new (harmonic) vista, Schubert composes a moment's silence before its re-entry, a silence that Johnson and Varcoe exaggerate to magnificent effect. It seems hard for us to imagine that these shifts in key, for at least one pair of nineteenth-century ears, constituted 'modulation mania'.

Suzannah Clark
Harvard University

Discs 20–26

Volumes 20 to 26 of Hyperion's new chronological edition of Schubert's complete songs encompass music written between November 1817 and March 1823. The time covered, then, is less than five-and-a-half years, but spans a large portion of Schubert's short career (as readers learn from instalments of the brief but informative 'Schubert Calendar' that precedes each year's songs in the accompanying book of texts): from just before the publication of Schubert's first song and the beginnings of his public reputation through numerous publications and growing renown, but also through his first convalescence from the syphilitic infection that would eventually prove fatal. Within those years are contained an enormous wealth of songs, and a variety that will demand attention below. Schubert's activity in song had, to be sure, slowed by this time, but despite a creative pace far more moderate than that of, say, 1815, this segment of the collection includes some 125 distinct works. Those works are distributed somewhat unevenly throughout the period, but even discounting several fragments here presented in hypothetical completions, the average still works out to well over 20 songs per year.

Such historical and biographical observations are an almost inevitable result of Hyperion's decision to repackage its Schubert Edition, transforming it from a diverse collection of individual discs organized by singer, theme, poet, or sometimes a somewhat obscure mix of those and other criteria – including, of course, what remained to be recorded in the project (the 'accompanist's memoirs' that form another new part of the accompanying notes [pp. iv–x] give Graham Johnson's account of the process) – into a first-to-last record of a life's work in song. I will consider further aspects of that transformation below, but the one that, for me at least, demanded first consideration is the spectre that must haunt any such presentation of Schubert's songs in recorded form, that of their single illustrious predecessor, the Deutsche Grammophon edition of the songs for male voice, recorded by Dietrich Fischer-Dieskau and Gerald Moore in 1970 and 1971. That comparison is particularly inevitable for me because my preparation for this review marked the first time I have immersed myself so intensely in so many Schubert songs (again, chronologically ordered) since my experience as a graduate student in musicology in the twilight of the LP era. Preparing for a dissertation still somewhat nebulously focused on Schubert's lieder, which, being neither a singer nor a pianist, I knew at best fragmentarily, I undertook what seemed the obvious course of remedial action: learning them from the magisterial collection that, in the words of Fischer-Dieskau himself, sought 'to reveal the great range of riches – aesthetic, historical, and of ideas – which Schubert's music possesses', and to 'bear witness to the universality of Franz Schubert, who is still widely

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409800003463 Published online by Cambridge University Press

regarded as a composer of very restricted outlook'.[1] And so for me, like many others, Fischer-Dieskau's voice became *the* sound of Schubert, a standard of vocal quality and interpretation that both colours any evaluation of other performances of the songs I internalized in this way and shaped my understanding of those songs in ways of which I was only partially aware.

With respect to the first of those results, the virtues of the present collection are readily apparent. At their best – and one of his remarkable accomplishments is rarely to have been heard on record below that level – Fischer-Dieskau's Schubert recordings are remarkable for their insight, conviction and technical mastery, and the Hyperion edition in whatever format will not fully replace them. But the uniform backdrop of its predecessor – and I am not the first to suggest that the 'immaculate performance' that Fischer-Dieskau upheld as an ideal could occasionally veer more towards the standardized than the standard-setting[2] – highlights the value of the variety of singers heard in the Hyperion set, united by Graham Johnson's impeccable performances on the piano, which never once left me longing for the hand of Gerald Moore. As reviews of the original edition have made clear, these performances also set a remarkably high standard, while allowing an image of Schubert that is both vocally and interpretively diverse, in a way that helps liberate listeners of my generation, at least, from that monolithic sonic image. There are precious few vocal disappointments and a gratifying wealth of revelatory experiences. Rather than providing an extensive list, I will leave readers to their own preferences and discoveries, singling out only a few exemplary cases. Some, like the tiny delay that Christine Schäfer inserts before 'Nachtigall' in the final strophe of 'Das Mädchen' (D. 652; disc 21, track 16), are fleeting but riveting moments that unite vocal artistry with a keen sense of crucial points in both song and text. In other instances, entire interpretations stand out: Simon Keenlyside's 'Prometheus' (D. 674; disc 22, track 11), for its vigorous but audibly sardonic energy; Thomas Hampson's 'Freiwilliges Versinken' (D. 700; disc 23, track 12), in which a majestically slow pace and wonderfully controlled lines reveal riches I had never before recognized; and Ann Murray's simply radiant 'Nacht und Träume' (D. 827; disc 26, track 14) are only a few chosen from a long list of personal highlights. And although this compilation disrupts the focus on one or a few voices that characterized the single discs of the original edition, the new arrangement can yield unexpected pleasures, too, as when my attention was diverted from the chronological succession of Schubert's songs by a remarkably diverse sequence of voices (disc 21, tracks 4–6), beginning with Arleen Auger's delicate, lyrical rendition of 'Blanka' (D. 631), followed by Edith Mathis's greater intensity in 'Vom Mitleiden Mariä' (D. 632) and a still heavier voice (more controlled here than in some other examples within these volumes) in Mirjana Lipovšek's rich rendition of 'Hoffnung' (D. 637).

Such experiences serve as reminders of a rich variety of interpretive possibilities that a single hegemonic voice, however exquisite, can obscure. More than that, they are salutary reminders that the experience of the lied is not an exclusively intellectual one in which poet, composer and listener engage in mystic communion. Different voices, alternative gestures, and a relative

[1] Dietrich Fischer-Dieskau, 'Franz Schubert, the Lieder Composer', in notes to *Schubert, Lieder*, vol. 1 (Deutsche Grammophon 2720 022): 7.

[2] Fischer-Dieskau so described the goal of contemporary lied performance in 'German Song', in *The Fischer-Dieskau Book of Lieder*, trans. George Bird and Richard Stokes (New York: Limelight Editions, 1984): 27.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409800003463 Published online by Cambridge University Press

diversity of approaches all serve to recall that the lied is also a vehicle for voices and a musical pleasure, and that all these roles can co-exist – certainly in a single collection, and ideally in a single performance. They do so with remarkable consistency, for instance, in the performances of Matthias Görne, almost all of whose renditions of settings of poems by the brothers Schlegel (from volume 27 of the original Hyperion Schubert Edition) appear within this section of the set.[3] But the attractiveness of Görne's interpretations rests on more than this. More than any other singer in this section, at least, both his vocal quality and his interpretive ease align him clearly with his sometime mentor Fischer-Dieskau; he matches (without denigrating in the slightest his own distinct strengths) a template that I will likely never completely expunge. The ghost of baritones past is not easily exorcised.

The variety of this collection, however, rests in more than its inclusion of songs for women's voices, or of a greater variety of interpretations, significant as each of those accomplishments is, for the Hyperion collection generously understands 'complete songs' to include not only the solo lied narrowly construed, but also exceptional pieces such as Schubert's four canzonas to Italian texts (D. 688; appearing here on disc 23, tracks 1–4 in vivid performances by Arleen Auger), his textless vocal exercises (D. 619; disc 20, track 9, sung by Patricia Rozario and Lorna Anderson), and the cantata for the birthday of the singer Johann Michael Vogl (D. 666; disc 22, track 6, featuring Lynne Dawson, Michael Schade and Gerald Finley) – and especially the part-songs, a dozen of which are scattered among these seven discs. In this portion of the set, these departures from the standard fare of solo voice and piano amount to only about a tenth of the whole, and yet their presence can have an illuminating effect on our understanding of Schubert's activity.

As an example, the opening of volume 20 serves as well as any other segment. The disc begins with two Schiller settings originating in November 1817: 'Der Kampf' (D. 594), an almost comically earnest treatment of the struggle between virtue and temptation, in a sectional treatment gallantly assayed by Neil Davies; and 'Thekla: eine Geisterstimme' (D. 595), the revised version of Schubert's second setting of that text, as the composer published it in 1827, here sung with hypnotic beauty by Arleen Auger.[4] It would be difficult to imagine a greater contrast, either in style or attractiveness to current audiences. 'Der Kampf' is expansive and showy but, despite attractive individual moments, comes off as a not particularly unified exercise in emotional extremes. The strophic setting of 'Thekla' relies on the simple contrast of major and minor and a vocal line that encompasses only an augmented fourth, and yet achieves an intensity that makes listeners eagerly await each successive strophe. The obvious conclusion: a miss and a hit, or, alternatively, where Schubert began and where he arrived.

The continuation of the disc, however, undermines this conclusion immediately. Two accompanied part-songs, one for two tenors and two basses

[3] A minor quibble: unlike that original volume's, the list of tracks on these discs fails to distinguish between Friedrich's and August Wilhelm's contributions (although the text-book does so).

[4] This juxtaposition thus suggests some of the hazards of the chronological enterprise. The fragmentary manuscript of the revised version is undated, and the considerable changes between it and the dated first version may stem from the period of publication rather than original composition. A chronological edition must inevitably tidy up these complexities, creating a fictionally straightforward sequence. On the manuscript situation, see John Reed, *The Schubert Song Companion* (New York: Universe Books, 1985): 401.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409800003463 Published online by Cambridge University Press

('Das Dörfchen', D. 598) and one for mixed men's and women's voices ('Die Geselligkeit – "Lebenslust"', D. 609) serve as reminders of the complex socio-musical situation in which Schubert wrote vocal music. Confronted with a collection consisting exclusively of solo songs, it is easy to imagine Schubert wiping his hands in satisfaction at having elevated the lied into the realm of art in the years preceding this section of the collection, and to dismiss songs such as 'Der Kampf' as products of an off day, or to ascribe them to Schubert's indiscriminate taste. But part-songs audibly introduce a different world, one in which compositional polish is clear, but in which the expressive subtleties of the solo song are usually neither present nor missed. They are, as the title of the second of this pair suggests, first and foremost *sociable* music, whether sung among friends or as part of the typically mixed concert programmes of the period. To consider them as a result inferior to solo song would be to confound distinct generic categories. And yet, that is precisely the sort of confusion that my own incriminating listening notes suggest I was inclined toward with the first songs on this disc, until the two part-songs brought my judgement up short. The different world of the part-song serves as a reminder of the equally distinct, if more subtly present, worlds of solo song, for 'Der Kampf' is no more comparable to 'Thekla' than either of those songs is to 'Das Dörfchen'. Both the musical antecedents of 'Der Kampf' and its purpose (it was likely composed as a display piece for Vogl) mark it as essentially unrelated to the lyrical strophic song.

And 'Der Kampf' and 'Thekla' represent only two of many traditions on which Schubert could draw, just as jovial sociability, intense, soul-baring expression, and vocal and expressive display are only a few of the diverse purposes *for* which he could and did write. The contents of these discs serve as a reminder that, even within the relatively circumscribed realm of solo song, and even with an admittedly artificial focus on what seem clearly to be 'serious' works, the number of conceivable directions and combinations was nearly limitless. Engagement with poetic forms and poets of the past (as in the translations of three Petrarch sonnets, disc 21, tracks 1–3) offered one kind of serious challenge, and contemporary poetry such as that of Novalis, Friedrich Schlegel or Goethe offered a very different one (and these volumes include most of Schubert's settings of those leading Romantic poets and some of the greatest of his Goethe). But contemporary (and highly conventional) devotional poetry, like that of Johann Petrus Silbert, was also recognizably high-minded, albeit with a vastly different tendency. And within any poetic direction, musical possibilities were equally undetermined, so, for instance, Schubert could set Silbert's 'Abendbilder' (D. 650; disc 21, track 14) as an extraordinarily expansive *Gesang* whose scale and degree of vocal display match that of 'Der Kampf' (though its audible continuity makes it far more attractive fare for current programming), while the same poet's 'Himmelsfunken' (D. 651; disc 21, track 15) received a modest strophic setting in which the chorale-like homophonic texture signals seriousness of purpose as effectively as the ambitious scale of 'Abendbilder', but with entirely different effect. To explore the poetic and musical diversity of these and numerous other subgenres would far exceed the bounds of a brief review, but the continued co-existence of so many distinct strands at the midpoint of Schubert's career attests eloquently to the multiple aims of his compositional activity.

Recognizing this, of course, does not *depend* on the presence of part-songs, cantatas or canzonas, but those elements add an obvious and fascinating inconsistency (not of quality but of genre) to this collection, and that unevenness, in turn, facilitates recognition of the diversity of styles and purposes within what

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409800003463 Published online by Cambridge University Press

is too easily imagined as a corpus of lyrical gems or of intense engagement with subtle poetic nuances. To be sure, both of those qualities are present in abundance here, but this collection argues against a generalization that would confound 'the universality of Franz Schubert' with his uniformity. The claim that Schubert elevated the lied to art elevates Schubert to the point that we forget that the high art music tradition to which we grant (some, at least of) his lieder admission was during his lifetime nothing like the recognizable entity it has become to us. Listening to this remarkably messy collection can re-inject a salutary degree of confusion into our perceptions of Schubert's activities and his creations.

Ironically, the chronological format that brings about this untidiness is a result of the very elevation to canonical status that tidied our image of the composer in the first place. The existence of either version of this project testifies to Schubert's status, but the chronological version under review here ostensibly does without the programming efforts of the previous version, and thus shifts the emphasis of the set away from the function of entertainment in the direction of the monumental. Few, one imagines, will listen straight through this entire collection (except, perhaps, musicologists-in-training); it is shaped as a reference source, and as such, unlike its earlier incarnation, offers no implicit or explicit suggestions for the use and interrelation of its contents.

I cannot, however, end with such a sharply drawn contrast between the two versions of the collection. First, for all its monumental character, the chronological edition lacks an important feature that distinguished the original and lent it its own weight: Graham Johnson's extensive and insightful critical notes on every song. Those notes will be published separately in book form, but their absence in this collection will be missed, and those new to this repertoire in particular may find accessing it all the more forbidding as a result. And, finally, the claim of chronological faithfulness as the new collection's ordering principle must be tempered. True, unlike the Fischer-Dieskau and Moore set, which simply worked its way through every suitable song in the old complete edition of Schubert's works in order, without regard to either revised conceptions of chronology or the shape of individual records, this one carefully takes account of the current state of research. But as I have already suggested (see note 4, above), the creation of an exact chronology is, finally, impossible; lost manuscripts, imprecise dates, uncertainty about revisions, and a host of other factors all mean that deciding to order the songs chronologically leaves a great many decisions still to be made. Happily, those decisions have apparently been made here with an ear toward musical considerations. The sequence of three women's voices discussed above (disc 21, tracks 4–6), for instance, begins with two songs from December 1818 but continues with 'Sehnsucht', which, along with several other songs, can only be dated 'c. 1819'. This ordering goes against that of Deutsch's catalogue, but it both creates the arresting succession I have noted and allows 'Die Berge' (D. 634), which could have preceded 'Sehnsucht', to appear together with several other Schlegel settings. Such programming decisions also seem to have influenced the overall shape of at least some of the discs: 22 begins and ends with hymns by Novalis; 23 and 24 close satisfyingly with part-songs; and 25 and 26, although presenting remarkable diversity, each end with a song that seems foreordained to be an effective closer – 'Sie mir gegrüsst!' (D. 741) and 'Abendröte' (D. 690). Those who use this set only to pick and choose favourites or novelties will overlook this touch, but the added measure of care to which it attests means that Johnson and his distinguished cast of singers may be able to add the quiet relief of the future

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409800003463 Published online by Cambridge University Press

musicology students whose labours they will have eased to the accolades they have already earned for this unprecedented project as a whole.

David Gramit
University of Alberta

Discs 27–31

From March 1823 to 1826, from 'Viola', D. 786 to 'Der Wandrer an den Mond', D. 870: this is a hugely rich swathe of song. It begins in the midst of the unhappiest period of Schubert's life, with the composer recovering from the first stage of syphilis at home; at age 26, he had to re-order his life, his priorities, his hopes for the future. Forced to see everything in an altered and darkened light, it is no wonder that he would be drawn to his friend Franz von Schober's allegorical ballad 'Viola' about a flower that hastens forth into love and life too soon, only to freeze to death. It is no wonder that he would gravitate to Schiller's pilgrim songs whose personae lament the rent tissue of life's happiness ('Pilgerweise', D. 789) or end in nihilistic despair ('Der Pilgrim', D. 794). It is no wonder that he sang swansongs about transfiguration in the wake of life's ending ('Auf dem Wasser zu singen', D. 774) and no wonder that he might have seen himself mirrored in Wilhelm Müller's suicidal miller lad in *Die schöne Müllerin*, D. 795. All of these songs were composed under the sign of death; if the words he wrapped in music were not his own, the choice of texts for music is never disinterested and certainly was not ever so for Schubert.

And yet, we see him in late 1823 and thereafter reconciling himself to an inalterable fate in a myriad of ways. His personae sing of the world's dissolution in the fires of creativity and death (his friend Johann Mayrhofer's 'Auflösung', D. 807), of savouring the beauty of the world before the heart and body break (Karl Lappe's 'Im Abendrot', D. 799, with its telling acknowledgements of doubt, lament and apprehension). 'Die junge Nonne', D. 828, bares a heart now at peace in the wake of a 'wild, mighty storm', and Friedrich Schlegel's 'Fülle der Liebe', D. 854, seems the summary in a nutshell of Schubert's own Pilgrim's Progress, with its youthful spirit awakened to suffering, its 'noble flames' and 'fatal wound', and its ultimate realization that his sorrow is a blessing. He now has an even deeper understanding of suffering outsiders doomed to death: for the last time, he returns in 1826 to the tragic figures of Mignon and the Harper from Goethe's *Wilhelm Meisters Lehrjahre* in order to clothe them in unforgettable music, and he finds his way to seven poems from the *Poetic Diary* of Ernst Schulze, a talented young poet suffering both from a frustrated erotic fixation on the Tychsen sisters in Göttingen (a tragic story from start to finish) and, eventually, the tuberculosis that killed him. A soul in torment with little or no hope of surcease peers out at us from these songs, although the immortal 'Im Frühling', D. 882; 'Über Wildemann', D. 884; and 'Lebensmut', D. 883 lie outside my purview, on disc 32.

Personal circumstances were, of course, not the only impetus to song composition; Schubert was always responsive to events in the book trade, and Schulze's well-deserved, if brief, poetic fame and the appearance of a complete edition of his works were surely factors. By the same token, the composer could hardly have failed to take note of the cottage industry in translations of Sir Walter Scott, and his seven songs from that writer's 'The Lady of the Lake' are testaments to his deep involvement in the literary culture of the day. That culture

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409800003463 Published online by Cambridge University Press