

Suicidality, ethnicity and immigration in the USA

G. Borges^{1*}, R. Orozco¹, C. Rafful¹, E. Miller² and J. Breslau³

¹ National Institute of Psychiatry, Mexico City, Mexico

² University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, PA, USA

³ RAND Corporation, Pittsburgh, PA, USA

Background. Suicide is the 11th leading cause of death in the USA. Suicide rates vary across ethnic groups. Whether suicide behavior differs by ethnic groups in the USA in the same way as observed for suicide death is a matter of current discussion. The aim of this report was to compare the lifetime prevalence of suicide ideation and attempt among four main ethnic groups (Asians, Blacks, Hispanics, and Whites) in the USA.

Method. Suicide ideation and attempts were assessed using the World Mental Health version of the Composite International Diagnostic Interview (WMH-CIDI). Discrete time survival analysis was used to examine risk for lifetime suicidality by ethnicity and immigration among 15 180 participants in the Collaborative Psychiatric Epidemiological Surveys (CPES), a group of cross-sectional surveys.

Results. Suicide ideation was most common among Non-Hispanic Whites (16.10%), least common among Asians (9.02%) and intermediate among Hispanics (11.35%) and Non-Hispanic Blacks (11.82%). Suicide attempts were equally common among Non-Hispanic Whites (4.69%), Hispanics (5.11%) and Non-Hispanic Blacks (4.15%) and less common among Asians (2.55%). These differences in the crude prevalence rates of suicide ideation decreased but persisted after control for psychiatric disorders, but disappeared for suicide attempt. Within ethnic groups, risk for suicidality was low among immigrants prior to migration compared to the US born, but equalized over time after migration.

Conclusions. Ethnic differences in suicidal behaviors are explained partly by differences in psychiatric disorders and low risk prior to arrival in the USA. These differences are likely to decrease as the US-born proportion of Hispanics and Asians increases.

Received 31 May 2011; Revised 7 September 2011; Accepted 13 September 2011; First published online 26 October 2011

Key words: Attempt, epidemiology, ethnicity, race, suicide.

Introduction

According to the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC, 2011), there were 34 598 suicide deaths in the USA in 2007, 11.5 per 100 000 people, making suicide the 11th leading cause of death in the USA. This rate varies dramatically across ethnic groups: the suicide rate per 100 000 people was 14.4 among Non-Hispanic Whites, 6.2 among Asians, 5.1 among Non-Hispanic Blacks and 5.4 among Hispanics. Differences related to nativity (US-born *versus* foreign-born) (Choi *et al.* 2007; Duldulao *et al.* 2009; Singh & Hiatt, 2006), adverse social status (Crosby *et al.* 2011) and genetic endowment (Galfalvy *et al.* 2009) have been examined as potential explanations for these

differences, without conclusive results (Nock *et al.* 2008; Perez-Rodriguez *et al.* 2008).

Studies that focus on suicidal ideation and suicide attempts can offer some insight into the demographic patterns of suicide. Suicide ideation increases the likelihood of suicide attempt and suicide death (Goldstein *et al.* 1991; Kessler *et al.* 1999; Borges *et al.* 2008; Nock *et al.* 2008). Suicide attempts are strongly associated with risk for suicide death (Suominen *et al.* 2004) and repeated suicide attempts (Borges *et al.* 2008). Whether suicidality differs by these ethnic groups in the USA in the same way as observed for suicide death is a matter of current discussion (Perez-Rodriguez *et al.* 2008), with inconsistent results across studies (Roberts *et al.* 2007; CDC, 2009). Reports from national surveys of adults in the USA have reported lower prevalence of attempts only among Blacks, relative to Non-Hispanic Whites (Kessler *et al.* 1999; Borges *et al.* 2006, 2008), but no studies have focused systematically on possible differences across the main ethnic groups in the USA using comparable assessments of suicidality and mental disorders (Moscicki

* Address for correspondence: Dr G. Borges, Departamento de Modelos de Intervención, Dirección de Investigaciones Epidemiológicas y Psicosociales, Instituto Nacional de Psiquiatría, Calzada México Xochimilco No. 101, Col. San Lorenzo Huipulco, México D.F., C.P. 14370, Mexico.
(Email: guibor@imp.edu.mx)

et al. 1988; Oquendo *et al.* 2004; Perez-Rodriguez *et al.* 2008).

Whereas most studies focus on a range of psychological, cultural and adverse risk factors among minorities groups to explain alleged differences in suicidality (Perez-Rodriguez *et al.* 2008), here we examined three other potential explanations for ethnic variation in suicide ideation and attempt. First, psychiatric disorders, which are known risk factors for suicidal behavior (Kessler *et al.* 1999), are more prevalent among Non-Hispanic Whites in the USA relative to other ethnic groups (Breslau *et al.* 2006). The potential that pre-existing psychiatric disorders and types of disorders (Nock *et al.* 2009; Borges *et al.* 2010) might account for the reported ethnic differences in suicidal behaviors has not been ruled out. Our hypothesis is that the differential distribution of psychiatric disorders among the main ethnic groups in the USA may partially explain possible differences in suicidality among these groups.

Second, large portions of Hispanics and Asians in the USA are immigrants (about 66% and 75% respectively) (Grieco, 2010; Pew Hispanic Center, 2010). High rates for suicide death are visible for all US-born compared to foreign-born of the largest ethnic groups in the USA (Singh & Hiatt, 2006). Part of the alleged differences in suicidality among ethnic groups might be caused by the large influx of new immigrants into the USA. There is evidence that, within these groups, immigrants have a much lower risk for psychiatric disorders and possibly suicide attempts (Breslau & Chang, 2006; Fortuna *et al.* 2007; Borges *et al.* 2009; Breslau *et al.* 2009). Our hypothesis here is that the US-born population will show higher rates of suicidality compared to immigrants, and that among those US-born (second-generation), there are no ethnic differences in suicidality.

Third, ethnic comparisons of suicidal behavior in the USA may gain from a deeper analysis of possible differences between immigrants and US-born in suicidality, within each ethnic category, as has been suggested (Baca-Garcia *et al.* 2011). Our hypothesis here is that, within ethnic groups, the US-born would have higher prevalence of suicide ideation and attempts than foreign-born immigrants of the same ethnicity and that immigrants who arrived as children (at age ≤ 12 years) would have higher risk than immigrants who arrived as adolescents or adults (at age ≥ 13 years). Evidence for these hypotheses came from prior studies of immigration and mental disorders in the USA (Breslau *et al.* 2007, 2009).

The aim of this report was to compare the lifetime prevalence of suicide ideation and attempt among four main ethnic groups in the USA using data from a multi-ethnic national sample that assessed suicidality

with the same survey instrument in five languages (English, Spanish, Chinese, Tagalog and Vietnamese). Analysis such as the one proposed here can have an impact on public health policies that delve into the health disparities in the treatment and prevention of suicide and suicide behaviors associated with race/ethnicity and migration patterns (Goldsmith *et al.* 2002).

Method

Data come from the National Institute of Mental Health (NIMH)-funded Collaborative Psychiatric Epidemiological Surveys (CPES), which includes the National Comorbidity Survey Replication (NCS-R), the National Latino and Asian-American Survey (NLAAS) and the National Study of American Life (NSAL) (Heeringa *et al.* 2004). The CPES were conducted during the same time period, using the same diagnostic instrument, and field staff were certified by the Institute for Social Research at the University of Michigan (Kessler *et al.* 2004; Alegria *et al.* 2007; Takeuchi *et al.* 2007; Williams *et al.* 2007). The instrument used in these surveys, the World Mental Health version of the Composite International Diagnostic Interview (WMH-CIDI) was developed with NIMH support to assess DSM-IV mood, anxiety, substance use and impulse control disorders in addition to suicidality and a broad range of correlates and suspected risk factors. The CIDI is a fully structured computer-assisted diagnostic interview. After complete description of the study to the subjects, informed consent was obtained.

A total of 15 180 respondents were in one of the four ethnic groups in this study. Further analyses on 10 274 US-born subjects and 4853 immigrants, with complete information about nativity/migration status, were available for: 4179 Non-Hispanic Whites from the NCS-R; 3258 Hispanics from the NLAAS (2553), the NCS-R (527) and the NSAL (178); 2176 Asians from the NLAAS (2093) and the NCS-R (83); and 5514 Non-Hispanic Blacks from the NSAL (4799) and the NCS-R (715).

Measures of suicide-related outcomes

The WMH-CIDI contains a module that assesses history of suicide ideation ('Have you ever seriously thought about committing suicide?') and suicide attempts ('Have you ever attempted suicide?'). These questions were printed in a booklet and referred to in the interview by letter, given that evidence suggests that participants' reports of such potentially sensitive behaviors are higher in self-administered than in interviewer-administered surveys (Turner *et al.* 1998).

Respondents with a history of any suicide ideation or attempt were asked the age at which they first experienced that outcome. Timing of prior suicide ideation and attempt was obtained using a question sequence shown experimentally to improve recall accuracy (Knauper *et al.* 1999).

Psychiatric disorders and other covariates

Psychiatric disorders were diagnosed according to DSM-IV criteria. The common diagnostic assessment in all surveys included mood disorders (major depressive disorder and dysthymia), anxiety disorders (panic disorder, agoraphobia without panic disorder, social phobia, generalized anxiety disorder and post-traumatic stress disorder) and substance use disorders (alcohol abuse, drug abuse, alcohol dependence with abuse, and drug dependence with abuse). All respondents were asked the age at which they had first experienced any of those disorders.

Demographics

Analyses also used sociodemographic information including gender, age, educational attainment, and age at first marriage and divorce (if any). Race/ethnicity was asked in all surveys and the original variables were recorded by CPES processors to harmonize data across the three studies (CPES, 2008). Twelve categories were identified: Vietnamese, Filipino, Chinese, All other Asian, Cuban, Puerto Rican, Mexican, All other Hispanic, Afro-Caribbean, African-American, Non-Latino Whites, and All other (excluded here). These categories were then collapsed into the following broader ethnic groups: Asian, Black, Hispanic and White (CPES, 2008; OMH, 2010).

Foreign- versus US-born and age at migration

Respondents were asked whether they were born in the USA, and, if not, they were asked the age at which they arrived at the USA. Because of possible differences in mental disorder risk by age at immigration (Breslau *et al.* 2009), we divided immigrants into two groups: immigrants who arrived as children (at age ≤ 12 years) and immigrants who arrived as adolescents or adults (at age ≥ 13 years).

Analysis

After estimating the lifetime prevalence of suicidal ideation and attempts among various ethnic groups in the CPES, discrete-time survival analysis with time-varying covariates (Efron, 1988; Willett & Singer, 1993) was used to examine the associations between ethnicity, immigration and risk of suicidality, adjusting

for sociodemographic variables. Time-varying indicators for DSM-IV disorders were further added to adjust for possible effects of mental health on the differential distribution of suicidality across ethnic and migrant groups. Discrete-time survival analysis was used instead of logistic regression to model the lifetime prevalence of suicide-related outcomes as this allows for incorporation of the temporal ordering of onset of mental disorders and suicide-related outcomes, time-varying sociodemographics (e.g. marital status) and, most importantly, immigration status among CPES respondents. This, in turn, allowed for comparison of the risk of the onset of suicide-related outcomes among foreign-born immigrants in the CPES before and after their immigration to the USA. We used weights developed by CPES biostatisticians (NIMH, 2010).

Survival coefficients were converted to odds ratios (ORs) for ease of interpretation; significance tests of sets of coefficients in the logistic regression equations were made using Wald χ^2 tests based on design-corrected coefficient variance-covariance matrices. Statistical significance was consistently evaluated as $p=0.05$, two-tailed. We estimated standard errors and significance tests by the Taylor series method with SUDAAN version 9 (SUDAAN, 2005) to adjust for the weighting and clustering of the data. We also report the 95% confidence intervals (CIs) of the ORs, which were adjusted for design effects on stratification and clustering and for unequal weighting of the observations. Because of the multiple comparisons included in this report for each dependent variable, we emphasize findings with $p < 0.01$.

Results

Suicidality among ethnic groups

Table 1a shows that 14.64% of the sample reported suicidal ideation and 4.58% reported a suicide attempt. Suicidal ideation was most common among Non-Hispanic Whites, and suicide attempts were most common among Hispanics. Asians had the lowest prevalence in both outcomes. The crude analyses (Table 1b) suggested significant differences in suicide ideation ($\chi^2=33.04$, $p < 0.001$) and attempts ($\chi^2=24.41$, $p < 0.001$) across ethnic groups.

As expected, there were differences in the crude lifetime prevalence of any of the psychiatric disorders listed in the Method section. The lifetime prevalence of any disorder was: Asians (18%, 1.3 s.e.), Hispanics (31%, 1.3 s.e.), Blacks (31%, 0.9 s.e.) and Non-Hispanic Whites (40%, 1.2 s.e.) ($\chi^2=125$, 3 df, $p < 0.001$). Discrete-time survival estimates of ORs adjusted by age, sex, marital status, educational attainment

Table 1. Lifetime prevalence and crude association of suicidality among race/ethnicity in the CPES study ($n = 15\,180$)^a

Race/ ethnicity population group	(a) Lifetime prevalence of suicidality among race/ethnicity ^b							(b) Lifetime crude association of suicidality with race/ethnicity ^c									
	Suicide ideation				Suicide attempt			Suicide ideation					Suicide attempt				
	<i>n</i>	<i>n</i>	%	S.E.	<i>n</i>	%	S.E.	OR	95% CI	χ^2	df	<i>p</i>	OR	95% CI	χ^2	df	<i>p</i>
Total sample	15 180	2280	14.64	0.55	802	4.58	0.22			33.04	3	<0.001			24.41	3	<0.001
Asian	2178	211	9.02	0.78	60	2.55	0.36	0.58	0.47–0.71				0.57	0.42–0.77			
Hispanic	3259	414	11.35	0.72	190	5.11	0.39	0.78	0.67–0.92				1.19	0.98–1.45			
Black	5563	672	11.82	0.64	235	4.15	0.46	0.76	0.65–0.88				0.93	0.71–1.20			
White	4180	983	16.10	0.71	317	4.69	0.29	1.00	–				1.00	–			

CPES, Collaborative Psychiatric Epidemiology Surveys; S.E., standard error; OR, odds ratio; CI, confidence interval; df, degrees of freedom.

^a The total sample includes long-version National Comorbidity Survey Replication (NCS-R) respondents and excludes the following respondents from the National Study of American Life (NSAL): Non-Hispanic Whites (were not asked the suicidality section), respondents not willing to think before answering questions or who did not pass the Short Portable Mental Status Questionnaire (SPMSQ) test. There were 17 respondents with missing data on ideation and 21 on attempt.

^b Frequencies are unweighted; percentages are weighted.

^c ORs were estimated by discrete-time survival models controlling only for person-years.

p values were computed by the Wald χ^2 test.

(Table 2a) and the series of demographic variables and psychiatric disorders (any mood, any anxiety and any substance use disorders) (Table 2b) show that, compared to Non-Hispanic Whites, all ethnic groups had lower risk of suicide ideation ($\chi^2 = 33.5$, OR range 0.67–0.74) but similar risk for suicide attempts ($\chi^2 = 7.17$, OR range 0.80–1.21) (Table 2b). The lack of association between ethnic groups and suicide attempt was mostly due to the further adjustment of psychiatric disorders because all ethnic groups had significantly lower ORs in models that adjusted only for basic demographic variables ($\chi^2 = 16.88$, OR range 0.53–0.92, Table 2a).

Suicidality and nativity

Table 3 presents the raw data on suicidality among ethnic groups and nativity. For the total population, the prevalence of suicide ideation is highest in the US-born (15.68%), followed by immigrants who migrated as children (≤ 12 years) (12.64%), and immigrants who migrated at older ages (> 12 years, adolescents or adults) (6.48%). Among the US-born, the prevalence of suicidal ideation was highest in Non-Hispanic Whites and the prevalence of suicide attempt was highest among Hispanics. The results of Table 3 suggest large differences between the US-born and the foreign-born of the same ethnicity in both ideation and attempts. To examine differences within the US-born population only, discrete-time survival models similar to those used in Table 2b were estimated in this subsample, adjusting for demographic characteristics and psychiatric disorders (results not shown). Only two significant differences emerged in this subsample: compared

with the US-born Non-Hispanic Whites, risk for suicidal ideation was significantly lower among the US-born Non-Hispanic Blacks (OR 0.74, 95% CI 0.65–0.86) and risk for suicide attempt was significantly higher among the US-born Hispanics (OR 1.43, 95% CI 1.10–1.87).

In Table 3, within the four ethnic groups, immigrants who migrated as adolescents or adults had consistently lower prevalences for suicide ideation and attempts compared to US-born respondents of the same ethnic group. The immigrants who migrated as children of Asian and Black ethnicity showed higher lifetime prevalence of ideation and attempts than the US-born of the same ethnicity. By contrast, among Whites, older immigrants had prevalence of suicide ideation that was higher than younger immigrants.

Suicidality and immigration

A final set of models was estimated to compare immigrants with the US-born of the same ethnicity during years prior to and following their arrival in the USA. In the total sample, risk for both ideation and attempt is lowest during years prior to immigration, and intermediate in the years following immigration, after adjusting for age, sex, marital status and education (Table 4, model 1). After further adjustment for psychiatric disorders (Table 4, model 2), the risk remains lowest in years prior to immigration, but is no longer significantly different from the US-born in years after immigration in three out of four comparisons in the total sample. A similar pattern of results was found across all ethnic groups when we adjusted

Table 2. Adjusted lifetime association of suicidality with race/ethnicity in the CPES study (n = 15 180)

Race/ethnicity population group	(a) Model adjusted by demographics variables ^a						(b) Model adjusted by demographics variables and DSM-IV psychiatric disorders ^b								
	Suicide ideation			Suicide attempt			Suicide ideation			Suicide attempt					
	OR	95% CI	χ^2	df	p	OR	95% CI	χ^2	df	p	OR	95% CI	χ^2	df	p
Total sample	0.52	0.42–0.64	78.91	3	<0.001	0.53	0.38–0.73	16.88	3	0.001	0.67	0.54–0.82	33.5	3	<0.001
Asian	0.60	0.51–0.71				0.92	0.73–1.15				0.71	0.60–0.83			
Hispanic	0.64	0.55–0.74				0.78	0.60–1.02				0.74	0.64–0.85			
Black	1.00	–				1.00	–				1.00	–			
White															

CPES, Collaborative Psychiatric Epidemiology Surveys; OR, odds ratio; CI, confidence interval; df, degrees of freedom.

^a ORs were estimated by discrete-time survival models controlling for age and sex as fixed covariates, and person-year, marital status and education as time-varying covariates.

^b ORs were estimated by discrete-time survival models controlling for age and sex as fixed covariates, and person-year, marital status, education, any mood, any anxiety and any substance DSM-IV disorders as time-varying covariates. Any mood includes major depressive disorder with hierarchy and dysthymia; any substance includes both alcohol and drug abuse and dependence; any anxiety includes panic disorder, agoraphobia without panic disorder, social phobia, generalized anxiety disorder and post-traumatic stress disorder.

p values were computed by the Wald χ^2 test.

for psychiatric disorders, except for Non-Hispanic Whites. Focusing on the results from model 2, there are only two instances where risk is significantly lower among immigrants after they have arrived in the USA compared to their co-ethnic US-born population. Both occur in immigrants who arrived after age 12, Hispanics (suicidal ideation) and Non-Hispanic Blacks (suicide attempt). The sample size for the non-Hispanic whites, by migration status, is too small for any conclusive statement.

Discussion

This large national survey provided an opportunity to examine suicide ideation and attempt in relationship to ethnicity and immigration in population samples assessed with the same survey instrument. First, crude ethnic differences in suicide ideation and attempt were generally similar to ethnic differences in rates of suicide as compiled by the CDC (2011). Nevertheless, after adjustment for mental disorders, the ethnic differences in prevalence of suicide ideation was greatly reduced but still persisted. For suicide attempt, the ethnic differences were no longer significant when these adjustments were performed.

Second, immigration makes a large contribution to ethnic differences in the prevalence of suicide ideation and attempt, with the US-born more likely to report suicidality. Suicidality is less common among the large immigrant segments of the Hispanic and Asian-American populations, contributing to the low crude prevalence of suicide ideation and attempt in these groups. US nativity further attenuated the differences in suicide ideation and attempt across ethnic groups. When an ethnic comparison was performed among the US-born, no differences were found in suicide ideation and attempts with only two exceptions: US-born Blacks had lower prevalence of suicide ideation when compared to US-born Whites, and US-born Hispanics had higher prevalence of suicide attempt when compared to US-born Whites.

Third, within ethnic groups and using the US-born as the reference, the lowest ORs for both ideation and attempts were found among immigrants prior to their arrival in the USA. After arrival in the USA, risk among immigrants tended to increase to levels similar to that of the US-born population of the same ethnicity.

Prevalence of suicidality

The lifetime prevalence of ideation and attempt that we report here for Blacks, Asians and Hispanics are comparable to, but slightly different from, those reported by the individual studies from the CPES

Table 3. Lifetime prevalence of suicidality among race/ethnicity and nativity in the CPES study by nativity^a

Race/ethnicity population group ^b	n	Suicide ideation		Suicide attempt	
		%	S.E.	%	S.E.
Total sample	15 180				
USB	10 274	15.68	0.58	4.93	0.25
FB: immigrated at age ≤12 years	988	12.64	1.47	4.18	0.75
FB: immigrated at age ≥13 years	3819	6.48	0.63	1.78	0.26
Asian	2178				
USB	476	13.52	1.94	3.91	1.08
FB: immigrated at age ≤12 years	249	15.48	2.64	5.20	1.48
FB: immigrated at age ≥13 years	1450	6.10	0.70	1.53	0.30
Hispanic	3259				
USB	1370	15.46	0.98	7.07	0.69
FB: immigrated at age ≤12 years	481	13.55	1.99	5.28	1.19
FB: immigrated at age ≥13 years	1390	5.59	0.61	2.62	0.46
Black	5563				
USB	4382	12.10	0.67	4.38	0.48
FB: immigrated at age ≤12 years	207	17.23	5.44	4.91	2.30
FB: immigrated at age ≥13 years	898	4.85	1.42	0.52	0.18
White	4180				
USB	4046	16.32	0.69	4.84	0.30
FB: immigrated at age ≤12 years	51	7.79	3.18	1.02	0.78
FB: immigrated at age ≥13 years	81	10.81	3.53	0.00	0.00

CPES, Collaborative Psychiatric Epidemiology Surveys; S.E., standard error; USB, United States born; FB, foreign born.

^a Frequencies are unweighted; percentages are weighted.

^b There were 53 respondents with missing data on migrant status or age of migration.

(Joe *et al.* 2006; Fortuna *et al.* 2007; Duldulao *et al.* 2009), as we included ethnic groups from the NCS-R in these analyses. The Epidemiologic Catchment Area (ECA) Study (Moscicki *et al.* 1988), conducted more than 25 years ago, is the only other large epidemiological study to report separate estimates of lifetime suicide attempt for Whites (3.0%), Blacks (2.3%) and Hispanics (3.3%). The ECA estimates are lower than those reported here, but are in the same direction. Whether there was an increase in lifetime prevalence of suicidality in the past 30 years is a matter of discussion beyond our results, but more limited evidence from examining the NCS and the NCS-R (Kessler *et al.* 2005), a 10-year interval, and the National Longitudinal Alcohol Epidemiologic Survey (NLAES) and the National Epidemiologic Survey on Alcohol and Related Conditions (NESARC; Baca-Garcia *et al.* 2010) showed no recent increase in suicide attempt. A recent study based on the NESARC reports data on suicide attempt by ethnicity (2.4% for Whites, 2.1% for Blacks, 2.1% for Hispanics and 2.0% for Asians), but unfortunately the data are limited to respondents who screened into the depression section and resulted in extremely low lifetime prevalences (Baca-Garcia *et al.* 2010). A combination of differences in sample representativeness, differential composition of the first

and the second generation of immigrants in the 1980s and the 2000s, and, most importantly, the instruments used in the ECA and the NESARC to assess suicide attempt may account for the differences in the lifetime prevalence between these surveys and the CPES.

Ethnicity and immigration into the USA

Our analyses suggest that ethnicity, *per se*, has a more limited role in the current epidemiology of suicidality in the USA than that shown by previous studies (Joe *et al.* 2006; Fortuna *et al.* 2007; Duldulao *et al.* 2009). Differences in suicide attempt among ethnic groups were accounted for by differences in psychiatric disorders among these groups and we found only a moderate gap in suicide ideation between the four main ethnic groups in the USA, which mostly disappeared when we focused exclusively on the second-generation ethnic groups. Among the second generation, Blacks were at a lower risk for ideation, but Hispanics were at a higher risk for attempt. Moscicki *et al.* (1988) found lower ORs for suicide attempt for both Blacks (OR 0.59) and Hispanics (OR 0.56, non-significant), contrary to our findings. These differences in results may be due to differences in the statistical models used in these studies and,

Table 4. Adjusted lifetime association of suicidality among race/ethnicity and immigration in the CPES study by nativity

Race/ethnicity population group	Model 1 ^a				Model 2 ^b			
	Suicide ideation		Suicide attempt		Suicide ideation		Suicide attempt	
	OR	95% CI	OR	95% CI	OR	95% CI	OR	95% CI
Total sample								
PY: in country of origin	0.30	0.22–0.41**	0.23	0.16–0.35**	0.37	0.27–0.49**	0.33	0.22–0.50**
FB: immigrated at age ≤12 years	0.74	0.57–0.95*	0.70	0.47–1.04	0.85	0.66–1.09	0.91	0.62–1.34
FB: immigrated at age ≥13 years	0.53	0.42–0.67**	0.57	0.38–0.85*	0.70	0.55–0.90*	0.92	0.62–1.37
USB	1.00	–	1.00	–	1.00	–	1.00	–
Asian								
PY: in country of origin	0.37	0.24–0.56**	0.30	0.13–0.71*	0.40	0.27–0.59**	0.36	0.15–0.86*
FB: immigrated at age ≤12 years	1.03	0.63–1.66	1.22	0.52–2.84	1.04	0.64–1.68	1.36	0.58–3.17
FB: immigrated at age ≥13 years	0.77	0.40–1.47	0.98	0.38–2.51	0.92	0.49–1.71	1.42	0.58–3.44
USB	1.00	–	1.00	–	1.00	–	1.00	–
Hispanic								
PY: in country of origin	0.27	0.18–0.40**	0.26	0.15–0.44**	0.30	0.20–0.44**	0.33	0.19–0.55**
FB: immigrated at age ≤12 years	0.88	0.64–1.21	0.67	0.39–1.16	0.94	0.70–1.27	0.80	0.47–1.35
FB: immigrated at age ≥13 years	0.46	0.33–0.63**	0.58	0.33–1.02	0.55	0.41–0.75**	0.82	0.47–1.46
USB	1.00	–	1.00	–	1.00	–	1.00	–
Black								
PY: in country of origin	0.45	0.20–0.99*	0.09	0.04–0.22**	0.49	0.23–1.03	0.11	0.04–0.25**
FB: immigrated at age ≤12 years	1.40	0.72–2.73	1.00	0.36–2.73	1.41	0.85–2.36	0.93	0.29–2.94
FB: immigrated at age ≥13 years	0.63	0.25–1.57	0.19	0.06–0.67*	0.76	0.31–1.88	0.27	0.08–0.91*
USB	1.00	–	1.00	–	1.00	–	1.00	–
White								
PY: in country of origin	0.52	0.17–1.56	^c	–	0.62	0.21–1.77	^c	–
FB: immigrated at age ≤12 years	0.46	0.20–1.07	0.20	0.05–0.89*	0.55	0.23–1.29	0.26	0.06–1.12
FB: immigrated at age ≥13 years	0.80	0.40–1.60	^c	–	1.04	0.52–2.10	^c	–
USB	1.00	–	1.00	–	1.00	–	1.00	–

CPES, Collaborative Psychiatric Epidemiology Surveys; USB, United States born; FB, foreign born; PY, person-years; OR, odds ratio; CI, confidence interval.

^a Estimated in discrete-time survival models controlling for age and sex as fixed covariates and person-year, marital status and education as time-varying covariates.

^b Estimated in discrete-time survival models controlling for age and sex as fixed covariates and person-year, marital status, education, any mood, any anxiety and any substance DSM-IV disorders as time-varying covariates.

^c Could not be estimated due to zero cell.

* $p < 0.05$, ** $p < 0.001$.

importantly, differences in the composition of first- and second-generation ethnic groups in the ECA and in more recent surveys of the US population. As no prior study has reported on ethnic differences in suicidality among the second generation only, future research should confirm these findings and look into more details on protective and risk factors for the second generation of the ethnic groups in the USA before any firm conclusions can be drawn.

Previous studies suggest that differences between foreign-born and US-born individuals may be due to acculturation (Canino & Roberts, 2001; Joe *et al.* 2006; Choi *et al.* 2007; Fortuna *et al.* 2007; Smokowski *et al.* 2009) and selectivity of immigration (Duldulao *et al.* 2009). Besides eroding basic culturally influenced

coping strategies and cultural values (Baca-Garcia *et al.* 2011), which are core elements of the concept of acculturation, it is still unclear how assimilation into US society may influence suicide ideation and attempts. For example, Fortuna *et al.* (2007) suggested that English proficiency, parental US nativity, family values, and language spoken as a child may be risk factors among Hispanics, whereas Duldulao *et al.* (2009) argued that acculturation can be seen as both a protective and a risk factor for Asians. It may be a protective factor because highly acculturated immigrants are more socially integrated; and a risk factor because higher acculturation may imply the presence of new risk factors, such as a loss in traditional values. Crawford *et al.* (2005) found no significant effect of

acculturation levels on suicidal behavior in a UK immigrant sample. In addition, our finding that the protection for suicidality decreases after moving to the USA is consistent with the relationship that Duldulao *et al.* (2009) found between suicidality and number of years living in the USA for Asians. Similar to Fortuna *et al.* (2007), we also found among Hispanics a higher risk of suicidality in the second generation and among immigrants who arrived in the USA at a younger age. However, for the other ethnic groups, the difference between US-born and foreign-born individuals is mainly present in the years prior to immigration.

Future research should attempt to disentangle more precisely how specific mental disorders and socio-demographic factors may differentially affect ethnic groups or even nations (Borges *et al.* 2010). Our results suggest that at least some of the differences in crude rates of suicide among ethnic groups in the USA may reflect baseline differences in the prevalence of psychiatric disorders and suicidality prior to immigration among these groups, factors that were not fully investigated previously.

Limitations

The results of this study are limited in important ways. First, our analyses were based on retrospective self-reports, which may be affected by recall bias if some groups are systematically more likely to accurately recall and report past life events than others, especially recall over longer periods of time (pre-migration years). Second, the CIDI questions used to elicit suicide ideation and attempt are clearly limited and did not include any measure of chronicity or severity of suicide ideation or attempt that may also differ by ethnicity and immigration status. Furthermore, no reliability or validity data were obtained on the measures of ideation or attempt and we did not examine non-suicidal self-injury (i.e. self-mutilation) (Nock & Prinstein, 2005); these restrict the inferences that can be drawn from this study and represent areas for improvement in future studies. Clinical studies of suicidal patients that include a more in-depth evaluation of the patient's state of mind and a larger number of risk factors (Mann *et al.* 1999; Oquendo *et al.* 2005) are therefore needed. Third, the four ethnic groups examined here are internally heterogeneous and future studies with larger samples are needed to explore suicidality among important subgroups (Baca-Garcia *et al.* 2011). An example of this within-ethnic group difference was reported on suicide-related outcomes between African Americans and Caribbean Blacks, where Caribbean black men were mostly affected (Joe *et al.* 2006), but this effect was not seen within

Latinos (Fortuna *et al.* 2007). All of the ethnic groups and their cultures studied here are richer and show a wider variability of norms, family structure or coping strategies among their members than this succinct description of findings or, sometimes, tentative conclusions may suggest. The careful description and analysis of the multiple cultural components that exist within a particular ethnicity and its constituent nationalities is a fruitful avenue that has been used before in analysis of, for example, suicidality among Hispanics in the USA (Fortuna *et al.* 2007; Baca-Garcia *et al.* 2011). Finally, two sources of bias have been identified in studies of mental health and immigration: the selection of healthier immigrants and the return of sick immigrants. Without data from the sending countries, we can only speculate regarding whether these biases could be operating in our study. Nevertheless, the single study to date to test these biases in the context of immigration and suicidality among Mexicans (Borges *et al.* 2009) did not find such bias.

Conclusions

Despite these limitations, this large epidemiological study of four ethnic groups in the USA adds to the literature in showing that ethnic differences in suicidal behaviors are smaller in magnitude than those reported for suicide deaths. The findings that ethnic differences in suicidal behaviors are partly explained by differences in psychiatric disorders, nativity and risk prior to arrival in the USA are important. As most immigrants start with low rates of suicidality and these rates tend to increase as they become familiar with the US milieu and eventually settle as US nationals, the ethnic convergence of rates is not a good outcome. These findings suggest that, from a public health perspective, more preventive efforts should be directed to second-generation immigrants who have lost all protective factors, whatever they were. Pre-migration factors, such as baseline risks of suicidality, social and cultural conditions in the country of origin and selection factors (i.e. ways in which those who migrate differ from those who do not migrate), potentially play a large role. As the proportion of these ethnic groups born in the USA increases, the prevalence of suicide ideation and attempt, and potentially also of suicide, is likely to increase to levels similar to those currently found among Non-Hispanic Whites.

Acknowledgements

Funding for this study was provided by NIMH Grant R01 MH082023 (J. Breslau, PI).

Declaration of Interest

None.

References

- Alegria M, Mulvaney-Day N, Torres M, Polo A, Cao Z, Canino G** (2007). Prevalence of psychiatric disorders across Latino subgroups in the United States. *American Journal of Public Health* **97**, 68–75.
- Baca-Garcia E, Perez-Rodriguez MM, Keyes K, Oquendo MA, Hasin D, Grant BF, Blanco C** (2010). Suicidal ideation and suicide attempts in the United States: 1991–1992 and 2001–2002. *Molecular Psychiatry* **15**, 250–259.
- Baca-Garcia E, Perez-Rodriguez MM, Keyes K, Oquendo MA, Hasin D, Grant BF, Blanco C** (2011). Suicidal ideation and suicide attempts among Hispanic subgroups in the United States: 1991–1992 and 2001–2002. *Journal of Psychiatric Research* **45**, 512–518.
- Borges G, Angst J, Nock MK, Ruscio AM, Kessler RC** (2008). Risk factors for the incidence and persistence of suicide-related outcomes: a 10-year follow-up study using the National Comorbidity Surveys. *Journal of Affective Disorders* **105**, 25–33.
- Borges G, Angst J, Nock MK, Ruscio AM, Walters EE, Kessler RC** (2006). A risk index for 12-month suicide attempts in the National Comorbidity Survey Replication (NCS-R). *Psychological Medicine* **36**, 1747–1757.
- Borges G, Breslau J, Su M, Miller M, Medina-Mora ME, Aguilar-Gaxiola S** (2009). Immigration and suicidal behavior among Mexicans and Mexican-Americans. *American Journal of Public Health* **99**, 728–733.
- Borges G, Nock MK, Haro JM, Hwang I, Sampson N, Alonso J, Andrade L, Angermeyer M, Beautrais AL, Bromet E, Bruffaerts R, Girolamo G, Florescu S, Gureje O, Hu C, Karam EG, Kovess V, Lee S, Levinson D, Medina-Mora ME, Ormel J, Posada-Villa J, Sagar R, Tomov T, Uda H, Williams DR, Kessler RC** (2010). Twelve month prevalence of and risk factors for suicide attempts in the WHO World Mental Health Surveys. *Journal of Clinical Psychiatry* **71**, 1617–1628.
- Breslau J, Aguilar-Gaxiola S, Borges G, Kendler K, Su M, Kessler RC** (2007). Risk for psychiatric disorder among immigrants and their US-born descendants: evidence from the National Comorbidity Survey Replication. *Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease* **195**, 189–195.
- Breslau J, Aguilar-Gaxiola S, Kendler K, Su M, Williams D, Kessler RC** (2006). Specifying race-ethnic differences in risk for psychiatric disorder in a USA national sample. *Psychological Medicine* **36**, 57–68.
- Breslau J, Borges G, Hagar Y, Tancredi D, Gilman S** (2009). Immigration to the USA and risk for mood and anxiety disorders: variation by origin and age at immigration. *Psychological Medicine* **39**, 1117–1127.
- Breslau J, Chang DF** (2006). Psychiatric disorders among foreign-born and US-born Asian-Americans in a US national survey. *Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology* **41**, 943–950.
- Canino G, Roberts RE** (2001). Suicidal behavior among Latino youth. *Suicide and Life-Threatening Behavior* **31**, 122–131.
- CDC** (2009). *Youth Risk Behavior Surveillance System (YRBSS)*. National Center for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion, Division of Adolescent and School Health. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention: Atlanta, GA (www.cdc.gov/HealthyYouth/yrbs/). Accessed 12 October 2011.
- CDC** (2011). *Web-based Injury Statistics Query and Reporting System (WISQARS)*. National Center for Injury Prevention and Control. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention: Atlanta, GA (webappa.cdc.gov/sasweb/ncipc/mortrate10_sy.html). Accessed 11 February 2011.
- Choi JL, Rogers JR, Werth Jr. JL** (2007). Suicide risk assessment with Asian American college students: a culturally informed perspective. *The Counselling Psychologist* **37**, 186–218.
- CPES** (2008). *Collaborative Psychiatric Epidemiology Surveys: CPES Processing Notes* (www.icpsr.umich.edu/files/CPES/CPES%20Processing%20Notes.pdf). Accessed 3 August 2011.
- Crawford MJ, Nur U, McKenzie K, Tyrer P** (2005). Suicidal ideation and suicide attempts among ethnic minority groups in England: results of a national household survey. *Psychological Medicine* **35**, 1369–1377.
- Crosby A, Ortega L, Stevens MR;Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC)** (2011). Suicides – United States, 1999–2007. *MMWR Surveillance Summaries* **14**, 56–59.
- Duldulao AA, Takeuchi D, Hong S** (2009). Correlates of suicidal behaviors among Asian Americans. *Archives of Suicide Research* **13**, 277–290.
- Efron B** (1988). Logistic regression, survival analysis, and the Kaplan-Meier curve. *Journal of the American Statistical Association* **83**, 414–425.
- Fortuna LR, Perez DJ, Canino C, Sribney W, Alegria M** (2007). Prevalence and correlates of lifetime suicidal ideation and suicide attempts among Latino subgroups in the United States. *Journal of Clinical Psychiatry* **68**, 572–581.
- Galfalvy H, Huang YY, Oquendo MA, Currier D, Mann JJ** (2009). Increased risk of suicide attempt in mood disorders and TPH1 genotype. *Journal of Affective Disorders* **115**, 331–338.
- Goldsmith SK, Pellmar TC, Kleinman AM** (2002). *Reducing Suicide: A National Imperative*. National Academies Press: Washington, DC.
- Goldstein RB, Black DW, Nasrallah A, Winokur G** (1991). The prediction of suicide. Sensitivity, specificity, and predictive value of a multivariate model applied to suicide among 1906 patients with affective disorders. *Archives of General Psychiatry* **48**, 418–422.
- Grieco EM** (2010). *Race and Hispanic Origin of the Foreign-Born Population in the United States: 2007*. US Department of Commerce, Economics, and Statistics Administration: Washington, DC.
- Heeringa S, Wagner J, Torres M, Duan N, Adams T, Berglund P** (2004). Sample designs and sampling methods for the Collaborative Psychiatric Epidemiology Studies (CPES). *International Journal of Methods in Psychiatric Research* **13**, 221–240.
- Joe S, Baser R, Breeden G, Neighbors H, Jackson JS** (2006). Prevalence of and risk factors for lifetime suicide attempts

- among blacks in the United States. *Journal of the American Medical Association* **296**, 2112–2123.
- Kessler RC, Berglund P, Chiu WT, Demler O, Heeringa S, Hiripi E, Jin R, Pennell BE, Walters EE, Zaslavsky A, Zheng H** (2004). The US National Comorbidity Survey Replication (NCS-R): design and field procedures. *International Journal of Methods in Psychiatric Research* **8**, 69–92.
- Kessler RC, Berglund P, Borges G, Nock M, Wang PS** (2005). Trends in suicide ideation, plans, gestures, and attempts in the United States, 1990–1992 to 2001–2003. *Journal of the American Medical Association* **293**, 2487–2495.
- Kessler RC, Borges G, Walters EE** (1999). Prevalence of and risk factors for lifetime suicide attempts in the National Comorbidity Survey. *Archives of General Psychiatry* **56**, 617–626.
- Knauer B, Cannell CF, Schwarz N, Bruce ML, Kessler RC** (1999). Improving accuracy of major depression age-of-onset reports in the US National Comorbidity Survey. *International Journal of Methods in Psychiatric Research* **8**, 39–48.
- Mann JJ, Waternaux C, Haas GL, Malone KM** (1999). Toward a clinical model of suicidal behavior in psychiatric patients. *American Journal of Psychiatry* **156**, 181–189.
- Moscicki EK, O'Carroll P, Rae DS, Locke BZ, Roy A, Regier DA** (1988). Suicide attempts in the Epidemiologic Catchment Area Study. *Yale Journal of Biology and Medicine* **61**, 259–268.
- NIMH** (2010). *Collaborative Psychiatric Epidemiology Surveys*. National Institute of Mental Health (<http://www.icpsr.umich.edu/files/CPES/CPES%20Weights%20Chart.pdf>). Accessed 16 March 2010.
- Nock MK, Borges G, Bromet E, Cha CB, Kessler RC, Lee S** (2008). Suicide and suicidal behavior. *Epidemiologic Reviews* **30**, 133–154.
- Nock MK, Hwang I, Sampson N, Kessler RC, Angermeyer M, Beautrais AL, Borges G, Bromet E, Bruffaerts R, de Girolamo G, de Graaf R, Florescu S, Gureje O, Haro JM, Hu C, Huang Y, Karam EG, Kawakami N, Kovess V, Levinson D, Posada-Villa J, Sagar R, Tomov T, Viana MC, Williams DR** (2009). Cross-national analysis of the associations among mental disorders and suicidal behavior: findings from the WHO World Mental Health Surveys. *PLoS Medicine* **6**, e1000123.
- Nock MK, Prinstein MJ** (2005). Clinical features and behavioral functions of adolescent self-mutilation. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology* **114**, 140–146.
- Oquendo MA, Dragatsi D, Harkavy-Friedman J, Dervic K, Currier D, Burke AK** (2005). Protective factors against suicidal behavior in Latinos. *Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease* **193**, 438–443.
- Oquendo MA, Lizardi D, Greenwald S, Weissman MM, Mann JJ** (2004). Rates of lifetime suicide attempt and rates of lifetime major depression in different ethnic groups in the United States. *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica* **110**, 446–451.
- Perez-Rodriguez MM, Baca-Garcia E, Oquendo MA, Blanco C** (2008). Ethnic differences in suicidal ideation and attempts. *Primary Psychiatry* **15**, 44–53.
- Pew Hispanic Center** (2010). *Hispanics of Puerto Rican Origin in the United States, 2008* (pewhispanic.org/files/factsheets/58.pdf). Accessed 12 October 2011.
- Roberts RE, Roberts CR, Xing Y** (2007). Are Mexican American adolescents at greater risk of suicidal behaviors? *Suicide and Life-Threatening Behavior* **37**, 10–21.
- Singh GK, Hiatt RA** (2006). Trends and disparities in socioeconomic and behavioural characteristics, life expectancy, and cause-specific mortality of native-born and foreign-born populations in the United States, 1979–2003. *International Journal of Epidemiology* **35**, 903–919.
- Smokowski PR, David-Ferdon C, Stroupe N** (2009). Acculturation and violence in minority adolescents: a review of the empirical literature. *Journal of Primary Prevention* **30**, 215–263.
- SUDAAN** (2005). *SUDAAN Language Manual, Release 9.0*. Research Triangle Institute: Research Triangle Park, NC.
- Suominen K, Isometsa E, Suokas J, Haukka J, Achte K, Lonnqvist J** (2004). Completed suicide after a suicide attempt: a 37-year follow-up study. *American Journal of Psychiatry* **161**, 562–563.
- Takeuchi DT, Zane N, Hong S, Chae DH, Gong F, Gee GC, Walton E, Sue S, Alegria M** (2007). Immigration-related factors and mental disorders among Asian Americans. *American Journal of Public Health* **97**, 84–90.
- OMH** (2010). *OMB Standards for Data on Race and Ethnicity*. The Office of Minority Health, US Department of Health and Human Sciences (<http://minorityhealth.hhs.gov/templates/browse.aspx?lvl=2&lvlID=172>). Accessed 3 August 2011.
- Turner CF, Ku L, Rogers SM, Lindberg LD, Pleck JH, Sonenstein FL** (1998). Adolescent sexual behavior, drug use, and violence: increased reporting with computer survey technology. *Science* **280**, 867–873.
- Willett JB, Singer JD** (1993). Investigating onset, cessation, relapse, and recovery: why you should, and how you can, use discrete-time survival analysis to examine event occurrence. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology* **61**, 952–964.
- Williams DR, Haile R, Gonzalez HM, Neighbors H, Baser R, Jackson JS** (2007). The mental health of black Caribbean immigrants: results from the National Survey of American Life. *American Journal of Public Health* **97**, 52–59.