

was mandatory for millions of recipients to receive welfare assistance (Rautray 2018). Through the Voter Verification Programme, the Election Commission of India assembles various documents from voters to authenticate their details, including Aadhaar numbers, government-issued identity cards, data that identify recipients of welfare programs, utility bills, and the NPR

- PTI. 2019. "Exclusion of Hindu Bengalis from Assam NRC changing political." *Business Standard*. September 22. 13:40 IST. <https://bit.ly/3ATTgdQ>
- PTI. 2019. "Election Commission's mega Electors Verification Programme to be launched on September 1." *The Economic Times*. August 31. 2019, 06:25 PM IST. <https://bit.ly/3hqBdE8>
- PTI. 2020. "Banks, post offices being used to collect CAA-NRC data: West Bengal CM Mamata Banerjee." *The New Indian Express*. February 12. 07:38 PM. <https://bit.ly/3wnarAU>

Indeed, it may be easier for the government to commence the NRC process by linking and exploiting voter, Aadhaar, bank, post office, and NPR data, thereby compiling a list of "doubtful" citizens. These citizens would likely be given notices to prove their citizenship.

number of voters or that of their immediate relatives (e.g., parents) (PTI 2019). During the process, a voter from each family received a username and password, allowing them to upload all documents related to electoral registration and to tag similar details about their family members. This exercise allowed the government to create "family groups" and to identify "total family members," "total unenrolled members," and "total prospective electors".

The amassing of data under the NPR and combining them with other data collected assumes further significance in the context of the current government's desperation to conduct a nationwide NRC. Indeed, such control over data allows the government to construct an NRC without undertaking a door-to-door exercise if—for example—popular protests against the exercise were to be resumed or state governments opposed to the center were to stall or prohibit it. Indeed, it may be easier for the government to commence the NRC process by linking and exploiting voter, Aadhaar number, bank, post office, and NPR data, thereby compiling a list of "doubtful" citizens. These citizens would likely be given notices to prove their citizenship. ■

- Rautray, Samanwaya. 2018. "Aadhaar verdict: Legal, but limit use to government benefits, says Supreme Court." *The Economic Times*. September 27. 06:53 AM IST. <https://bit.ly/3k6qVuy>
- The Wire. 2020. "Tamil Nadu: Customers Scramble to Withdraw Cash After Bank Lists NPR Letter for KYC." *Banking*. January 23. <https://bit.ly/2UBaMcy>
- Venkataramakrishnan, Rohan. 2019. "Who is linking Citizenship Act to NRC? Here are five times Amit Shah did so." *Scroll.in*. December 2020. 06:00 pm. <https://bit.ly/3hrHGyH>

FEMINIZING CITIZENSHIP: WHY MUSLIM WOMEN PROTEST AGAINST THE CAA

Qudsiya Contractor, *University of Erfurt, Germany*

DOI:10.1017/S104909652100069X

Almost from the moment of its promulgation, the amendments to India's citizenship laws have generated protests across the country. The images of a young Muslim woman student from Jamia Milia Islamia who stopped a policeman from assaulting a male student and the crowds of women gathered at a Delhi neighborhood called Shaheen Bagh are now etched in public memory. The image of resistance to the newly introduced Citizenship Amendment Act (CAA) has become that of a Muslim woman holding the national flag and a portrait of Bhimrao Ramji Ambedkar, the architect of the Indian Constitution. Younger Muslim women have been active in expanding support to the peaceful protests through social media and a door-to-door campaign to create awareness of the need to resist the CAA. Many of these women are first-time participants in a public protest that has spread nationwide, as Muslim men continue to support them from the side lines.

Paradoxically, many of the Muslim women present at Shaheen Bagh came in their role as mothers and sisters, raising concerns over the government's brutally violent response to Muslim students protesting against the CAA at Jamia Milia Islamia. This incident shows that social concerns articulated by women based on familial roles can be expanded to address larger debates around citizenship and belonging. These social concerns can form the basis of a wider solidarity, translating their compassion into an ideological agenda articulated in the public sphere (Werbner 2005). This calls for attention to Muslim women's consciousness that considers the motivations in their everyday lives that might lead them to act collectively in pursuit of goals they may perceive as better achieved collectively than individually. The sense of community that emerges from shared routines binds them together within their religious identity and within their neighborhoods and homes. Physical proximity and shared experiences influence what and how Muslim women think, facilitating bonds

NOTE

1. Legacy Data in the context of India's Assam State refers collectively to the 1951 NRC and all electoral rolls up to midnight on March 24, 1971. This date is when the Pakistani military fired on pro-liberation demonstrators in the neighboring East Bengal province—then a province of that country but which subsequently became the Republic of Bangladesh—sparking an exodus of refugees to India.

REFERENCES

- BBC. 2019. "India National Population Register: Database agreed amid protests." December 24. <https://bbc.in/3AM3tbU>
- BJP. 2019. "CAB will be applicable in the entire country and not just confined to West Bengal: Shri Amit Shah." *YouTube*. April 23. <https://bit.ly/2SZogbd>
- Dowerah, Simantik. 2019. "Understanding the chronology: A few fundamental truths about the CAA, NRC, NPR and all the threads that bind the three together." *Firstpost*. December 28, 10:50:00 IST. <https://bit.ly/3xwBKdi>
- Dutta, Prabhaskar K. 2019. "CAA, NPR and NRC: Confusion and connection explained." *India Today*. December 26, 12:10 IST. <https://bit.ly/3xFJutu>
- ECL. 2019. "Know how to get registered in Electors Verification Programme (EVP)." *YouTube*. September 2. <https://bit.ly/3hrleNp>
- Home Ministry. 2019. "Home Ministry File Notings." *The Wire*. <https://bit.ly/3hp9Muz>
- Jain, Bharti. 2020. "Have Aadhaar, passport? You'll have to share details for NPR." *Times of India*. January 16. 12:13 IST. <https://bit.ly/3hUpzk7>
- Jha, Prashant. 2014. "BJP offer of 'natural home' for Hindu refugees triggers debate." *Hindustan Times*. April 09. 12:57 AM IST. <https://bit.ly/3hxCNN7>
- Mohanty, Prasanna. 2019. "CAA & NRC III: Who are 'doubtful' citizens NPR seeks to identify?" *Business Today*. December, 2019. 11:23 PM IST. <https://bit.ly/3yRQHxz>

and networks for collective action. Songs, poetry, and stories as communal rituals constitute Muslim women's cultural world and enable them to reflect together, creating a consciousness relative to the societal conditions and political upheaval of their times. The protesters transformed Shaheen Bagh in political ways: a community kitchen to feed protesters, an arena for political discourse, a space for artistic expression, and a public reading room and library. The protest at Shaheen Bagh, although emerging from within a localized context of a Muslim neighborhood, reached several sites across the country that joined in support of the protesters, creating trans-local networks of support and solidarity. It inspired many similar networks across the country, bringing Muslim localities with a history of marginalization into a national space (Abu-Lughod 2012).

Women's active citizenship starts from the preestablished cultural domains of female power and rightful ownership or responsibility. These culturally defined domains, or the attacks on them, create the conditions for women's civic activism. This is the face of female resistance, which evolves progressively to challenge authoritarian structures of power, typically controlled

a private–public binary (Benhabib 1992). Their apparent prominent roles in the movement caught the government and allied media off-guard, making it slightly more difficult for them to demonize the protests than if they had been led by men.

The nature of these protests reminds us of the centrality of sentimental passions about citizenship and the legitimate authority of political community (Werbner 2005). The feminization of citizenship has the potential to overcome the exclusionary tendencies ingrained in the theory and practice of citizenship in India, which not only are inherently gendered but also reflect the exclusion of Muslim women's experiences and perspectives as they interact with other axes of social division including class, sect, caste, region, language, ethnicity, sexuality, age, and disability. Furthermore, feminization of citizenship supports the inclusion of interests and issues that a Habermasian concept of the "public" labels "private" and treats as forbidden (Fraser 1990). However, the difference then is reinstated as a higher-order value, which encompasses equality through a relational and dialogical ethic of care, compassion, and responsibility (Yuval-Davis and Werbner 2005).

This calls for attention to Muslim women's consciousness that considers the motivations in their everyday lives that might lead them to act collectively in pursuit of goals they may perceive as better achieved collectively than individually.

by (in this case, Hindu) men (Werbner 2005). The Muslim women who spearheaded the protests against the CAA at Shaheen Bagh entered the public realm because they wanted something more of their own—beyond their private selves—but something they had in common with others: belonging to a nation. Being in the public realm means being seen and heard by others, and it is the presence of others who see and hear what we see and hear that assures us of the reality of the world and ourselves (Arendt 1958, 199). On one level, Muslim women's emergence as the backbone of the protests points to a tactical move: their presence in large numbers made it difficult for the government to crack down as brutally on the protests as it surely would have if men were in its vanguard. On a deeper level, however, Muslim women's presence, and often their leadership, offered a fundamental challenge to the assumptions of leadership vis-à-vis both the Indian government (i.e., lurching toward a Hindu state) and Muslim men. Participation in the protests provided Muslim women the opportunity to exercise their autonomy vis-à-vis the patriarchal norms imposed by the government and the family.

Unlike nationalism, which is based on the past myths and imaginations of a common origin or culture (Anderson 2006), citizenship looks to the future. As a political vision, discourses of citizenship constitute horizons of possibility (Yuval-Davis and Werbner 2005). This also is probably why the protesters viewed an assault on Muslim students of Jamia Milia Islamia as an assault on the aspirations of the Muslim community. Higher education became the symbolic domain for struggles over citizenship and the authenticity of the nation, thereby blurring the distinction between the two (Bénéï 2007). Clearly, the role that Muslim women play in the protests questions the distinction of

Acknowledgments

I thank the *PS* reviewers for critical feedback and Indrajit Roy for his close reading and editorial input. Any errors remain my own. ■

REFERENCES

- Abu-Lughod, Lila. 2012. "Living the 'Revolution' in an Egyptian Village: Moral Action in a National Space." *American Ethnologist* 39 (1): 21–25.
- Anderson, Benedict. 2006. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. Brooklyn, NY: Verso Books.
- Arendt, Hannah. 1958. *The Human Condition*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Bénéï, Véronique. 2007. *Manufacturing Citizenship: Education and Nationalism in Europe, South Asia and China*. Oxfordshire, UK: Routledge.
- Benhabib, Seyla. 1992. *Situating the Self: Gender, Community, and Postmodernism in Contemporary Ethics*. Cambridge, MA: Polity Press.
- Fraser, Nancy. 1990. "Rethinking the Public Sphere: A Contribution to the Critique of Actually Existing Democracy." *Social Text* 25/26:56–80.
- Werbner, Pnina. 2005. "Political Motherhood and the Feminization of Citizenship: Women's Activism and the Transformation of the Public Sphere." In *Women, Citizenship and Difference*, ed. Nira Yuval-Davis and Pnina Werbner, 221–45. New Delhi: Zubaan.
- Yuval-Davis, Nira, and Pnina Werbner. 2005. *Women, Citizenship and Difference*. New Delhi: Zubaan.

HUMANIZING CITIZENSHIP: CONSTITUTIONAL PRINCIPLES AND THE PROTESTS AGAINST THE CAA

Suryakant Waghmore, *Indian Institute of Technology, Bombay*

DOI:10.1017/S1049096521000706

In December 2019, Ramchandra Guha, a renowned liberal historian in India, was briefly detained in Bangalore for protesting against the Citizenship Amendment Act (CAA). When he was