

The book's strong points include its exhaustive approach to the Tocharian B corpus, the extensive appendices and the index of Tocharian words cited. However, given the subject matter, it cannot be described as a fascinating read. Perhaps this is unavoidable with linguistic studies such as this. The author's use of diagrams and charts is helpful, but more could have been incorporated in order to help the reader, especially when new ideas are introduced, such as Stumpff's theory of three stages (p. 19). In addition, especially for any non-specialists who might consult the work, a table of all transcription symbols used, with their IPA equivalents, would have been a useful addition (particularly for characters not commonly encountered, such as š). On a minor point, it also seems odd that place names in the maps were not capitalised.

Finally, the book suffers somewhat from not having been well edited by a native English speaker, so that unfortunate spelling and grammatical errors are scattered through the text: "The designations 'A' and 'B' stuck to these varieties" (p. 15), "1.2 Incomplete Language Description" (p. 24), "Syntactic variation is very difficult to asses" (p. 158), "a layer of classical texts with few or no influence of the late language, (p. 208)" etc. However, although these are irritating, they do not impact the overall value of the book for all who are interested in the complex linguistic history of Central Asia.

MARK DICKENS

School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London

NEUE ENTWICKLUNGEN IN DER WAKHI-SPRACHE VON GOJAL (NORDPAKISTAN). By BEATE REINHOLD. pp. xxx. Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz Verlag, 2006.
doi:10.1017/S1356186308009164

The seminar in Iranian Languages at the University of Hamburg led by the late much-lamented Ronald Emmerick was greatly interested in the modern languages of the family, and one of its students, Beate Reinhold, was encouraged to take up Waxi, for the study of which she undertook several long visits to the Gojal Valley in the Hunza area of North Pakistan in the 1990s.

Great Britain's 'Great Game' with Russia, during the nineteenth century, created the Waxān Corridor in the eastern Pamirs in 1873 to separate British territory from Russian, and the arrangement has remained to this day. Whilst Waxi-speakers (estimated by Georg Morgenstierne in 1938 at perhaps 10–15,000) may form the majority in Waxān, they are all mixed with and surrounded by speakers of other languages (Dardic, Nūristānī, as well as several other Iranian languages of the eastern Pamirs) so that many Waxi-speakers are bi- or tri-lingual. In the Gojal valley to the southeast of Waxān proper (north of Hunza) the principal competing language seems to be Burušaski, a language of unknown connexions. The Gojal valley along the Hunza River lies a bit more than 100 km as the crow flies from the main Waxi settlement along the Āb-i Panja (Oxus) and the Waxān-daryā Rivers but, given the extremely rugged mountainous nature of the terrain, communication is very arduous and difficult.

The first real information about the language came from an article by R B Shaw in JASB, 1876, which gave a grammar and vocabulary (v. LSI, X, 457 for further references), and Sir George Grierson based his very brief account of it on Shaw's materials. Even from Shaw's incomplete and insufficient description, it was immediately clear Waxi was a very interesting modern Iranian language: its very peculiar phonology, its infinitives and past participles containing *n*, the very odd forms of its personal pronouns, the existence of 3 verbal stems (instead of the usual modern Iranian 2), and the preservation of many Iranian and even Indo-European lexical items lost elsewhere.

But further documentation was slow in coming, until Georg Morgenstierne in *Indo-Iranian Frontier Languages* II, 1938, produced the first satisfactory account, both synchronic and diachronic, based on

his notes from 1929. He also furnished the first etymological vocabulary, but only 3 short pages of new text.

Isolated remains D R L Lorimer's two-volume *The Wakhi Language* of 1958. Mentioned in Reinhold's bibliography, it is not clear if she has made any use of it. New impetus was given to Waxi studies in the 1980s by Georg Buddruss's publication of several collections of Waxi proverbs collected in situ, as well as a folklore text, published in 2001, in *Strany i Narody Vostoka*, Vol.30, 1998, 30–45; and 'Wakhi Sprichwörter aus Hunza', *Festschrift Humbach*, 1986, (pp. 27–44).

Russian scholars began to take an interest in the Pamir languages early in the 20th century, and for Waxi that interest began when T. A. Pakhalina, using much more data, wrote a first comprehensive grammatical study in 1966, *Vakhanskij Jazyk*, only to trumped a little later (1976) by Gryunberg and Steblin-Kamensky's massive volume in the University of Leningrad's series 'Languages of the Eastern Hindu-Kush', *Vakhanskij Jazyk*, (GSK), containing several hundred pages of texts of every sort with translations, drawings of implements used in daily life, a 233-page vocabulary, as well as 130 pages of description of Waxi phonology, morphology, lexicon and even notes on syntax. This work has become the standard base for detailed scientific study of the language by Iranianists; it was followed in 1999 Steblin-Kamensky's *Etimologičeskij Slovar' Vakhanskogo Jazyka*.

Anyone contemplating work in Waxi in the 1990s was well-advised to get in touch with these scholars in St Petersburg first, and that is what this author did, spending 3 months in the city just before the untimely death of Gryunberg in 1995. She has thereby greatly increased the reliability of her work and the confidence which other Iranianists will have in it.

I may as well say now that Reinhold's work, with 217 pages of texts and translations is good and very worthwhile, increasing as it does by a large measure the variety and extent of reliable Waxi texts. A particular interest of these texts – 13 quite extensive ones, in dialogue form – is that for the first time it was possible to use women as well as men as informants, and no less than 10 of these 'dialogues' stem from women, who range in type and status from elderly monoglots, uneducated and untravelled females to others who are young educated travelled and multilingual (some with Urdu or even English). (I myself was often told that women spoke a slightly different language from their menfolk, especially amongst themselves, but only on two occasions in many years of language-gathering was it possible to seek information directly from women – both in quite exceptional circumstances.) The extraordinary breadth and diversity of the experience of Reinhold's 13 informants, of which 10 were women, is summarised in tabular form on p. 110.

The method used is that now universally adopted by field workers in language: to make recordings on tape and to work them over later. It is always a good idea to check again with the original speaker, but it is not clear if that was done in this case. Speakers often change their minds upon hearing a replay.

Reinhold's introductory remarks on the Gojal dialect are sensible and informative. The "new developments" of her title refer to changes in the language in Gojal over the years from 1990 (her first visit) to 1999. These seem principally to concern a rapidly developing multilingualism, especially amongst younger speakers who now travel about in Pakistan and have developed close and continued contact with speakers of the other languages, especially Urdu, and often even English. Reingold devotes several chapters to sort of "social-linguistic survey" of what she found, with fashionable discursions on the theory of loans/borrowings which seem to this reader largely otiose. She also has a chapter on native Waxi efforts to develop a written language, and describes well the great cultural changes of the last 30 years. Waxi is not threatened, it seems.

The consonant system of Waxi is, even for an eastern Iranian language, extraordinary complicated, and one needs a very practiced ear to hear all the contrasts. Reingold follows the now universally accepted scheme of GSK, which appears to fit Gojal speech well. The difficulty lies in the vowels, which seem rather unstable, varying from district to district, and even with the same speaker at different times. GSK allows 6 vowels, all short (and denies that length, although undeniably present,

is phonemic). It is disputed whether what Reinhold writes as /e/ should not rather be written (with Buddruss) as /i/ or as GSK, /bl/. But the real problem is Reinhold's *ú*, e.g. in *žú* 'my', *múlk* 'state', (*h*) *úmr* 'age', *vrút* 'brother', etc. It does not seem to have a simple correspondent in other transcriptions, sometimes originating from a short /u/, but sometimes corresponding to GSK /bl/ or to /a/. It may represent a real dialect characteristic of Gojal. Whilst long vowels certainly exist on Gojal speech, I have not found any minimal pairs. The matter needs further study.

Reinhold has provided no Glossary, nor grammatical notes. To make her study complete, she must urgently prepare a Glossary to her 'dialogues', listing all variants and grammatical forms which occur. It would be very pleasant for all students of Waxi if she adopted the alphabetical ordering system advocated by Sir George Grierson and used by Morgenstierne (and by the present writer) whereby entries are ordered by consonant only, taking vowels into account only when the consonantal framework is identical. This facilitates greatly the use of any vocabulary of an Iranian language, and especially Waxi, where some of the vowels are in dispute.

Whilst she is about it, she might consider adding a decent map (that given on p.108 is woefully inadequate), one which shows all place names mentioned in the texts, and in which the spellings correspond.

J. ELFENBEIN
University of Mainz, (Retired)

IN QUEST OF INDIAN FOLKTALES. PANDIT RAM GHARIB CHAUBE AND WILLIAM CROOKE. By SADHANA NAITHANI. pp. 328. Bloomington, Indiana University Press, 2006.
doi:10.1017/S1356186308009486

In this impressive book, Sadhana Naithani, Professor at the Centre of German Studies at Jawaharlal Nehru University in New Delhi, makes a wonderful contribution to the field of Indian folklore studies. First she provides a previously unpublished compendium of folk stories collected in North India at the end of the nineteenth century and also studies the history of Indian folklore research. Second she makes a contribution to colonial history, in particular to the study of orientalism and indigenous involvement in the colonial production of knowledge of the colonised by studying the collaboration between a British administrator and his local informant.

The book is an in depth study of the interaction of a local *pandit* with William Croke (1848–1923), a giant in Indian Folklore Studies and possibly anthropology. During his 25-year career as an officer in the Indian Civil Service, Croke edited *North Indian Notes and Queries* (1891–1896), which stood out from other colonial journals in its focus not on antiquities, but on modern contemporary popular culture. After his early retirement, he became president of the Folklore Society in London (1911–1912) and editor of its journal *Folklore* (1915–1923). He is best remembered for his two magna opera *The Popular Religion and Folklore of Northern India* (1892) and *The Tribes and Castes of the North Western Provinces and Oudh* (1896), both published towards the end of the time he served in India.

Through this volume Sadhana Naithani makes two major achievements. First she has brought to light the handwritten manuscripts collected by William Croke that had been lying forgotten in the archives of the Folklore Society in London for a 100 years. These manuscripts contain translations of and notes to an impressive systematically recorded and thus far unpublished collection of folk stories from every district of the North Western Provinces and Oudh, collected between 1891 and 1896 mainly from village schoolteachers (the original versions in Hindi have not survived).

The bulk of the book (part 2) is devoted to the publication and annotation of these stories, complete with the Aarne-Thomson Tale Type Index numbers and a short glossary of Indian terms.