

who, especially in relation to Trito-Isaiah, posited ideas as being the property of different rival groups. Whilst ideas never emerge in a complete abstract vacuum, some of the attempts to ground these similarities in actual situations seems a bit fanciful at times – ultimately these reconstructions have no firm basis. However, Blenkinsopp has shown in this fascinating bringing together of two major texts of the Hebrew Bible how ideas intersect across our different ‘genre groupings’ of books (prophecy/psalms) to which we have become too tied in the past. We are wrong also to think that genres eventuate in separate groups of people – perhaps Blenkinsopp is right that, for ancient psalmists and prophets alike, in their attention to ‘the beauty of holiness’ there was a meeting of minds and of musical rejoicing.

doi:10.1017/S0036930619000425

Thomas G. Guarino, *The Disputed Teachings of Vatican II: Continuity and Reversal in Catholic Doctrine*

(Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans, 2018), pp. ix + 214.
\$28.00.

Gregory A. Ryan

Department of Theology and Religion, Durham University, Durham (g.a.ryan@durham.ac.uk)

‘Was Vatican II a proper development or a pernicious corruption of the prior doctrinal tradition?’ This is the question which animates Thomas Guarino’s latest book. As the author of several nuanced, even eirenic, books which seek to defend a material continuity in Catholic doctrine whilst allowing for certain types of development and reformulation, Guarino is well-placed to attempt an answer. Indeed, ideas from his major works appear throughout this accessible volume, such as defending a distinction between form and content as the essential means of preserving material identity when doctrines are cast into new language and relationships. Although Newman inevitably makes an appearance in the discussion, it is Vincent of Lerins – the subject of a previous book by Guarino – who provides the author with his foundational hermeneutic for assessing the status of Vatican II as *profectus* or *permutatio*.

The structure is straightforward. The first chapter introduces the basic question of continuity and rupture, and chapter 2 sets out some ‘foundational theological principles for understanding Vatican II’. Whilst this might sound like the author is going to name the core doctrinal landmarks, it is in fact best read as ‘principles of foundational (i.e. fundamental) theology’. Thus Guarino sets out a framework involving the nature of doctrinal statements, including the largely abandoned role of ‘theological notes’, the distinction of mutable form from essential content, the legitimacy and boundaries of ecclesial pluralism, the possibility of reversals of prior church teaching, and the right use of philosophical and cultural ‘spoils from Egypt’. These are familiar tropes from his earlier work, and are succinctly summarised here. Chapter 3 usefully explores the proper use of three key terms: development, *ressourcement* and *aggiornamento*.

The final two chapters then engage with specific controverted topics. Chapter 5 gives an account of the conciliar debates on collegiality, revelation and religious freedom, making the well-rehearsed case that that none of the Council teachings on these topics overturned core Catholic doctrine, whilst also acknowledging the legitimate development and even reversal of ordinary magisterial teaching. Chapter 4 on the other hand includes a number of interesting contributions which makes this volume more than a useful primer on continuity at Vatican II. In this chapter and elsewhere Guarino draws heavily on the journals of Gérard Philips, adjunct secretary to the Theological Commission. Less well-known than Congar and Rahner, Philips exerted considerable influence as the architect of several key documents. This is a welcome English-language appreciation of Philips' contribution even if his voice tends to dominate the analysis at times.

The central idea in this chapter is that, although the pastoral nature of Vatican II meant that scholastic language was set aside, Thomistic ideas still influenced the thinking of the Council. Partly historically, but more from his own theological perspective, Guarino argues that participation and analogy are essential tools for understanding continuity and development in the Council's teaching on priesthood, on Mary and on ecumenism. Thus 'it is never a matter of *either* the ministerial priesthood *or* the universal priesthood of the baptized. The council seeks to preserve *both* priesthoods, upholding each one's unique participation in the one priesthood of Jesus Christ' (p. 75). Similarly, the role of Mary and the saints as mediators is only possible because of participation in the unique mediator, Jesus Christ. There are important implications for ecumenism in this style of reasoning, as the participation of other Christian churches in the one Church of Christ is viewed as formal, not simply metaphorical, and Guarino sets out a reading of *Lumen Gentium* 8 that the church of Christ 'subsists in' (*subsistit in*) the Catholic Church along these lines.

Who is the book aimed at? The introduction says that the book is intended primarily for theology students, and a comment that there is a 'sense, sometimes vague and ambiguous that the council engaged in a significant rupture with the prior doctrinal tradition' (p. 24) suggests that Guarino may be correcting a popular misconception among students more than critiquing a serious contemporary theological opinion. Certainly as an apology for continuity, it is a calm, reasoned contribution, and as an introduction to the doctrinal dynamics of Vatican II it is a model of clarity, although relying heavily on a small number of selected sources. With Guarino's creative exploration of analogical reasoning this volume will also be of interest to theologians and ecumenists, especially those dealing with issues of plurality and legitimate diversity.

doi:10.1017/S0036930619000516