

as: How do aficionados and performers mediate their involvement and artistry between “old” and “modern” sonorities and practice?

Chapter 4 analyses the compositional technique of melodic criss-crossing in the musical structure of *ma'lūf* songs in the traditional repertoires of the *zāwīya*, especially on the *Mawlid* festivities. The author also presents different aspects of this performance in the context of interpretation, and illustrates this with some musical examples that interconnect the *ma'lūf* with the *maqām rāst* songs. Finally, Ciantar closes the chapter by making a rating about the identity of the musical structure of *ma'lūf*, as old legacy (*turāth al-qadīm*), in the realm of Libyan social and cultural life.

Chapter 5 continues with the author's evaluation of the *ma'lūf* within the framework of the aesthetic value of Arab music. In this context he explains the capacity of music to move the emotions, with an emphasis on the aesthetic potential of the *nawba* in the ceremonial Sufi *ma'lūf* in the *zāwīyat*, known as *al-samā'*. The author draws on theory from Greek philosophy and the Theory of Affects, the Arabic philosophers and music theorists such as al-Kindī, Ikhwān al-Safā', Ibn Sīna, and the Andalusī Ibn Bāyḡa and Ibn al-Jaḡīb, among others to explore the power of Arabic music on the emotions. He explains the relationship between the four strings of the lute, mood, temperament and musical modes. The chapter includes an interesting paragraph about the relationship in the *nawba* between the *ṭarab* (emotions) and sentimentality, two of the identifying elements that give character to this performer.

The book ends with an epilogue in which Philip Ciantar points out, among other things, that the *ma'lūf* in contemporary Libyan society exist between the tensions that have arisen inside of the *zawīya* brotherhoods and the Gadafi political administration. The *ma'lūf* in practice, in their opinion “is very much determined by the way the Libyans think and talk about it, with all this intrinsically moulded by factors that from the outside may appear as irrelevant to the tradition, though in real terms they are not so”. In the context of these findings, he finally adds that “the Libyan *ma'lūf*, both in *zāwīya* and outside, will continue evolving within a kaleidoscope of meanings and their re-evaluation, with all this being reshaped by new political scenarios at local, regional and global levels”.

The work is complemented by an extensive glossary of musical terms, an index, a detailed bibliography, as well as a collection of photographs of *ma'lūf* teachers, groups of musicians and traditional instruments.

Manuela Cortés García

Department of History and Science of Music, University of Granada

SOUTH ASIA

N.V.P. UNITHIRI, H.N. BHAT and S.A.S. SARMA:

The Bhaktimandākinī. An Elaborate Fourteenth-Century Commentary by Pūrṇasarasvatī on the Viṣṇupādādīkeśavastotra attributed to Śaṅkarācārya. (École française d'Extrême-Orient, Collection Indologie 118.) li, 186 pp. Pondicherry: Institut français de Pondichéry, 2011. ISBN 978 81 8470 188 3.

doi:10.1017/S0041977X13000669

This book contains two parts. The first consists of a detailed introduction to the *Bhaktimandākinī* of Pūrṇasarasvatī, who lived in Kerala and dates to the late fourteenth century to early fifteenth century. The second contains the text of the *Viṣṇupādādikeśavastotra*, attributed to Śaṅkarācārya but certainly dating to several centuries later, and a critical edition of the *Bhaktimandākinī*, which is a commentary on the *Viṣṇupādādikeśavastotra*. The authors begin their substantial introduction by reviewing the evidence regarding the authorship of the *Viṣṇupādādikeśavastotra*, and conclude the author cannot be Śaṅkara because the *stotra* has too many references to post-Śaṅkara texts, including the *Bhāgavata-Purāṇa*. In any event, the commentator, Pūrṇasarasvatī, probably lived several centuries after the *stotra* was composed. He was not an inconsiderable name in the history of Sanskrit commentarial literature. He wrote commentaries on Sanskrit poetry and drama, including on Kālidāsa's *Meghadūta* called *Vidyullatā*, a *ṭīkā* on Kālidāsa's *Abhijñānaśakuntalam*, on Bhavabhūti's *Mālatīmādhava* called *Rasamañjarī*, and on the *Anargharāghava* of Murāri called *Anargharāghavapañcikā* (if one assumes the identity of Pūrṇasarasvatī with Viṣṇubhaṭṭa, as is argued here). In addition, he composed several independent *kāvya* works.

The text of the *Viṣṇupādādikeśavastotra* is a meditation on the form of Viṣṇu to be used by devotees in their practice of yoga. Pūrṇasarasvatī's commentary begins with a standard Upaniṣadic injunction to sit at the feet of a teacher, contemplate the teaching, and meditate on it (*śravaṇa*, *manana*, *nididhyāsana*). He continues by saying that meditation on the form of a deity (*svarūpagrahaṇam*) is easier than meditation on the abstract reality, even if the former leads to the latter.

Pūrṇasarasvatī provides word meanings, defends the author's occasional questionable Sanskrit usages, explains allusions in the text, discusses the poetic flourishes (*alaṃkāra*), and is consistently sympathetic to the poet. He cites more than sixty texts in his commentary, including many Purāṇas, the *Manusmṛti*, the *R̥gveda*, the *Mahābhārata*, the *Nyāyasūtra*, the *Yogasūtra*, and many Upaniṣads and other Vedānta texts. Thus, Pūrṇasarasvatī was exceptionally learned, an erudition which is on full display in this text. The edition is based on five published texts of the *Viṣṇupādādikeśavastotra*, texts which are in almost complete agreement. They have located four texts of the *Bhaktimandākinī* in libraries in Kerala, and have noted several other manuscripts, recorded in manuscript lists, that they were unable to trace. With all of this, they have managed to improve greatly upon the 1911 Vani Vilas Press edition, which had been the standard for a century.

The text of the *Viṣṇupādādikeśavastotra* consists of 52 verses in the *sragdharā* meter, each verse containing a description of an aspect of Viṣṇu that is intended for a meditative visualization. This has many precedents in the Purāṇas, but what is depicted here is concise and highly organized. For example, there are specific verses on Viṣṇu's weapons, including his conch (*pañcajanya*), discus (*sudarśana*), bow (*śārṅga*), sword (*nandaka*), and club (*kaumodakī*); his wives Lakṣmī and Bhū; the dust on his feet (*pumsava*); thirty-seven parts of his body, ranging from the auspicious marks on the soles of his feet to his curly hair (*kuntalālī*), the crown of his head (*kirīta*), and his entire body (*dehāmbhodhi*); his ten incarnations (*avatāra*), the absolute reality (*brahman*); and finally the devotee or *bhakta* himself. For each of these, Pūrṇasarasvatī supplies full textual explication, precedents in previous texts, and much more, to bring out the fullness of the images.

The editors have translated the entire text of the *Viṣṇupādādikeśavastotra* at the end of their introduction, and provided many of Pūrṇasarasvatī's exegetical comments in footnotes. This is a difficult text, so the translation, which reads very well, is a noteworthy accomplishment. Every verse contains many attractive images, and was probably used for several centuries as a meditation text among certain

circles of South Indian Vaiṣṇavas. The second, much longer, section is a precisely written critical edition of the two texts (170 pp.). The editors, all accomplished Sanskritists with long experience editing difficult texts, have worked hard to meet the strictest standards of contemporary critical editing now observed at Oxford, Pondicherry, and elsewhere. This volume of exquisite devotional poetry is a valuable addition to the literature on Vaiṣṇava meditational iconography, a genre that is little-known outside of explicitly sectarian circles. It also makes accessible to the modern reader another work by the important pre-modern Kerala paṇḍit Pūrṇasarasvatī.

Frederick M. Smith
University of Iowa

GEORGE CARDONA and MADHAV M. DESHPANDE (eds):

Indian Grammars: Philology and History.

(Papers of the 12th World Sanskrit Conference, Vol. 4.) xiii, 268 pp.

Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass Publishers, 2012. Rs. 750. ISBN 978 81 208 3555 9.

doi:10.1017/S0041977X13000670

Many might have heard of the grammarian Pāṇini. His name is legendary in Sanskrit scholarship and many Western linguists too have celebrated his intellectual achievements over the last two centuries or so. Fewer are probably familiar with the indigenous field of which Pāṇini is considered to be the champion, namely *vyākaraṇa* (usually translated as “grammar”). Briefly put, this is a discipline that, given a set of semantic considerations and various lists of “building blocks” (verbal roots, pronominal suffixes, etc.), prescribes how to form correct Sanskrit words through the application of derivative rules.

Indian Grammars: Philology and History collects the proceedings of the *vyākaraṇa* section of the 12th World Sanskrit Conference (Helsinki, 13–18 July 2003). It contains thirteen articles, each of which offers a well-considered and well-presented contribution to the field. The editors group them into four sections:

- (1) Metalanguage. Maria Piera Candotti and Tiziana Pontillo (pp. 61–82) deal with the morphological bearing of some speech-sounds used as metalinguistic markers. Thus, they offer a further contribution to the interpretation of Pāṇini’s rule 1.1.56, which was the object of their scrutiny in earlier publications. Peter M. Scharf (pp. 181–214) proposes some fresh considerations about a long-standing issue concerning the technical use of the ablative and genitive cases in both *vyākaraṇa* and *nirukta* (this is one of the “sister” disciplines of *vyākaraṇa*, usually translated as “semantic analysis”). Ram Karan Sharma (pp. 215–23) offers a description, accompanied by numerous examples, of the use of the terms *asiddha* and *asiddhavat* in *vyākaraṇa* as tools preventing the application of certain rules in specific derivational contexts. Forming a sub-category within the metalinguistic area, Sharon Ben-Dor (pp. 19–60) and Shankarji Jha (pp. 155–68) both engage with the relations occurring between specific metarules, called *paribhāṣās*, and their counterparts in everyday life. The former also deals at length with the applicability of two of these metarules.