

Muslim Pilgrimage in the Modern World. Babak Rahimi and Peyman Eshaghi (Chapel Hill, NC: The University of North Carolina Press, 2019). Pp. 296. \$29.95 paper. ISBN: 9781469651460

Sara J. Musaifer, Department of Organizational Leadership, Policy and Development, University of Minnesota, Twin Cities, MN; e-mail: musai001@umn.edu

Muslim Pilgrimage in the Modern World, edited by Rahimi and Eshaghi, interrogates what Aziz al-Azmeh (2009) describes as the “over-Islamization of Islam.” It unsettles the fixation of Islam, the Muslim, the Muslim community, Muslim rituals, and modernity, to foreground instead a conceptualization of pilgrimage as fluid, relational, and context-specific. This edited volume assembles detailed ethnographic accounts of what can loosely be identified as Muslim pilgrimage, to trace how ritual practices undergo or resist transformations, within shifting sociohistorical, political, embodied and technological frameworks, unfolding in locations that are at once local, national, and global, subjected to the intricate authority of ever-evolving institutions of transnational capitalism in the modern world.

Conceptualizing Muslim pilgrimage as ambiguous allows the authors to take four analytical approaches that constitute this edited volume’s rationale and roadmap. First, while all Muslim pilgrimage—including hajj—can arguably be understood as practices of *ziyāra*, Arabic for ‘a visit’, “a temporary outing to a blessed place associated with a pilgrimage site, mostly a tomb or a gravesite” (p. 3), ambiguity makes apparent the variations of Muslim pilgrimage, where Muslim ritual practices can no longer be assumed to be monolithic. Secondly, a multi-layered conceptualization of *ziyāra* invites a multi-layered methodology and transdisciplinary analytical approach to study subjectivities, social structures, state, and capital, grounded in particular times, places, and encounters. Thirdly, this conceptual and methodological shift takes seriously creative agency, emerging in dynamic sociopolitical processes, articulated by pilgrims in relation to performances of race, ethnicity, class, gender, social status, and nation. Finally, conceptualizing *ziyāra* as “assemblages of fluid identities and connectivities” constituting the Muslim community (the *umma*) as body politic (p. 2) makes relevant an analysis of regulatory apparatuses taking shape at the intersection of state, local and transnational governance of ritual life.

Divided into three thematic threads, this volume brings together eleven unique transdisciplinary case studies to examine complex aspects of modern *ziyāra*, expanding the geographical and theoretical focus of Islamic studies scholarship. Part 1, “Rethinking Muslim Pilgrimage,” traces the effects of political contestations, historical and sociological processes, on the reinvention of pilgrims’ religious and communal identities. Chapter 1 makes a compelling argument for understanding Islamic funerary performances and animal sacrifice of hajj as forces of reconstruction, opening up one’s locality to a new cosmology that regenerates a defined *umma* body politic. Also noteworthy is Chapter 3, an empirical study on transnational religious imaginations manifesting in Brazil. Drawing on ethnographic data, it shows how discourses and practices of hajj and other forms of *ziyāra* become dynamic terrains of contestations and negotiations. The study suggests that such dynamic terrains contribute to the “pluralization of the ways of being Muslim in Brazil” (p. 106). This is due to a double process of an increased uniformity of Brazil’s Muslim identity, conforming to larger transnational religious communities of belonging, coupled with an increased “creolization” of Brazil’s Muslim identity because of a rising “consciousness of the cultural background of all religious codifications, leading to the affirmation of one’s cultural specificity as compatible with a globalized Muslim identity” (p. 106).

Part 2, “Embodiment, Memory, and Materiality,” shifts our focus towards an examination of localized material cultural processes, carefully weaved into national and transnational religious landscapes. Here, four case-studies examine particular religiocultural processes, ranging from Sufi pilgrimages to Sehwan Sharif in Pakistan, to renewed forms of Sunni shrine pilgrimages in post-Soviet era Kazakhstan, through Shi’i pilgrimage practices in Syria’s Sayyida Zaynab shrine, and ending with cross-confessional *ziyāra* practices in contemporary Indonesia. Of particular interest is Chapter 5, a nuanced ethnographic study of the corporal, affective, and imaginative dimensions of Sufi pilgrimage in Pakistan. Specifically, the study coins “*ziyāra* as occasion” to invite an analysis of *ziyāra* through a lens of governmentality

(p. 137). In doing so, it allows us to take seriously the tangible and intangible forms by which the state apparatus arranges, conditions, and governs pilgrims' material and aesthetic sacred encounters.


Part 3, "Communication, New Media, and Space," clusters three chapters to trace the relationship between changing technological practices and the reconfiguration of modern experiences of Muslim pilgrimage. Chapter 9 offers us an ethnographic study of particular Shi'i *ziyāra* practices at the Jamkaran Mosque in Iran, and a nuanced analysis of how emotions, embodiment, materiality and media technologies are deeply entangled. The study examines three new forms of *ziyāra* to demonstrate how technology changes the very substance of ritual practices at this particular site of messianic manifestation. Hence, it directs our attention to the ways in which media technologies collapse the boundaries of time, space, sensory, and materiality to reconstruct conceptions of self and community in the modern world. Rounding out the collection is the ethnographic spatial analysis of Chapter 11. Here, the author traces the relationship between Muharram practices of a particular Shi'i community—the Bohra Muslims in India—and the production of ethnoreligious solidarity and diasporic *communitas*. Read as a sacred site of "fluid geography," the chapter highlights the Bohra community's creative hosting practices of annual Muharram sermons at different geographic locations. The study convincingly argues that fluid geography alters the inevitable production of the center/periphery binary of sacred sites. It shows how this fluidity strikes a critical and delicate balance between the sacred practice of producing the Bohra community's "liminal translocal geography" and the mundane practice of religious communal negotiations with territorial authorities (p. 252).

The vast geographical and theoretical scope of this volume, embedded in particular places, textures, and languages, can satisfy eager scholars of the social sciences interested in new approaches to studying the forms, purposes, and effects of Muslim pilgrimage practices. Yet, it is precisely because of this ambitious pursuit that silences become inevitable. I end my review with lingering curiosities that I hope will be useful for readers. In Chapter 2, the focus on descriptive statistics demonstrates how ethnic, class, gender, and "geo-religious" dimensions shape state's sanctioning of hajj practices for China's Muslim communities. Simultaneously, this analytical framework runs the risk of erasing the reality of state-orchestrated crackdown, surveillance, and persecution of China's Uyghur community. Chapter 4 offers a rich analysis of hajj experiences for Muslim converts in the United States; however, there is a puzzling absence of supporting evidence for key claims in the study. For example, the authors offer no evidence to support their claim that for "most Americans, the hajj is not the result of a lifetime of saving funds, or the culmination of a lifetime of waiting, because they can afford to undertake the journey earlier in life" (p. 115). Also, the authors' interchangeable deployment of "U.S. culture," "American exceptionalism," and "capitalism" deserves careful unpacking. Relatedly, their argument's problematic claim that "US culture" is inherently incompatible with "Islamic teaching" deserves further unpacking (p. 115). Finally, the authors make an important observation of how discourses and practices of linguistic identities are entangled in a web of contestations over religious, ethnic, racial, class, and gender identities. Yet, the absence of an explicit engagement with the particular colonial and imperial legacies of the English language and US English varieties in relation to contestations over linguistic and sociopolitical identities is a missed opportunity. Similarly, Chapter 7 misses an opportunity for a potentially key contribution to the volume at the end of a rich analysis of Shi'i pilgrimage practices in Syria, where the author notes that the "duty of visit to Zaynab has turned, for some, into the duty to defend her" (p. 180). As the only chapter examining *ziyāra* practices associated with a female saint, an explicit analysis of how gender organizes microsocial ties and performances of authority emerging in particular sacred sites would have been valuable. Further, in Chapter 6, applying a transnational lens to the analysis of Sunni pilgrimage practices in Southern Kazakhstan could have illuminated how non-state actors, like private philanthropists and the Turkish Religious Foundation in Turkistan (p. 164), reconstruct understandings of self and other in and through Muslim shrine cultures. Finally, Chapter 8 combines secondary data with ethnographic observations to trace the effects of distinct cross-confessional *ziyāra* discourses and practices at Indonesia's Mount Kawi shrine. However, this methodology runs the risk of reproducing teleological assumptions. For example, the study adopts unproblematically Roibin's category of "putihan" among Indonesian Muslim Pilgrims, translated to "white Muslims," referring to "a pious orthodox Islamic subjectivity, which in contemporary times harmonizes with idealizations of citizen subjectivity" (p. 192). The association of race, progress, and ideal subjectivity cannot be taken lightly.

Muslim Pilgrimage in the Modern World admirably fills a void in the literature on Muslim pilgrimage practices. Its authors unique blend of transdisciplinary theoretical and methodological approaches and rich research give the volume its lasting validity.

doi:10.1017/S0020743820000513

Istanbul 1940 and Global Modernity: The World According to Auerbach, Tanpınar, and Edib. E. Khayyat, (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2019). Pp. 296. \$95.00 cloth. ISBN: 9781498585835

C. Ceyhun Arslan , Department of Comparative Literature, Koç University, Istanbul, Turkey; e-mail: cceyhunarslan@ku.edu.tr

E. Khayyat's *Istanbul 1940 and Global Modernity* focuses on three authors, Erich Auerbach (1892–1957), Ahmet Hamdi Tanpınar (1901–1962), and Halide Edib (1884–1964), who all taught at Istanbul University in the 1940s. Khayyat demonstrates that their works provide “three different yet analogous accounts of the one and the same world historical moment drafted at the same time, in the same place” (p. xii). By contextualizing Auerbach, Tanpınar, and Edib within this moment, Khayyat successfully reorients both the fields of modern Turkish literature and comparative literature toward new directions.

The book consists of three parts, each dedicated to one author. At the same time, *Istanbul 1940* provides a coherent account of these authors' shared vision of global modernity, as Khayyat makes constant comparisons among them. Thus, he demonstrates that the cultural and political shifts that Turkey experienced within the first half of the 20th century cannot be studied apart from similar shifts that Europe underwent in the same period. Auerbach, Tanpınar, and Edib became disenchanted with the optimistic vision of progress and modernity that has characterized the 19th and early 20th centuries. This vision culminated in horrendous social and political practices such as the rise of fascism in Europe and modernization movements that suppressed traditional practices in non-Western societies. As a response, these authors chartered the histories of their cultures for ultimately critiquing the globalizing world in which they lived.

It is easy to assume that Auerbach's works are Eurocentric because Auerbach did not know Turkish and his work, *Mimesis*, does not discuss literatures emerging from the Muslim world. However, Khayyat demonstrates that Auerbach often gestured toward the non-Western world in his writings. He then argues that critics can reassess his works within a collective effort in which Tanpınar and Edib participated. This new reading of Auerbach undermines some of the scholarship in the discipline of comparative literature that often endows him with a sense of exceptionalism and studies him as a founding figure whose works laid the ground for the discipline's key concepts such as exile and worldliness. In *Istanbul 1940*, Khayyat establishes that Auerbach's Turkish colleagues, Tanpınar and Edib, also wrote works that engaged with foundational issues of comparative literature. Likewise, Auerbach's exile in Istanbul was not a peculiar phenomenon. His colleagues shared a similar disposition with him toward their society and the world. Both Edib and Tanpınar had an astute understanding and appreciation of Ottoman heritage and they were thus marginalized in their modernizing society that belittled this legacy.

Khayyat's analysis will also encourage the field of modern Turkish literature to move beyond its typical interpretations of the tension between tradition and modernity. Furthermore, *Istanbul 1940* covers issues in which the field has shown little interest such as the representations of South Asia in Turkish texts. The section on Tanpınar demonstrates how Tanpınar reflected on a rich, multilingual, and ambiguous heritage of pre-modern Islamic culture as he witnessed the nationalist climate dismissing the complexity of this heritage to forge a crystal-clear myth of national origins. Khayyat gives a creative and convincing interpretation of Tanpınar's famous novel, *The Time Regulation Institute* (*Saatleri Ayarlama Enstitüsü*; 1954). Khayyat argues that this novel may be read as the second volume of Tanpınar's *The History of*