cambridge.org/par

Review

Cite this article: Cortés A, Peachey LE, Jenkins TP, Scotti R, Cantacessi C (2019). Helminths and microbes within the vertebrate gut – not all studies are created equal. *Parasitology* **146**, 1371–1378. https://doi.org/10.1017/ S003118201900088X

Received: 23 April 2019 Revised: 16 June 2019 Accepted: 23 June 2019 First published online: 31 July 2019

Key words:

Helminth-microbiota interactions; soiltransmitted helminths; anthelmintics; bacterial 16S rRNA sequencing; confounding factors

Author for correspondence: Cinzia Cantacessi, E-mail: cc779@cam.ac.uk

© Cambridge University Press 2019



Helminths and microbes within the vertebrate gut – not all studies are created equal

CrossMark

Alba Cortés¹, Laura E. Peachey^{1,2}, Timothy P. Jenkins¹, Riccardo Scotti¹ and Cinzia Cantacessi¹

¹Department of Veterinary Medicine, University of Cambridge, Madingley Road CB3 0ES, Cambridge, UK and ²Bristol Veterinary School, Faculty of Health Sciences, University of Bristol, Langford House, Langford, BS40 5DU, Bristol, UK

Abstract

The multifaceted interactions occurring between gastrointestinal (GI) parasitic helminths and the host gut microbiota are emerging as a key area of study within the broader research domain of host-pathogen relationships. Over the past few years, a wealth of investigations has demonstrated that GI helminths interact with the host gut flora, and that such interactions result in modifications of the host immune and metabolic statuses. Nevertheless, whilst selected changes in gut microbial composition are consistently observed in response to GI helminth infections across several host-parasite systems, research in this area to date is largely characterised by inconsistent findings. These discrepancies are particularly evident when data from studies of GI helminth-microbiota interactions conducted in humans from parasite-endemic regions are compared. In this review, we provide an overview of the main sources of variance that affect investigations on helminth-gut microbiota interactions in humans, and propose a series of methodological approaches that, whilst accounting for the inevitable constraints of fieldwork, are aimed at minimising confounding factors and draw biologically meaningful interpretations from highly variable datasets.

Introduction

A plethora of experimental evidence supports a key role of infections by gastrointestinal (GI) helminth parasites in shaping the composition of the vertebrate gut microbiota, with significant implications for local and systemic host immunity (reviewed by Brosschot and Reynolds, 2018). For instance, recent studies have partly attributed parasite-associated qualitative and/or quantitative alterations to host GI microbial profiles to the ability of GI helminths to stimulate the initial onset of T-regulatory (Treg) immune responses (cf. Reynolds *et al.*, 2014; Giacomin *et al.*, 2015, 2016; Zaiss *et al.*, 2015). On the other hand, other studies have reported associations between acute helminth infections and gut microbiota imbalances (= dysbiosis) characterised by significant expansion of populations of putative pro-inflammatory bacteria (e.g. Rausch *et al.*, 2013; Jenkins *et al.*, 2018*a*; Schneeberger *et al.*, 2018*a*); these observations have lent credit to the hypothesis that helminth-associated alterations of gut microbiota composition may lead to both localised and systemic consequences for the host organism, that include immunopathology and exacerbated malnutrition in at-risk subjects from parasite-endemic areas (reviewed by Glendinning *et al.*, 2014; Houlden *et al.*, 2015; Cattadori *et al.*, 2016).

Over the past decade, newly acquired knowledge of the impact that GI helminth infections exert on the vertebrate gut microbial composition and metabolism has contributed to a better understanding of parasite systems biology and host-pathogen interactions (reviewed by Peachey *et al.*, 2017; Leung *et al.*, 2018; Rapin and Harris, 2018), and has been proposed as a first step towards the identification and development of novel strategies of parasite control based on the targeted manipulation of the host gut microbiota (cf. Peachey *et al.*, 2017). Nevertheless, for humans in particular, progress in this field of research is greatly impaired by the impact of several confounding factors that inevitably affect studies conducted in naturally infected individuals (Mutapi, 2015; Chabé *et al.*, 2017). In this review, we summarise current knowledge of GI helminth-microbiome interactions in humans under natural conditions of infection, identify similarities and differences between datasets and provide an overview of the confounding factors that may affect the interpretation of findings.

Helminth-gut microbiota interactions in real-world scenarios

In endemic areas for helminthiases, the vast majority of infected individuals harbour multiple helminth species, often occupying different niches of the host organism (Hotez *et al.*, 2014). Whilst polyparasitism is often regarded as a major confounding factor in investigations of parasite-microbiota interactions conducted in humans under natural conditions of infection (Cooper *et al.*, 2013; Jenkins *et al.*, 2017; Martin *et al.*, 2018; Rosa *et al.*, 2018), findings from these studies are key to assessing the impact that GI helminths exert on gut microbiota homeostasis in a 'real-world' scenario. Nevertheless, several factors should be considered when

interpreting results obtained from individuals infected by multiple helminth species. First, anthropometric (e.g. age and gender) and anthropologic variables (e.g. ethnicity, diet and occupation) are well known to profoundly impact the 'baseline' composition of the human gut microbiota (Sekirov et al., 2010; Yatsunenko et al., 2012) (cf. Fig. 1); therefore, the enrolment of large cohorts of individuals is often necessary in order to achieve sufficient statistical power and avoid uninformative and/or misleading results (Kelly et al., 2015). However, in many studies, the number of individuals enrolled and samples analysed is inevitably dictated by logistical and financial constraints. In these instances, populationrelated variables that impact gut microbiota composition may contribute substantially to inconsistencies among findings from different studies (cf. Fig. 1). For instance, a negative association between colonisation by the whipworm Trichuris trichiura and the abundance of bacteria belonging to the genus Prevotella in the faeces of infected individuals has been reported in two separate studies conducted in Malaysia (Lee et al., 2014; Ramanan et al., 2016), while other studies conducted in Ecuador, and Liberia and Indonesia, respectively, have failed to identify significant variations in faecal populations of Prevotella in individuals either solely infected by T. trichiura or co-infected with other species of soil-transmitted helminths (STHs) (Cooper et al., 2013; Martin et al., 2018; Rosa et al., 2018).

In addition, whilst Rosa et al. (2018) detected several distinctive features in the gut microbial profiles of helminth-harbouring individuals that were specifically associated to single infections with the hookworm Necator americanus, the roundworm Ascaris lumbricoides or T. trichiura, such features were inconsistent between two independent cohorts of helminth-infected volunteers from Liberia and Indonesia; this discrepancy suggests that other yet undetermined environmental factors may contribute to qualitative and quantitative alterations of the gut microbial profiles of helminth-infected individuals from different geographical areas. In contrast, an association between the abundance of selected bacterial taxa and infections by one or more STHs could be consistently detected in samples from both Liberian and Indonesian cohorts (Rosa et al., 2018). These taxa included bacteria belonging to the genera Olsenella and Allobaculum, which were expanded in the gut microbiota of helminth-infected individuals when compared to that of uninfected controls. To the best of our knowledge, the study by Rosa et al. (2018) was the first to report a link between infections by STHs and the abundance of these bacterial genera in the human gut. Interestingly, in mice suffering from metabolic syndrome, administration of probiotics was followed by the expansion of populations of Olsenella and/or Allobaculum, and a reduction in systemic and/or local gut inflammatory responses (Wang et al., 2015a). Moreover, Allobaculum spp. are putative producers of anti-inflammatory short-chain fatty acids (Greetham et al., 2004), and are severely reduced in the gut of mice genetically predisposed to spontaneous colitis (Pérez-Muñoz et al., 2014). This knowledge led Rosa et al. (2018) to hypothesize that these bacteria may play a yet undetermined role in the anti-inflammatory properties of parasitic helminths, and reinforce the proposition that the interactions between hosts, parasites and gut microbiota are multidirectional and should be approached in a holistic manner (cf. Cortés et al., 2018; Leung et al., 2018). Interestingly, in contrast to evidence acquired in human hosts, a negative association between Allobaculum abundance and colonisation by GI helminths has been observed in a mouse model of chronic trichuriasis (Holm et al., 2015), in which Th1-mediated immune responses are dominant (reviewed by Cliffe and Grencis, 2004), as well as in mice with patent infection by the blood fluke Schistosoma mansoni (Jenkins et al., 2018a), in which migrating eggs are responsible for the onset of marked Th2-mediated inflammatory responses

(reviewed by Pearce and MacDonald, 2002). The immunemolecular mechanisms *via* which members of the genus *Allobaculum* may regulate local and systemic inflammation are still unclear (Greetham *et al.*, 2004; Pérez-Muñoz *et al.*, 2014; Wang *et al.*, 2015*a*). Nonetheless, current data reporting reductions in populations of *Allobaculum* alongside helminth-associated gut inflammation supports the hypothesis raised by Rosa *et al.* (2018); in the future, rodent models of GI helminth infections whose gut microbiota is deprived of, and subsequently recolonised with, the genus *Allobaculum* could be exploited to investigate the potential role(s) of these bacteria in parasitemediated immunomodulation.

Beside the intrinsic variability of the human gut microbiota, studies conducted under natural conditions of helminth colonisation are likely to be affected by factors linked to the different combinations of infecting species and their relative abundances. For instance, in a study conducted in a cohort of Ecuadorian children, the specific features detected in the gut microbial profiles of subjects co-infected with T. trichiura and A. lumbricoides could not be identified in the microbiota of Trichuris-only infected individuals (Cooper et al., 2013). Similarly, selected microbial features that were observed in studies conducted in human volunteers with mono-specific infections with, for instance, A. lumbricoides, could not be detected in the gut microbiota of subjects harbouring the same parasite alongside other helminth species (e.g. T. trichiura and N. americanus) (Rosa et al., 2018), thus suggesting that a complex interplay exists between the host gut and its macro- and microbiota, that might be difficult to replicate in experimental settings. Furthermore, current evidence obtained from animal models of helminth infections indicates that worm burdens can impact the nature and/or the magnitude of parasite-associated alterations in gut microbial composition (Wu et al., 2012; Peachey et al., 2018). Nevertheless, such evidence is not yet available for human infections, in which parasite burdens may range from low to very high in endemic areas (Barbour and Kafetzaki, 1991; Churcher et al., 2005).

Another frequent constraint of investigations conducted in cohorts of human subjects with natural helminth infections is the limited availability of 'genuine' negative controls, i.e. individuals from the same communities of parasite-infected subjects who lack previous exposure to infections by parasitic helminths. Instead, individuals with no evidence of patent helminth infections are inevitably enrolled as control subjects (e.g. Cooper et al., 2013; Lee et al., 2014; Jenkins et al., 2017; Rosa et al., 2018); nevertheless, studies in helminth-infected individuals subjected to anthelmintic treatment, as well as in primates and pigs exposed to Trichuris spp., have shown that parasite-associated alterations in gut microbial communities can persist, at least partly, in absence of active infections (Broadhurst et al., 2012; Wu et al., 2012; Cooper et al., 2013; Kay et al., 2015; Schneeberger et al., 2018a). These data call for caution when interpreting the biological meaning of differences between the gut microbial profiles of helminth-infected and uninfected volunteers from the same communities. In addition, patent infections are often diagnosed using stool-based microscopic methods, that are known for their relatively low sensitivity and that may yield false negative results, e.g. in case of intermittent shedding of eggs and/or larvae (O'Connell and Nutman, 2016). Recently, Rosa et al. (2018) used quantitative real-time PCR to diagnose STH infections in individuals subjected to gut microbiota profiling, indicating that this technique may represent a robust and sensitive alternative to microscopic methods, since it provides users with the ability to semi-quantify burdens of different helminth species from minute amounts of DNA template. However, in spite of their higher sensitivity, molecular methods rely on the use of primers that selectively target the parasite species of



Fig. 1. Sources of variation and confounding factors potentially impacting on the outcome of studies of helminth-gut microbiota interactions in parasite-endemic regions.

interest, thus impairing the simultaneous detection of potential (asymptomatic or subclinical) co-infections with other helminth and/or non-helminth pathogens (O'Connell and Nutman, 2016). Indeed, the impact of protozoa on the gut microbial diversity and composition has been clearly demonstrated in humans and other vertebrates (reviewed by Chabé et al., 2017; Stensvold and van der Giezen, 2018). Furthermore, a recent study conducted in a cohort of Colombian schoolchildren reported common features in the faecal microbial composition of subjects co-infected with helminths and protozoans and mono-parasitized with the flagellate Giardia intestinalis compared to uninfected individuals (Toro-Londono et al., 2019). Whilst the mechanisms via which each group of parasites alters the host gut flora, as well as the nature of such alterations, are yet to be determined, these findings support the need to conduct additional diagnostic tests on stool samples from helminth-infected cohorts, as well as the corresponding uninfected subjects, in order to rule out the influence of concomitant bacterial, viral and/or protozoan infections that may be responsible for the changing gut microbial profiles of these individuals (cf. Chabé et al., 2017).

Nevertheless, in spite of the several confounding factors outlined above (cf. Fig. 1), observational studies in helminth endemic areas have proven useful for the identification of significant associations between parasite colonisation and the gut microbial profiles of humans under natural conditions of infection. Importantly, studies conducted in these communities provide excellent opportunities to evaluate the effect(s) that parasite removal (e.g. *via* the administration of broad-spectrum anthelmintics) exert(s) on the gut microbiota of previously infected individuals, thus contributing cues to understand the causality of helminth-microbiota relationships.

Impact of deworming on the human gut microbiota

The implementation of mass drug administration programmes in endemic areas for STHs and schistosomiasis offers opportunities to elucidate potential mechanisms via which parasitic helminths modulate the host gut microbiota. For instance, qualitative and quantitative changes in gut microbial profiles that are caused by direct interactions between parasites and gut bacteria may be expected to rapidly reverse following parasite removal, whilst long-lasting alterations are likely to result from indirect interplay mediated by the host immune system (Houlden et al., 2015; Su et al., 2018). Nevertheless, such investigations are also generally constrained by the presence of several confounding factors that include not only the host- and parasite-dependent variables outlined above, but also variations linked to the use of different drugs and treatment regimes (Schneeberger et al., 2018b), as well as time of sampling post-anthelmintic treatment (Houlden et al., 2015) (Fig. 1). The latter in particular may profoundly affect findings from these studies, as the presence of tissue lesions caused by, for instance, parasite feeding activity and location (e.g. bloodfeeders *vs.* non blood-feeders and luminal *vs.* tissue dwellers) are likely to influence the timespan between helminth removal and microbiome recovery (reviewed by Leung *et al.*, 2018). Moreover, for ethical reasons, data from these experiments is often biased by the lack of placebo-treated control groups. These limitations may be at least partially responsible for the differences between findings from studies aimed at elucidating the effect of anthelmintic treatment on the gut microbiota of helminth-infected volunteers; notwithstanding, it is worth noting that, in instances where deworming-associated changes in human gut microbial profiles were detected, these were generally moderate (Ramanan *et al.*, 2016; Martin *et al.*, 2018; Schneeberger *et al.*, 2018*b*).

Consistent with this, a recent study conducted on faecal samples collected from a rural community in Indonesia reported that the composition of the gut microbiota of individuals repeatedly treated with either albendazole or placebo (for 21 months) resembled that of samples collected from the same subjects prior to treatment, rather than that of uninfected controls (Rosa et al., 2018). Moreover, a parallel investigation conducted on the same cohort of individuals detected reduced populations of Prevotella in albendazole-treated subjects in which complete deworming did not occur, compared to placebo-treated individuals with patent helminth infections (Martin et al., 2018). Intriguingly, failure of albendazole treatment was accompanied by a dominance of T. trichiura (over other helminth species) in these subjects, while placebo-treated individuals maintained a diverse macrobiota (i.e. infections by multiple helminths); hence, differences in the composition of the GI macrobiota (i.e. species present and their relative abundances) between albendazole- and placebo-treated individuals could account for variations in the composition of the intestinal microflora of these subjects (Martin et al., 2018). Significant associations between colonisation by T. trichiura and Prevotella abundance were not observed in the Indonesian cohort (Martin et al., 2018; Rosa et al., 2018). However, negative associations between whipworm infections and Prevotella abundance had been detected previously in two independent studies conducted in Malaysia (Lee et al., 2014; Ramanan et al., 2016). In particular, Ramanan and co-authors (2016) observed that, following albendazole treatment, expansion of Prevotella populations in the human faecal microbiota was related to reduced T. trichiura faecal egg counts. In contrast, no significant associations between helminth infection and abundance of Prevotella was reported in a study investigating the impact of parasite colonisation and successful treatment with a combination of albendazole and ivermectin on the faecal microbial profiles of a cohort of Trichurisinfected children from Ecuador (Cooper et al., 2013), nor in a group of helminth-infected adults from Sri Lanka treated with pyrantel pamoate (Jenkins et al., 2017). Similarly, no qualitative or quantitative changes to faecal microbial composition were observed in two cohorts of schoolchildren from Côte d'Ivoire and Zimbabwe infected by S. mansoni and S. haematobium, respectively, following treatment with praziquantel (Kay et al., 2015; Schneeberger et al., 2018a). However, successful elimination of S. mansoni was associated with a higher abundance of Fusobacterium spp. pre-treatment, as well as 24 h post-treatment (Schneeberger et al., 2018a).

Whilst drug administration in endemic regions may result in effective elimination of helminth infections, potential co-infecting protozoan parasites are not susceptible to anthelmintic treatment; this, together with the sub-standard hygienic and sanitary conditions that generally characterise these areas and that result in continuous re-exposure to infective helminth developmental stages (Campbell *et al.*, 2018), impairs the full assessment of the consequences of helminth removal on the composition of the human

gut microbiota. To the best of our knowledge, thus far, a single study has investigated the effects of chronic infections by a GI helminth, Strongyloides stercoralis, and anthelmintic treatment on the composition of the faecal microbiota and metabolome of humans from a non-endemic area of Europe, where parasite transmission had been interrupted (Jenkins et al., 2018b). Treatment with ivermectin resulted in compositional changes of the faecal microbiota (analysed 6 months post-treatment), which partially resembled that of uninfected control subjects (Jenkins et al., 2018b); in particular, alpha diversity [= a measure of the number of bacterial species present in a given microbial community (richness) and their relative abundance (evenness)] was reduced in the microbiota of individuals post-treatment (although statistical significance was not achieved) and accompanied by expanded populations of potentially pathogenic bacteria (Jenkins et al., 2018b). In addition, the faecal metabolic profiles obtained from samples collected post-ivermectin treatment shared features with both those obtained from samples collected pre-treatment and from uninfected controls (Jenkins et al., 2018b); this observation led Jenkins et al. (2018b) to hypothesise that, following parasite removal and over time, both gut microbiota and metabolome may revert to the original pre-infection state. Multiple factors, including but not limited to those outlined above, may contribute to the discrepancies observed between the findings from this work and those that reported no or minor effects of anthelmintic treatment on the gut microbiome of helminth-infected humans (Cooper et al., 2013; Ramanan et al., 2016; Martin et al., 2018; Rosa et al., 2018; Schneeberger et al., 2018a, 2018b).

Despite the limitations outlined above, studies of GI helminthmicrobiota relationships conducted in endemic areas for helminthiases have provided repeated evidence of the perturbations that parasites and anthelmintic treatment exert on the equilibrium of resident populations of bacteria and on gut homeostasis. However, the identification of common signatures across studies remains key to designing future experiments, e.g. in animal models of helminth infections, that may assist the elucidation of the mechanisms that underpin the interactions between GI helminths, the gut microbiota and the host immune system.

Do common signatures exist across studies of host-helminth-microbiota interactions?

The identification of gut microbial signatures that occur reproducibly across several host-GI helminth systems is crucial for designing novel anti-helminth intervention strategies based on the manipulation of the gut microbiota (Peachey et al., 2017). Studies conducted in animal models of helminth infections are expected to assist the identification of such signatures, as well as the direct (i.e. parasite-mediated) and/or indirect (i.e. immunemediated) mechanisms that govern helminth-microbiota interactions (Cortés et al., 2018); nevertheless, the inconsistencies that characterise studies of helminth-microbiota relationships published to date make such a task highly challenging. Indeed, for patterns to be identified, fluctuations in selected populations of gut microbes must be interpreted in light of the physical and immunological alterations of the mucosal environment in which such alterations occur (Leung et al., 2018). For instance, expanded populations of Lactobacillaceae have been repeatedly detected following infection with several species of parasitic helminths in multiple host species (Reynolds et al., 2014; Holm et al., 2015; Houlden et al., 2015; Cattadori et al., 2016; Duarte et al., 2016; Jenkins et al., 2018a; Kim et al., 2018), and could thus be considered as a 'consistent alteration' in gut microbiota composition upon helminth colonisation. However, key differences exist between host-parasite pairs investigated in the studies that have

reported such an outcome. Indeed, whilst populations of Lactobacillaceae promote regulatory responses in mice infected by Heligmosomoides polygyrus bakeri (Reynolds et al., 2014), a lack of correlation between Lactobacillaceae abundance and Treg populations has been observed in other host-parasites systems, such as mice chronically infected with T. muris and rabbits infected with Trichostrongylus retortaeformis, in which the expansion of populations of gut Lactobacillaceae upon helminth infection occurs in an environment dominated by Th1-mediated immune responses (Holm et al., 2015; Houlden et al., 2015; Cattadori et al., 2016). These differences suggest that alternative mechanisms may regulate the differentiation and development of adaptive immune responses in each host-parasite system (Houlden et al., 2015), and thus that similar alterations in gut microbiota composition may result in different consequences that are dependent on the microenvironment where these changes occur. Notwithstanding, the interactions between hosts, helminths and the gut microbiota are likely multifaceted and multidirectional, and therefore the potential consequences that selected compositional changes in gut microbiota exert on host homeostasis are only one aspect of this complex interplay. For instance, a common yet unidentified mechanism may determine the expansion of Lactobacillaceae in the gut of helminth-infected hosts.

On the other hand, apparent 'contradictory' findings across studies may result from fundamental differences between gut compartments under investigation. For instance, Prevotella spp. was expanded in the abomasum and faeces of sheep infected by abomasal trichostrongyles (i.e. Haemonchus contortus and Teladorsagia circumcincta; Li et al., 2016; Cortés et al., submitted), whilst the same taxa were reduced in the faeces of a range of host species, including mice, humans and horses, infected by nematodes residing in the large intestine, i.e. Trichuris spp. and cyathostomins, respectively (Lee et al., 2014; Houlden et al., 2015; Peachey et al., in press). It must be noted, however, that whilst increased abomasal pH favours Prevotella overgrowth in the abomasum (De Nardi et al., 2016; Li et al., 2016), the same taxa are likely to be exposed to a dramatically different microenvironment in the large intestine that may determine the contraction of these bacterial groups. In addition, given the functional dissimilarities between the abomasal and colonic microbiota, such alterations are expected to result in fundamentally different outcomes for the homeostasis of each of these gut compartments (Ley et al., 2008), and hence comparisons are, in our opinion, unwarranted.

In parallel to species of bacteria with functions that may vary depending on the gut compartment, multiple taxa share the same functions in different microenvironments (Lozupone et al., 2012); therefore, it is plausible that, even though inconsistencies are detected across studies, these may result in similar functional alterations in the host-parasite pairs being compared. For instance, recent studies in mouse and humans infected with S. mansoni have reported the expansion of different genera of bacteria with pro-inflammatory functions in the gut microbiota of the respective hosts (Jenkins et al., 2018a; Schneeberger et al., 2018a). These observations lend credit to the hypothesis that the functional role of the gut microbiota in helminth infections could be far less 'diverse' than the taxonomic associations reported thus far. For this hypothesis to be confirmed or confuted, a better understanding of the function(s) of each bacterial taxon inhabiting the different gut compartments in a range of host species is needed. To this aim, the integration of metagenomic, metabolomic and metatranscriptomic technologies, alongside traditional microbiology and microscopy techniques, may assist to achieve a holistic picture of the impact of GI helminth infections on the functions of the human gut microbiota, and its

significance for disease pathophysiology and overall host health (Wang *et al.*, 2015*b*).

Current needs and future directions

Understanding the complex interactions between GI helminths and their vertebrate hosts is pivotal for advancing our knowledge of the fundamental biology of these parasites and the diseases they cause (see Peachey et al., 2017; Leung et al., 2018; Rapin and Harris, 2018 for reviews). Whilst the role of the gut microbiota in host-parasite relationships has long been overlooked, current knowledge of the key roles that resident bacteria play in host health and disease, together with recent technical advancements for microbiota profiling, have boosted research is this area. This is currently leading to increasing evidence of a role for the gut microbiota in the immune regulatory properties of helminth parasites (cf. Cantacessi et al., 2014; Reynolds et al., 2014; Giacomin et al., 2015, 2016; Zaiss et al., 2015). In addition, data collected to date points towards a likely role of the gut microflora in the immunopathology of selected GI helminth infections that awaits experimental validation. Trying to untangle the relevance of particular fluctuations of specific bacterial taxa on infection outcome is challenging; nevertheless, currently available data suggest that low-intensity, chronic helminth infections are commonly linked to high microbial diversity and predominance of bacteria typically associated with gut health. Conversely, high-intensity, acute infections are often associated to gut dysbiosis, characterised by reduced alpha diversity and an increase in pro-inflammatory and often opportunistic pathogens (Peachey et al., 2017). However, for this knowledge to be exploited in translational studies, further investigations in both natural and experimental settings are needed to distinguish spurious results from genuine helminth-microbiota associations (Peachey et al., 2017), and mechanistic studies in animal models of helminth infections are necessary to dissect the causality of these relationships (cf. Cortés et al., 2018). Importantly, minimising variations between studies is crucial to warrant meaningful comparisons between datasets.

Whilst reducing the variability amongst samples collected from naturally helminth-infected humans may be difficult to achieve, the enormous impact that differences in technical and experimental approaches (from sample collection to bioinformatics and biostatistical analyses of high-throughput metagenomics sequence datasets) exert on the overall variation detected across studies can be reduced (Figs 1 and 2; Lindgreen et al., 2016; Costea et al., 2017; Golob et al., 2017). In particular, a range of bioinformatics pipelines are available for the analysis of highthroughput amplicon and whole metagenome sequence datasets that include, e.g., different sequence-processing tools and reference databases for sequence annotation that could yield slightly different results (Lindgreen et al., 2016; Golob et al., 2017). For instance, the use of validated open microbiome analysis packages such Multiplexed Analysis of Projections by Sequencing (MAPseq) (Matias Rodrigues et al., 2017) or QIIME2 (https:// qiime2.org/) may assist accurate taxonomic classifications of bacterial 16S rRNA amplicon datasets; similarly, sequence annotation should rely on the use of regularly updated reference databases. Amongst these, SILVA (https://www.arb-silva.de/) (Quast et al., 2013) enables sensitive annotations of bacterial rRNA sequence data (Almeida et al., 2018). The use of such standardized analysis workflows and reference databases for sequence annotation might prove extremely useful to increase consistency across studies and enable researchers to identify common and/or unique features between the gut microbiota of different host-parasite systems which, in turn, might assist to better understand the mechanisms that regulate helminth-microbiota relationships.

Population

- Balanced gender ratios
- Delimited age ranges
- Homogeneous socioeconomic status of study subjects
- Lifelong residence in the study area
- Comparison of similar populations across different geographical locations
 - History of recent anthelmintic and/or antibiotic treatment
- Inclusion of placebo-treated groups
- Assessment of potential effects of treatment on the gut microbiota
- Verification of infection clearance following anthelmintic treatment
- Multiple samplings post-treatment (longitudinal assessment of variations)

3 Treatment

2 Infection

- Diagnostic screening of intestinal and extra-intestinal bacterial, viral, and/or protozoan pathogens
- Estimation of infection intensities according to standardised scales (WHO 2006)
- Absence of clinical symptoms of gut and/or systemic diseases
- Suitable diagnostic tools for pathogen identification
- Sample size and statistical power calculation
- Standardised protocols for sample collection, storage, and nucleic acid extraction
- Standardised pipelines for bioinformatic and statistical analysis of sequence data

4 Methods

Fig. 2. Proposed approaches aimed at reducing the methodological sources of variation surrounding investigations of helminth-gut microbiota interactions.

The consequences that elucidating such mechanisms may exert on future strategies of parasite control are two-fold. First, disentangling the potential contribution of the gut flora to the pathogenesis of the infection is necessary in order to discover and develop new strategies to contrast helminth-associated pathology. Second, understanding the microbiota-dependent mechanisms by which parasitic helminths are able to modulate host immune responses and suppress inflammation may assist the discovery of novel immune-regulatory therapeutics against chronic inflammatory disorders of the GI tract that may act in synergy with helminth-based therapy (see Peachey et al., 2017 and Rapin and Harris, 2018 for reviews). However, in order for this new knowledge to be fully exploited in translational research, further studies that thoroughly consider inclusion/exclusion criteria for the selection of participants, include appropriate controls, and follow standardised experimental and data analysis protocols are necessary, and will allow to disentangle the potential influence of parasite-, drug- and/or population-dependent variables in each setting (Fig. 2).

Acknowledgements. The authors would like to thank Professor R. Stephen Phillips for helpful suggestions on the draft manuscript.

Financial support. AC is supported by a postdoctoral fellowship from Fundación Alfonso Martín Escudero (Madrid, Spain). LEP is supported by funding from the Horserace Betting Levy Board (HBLB) and TPJ by scholarships by the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council (BBSRC) of the United Kingdom. Research in the CC laboratory is supported by grants by the Royal Society and the Isaac Newton Trust.

Conflict of interest. None.

Ethical standards. Not applicable.

References

- Almeida A, Mitchell AL, Tarkowska A and Finn RD (2018) Benchmarking taxonomic assignments based on 16S rRNA gene profiling of the microbiota from commonly sampled environments. *GigaScience* 7, 1–10.
- Barbour AD and Kafetzaki M (1991) Modeling the overdispersion of parasite loads. Mathematical Biosciences 107, 249–253.
- Broadhurst MJ, Ardeshir A, Kanwar B, Mirpuri J, Gundra UM, Leung JM, Wiens KE, Vujkovic-Cvijin I, Kim CC, Yarovinsky F, Lerche NW, McCune JM and Loke P (2012) Therapeutic helminth infection of macaques with idiopathic chronic diarrhea alters the inflammatory signature and mucosal microbiota of the colon. *PLoS Pathogens* 8, e1003000.
- **Brosschot TP and Reynolds LA** (2018) The impact of a helminth-modified microbiome on host immunity. *Mucosal Immunology* **11**, 1039–1046.
- Campbell SJ, Biritwum NK, Woods G, Velleman Y, Fleming F and Stothard JR (2018) Tailoring water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH) targets for soil-transmitted helminthiasis and schistosomiasis control. *Trends in Parasitology* **34**, 53–63.
- Cantacessi C, Giacomin P, Croese J, Zakrzewski M, Sotillo J, McCann L, Nolan MJ, Mitreva M, Krause L and Loukas A (2014) Impact of

experimental hookworm infection on the human gut microbiota. *The Journal of Infectious Diseases* **210**, 1431–1434.

- Cattadori IM, Sebastian A, Hao H, Katani R, Albert I, Eilertson KE, Kapur V, Pathak A and Mitchell S (2016) Impact of helminth infections and nutritional constraints on the small intestine microbiota. *PLoS One* 11, e0159770.
- Chabé M, Lokmer A and Segurel L (2017) Gut protozoa: friends or foes of the human gut microbiota? *Trends in Parasitology* **33**, 925–934.
- Churcher TS, Ferguson NM and Basáñez MG (2005) Density dependence and overdispersion in the transmission of helminth parasites. *Parasitology* 131(Pt 1), 121–132.
- Cliffe LJ and Grencis RK (2004) The *Trichuris muris* system: a paradigm of resistance and susceptibility to intestinal nematode infection. *Advances in Parasitology* 57, 255–307.
- **Cooper P, Walker AW, Reyes J, Chico M, Salter SJ, Vaca M and Parkhill J** (2013) Patent human infections with the whipworm, *Trichuris trichiura*, are not associated with alterations in the faecal microbiota. *PLoS One* **8**, e76573.
- Cortés A, Toledo R and Cantacessi C (2018) Classic models for new perspectives: delving into helminth-microbiota-immune system interactions. *Trends in Parasitology* 34, 640–654.
- Cortés A, Wills J, Su X, Hewitt R, Scotti R, Robertson J, Price DRG, Bartley Y, McNeilly TN, Krause L, Powell JJ, Nisbet AJ, Cantacessi C (Submitted) Infection with the gastrointestinal nematode *Teladorsagia circumcincta* increases tissue T cell numbers and luminal pathobionts.
- Costea PI, Zeller G, Sunagawa S, Pelletier E, Alberti A, Levenez F, Tramontano M, Driessen M, Hercog R, Jung FE, Kultima JR, Hayward MR, Coelho LP, Allen-Vercoe E, Bertrand L, Blaut M, Brown JRM, Carton T, Cools-Portier S, Daigneault M, Derrien M, Druesne A, de Vos WM, Finlay BB, Flint HJ, Guarner F, Hattori M, Heilig H, Luna RA, van Hylckama Vlieg J, Junick J, Klymiuk I, Langella P, Le Chatelier E, Mai V, Manichanh C, Martin JC, Mery C, Morita H, O'Toole PW, Orvain C, Patil KR, Penders J, Persson S, Pons N, Popova M, Salonen A, Saulnier D, Scott KP, Singh B, Slezak K, Veiga P, Versalovic J, Zhao L, Zoetendal EG, Ehrlich SD, Dore J and Bork P (2017) Towards standards for human fecal sample processing in metagenomic studies. *Nature Biotechnology* 35, 1069–1076.
- De Nardi R, Marchesini G, Li S, Khafipour E, Plaizier KJ, Gianesella M, Ricci R, Andrighetto I and Segato S (2016) Metagenomic analysis of rumen microbial population in dairy heifers fed a high grain diet supplemented with dicarboxylic acids or polyphenols. BMC Veterinary Research 12, 29.
- Duarte AM, Jenkins TP, Latrofa MS, Giannelli A, Papadopoulos E, de Carvalho LM, Nolan MJ, Otranto D and Cantacessi C (2016) Helminth infections and gut microbiota – a feline perspective. *Parasites & Vectors* 9, 625.
- Giacomin P, Zakrzewski M, Croese J, Su X, Sotillo J, McCann L, Navarro S, Mitreva M, Krause L, Loukas A and Cantacessi C (2015) Experimental hookworm infection and escalating gluten challenges are associated with increased microbial richness in celiac subjects. *Scientific Reports* 5, 13797.
- Giacomin P, Zakrzewski M, Jenkins TP, Su X, Al-Hallaf R, Croese J, de Vries S, Grant A, Mitreva M, Loukas A, Krause L and Cantacessi C (2016) Changes in duodenal tissue-associated microbiota following hookworm infection and consecutive gluten challenges in humans with coeliac disease. Scientific Reports 6, 36797.
- Glendinning L, Nausch N, Free A, Taylor DW and Mutapi F (2014) The microbiota and helminths: sharing the same niche in the human host. *Parasitology* 141, 1255–1271.
- Golob JL, Margolis E, Hoffman NG and Fredricks DN (2017) Evaluating the accuracy of amplicon-based microbiome computational pipelines on simulated human gut microbial communities. *BMC Bioinformatics* 18, 283.
- Greetham HL, Gibson GR, Giffard C, Hippe H, Merkhoffer B, Steiner U, Falsen E and Collins MD (2004) *Allobaculum stercoricanis* gen. nov., sp. nov., isolated from canine feces. *Anaerobe* 10, 301–307.
- Holm JB, Sorobetea D, Kiilerich P, Ramayo-Caldas Y, Estelle J, Ma T, Madsen L, Kristiansen K and Svensson-Frej M (2015) Chronic *Trichuris muris* infection decreases diversity of the intestinal microbiota and concomitantly increases the abundance of Lactobacilli. *PLoS One* 10, e0125495.
- Hotez PJ, Alvarado M, Basanez MG, Bolliger I, Bourne R, Boussinesq M, Brooker SJ, Brown AS, Buckle G, Budke CM, Carabin H, Coffeng LE, Fevre EM, Furst T, Halasa YA, Jasrasaria R, Johns NE, Keiser J,

King CH, Lozano R, Murdoch ME, O'Hanlon S, Pion SD, Pullan RL, Ramaiah KD, Roberts T, Shepard DS, Smith JL, Stolk WA, Undurraga EA, Utzinger J, Wang M, Murray CJ and Naghavi M (2014) The global burden of disease study 2010: interpretation and implications for the neglected tropical diseases. *PLoS Neglected Tropical Diseases* 8, e2865.

- Houlden A, Hayes KS, Bancroft AJ, Worthington JJ, Wang P, Grencis RK and Roberts IS (2015) Chronic *Trichuris muris* infection in C57BL/6 mice causes significant changes in host microbiota and metabolome: effects reversed by pathogen clearance. *PLoS One* **10**, e0125945.
- Jenkins TP, Rathnayaka Y, Perera PK, Peachey LE, Nolan MJ, Krause L, Rajakaruna RS and Cantacessi C (2017) Infections by human gastrointestinal helminths are associated with changes in faecal microbiota diversity and composition. *PLoS One* **12**, e0184719.
- Jenkins TP, Peachey LE, Ajami NJ, MacDonald AS, Hsieh MH, Brindley PJ, Cantacessi C and Rinaldi G (2018a) *Schistosoma mansoni* infection is associated with quantitative and qualitative modifications of the mammalian intestinal microbiota. *Scientific Reports* **8**, 12072.
- Jenkins TP, Formenti F, Castro C, Piubelli C, Perandin F, Buonfrate D, Otranto D, Griffin JL, Krause L, Bisoffi Z and Cantacessi C (2018b) A comprehensive analysis of the faecal microbiome and metabolome of *Strongyloides stercoralis* infected volunteers from a non-endemic area. *Scientific Reports* **8**, 15651.
- Kay GL, Millard A, Sergeant MJ, Midzi N, Gwisai R, Mduluza T, Ivens A, Nausch N, Mutapi F and Pallen M (2015) Differences in the faecal microbiome in *Schistosoma haematobium* infected children vs. uninfected children. *PLoS Neglected Tropical Diseases* 9, e0003861.
- Kelly BJ, Gross R, Bittinger K, Sherrill-Mix S, Lewis JD, Collman RG, Bushman FD and Li H (2015) Power and sample-size estimation for microbiome studies using pairwise distances and PERMANOVA. *Bioinformatics* 31, 2461–2468.
- Kim JY, Kim EM, Yi MH, Lee J, Lee S, Hwang Y, Yong D, Sohn WM and Yong TS (2018) Intestinal fluke *Metagonimus yokogawai* infection increases probiotic *Lactobacillus* in mouse cecum. *Experimental Parasitology* 193, 45–50.
- Lee SC, Tang MS, Lim YA, Choy SH, Kurtz ZD, Cox LM, Gundra UM, Cho I, Bonneau R, Blaser MJ, Chua KH and Loke P (2014) Helminth colonization is associated with increased diversity of the gut microbiota. *PLoS Neglected Tropical Diseases* 8, e2880.
- Leung JM, Graham AL and Knowles SCL (2018) Parasite-microbiota interactions with the vertebrate gut: synthesis through an ecological lens. *Frontiers in Microbiology* 9, 843.
- Ley RE, Hamady M, Lozupone C, Turnbaugh PJ, Ramey RR, Bircher JS, Schlegel ML, Tucker TA, Schrenzel MD, Knight R and Gordon JI (2008) Evolution of mammals and their gut microbes. *Science* **320**, 1647–1651.
- Li RW, Li W, Sun J, Yu P, Baldwin RL and Urban JF (2016) The effect of helminth infection on the microbial composition and structure of the caprine abomasal microbiome. *Scientific Reports* **6**, 20606.
- Lindgreen S, Adair KL and Gardner PP (2016) An evaluation of the accuracy and speed of metagenome analysis tools. *Scientific Reports* 6, 19233.
- Lozupone CA, Stombaugh JI, Gordon JI, Jansson JK and Knight R (2012) Diversity, stability and resilience of the human gut microbiota. *Nature* **489**, 220–230.
- Martin I, Djuardi Y, Sartono E, Rosa BA, Supali T, Mitreva M, Houwing-Duistermaat JJ and Yazdanbakhsh M (2018) Dynamic changes in humangut microbiome in relation to a placebo-controlled anthelminthic trial in Indonesia. *PLoS Neglected Tropical Diseases* 12, e0006620.
- Matias Rodrigues JF, Schmidt TSB, Tackmann J and von Mering C (2017) MAPseq: highly efficient k-mer search with confidence estimates, for rRNA sequence analysis. *Bioinformatics* **33**, 3808–3810.
- Mutapi F (2015) The gut microbiome in the helminth infected host. *Trends in Parasitology* **31**, 405–406.
- O'Connell EM and Nutman TB (2016) Molecular diagnostics for soiltransmitted helminths. *The American Journal of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene* **95**, 508–513.
- Peachey LE, Jenkins TP and Cantacessi C (2017) This gut ain't big enough for both of us. Or is it? Helminth-microbiota interactions in veterinary species. *Trends in Parasitology* 33, 619–632.
- Peachey LE, Molena RA, Jenkins TP, Di Cesare A, Traversa D, Hodgkinson JE and Cantacessi C (2018) The relationships between faecal egg counts and gut microbial composition in UK thoroughbreds infected by cyathostomins. *International Journal for Parasitology* 48, 403–412.

- Peachey LE, Castro C, Molena RA, Jenkins TP, Griffin JL, Cantacessi C (In press) Dysbiosis associated with acute helminth infections in herbivorous youngstock observations and implications. *Sci Rep.*
- Pearce EJ and MacDonald AS (2002) The immunobiology of schistosomiasis. Nature Reviews Immunology 2, 499–511.
- Pérez-Muñoz ME, Bergstrom K, Peng V, Schmaltz R, Jiménez-Cardona R, Marsteller N, McGee S, Clavel T, Ley R, Fu J, Xia L and Peterson DA (2014) Discordance between changes in the gut microbiota and pathogenicity in a mouse model of spontaneous colitis. *Gut Microbes* 5, 286–295.
- Quast C, Pruesse E, Yilmaz P, Gerken J, Schweer T, Yarza P, Peplies J and Glöckner FO (2013) The SILVA ribosomal RNA gene database project: improved data processing and web-based tools. *Nucleic Acids Research* 41, 590–596.
- Ramanan D, Bowcutt R, Lee SC, Tang MS, Kurtz ZD, Ding Y, Honda K, Gause WC, Blaser MJ, Bonneau RA, Lim YA, Loke P and Cadwell K (2016) Helminth infection promotes colonization resistance via type 2 immunity. Science 352, 608–612.
- Rapin A and Harris NL (2018) Helminth-bacterial interactions: cause and consequence. *Trends in Immunology* **39**, 724–733.
- Rausch S, Held J, Fischer A, Heimesaat MM, Kühl AA, Bereswill S and Hartmann S (2013) Small intestinal nematode infection of mice is associated with increased enterobacterial loads alongside the intestinal tract. *PLoS One* 8, e74026.
- Reynolds LA, Smith KA, Filbey KJ, Harcus Y, Hewitson JP, Redpath SA, Valdez Y, Yebra MJ, Finlay BB and Maizels RM (2014) Commensalpathogen interactions in the intestinal tract: Lactobacilli promote infection with, and are promoted by, helminth parasites. *Gut Microbes* 5, 522–532.
- Rosa BA, Supali T, Gankpala L, Djuardi Y, Sartono E, Zhou Y, Fischer K, Martin J, Tyagi R, Bolay FK, Fischer PU, Yazdanbakhsh M and Mitreva M (2018) Differential human gut microbiome assemblages during soil-transmitted helminth infections in Indonesia and Liberia. *Microbiome* 6, 33-018-0416-5.
- Schneeberger PHH, Coulibaly JT, Panic G, Daubenberger C, Gueuning M, Frey JE and Keiser J (2018a) Investigations on the interplays between Schistosoma mansoni, praziquantel and the gut microbiome. Parasites & Vectors 11, 168.
- Schneeberger PHH, Coulibaly JT, Gueuning M, Moser W, Coburn B, Frey JE and Keiser J (2018b) Off-target effects of tribendimidine,

tribendimidine plus ivermectin, tribendimidine plus oxantel-pamoate, and albendazole plus oxantel-pamoate on the human gut microbiota. *International Journal for Parasitology Drugs and Drug Resistance* **8**, 372–378.

- Sekirov I, Russell SL, Antunes LC and Finlay BB (2010) Gut microbiota in health and disease. *Physiological Reviews* **90**, 859–904.
- Stensvold CR and van der Giezen M (2018) Associations between gut microbiota and common luminal intestinal parasites. *Trends in Parasitology* 34, 369–377.
- Su C, Su L, Li Y, Long SR, Chang J, Zhang W, Walker WA, Xavier RJ, Cherayil BJ and Shi HN (2018) Helminth-induced alterations of the gut microbiota exacerbate bacterial colitis. *Mucosal Immunology* 11, 144–157.
- Toro-Londono M, Bedoya-Urrego K, Garcia-Montoya GM, Galvan-Diaz AL and Alzate JF (2019) Intestinal parasitic infection alters bacterial gut microbiota in children. *PeerJ* 7, e6200.
- Wang J, Tang H, Zhang C, Zhao Y, Derrien M, Rocher E, van-Hylckama Vlieg JE, Strissel K, Zhao L, Obin M and Shen J (2015a) Modulation of gut microbiota during probiotic-mediated attenuation of metabolic syndrome in high fat diet-fed mice. *The ISME Journal* 9, 1–15.
- Wang WL, Xu SY, Ren ZG, Tao L, Jiang JW and Zheng SS (2015b) Application of metagenomics in the human gut microbiome. World Journal of Gastroenterology 21, 803–814.
- Wu S, Li RW, Li W, Beshah E, Dawson HD and Urban Jr JF (2012) Worm burden-dependent disruption of the porcine colon microbiota by *Trichuris* suis infection. PLoS One 7, e35470.
- Yatsunenko T, Rey FE, Manary MJ, Trehan I, Domínguez-Bello MG, Contreras M, Magris M, Hidalgo G, Baldassano RN, Anokhin AP, Heath AC, Warner B, Reeder J, Kuczynski J, Caporaso JG, Lozupone CA, Lauber C, Clemente JC, Knights D, Knight R and Gordon JI (2012) Human gut microbiome viewed across age and geography. Nature 486, 222–227.
- Zaiss MM, Rapin A, Lebon L, Dubey LK, Mosconi I, Sarter K, Piersigilli A, Menin L, Walker AW, Rougemont J, Paerewijck O, Geldhof P, McCoy KD, Macpherson AJ, Croese J, Giacomin PR, Loukas A, Junt T, Marsland BJ and Harris NL (2015) The Intestinal microbiota contributes to the ability of helminths to modulate allergic inflammation. *Immunity* 43, 998–1010.