

could have done more to create greater consistency between articles on similar topics. María Jesús Fuente's assertions that Jewish women in Visigothic Iberia compensated in their homes for the closure of synagogues and Talmudic schools [*sic*] (pp. 280–1) sit very uneasily with Raúl González Salinero's alignment with the camp which argues that the Jews of Visigothic Iberia effectively had no Hebrew. Salinero concludes that when Julian of Toledo (†690) referred to *codices Hebraeorum* or *codices Hebraici* he probably meant Jewish works written in Latin (pp. 198–203). For her part, Bat-Sheva Albert interprets the *Placitum* of 637 which identifies some Jewish texts as *Deuteras* as demonstrating that Jews in Visigothic Iberia were acquainted with the Mishna (p. 190). I do not think that the brief allusion to Salinero's position in the conclusion deals with this issue adequately.

Highlights of the volume include the way in which Céline Martins uncovers the shades of personal freedom and the lack thereof in Visigothic Iberia. Some freemen were freer than others; conversely a Visigothic *servus* had more legal options than a Roman one would have had. In post-Roman Hispania reducing a free person to servile status was a punishment used to commute the death penalty required by Roman law for crimes against the state. Seen in this context, what is so very startling in the Visigothic 'enslavement' of Jews in 694 was that all Jews were reduced to servile status without a trial. Rachel Stocking sheds welcome light on canon 10 of the Council of Seville (c. 624) which more and more scholars are beginning to recognise as authentic. The canon deals with attempts made by forcibly-converted Jews to avoid baptising their children. What is so remarkable is that the bishops seemed to endorse Sisibut's forced conversion of the Jews. At the Fourth Council of Toledo in 633 the bishops upheld the forced conversions which had occurred, even as they declared that no one should be forced to convert. For his part Philippe Depreux argues convincingly that the much maligned *Capitula de Iudeis* may have originated in the court of Charlemagne or Louis the Pious after all. Johannes Heil makes a very good case for reading the canons concerning Jews in Burchard's *Decretum* (c. 1012) in the light of the bishop of Worms's eschatological expectations. And Paul Magdalino makes clear how important it is to take account of the eschatological expectations of Byzantine emperors such as Heraclius (d. 641) as well as contemporary Jewish messianic hopes to make sense of imperial interaction with the Jewish community.

LADY MARGARET HALL,  
OXFORD

ANNA SAPIR ABULAFIA

*Ecclesia et violentia. Violence against the Church and violence within the Church in the Middle Ages.* Edited by Radoslaw Kotecki and Jacek Maciejewski. Pp. xiii + 360. Newcastle-upon-Tyne: Cambridge Scholars, 2014. £52.99. 978 1 4438 6659 0

*JEH* (67) 2016; doi:10.1017/S0022046915002961

The Latin term 'violentia' derives from 'vis', meaning 'force', 'vigour' and 'power', and is defined in dictionaries as 'violence', 'vehemence', 'impetuosity' and 'ferocity'. It occurs only four times in the Bible, all in the Old Testament, and was comparatively rare in the Middle Ages. It does not appear at all in

Niermeyer's *Mediae Latinitatis lexicon minus*. In English 'violence' implies the use of physical force, but its precise meaning varies. Scholars see a spectrum of violence in society and in history, going from war and combat at one end and to self-control and cooperation at the other, with many variations in between. It is common today to refer to the Middle Ages as a violent society in which a 'culture of violence' prevailed. Although the medieval Church is sometimes seen as a haven of peace, it is presented here as 'immersed in violence' (p. 1) and as fully part, and often the source and cause, of violence.

This volume contains nineteen articles by writers from nine different countries, including seven from Poland and five from the United States, and is divided into four sections on violence against the Church (four articles), violence within the Church (six articles), the Church in a violent world (four articles), and cultural perceptions of violence (five articles), which has one article on 'Rough sex and rape in the *Carmina Burana*', with no specific bearing on the Church. They could be reclassified as concerned with violence respectively against the Church and by the Church. The subject matter ranges in date from the sixth to the fifteenth century and covers almost all of Europe, from Spain, England, France, and Italy in the west to Norway in the north and Poland, Silesia, Bohemia, Hungary and Croatia in the east. According to the editors in the introduction 'The central question the authors are trying to reconcile is how the phenomenon of violence interacted with the most important medieval institution and official Church thinking regarding concepts such as power, rank, feudal loyalty and protection or ownership' (p. 6). The introduction also includes useful brief summaries of each of the articles. Together they throw light on many different aspects of violence in the Middle Ages.

An interesting typology of violence both against and by the Church could be compiled on the basis of these articles. It would vary to some extent from region to region, since violence was recorded differently in different places and sources. Some sorts of violence were universally condemned, but others were regarded as normal and even acceptable, such as the ritual violence of the *ius spoli* after the death of a prelate, electoral depredation and *plunderbacchanales* 'as the "embodiment" of legitimate power' (p. 67). Other violence was based on legal grounds and arose from a prelate's recognised secular obligations, which included judicial responsibilities and military service owed to a ruler. The recent work of Lawrence Duggan on *Armsbearing and the clergy*, which studies especially the canonical aspects of clerical arms-bearing, though cited here, appeared too late to be taken fully into consideration. Many bishops and abbots throughout the Middle Ages, and in modern times, bore arms both in self-defence and as a result of their feudal positions. In the case of Henry II's son Geoffrey, who was archbishop of York, the most important determinant of his reputation was 'the cause that he was supporting, rather than his actual behaviour' (p. 140).

It is not always possible to distinguish judicial violence, liturgical violence, the threat of violence, or even silent violence and what may be called 'non-violent violence'. 'It was also a game of power and domination, with silent violence leading to the suppression of some people and ideas and the promotion of others' (p. 349). Among the monks of St Gall, for instance, the threat of violence replaced violence itself. 'In their interaction with the community of their victims, the fear of the guilty

person should be a sufficient form of punishment' (p. 101). The patterns of violence changed over the years and the same act of violence was regarded in various ways. 'The use of conflict as a rhetorical tool was very effective' (p. 251), and the motives for recording violence varied according to the circumstances. The case of Pope Formosus illustrates 'the violence of de-symbolisation', in which the exhumation of Formosus and his posthumous trial and humiliation were 'part of an effort to undo his symbolic existence' (p. 208).

Among other types of violence discussed here are 'holy' violence in the forcible conversion of pagans, mimetic violence (imitating the violent actions of others), and the use of violence to compel entry into a religious community and to keep members there. Clerical and monastic life were permeated with violence, both potential and actual. Endless complaints were brought before popes and bishops, and also secular authorities, about violent behaviour in churches and monasteries. Monks and nuns were physically punished by whipping and by imprisonment for offences ranging from apostasy to relatively minor breaches of discipline, which brought to light the underlying tensions of religious life (p. 86).

An interesting chapter is devoted to the defence of their rights by saints who violently punished, or threatened with punishment, anyone who violated their shrines or relics. They appeared to the perpetrators in visions and dreams threatening death and damnation unless they desisted from their misdeeds and made reparation. Holy men were also known to threaten and sometimes strike their enemies. Their violence can be described as 'holy violence' or 'the earthly manifestation of divine jurisdiction' (p. 255) by which the will of God was enforced.

The articles are for the most part fully annotated, but since there is no bibliography it is sometimes hard to locate a specific book or article. More serious is the lack of an index, which could have guided the reader to common themes. Some of the articles would have benefitted from more careful editing and proof-reading. The first name Lucien in p. 287 n. 12 should be Marie, Luno and Osnabrück on p. 298 should be Leno and Osnabrück, and Pourgin on p. 307 n. 52 should be Bourgin. As a whole, however, this volume makes a useful and interesting contribution to an important subject.

INSTITUTE FOR ADVANCED STUDY,  
PRINCETON

GILES CONSTABLE

*Holy treasure and sacred song. Relic cults and their liturgies in medieval Tuscany.* By Benjamin Brand. Pp. xxiii + 296 incl. 16 music examples, 20 figs and 5 tables. New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014. £32.99. 978 0 19 935135 0  
*JEH* (67) 2016; doi:10.1017/S0022046915002626

How and for what reasons were medieval liturgies honouring saints of regional interest constructed? How did these texts and their music relate to the wider concerns of the worshipping communities which created them? Benjamin Brand considers these and other enduring questions in the case of the dioceses of medieval Tuscany in the early and central Middle Ages. He shows that the liturgical material for saints including Donatus, Minias, Zenobius and Fridian are not merely interesting for their own