

PSYCHIATRIC EDUCATION

Survey of Undergraduate Psychiatric Teaching in the United Kingdom (1966-1967)

By G. M. CARSTAIRS, H. J. WALTON, J. R. SMYTHIES and A. H. CRISP

INTRODUCTION

The conduct of this survey has brought home to us the great diversity which exists in the amount, content and methods of teaching psychiatry in U.K. medical schools today. No two schools are quite alike in the type of staff facilities, in the allocation of teaching time in the several years of the course, or in the persons available to act as teachers. After two trial runs, we evolved a schedule of inquiry which has enabled us to compare schools in a number of respects in which reasonably reliable and quantifiable data were available. This report necessarily concentrates upon those aspects in which the various schools can be compared with each other: it does not do justice to the full detail of all the teaching given in any one school. In particular, we have deliberately confined our attention to teaching which is given to *all* students, whether they take advantage of it or not. Except for some observations on organized periods of elective study, we have not dealt with the extra opportunities which are available in a number of schools for students who go out of their way to seek additional experience in psychiatry. Our schedule of inquiry was discussed by one of us personally with the psychiatrist responsible for teaching in every school except one—a London part-time teacher who remained obdurately “too busy” to comply with this request. It was found necessary, in the majority of cases, to supplement our interview and the schedule return by further inquiries; in a few particulars, and in respect of certain schools, we are still left in some uncertainty as to the accuracy of the information given to us. This report is submitted, however, as the best approximation possible within the limitations of our survey.

NUMBERS OF STUDENTS IN THE CLINICAL YEARS

The clinical year in London Medical Schools has a mean size of 80, range 45-120.

That in the provincial schools has a mean of 93, range 32-173 students.

The total number of students in a clinical year throughout Britain is 2,271, with a mean of 87 students per school.

In *London* there are four relatively small schools: Westminster (60), King's College (65), Charing Cross (45) and St. George's (60). The four largest are St. Bartholomew's (120), Guy's and Middlesex (100 each) and the Royal Free (90). Of the four others, three have 80 and one 85 students.

Among *Provincial Schools*, Oxford is exceptional, with a clinical year of 32 students. Glasgow is the largest with 173 students. Edinburgh has a clinical class of 140. Birmingham, Manchester and Liverpool each have just over 100 students in a class. A group of schools (Belfast, Aberdeen, Dundee, Newcastle, Leeds and Sheffield) have between 80 and 90 students. Bristol and Cardiff have respectively 70 and 65 students.

FULL-TIME STAFF

London Schools

Seven have no University full-time staff; five other schools have respectively, one, three, four and six full-time staff. The mean is three per school for these five schools.

Scottish Schools

Four schools have respectively, four, six, eight and nine full-time teachers, a mean of seven per school.

Provinces

Ten schools: of these, one (Oxford) has no full-time staff; the rest have a range of two to nine, a mean of 6.5 per school.

TEACHING BEDS

In *London* six schools have no beds in the main teaching hospital; six schools have a total of 102 beds, with a mean of 17 beds for these six schools.

All twelve London schools use beds in associated general hospitals, with a mean of 49 such beds per school.

In the rest of the country, Scottish schools (with the exception of Glasgow), Liverpool and Cardiff have their main teaching beds in psychiatric hospitals. Seven schools have 346 beds (including 50 day hospital places) in the main teaching hospital. The mean for these schools is 49 beds, range 20-86. Glasgow and Belfast each have units (93 and 47 beds respectively) in general hospitals. Five other schools have their beds in associated hospitals or psychiatric units.

Every school also draws on large mental and mental deficiency hospitals beds to some extent, varying from occasional visits to two-week periods of full-time residence (as practised by Bart's, The London, St. Mary's and Middlesex hospitals). In Edinburgh and Dundee, National Health Service and Professorial Unit consultant firms in the psychiatric hospital are simultaneously involved in continuing clinical teaching of undergraduate tutorial groups.

Teaching on Behavioural Science in the Pre-Clinical Years

No pre-clinical teaching on the Behavioural Sciences is given in the first three years in three schools, Oxford, St. Thomas's and Cardiff. The total for the 23 schools providing pre-clinical teaching is 352½ hours, with a mean of 15 hours.

In the *first* (pre-medical) year only one London school, Middlesex, provides teaching (four hours). Edinburgh and Aberdeen teach six hours each.

In the *second* year, two London schools and five provincial schools give teaching.

In London the Middlesex gives 29 hours, The London 14 hours. Among provincial schools, Bristol gives 13 hours, Birmingham 6½ hours, Sheffield 30 hours, Newcastle 20 hours and Aberdeen five hours. The total hours taught by these seven schools is 117½, mean 17 hours, range 5-29 hours; 19 schools give no teaching in this year.

In the *third* (second pre-clinical) year 10 London schools teach a total of 89 hours, mean 8.9 hours, range 6-12 hours. Ten provincial schools teach a total of 130 hours, mean 13 hours, range 4-60 hours.

Content of Pre-Clinical Teaching on Behavioural Science

Three schools, as indicated above, provide teaching in the *first* (pre-medical) year: Middlesex, Edinburgh and Aberdeen.

Aberdeen. There is a course in the curriculum in Human Ecology. In this course there are six hours taught by the Department of Psychology, devoted mainly to the Psychology of the Organism. Efforts are made to integrate this teaching with the course as a whole.

Edinburgh. There are six hours in a course on Ecology, arranged by the Department of Zoology, in which psychiatrists take part in symposia together with a zoologist. (In some of the seminars, a sociologist takes part with the zoologist and the psychiatrist.) The topics dealt with are aspects of animal ethology relevant to psychological development, the smiling response and the stranger response in babies, social behaviour of monkeys relevant to human personality formation; the last three seminars deal with personality development in different cultures.

Middlesex. In four lectures, the brief course deals with ethology, conditioning processes and psycho-analytic theory.

Second Year

As indicated above, two London and four provincial schools teach during this year. In the Middlesex Hospital psychologists and psychiatrists share the course, consisting of 29 lectures. The subjects covered are: social development of the child; intellectual development, learning and motivation; psychological and physiological influences, including psychodynamic determinants of behaviour and emotion; personality development and psychological symptoms; social patterns and stress. During the course patients are discussed. The course ends with an annual examination in psychology, the best student getting a prize.

At The London Hospital 14 hours of teaching are organized in conjunction by the Departments of Psychiatry and Pharmacology.

The provincial schools giving pre-clinical teaching, in diminishing order of time allocated are: Sheffield, Bristol, Birmingham, Newcastle and Aberdeen.

Sheffield. The psychology course of 30 hours (with 20 hours more to follow in the third year) is organized by the Department of Psychiatry. The topics dealt with are the following: perception, ethology and motivation, learning, psychodynamic mechanisms, normal and abnormal sexual behaviour, remembering, thinking, intellectual development, intelligence, social role and personality; there are also practical classes, and lectures devoted to social psychology, mental subnormality, emotion, and neurological deficits.

Birmingham. The teaching is given as part of a special course on "Medicine as Science and Service". There is a lecture of one hour, a demonstration of an hour and a half, a visit to a mental hospital and another visit to a mental subnormality hospital.

Newcastle. Total teaching comprises 20 hours on human development, personality and other aspects of psychology.

Aberdeen. Integrated teaching is given on the Human Ecology course; social psychology is taught, dealing with man and animal, the behaviour of groups and the concepts of stress and response.

Third Year

Nine London and ten provincial schools teach during this year. It is not possible to summarize the programmes of all these Departments. In general, a school which has not taught during the second year tends to provide teaching during the third. As indicated above, the mean duration of the teaching is 14½ hours. No school teaches only in the first pre-clinical year. Aberdeen is one of the very few schools which teach in all three pre-clinical years. The following provincial schools teach in both the second and third years: Bristol, Birmingham, Sheffield and Newcastle. (In Newcastle 20 hours of teaching on structure and function of society are organized in this year by the Department of Public Health.) Edinburgh is one of the schools which teach in the first and the third year. St. George's, Westminster, and King's are examples of schools teaching in the third pre-clinical year.

At the time of this survey Cambridge University was unique in that it provided pre-clinical training only (see Appendix), sending the majority of its medical students to London hospitals for their clinical training.

In summary, during the pre-clinical years the behavioural science subjects which are taught include psychology of behaviour (physiological, individual and social), psychodynamic theory about personality development and inter-personal relationships, conditioning and learning theory, and social and cultural influences on behaviour. Of these, physiological psychology and personality development are the two subjects most widely taught.

PSYCHIATRIC TEACHING IN THE CLINICAL YEARS

The total time devoted to psychiatric teaching in the three clinical years in all 26 schools is 4,812 hours, mean 185 hours. (This includes the clerkship time—a full-time clerkship was counted as 36 hours per week, Wednesdays and Saturdays regarded as half-days and Sundays as a day off.) The range is 66 hours (Charing Cross) to 468 hours (Middlesex).

Lectures

In the fourth year a total of 96 hours of formal lectures are given. The mean lecturing time is eight

hours for 12 schools (14 schools do not provide lectures in the fourth year).

In the fifth year 21 schools give a total of 321½ hours of lectures. The mean is 15½ hours. The range is 4–36 hours.

In the sixth year six schools provide a total of 73 lecture hours; the mean for the six schools is 12 hours.

The total lecture time for the 26 schools is 485½ hours. The mean is 19 hours, range 6–39 hours. Sheffield teaches six hours of lectures (with an additional 26 hours of lecture-demonstrations). Middlesex seven; 10 each at Charing Cross, King's College and Westminster; 25 hours at Belfast, Glasgow and Newcastle; 27 at St. Bartholomew's and Dundee, 29 at Liverpool, 34 at Edinburgh, and 39 at St. Mary's. There is a wide variation in the employment of formal lectures.

Methods of Clinical Instruction

The range of methods of instruction used in different schools was too wide and diverse to allow any meaningful tabular presentation. Some schools employ a great deal of out-patient teaching, some very little; some resort to mental hospitals only for a few demonstration visits, others encourage their students to clerk patients during a period of residence in these hospitals; some enlist clinical psychologists, psychiatric social workers, mental welfare officers or research workers to contribute to undergraduate teaching; the majority do not. We found it particularly difficult to do justice to the teaching carried out by psychiatrists on patients seen in consultation on their colleagues' medical, surgical and obstetric or gynaecological wards. This teaching takes place in some degree in many schools. The following sections give information about some aspects of clinical instruction on which we were able to obtain systematic information.

Seminar Teaching

We have defined seminar teaching as: regular meetings of a group of not more than twenty students, meeting on at least *four* occasions, with continuity of tutor and active participation by the students.

Charing Cross is the only London school which does not systematically offer seminar teaching, although we were informed that the sole psychiatric registrar would sometimes give "up to twelve seminars" to any students who were especially interested.

All four Scottish schools have seminars, while in the provinces Liverpool, Manchester and Oxford do not

have seminars. The hours devoted to seminar teaching are distributed as follows:

Fourth Year

Bart's, 39; U.C.H., 26; Birmingham, 18; King's, 13; The London, 5; Bristol, 30; Sheffield, 14; Leeds, 8; Newcastle, 7.

The remaining eight London schools and 10 provincial schools do not provide seminars in this year.

Fifth Year

U.C.H., 42; Guy's, 39; The London, 36; Westminster, 30; Royal Free and King's College, 20; Middlesex, 13.

Cardiff, 30; Edinburgh, 18; Glasgow and Dundee, 16; Sheffield, 10; Aberdeen, 8.

Sixth Year

King's, 56; St. George's, 35; St. Mary's, 33; Leeds, 14; Bart's, 13; St. Thomas's, 12; Birmingham, 11; Belfast, 8; Edinburgh, 5; Sheffield, 5.

Summary of Seminar Teaching

Twenty-two schools give a total of 650 seminars (mean 30) spread over the three clinical years, but with a large proportion given in the second clinical year.

Intensity of Students' Clinical Involvement

Students see an average of 7 psychiatric patients for themselves during the clinical years. There is only one school (Liverpool) where students are not required to clerk any psychiatric case. In the other schools, the range is from two in Glasgow and Manchester to 20 in Aberdeen.

The number of occasions students see the particular psychiatric patients assigned to them is as follows: Liverpool, 0; Bart's, The London, Charing Cross, Newcastle and Dundee—once only. Patients are seen two or three times at St. Mary's, Westminster, U.C.H., St. George's, Manchester, Aberdeen, Belfast and Edinburgh. Patients are seen over an extended period at Guy's, St. Thomas's, Middlesex, Royal Free, King's, The London, Oxford, Bristol, Birmingham, Sheffield, Leeds and Cardiff. In a few schools, e.g. The London, students take histories for themselves on out-patients.

Duration of Clerkship

We have defined clerkship as: a clinical attachment for all students as a required part of the psychiatry

training, the student having continuity of contact with patients, for at least three days per week.

(a) Timing of Clerkship

Fourth year

Only Bristol and Sheffield have any clerkship in the fourth year. Bristol has six weeks, half time, and Sheffield has four weeks, half time.

Fifth Year

Seven London schools have clerkship in this year, with a mean duration equivalent to six weeks full-time. In the provinces there are clerkships in: Oxford, full-time, five days a week for eight weeks (fifth or sixth year); Manchester, two weeks, half-time; Aberdeen, eight weeks, half-time.

Sixth Year

Four London schools have a clerkship in this year, with a mean duration equivalent to just under six weeks full time. In the provinces there are sixth year clerkships in five schools: Birmingham, six weeks, full-time; Sheffield, six weeks, half time; Leeds, eight weeks, half-time; Newcastle, four weeks, full-time; Belfast, four weeks, half-time.

(b) Total Clerkship Time

In terms of our definition, six schools (Charing Cross, Cardiff, Liverpool, Glasgow, Dundee and Edinburgh) have no clerkship time; excluding Charing Cross, the London schools have a mean clerkship duration of six weeks, full-time.

In Scotland, two out of four schools have no clerkship. In the provinces, 10 schools have a mean of just over five weeks, full-time. In the whole U.K., 20 schools have clerkships, with a mean duration of 5.7 weeks, full-time.

In terms of hours, counting a full-time week as 36 hours, and one month as four weeks, but three months as 13 weeks, the total clerkship time for 26 schools was 4,056 hours. Not considering the six schools without clerkships, the mean time for 20 schools is 192 hours (equivalent to 5½ weeks). The range is from 468 hours (Middlesex) to 36 hours (Manchester).

CHILD PSYCHIATRY

We did not inquire specifically about child psychiatry beds, but it is our impression that Guy's Hospital and Dundee are the only schools which have such beds in the teaching hospital. Nor did we inquire systematically into the organization of teaching in

child psychiatry, but information emerged in the course of our survey of teaching in the clinical years.

No school claims a full-time academic teacher of child psychiatry: it is taught entirely by honorary and part-time teachers. In five schools (Dundee, Middlesex, St. Bartholomew's, St. Mary's, Guy's Hospital) child psychiatry is intimately connected with the Department of Psychological Medicine. In 11 schools this teaching forms part of the students' instruction in paediatrics: two of these schools (Edinburgh and U.C.H.) specifically mention giving instruction in child psychiatry during the psychiatry course in addition, and we suspect that this may also happen in some of the other nine schools in this group.

Five schools reported no specific teaching of child psychiatry; five other schools report some teaching of this topic but do not specify by whom it is given—presumably by local consultants in child psychiatry.

Only one school (Guy's Hospital) devotes a really substantial amount of time (87 hours of lectures, discussions, clinical demonstrations and out-patient sessions) to child psychiatry. Two schools stated that child psychiatry is taught in their paediatrics course, without specifying how much time is given to this teaching. Besides Guy's Hospital, 18 schools have indicated time formally allocated to this subject, the hours ranging from one to 26 (mean 11 hours for these schools), but we cannot regard this as a reliable figure because in many cases some additional, but unspecified, child psychiatry teaching is given in conjunction with clinical teaching in paediatrics.

IMPENDING CHANGES

Many schools were able to tell us of impending changes in their curricula which would allocate increased time for psychiatric teaching. This was principally designated for an increase in students' clerkship experience in schools where the clerkship in psychiatry was exiguous or non-existent.

Dundee has allocated 214 hours to psychiatry in the fifth year; each student will work in the psychiatric service for 3½ days a week for one term. (Child psychiatry will be taught with paediatrics in the sixth year.) At Edinburgh a clerkship of one month's duration is proposed for the final year.

A number of schools are also adding instruction in the pre-clinical years. At Edinburgh teaching in psychology will be increased to 42 hours in the third year. At Dundee there will be 30 hours of teaching psychology instead of the present 12. At Manchester a course of psychology consisting of 60 hours of lectures and demonstrations will be given. At Bristol a behavioural science course of 96 hours

is planned as a joint undertaking of the Department of Mental Health with the Departments of Psychology and Sociology.

A number of our colleagues have drawn attention to the importance of including questions on the teaching given by the Department of Psychiatry in the students' professional examinations, both at Second M.B. (as is done for example in Leeds, Birmingham and Sheffield) and in the Final Examination. This already obtains in principle in the great majority of schools, but the effectiveness of psychiatric participation in the Final Examination varies widely from one school to another.

The year 1966–1967 has been an important one for medical education in Britain. A Royal Commission has been studying the whole problem (this survey was conducted to provide the Commission with information about undergraduate training in psychiatry), the first Chair in Medical Education was established, and the first issue of the *British Journal of Medical Education* appeared. The departments of psychiatry reflect the general spirit of self-examination in medical schools, and the intention to remedy obvious deficiencies. In psychiatry, the major defects now being made good are in pre-clinical behavioural science teaching, and in the provision of clinical clerkships, which extend the student's theoretical instruction by enabling him to observe the phenomena of abnormal behaviour.

APPENDIX

Cambridge University

During their pre-clinical training, the only Behavioural Science teaching offered to Cambridge medical students is a course in Experimental Psychology which can be taken as part of the Natural Sciences Tripos. From 1962–1964 a minority of students who took this Tripos (their proportion varying from 10 to 20 per cent. of the total) took Experimental Psychology as part of their studies. This course consists of 48 lectures and 64 hours' practical work (including demonstrations and statistical exercises). The major topics covered are:

- (1) Experimental analysis of human behaviour.
- (2) Psychological statistics.
- (3) Physiological psychology.
- (4) Special senses and perception.
- (5) Intelligence and human abilities.
- (6) Motivation and learning.

Two concluding lectures are given on "Personality, Freud, Jung and Adler". The course stresses the experimental approach to problems of behaviour and the need to develop appropriate techniques

of measurement. No systematic attempt is made to cover aspects of psychology less obviously open to experimental inquiry.

A very few students go on to take the Part II course in Psychology, which is designed to extend and deepen the candidates' knowledge of experimental psychology, and also to give them some acquaintance with issues of social, abnormal and applied psychology.

Mention should also be made of a two-week summer vacation course on "Human Relations in Medicine" taught by psychiatrists, physicians active in social medicine, administrators and senior social workers from a variety of disciplines, together with local General Practitioners. This course was held for the first time in July, 1967, and has been subscribed to by 15 students.

G. M. Carstairs

H. J. Walton

J. R. Smythies

Department of Psychiatry, Edinburgh University, Morningside Park, Edinburgh 10

A. H. Crisp

Department of Psychiatry, St. George's Hospital Medical School, London S.W.1

(Received 21 August, 1967)