

volume reads rather clumsily as a narrative, yet its clear prose, incredible detail, and exhaustive index render it invaluable.

Dorrien himself notes a significant limitation of this work: it deals with intellectual history, philosophy, theology, politics, and social ethics, but not social history. A social history of the era, exploring the contributions of organizations such as the NAACP and other grassroots initiatives, is outside his wheelhouse but sorely needed (xi). Perhaps this explains why, even though Dorrien aims to delineate an intellectual tradition and titles the chapters thematically, he still organizes the material overwhelmingly by individual thinker rather than by time period, theme, or defining event (for example, encounters with Gandhi). What this means for the reader is that the era's history is recounted over and over, with the figures showing up repeatedly in each other's stories. A towering strength of the work is Dorrien's thorough knowledge of the people and events he describes. Yet at times his very ease with the material, combined with the sheer mass of data, can leave the reader feeling lost in a sea of names, dates, and events.

On a possibly related note, the book's title, though compelling, is overstated. As Dorrien admits in the first paragraph, the civil rights movement "failed to break white supremacy" (1). Neither does he attempt to spin it by arguing that the project is ongoing. Indeed, whether substantive social progress has been made against white supremacy is a question that Dorrien avoids, perhaps because he is not doing "social history."

In dialogue with other histories of US social thought, *Breaking White Supremacy* argues persuasively that Martin Luther King Jr. arose from a robust intellectual tradition that was already sophisticated and venerable when it formed him. The book should be in every library and will be hailed by scholars of the civil rights movement and US history generally. *Breaking White Supremacy* will prove handy for instructors and researchers dipping in for overviews of the figures and writings covered. The entire book would be too much to ask of most undergraduates but might be assigned in graduate seminars. Excerpts could be used at any level.

KAREN TEEL

*University of San Diego*

*Stumbling in Holiness: Sin and Sanctity in the Church.* By Brian P. Flanagan. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2018. viii + 185 pages. \$24.95 (paper).

doi: 10.1017/hor.2019.72

This text has arrived at a very appropriate moment given the crisis in the US Catholic Church. How are we to understand the church in this moment, in the face of the betrayal of sexual and financial scandals? Who is the church?

How does the way we identify the church and shape the response of the church in this time of catastrophe (and make no mistake this is a catastrophe)? In the midst of such pain and anger, Flanagan examines the identity of the church and asks and answers important questions about identity, composition, and aim of a faith community that presents itself through both sin and sanctity.

First, this book is neither diatribe nor screed against the church and the current crisis. Rather, it is a theologically sound, liturgically grounded exploration of the nature of the very contradiction that lies at the heart of ecclesial reality: how can the church be both holy and sinful? Flanagan answers by way of the ancient maxim *legem credendi, lex statuat supplicandi* (the law of praying establishes the law of believing). Another way to state this is that the public, communal prayer of the church both expresses who we are and forms us into that living reality, a reality that is both holy and sinful. This choice of approach is important given a cultural milieu that identifies the term "church" with church leadership and emphasizes the institution over and above the living community.

Flanagan establishes his arguments soundly within the liturgy of the church, an activity that both manifests and transforms ecclesial identity. The text is well organized and moves through an analysis of holiness and sin by way of liturgical expression, clearly noting the historical and theological understandings of these concepts and presenting them in light of the principles of Vatican II. He goes on to explore the nature of church as a liturgically established communal ecclesiology that must face the evil (defined as absence of God) in its midst, reconcile with the sinful reality of its actions, and in so doing grow in holiness characterized by eschatological hope. In other words, the church is both sin and sanctity at the same time. This is sin that *must* be recognized and named if mercy and reconciliation are to be possible. The essential communal nature of the church, liturgically expressed, reveals that we are asking that *our* sin be forgiven if *we* are to reconcile, if *we* are to have hope. This does not mean that those who caused such damage should not be held to account; the opposite in fact must occur, both for the sake of their victims and the wider church. Flanagan is presenting a path forward from darkness and an absence of love into a church of spirit and life.

This text, as Flanagan himself notes up front, is a theological exploration at thirty thousand feet. He is not trying to land the plane but rather provide necessary foundational theological arguments into the communal nature of the church so that they may be used in a further pastoral response. The text is well written, organized, and will make an excellent addition to upper-level

undergraduate or graduate questions on ecclesiological and liturgical responses to the betrayal of leadership that the church faces today.

RODICA M. M. STOICOIU  
*Independent Scholar*

*Paul: The Pagans' Apostle.* By Paula Fredriksen. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2017. xii + 319 pages. \$35.00.

doi: 10.1017/hor.2019.73

In this recent study on Paul and the significance of the Gentile mission associated with him, Paula Fredriksen analyzes the decisive role that intra-Jewish debate over the status of Gentiles played in the development of the early Jesus movement during the lifetime of Paul. In the process, her study adds an important entry to the list of contemporary scholarship that seeks to contextualize Paul's remarks on Torah observance as it relates to Gentiles squarely against the prophetic backdrop of the eschatological vision of the ingathering of Gentiles at the close of the age.

A key feature in the study is the proposal that the Gentile adherents to Jesus targeted by Paul in his letters occupied a liminal, and highly unstable identity *vis à vis* their surrounding Jewish and Greco-Roman socio-religious contexts. Previously affiliated with synagogue communities in the diaspora, and selectively observing some Jewish customs, these Gentiles were neither required nor expected by their Jewish hosts to abandon their pagan ancestral religious traditions; rather, it was assumed that they would continue to worship their own familial and civic cults and remain ethnically, as well as religiously, pagan. The epigraphical evidence that Fredriksen marshals in support of this inclusive stance demonstrates not only that Jewish communities were fully integrated in diaspora cities but that they also welcomed Gentiles as worshipping pagans within their places of prayer, study, and communal gathering spaces.

Dismantling the delicate social and religious equilibrium between Jews and non-Jews in the diaspora synagogues were Jewish Jesus adherents who, in the context of their missionary work to Gentiles in diaspora synagogues, demanded of the latter the complete renunciation of their ancestral worship, without, however, insisting on circumcision for males. Requiring Gentile adherents to Jesus to renounce their idols without, however, insisting on full-blown proselyte conversion, effectively made such gentile God-fearers neither pagans nor Jews. Instead, what emerged was a completely new and therefore socially and religiously deviant category of persons whose deviancy posed real risks to both the surrounding Greco-Roman and Jewish communities.