

VOLUME 17
NUMBER 3
SEPTEMBER 1994

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

Characteristics of dissociable human learning systems David R. Shanks
& Mark F. St. John

Two functional components of the hippocampal memory system
Howard Eichenbaum, Tim Otto & Neal J. Cohen

Multiple book review of *The Creative Mind: Myths and Mechanisms*
Margaret A. Boden

Also, Continuing Commentary on

"Multiple book review of *How Monkeys See the World*" (Cheney & Seyfarth)

"Age preferences in mates reflect sex differences in human reproductive strategies" (Kenrick & Keefe)

CAMBRIDGE

ISSN 0140-525X

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad

E-mail: harnad@clarity.princeton.edu or
harnad@pucc.bitnet
20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08542

Managing Editor

Nancy Simon

Chief Copy Editor

Avis Kniffin

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

Computational Neuroscience

Stephen Grossberg/Boston U.

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Philip Johnson-Laird/Princeton

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics

Robert Freidin/Princeton

Neurobiology

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

Neurobehavioral Genetics

Wim E. Crusio/Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London
John C. Marshall/Radcliffe Infirmary, Oxford

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Perception

Bruce Bridgeman/U. California
Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

Philosophy of Science

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh
Massimo Piatelli-Palmarini/MIT

Primatology

Horst D. Steklis/Rutgers

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (222 Rosewood Dr., Danvers, MA 01923). Orga-

nizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price for institutions of Volume 17 (1994) is US \$210.00 net in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £141.00 in the rest of the world; for individuals US \$85.00 net (£57.00); for BBS Associates and for students (in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico only) with proof of eligibility with order US \$49.00 net (£36.00); for APA, APS, and ASA members US \$68.00 net (£36.00) with proof of eligibility with order. Subscription price includes postage.

Single parts cost US \$54.00 net (£36.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y., and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 17:3 September 1994

Shanks, D. R. & St. John, M. F. Characteristics of dissociable human learning systems	367
Open Peer Commentary	
Andrade, J. Is learning during anaesthesia implicit?	395
Baeyens, F., De Houwer, J. & Eelen, P. Awareness inflated, evaluative conditioning underestimated	396
Berry, D. C. A step too far?	397
Bornstein, R. F. Are subliminal mere exposure effects a form of implicit learning?	398
Brody, N. & Crowley M. J. Of what are we aware?	399
Carlson, R. A. Is implicit learning about consciousness?	400
Catania, A. C. The aware pigeon	400
Cleeremans, A. Awareness and abstraction are graded dimensions	402
Dienes, Z. & Perner, J. Dissociable definitions of consciousness	403
Ennen, E. Implicit practical learning	404
Goldstone, R. L. & Kruschke, J. K. Are rules and instances subserved by separate systems?	405
Holyoak, K. J. & Gattis, M. Implicit assumptions about implicit learning	406
Howe, M. L. & Rabinowitz, F. M. Development, learning, and consciousness	407
Kimmel, H. D. Human autonomic conditioning without awareness	408
Kourtzi, Z., Oliver, L. M. & Gluck, M. A. Can procedural learning be equated with unconscious learning or rule-based learning?	408
Lachter, J. Consciousness in natural language and motor learning	409
Lindsay, R. O. & Gorayska, B. Tacit knowledge and verbal report: On sinking ships and saving babies	410
Marsolek, C. J. Implementational constraints on human learning and memory systems	411
Merikle, P. M. On the futility of attempting to demonstrate null awareness	412
Nagata, H. Faulty rationale for the two factors that dissociate learning systems	412
Overskeid, G. The intuitive mind	414
Packard, M. G. Dissociating multiple memory systems: Don't forsake the brain	414
Perruchet, P. & Gallego, J. What about unconscious processing during the test?	415
Poldrack, R. A. & Cohen, N. J. On the representational/computational properties of multiple memory systems	416
Rakover, S. S. Learning without awareness: What counts as an appropriate test of learning and of awareness	417
Reber, A. S. & Winter, B. What manner of mind is this?	418
Reed, J. & Johnson, P. New evidence for unconscious sequence learning	419
Rizzo, A. & Parlangei, O. Learning strategies and situated knowledge	420
Seger, C. A. Criteria for implicit learning: Deemphasize conscious access, emphasize amnesia	421
Squire, L. R., Hamann, S. & Knowlton, B. Dissociable learning and memory systems of the brain	422
Stadler, M. A. & Frensch, P. A. Whither learning, whither memory?	423
Svartdal, F. Is awareness necessary for operant conditioning?	424
Terrace, H. S. Are infants human?	425
Willingham, D. B. On the creation of classification systems of memory	426
Authors' Response	
Shanks, D. R. & St. John, M. F. How should implicit learning be characterized?	427
Eichenbaum, H., Otto, T. & Cohen, N. J. Two functional components of the hippocampal memory system	449
Open Peer Commentary	
Aggleton, J. P. Is Eichenbaum et al.'s proposal testable and how extensive is the hippocampal memory system?	472
Bingman, V. P. Remembering spatial cognition as a hippocampal functional component	473
Bolhuis, J. J. & Reid, I. C. The hippocampal system, time, and memory representations	474
Brown, M. W. Recording the recognition due to the parahippocampal region places hippocampal relational encoding in context	474
Fuster, J. M. In search of the engrammer	476
Gluck, M. A., Myers, C. E. & Goebel, J. K. A computational perspective on dissociating hippocampal and entorhinal function	476
Good, M. A. & Morris, R. G. M. A step linking memory to understanding?	477
Gray, J. A., Sinden, J. & Hodges, H. Psychoarithmetic or pick your own?	478
Grossberg, S. Hippocampal modulation of recognition, conditioning, timing, and space: Why so many functions?	479
Hampson, R. E. & Deadwyler, S. A. Hippocampal representations of DMS/DNMS in the rat	480
Horel, J. A. The localization of general memory functions	482
Humphreys, M. S. & Dennis, S. Going from task descriptions to memory structures	483
Jarrard, L. E. A call for greater concern regarding the underlying anatomy	483
Katz, D. B. & Steinmetz, J. E. How long do relational representations in the hippocampus last during classical eyelid conditioning?	484
Kesner, R. P. Hippocampus and memory for time	485
Mayes, A. R. What exactly do amnesics fail to store normally?	486
McNaughton, N. The hippocampus: Relational processor or antiprocessor?	487
Miller, E. K. Neocortical memory traces	488
Murray, E. A. Relational but not spatial memory: The task at hand	489
Nadel, L. Hippocampus, space, and relations	490
Rapp, P. R. Functional components of the hippocampal memory system: Implications for future learning and memory research in nonhuman primates	491
Rawlins, J. N. P., Deacon, R. M. J., Yee, B. K. & Cassaday, H. J. Does it still make sense to develop a declarative memory theory of hippocampal function?	492

Shapiro, M. L. From Heisenberg's cat to Eichenbaum's rat: Uncertainty in predicting the neural requirements for animal behavior	493	Tulving, E. & Markowitsch, H. J. What do animal models of memory model?	498
Solomon, P. R. & Yang, B.-Y. What are the best strategies for understanding hippocampal function?	494	Wilson, F. A. W. Hippocampal neuronal activity in rat and primate: Memory and movement	499
Squire, L. R., Zola-Morgan, S. & Alvarez, P. Functional distinctions within the medial temporal lobe memory system: What is the evidence?	495	Authors' Response	
Suzuki, W. A. What can neuroanatomy tell us about the functional components of the hippocampal memory system?	496	Eichenbaum, H., Otto, T. & Cohen, N. J. The hippocampal memory system and its functional components: Further explication and clarification	500

Boden, M. A. Précis of *The creative mind: Myths and mechanisms* 519

Open Peer Commentary

Adams-Price, C. Can artificial intelligence explain age changes in literary creativity?	532	O'Rourke, J. The generative-rules definition of creativity	547
Bringsjord, S. Lady Lovelace had it right: Computers originate nothing	532	Pind, J. Computational creativity: What place for literature?	547
Bundy, A. What is the difference between real creativity and mere novelty?	533	Ram, A., Domeshek, E., Wills, L., Nersessian, N. & Kolodner, J. Creativity is in the mind of the creator	549
Burns, B. D. Analogy programs and creativity	535	Rehkämper, K. Imagery and creativity	550
Campbell, R. L. On doing the impossible	535	Rowe, J. Creativity: Metarules and emergent systems	550
Dartnall, T. Creativity, combination, and cognition	537	Shames, V. A. & Kihlstrom, J. F. Respecting the phenomenology of human creativity	551
Donald, M. Computation: Part of the problem of creativity	537	Simonton, D. K. Individual differences, developmental changes, and social context	552
Dunbar, K. & Baker, L. M. Goals, analogy, and the social constraints of scientific discovery	538	Sternberg, R. J. Can computers be creative, or even disappointed?	553
Fetzer, J. H. Creative thinking presupposes the capacity for thought	539	Treisman, M. Creativity: Myths? Mechanisms?	554
Flor, N. V. What about everyday creativity?	540	van der Maas, H. L. J. & Molenaar, P. C. M. The empirical detection of creativity	555
Fulford, K. W. M. Creativity, madness, and extra-strong AI	542	Weisberg, R. W. The creative mind versus the creative computer	555
Gabora, L. M. The birth of an idea	543	Żytkow, J. M. Machine discoverers: Transforming the spaces they explore	557
Garnham, A. Art for art's sake	543	Author's Response	
Gilhooly, K. J. Creativity theory: Detail and testability	544	Boden, M. A. Creativity: A framework for research	558
Grasshoff, G. The historical basis of scientific discovery	545		
Ippolito, M. F. Conscious thought processes and creativity	546		

Continuing Commentary

On Cheney, D. L. & Seyfarth, R. M. (1992) Précis of *How monkeys see the world*. BBS 15:135–182. 571

Bekoff, M., Townsend, S. E. & Jamieson, D. Beyond monkey minds: Toward a richer cognitive ethology	571	Authors' Response	
Gallup, Jr., G. G. Monkeys, mirrors, and minds	572	Cheney, D. & Seyfarth, R. Mirrors and the attribution of mental states	574
Povinelli, D. J. A theory of mind is in the head, not the heart	573		

On Kenrick, D. T. & Keefe, R. C. (1992) Age preferences in mates reflect sex differences in human reproductive strategies. BBS 15:75–133. 578

Waller, N. G. Individual differences in age preferences in mates	578	Authors' Response	
Response to Waller, N. G. by Buss, D. M. Individual differences in mating strategies	581	Kenrick, D. T. & Keefe, R. C. Gender and sexual orientation: Why the different age preferences?	582