

descended from King Yusuf IV. This section also includes a remarkable and well-documented chapter authored by Nicola Jennings on the artistic patronage of some fifteenth-century *converso* families of Jewish origin. This inspiring paper studies artistic patronage as an element in the political, social and religious promotion of some powerful *conversos*.

The last part of the book focuses on the visual representation of Islam – identified with Ottoman Turkey – in the Iberian Peninsula and in some Italian states during the early modern period. Several chapters consider the image of the Turk in ephemeral art, sculpture and painting and architecture. Logically, Charles V's victory in Tunis in 1535 and the Battle of Lepanto provided the main motifs for representing defeated Turks, although the political meanings of these images could change due to different circumstances and times, as studied in their respective papers by Borja Franco and Francisco García, Cristelle Baskins and Giuseppe Capriotti. Finally, Laura Stagno's chapter is truly remarkable, because of its chronological width and its emphasis on the plurality and complexity of interpretations of the image of the Turk in Genoa.

To sum up, religious, political and racial overlapping and changing identities are analysed through a range of artistic elements, from ephemeral art to engravings, from *stucco* decoration to paintings, in this diverse and suggestive book.

UNIVERSIDAD COMPLUTENSE DE MADRID

ANA ISABEL LÓPEZ-SALAZAR

Luther at Leipzig. Martin Luther, the Leipzig debate, and the sixteenth-century Reformations.

Edited by Mickey L. Mattox, Richard J. Serina Jr and Jonathan Mumme. (Studies in Medieval and Reformation Traditions, 218.) Pp. xiv + 348 incl. 5 colour ills. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2019. €129. 978 90 04 41462 4; 1573 4188 JEH (72) 2021; doi:10.1017/S0022046920002900

The formal academic disputation held 1519 in Leipzig brought together the German theologians, John Eck, Martin Luther and Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt. Unlike Luther's 1517 Ninety-Five Theses, which had been published and widely disseminated but not formally debated, in 1519 Eck debated the Wittenbergers face-to-face, challenging theological positions taught at the university in Wittenberg. This collection asserts the importance of the debate and its implications for the Reformation both then and now.

The editors' introduction traces treatment of these debates from the nineteenth-century view that the disputation was critically important (p. 2) to a later view that the debate was 'little more than a crystallization of ideas rather than a sea change' (p. 3). The editors argue that more scholarship is needed, seeking with this collection 'to fill that gap in English scholarship' (p. 5).

Part I has six essays focused on the context and content of the debate. Volker Leppin and Mickey Mattox argue that the debate is a dramatic turning point for the Reformation. A key question was whether the pope ruled in the Church as a matter of divine law. This called into question the authority of Scripture (p. 11). Medieval papal and conciliar disputes provided context for the different theological positions of all three theologians (pp. 21–5), but the debates themselves highlighted differences that led 'to the formation of the Scripture principle' (p. 28). The second chapter (Alyssa Lehr Evans) focuses on the role of Karlstadt

and his defence of the Wittenberg theology. While exchanges between Eck and Luther on papal authority are often remembered, this chapter advances Karlstadt's defence of the university 'by strongly opposing scholasticism and publicly advancing an Augustinian understanding of the will, grace, and salvation' (p. 37). Henning Bühmann summarises the disputation culture of the sixteenth century, while Thomas M. Izbicki recaps the papacy's attitude toward conciliarism as context for the Leipzig debate. Part I closes with chapters on the importance of Scripture and authority at Leipzig (Ian Christopher Levy) and the implications of canon law for Luther's thirteenth proposition (Richard J. Serina Jr.).

Implications of the disputation – both then and now – are emphasised in part II. Timothy Wengert asserts that Philip Melancthon's quickly penned report on these events elevated Luther's standing among humanist intellectuals, even though others viewed Eck as the winner of the debate (p. 172). Bernward Schmidt reveals differences between Eck and Luther that would lead to divisions in the Church (p. 216). Chapters ix and x (Phillip Haberkern and Paul Robinson respectively) focus on Luther's adoption of elements of the theology of Jan Hus, and Luther's developing understanding of the role of church councils which led to his principle of Scripture alone (p. 263). Jonathan Mumme argues that Luther's ecclesiology as put forward at Leipzig nearly aligns with Luther's later writings. The final chapter (Michael Root) sees the Roman Catholic reception of the debate as offering possibilities for modern ecumenical discussions.

This collection does what it intended, helping to fill the gap in English scholarship on the Leipzig debate. Carefully footnoted with bibliographies following each essay, the collection is a scholar's delight. Perhaps the most important contribution to such scholarship is the appendix with original English translations of select portions of the disputation by Carl D. Roth and Richard J. Serina Jr.

CONCORDIA UNIVERSITY-SAINT PAUL,
MINNESOTA

SUZANNE HEQUET

Die Leipziger Disputation von 1519. Ein theologisches Streitgespräch und seine Bedeutung für die Frühe Reformation. Edited by Markus Hein and Armin Kohnle. (Herbergen der Christenheit, 25.) Pp. 272 incl. 57 ill. Leipzig: Evangelische Verlagsanstalt, 2019. €34. 978 3 374 06244 7

JEH (72) 2021; doi:10.1017/S0022046920002808

The 1519 Leipzig Disputation was a formal scholarly debate between the Roman Catholic theologian Johannes Eck, and the Wittenberg theologians Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt and Martin Luther. The five-hundredth anniversary of that debate prompted the publication of this book, which includes essays from an earlier publication.

The earlier volume was the result of work on the disputation that was presented in Leipzig in 2009. Essays from that meeting were published in a 2011 collection entitled *Die Leipziger Disputation 1519, I: Leipziger Arbeitsgespräch zur Reformation*. In her review of that book, Amy Nelson Burnett concluded that the volume adequately summarised the state of existing scholarship, but she also pointed to the absence of an essay on Karlstadt's role in the debate, while hoping for new