

Heuristic model of depressive disorders as systemic chronic disease

Received 17 April 2015; Accepted 20 April 2015

Key words: Mental disorders, public health, health services research, mood disorders.

Commentary on: Scott B. Patten (2015). Medical models and metaphors for depressive disorders. *Epidemiology and Psychiatric Sciences*, (doi:10.1017/S2045796015000153).

The essay by Professor Patten on the various paradigms for depressive disorders has the merits of inviting an epistemological reflection or simply encouraging thinking out of the box. Eight possible models are proposed for depressive disorders: chemical imbalances, degenerative conditions, toxicological syndromes, injuries, obsolete category, medical mysteries and evolutionary vestiges. Medical disease models have been important in shaping the reflection, especially for an international journal such as *Epidemiology and Psychiatric Sciences*. In the following comments, I would like to enrich and link some of the models with the public health perspective, provide further epidemiological findings often drawn from Canada, and propose the heuristic model of depressive disorders also as a systemic chronic disease.

Public health recognises four determinants of diseases: genetic, environmental (social or physical), health habits and services. In its classical context, epidemiology as a discipline has provided public health with data on prevalence and methods to test aetiology and provides a description of service utilisation.

Epidemiological studies on depression have provided a picture of depression both as a short-lived episodic disorder that is apparently very reactive to life events and situations, and as a chronic disorder that is also reactive to life events and chronic difficulties. For example, as early as the end of the 1980s, the Epidemiological Catchment Area study in the USA found a 40% complete remission of major depression

after 1 year for cases identified in the course of community surveys (Regier *et al.* 1984; Robins & Regier, 1991). With the emergence of the monstrous DMS-5, there has been a continuous debate between ‘lumpers’ and ‘splitters’ in many fields of epidemiology, including psychiatry. Genetic epidemiology has led Kenneth Kendler to the terrible verdict that ‘DSM does not carve nature at its joints’ (Kendler & Gardner, 1998; Kendler, 2013). It underlines the failure to distinguish between clinically severe formal depression, major depression and ‘sub-clinical syndromes’ (Kessler *et al.* 1997). Sir David Goldberg was more blunt as a ‘lumper’ at a public conference about anxiety-depressive disorders when he remarked: ‘It would be presumptuous to call them separate diseases when they share the same genes.’

What may be the nature of the beast? Certainly not the limited theory of the anomaly of neurotransmitters as Patten points out. I believe it is better represented as an anomaly of stress mechanisms. Coincidentally, the general theory of stress was developed in Montreal by Professor Hans Selye (1907–1982). And more recently, also from Montreal, Michael Meaney, using animal models, and Gustavo Turecki, using post-mortem depressed suicides, have illuminated epigenetic pathways in showing the effects of the social environment (poor parental care, childhood trauma) and stress on glucocorticoid receptor genes (Turecki & Meaney, 2014). Recent Canadian Surveys have confirmed the association between childhood trauma, a diversity of mental disorders and suicidal behaviours (Afifi *et al.* 2014). Can this theory be put to the test? Would the reduction of childhood trauma or impoverished parental guidance improve child attachment and break the cycle of reproduction of anxiety and depression, as Robins & Rutter (1990) put it? The longitudinal study of children of depressed mothers in underprivileged areas together with the establishment of a universal day care program in Quebec made it possible to test the theory. Herba *et al.* (2013) found that for mothers with symptoms of high mood disorders, regulated early childcare services reduced the risks of problem

Address for correspondence: A. Lesage, Institut universitaire en santé mentale de Montréal, Canada
(Email: alesage.iusmm@sss.gouv.qc.ca)

internalisation by their children. They suggested that regulated child care services may be used as a public health intervention to buffer the negative effect of maternal depression on the internalisation of problems by children.

Childhood trauma has been associated not only with mental disorders but with other chronic diseases and lower life expectancy (Cicchetti, 2010). The allostatic load model, a more general theory of the hypopituitary-gluccorticoid pathway, was developed by Bruce McEwen (1998, 2003). This 'wear and tear' model stipulates that with the early developmental mechanisms described above (Turecki & Meaney, 2014), and with continuous exposure to psycho-social and normal life stress, a maladaptive overreaction occurs that wears and tears different circulatory, inflammatory, immune and psychological systems and, with other genetic predispositions, leads to premature chronic diseases like cardiovascular disease, diabetes, hypertension and depression. Epidemiological studies of depression have regularly found associations between depression and chronic diseases to an extent that up to 60% of depressed individuals may also have some common chronic diseases (Schmitz *et al.* 2007). These chronic diseases are therefore linked by aetiological pathways and respond to undue psychosocial stress with flare-ups of diseases, some very serious. In the workplace for example, where common mental disorders have become the primary sources of disability (Jacobs *et al.* 2010), the same undue psycho-social stress is associated with increased cardiovascular diseases and burn-out, as shown by the now half-century-old Whitehall studies and their replications in Canada (Marmot *et al.* 1984; Stansfeld *et al.* 1999; Vézina *et al.* 2004; Aboa-Éboulé *et al.* 2011). Again, can it be prevented by environmental intervention? In Quebec City, Bourbonnais *et al.* (2011) showed the long-term positive effects of an intervention on psychosocial work factors among healthcare professionals in a hospital setting. Continuous improvements of work environment practices (e.g., the Quebec 'healthy enterprise standards' (BNQ, 2008)) have been embedded in work and safety standards to improve both somatic and mental health. It remains to be tested if large-scale implementation is feasible, should changes occur in organisational practices that result in better cardiovascular and mental disorder outcomes.

Less has been said by Patten about the health services epidemiology in relation to depression and models of chronic disorders. The vast majority of people with common mental disorders and anxiety depressive disorders are identified and treated by primary care providers, i.e., general practitioners. Primary care has been identified by the World Health Organisation in both developing and industrialised countries as the fulcrum for the therapeutic management of mental

disorders. One Canadian population-based and administrative database study in a public managed care system that covers over 99% of the population showed that 75% of the population had consulted a general practitioner at least once in the preceding year; that one in five were identified or seen for mental disorders in the preceding year; that those identified with a mental disorder accounted for 3–4 times more medical visits than those without; and that two-thirds of their visits were for other common chronic diseases rather than for common mental disorders like anxiety or depression (Ouadahi *et al.* 2009).

In industrialised countries, primary care has been moving from the treatment of infectious diseases to very common chronic diseases like diabetes, hypertension, cardiovascular diseases, chronic pain and asthma. Effective clinical chronic diseases management calls for a re-organisation of healthcare in favour of patient education and self-management, monitoring of symptoms and treatment adherence, decision support for medication management, a patient registry and supervision by care managers (Wagner, 1998; Kates & Mach, 2007). The work of Katon and Seelig (2008) has shown that the joint treatment and management of depression and chronic diseases like diabetes has synergistic effects on both conditions and on general social functioning, confirming the epidemiological studies that have shown a synergistic effect on the social functioning of patients with depression in the presence of common chronic diseases like diabetes.

Professor Patten has stimulated the present comment by inviting us to think outside the box about the aetiology and research agenda in the clinical and public health areas. The heuristic model proposed is that some depressive disorders share common aetiological pathways with other common chronic disorders. Prevention strategies are possible for all these chronic disorders – from regulated childcare to better workplace organisational practices – and better clinical outcomes could be achieved in primary care with the support of specialist care within a chronic disease disorders management model.

Alain Lesage

Institut universitaire en santé mentale de Montréal, Canada

References

- Aboa-Éboulé C, Brisson C, Maunsell E, Bourbonnais R, Vézina M, Milot A, Dagenais GR (2011). Effort-reward imbalance at work and recurrent coronary heart disease events: a 4-year prospective study of post-myocardial infarction patients. *Psychosomatic Medicine* 73, 436–447.
- Afifi TO, MacMillan HL, Boyle M, Taillieu T, Cheung K, Sareen J (2014). Child abuse and mental disorders in

- Canada. *Canadian Medical Association Journal* **186**, E324–E332.
- BNQ** (2008). Prevention, Promotion and Organizational Practices Contributing to Health in the Workplace 9700–800. Available from <https://www.bnq.qc.ca/english.html>.
- Bourbonnais R, Brisson C, Vézina M** (2011). Long-term effects of an intervention on psychosocial work factors among healthcare professionals in a hospital setting. *Occupational and Environmental Medicine* **68**, 479–486. doi: 10.1136/oem.2010.055202. Epub 2010 Nov 23.
- Cicchetti D** (2010). Resilience under conditions of extreme stress: a multilevel perspective. *World Psychiatry* **9**, 145–154.
- Herba CM, Tremblay RE, Boivin M, Liu X, Mongeau C, Séguin JR, Côté SM** (2013). Maternal depressive symptoms and children's emotional problems: can early child care help children of depressed mothers? *JAMA Psychiatry* **70**, 830–838.
- Jacobs P, Dewa C, Lesage AD, Vasiliadis HM, Escobar C, Mulvale G, Yim R** (2010). *The Cost of Mental Health and Substance Abuse Services in Canada*. Institute of Health Economics – Alberta (Canada) & Commission de la santé mentale du Canada – Mental Health Commission of Canada: Edmonton (Alberta).
- Kates N, Mach M** (2007). Chronic disease management for depression in primary care: a summary of the current literature and implications for practice. *Canadian Journal of Psychiatry* **52**, 77–85.
- Katon WJ, Seelig M** (2008). Population-based care of depression: team care approaches to improving outcomes. *Journal of Occupational and Environmental Medicine* **50**, 459–467.
- Kendler KS** (2013). What psychiatric genetics has taught us about the nature of psychiatric illness and what is left to learn. *Molecular Psychiatry*, **18**, 1058–1066. doi: 10.1038/mp.2013.50. Epub 2013 Apr 30.
- Kendler KS, Gardner CO Jr.** (1998). Boundaries of major depression: an evaluation of DSM-IV criteria. *American Journal of Psychiatry* **155**, 172–177.
- Kessler RC, Zhao S, Blazer DG, Swartz M** (1997). Prevalence, correlates, and course of minor depression and major depression in the National Comorbidity Survey. *Journal of Affective Disorders* **45**, 19–30.
- Marmot MG, Shipley MJ, Rose G** (1984). Inequalities in death – specific explanations of a general pattern? *Lancet* **1**, 1003–1006.
- McEwen BS** (1998). Protective and damaging effects of stress mediators. *The New England Journal of Medicine* **338**, 171–179.
- McEwen BS** (2003). Mood disorders and allostatic load. *Biological Psychiatry* **54**, 200–207.
- Ouadahi Y, Lesage AD, Rodrigue J, Fleury M-J** (2009). Les problèmes de santé mentale sont-ils détectés par les omnipraticiens? Regard sur la perspective des omnipraticiens selon les banques de données administratives. [Can mental health problems be diagnosed by general physicians? Perspectives of family physicians according to administrative standards]. *Santé mentale au Québec* **34**, 161–172.
- Regier DA, Myers JK, Kramer M, Robins LN, Blazer DG, Hough RL, Eaton WW, Locke BZ** (1984). The NIMH Epidemiologic Catchment Area program. Historical context, major objectives, and study population characteristics. *Archives of General Psychiatry* **41**, 934–941.
- Robins LN, Rutter M** (ed.) (1990). *Straight and Devious Pathways from Childhood to Adulthood*. Cambridge University Press: Cambridge.
- Robins LN, Regier DA** (1991). *Psychiatric Disorders in America: the Epidemiologic Catchment Area Study*. The Free Press: New York, pp. 449.
- Schmitz N, Wang J, Malla A, Lesage A** (2007). Joint effect of depression and chronic conditions on disability: results from a population-based study. *Psychosomatic Medicine* **69**, 332–338.
- Stansfeld SA, Fuhrer R, Shipley MJ, Marmot MG** (1999). Work characteristics predict psychiatric disorders: prospective results from the Whitehall II Study. *Occupational and Environmental Medicine* **56**, 302–307.
- Turecki G, Meaney MJ** (2014). Effects of the social environment and stress on glucocorticoid receptor gene methylation: a systematic review. *Biological Psychiatry*. doi: 10.1016/j.biopsych.2014.11.022.
- Vézina M, Bourbonnais R, Brisson C, Trudel L** (2004). Workplace prevention and promotion strategies. *Healthcare Papers* **5**, 32–44.
- Wagner EH** (1998). Chronic disease management: What will it take to improve care for chronic illness? *Effective Clinical Practice* **1**, 2–4.