Orchestra Thrives," Xinhua News Agency, July 31, 2002, <http://www.andante.com/magazine/article.cfm?id=17879&highlight=1&timeline=1&highlightterms=woman%7Cconductor%2A&lstKeywords=woman%20conductor> (accessed Aug. 7, 2002).
47. "Instrumental Women," hour 2 at 36:30.
48. Gwendolyn Freed, "Semiconductors: Why Are Women Conductors Overlooked at the Top of the Orchestra World?" *Star Tribune* (Minneapolis–St. Paul), Mar. 18, 2001, pp. F1, 16.
49. *Ibid.*
50. Léonie Rosenstiel, *Nadia Boulanger: A Life in Music* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1982), p. 292.
51. Stephanie von Buchau, "JoAnn Falletta at the Podium of the Women's Philharmonic," *San Francisco Magazine*, Nov. 1987, p. 58.
52. Louis Biancolli, "Boulanger Gives Views on Careers," *New York World Telegram*, Feb. 11, 1939, as quoted in Brooks, "Noble et grande servante," p. 103.

53. Jane Glover quoted by Christian Tyler, “Christian Tyler Meets the Conductor Jane Glover,” *Financial Times* (London), Feb. 9, 1991, p. 16.

54. Freed, “Semiconductors,” p. 16. See also Jonathan Finer, “Study: There’s Still Few Women at Top,” *Star Tribune* (Minneapolis–St. Paul), Aug. 29, 2002, p. D8, for a report about a study on communication companies that suggests changes for women will not occur without specific action taken by top leadership.

55. Frédérique Petrides, “On Women Conductors,” *American Music Lover* 2/3 (July 1936), p. 77. (NB. This journal is often erroneously cited as being from 1935.)

56. Dr. Mary Mattis, who heads the research and advisory division of Catalyst in New York, America’s leading nonprofit organization for the advancement of women in business, tracks women’s progress in leadership for virtually all fields and has remarked about orchestral conducting: “I can’t think of any profession with a more dismal record in the area of women’s advancement.” Quoted by Freed, “Semiconductors,” p. 16.

57. “Instrumental Women,” hour 2 at 55:00.

17 Conducting early music

1. James L. Webster, “On the Absence of Keyboard Continuo in Haydn’s Symphonies,” *Early Music* 18/4 (Nov. 1990), pp. 599–608; Simon McVeigh, *Concert Life in London from Mozart to Haydn* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), p. 212. See chapter 8 for more on early conducting.

2. But see below for a discussion of the experiments of Nikolaus Harnoncourt and Christopher Hogwood.

3. See John Butt, *Playing with History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 96–9. The debate about who should mark the parts and how best to do it is actively pursued in this volume in chapters 1, 2, 4, 5, 16 and 21.

4. Butt, *Playing*, chapter 4, discusses many other explanations as well.

5. See, for example, Colin Lawson, *The Early Clarinet: A Practical Guide*, Cambridge Handbooks to the Historical Performance of Music (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000).

6. See Richard Taruskin, *Text and Act* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997) and Bernard D. Sherman, *Inside Early Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997).

7. John Butt, *Music Education and the Art of Performance in the German Baroque* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), pp. 102–3.

8. Wolfgang Caspar Printz, *Musica Modulatoria Vocalis, oder Manierliche und zierliche Sing-Kunst* (Schweidnitz, 1678), pp. 37–8.

9. Johann Samuel Petri, *Anleitung zur practischen Musik, vor neuangehende Sängere und Instrumentenspieler* (Lauban, 1767), p. 45.

10. Butt, *Music Education*, p. 103. The 1779 booklet by “Biedermann” (a pseudonym for an anonymous writer) lends support to this speculation: “Where an orchestra is arranged so that its members can all see and hear one another, where it is staffed with virtuosos, where the composer has included performance indications in the parts, and where there are sufficient rehearsals, then no further direction is necessary: the piece plays itself like a clock that has been wound up and set running.”

“Biedermann,” *Wahrheiten die Musik betreffend*, translation cited from Adam Carse, *Orchestra in the Eighteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1940), pp. 98–9. Further bibliographic details are unavailable, even after “extensive research,” says Elliott W. Galkin in *A History of Orchestral Conducting in Theory and Practice*, (New York: Pendragon Press, 1988), pp. 447–8.

11. David Charlton, “‘A maître d’orchestre . . . conducts’: new and old evidence on French practice,” *Early Music* 21 (1993), pp. 340–53, quotation on p. 346.

12. Neal Zaslaw, *Mozart’s Symphonies* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1989), p. 508.

13. Letter of 1774; in Werner Neumann and Hans-Joachim Schulze, *Bach-Dokumente* (Leipzig, 1972), vol. III, p. 801 (and cited in chapter 8).

14. There is some debate about whether this was typical. See Joshua Rifkin, “Performance Questions in Bach’s Trauerode,” in *Bach Studies II*, ed. Daniel Melamed (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989) and Laurence Dreyfus, *Bach’s Continuo Group* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1987).

15. In Leipzig, the organ faced away from the ensemble. (See Dreyfus, *Bach’s Continuo Group*, pp. 31–2.) Also, Bach’s transposed organ parts, which would not have been necessary if he had been playing the instrument. See Rifkin, “Performance Questions,” p. 148, n. 111.

16. Dreyfus, *Bach’s Continuo Group*, p. 31.

17. Johann Matthias Gesner (1738) in *Bach-Dokumente*, vol. II, no. 432; tr. from *The New Bach Reader*, ed. Hans T. David and Arthur Mendel, revised and expanded by Christoph Wolff (New York, 1999), entry 328. Dreyfus believes that Bach was leading from a harpsichord (*Bach’s Continuo Group*, p. 28) while Rifkin disagrees firmly (Rifkin,

- “Performance Questions,” p. 147, n. 104).
18. The 1750 obituary of J. S. Bach by Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach and Johann Friedrich Agricola, *Bach-Dokumente*, vol. III, p. 666; trans. in *The New Bach Reader*, entry 306, p. 305.
 19. Dreyfus, *Bach’s Continuo Group*, pp. 28–30.
 20. Mattheson complains about “useless stamping, din and pounding with sticks, keys, and feet” used in conducting, in his 1739 Hamburg treatise *Der Volkommene Kapellmeister*, tr. Ernest C. Harriss (Ann Arbor: UMI, 1981), p. 866; (facs. edn.: Basel, 1954). Mary Sue Morrow also argues that later eighteenth-century reports of foot-tapping and hand-waving by conductors may have reflected “the inadequacy of the system” of directing from the violin, in her *Concert Life in Haydn’s Vienna* (Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon, 1989), pp. 182–3.
 21. Uri Golomb, personal communication; interview conducted for a doctoral thesis, in progress at Cambridge University.
 22. Galkin, *Orchestral Conducting*, p. 475.
 23. Leon Botstein, “Conducting (2),” in the *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, second edn., 29 vols., ed. Stanley Sadie and John Tyrrell (London: Macmillan, 2000), vol. X, p. 270.
 24. Clive Brown, *Classical and Romantic Performing Practice: 1750–1900* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), p. 389.
 25. Carl Spazier, “Hints and Rules for Leaders of Music in Concerts,” *Berlinische Musikalische Zeitung* (1793); tr. Mary Sue Morrow in *Concert Life in Haydn’s Vienna*, p. 182.
 26. Dreyfus, *Bach’s Continuo Group*.
 27. See chapter 19 or Botstein, “Conducting,” p. 270. Bach’s music does not demand the ability to beat three meters at once, as Fritz Reiner could do – and Furtwängler or Toscanini could not.
 28. Robert Philip, *Early Recordings and Musical Style: Changing Tastes in Instrumental Performance* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992).
 29. Leon Botstein discusses how reduced rehearsal time in recent decades has led to more precise conducting technique; see his “On Conducting,” *The Musical Quarterly* 81 (1997), pp. 9–10; “Conducting,” p. 271. It may be worth noting that this is a rare counterexample to William Baumol’s well-known argument that performing arts cannot generally increase productivity, at least as measured by person-hours.
 30. Sherman, *Inside Early Music*, pp. 283–4 and Monika Mertl, *Vom Denken des Herzens: Alice und Nikolaus Harnoncourt, Eine Biographie* (Salzburg, 1999), p. 36.
 31. See F. G. Wegeler and Ferdinand Ries, *Biographische Notizen über Beethoven* (Coblenz, 1838), p. 77. and David Levy, *Beethoven: The Ninth Symphony* (New York: Schirmer Books, 1995), pp. 122–62.
 32. Anton Schindler, *Biographie von Ludwig van Beethoven* (Münster, 1840), pp. 237–9.
 33. George Barth, *The Pianist as Orator* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1992).
 34. Anton Schindler, *Biographie von Ludwig van Beethoven*, (Münster: Aschendorff’schen Buchhandlung, 1871); repr. (Hildesheim: Georg Olms Uerlag, 1970), pp. 242–4. Ignaz von Seyfred independently reported that Beethoven, when rehearsing an orchestra, “was very meticulous with regard to expression, the more delicate shadings, an equable distribution of light and shade, and an effective tempo rubato.” In Oscar G. Sonneck, ed., *Beethoven: Impressions by His Contemporaries* (New York: Dover, 1926), p. 41.
 35. Nicholas Cook, *Beethoven: Symphony No. 9* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), pp. 44–7. See also Levy, *Beethoven: The Ninth Symphony*, pp. 122–62.
 36. “An Interview with H. C. Robbins-Landon and Sir Charles Mackerras”; booklet notes to Mackerras’s recording of *Le Nozze di Figaro*, Telarc 80388 (Cleveland, 1995), p. 31.
 37. Sherman, *Inside Early Music*, p. 327.
 38. A. E. M Grétry, *Mémoires, ou Essais sur la musique* (Paris, 1789; facsimile of 1797 edn., New York, 1971), vol. I, pp. 40–1. Cited from Charlton, “A maitre,” p. 342.
 39. Butt, *Playing*, p. 211. See also Laurence Dreyfus, “Early Music Defended against Its Devotees,” *Musical Quarterly* 69 (1983), pp. 297–322.
 40. Sherman, *Inside Early Music*, p. 284.
 41. Butt, *Playing*, p. 9.
 42. Allan Kozinn, “It’s 30 Now, and Still Faithful to Its Mission,” *The New York Times*, Oct. 19, 2002.
 43. Clive Brown is one of the few to revive dual direction in opera.
 44. Butt, personal communication, August 17, 2002.
 45. Indeed, Daniel Barenboim likes to lead Mozart concertos from the keyboard for reasons opposite to Levin’s: he says it allows for more unified phrasing. Daniel Barenboim, *A Life in Music* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1991), p. 91. The term “noticeable,” by the way, is Butt’s.
 46. Taruskin, “The Crooked Straight and the Rough Places Plain,” *Opus* (Dec. 1986), pp. 42–3; reprinted in *Text and Act*, pp. 316–20.

47. Rifkin, quoted in Sherman, *Inside Early Music*, p. 380.
48. See, Malcolm Bilson, “Interpreting Mozart,” and Eric Van Tassel, “Interpreting Mozart, a Reply,” in *Early Music* 12/4 (1984), p. 519.
49. Golomb, “Modernism, Rhetoric and (De-) Personalisation in the Early Music Movement,” King’s College Seminar paper, August 1998; online at <http://homepages.kdsi.net/~sherman/golomb1.htm>
50. See *ibid.*, and Van Tassel, “Interpreting Mozart.”
51. Rifkin in Sherman, *Inside Early Music*, p. 380. Botstein argues that to communicate meaning through instrumental music to modern audiences – as composers hoped would happen with their audiences – may require different interpretative means than those used by the composer for period audiences. “On Conducting,” p. 8.
52. Leon Botstein, “Sound and Structure in Beethoven’s Orchestral Music,” in Glenn Stanley, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Beethoven* (Cambridge, 2000), p. 182.
53. Eric Van Tassel, “What Jazz Teaches Musicians,” *Early Music America* 63 (Fall 2000), pp. 23–9.
54. Mackerras, “Handel,” in Phelan, *Charles Mackerras: A Musician’s Musician* (London, 1987), p. 306.
55. Clive Brown, “Joachim’s Violin Playing and the Performance of Brahms’s String Music,” in Michael Musgrave and Bernard D. Sherman, *Performing Brahms* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, forthcoming).
56. Lydia Goehr, *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works: An Essay in the Philosophy of Music* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1992); Butt, *Playing*, p. 217.

18 Training conductors

1. There were also experiments in leading with musical sound (by playing). The wide range of early time-keeping is discussed in chapter 8.
2. *The Memoirs of Hector Berlioz*, tr. David Cairns (New York: Knopf, 1969); cited from Harold C. Schonberg, *The Great Conductors* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1967), p. 82.
3. Thomas Baltazar Janoka, *Clavis ad Theasaurum Magna Artis Musicae* (Prague: In Magno Collegio Carolino Typis Georgij Labaun, 1701) s.v. “Tactus.”
4. Louis Spohr, *Grand Violin School*, ed. and tr. U. C. Hill (Boston: Oliver Ditson, 1851), and Hector Berlioz, *L’Art du chef d’orchestre* (Paris, 1855). A modern version of these beat diagrams is given in chapter 1. The graphic representations that appear in all modern

textbooks have been only marginally updated, and the technique seems virtually unchanged.

5. Heinrich Christoph Koch, *Musiklexikon* (Frankfurt am Main: August Hermann dem Jungerin, 1802), s.v. “Kapellmeister.” Koch also confirms that duties varied by genre, revealing that Kapellmeisters beat time during choral music, but play the figured bass during the opera. When there is a concertmaster, Koch says the Kapellmeister concentrates on the singers.
6. Hector Berlioz, *L’Art du chef d’orchestre* (Paris, 1855). The treatise proved so popular it was soon reprinted in the new edition of the *Grand traité d’instrumentation et d’orchestration modernes*, first printed in 1843 and reprinted in several languages including Mory Clark’s English translation as *A Treatise on Modern Instrumentation and Orchestration to which is Appended the Chef d’Orchestre* (London and New York: Novello, Ewer, 1856).
7. In his proposal, “A Music School for Munich,” Wagner mentions conducting only in reference to the piano course which, in addition to the occasional virtuoso, would aim to produce good piano teachers and “good orchestra and choral conductors.” Richard Wagner, *Prose Works*. 8 vols., tr. William Ashton Ellis (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul Ltd., 1892); rept. edn., (New York: Broude Brothers, 1966), vol. IV, p. 198.
8. *Editor’s note*: In some ways, the exclusion of conducting technique was also a product of more general attitudes toward musical education in the nineteenth century. Advanced conservatories specifically excluded instrumental technique from their curricula and concentrated on “artistic” training. In his Munich proposal, Wagner writes: “As with the orchestral instrument, we relegate the learning of sheer technique of the pianoforte to private tuition, and only to the already finished technician would the school stand open for instruction in the higher art of rendering” (Wagner, “School,” p. 198). Despite having the greatest technique of his day, Liszt also refused to teach technique and taught only interpretation. His students are unanimous on this point. See, for example: “Of plain technic [sic] he said little or nothing. Why should he have done so? Anyone requiring instruction in technic did not belong here. Those who came to him had sufficiently mastered technic.” Carl Valentine Lachmund, *Living with Liszt, Diary of Carl Lachmund: An American Pupil of Liszt, 1882–1884*, ed. Alan Walker (Stuvesant NY: Pendragon Press, 1995), p. 14. So while they recognized the importance of technique, Wagner and Liszt, at least, saw it as a preliminary stage and never considered the

paradox of learning to conduct which, unlike the piano, ends rather than begins with technique.

9. Hermann Scherchen, *Lehrbuch des dirigierens: Mit zahlreichen notenbeispielen* (Leipzig: J. J. Weber, 1929); (Mainz: B. Schott's Sohne, 1956); *Handbook of Conducting*, trans. M. D. Calvoceossi (London: Oxford University Press, 1933), repr. 1989.
10. Max Rudolph, *The Grammar of Conducting* (New York: Schirmer, 1949); second edn. (1980); third edn. (New York: Maxwell Macmillan, 1994).
11. Rudolf, first edn., p. ix.
12. *Ibid.*, p. 299.
13. Harold C. Schonberg, *New York Times*, unidentified clipping.
14. Carl Flesch, *The Memoirs of Carl Flesch*, tr. H. Keller, (New York: Macmillan, 1958), cited from Schonberg, p. 23.
15. I have known two remarkable teachers who have the gift of creating meaningful conducting technique. One is Daniel Lewis, retired from USC in California, and the other is Jorma Panula, still teaching in Finland.
16. A more detailed discussion of this topic can be found in Harold Farberman, *The Art of Conducting Technique: A New Perspective* (Los Angeles: Warner Brothers, 1997).
17. Erich Leinsdorf, *The Composer's Advocate: A Radical Orthodoxy for Musicians* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1981), p. 167.

19 The composer-conductor and modern music

1. The history of this change is discussed in chapter 8.
2. The conducting of both Mahler and Strauss is discussed in chapter 9. Table 9.1 gives the tempos Strauss used in the three recordings of his *Don Juan*.
3. Colin Matthews in the "Introduction" to the CD booklet for Benjamin Britten's *Les Illuminations, Sinfonia da Requiem, Seven Sonnets of Michelangelo*, Benjamin Britten Archive Series (London: NMC Recordings, NMC D030, 1995), p. 3.

4. Grant Llewellyn in conversation with the author (summer 2002). More on Bernstein's career as a conductor can be found in chapter 12.
5. Jean Vermeil, *Conversations with Boulez: Thoughts on Conducting* (Paris: Calmann Lévy; Portland: Amadeus, 1989), p. 33.
6. Hans Keller, *1975 (1984 minus 9)* (London: Dobson, 1975); *Music, Closed Societies and Football* (London: Toccata Press, 1988).
7. Vermeil, *conversations*, p. 135.
8. Rebecca Saunders, *G and E on A for Orchestra and 27 Music Boxes*, (Peters Edition, 1996–7).
9. Robert Fink examines the performance materials and discusses both the Stravinsky recordings and the other early performances (Koussevitsky, Monteux, Stokowski and Ansermet) in his "'Rigorous': The Rite of Spring and the Forging of a Modernist Performing Style," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 52/2 (Summer 1999), pp. 299–363.
10. Bramwell Tovey further discusses the commissioning of new works in chapter 15.
11. Letter from Piers Hellawell to Martyn Brabbins, 2002.

21 The future of conducting

1. Hans Keller, *Criticism* (London: Faber and Faber, 1987), pp. 21–7.
2. Arnold Schoenberg, "My Public" (1930), in *Style and Idea*, ed. Leonard Stein (London: Faber and Faber, 1975), p. 97. See also p. 28.
3. Keller, *Criticism*, p. 23.
4. Both complementary and conflicting opinions are given in chapters 1, 2, 4, 5, and 16.
5. Gary Bertini, personal communication, Detroit, fall 1982.
6. Statistics courtesy of Sound Scan Reports 2000, USA.
7. Eduard Hanslick, *Vom Musikalisch-Schönen: ein Betrag zur Revision der Ästhetik der Tonkunst*, eighth edn., (1891); *On the Musically Beautiful: A Contribution towards the Revision of the Aesthetics of Music*, tr. and ed. Geoffrey Payzant (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Co., 1986).
8. See chapter 15 for a further discussion of curating concerts.