

## Reviews

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03216941

Virginia Garrard-Burnett (ed.), *On Earth as It Is in Heaven: Religion in Modern Latin America* (Wilmington, DE: SR Books, 1999), pp. xxv + 251, \$65.00, \$18.95 pb.

Brian H. Smith, *Religious Politics in Latin America: Pentecostal vs. Catholic* (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1998), pp. vii + 126, \$16.00, pb.

Anna L. Peterson, Manuel A. Vásquez and Philip J. Williams (eds.), *Christianity, Social Change, and Globalization in the Americas* (New Brunswick, NJ, and London: Rutgers University Press, 2001), pp. xvi + 259, \$60.00, \$22.00 pb.

The books reviewed here are part of the ongoing effort to bridge a series of divides that have inhibited the advance of scholarship on religion, society and politics in Latin America: the gap between historical and contemporary research, the gap between local or national studies and fully comparative research, the gap between exclusive focus on Latin America and one that sets Latin America in a broader transnational context and, finally, the gap represented by relations between Latin America and the United States.

*On Earth as It Is in Heaven* appeared in 2000, and draws together a wide range of material produced between 1983 and 1995: one previously unpublished paper (Hale on *Pretos Velhos* and Umbanda); excerpts from two doctoral theses (Sullivan-González on the Guatemalan Church in the Carrera years and Chesnut on Pentecostals and spiritual power in Brazil); three previously published book chapters (Rus on the caste war in Chiapas, Mainwaring on the Catholic Church and the popular movement in Brazil, and Williams on the progressive church in Nicaragua); excerpts from two books (Earle on space and time among the Quiché, and Annis on Protestantism, conversion and economic life in Guatemala); and one fascinating short journalistic piece by Gardy on the hidden life of a small Jewish community in Mexico.

Although no single thread ties this collection together, the logic of the editor's selection of contributions and organisation of the volume is made clear in her introduction which offers a crisp and illuminating review of the history of religion in Latin America with particular emphasis on rereading that history in ways that make sense of the continuing dynamic of change, and the appearance and the vitality of religious pluralism. Chapters are grouped into four sections: Liberalism, Catholicism and Church–State Conflict; Popular Religion and 'Folk Catholicism'; The Catholic Church in Transition: Liberation Theology and Beyond; and Protestantism and Religious Pluralism. The volume closes with a very helpful bibliographical essay by the editor which offers suggestions for further reading on the major topics.

Space permits only limited comment on individual contributions. Jan Rus' 'Whose Caste War?' rereads the history of the caste war in Chiapas and the uses to which prevailing accounts were put through the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Setting these accounts in the context of conflicts over land and labour, as well as of

intra-Ladino disputes, Rus concludes that the caste war as conventionally described did not happen. There was indeed a war, but ‘far from being a sudden explosion [Indians against Ladinos] the provocation and violence were almost entirely on the side of the ladinos; the Indians, far from having been the perpetrators of massacres, were the victims!’ (p. 25). The mythology of latent peril from Indian communities gave Ladinos a convenient rationale for repression through the next century and a half. Lindsay Hale’s study of *pretos velhos* (*literally* old backs, the spirits of old slaves contacted through mediums) sets Umbanda in the context of ambivalence over the meaning of African heritage in Brazil. Hale takes Umbanda as medium for meaning-making, particularly the meaning of ethnic identity. Identity is made not only with words, but also with symbols, gestures and the reconstruction of spaces such as the space of the *senzala* or old slave quarters. The ethnographic account of his own experiences with mediums and contact with *pretos velhos* shows how many experiences that are too difficult to put into words are transmitted through the figure of the pretos velhos: ‘torture, sexual violation, old age, crippling injury and disease, kindness, tragic love, Africa, Brazil, Plantation houses, slave quarters, guilt and forgiveness. These concerns emerge as pretos velhos reminisce about the way things were’ (p. 118).

Early and often partisan scholarship on liberation theology and the progressive church in Latin America influenced major cultural and political transformations, but the accumulation of empirical studies has made for considerable caution. Scott Mainwaring was one of the early scholars to take a close and critical look at the progressive church, and to consider the limits on its possible influence. His detailed account of the progressive church in Nova Iguaçu, Brazil, remains important for the richness of his insight into organisations, their members and their ties to larger structures. Williams does something similar for Nicaragua, making clear the limitations (not just the strengths or ambitions) of the popular church.

The expansion of Protestantism, above all Pentecostal Protestantism, has been one of the major developments in Latin American religion in the past quarter century. As Protestants have grown as a share of the population in all countries, they have claimed a place in the public sphere. At the same time they have diversified well beyond stereotypes of North American influence and Cold War affiliations. Some have argued that Protestant growth represents an edge of major cultural and political transformation. David Martin underscores parallels to the Reformation, while others, following Weber, search for the emergence of a new economic ethic. Annis and Chesnut address different dimensions of the issues: Annis centres attention on the relation of Protestantism to economic activity, showing that although Catholics and Protestants may be equally poor, they earn their livings and treat their families in different ways. Protestants are notably more open to business activity and new technologies while Catholics remain dependent on the land. Chesnut focuses on charismatic power, the encounter with the divine, that comes through spiritual baptism essential to Pentecostal Churches, and in particular on its relation to health and healing. The Pentecostal congregation promotes intense membership while serving as a mutual aid society in the city. In both cases, conversion is a liberation – from older ties, from the ‘cultural tax’ of traditional ritual and fiesta practices and (in Guatemala at least) from the costs of ritual drunkenness, and from fear of spirits, illness and isolation.

*Religious Politics in Latin America* is a slim and focused volume that draws together an enormous body of data from across the entire region under three general

headings: the dynamic of Pentecostal growth and Catholic 'retrenchment', explanations and implications of Protestant growth; and an assessment of contemporary Catholicism. A final chapter outlines possible scenarios for Pentecostal/Catholic interaction, considers their likelihood and assesses their implications for society and politics. Smith provides a balanced assessment of the reasons for Protestant, and especially Pentecostal growth. Growth does not depend solely on cold war dynamics or on a North American financed 'invasion of the sects' or on cold war dynamics. Nor can growth be attributed to defections from Catholicism, or to a supposed reaction to the errors or dangers of liberation theology. Protestant expansion is too general, and Protestantism itself much too diverse internally, to make any single factor explanation effective. Smith situates the debate over numbers in the context of the overall modernization and diversification of Latin American societies, which has created a new audience, with only the weakest and most nominal ties to Catholicism.

Smith's central concern is to assess the political implications of Protestant growth, and of Catholic reaction to that growth. His definition of 'politics' is compact and deliberately limited: politics refers to the presence of churches as religious actors in political parties, elections, the exercise of pressures on or presence in government, and efforts to shape the agenda of government or political parties in explicitly 'religious' terms. The task is not as easy as it once seemed. Smith notes the diversity of the Protestant presence in politics, and underscores how much 'rank and file Protestants do not fit some of the stereotypes that have been used to characterize them politically' (p. 48). Explicitly Protestant political parties (and, for the most part, candidates) have not fared well, and there is no evidence that Protestant voters can be relied on to vote in a block for Protestant candidates. More successful has been the strategy of groups like the Universal Church of Brazil, which has clericalised its candidates (for greater control) and hedged its bets by spreading candidates across a range of existing political parties. Initial Protestant claims to moralise politics have been undermined by the troubles of Protestant presidents in Guatemala, and, of course, by the extent to which, like all political groups, Protestant deputies were snared in the web of corruption spun by Montesinos and Fujimori in Peru. The author's assessment of contemporary Catholicism is mixed. He points to efforts to reconfigure the Church's public agenda around traditional issues of personal morality and Catholic schooling, but also recognises the continuing presence of transnational NGOs who advance an agenda centred on peace and social justice. Vatican campaigns to rein in what they see as 'excessive politicization' (in practice, linked to liberation theology) have had some success, particularly since the return of democracy and civilian rule, when, Smith writes, 'it seems to be true (at) least in some regions, that the more one is engaged in the Church (regular Mass attendance and participation in one or more Church-sponsored local organizations) the less likely one is to join a social or political movement' (p. 71).

The chapter on scenarios is instructive. Three possible scenarios are discussed extensively: mutually reinforcing flight from the world; conflicting religiopolitical agendas; and prophetic catalysts moving in tandem. The first, which would work counter to religious legitimation and possible sponsorship of active citizenship, is unlikely. The second, which appears in stereotyped, Cold War-influenced terms as Protestant support for capitalism and the military *versus* Catholic opposition, no longer fits the facts, if it ever did. There is too much diversity, and the political agenda of the region has changed. Smith suggests that growing shared concern with

economic inequality may provide a basis for common positions in the future. As to the third scenario, despite numerous points of convergence (work among the poor, stress on bible study, use of the media) collaboration is likely to be more tactical than extensive and committed. Competition and mistrust remain the order of the day.

*Christianity, Social Change and Globalization in the Americas* is a theoretically ambitious and successful volume, which brings together original contributions by North American and Latin American scholars under three headings: Women, Family and Community; Civil Society, Citizenship and Democratization; and Religion, Transnationalism, and Globalization. The editors' introduction ('Christianity and Social Change in the Shadow of Globalization') and concluding chapter ('The Global and the Local') are important statements which go beyond summarising the collection to lay out a stimulating agenda for future work. Each of these editors has a distinguished track record of earlier work. Together, they have produced a significant collection that stands out for the sharpness of the work on women and the family as well as for the freshness and originality of presentation on transnational groups and global connections.

This volume is unusually coherent for an edited collection: individual contributions present the results of integrated field work in the United States, Peru and El Salvador, along with research on transnational groups that link experiences in the three. All the individual pieces are strong, and coherence is magnified by the common themes and multiple contributions from the same authors: Rosa Castro Aguilar has two excellent chapters ('Religion and Family in Peru: Catholic Experience in Peru' and 'Faith and Citizenship: Local Catholic Experiences in Peruvian Communities'), Ileana Gómez contributes a fine paper on the role of the churches in rebuilding community in Morazán, El Salvador, in the wake of war and is also co-author, with Manuel Vásquez, of a remarkable chapter that traces the connections of 'Youth Gangs and Religion Among Salvadorans in Washington (DC) and El Salvador'. The work on youth gangs and religion, along with chapters on transnationalism and national identity among Peruvian Catholics in New Jersey (Larissa Ruíz Baía) and by Peterson and Vásquez on the Catholic charismatic renewal in transnational perspective are among the freshest and most original work available on these important issues. It is not too much to say that everyone talks about transnationalism and globalisation but few go to the effort of sustained research. These contributions, indeed the entire volume, constitute an indispensable starting point for future scholarship. *Christianity, Social Change, and Globalization in the Americas* is unusually valuable in that the authors manage to combine rich analysis of particular societies with careful attention to transnational linkages, provided for example by churches, youth gangs, devotions or remittances.

Together, the three volumes presented here bridge gaps and open new possibilities for scholarship on religion, society and politics in Latin America. They move us away from single country case studies, incorporate transnational connections and influences, and lay Cold War stereotypes and expectations, whether about the 'popular church' or Pentecostal Protestants, safely to rest.

*University of Michigan*

DANIEL H. LEVINE

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03226948

Will Fowler, *Latin America, 1800–2000* (London: Arnold, and New York: Oxford University Press Inc., Modern History for Modern Languages Series, 2002), pp. xx + 170, £40.00, £12.99 pb.

To offer a concise overview of Latin American history since Independence is an enormous challenge of synthesis. Will Fowler's *Latin America, 1800–2000* faces the challenge squarely and with considerable success. Fowler is among the most imaginative of the new generation of Latin Americanist historians working on nineteenth-century politics. He avoids over-representing the country of his specialisation, Mexico, achieving admirable geographical balance, another stiff challenge integral to writing such a book. Beginning with the Wars of Independence, he manages to weave a unified narrative of twenty countries over two centuries in only 156 pages. The book appears in a series intended to address the specific needs of students in language courses, and therefore it also appends to each chapter short primary documents in Spanish and suggested topics for discussion of those documents. (Given the increasing knowledge of Spanish among today's undergraduate university students, these appended documents may find application in history survey courses as well.) In addition, the author refers to literary works to help students place them in their historical context.

The book is most successful in its rendering of a sturdy, consensual political narrative that integrates a remarkable amount of detail despite its extreme brevity. Overall, this narrative marks the broad contours of the region's political and economic development very effectively and sure-footedly. On the other hand, the amount of compression required to include so much political detail occasionally robs that same detail of meaning. This happens mostly because of the author's laudable wish to deal with all the countries of the region, but it results, at times, in a hail of names and dates from which students are likely to take away little and which, in fact, makes it more difficult for them to identify the significant names and dates that are worth remembering. And not all the details are well chosen. Do new initiates to Latin American history need to know the names of undistinguished presidents who ruled for only twenty-one days, if indeed it may be said that they ruled at all (p. 120)? The procedure of trying to touch all bases at each juncture results in rapid 'country jumping' that most students (not to mention some professors) will find dizzying.

Furthermore, there are issues of proportion. The idea that, on the eve of the crisis of the Spanish monarchy in 1808, 'Spanish America was on the verge of a revolutionary explosion' due to policies 'that had succeeded in alienating the majority of the colonial population' (p. 13) is a seriously misleading overstatement. To view Spanish America as a powder keg awaiting a spark may be an effective narrative image but it actually hinders students understanding of the long, drawn-out process that began with fervent and spontaneous colonial outpourings of loyalty to the deposed Spanish king and evolved only haltingly toward concerted independence movements. (Here, indeed, is one point at which the author does seem unduly influenced by his Mexicanist expertise, Mexico being the colony most resembling a powder keg.) Another odd proportion gives the few radical challenges to Latin American neocolonialism more attention than the structures of oligarchic domination that held sway for half a century. Many ideological dimensions of neocolonial domination, most especially those involving race, get virtually no attention at all. And proportion again becomes an issue when the five-day 'Football War' between

Honduras and El Salvador (14–18 July 1969) receives more detail than the terrible 1932–35 Chaco War between Paraguay and Bolivia (pp. 126–7).

But these are quibbles, and in the main the political narrative is well done – more subtle and more comprehensive than my own attempt to produce a concise overview of the topic. Still, there is too much politics in *Latin America, 1800–2000* to best serve the needs of students in language courses. Students trying to understand Latin American novels need to understand political struggle, of course, but they need fewer lists of presidents and more about Latin American women. They need less about party politics and more about the larger social and cultural currents. Such things simply motivate undergraduate students more. And such things are, after all, far more pertinent to the students' appreciation of the literature that presumably occupies most of their attention in the courses where this book will be adopted as a historical introduction.

In the next edition – which this book certainly deserves – the author should craft more generalisations to replace an unmanageable plethora of cases. He should make the treatment of important individuals (which currently read like prose resumé) more memorable. Above all, he should prune political detail to make room for expanded treatment of other matters, especially race and gender.

*University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill*

JOHN CHARLES CHASTEEN

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03236944

H. B. Nicholson, *Topiltzin Quetzalcóatl: The Once and Future Lord of the Toltecs* (Boulder, CO: University Press of Colorado, 2001), pp. lxi + 360, \$65.00, \$27.95 pb.

This book makes available to the general public the contents of H. B. Nicholson's 1957 doctoral thesis. A comprehensive introduction bridges the 40-year gap by analysing the studies and new translations of primary sources that have since appeared, making the work up to date despite the time that has passed since the original research.

The topic is captivating in that it deals with one of the most famous figures of preconquest Mexico, Topiltzin Quetzalcóatl, the ruler of the Toltecs. The aim is to reconstruct the basic tale of Topiltzin Quetzalcóatl of Tollan while evaluating its historicity and discussing some of its major features. Nicholson's intention is to base interpretations of the tale in a broader corpus of accounts than used by previous studies. Indeed, the range of sources is impressive, from historical narratives or legends and myths in Spanish and indigenous languages, mainly Náhuatl, of different parts of Mesoamerica, to archaeological evidence.

The book can be divided in two parts; a first section that I would call 'philological' in which all the primary sources are discussed, followed by a chapter on the information that can be drawn from the archaeological sites of Tula and Chichén Itzá. Then a brief second part, more 'analytical', with some interpretations of the basic data presented. The sources are meticulously analysed first by introducing the account itself and its author, when known, then concentrating on the relevant material on Topiltzin Quetzalcóatl, which is afterwards summarised in few essential details for more clarity and briefly commented on.

The sources are discussed following a scheme of concentric circles: first come the major sources, those that are deemed to contain the most reliable formulation of

the tale, from Nahuatl central Mexico. From the same area, some important supplementary accounts are considered, followed by those sources that present only fragments and scraps of information or late versions of the tale. After that, non-Nahuatl central Mexican sources are briefly mentioned. The circles then open up to include accounts generated in different peripheral regions as far away as Nicaragua. The outermost circle is composed by evidence collected from archaeology.

The great range of sources makes it impossible to list here the accounts that Nicholson used to recreate the tale of the great ruler; suffice it to say that a consolidated version of the tale was built on six major accounts, all of them from the Basin of Mexico and dating from before 1570. They all contain a full story of our hero, and this characteristic, together with the early period in which they were written, helps to establish their centrality. The sources of non-Nahuatl central Mexico provide scanty data, while outside the core area there are some figures similar to Topiltzin Quetzalcóatl, but it cannot be established whether they come from the Toltec influence or not. As far as archaeological evidence is concerned, it corroborates the importance of the feathered serpent and the probable existence of leaders who bore the title of Quetzalcóatl, but it cannot go further than that.

The author reconstructs the basic tale from the differing sources. After all, a standardised version of the tale never existed, for it was based on oral tradition and pictorial histories that changed over time. The Toltec hero was born in a year 1 Acatl of Mixcóatl, the founder of the Toltec power, and Chimalmán. After punishing the uncles who killed his father, he became the ruler in Tollan. Following a conflict with Tezcatlipoca, he abandoned his office and moved toward the Gulf Coast, ending up in Tlapallán. There, according to one version, he disappeared across the sea, or following another, he died and was cremated; his transformation into the planet Venus is another quite common ending. A few sources also mention his expected return.

After the summary, the question of historicity is discussed. Nicholson takes for granted a degree of historicity in the tale, the problem being to determine how much; this point, however, is still disputed by others. In Nicholson's view it is possible that an actual person called Topiltzin Quetzalcóatl existed, that he was the ruler of Tollan, and was later fused with various deities and rulers. The author also discusses the figure's religious and political importance in Toltec society and attempts to situate him in a definite space and period of time.

One can agree or not with Nicholson's conclusions, but his rigour in the analysis of the sources is laudable, and his approach of combining written texts with archaeological evidence goes in the direction of integrating different types of sources, which is gaining importance in various disciplines. His book, ending a long wait to see his research published, represents a serious and meticulous contribution to the debate over a central figure of pre-conquest Mexico.

*Institute of Latin American Studies, London*

CATERINA PIZZIGONI



*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03246940

Virginia M. Bouvier, *Women and the Conquest of California, 1542–1840: Codes of Silence* (Tucson, AZ: University of Arizona Press, 2001), pp. xvii + 266, \$40.00, hb.

Arguing that the same codes of silence which concealed the experience and agency of colonial California's female population, especially its indigenous female population, also revealed 'the gender ideologies of those who created and maintained them' (p. xvii), Virginia Bouvier inventively constructs her gender-centred interpretation and deconstructs the Spanish and Mexican sources on early California history. In this conceptually innovative study, Bouvier ranges among the literatures of ethnohistory, gender studies and discourse analysis to provide a largely thematically organised study of women in the exploration, colonisation and missionisation of Upper California. Situating her study especially within the gender literatures of both the US Southwest and Latin America, she discusses to the roles of women and gender ideologies from 1542 to 1840 as Alta California experienced a growing Spanish presence that fundamentally transformed the region.

After detailing the mythical California described in chivalric fiction where male conquerors controlled feminised native populations, the book provides accounts of the early exploration and alter evangelisation effort. Spanish evangelisation took place in an area very different from the central region of Mexico, more comfortable for the Jesuits and Franciscans, the latter coming to dominate the conversion campaign in Alta California. While the varieties of languages and forms of cultural practices proved daunting, the more immediate problem faced by the Franciscans in the mid- to late-eighteenth century, was that abuse of native women, primarily by soldiers, provoked hostility between native communities, on the one hand, and missions, the Church and/or the military, on the other. Church and state decided that the best way to evangelise and secure Alta California as part of New Spain would be to promote Hispanic settlement, especially in the form of immigration of women from areas to the south. Officials believed their presence would lead to greater stability among settlers and more security in this frontier area.

This discussion leads into two chapters (four and five) describing colonisation and life in the missions. Aside from telling us in the greatest detail possible allowed by the paucity of sources, about the often mixed-race but culturally Hispanic women who migrated under difficult circumstances, chapter four illustrates the ways Spanish and Mexican authorities viewed women as keys to security, economic development and cultural transformation. Some of these women would play important roles in the twenty-one missions established by the Spanish in the eighteenth- and early-nineteenth centuries. The fifth chapter details the development and roles of the missions, highlighting women's experiences living and working at the missions. Bouvier effectively describes the patriarchal nature of the missions, from the building of *monjerías* (dormitories for neophyte girls and single or widowed women) to the severe physical punishments imposed on women for rule-breaking or attempts to flee. The hispanic gender ideology so important in the central parts of the Spanish empire affected indigenous divisions of labour and notions of sexuality and family life yet it failed to protect native women from the violence associated with frontier life.

Bouvier intensifies her focus on indigenous patterns of sexuality in chapter six. While kinship structures and marriage patterns, as well as practices relating to sexuality and other aspects of family life, varied among California's aboriginal peoples, Spanish missionaries and policies treated all groups as equivalent. At times they



encouraged intermarriage between Spanish men and native women, based on the assumption that intermarriage would promote better relations and loyalty on the part of indigenous groups, at other times they focused more on directly controlling women's behaviour. Such control often took the form of punishment, sometimes carried out publicly, sometimes carried out behind closed doors but in ways that still violated the privacy of husbands and wives as priests attempted to encourage fertility and control the spread of venereal diseases. While priests attempted to inculcate values and practices relating to Catholic doctrine including marrying within the Church (for life), monogamy, chastity and the rejection of adultery, they mainly succeeded in interfering with family life, perhaps leading to a significant lowering of birth rates.

The intrusive behaviour of soldiers and missionaries provoked various forms of resistance, such as flight, plots to poison priests and attack mission buildings, secret practicing of native religion and cultural observances (which could involve women's participation and leadership), and/or rejection of pressures to learn Spanish or wear European clothing. Not only does the author discuss these forms of resistance in detail, but she also demonstrates how Franciscan writings downplayed resistive behaviours in part, no doubt, to magnify mission successes and in part because Franciscans denied native peoples' autonomy as well as their ability to resist or rebel.

Bouvier's perceptive, very close readings of Franciscan and other texts adds a sophisticated dimension to her source analysis that enhances the utility of the book, both for scholars interested in border and Latin American colonial gender studies and for students, especially advanced undergraduates or those at the graduate level. Highlighting female roles and experiences, this book is also informative about – though it might have been more analytical of – male behavior and masculine assumptions about gender, especially those of priests, soldiers, and government officials. By reading between the lines to highlight not only male and female voices, but also their silences, Virginia Bouvier has produced an interdisciplinary work of lasting value.

*University of Houston*

SUSAN KELLOGG

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03256947

Antonio Ibarra, *La organización regional del mercado interno novohispano: la economía colonial de Guadalajara, 1770–1804* (Puebla: Benemérita Universidad Autónoma de Puebla, and México: Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, 2000), pp. 254, pb.

Over the last several decades the study of regional economic structures has grown into one of the most common approaches to Latin American economic history, if not supplanting then at least complementing and in some measure subsuming more traditional methodologies such as business or entrepreneurial, sectoral or serial history. While these established genres have much to recommend them, and are by no means exhausted, the regional concept is an especially compelling one in societies which have appeared historically prone to the preservation of strong regional identities, or even fragmentation along regional lines, in the face of centralising, state-building and modernising projects on the part of dominant elites. The Mexican economic historian Antonio Ibarra has written what is in some ways an exemplary study of the important Mexican region of Guadalajara during the expansive late

Bourbon period, when the colonial city grew impressively, the pace of economic life in western central Mexico quickened notably, and the city and its extended hinterland were increasingly integrated into the greater colonial economy by means of agro-pastoral exports. One of the study's great virtues is that it only tells us a great deal substantively about the Guadalajara region, but explores the very concepts of regionality, markets, and capital formation by means of an attempt to think about regional balances of trade, regional accounting, gross regional product, thus making the theoretical findings of Ibarra's work applicable to other cases. Written in a lively, occasionally polemical, style and with a certain panache most readers will perhaps not associate with such highly quantitative economic history, Ibarra's study is nonetheless replete with useful statistical tables on regional population movements, types of production, trade flows and so forth. The work is steeped in the grand tradition of European economic history (the very interesting but occasionally opaque *postfacio* by Ruggiero Romano is a tipoff here) while making generous if critical reference to the recent historiography (including this reviewer's work) on the region and the colonial economy, and deploys a small mountain of useful data in the footnotes, some of it in the form of extensive quotations from primary sources. The central source-text for Ibarra's treatment is a well known, detailed report on regional production and trade for the years 1802–1803 by the Intendant of Guadalajara, the talented Bourbon bureaucrat José Fernando Abascal y Sousa.

Ibarra sets out to define what the Guadalajara region looked like and how it functioned economically in the final decades of the eighteenth century, but less through evoking geography than by describing the extent of an internal market centering on the city itself. Employing what he terms a 'regional accounting model' (after the usage of the French economic historian Pierre Chaunu), Ibarra first paints in broad but convincing terms the background of the entire late colonial period in order to analyse in detail in his final chapters Intendant Abascal's quantitative report of 1802–1803, thus providing both diachronic and synchronic descriptions. The virtue of this method, as opposed to a more static or selective serial model in which one or two sets of indicators – say, prices or wages – are traced, is that it produces a dynamic picture over time, in which some economic activities, sub-regions, or forms of capital accumulation surge forward while others retreat, and in which the investment of regional economic energies notably shifts over the last decades of the century in favour of markets external to the region itself. Ibarra sees the region as enjoying a well-balanced economy embracing not only agro-pastoral activities, but early forms of processing and manufacturing industry (particularly textiles), and a not inconsiderable amount of silver mining. Among the most interesting of his findings is that the initial stages of the regional economic growth spurt were stimulated by internal (urban) demand, but that as the century closed external demand came more to the fore, and with it a more complex and deeper integration of the entire region into a larger colonial market fueled in large measure by silver mining. Echoing an almost Rostovian developmental model, Ibarra finds that at the very end of the period a take-off into further regional economic growth was blocked by the 'strangulation' of capital formation within the region.

If one can point to a single problem with this ingenious and sophisticated study, it is that the Abascal report of 1802–1803 may be idiosyncratic in the statistical evidence it presents on production, trade volume, and values of goods traded. On the basis of the evidence Ibarra deploys, there is simply no way to know how representative it is of 'normal' levels or trends. This is to some degree compensated

for by more longitudinal data presented in various tables and graphs, such as mining production, tax and tithing figures, but these often do not correspond neatly to Abascal's own categories. Notwithstanding this problem, Ibarra's book represents one of the most sophisticated analyses to date of a regional economy *anywhere* in colonial Latin America, and is well worth the attention of a wide readership interested in economic development.

*University of California, San Diego*

ERIC VAN YOUNG

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03266943

Martha Menchaca, *Recovering History, Constructing Race: The Indian, Black, and White Roots of Mexican Americans* (Austin, TX: University of New Texas Press, 2002), pp. xi + 375, \$55.00, \$24.95 pb.

Debates about race in the United States have tended to revolve around the axis of Black–White relations. Martha Menchaca's new book marks an important step toward broadening the polemics to include the experiences of other ethnic minorities at the tables of discussion. Menchaca shows us that the social segregation practised against Mexicans in the USA is just as insidious as the more widely touted discrimination against US Blacks. Her book raises important questions that underscore the tremendous impact and legacy of racial ideologies on notions of citizenship and naturalization with their associated political rights and privileges. Likewise, her book questions the construction of racial categories and the implications of racial ideologies for national identities; policies on land tenure, education, and marriage; and economic disparities between ethnic groups.

Menchaca's exploration of the Indian, Black and White roots of Mexican Americans takes readers on a journey from antiquity to the present, although the bulk of her data covers the relatively shorter period from 1570 to the early twentieth century. On the wind of race relations, Menchaca capably sails the globe from the Iberian peninsula, Europe and Northern Africa to Western Africa and then across the Atlantic to Mesoamerica and the region that currently constitutes the US southwest. The author does not shy away from her subject's complexities, which include racial categories that change over time and by region; shifting strategies of racial identification that accompany global shifts in governance; a predominant tendency in the United States to classify Mexicans as Whites, despite their mixed racial roots; and the use of language to justify the segregation of Spanish-speakers in the United States.

Against prevailing myths that portray the contemporary United States as a place of greater development and racial equality compared to Latin America, Menchaca offers a well-documented testimony of the early efforts of the Mexican Republic to legislate equality for all, regardless of race. Ironies abound. As Anglo-Americans quickly became a majority in Texas, seceded from Mexico and nullified the land deeds and property rights of Indians and Blacks, in Mexico the first *afromestizo* assumed the presidency and abolished slavery south of the border. Likewise, Mexico's inability to stem the illegal Anglo migration to Texas in the nineteenth century serves as an ironic counterpoint to current efforts to stem the tide of Mexican migration in the opposite direction.

Menchaca's book challenges other widespread myths about Mexican Americans – that they lack ancient historic roots, that they are an immigrant and

peasant-like group, that they have not contributed to US culture, and that they suffer economic disparity because they are inferior, culturally impoverished, disdain hard work or do not value education. She takes on each of these myths and argues that the emergence of new economic structures in the late nineteenth century based on concepts of citizenship that excluded and discriminated against non-Whites provided the underpinnings for access to land and economic success. In an especially strong chapter on land, race and war, Menchaca analyses the tremendous variations in land tenure patterns in different parts of the US southwest and their implications for ethnic advancement and race relations. Not content with merely enumerating the relevant (and frequently clashing) state and federal legislative initiatives, Menchaca analyses the ways in which the laws differentially and sometimes inadvertently were applied to different sectors within each region of Mexico's northern frontier. She finds that the implementation of seemingly progressive colour-blind land legislation under the Mexican Republic sometimes backfired as it encountered the regional peculiarities of previous land tenure arrangements (which often rewarded pacified indigenous groups, the military, the *peninsulares* or the reigning governors and their friends), as well as the distinct regional legacies of inter-ethnic relations, including different missionisation practices in each region.

Menchaca argues that access to education, which she rightly calls the 'main societal gatekeeper of economic success', like access to land, is pivotal for the economic and social advancement of any group. Her analysis of the detrimental effects of segregation on non-white Mexican students (often expressed on the basis of language rather than race) is not quite as developed as her discussion of discriminatory land tenure patterns, but provides a compelling case for the difficulties Mexican Americans have also faced in education.

While none of the women – White, Black, Indian or Hispanic – enjoyed the rights and privileges of citizenship during much of the period Menchaca considered, her analysis raises interesting questions about how women and men might have differed in their experience of racial policies, their construction of racial identities, and their eventual political and economic place in society. Such questions are clearly beyond the already tremendous scope of Menchaca's study but this opus is sure to stimulate many such avenues of future investigation.

*United States Institute of Peace*

VIRGINIA M. BOUVIER

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X0327694X

Erika Pani, *Para mexicanizar el Segundo Imperio: el imaginario político de los imperialistas* (México: El Colegio de México, 2001), pp. 444, 170 pesos pb.

The French Intervention in Mexico (1862–67) and the empire that was imposed with the Habsburg prince Maximilian at its head (1864–67) has been generally given a certain parenthetical value in nineteenth-century Mexican historiography. Most national narratives have tended to eschew the fact that the Empire received significant support from the Mexican political class and have, instead, concentrated on the heroic actions of Benito Juárez and the republican resistance. In fact, Maximilian I's Empire has been repeatedly defined, almost exclusively as a 'foreign' misadventure, ultimately overcome by those 'true' Mexicans who stood by Juárez and the liberal factions that succeeded in restoring the Republic in 1867. Those 'ill-advised' and 'treacherous' monarchist Conservatives who conspired to bring about the Intervention, in the wake of the War of the *Reforma* (1858–60), have as a result, been

portrayed as few and far between, anti-patriotic in their inclinations and repugnantly reactionary. Any serious attempt to understand their motivations has overall been avoided with the triumphant Liberal historiographical insistence on emphasising the fact that this was a French Intervention and that those Mexicans who supported it were quite simply *vendepatrias* and *pinches cangrejos*. It is for all of this that Erika Pani's study of the Mexican *imperialistas* is so important.

Working closely with the press, correspondence and writings the *imperialistas* left behind, Pani is able to construct a lucid and detached interpretation of the experiences and ideas that led politicians with a moderate liberal past, including the Conservatives, to seek and support the reintroduction of a monarchy with a European prince on the throne. Assisted by noteworthy appendices with which Pani is able to show which Mexicans formed the imperial personnel, trace the political careers of 101 *imperialistas* and outline their economic activities, her interpretation of their monarchism is both novel and persuasive. As might have been suspected, although undemonstrated until now, the *imperialistas* were not a homogeneous faction. Those who supported this French-backed monarchical experiment did so for a wide range of reasons, and were often seriously divided over policy. What most of them shared was a sense of despair. The early national period with its chequered history of republican constitutional failure, the disastrous Mexican–American War (1846–48), and the War of the *Reforma* were experiences that moulded *imperialista* ideology. The need to impose order and stability, the desire to attract foreign capital and secure European protection from US expansionism, were aspirations that inspired a significant proportion of the Mexican political class to embrace the monarchical ideal. Although they tended to reject 'abstract' or 'foreign' ideas, believing that concrete problems could only be resolved with a pragmatic and realistic approach, many found Napoleon III's model in France worth emulating. And many, with the exception of the pro-clerical Conservative hardliners, believed in and fully supported the liberal policies Maximilian actually pursued once in power.

Among the numerous remarkable points that are made in Pani's study, the issue of continuity is perhaps the most salient. At one end, Pani's book demonstrates the extent to which the 1860s monarchical proposal was neither an aberration nor a foreign imposition. Its origins were decidedly Mexican. Mexican circumstances and Mexican ideas inspired a significant number of politicians to defend the imposition of a constitutional monarchy with a liberal European prince at its head. We are not dealing with a parenthesis within the historical narrative. The monarchist proposal was the result of at least two decades of unresolved political conflict. It was forged on the back of previous liberal and conservative proposals and the outcomes of their respective experiences in power. The Empire was as much a Mexican experiment as it was a French imposition. Furthermore at the other end, Pani highlights only too well how many of the precepts of the 1860s monarchical proposal went on to become among some of the most influential tenets of General Porfirio Díaz's regime. Albeit within a republican framework, the *porfiriato* equally strove to impose order and stability and attract foreign capital, with 'plenty of administration, no politics'. These continuities, moreover, developed as a number of key *imperialistas* such as Manuel Dublán, Juan A. Mateos and Manuel Payno, to name but three, went on to become active members of the political class that backed General Díaz's government.

Through this study Erika Pani joins such eminent revisionists as Paul Garner, Brain Hamnett, Andrés Lira, Elías José Palti and Barbara Tenenbaum, whose work

is, finally, beginning to free Mexican history from the so-called *liberal* historiographical tyranny it has been subjected to. *Para mexicanizar el Segundo Imperio* is destined to become a classic in the historiography. It is a must for anybody interested in understanding the complexities of Mexican politics during the mid-nineteenth-century watershed.

*University of St Andrews*

WILL FOWLER

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03286946

Richard Snyder, *Politics after Neoliberalism: Reregulation in Mexico* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), pp. xxi + 245, £40.00, hb.

What happens *after* developing countries adopt neoliberal policies? Expanding on Polanyi's (1944) insight that free-market reforms can result in new regulations, Snyder argues that, rather than creating laissez-faire markets, neoliberal reforms trigger the construction of new institutions for market governance.

Rather than using aggregate, national-level data, as is common in comparative politics, Snyder uses subnational units to study the economic reform of the Mexican coffee sector. He finds that governments of Mexico's coffee-producing states sought to establish policy frameworks that essentially reregulated what federal law had de-regulated. Snyder explores four different scenarios in which politicians and societal groups bargained over the dismantling of a huge federal government enterprise and the rules of new institutions. The new frameworks had dramatically different distributive and developmental consequences. In the states of Oaxaca and Chiapas, 'mass-based policy frameworks' resulted in institutions that promoted the welfare of small farmers and offered them channels for participating in policy decisions; in the states of Guerrero and Puebla, 'oligarchic policy frameworks' yielded institutions that served elite interests and reproduced longstanding patterns of exclusionary, top-down policy making.

Snyder's success story is Oaxaca. There, Governor Heladio Ramírez López (1986–92) responded to the state's withdrawal by launching an authoritarian, neo-corporatist regulation project (including a quasi-public company that would monopolise coffee exports) to occupy the policy areas vacated by the federal agency and to stop the spread of independent organisations in the coffee sector. He was challenged by a grassroots organisation, the State-wide Coordinating Network of Coffee Producers of Oaxaca (CEPCO), the strength of which based on its broad territorial scope, non-hierarchical internal organisation, and non-partisan productivist strategy – won it inclusion in the new policy framework. As a result, Ramírez created a new State Coffee Council that allowed producers to channel demands collectively, helped secure crucial collective goods for the coffee sector, and helped grassroots organisations to compete in global markets.

Snyder argues that, while students of comparative political economy are increasingly sceptical about the efficacy of corporatist institutions for managing challenges of economic adjustment, the case of Oaxaca shows that innovation along corporatist lines could potentially produce participatory policy frameworks in developing countries like Brazil, Venezuela, Egypt, Ghana, Ivory Coast and Thailand.

Snyder's analytical framework is part of a debate within the political economy of development literature and comparative politics (chapters one, two and seven). However, social scientists in general and scholars of Mexico in particular will greatly



benefit from reading this book's masterful subnational case studies (chapters three to six).

Although many anthropologists and historians have long argued for regional understandings of Mexico, Snyder's work is extraordinary in its comparative efforts. Based on over two hundred interviews with government officials and coffee producers, Snyder clearly presents a complex history of state–society power relations in four Mexican states. As opposed to more traditional regional studies, he manages this by limiting the time period (late 1980s to 1995) and the scope (the deregulation of coffee) of the inquiry. His presentation involves a sustained dialogue among the four state-level case studies, permitting him to identify different governing styles; structural, geographical, and ideological limits on agency; and the history and organisational structure of producer organisations. In so doing, he joins political scientists like Jonathan Fox and Jeffrey Rubin who have argued that, despite the extreme centralisation of power in Mexico, there are important differences in state–society relations across sub-national units.

Snyder's work raises important questions about the relationship between decentralisation and democratisation, challenging the common assumption in the development literature that equates decentralisation with participatory governance. For example, President Ernesto Zedillo (1994–2000) implemented a decentralisation programme intended to devolve increasing authority over economic development programmes to state and local governments. In the case of Puebla, this led to recentralisation at the state level, dramatically increasing the control of an authoritarian state government over agricultural policy. Moreover, we learn that political decentralisation threatened to reverse important advances that Mexico's small-producer organisations had achieved during the 1970s and 1980s by building national alliances.

What Snyder's case studies also show is that, despite electoral liberalisation in the 1990s, systematic abuse of power was pervasive at all government levels. The case studies are filled with examples of corruption, governors sanctioning the violation of federal rules, violence against members of political opposition groups, and coercion of independent organisations (or, alternatively, the use of state resources to co-opt coffee producers' organisations).

*Institute of Latin American Studies, London*

HELGA BAITENMANN

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03296942

Claudio Lomnitz, *Deep Mexico, Silent Mexico: An Anthropology of Nationalism* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2002), pp. xxiii + 354, £48.00, £19.00 pb.

It should come as no surprise that the most nuanced analysis of national identity in Mexico is still being undertaken by anthropologists. While this collection of essays by Claudio Lomnitz concedes with weary resignation that the potential of a national anthropology may now be exhausted, it remains loyal to the possibilities that the anthropological perspective can offer. Lomnitz combines such a perspective with a focus upon his chief historical preoccupation – the role of intellectual production in shaping the national idea – and the result is a distinctive brand of inquiry. *Deep Mexico, Silent Mexico* prioritises for sociological analysis the production of knowledge in the nationalist complex, and its most incisive chapters are those that examine the national idea in discourse. This collection of essays is an example of the increased



attention paid to Mexican nationalism since the 1980s, and its insights coincide with those emanating from other disciplinary directions.

Lomnitz's work is at once an examination of the modernist relationship between the content of the national idea and the politics of state-building, and of the cultural mechanisms that sustain it. But this collection can also be seen as a statement about the conceptual infrastructure that has permitted something akin to an official history to persist, worth reading for the critique of Enrique Krauze alone. Lomnitz's work is, moreover, infused with a sense of his own condition as a Mexican working outside the confines of national intellectual tradition.

The book's three parts explore nationalism, the public sphere and intellectual production. Part one provides an historical and theoretical framework for understanding Mexican nationalism and national identity in the *longue durée*. This begins with a critique of Benedict Anderson's influential work, allowing Lomnitz to advance his own understanding of the term as a productive discourse that provides an arena in which institutional and social relationships can be negotiated. Lomnitz draws attention to the politics of statebuilding behind nationalist discourse, the politicised nature of citizenship and its relationship with the construction of nationality. Part II examines the 'cultural geography' within which national identity emerges by discussing the plasticity of Mexico's public sphere. Spatial metaphors abound, in Lomnitz's theoretical approach as he explores the contexts in which national identity evolves from local identity-producing social relationships and processes of distinction. Part III analyses the generation of public knowledge about nationhood. Lomnitz argues that the limited instruments of government administration have encouraged intellectual 'mediums' to interpret popular will in the absence of a genuine public opinion. In this way, he sets the scene for his polemical critique of Krauze's *Mexico: Biography of Power*, reproducing an article that led to a vigorous exchange between the two men. Lomnitz argues that while Krauze's 'generation of mythmakers' have not been statebuilders themselves, they embody the longstanding concentration of cultural power linked to Mexico's authoritarian presidency. He considers the role that anthropology has played in shaping Mexican nationalism through a critique of Guillermo Bonfil's *México profundo* (1987) which takes issue with a primordialist nationalism while advancing the alternative notion of a 'silent Mexico', which gives this book its title.

While he aims to develop an historical sociology of Mexican nationalism, Lomnitz does not draw upon the theoretical literature influenced by the study of ethnicity, such as the work of Anthony Smith, that has made such a contribution to this endeavour. The dearth of studies of nationalism from within Mexico itself that draw upon such theoretical work can be associated with the doggedly persistent official history and the preponderant role of nationalism in shaping social thought that Lomnitz pays such critical attention to. Nor does Lomnitz develop his allusions in chapter five to the relationship between the state's role in fostering capital accumulation and cultural production into anything like a comprehensive treatment of political economy. Similarly, while dismissing neoliberal attempts to reformulate nationalism, he does not give them empirical content.

Nonetheless, Lomnitz pays considerable attention to the need to elaborate systematic principles for the generation of national identity that are linked to the evolution of the state and the production of knowledge. His recognition of the contingent quality of that identity and his forays against exceptionalism are refreshing. Although, other than references to Foucault and Bhabha, he does not

grapple with the forbidding literature circulating around the term ‘discourse’, the most incisive chapters of his book are those that examine narrative. Chapter twelve speaks to a body of thought that seeks to ascertain the role of intelligentsias in the reproduction of nationalist discourse and achieves the delicate reconciliation sought by Smith between tradition and modernity by linking localised mechanisms of cultural distinction to the broader policies of the state and national public sphere.

*Queen Mary, University of London*

GAVIN O’TOOLE

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03306947

Lynn Stephen, *Zapata Lives! Histories and Cultural Politics in Southern Mexico* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press, 2002), pp. xlv + 400, \$60.00, \$24.95 pb; £40.00, £17.95 pb.

Lynn Stephen is a respected anthropologist who has worked with indigenous communities in Oaxaca, Mexico for more than two decades. After the emergence of the Zapatista Army of National Liberation (EZLN) in 1994, Stephen extended her work to Chiapas, where she gained entrance and access to Zapatista communities largely through her involvement in human rights efforts. In *Zapata Lives!* Stephen compares local community histories in Oaxaca and Chiapas, arguing that these histories – ‘situated in specific geographies’ – are crucially important in the process of state formation.

Stephen argues that states and nationalism are constructed both from above and below. She illustrates this point by examining how state officials and local communities in Oaxaca and Chiapas have utilised the revolutionary figure of Emiliano Zapata – best known for his championing of land reform – for different purposes over time, to accomplish their goals and for their own ends. Stephen examines this process of state formation in Oaxaca and Chiapas during two periods: the consolidation of the Mexican state (1920s and 1930s) and the post NAFTA (1994-) period. In part one, she examines state formation from above. In parts two and three, state formation is viewed from below within the context of four local communities: Santa María del Tule and Unión Zapata in Oaxaca, Guadalupe Tepeyac and La Realidad in Chiapas.

In the 1920s and 1930s educators, cultural ‘missionaries’, and land reform officials attempted to incorporate rural citizens into the post-revolutionary Mexican state through the construction of schools and the establishment of *ejidos* (small communities organised around communal land plots granted by the government). Drawing on primary documents, such as textbooks, as well as on secondary sources describing public education in this period, Stephen concludes that the state of Oaxaca was more successful than Chiapas in incorporating rural citizens into the ‘revolutionary family’ through education and land reform programmes. She notes, for example, that while Oaxaca had a 27 per cent increase in state primary school enrollment from 1920 to 1928, Chiapas had a 55 per cent decline in such enrolment during this period (p. 41).

In the 1990s, hundreds of government workers once again fanned into the Mexican countryside. This time the goal was not to encourage participation in the government’s land reform programme but to educate and persuade citizens as to the merits of a new public policy initiative, the Programme for the Certification of

Ejido Land Rights and the Titling of Urban House Plots, or PROCEDURE. Land reform had officially ended in 1992 with the amendment to Article 27, which legalized the sale of *ejido* land and released the state from its obligation to distribute land to petitioning peasants. PROCEDURE emerged as the government sought to convince *ejidatarios* to map and title their land, so that 'individual plots could now be held in private tenancy' (p. 62). Drawing on data from state-level agricultural ministries, Stephen shows that PROCEDURE advanced much further in Oaxaca than in Chiapas. By 1999, 65 per cent of ejidos in Oaxaca had completed PROCEDURE, while in Chiapas, the corresponding figure was 23.2 percent (p. 74).

Turning to her case studies in parts two and three of the book, Stephen argues that while rural Oaxacans generally have had a more positive view of public policy and official nationalist narratives than their counterparts in Chiapas, in neither state did citizens accept or reject state policies and rhetoric wholesale. Since the 1920s rural Oaxacans largely embraced the figure of Zapata and the land reform extended in his name. Yet, after 1994 Stephen found that many rural Oaxacans supported the EZLN and its demands, while continuing to vote for the PRI in high numbers. For rural Chiapas, on the other hand, the figure of Zapata was not introduced until the 1970s, and then not by state officials, but by peasant union activists. The EZLN has laid claim to Zapata's legacy, but fused the revolutionary figure with indigenous elements to create *Votán Zapata* – supposedly a Tzeltal mythical figure. Stephen claims that *Votán Zapata* 'provided a focal point for the emerging Zapatista movement when it first consolidated among an isolated multiethnic group of mestizo, Tzeltal, Ch'ol, Tojolabal, and Tzotzil guerrillas and then was exported to surrounding communities through indigenous leaders and political operatives of the EZLN' (p. 164).

Stephen's book contributes significantly to scholarship on southern Mexico and the EZLN, and I highly recommend it. No other work has attempted, in as much detail, to situate the EZLN and Chiapas within a comparative context. While Stephen does not break new theoretical ground in her insights on state formation and nationalism, she does provide substantive empirical evidence to support her contention that local areas are an integral part of the process of state formation and nation building. Additionally, Stephen is exhaustive in her coverage of the secondary literature on educational policy, land reform and peasant organisation in twentieth century Chiapas and Oaxaca.

The book is strongest on the Oaxacan case studies, which is not surprising given Stephen's years of fieldwork there. The two Chiapas community studies are not as strong, given the difficulty she had in gaining access to these communities. Deep in Zapatista territory, Guadalupe Tepeyac and La Realidad were under heavy military surveillance during the time Stephen conducted her research. Stephen claims that her experience in Chiapas led her to conduct a new kind of fieldwork, which was more political, more actively engaged with her 'subjects', and more closely tied to human rights work. She sees her work 'as part of ongoing collaborative efforts that are reshaping the nature of anthropology through research that seeks to serve the communities in studies' (pp. 12–13).

Stephen's 'anthropology of witnessing' is a challenging idea, as it further blurs the admittedly porous distinction between activist and intellectual. Advocating for 'informants,' however, can be a tricky proposition. Stephen relies so heavily on Zapatista voices in Chiapas, in part because she committed herself to the Zapatistas she was working with and advocating for, that she may have sacrificed some of her

critical edge. That said, *Zapata Lives!* represents years of solid scholarship and fieldwork in southern Mexico and is a good and important book to read.

*Allegheny College, Meadville PA*

SHANNAN L. MATTIACE

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03316943

Helaine Silverman and Donald A. Proulx, *The Nasca* (Malden, MA, and Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2002), pp. xix + 339, £55.00, £19.99 pb.

*The Nasca* describes an archaeological culture flourishing in the south coast deserts of Peru, c. AD 1–800. It is best known for its beautiful polychrome pottery and for the creation of the ‘Nazca Lines’. The book’s purpose is ‘to provide a comprehensive synthesis of scholarly knowledge about Nasca culture and society’ (p. xi). For archaeologists acquainted with Andean material it succeeds; for a more general readership it will be hard going, because it assumes considerable knowledge and is written in the language of academic anthropologists. Knowledge of the Nasca is very patchy; there have been few scientific excavations, and the quality of reporting of data has been variable, which is reprehensible as the archaeological problems have been hugely exacerbated by the worst tomb looting in the world. Chapter one reviews the history of Nasca studies, and chapter two studies the problems of the Paracas culture antecedents of Nasca, and also outlines the relative chronologies advanced for Nasca ceramics, particularly that of the ‘Berkeley School’, eight of the nine phases of which are used throughout the book for ordering developments in Nasca material culture. The Nasca heartland is a series of desert oases in a transitional zone between the Andes and the coast. Chapter three examines how the climate and ecology effected the organisation and ideology of Nasca society. The environment was subject to occasional devastating floods and some prolonged periods of drought, the full impact of which on Nasca history has yet to be documented.

*The Nasca* defines the physical features and cultural practices that made up the Nasca identity. The latter part of the chapter differentiates the core area of Nasca – the Rio Grande de Nazca and Ica – from Nasca-related cultural manifestations to the north and south, none of which, rightly, are considered the product of an expansive state. Chapter five considers Nasca sites and settlement patterns. It begins with a surprisingly truncated description of the greatest Nasca site, Cahuachi, the apogee of which was c. AD 200–400. Silverman has convincingly demonstrated that Cahuachi was an empty ceremonial centre, the focus of pan-Nasca religious pilgrimage. There is a useful discussion of Nasca village sites and cemeteries before a phase-by-phase description of the occupation of the Rio Grande de Nazca drainage. The lack of close chronological control on most of the field data and the few excavations render conclusions in this sphere highly speculative. In chapter six Silverman and Proulx analyse *Symbolic Expressions of the Natural and Supernatural World*, particularly on painted pottery. They illustrate how the representations on pottery mirror mundane aspects of Nasca society and give insights into its concepts of the supernatural. The general conclusion is that ‘Nasca art indicates a major societal concern with agricultural fertility’ (p. 148).

Chapter seven is a comprehensive review of the geoglyph phenomenon (‘Nazca Lines’). The authors have a subtle, multi-layered view of their various significances in creating a structured and controlled environment. There are illuminating discussions of the lines as sites of movement and rituals concerned with bringing forth

water. Analysis of cult objects, iconography and ritual and social spaces is used to reconstruct *Religion and Ritual* in chapter eight. There are clear differences of approach between the authors in this chapter, Silverman deriving her interpretations from a belief in the existence of a ‘fundamental pan-Andean culture’ (p. 194), whilst Proulx prefers ‘to contextualize the study of Nasca religion within the larger framework of studies of Nasca iconography’ (p. 194). Both agree that Nasca religion was shamanistic – there was no state priesthood – and was essentially concerned with propitiating the deities and other forces responsible for agricultural fertility. Chapter nine deals with ‘trophy heads’ and warfare. ‘Trophy head’ is a convenient term to retain, but the actual activity involved in decapitation is disputed. The authors discuss the ‘significant shifts ... from early to late Nasca times in the role and meaning of trophy heads in Nasca practice and ideology’ (p. 237). There is an indisputable increase in warfare themes in Nasca 6 art, presumably reflecting change social realities.

Chapter ten is Silverman’s sole responsibility. She is concerned to reconstruct Nasca sociopolitical organisation and argues that ‘ethnographically and ethnohistorically known principles of Andean sociopolitical organization may have operated in Nasca time’ (p. 239), such as the *ayllu*. Silverman sees the core culture area populated by a series of independent communities, periodically, brought together by movements such as pilgrimages to Cahuachi. The collapse of Cahuachi at the end of Nasca 3 is discussed, but no firm reasons can yet be advanced for it. Nasca society was radically reorganised in Nasca 5, probably with the emergence of new elites, and Silverman’s discussion of the complexities of this transitional period are insightful. The final chapter envisions late Nasca culture disintegrating in Nasca phase 8. *The Nasca* can be recommended as the only comprehensive overview of its subject, and it is to be hoped that it will stimulate the programme of research badly needed to put to the test the plethora of ideas advanced in it.

*Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical  
Monuments of Wales*

DAVID M. BROWNE

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X0332694X

Penelope Z. Dransart, *Earth, Water, Fleece and Fabric: An Ethnography and Archaeology of Andean Camelid Herding* (London and New York: Routledge, 2002), pp. xvii + 308, £60.00, hb.

This book, in nine chapters, focuses on the place of camelids in south central Andean highland residents’ lives and cultures through time. Dransart uses both modern ethnographic and archaeological artifact research to explore this human-animal relationship, and in so doing weaves many related topics into her study of this northeastern Chilean region. It is an intricately presented book with each chapter bringing in a different set of data related to the topic of a small social group’s life in the dry western Andes. Essentially Dransart wants to pursue the contradictory and missing links that have been generated about herding as well as think about how animal domestication came about in a hunting/gathering society. The big conundrum is the development of caring for the animals while needing to destroy them for human survival. Dransart’s book centres on this debate as she follows both the maintenance of the herds and the people in this dry environment. Towards this end, she completed fieldwork over several years living in a herding community of Isluga,

Chile as well as excavating and studying several archaeological sites that are associated with hunting and herding of camelids to the east of San Pedro de Atacama, Chile in the Tulan basin. She highlights the centrality of fleece in these animal-oriented groups with a detailed investigation of spinning and weaving and the role of cloth and yarn production through time. She also looks at the artefactual evidence in rock shelters and caves for fleece processing and use in the past.

While she presents a series of models about herding societies as well as animal domestication, Dransart asserts a cultural view, strongly based on Ingold's herding work with reindeer. In this approach, the main factor that determines whether people hunt or herd in these severe climatic conditions is how humans view the animals. In essence, she claims that if people view the animals as a group then hunting will continue. Herding comes about when people begin caring for the animals as individuals. She brings in the important issues of Andean environmental conditions and spends time on the different camelid ecologies and requirements as well as data about climate change through the last 8000 years in the region to provide a substantial background to camelid-human relationships over time. As she expands on the symbolic aspects of animal fleece and its processing, we learn of the strong links between camelids, birds, water and fertility, seen also in the archaeological imagery. The animals, like birds, gravitate to and require water, which is the essence of fertility for all. While not stated, the issue of fertility is truly the core to Dransart's thesis, linking all of the different material together for both animals and humans. Her multi-faceted presentation allows for the acceptance of symbolic links seen on early ceramics, in archeological textiles and in modern ethnographic settings. As part of her section on modern camelid rearing, she presents a detailed description and interpretation of the marking ceremony that is the focal point of the annual cycle in Isluga. In her detailed reading of the ceremony, she attributes much of the residents' activities in their care of the animals to their links with the landscape and the spirits that live there. Over and over again, we see how animals are perceived to have a parallel life to humans.

When Dransart turns to spinning and weaving in chapter five, we get a detailed analysis of value for comparing with other textiles around the Andes. With chapters six to eight we turn to the archaeology in the region. First we learn about the early evidence for camelid weaving through items and imagery. Next there are brief presentations of some ten sites, with dates, architecture, rock art, plant and fleece evidence. Dransart then turns to the prehistoric yarn and textile evidence where we learn that many of the techniques employed today were used at least 3000 years ago. She astutely summarises how looped and coiled styles occur in the South-Central Andes while twining was more common in the north. Such long-term cultural continuities is a significant result of Dransart's sensitive and precise fabric study. She includes an extensive appendix of archaeological yarn and fabric details, a glossary of terms used, foot notes, bibliography, index and a website address (in the preface) that presents an archive of the colour images discussed in the text.

While this book presents an excellent summary of an archaeological region, the text's strengths lie equally in the ethnographic and weaving discussions.

*Department of Anthropology,  
University of California, Berkeley*

CHRISTINE A. HASTORF



*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03336946

Fernando Purcell Torretti, *Diversiones y juegos populares: formas de sociabilidad y crítica social, Colchagua, 1850–1880* (Santiago: Dirección de Bibliotecas, Archivos y Museos; LOM Ediciones; Centro de Investigaciones Diego Barros Arana, 2000), pp. 148, pb.

This enjoyable and informative study focuses primarily on socio-cultural spaces in Chilean rural society that were commonly known as *chinganas* – festive gatherings of the rural lower class that reproduced and reinforced ribaldry and debauchery, or at least that is what ‘upstanding’ Chileans believed in the nineteenth century. The author presents an empirically rich account of how and why *chinganas* and specific forms of *chingana* revelry, such as drinking, brawling, singing and dancing, became central elements of ‘popular’ culture in the bountiful Colchagua region of the Central Valley during the mid- and late-nineteenth century. He also assigns broader significance to *campesino* sociability and cultural practices in Colchagua when assessing the often-conflictive relations between *chingana* organisers/participants and national and local governments controlled by rather powerful and savvy landowners.

This book, which opens with a thoughtful and wide-ranging review of scholarly literature in the area of sociability and popular customs, rather clearly reflects the influence of such figures as Fernand Braudel and Maurice Agulhon on the author’s approach to his subject. Such sway is especially evident when Purcell underscores the applicability of studying ‘everyday life’ and social interaction within and among popular sectors in his call for de-centring the elite from Chilean historiography. In that vein, Purcell dismisses any notion that *chinganas* were mere manifestations of collective ‘escapism’. Instead, he argues, *chinganas* and other forms of rural revelry were firmly embedded in the lifeways and labour rhythms of the Central Valley countryside, where seasonal duties often dictated the time and place of popular festiveness. In essence, *chinganas* were not opportunities to exit – even for a brief time – ‘real’ life. They were a fundamental part of it.

The book not only depicts in considerable detail the many specific elements of *chingana* culture and sociability, including traditional dances (*cuecas*), chicken fights, and horse racing, but also addresses the very interesting issue of government regulation as well as the biting ‘social criticism’ of the Chilean elite who looked upon *chinganas* as the lowest of low-brow socio-cultural expressions. Beginning with a short discussion of laws that restricted *chinganas* during the earliest years of the republic under Bernardo O’Higgins, Purcell follows a trail of regulations through the 1830s that ‘institutionalised’ such festivities, incorporating them into the legal framework of a relatively new state. The intent of this incorporation was to limit, if not destroy, the *chinganas*, which the nineteenth-century elite interpreted as putrid lairs of deviance and immorality. The problem for government officials related to the enforcement of the numerous legal restrictions placed on *chinganas*. The fiscal insufficiencies of the central and local governments allowed for the open practice of ‘popular’ culture and sociability in Colchagua despite any social criticism it precipitated among the elite. Indeed, one also gathers that as long as landowners were pleased with their labourers, and as long as popular festivities dovetailed with state-endorsed commemorations such as Chile’s Independence Day (*dieciocho*) celebrations, the *chinganas* were allowed to go on despite their illegality.

While the book’s strengths are depiction and description (pithy quotes of considerable length are scattered throughout), it would have benefited from a more developed analytical posture. That is not to say the book is bereft of interpretation



and reflection. Empirical evidence, however, often is presented without interruption for analysis. Moreover, the reader is left wondering if social criticism flowed only in one direction. In other words, were *chinganas* and *chingana* activities imbued with ‘popular’ social criticism directed at those in loftier positions in nineteenth-century Chile’s socio-economic hierarchy? These issues aside, *Diversiones y juegos populares* is a well-written book with numerous interesting accounts of the social and cultural lives of so many Chileans who contributed to the social, economic and cultural fabrics of the nineteenth-century countryside.

Iowa State University

PATRICK BARR-MELEJ

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03346942

Pedro Bravo Elizondo and Bernardo Guerrero Jiménez, *Historia y ficción literaria sobre el ciclo salitrero en Chile* (Iquique, Chile: Ediciones Campus, Universidad Arturo Prat, 2000), pp. 205, pb.

If travelling northward by automobile or bus from the city of Copiapó, any visitor might soon arrive at some appreciation of the challenges and hardships faced by the many thousands of labourers who toiled daily in the nitrate production centres (*oficinas*) of Chile’s Norte Grande during the late-nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The environment was and is bleak. While scholars interested in nitrate production have focused mostly on the economic and social history of mining, little has been published on what may be called ‘nitrate literature’ – a distinctive species of literary nativism that coalesced during the heyday of the *pampa salitrera*.

Bringing together selections of Chilean fiction and non-fiction that, as the book’s concise introduction argues, bestow ‘meat, bones, and blood to the historical figures or ghosts of the past’, Bravo and Guerrero, both *iquiqueños*, bring to bear their collective erudition in the sphere of nitrate literature. This book is more an edited collection than a synthesis, and readers interested solely in fiction literature will be slightly misled by its modest title. Bravo and Guerrero include excerpts from newspapers, memoirs, and other chronicles, adding texture to a collection with samples of novels and short stories at its core. Simply put, Bravo and Guerrero have assembled a book about nitrate literature in a broad sense.

Bravo and Guerrero begin the book by pinpointing six themes – ‘La expansión salitrera’; ‘Despertar y combatividad del proletariado pampino’; ‘Santa María de Iquique’; ‘Recabarren’; ‘La gran crisis’; and ‘La epopeya social del salitre’ – providing a brief introduction and relevant excerpts for each. In ‘Despertar y combatividad del proletariado pampino’, for example, Bravo and Guerrero do a praiseworthy job of choosing samples that convey the heightened social and political tensions in the nitrate region during the so-called Parliamentary Republic (1891–1925). Their treatment of writers inspired by the naturalism of Zola and his famed *Germinal*, including Alejandro Escobar y Carvallo, precedes pithy selections presented later in the book. Moreover, a section of Luis Emilio Recabarren, Chile’s preeminent Marxist leader of the early twentieth century, offers a truly interesting excerpt from the memoirs of a most memorable figure of the Depression-era left: Elías Lafertte, the Communist Party leader who lost the 1932 presidential election to Arturo Alessandri Palma. Overall, Bravo and Guerrero bring together samples by and from a wide range of authors and sources, including Volodia Teitelboim, the Parisian newspaper *Le Figaro*, and Clodomiro Castro. The reader, furthermore, may

take particular interest in absorbing documents related to John Thomas North, the maverick British entrepreneur who very much shaped the *pampa salitrera* in the years after Chile's victory in the War of the Pacific.

While Bravo and Guerrero very skilfully draw out the relevance and significance of the book's selections, more robust attention to the nitrate genre's literary context would have been conducive to attracting a broader reading audience. In essence, the book would have benefited from greater contextualisation of 'nitrate literature', bringing in discussions of, say, the genre's place vis-à-vis *realismo* and *criollismo* in the broader current of Chilean literary production in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Such an exercise could have taken form in a conclusion or epilogue, either of which are absent. As it stands, however, this book is a very enjoyable and interesting contribution to our knowledge of Chilean literary culture. The collection deepens our understanding not only of nitrate literature but also of the genre's subjects – the workers and families who drove the 'nitrate cycle'. It should be added that reading this book will be a refreshing experience for those made weary by the economic history of nitrate production.

*Iowa State University*

PATRICK BARR-MELEJ

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03556949

Cristina Rojas, *Civilization and Violence: Regimes of Representation in Nineteenth-Century Colombia* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2002), pp. xxx + 224, £41.00, £16.50 pb.

The 1980s TV series *The A-Team* famously featured plenty of violence, but no one was ever seen to die on screen. Cristina Rojas' latest publication is similar in that in the study of what she calls 'post-Independence Colombia (1849–1878)', physical, 'manifested' violence gets little more than a passing mention. She looks instead at the violence she sees as inherent in Colombian 'regimes of representation'. By this she means the violence of a 'male creole literati's' discursive practices in establishing racial, gender, religious, regional and class difference, as part of a wider 'will to civilization'.

The value of Rojas' work lies in its attempt to understand the meanings of identities other than the political in Colombia's nineteenth-century. The book begins, 'Like many scholars born and raised in Colombia, I could not escape the question "why violence?"' (p. xi). Nevertheless, Rojas' aim is not to stress Colombian exceptionalism, but to use the country as a case study in a wider conceptual framework around the constitution of identities. This approach is refreshing and commendable. Rojas is correct to argue that 'to restrict our vision to only the most easily observable dimensions of violence, the tip of the iceberg, is to sanction its accidental, causal character and hence to place a shadow over the more permanent, subtle forms of violence' (p. xxiv). She advances our understanding of the Colombian case through a conscientious application of critical theories of violence in politics, psychoanalysis, anthropology and postcolonial theory. However, the book's shortcoming is that it does not translate the author's admirable intentions into analysis. The 'regime of representation' is allowed to become exactly the 'alternative mode of historical interpretation' (p. xix) argued for in the introduction – an *alternative* to the study of 'manifested violence'. The study of why people say nasty things about each other is simply substituted for one of why they hit each other. At no stage are wars, fights,

revolts, rapes or beatings actually considered as worthy subjects of study themselves, and important questions are left unasked. How did soldiers justify their own participation in such collective violence? Was physical violence against women or workers reported or described? Essentially: how was manifested violence *itself* received into these 'regimes of representation'?

The book begins with two chapters heavily-loaded with theory, 'The Will to Civilization' and 'Civilization and Violence'. Rojas is most convincing when arguing that civilisation and violence are by no means antagonistic, but in fact were often intertwined throughout the nineteenth century. Yet a definition of what elites actually meant when talking about civilisation is elusive. Here, the work would have benefited from a closer acquaintance with recent work on this period, particularly Frederic Martinez' *El nacionalismo cosmopolita. La referencia europea en la construcción nacional de Colombia, 1845–1900* (Bogotá, 2001) and Víctor Uribe Urán's *Honourable Lives: Lawyers, Family and Politics in Colombia, 1780–1850* (Pittsburgh, 2000). The material in those studies would have given the discussions of the post-independence elites have a historical grounding that it sometimes lacks.

Chapters on 'The Political Economy of Civilization', and 'The Will to Civilization and its Encounter with Laissez-Faire' demonstrate the ways that the violence of representation impacted on Colombians' lives in this period. 'Representation, Violence and the Uneven Development of Capitalism' introduces a useful regional analysis, comparing Cauca, Santander, Cundinamarca and Antioquia. Equally effective is chapter four, 'The Subalterns' Voices', which analyses a variety of literary sources to reveal the conflicts and tensions experienced by those who lived on the boundaries of civilisation. Yet Rojas' excellent discussions of the lives and works of the black poet Candelario Obeso, and the female creole writer Soledad Acosta, further underline the depersonalised nature of the preceding chapters dealing with the 'male creole literati'. It is illustrative that the only violent death explicitly referred to in the whole text is the lamented suicide of Candelario Obeso.

Rojas' writing is not helped by clumsy copy-editing, and the survival of some basic historical errors. For example, Francisco de Paula Santander is twice erroneously referred to as president of Colombia (p. 60; p. 98) when he was still vice-president serving under Simón Bolívar. In parts, Rojas' obvious grasp of the complexity of the subject struggles to emerge from beneath an excess of erudite referencing and stumbling prose. Elsewhere, she provides an illuminating perspective on mid-nineteenth century Colombia.

Rather than answering the 'Why violence?' question posited at the beginning, the conclusion belatedly directs our attention to 'Why war?', with a confident dismantling of Samuel Huntington's *Clash of Civilizations* theory. While Rojas' arguments here are sound, they sit uneasily at the end of a text in which representation has been analysed entirely apart from the processes and consequences of war. The conclusion that 'violence can be resolved only in representation, by refixing meanings and recreating original relations of identity and difference' (p. 170) remains, therefore, unproven.

University College London

MATTHEW BROWN

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03366945

Mimi Sheller, *Democracy After Slavery: Black Publics and Peasant Radicalism in Haiti and Jamaica* (London and Oxford: Macmillan Education Ltd., and USA: University Press of Florida, 2000), pp. xv + 270, £55.00, hb.

This lively, forcefully-argued book deals with two post-emancipation peasant uprisings: the 1844 Piquet and the 1865 Morant Bay rebellions in Haiti and Jamaica. It argues that underlying the islands' differing political trajectories (e.g. independent vs. colonial government, revolutionary vs. constitutional process of abolition) were the commonalities of a strong peasant and rural worker base determined to achieve citizen rights and the emergence of 'black (subaltern) publics' to conduct the struggle. In the upshot, in a pattern clearly defined in the post-emancipation United States and discernible in ex-slave societies across the Americas, those aspirations were obstructed by nominally liberal democratic elites. In these islands, rebellion followed. The author assembles a battery of primary and secondary historical sources and cuts an analytical swath through an array of sociological expertise to substantiate this thesis and established some significant comparisons.

The rebellions reflected the peasants' profound long-term disillusion with post-emancipation society and a sharp immediate reversal of raised expectations. In the Haitian case hopes derived from the urban mulatto-led and massively black-supported 1843 Liberal Revolution which ousted the de facto military government of mulatto Jean Pierre Boyer. The new government promised broad equal rights for all male citizens but was soon re-subordinated to mulatto and military rule. Armed rebellion by large- and small-scale black landowners and rural workers ensued.

The influence of the black publics in these processes can only be inferred. Popular political disillusionment in Jamaica, where there was freedom of assembly, franchise rights and a free press, was articulated at public protest meetings by local leaders. The cries were for land, increased wages, reduced taxes, capital, credit and against repression and political corruption. Hopes of redress were raised in 1865 when a visiting missionary (Edward B. Underhill), shocked by the levels of outright destitution publicly petitioned the imperial government for redress. This sparked an island-wide movement which besieged the authorities with a mass black demand for reform and redress only to be denied both. Rage and despair came to a head in a confrontation between peasants and militia at Morant Bay.

Peasants in both islands looked to leaders only marginally removed from their own ranks: Acau in Haiti was a renegade rural policeman, an instrument of Boyer's repressive regimes Jamaica's Paul Bogle was a native Baptist minister. And both leaders represented elements of a cross class alliance: in Acau's case substantial and small black landowners in opposition to the mulattos, and in Bogle's association with radical mulattos in opposition to the whites. Sheller has made a significant contribution to the extensive literature on Morant Bay by indicating the role played by these radicals in the Underhill movement and their close concern with Haitian politics – the 'Haitian dimension' feared by the colonial government.

Comparison between these rebellions also highlights interesting contrasts, particularly in terms of scale and political sophistication. The Piquet rebels, product of Haiti's traditions of revolution and military dictatorship, raised an army, defeated government troops and established, if only briefly, a territorial base. The Morant Bay events are more ambiguous and, as Sheller indicates, historians remain divided as to categorising them as a rebellion. The rebels comprised one lightly armed column: insofar as there was a rebel network and stockpiles of arms (and Sheller suggests

there was) the organisational level was poor, inferior to the level achieved in the 1831 slave rebellion.

Acauu's 'army of sufferers', moreover, had a well articulated political programme which claimed political equality for blacks and the material base to sustain it – land re-distribution, free compulsory education, increased crop and decreased import prices – demands which arguably identified Acauu as a socialist (p. 136) and perhaps reflected the intellectual influence of radical urban mulattos attuned to metropolitan debates. The cry 'colour for colour' raised at the moment of rebellion in Morant Bay expressed only the perceived need for black power which linked Bogle with Acauu.

Sheller's emphasis falls on the fact that, in political terms, these challenges met with similar responses from nominally liberal democratic authorities. The Piquets were defeated, Acauu jailed and mulatto supremacy in various forms restored: Morant Bay first prompted military repression of the unarmed population in the Eastern parishes and subsequent abolition by the imperial government of Jamaica's local parliamentary forms, a move which took almost a century to reverse. In both cases a popular black challenge to established nominally liberal authorities meant that the 'window of democratic opportunity' was slammed shut.

The book asserts the importance of grass-roots radicalism and reminds readers of the limitations of a democracy based on property rather than civic or human rights. And although the imbalance between the literature on Morant Bay as compared to the Piquet rebellion (which awaits its historian) underlines the continuing need for national studies, Sheller's bold effort to cut across the entrenched historiographical tradition of national and regional based Caribbean studies will hopefully establish a new trend.

*Institute of Commonwealth Studies, University of London*

MARY TURNER

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03376941

Laura J. McClusky, *'Here, Our Culture is Hard': Stories of Domestic Violence from a Mayan Community in Belize* (Austin, TX: University of Texan Press, 2001), pp. x + 310, \$45.00, \$21.95 pb.

*'Here, Our Culture is Hard'* is an engaging and highly accessible series of narratives about women and men in a Belizian Maya village focusing on domestic violence. In her introduction, McClusky makes the case for the study of domestic violence in an anthropological context which, according to her, it is a 'closed topic' (p. 7). The idea that domestic violence is something of a taboo (*ibid.*) for anthropologists is rather overdrawn and the assertion that anthropologists cannot obtain funding for doing such research very puzzling indeed. There are numerous works by anthropologists on gendered violence in general and domestic violence in particular, including several who work in Latin America. There is curiously no mention of Norwegian anthropologist Kristi Anne Stølen's work in Ecuador (1987, 1991) or the response from Sánchez Parga (1990) which occasioned a vigorous debate within Latin American anthropology. Nor is Harvey and Gow's (1994) volume cited which includes several articles on domestic violence, some from Latin American anthropologists. One of these is Olivia Harris, whose excellent paper (2000) discusses domestic violence as a social phenomenon within a specific cultural context – precisely the kind of analysis that McClusky argues is absent from anthropology.

McClusky is right, however, to say that book-length treatments of domestic violence are rare, but what is particularly interesting to the reader is the anthropological style she uses. She calls it 'narrative anthropology' and she blends the recorded data she collected according to traditional social science methods with a creative narrative. The book is then constructed around these narratives which read much like a novel as one goes through the lives of the various protagonists who are based on real people although some characters have been combined. The result is a rich, documentary-style account of the lives of people the reader soon becomes deeply familiar with: Olive Tzir, the young woman who works hard to change her community; Risa, the 'lazy' young bride; Cil, the village constable; Mr Coc, the shopkeeper; Francesca, the plump woman who has adopted several children and so on. Many of these lives overlap and the reader gets a very holistic sense of life in this village as the author takes us to the river to wash and bathe, to the mill to grind corn and through various people's daily lives.

McClusky does offer us a very full account of life in Mopan. The description is rich and detailed with long conversations mostly rendered in Belizian creole which is the language through which McClusky appears to have done most of her fieldwork, although there are a few Mayan phrases scattered through the narratives. I must confess, however, to some unease at this form of writing as it is never evident whose account this ultimately is. The many pages of reported speech are largely imaginative and engaging creations of the author, not actual utterances. I suspect many other readers will be uncomfortable with this mixture of creative writing and social science because one is never clear of the separation between the two. Yet other readers, I daresay, will have no difficulty with this at all, but McClusky herself wonders if she is right to 'feed two husbands' (p. 269) with this methodological *mélange* (the husbands being standard and narrative ethnography) and she may have done better to write two separate accounts.

Concerns about methodology and writings styles aside, this book provides a rich account of people's lives, their frustrations and aspirations as it follows them through their lives. Although the book focuses on domestic violence, there is much more material on such things as adoption, funerals, courtship, social change, marriage and work. Domestic violence is then carefully situated in very human relationships within a very specific cultural context; the contexts and consequences of violence are carefully and sometimes lyrically reproduced. We learn that there is some agreement on legitimate and illegitimate beatings, that mothers-in-law will sometimes encourage their sons to beat their wives, and that beatings decline with age as women gain more respect. As one might suspect with 'narrative anthropology', there is little analysis although each chapter does conclude with a section entitled 'analysis' in a nod to the other 'husband' McClusky hopes to feed. I think he remains hungry and I would have liked to read much more analysis of, for example, why drunk men cannot prevent themselves from beating their young wives but can prevent themselves from beating older wives. I would have liked to read much more about mothers-in-law and some further analysis of their roles in violence, perhaps related to a broader theoretical perspective. This second husband is fed snacks which, in some ways, is worse than not being fed at all.

McClusky has produced a very readable ethnography of Mayan life in Belize. This book will be useful for students of anthropology and Latin American Studies, not only for its content, but also for the methodological issues it raises.



## References cited

- J. Sánchez Parga, *¿Por qué golpearla?* (Quito, 1990).  
 K. A. Stølen, *A media voz: Relaciones de género en la sierra ecuatoriana* (Quito, 1987).  
 K. A. Stølen, 'Gender, Sexuality and Violence in Ecuador', in K. A. Stølen (ed.), *Gender, Culture and Power in Developing Countries* (Oslo, 1991), pp. 80–105.  
 O. Harris, 'Condor and Bull: The Ambiguities of Masculinity in Northern Potosí,' in O. Harris, *To Make the Earth Bear Fruit* (London, 2000), pp. 141–63.  
 P. Harvey and P. Gow (eds.), *Sex and Violence. Issues in Representation and Experience* (London, 1994).

University of Essex

ANDREW CANESSA

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03386948

David Howard, *Coloring and Nation. Race and Ethnicity in the Dominican Republic* (Oxford: Signal Books, and Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers, 2001), pp. xii + 227, £19.99 pb; £39.99 hb.

In *Coloring the Nation: Race and Ethnicity in the Dominican Republic*, David Howard makes an important contribution to the study of Dominican society and the complex dynamics of race relations in an island historically inhabited by people of different cultures and racial backgrounds. Complicating race relations is the shared insularity, the fact that the Island of Hispaniola or Santo Domingo, as the Spaniards originally named it, is the home of two different countries, whose colonial history unfolded differently. While Haiti or Saint Domingue was a rich and glorious colony of France, what later became the Dominican Republic declined into a neglected and impoverished Spanish colony from the seventeenth century. These different historical trajectories became prominent in the nineteenth century, when both societies sought to create their own identity as national and cultural entities. Through slave uprisings, Haiti gained its independence in 1804, and at the end of the eighteenth century Toussaint Louverture called for the island to be one and indivisible. Dominican independence from Spain, on the other hand, followed a longer and more uncertain path. The ephemeral Dominican independence of 1821 ended quickly with a Haitian occupation of the eastern part of the island in 1822. Dominicans gained independence again in 1844, this time from Haiti. Thereafter, social tensions, political conflicts and human suffering have marked the relationship between these neighbouring countries.

In what can be viewed as a benign assessment of racism in the Dominican Republic, Howard makes the claim that 'Dominican identity incorporates a racism that is more often insidious than overt' (p. 15). Yet, a closer reading of his data suggests otherwise. It may be true that anti-Haitian feelings are stronger than anti-black feelings; in other words, that being a black Dominican is preferable to being a black Haitian. Yet, the construction of an anti-Haitian identity is not only rooted in a national conflict, but also in a racial articulation of what is best and preferable, as Howard rightly indicates. In this regard, racial prejudices of Dominicans are not different from those of many other people in many other societies; they are, however, aggravated in the Dominican Republic by the (inter) national conflict.

Howard is correct in arguing, as others have before him, that the African heritage has been neglected or denied in the Dominican Republic. He explains that there



are three distinguishable racial–social categories: the blanco/a, the indio/a, and the negro/a. Social preferences and aesthetics follow this order, which leads Dominicans to choose indio/a over negro/a. This is certainly the case: indio/a is a more widely used and socially accepted racial category. An incorrect interpretation, however, is to assume that Dominicans somehow have a sense of identity around the notion of ‘indio’, understood as people of indigenous descent because the term indio/a is adopted as a racial definition. In fact, Dominicans do not have a well-rooted, indigenous-based identity. There are no significant traces of indigenous culture in the Dominican Republic, as Howard points out. Neither has there been an important attempt to uncover the anthropological past of the indigenous inhabitants. In this regard, there is not a strong sense of indio/a as an ethnic construction; it is basically used as a racial category.

Anti-Haitianism has been frequently used as a political tool in Dominican society as the book explains, so the significance of race extends beyond the socioeconomic sphere. Both in the nineteenth and twentieth century, intellectuals provided a rationale for political leaders to gather support and build a sense of common destiny among Dominicans. The strategy tends to work effectively at times of political crisis, but it declines in significance at other times. The arguments resonate in people’s feelings and thoughts about themselves, their country and their neighbours. Many of the quotes in the book from the interviewees illustrate these viewpoints: Haitians are too many; they are poor; they speak a different language; and they have a different religion. Does this mean that Dominicans define themselves primarily as White, Hispanic and Catholic? Howard thinks so, as others do; yet I do not find convincing evidence to support this claim outside official discourses whether by intellectuals or politicians. While the White–Hispanic–Catholic argument is valid for the identity definition of the intellectual and economic elite, for the rest of the population, only Catholicism is clearly an important defining characteristic. For most people, Hispanic is important only in connection to the Spanish language, not necessarily in the definition of any other specific Spanish traits. In fact, what constitutes ‘La Raza Dominicana’, is a theme raised in the book that remains unexplained in contemporary terms. Defined vis-à-vis Haiti, it is easy to claim that ‘La Raza Dominicana’ is White, Hispanic and Catholic. But when the question is posed from within, the definition of ‘Dominicanness’ becomes less clear. Truly, most Dominicans do not see themselves as black, but this is not to say that they see themselves necessarily as white.

To sort out the complexity of self-definition, identity construction and race relations in the Dominican Republic requires more research. The question of who Dominicans think they are, not only who they dislike, requires further consideration. It is important to move beyond the White–Hispanic–Catholic conceptualisation, beyond the use of terms such as indio/a as ethnic definition, regardless of how important they are to understand racial identity and race relations. *Coloring the Nation* moves us in the right direction. Enriched by empirical data and a thoughtful analysis, the book surveys the opinion of Dominicans on a variety of race-related issues. In this regard, it is required reading for those interested in the study of race and identity formation in the Dominican Republic. The book also provides a solid intellectual framework for thinking about relevant questions and examining available evidence.

*Temple University*

ROSARIO ESPINAL

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03396944

Alejandro de la Fuente, *A Nation for All: Race, Inequality, and Politics in Twentieth-Century Cuba* (Chapel Hill, NC, and London: The University of North Carolina Press, 2001), pp. xiv + 449, £16.96, pb.

Although race has always played a central part in the defining of Cuban society, only recently has full attention been given to the role of race in Cuban history. Alejandro de la Fuente's comprehensive account of the interplay between race and politics in twentieth-century Cuba joins a growing body of research that has sought to remove Cuban race relations from the margins of intellectual debate, and to develop a more complex understanding of how the formation of the Cuban nation and race are inextricably linked.<sup>1</sup>

Much of de la Fuente's earlier work has concentrated on the early twentieth century.<sup>2</sup> It is this study of the foundations of the Cuban republic, and the ambiguous definitions of race and nation that were central to this, that he seeks to extrapolate in this book, which covers the entire period from the end of the US occupation in 1902 up to the present day.<sup>3</sup> He divides the text into four principal sections. The first traces, from 1902 to the 1933 revolution, the conflicting notions of *cubanidad*, and the question of whether Cuba would be racially controlled or racially democratic, paying particular attention to the manipulation of race in successive elections. The second section takes an overview of changing racial inequality in pre-1959 Cuban society. The third returns to the chronological account of the interaction of race and politics, during the Second Republic from 1933 to 1959, with particular attention to the Communist Party's campaign to secure a legal end to discrimination. The fourth part looks at race in Cuba following the 1959 revolution, assessing to what extent the dream of a nation for all was made real under socialism, and showing how the economic crisis of the nineties helped to uncover underlying racial prejudices, and to recreate racial discrimination.

De la Fuente sets out to answer three important questions: how racially unequal was and is Cuba; the explanation for this inequality; and the role played by racial ideology in the defining of racial co-existence in the Cuban nation (pp. 5–6). He achieves this through the combination of two interrelated themes that have run through twentieth-century Cuban history. On the one hand, there is the contradiction between the gradual improvement in the position of Afro-Cubans within Cuban society, and yet the persistence of inequalities that can be seen even to this

<sup>1</sup> Outstanding are: Pedro Pérez Sarduy and Jean Stubbs (eds.), *Afro-Cuban Voices: On Race and Identity in Contemporary Cuba* (Gainesville, 2000); Ada Ferrer, *Insurgent Cuba: Race, Nation, and Revolution, 1868–1898* (Chapel Hill & London, 1999); Lisa Brock and Digna Castaneda Fuertes, *Between Race and Empire: African-Americans and Cubans before the Cuban Revolution* (Philadelphia, 1998); Robin Moore, *Nationalizing Blackness: Afro-Cubanismo and the Artistic Revolution in Havana, 1920–1940* (Pittsburgh, 1997); Aline Helg, *Our Rightful Share: The Afro-Cuban Struggle for Equality, 1886–1912* (Chapel Hill, 1995).

<sup>2</sup> Alejandro de la Fuente, 'Two Dangers, One Solution: Immigration, Race and Labor in Cuba, 1900–1930,' *International Labor and Working Class History*, vol. 51 (Spring, 1997); Alejandro de la Fuente, 'Myths of Racial Democracy: Cuba, 1900–1912,' *Latin American Research Review*, Vol. 34:3 (1999), pp. 39–73.

<sup>3</sup> The first steps towards this overview were made by him in: Alejandro de la Fuente, 'Race and Inequality in Cuba, 1899–1981,' *Journal of Contemporary History*, vol. 30 (1995), pp. 131–68; and Alejandro de la Fuente, 'Race, National Discourse, and Politics in Cuba: An Overview,' *Latin American Perspectives* (May, 1998), pp. 43–69.

day, after more than forty years of a revolution that declared racial discrimination to be a thing of the past. On the other hand, there has been the interplay between the two, mutually exclusive ideological positions that have defined the Cuban nation: that which uses José Martí's vision of a colour-blind nation as a cover for underlying racism; and that which recognises that, far from having been achieved upon independence, this vision continues to be fought over. Throughout the book, de la Fuente convincingly brings out the tensions between these positions, and shows how they were of primary importance in the political developments of the century.

Although de la Fuente successfully answers the above questions, he also raises several other concerns that remain largely unresolved in his book. On a number of occasions he touches upon how race can only be fully understood in conjunction with class, stating that racial divisions, far from being absolute, both reinforced and cut across social class divisions. Yet he pays little more than lip service to this, missing the opportunity to explore the complexity of social inequality and division in Cuba. It is perhaps indicative that, with the exception of the final chapters on race in the revolution, the Afro-Cuban voices that are heard tend to be those of black intellectuals and political leaders. Since the same is true of white Cubans, the arena in which de la Fuente plays out the story is largely that of institutional politics, with the experience of the multi-racial Cuban popular classes barely glimpsed through statistics and the impressions of various elite groups. This is despite his own assertion that everyday life and experience is a source of racial identity and division (p. 19).

De la Fuente likewise pays little detailed attention to the specific experiences of Afro-Cuban women. Rather than exploring how gender divisions provide another dimension to the understanding of racially-defined inequality, he relegates women to occasional paragraphs that make it appear that their story is merely incidental to, or a special case of, male-dominated political and ideological struggles. The fact that he himself points towards these other social divisions, that are not separate from but inevitably interacting with that of race, without fully taking them on board, weakens a study that pretends to provide a wide reaching reappraisal of twentieth-century Cuban history.

Having said this, de la Fuente's book is clearly an important and original contribution to the reassessment of race in Cuba. It is also a very timely study, given the increasing awareness in Cuba itself that there are no easy panaceas for the racial divisions, prejudices and inequalities that have been, and continue to be, of such great importance in the history of the island. It is above all this that de la Fuente convincingly reveals: the ambiguity that has led Cuba to oscillate 'between the hope of racial fraternity and the threat of racial confrontation' (p. 17).

*London Metropolitan University*

JONATHAN CURRY-MACHADO

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03406949

Manuel de Paz-Sánchez, *Zona de guerra: España y la revolución cubana (1960–1962)* (Tenerife, Gran Canaria: Centro de la Cultura Popular Canaria, 2001), pp. 388, hb.

The continuation of the diplomatic and commercial relations between the Franco and Castro regimes, so distinct in politics and economics, remains the subject of speculation. Still enigmatic are the alleged motivations of both dictators to keep the link between the two nations, in spite of their ideological differences and the

existence of some notable incidents involving public figures and private citizens. After all, thousands of Spanish immigrants in Cuba were deprived of their possessions and were never properly compensated.

The spark that almost broke this important historical relationship was the grave incident caused by the Spanish ambassador in Havana, Juan Pablo de Lojendio. At midnight on January 21 1960 he went in person to the television studios of the important Telemundo network and, live, he faced Fidel Castro and called him a liar for his accusations of an alleged conspiracy formed by the Spanish embassy and groups of counter-revolutionaries. Expelled from the country, Lojendio left Cuba the following day. Castro, aware that a Spanish plot did not exist, exploited the confrontation for domestic purposes, equating the Spanish activities with US imperialism.

However, in spite of certain official shows of solidarity for Lojendio in Spain, the record shows that Franco was not pleased with his ambassador. As a standard punishment for diplomats who made mistakes, he remained ('doing the corridors', as the expression goes) marginalised in the ministry of foreign affairs for a while before being reinstated to the formal echelons of the diplomatic career. In one of Franco's rare expressed opinions inserted in the memoirs of his cousin, the Spanish dictator justified his implicit censure of the diplomat because he supposedly endangered the Spanish interests in Cuba and he later provoked the expulsion of Spanish religious orders, one of the most impressive samples of the Spanish presence in Cuba after the end of the War of 1898.

Franco, a member of a generation traumatised by the memories of that war that ended four centuries of Spain's domination in the Caribbean island, had to place himself under the hegemony of the United States during the Cold War, even after Truman vetoed its membership in the United Nations and the development of NATO. According to one line of interpretation, Franco's continuation of Spain's relations with Cuba was justified as a sort of silent protest against the United States.

There was another more pragmatic reason: the hope of recovering the debt that had progressively grown because of the expropriations and the absence of payments for the trade between the two countries. The commercial link was also maintained because Cuba became an adequate market for certain Spanish products and manufactured goods that were not competitive in other Latin American countries under the overwhelming presence of the US export economy or were limited by the protective measures of the Latin American governments in the era of import-substitution policies. Cuba was a captive market worth keeping for Spain's newly liberalised economy.

However, the story of the Spain–Cuba relationship during the Franco era is more complex. According to views of Spanish representatives who served in Havana, in the worst moments of friction between the Spanish and Cuban governments, behind the scenes suggestions received by Franco to maintain the diplomatic link came from two apparently unexpected fronts: Washington and the Vatican. In the '60s and '70s, successive US governments considered the maintenance of the Spanish 'antenna' in Havana as extremely useful. This status quo was not interpreted as a defeat for US pressures, and was explainable for historical and cultural linkages. The record also shows that through Spain and via Iberia Airlines, thousands of Spaniards left Cuba and later settled in Miami, where they had more family and social links than with their former distant nation of origin. For the Vatican and the historically weak Cuban Catholic Church, the official presence of Spain was a guarantee.

The publication of *Zona de guerra: España y la Revolución Cubana (1960–62)*, a new, impressive book by Canarian scholar Rafael de Paz-Sánchez, is destined to fill a vacuum in the field of recent historical relations between Spain and Cuba. As with his previous book (*Zona rebelde: la diplomacia española ante la Revolución Cubana, 1957–1960*. Santa Cruz de Tenerife: Centro de la Cultura Popular Canaria, 1997), this volume dispels certain myths and confirms several trends and facts scattered through the considerable bibliography of the relationship between the two countries, but still lagging in conclusive, more recent research on this intriguing period.

The two dictators avoided tensing the rope too much not only because they professed a sort of mutual admiration. It is true that Franco professed fascination for three masters of guerrilla warfare (a military tactic variation that left an indelible mark after his service experience in Morocco): Mao, Ho Chi Minh and Castro. It is also true that Castro disliked jokes about the deceased Franco, alleging that the *gallego* behaved very well with him.

In reality, as de Paz-Sánchez demonstrates, the Spanish diplomacy of the '60s was more preoccupied with the spread of the case of Mexico. The Spanish regime tried at all cost to ensure that the Mexican boycott of Spain, maintained from the end of the Spanish Civil War until the disappearance of the Franco regime, would not become contagious to other Latin American republics in an era when the subcontinent was still attracted to the mystique of the *castrista* model. A confrontation with Havana would have meant a strengthening of the Spanish exiles in the Americas. In contrast, refusing to clone the US embargo gave the Spanish diplomacy a false aura of autonomy in Latin America in full implementation of its 'foreign policy of substitution' to make up for its shortcoming in others.

Although this aspect of the book by de Paz-Sánchez is only a fraction of its full content, it alone merits a reading for any expert or educated reader of the fascinating relationship between Spain and its former colony. Based on first hand research in the archives of the ministry of foreign affairs, the book shows an impressive portrait of the perception of the Spanish leadership not only of the evolutions of its relations with Cuba, but also about the general political and economic scene during the crucial period of US–Latin American relations. Spanish opinions about important episodes such as the Bay of Pigs fiasco and the missile crisis are also objects of several pages of commentary and analysis executed with an impeccable neutrality and avoidance of unnecessary editorialising.

*University of Miami*

JOAQUÍN ROY

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03416945

Pedro Monreal (ed.), *Development Prospects in Cuba: An Agenda in the Making* (London: Institute of Latin American Studies, University of London, 2002), pp. vi + 244, £14.95, pb.

When Cuba's economic expansion of the 1970s was in full bloom, the state began to support self-study of its model by Cuban economists. Early writings by Cuban economists tended to be unanalytical and uncritical recitals of Cuba's development achievements. Slowly, over time, economists with more refined analytical tools and critical perspectives began to emerge.

Generally, this new group of economists has been constrained by the politically-imposed, restricted scope of discussion on the island. Over the past ten years Pedro Monreal, the book's editor, has distinguished himself not only as one of the most

perceptive and creative economists but also one of its most daring – frequently willing to test the limits of permissible discourse.

In many respects, the present volume reaps the benefits of Monreal's initiative. Monreal's own lead article plausibly postulates that Cuba has been stuck in an import substitution strategy, complemented by natural resource and low productivity exports. To elevate itself onto a successful development trajectory Monreal argues that the Cuban economy must adopt an export substitution strategy wherein new technologically and skilled-labour-intensive exports are promoted. Apart from a few taxonomical issues in his discussion, the main failing in Monreal's argument is that it tends toward tautology. Namely, development depends on the successful introduction of higher productivity sectors into the economy. The fundamental questions left untouched by Monreal are how to identify and promote such sectors. Why, for instance, have biotechnology exports – a logical candidate for Monreal's proposed export substitution – stagnated? Is the problem systemic? Is the present set of economic institutions and policies in Cuba consistent with the economic upgrading proposed?

The clearest and most cogent answer to that question is given in the excellent essay by Colombian economist Mauricio de Miranda. De Miranda carefully lays out the case for massive economic distortions arising from the state's pervasive regulatory controls. De Miranda first identifies Cuba's dual exchange rate (an official rate of peso/dollar parity and a market rate of roughly 22 pesos per dollar) as giving insufficient incentive to Cuba's exporters and reinforcing the inefficient patterns in Cuban industries producing for the internal dollar market. Next, de Miranda notes that the country's wage scale prevents industry from competing for the most technically and professionally proficient labour. He then notes the prevalence of skilled workers leaving their jobs in education, medicine or state industry to work in the dollar economy as taxi drivers or hotel employees, and criticises the strict limitations on employing non-family labour in the country's diminutive private sector. De Miranda also observes the irony that, with no capital market, Cuban citizens have little incentive to save and are converted into full-time consumers despite leadership critiques of the consumerist culture of capitalism.

De Miranda calls for the consistent use of the market mechanism with parametric controls and redistributive policies (e.g., taxes and transfers) in the place of rationing and price controls. Of course, to the extent that the market mechanism is engaged and greater leeway is given to the development of the private sector, other institutional changes will be necessary (e.g., clearer definition of property rights, an independent judiciary, fuller development of financial markets) for successful implementation.

Julio Carranza's essay provides an overview of the Cuban economy in the 1990s. Carranza also is critical of excessive bureaucratic controls but appears more sanguine that the current model is adaptable to the country's long-term development needs. He, for instance, expresses hope that the ongoing 'business improvement' reform will yield significant benefits, but Carranza fails to explain how this will happen absent a more thoroughgoing decentralization of the economy. In the end, he echoes Monreal's endorsement of skilled-labour-intensive exports, but provides no analysis of why Cuba's experiments in biotechnology, computers and medical equipment have not been more successful.

Everlery Pérez offers a brief history of the Cuban experience with foreign investment. His article contains some useful data, but suffers from unclear and



incomplete exposition at points. The absence of any discussion of the free trade zones or the impact of the policy requiring foreign companies to pay for Cuban workers indirectly in dollars via state agencies (that then pay the workers in pesos) is noteworthy.

Hiram Marquetti and Anicia García contribute an interesting article on Cuban industrial growth that begins to address some of the issues raised by Monreal. Their piece, as others in the collection, suffers from unclear graphs and failure to indicate or adjust for the base year in time series data in constant prices.

Contributions from Lazaro Peña on Cuban sugar, Francisco León on regional trade insertion, Julio Díaz on market reform in China, Vietnam and Cuba, and Claes Brundenius on industrial upgrading and human capital in Cuba round out the collection. Overall, despite some shortcomings, this is one of the better and more balanced collections on the Cuban economy available.

*Smith College, Northampton, MA*

ANDREW ZIMBALIST

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03426941

Kristin Mann and Edna G. Bay (eds.), *Rethinking the African Diaspora: The Making of a Black Atlantic World in the Bight of Benin and Brazil* (London and Portland, OR: Frank Cass, 2001), pp. 160, £45.00, £17.50 pb.

Starting from the premise that the beginnings of the African diaspora occurred with the 'movement of slaves north across the Sahara, west across the Atlantic, and across different areas of Africa' (p. 7), the editors and contributors of this volume depart from the traditional unidirectional emphasis on cultural flow of the estimated, 2,000,000 forced migrants who were enslaved along the Bight of Benin and landed in Brazil's province of Bahia. Instead, the introduction and the nine essays that follow; initially presented in 1998 at an international conference on the commercial, historical and cultural links over 250 years along this south Atlantic trade route, advance a multidirectional flow of complex cultural blends of Africans and peoples of African descent on both continents. Contributing to some three decades of historical research on the development of the African diaspora, the authors document the regional and temporal dispersal of many groups of Africans and consider that many slave trades, rather than a single slave trade, accurately characterise the history of the Black Atlantic. Kristin Mann's opening essay on the shifting paradigms in the study of the African diaspora distances itself from the Africanist-creolist debate, emphasising sensitivity to 'the relationship between the Old and New World influences in specific historical contexts' (p. 6).

Towards this objective, the essays by Robin Law, Olabiyi Lay and Elisée Soumonu explore the impact of the resident Brazilian community that evolved under the Brazilian, Francisco Felix de Souza and his successors, in the major slaving port of Ouidah, where from 1670 to the 1860s as many as 60 per cent of the slaves exported from the Bight of Benin are thought to have gone to Brazil. Law examines changes in local African and Brazilian leadership in the port and surrounding region where, in the wake of the decline in the transatlantic slave trade, the influence of Brazilian trades also ebbed due to their inability to compete in the palm oil trade or to alter the new lines of material culture that were introduced by British and the eventually dominant French interests. Edna Bay probes the Dahomean meaning of the Atlantic slave trade through the collective memory of *bo*, charms that were used to protect threatened individuals and communities. She also uncovers documents and oral



traditions that follow on from the earlier findings of Melville Herskovits and Robin Law that the overseas slave trade was a means for elites to exile political enemies (p. 58). Luis Nicolau Parés, João José Reis and Alberto da Costa e Silva examine aspects of the religious practices of Africans and their descendants in Brazil. Luis Nicolau Parés's videotapes provide the bases for his exploration of similarities and differences in Jeje religious orthodoxies in Maranhão and Bahia, followed by indications of links between the Casa das Minas in São Luis Maranhão and the Nesuhué cult from Abomey in Benin. João José Reis examines the diffusion of Candomblé in nineteenth-century Bahian society through the gathering for worship of Africans from different ethnic backgrounds, the recruitment of initiates, and the spiritual and magical services that Candomblé offered to slaves and free persons from mixed racial and social backgrounds (p. 133). Alberto da Costa e Silva's discovery of the purchase and sale by the Fauchon and Dupont bookshop in Rio de Janeiro of some one hundred Korans, written in Arabic, provides a fascinating departure point for the exploration of the secretive world of the African Muslim (*mussulmis*) religious leaders and followers, their linkages to Bahia and to Africa, the persecution that haunted them, and the gradual isolation and virtual disappearance in the early decades of the twentieth century. In the final essay, Kim Butler argues that a reconceptualisation of ethnic groups (*nações*) on the basis of religion instead of birthplace through the vehicle of Candomblé maintained Africanisms as a vital part of Bahian culture and also enabled the move from the African phase to the modern Brazilian form of Candomblé, the popularisation of which embraces followers well beyond the African community. The focus of each essay on a specific historical reality involving two pivotal regions adds to the continuous historical experience of the African diaspora and probes new directions in the circulation of peoples of African descent around the Atlantic world.

*King's College London*

NANCY PRISCILLA NARO

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03436948

Imme Scholz, *Overexploitation or Sustainable Management: Action Patterns of the Tropical Timber Industry, the Case of Pará (Brazil), 1960–1997* (London and Portland, OR: Frank Cass, in association with the German Development Institute, Bonn, 2001), pp. xviii + 459, £45.00, hb.

Will the timber industry continue to be a cause of environmental destruction in the Brazilian Amazon, or is logging compatible with enlightened public policies for the Amazon's environmental resources? This important question is at the centre of Imme Scholz's study of the timber industry in Pará, a large state in the eastern Brazilian Amazon. Scholz argues that the timber industry in Pará should aim for 'flexible specialization in niche markets' that value the 'special aesthetic and physical features of tropical timber' (pp. 369–70). Policies to encourage this change in industrial behaviour include maintaining the export ban on logs (in place since 1974), encouraging environmental certification of timber from managed areas and strengthening environmental bureaucracies. Scholz suggests that actors in Pará who are 'committed' to this path will benefit from international development co-operation (p. 373). Perhaps the German Development Institute, which assisted in the publication of this book (and is Scholz's employer) will be especially generous in assisting the turn to 'niche markets'.

The core of Scholz's research is detailed study of 17 timber entrepreneurs in Pará, six of which are sawmill operators. According to Scholz, the 'action patterns' of sawmills may be summarised as follows: they are inefficient and unproductive; they use low levels of technology; they are primarily family-run enterprises; they exploit a relatively small number of tree species; they operate as if they were temporary activities, investing profits not in the sawmill or in reforestation, but in other assets; procurement of timber is often from intermediaries, or directly (and illegally) from public land, rather than concessions.

Scholz devotes much less attention to the institutional and political contexts in which Pará's sawmills operate. We learn that SUDAM, the now-disbanded Amazonian development agency infamous for its corruption and notorious environmental legacy, did little to promote modernisation of Pará's timber industry. A single forestry proponent within its ranks lost out to interests who favoured subsidies for cattle ranching. However, a broader analysis detailing how SUDAM's policies affected the timber sector is lacking. Scholz also quickly dismisses the Pará association of timber exporters as having 'very limited understanding of the technical function and economics of forestry' because they are 'mainly interested in rescinding instruments of planning and control' (p. 264). However, only a few pages earlier, Scholz admits that there are 'progressive' and 'traditionalist' factions within the industrial association (p. 256). Only in the book's final pages is any attention given to Pará's political culture and how it affects on environment-related activities (p. 374).

Although Scholz's main conceptual question is whether international trade is compatible with low-impact logging, her analysis primarily deals with why the Pará timber industry has failed to innovate. Her interesting discussion of ecological certification stresses its limitations in the Amazonian context (p. 164), but remains disconnected from sawmills that would be encouraged to become 'certified' producers of tropical timber. Even though the premise of ecological certification is sustainable management of tropical forests, Scholz undermines her position by admitting that there is 'no agreement on principles to which any sustained use of tropical forests would have to be oriented' (p. 147). If 'sustainable forestry' does not exist, then how can it be the basis for a reformed timber sector in Pará? Perhaps the answer may be found in Scholz's controversial suggestion that Pará's 'deforested, degraded areas' could be transformed into 'plantations based on a combination of various native and exotic species' (p. 366).

The book is not without several other problems, including excessively dense theoretical discussions, seemingly endless statistics of the Pará timber industry that substitute proper analytical discussion, omission of labour relations and Brazilian marketing networks from 'action patterns' and an excessive listing of ideas, rather than a fluid narrative, burdens the text unnecessarily. Although the book will interest specialists in Brazil's Amazon region and the timber industry, the set of ideas it contains could have been made significantly more concise, and certainly could have been published to a higher standard.

*Texas A and M University*

CHRISTIAN BRANNSTROM

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03446944

Maurício Rands Barros, *Labour Relations and the New Unionism in Contemporary Brazil* (Basingstoke: Macmillan Press, 1999), pp. xx + 321, £57.50 hb.

The New Unionism was perhaps the most notable of the 'new' social movements that emerged in the dying days of the Brazilian military regime. It represented not the organised expression of a previously unrepresented social sector, but rather a rejection of the prevailing authoritarian form of corporatist interest representation imposed on urban labour back in the days of Vargas' Estado Novo. As such, it challenged the role of the State in channelling, shaping and dominating labour's collective demands. The touchstones of this 'new' unionism were autonomy, internal democracy, collective bargaining outside the tutelage of the state, labour mobilisation and an ambition to tackle social issues beyond the strict remit of organised labour. It was assumed, as much by the new union leadership as by academic commentators, that this attempt to free unions from the bonds of the labour ministry and become a new social force in Brazil would be accompanied by a concomitant change in the way individual and collective trade union members related to the state, that is, they would move from being clients to becoming active citizens.

But are workers in the 'New Unions' more active citizens than those in the old-style, corporatist unions? Barros' study of a selection of labour unions in Pernambuco state in northeastern Brazil uses survey data to measure the real extent of attitudinal changes at the level of the shopfloor and local union leadership. This approach has two considerable virtues. First, in the best tradition of labour studies, it solicits the view of ordinary workers, rather than privileging the discourses and pronouncements of the union hierarchy, or focusing exclusively on institutional-level change. Secondly, this regional study is a much-needed counterbalance to the many studies of the New Union movement in Brazil that focus on its birthplace, the industrial belt surrounding São Paulo city. Using a multiple regression analysis Barros determines the degree to which membership of a union affiliated to the CUT (the movement's peak organisation) is an causal factor in his interviewees' personal adherence to a set of values indicating more 'active' citizenship, by comparison to other more structural and sociological explanatory variables such as age, education, gender and income.

Overall, the study finds sufficient statistical evidence to claim that 'new unionists' share political horizons that extend beyond economic self-interest. However, the study makes clear that political change in the labour movement has been uneven and proceeded at different speeds depending on the orientation of the union leadership, the economic sector, region and the size of the unions. The institutional reforms that the CUT fought for were only partially won, and therefore many trade unions had strong financial incentives for sticking with the old system, and associated dependency. For example, the 1988 Constitution did not eradicate the union tax, paid by individual union members to the ministry of labour and then paid back to the unions for the provision of welfare services, and thus maintained a lifeline and *raison d'être* for many small or unreformed unions. This is an excellent study that contributes to the field in several ways. For those with a general interest in the labour movement in Brazil, it gives a good clear account of the old labour relations model and the new alternatives proposed by the CUT. It also offers a portrait of an under-researched region. Finally, the finely weighted discussion of the survey data in relation to the dependent variable of citizenship is a most welcome addition both to

comparative studies of social movements and of industrial relations, particularly those oriented at the viewpoint of the rank-and-file.

*Institute of Latin American Studies,  
University of London*

FIONA MACAULAY

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03456940

Luis Alberto Romero (translated by James Brennan), *A History of Argentina in the Twentieth Century* (University Park, PA: Penn State University Press, 2002), pp. xiv + 370, \$60.00, \$22.50 pb.

Both in its current and in its original Spanish form as a *Breve Historia Contemporánea* published in 1994, Romero's work occupies a unique position in the historical writing on twentieth century Argentina. Other syntheses encompass either a much broader period starting either in 1776 or 1810 or adopt a more contemporary focus from 1930 or 1946. Romero starts his study in 1916, the year that marked the application of the recent democratic reform to a presidential election and the election of Radical party leader Hipólito Yrigoyen. The choice of starting point makes the issue of building a democracy in Argentina the focal point of the study. Here, democratisation acquires centrality against the issues associated with the career of Juan Perón such as nationalism, corporatism, anti-imperialism, labour rights or authoritarianism.

Romero's approach identifies him as a progressive liberal reformer. Like many members of his generation, he endured exile in the 1970s before returning to assume a prominent position in university teaching and policy-making for higher education under Raúl Alfonsín in the 1980s. His account of Argentina's twentieth-century history is written with the passion and commitment that only a native-born scholar can attain. He displays impressive credentials as a historical researcher. He betrays none of the bigotry that mars the work of many of his Argentine predecessors who have pursued broadly similar objectives. No doubt Luis Alberto Romero found inspiration for this book in *Las ideas políticas en la Argentina*, the famous work of his father, José Luis Romero, published almost fifty years ago. The son's book is superior to the father's in substance, sophistication and analytical quality. In the English language edition, Romero has taken the story up to early 2002 by sketching the calamitous decline and collapse of the neo-liberal model of the 1990s created by President Carlos Menem.

The book deals primarily with political history. It also covers the main topics in social development such as the rise of the urban middle and working classes and in economic development such as agriculture and industrial development. In analysing every administration sequentially since the Yrigoyen government of 1916, Romero risks lapsing into trivia and adopting an excessively traditional approach. He avoids such pitfalls by the quality of his writing (well re-captured in James Brennan's translation) and by the impressive depth of his knowledge. He varies the sequential approach by parenthetical analyses of economic and social development. He displays particular expertise on cultural and social development in the 1920s and 1930s, a subject he has worked on separately. Romero's decision to start his book in 1916, however, leads him to neglect some nineteenth-century themes such as regional interactions and the functions of presidential patronage in linking the provinces with Buenos Aires. These issues have revived

in importance under Menem and his successors. Similarly, the recent economic boom and collapse in Argentina has many parallels (and contrasts) with the foreign investment boom of the 1880s, which ended in the Baring crisis of 1890. The comparison with the Baring crisis emphasises the intractability of the current situation in Argentina, which can no longer export its way to recovery. Romero's more limited twentieth-century focus means that the struggle between democrats and authoritarian militarists, which has been almost dead over the past decade, remains at centre stage in his narrative.

While it maintains a high quality throughout, the book appears strongest on the post-Perón era. The analysis of the Aramburu–Frondizi period of 1955–1962 displays exceptional understanding. The book reaches a highpoint in Romero's account of the 1970s – the resurgence and collapse of the Peronist movement (1973–1976) and the rise of the military dictatorship styled the Process of National Reorganisation (1976–1983). On the chaotic era of Peronism in the seventies, Romero provides a peerlessly comprehensive and clear narrative. His account of the tyrannical rule of the 'Process' reiterates some well-known issues and material, but the author's dispassionate and sparse style intensifies the effectiveness of his indictment. Romero notes the ideological kinship between the economic policies pursued by José A. Martínez de Hoz under the Process and those of Domingo Cavallo under Menem. Despite employing entirely different monetary systems, the two ministers shared a commitment to neoliberalism. They each sought to restore the power of the market in Argentina, suppressing the legacy of Peronist interventionism. Currently, neoliberalism in Argentina has failed either as the arm of a dictatorship or of a democracy. In English, the book possibly assumes too much prior knowledge on the part of the reader. That assumption represents the only possible drawback to the book's wide acceptance by the English-speaking public.

*University of California, Santa Barbara*

DAVID ROCK

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03466947

Eduardo P. Archetti, *Masculinities: Football, Polo and the Tango in Argentina* (Oxford and New York: Berg Publishers, 1999), pp. xviii + 212, £39.99, £14.99 pb; \$65.00, \$19.50 pb.

It is a memory that still haunts the English football fan, long accustomed to disappointment: that of the two goals scored by Diego Maradona which put England out of the Mexico City World Cup in 1986. The first, 'the hand of God', saw Maradona palm the ball over the goalkeeper; the second came at the end of an extraordinary dribble (the *gambeta*) that took him half the length of the field, past most of the England team. Here he exhibited the craftiness, but also the extraordinary skill and creativity of the *pibe* – he was known in Argentina as the *pibe de oro* – the man-child who has been depicted as the symbol of Argentine football since the 1920s. As Archetti's fascinating account informs us, the Argentine sports magazine *El Gráfico* developed through the twenties and thirties a theory of the two 'foundings' of Argentine football: the first founding was British, the second was *criollo*. In this analysis, the discipline and physicality that the British brought to the game gave way to the spontaneity and improvisation of these urban sons of immigrants, the *pibes*, who 'nationalised' football through a fresh and spontaneous style learned in the

*potreros*, or urban empty spaces. One of the magazine's most famous journalists, Borocotó, declared in 1928 that Argentina should build a monument to the inventor of dribbling. It would represent:

'A *pibe* with a dirty face, a mane of hair rebelling against the comb; with intelligent, roving, trickster and persuasive eyes and a sparkling gaze ... His knees covered with the scabs of wounds disinfected by fate; barefoot or with shoes whose holes in the toes suggest that they must have been made with so much shooting. His stance must be characteristic; it must seem as if he is dribbling with a rag ball' (p. 181).

Borocotó could have been describing the popular image of Maradona, some sixty years before his 1986 demonstration of *viveza criolla* but also of consummate skill. British discipline and organisation was on this occasion left flat-footed, just as Borocotó, Chantecler and other *El Gráfico* journalists had imagined it would and should be in the 1920s, when Argentina started to show the world a new football style and win international recognition.

By concentrating on the early decades of the twentieth century, Archetti is building on the work of Argentine scholars such as Beatriz Sarlo (*Una modernidad periférica: Buenos Aires 1920 y 1930*, Buenos Aires 1988) who have analysed the 'peripheral modernity' of Argentina, the cultural mixing or 'hybridity' (one of Archetti's preferred analytical terms) caused by widespread immigration, and the growth of nationalist discourses. Archetti, one of the world's leading experts on Argentine football, has the development of this sport as his main focus, but he also includes discussion of polo and of tango lyrics as he seeks to define representations of Argentine masculinity in this maelstrom of the new. The world of polo offers slightly different images to that of football. Here the British (who brought polo as well as football to Argentina) are not so much erased from the national discourse by cheeky *pibes*, but rather they become Argentine 'gauchos' through riding the best polo ponies in the world and having contact with the 'barbarous' spirit of the pampas. The Argentine team who won the gold medal at the Olympic Games in 1924 ensured that, from that moment, the Argentine style and the Argentine pony would become central to polo played anywhere in the world. Polo is another example of what Archetti terms 'hybridity' in a national sport, but this was a sport that displayed a more traditional form of masculine identity, that extolled skill, dexterity and physical courage. Archetti then takes us from the playing fields of estancias and country clubs, to the brothels, dancing academies and cabarets of Buenos Aires, where tango was danced and sung. He traces the 'male discourse on gender relations' in tango, the sexual fantasies where men could take time out from the snares of domesticity, dance or have sex with a *milongueta* (a woman working in the clubs), emulate a *bacán* (a rich man), and ape or admire the *compadrito*, the neighbourhood hard man. The gap between the desire and the reality is often the theme of tango, leading to bitterness, suffering or nostalgia, the unsettling of fixed masculine identities.

Archetti covers a lot of ground in this rich and varied book. The work is theoretically sophisticated and based on wide-ranging scholarship. He shows, convincingly, how,

'the *potrero*, the *pibe*, the gaucho-like polo player as well as the *milongueta*, the *compadrito* and the *bacán* pertain to a mythical account which reproduces a tradition and a multiple and complex masculine world. In this world, there is no room for the family, work



and fatherhood. This national male imagery is not the official one. All these liminal figures ... threaten well established moral codes' (p. 189).

*University of Warwick*

JOHN KING

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03476943

Vilma Santiago-Irizarry, *Medicalizing Ethnicity* (Ithaca, NY, and London: Cornell University Press, 2001), pp. xi + 178, \$16.95, pb.

This is a timely book. There has been a need for a critical assessment of the essentialist and reductionist uses of the 'Latino' category in medical and mental health settings in the USA, and Santiago-Irizarry has provided us with it. The book is a study of the discursive practises emerging from three different projects in the New York City area. The aim of the work is to unveil some of the intentionalities and the paradoxes at stake in the implementation of ethnic sensitive programmes for the Latino population. Santiago-Irizarry concludes that the use of ethnicity in these programmes reproduces the very system that its inclusion was aimed at transforming (p. 146). Ethnicity becomes a 'form' or an appendix of psychiatric practice rather than changing the content of medical practices and the unequal and hegemonic relations that these practices foster. Broadly speaking, her critique is about how a notion (rather than a process) of culture is used for institutional entitlements in the USA, and how the playing of a multicultural/ethnic sensitive card in a psychiatric medical setting transforms culture into a pathogenic element 'to be treated', overruling its situated connections to aspects of gender and class which also engender mental illness. Nonetheless, this book is also about (and refreshingly so) the paradoxes and the institutionalising strategies that insert 'Latino' as a category in the US mental health system rather than on the analysis of the 'cultural' pathologies that emerge in the Latino population.

Santiago-Irizarry makes her points through the analysis of three different programmes. Two since the early/mid 1980s, have targeted mainly youth, women and patients defined as 'chronically ill', and one, located in a City hospital which treats people with acute short-term conditions. The author clearly shows how Latinos are constructed by mental health professional practices as a category of vulnerable 'others' in need of particular 'sensitive' attention. Paradoxically the mental health workers, who are often recruited among Latino themselves, often end up representing the Latino patient population through stereotypes and hierarchical representations especially in matter of language uses and food practices. For instance Puertorican signs and symbolism are used to represent the Latino population at large in a clear attempt of 'intracultural domination'. Santiago-Irizarry also focuses on the negotiations between the organisation 'Congress for Hispanic Mental Health' and the New York State Office of Mental Health to gain resources to target Latinos. She shows how the Hispanic Health Institute implements project evaluation methods that subtly re-inscribe cultural phenomena (such as *santería*, and *espiritismo*) as an appendix rather than a transformative element of psychiatric practice.

The particular strength of this book is that it goes beyond the study of culturally-bonded expressions of mental and physical states that are often short-circuited into psychiatric categories. Instead it addresses 'the institutional and practical contexts in which health is ministered to for differentially constituted sociocultural actors' (p. 35). In an interesting chapter Santiago-Irizarry analyses the problematic

assumption of taking Spanish language as the ‘natural’ language for all the Latino population regardless of their differences. Spanish language is feminised, devoided of its power for authority and converted into the unique carrier of motherhood/emotional expressions and capacity for regression – regardless of the complexity, borrowing and mixing that take place among, and between, different groups of the Latino population.

The critique that this book develops is an important contribution to the deconstruction of behavioural studies of ethnicity in US medical discourses, but it is just a first step. The book could have given us deeper ethnographic insights into the multiple layers of othering which operate together with the Latino ethnic label, such as the gendering of the ‘ethnic’ patient and the contradictory manifestations of patients’ embodied agency. We are left with some important questions about the embodiment of experience of this particular medical discourse. But this would require another book where the point of entry is the experience, resistance and compliance of patients to the institutionalising medical practices rather than the mental health institutions, working teams and the culture of the organizations in which they operate. This book is a timely contribution to the medical anthropological field and the areas of Latino studies and the sociology of medicine.

*University of Cambridge*

VALENTINA NAPOLITANO

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X0348694X

Peter Lloyd-Sherlock (ed.), *Healthcare Reform and Poverty in Latin America* (London: Institute of Latin American Studies, University of London, 2000), pp. x + 197, £12.00; \$19.95, pb.

Many governments are inclined to market changes to the health sector as ‘reforms’ in order that ministries may appear as though they are undertaking new and far-reaching reform programmes. This is not a new phenomenon, nor is it one that has brought about significant change in the organisation and management of the health systems of Latin America. However, in the last decade or so this has all changed. In place of the customary failed attempts at reform, the region has been witness to some of the most radical neo-liberal health sector reforms in the world. Much of that process has focused upon the private-public sector mix, the development of alternative management strategies and decentralisation; it has also placed considerable emphasis upon the concepts of equity and efficiency.

This volume is a useful contribution to a complex topic that combines both broad theoretical discussion of key issues with country-specific illustrations from El Salvador, the North-East of Brazil, Chile, Cuba, Mexico, Argentina and Colombia. The chapters explore everything from the theory and practice of health reform, to decentralisation, policies for the poor and the equity conditions of health systems before and after the introduction of reform programmes. The first chapter provides a useful framework for the articles, placing the work described in the current social and political context of globalisation, appropriate health policies, democratisation, poverty, social exclusion, violence and the role of health professionals. The chapter also shows how an emphasis on equity has served to promote a consensus amongst a wide range of different groups at the possible expense of protection of the weaker citizen from market dependency and any previous commitments to universal welfare.

The second chapter sets out to develop a new approach to healthcare systems, which it is claimed, could be applied in most Latin American countries. Operating from the premise that health systems can only be effectively re-structured if future policy is able to take into account the diverse conditions within Latin America, a conception of the health system as the interaction between populations and institutions is proposed. Under this model the health sector would provide strategic direction to the entire health system instead of being one of the weaker health service providers. However, the idea of structured pluralism is predicted upon the delegation of many functions to participatory organisations from civil society as part of its overriding commitment to increase the options for consumers and providers. Not only is the liable further to complicate an already over-burdened system, it is also likely to prove unworkable in situations that fail to have sufficient organisations with the capacity to compete for the enrolment of local people, such as in rural areas. Finally, in spite of the importance attached to the diverse conditions of Latin America, the absence of any socio-political component means that it is unclear how the model may operate in practice.

If high levels of support are to be retained for the view that investing in health is the best way to reduce poverty, engagement with the nature (and history) of citizen–state relations in any given situation is imperative. Not only does this require an understanding of the dynamics of poverty and social exclusion, it also requires a willingness to address those issues that are responsible for the exclusion of specific groups from social services.

These points are examined in some detail in the following chapters. In El Salvador (chapter three) the failure to consider reform within the context of national culture and local values is asserted as a fundamental challenge to those international agencies that persist in the belief that public interaction in the design and implementation of any reform programme is unnecessary. Further evidence of such manifest indifference to the interests and priorities of local people is also demonstrated in the case-study from Brazil (chapter four), where patron–client networks and an authoritarian power structure serves to exclude the population from any opportunity to exert collective pressure for improved health care provision. In the case-study from Mexico (chapter seven) such apparent indifference to local opinion is treated as an inevitable consequence of programmes directed at widely dispersed rural populations. However, any lack of suitable local advocacy groups or political parties with the capacity to assess the programme's suitability or ensure its reasonable implementation does not excuse the failure to respond to those prevailing inequities which underpin any widely dispersed, poorly organised population. Such evident unwillingness to engage with the local action environment calls into question the real objective of health sector reform. Instead of any commitment to improve the health status of the population, reform continues to be dominated by structural re-organisation at the expense of any genuine engagement with the nature (and history) of citizen–state relations.

In view of the complexity of the subject a chapter at the end of the book designed to draw all these various themes together would have been useful; there is no general conclusion. Overall this is a useful collection, particularly when set beside other recent publications such as the recent collection edited by Kelley Lee and others, *Health Policy in a Globalising World*, published by Cambridge University Press in 2001.

*University of Wales, Swansea*

TIM BOWYER

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03496946

Forrest D. Colburn, *Latin America at the End of Politics* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2002), pp. 142, £24.95, £10.95 pb; \$35.00, \$14.95 pb.

This is a collection of impressions and anecdotes on several dimensions of current Latin America: poverty, cities, migration, environment, business, gender, painting, democracy, crime, identities ... Such a broad scope is covered at the cost of unevenness. One-sided approaches to poverty or democracy go in hand with insightful comments on the ups and downs of private business in unstable economic and institutional settings, or with trivial statements on crime or life in megacities.

A recurrent ingredient in this book is the author's perplexity in the face of the coexistence of the institutions of representative democracy with high poverty and crime rates, environmental deterioration, joblessness and many other well-known ingredients of today's Latin American social crisis. Colburn takes for granted the neoconservative assertion of a universalisation of liberal democracy in the hemisphere, rejecting the many interesting discussions and alternative interpretations developed in the last decade and a half on that very subject. According to Colburn, the reason for this coexistence is none other than the ideological void which characterises Latin America's current politics, as well people's supposed disregard for social inequalities. Highly disputable as they are, none of these assertions is afforded even a minimal discussion nor are they strengthened by any empirical or theoretical foundation: they are simply presented as self-evident truths.

Colburn's obliviousness as to on-going debates and discussions in Latin American studies is favoured by the literary style he chose: rejecting the tools as well the challenges of the social sciences, this book goes back to a pre-scientific stage of dealing with human affairs. Any meaningful discussion of the very nature of current political regimes, and their uneasy relations with particular socioeconomic settings, is thereby avoided. Something similar has to be said with regard to the chapters on poverty – a simplistic summing up of the much criticised InterAmerican Development Bank's 1998–99 Report – ideologies – a repetition of old-fashioned arguments dating back to the 1950s hypothesis on 'the end of ideologies' at the precise moment when the so-called 'Washington Consensus' is facing heavy criticism even from IMF and World Bank technocrats – crime, urban crisis, gender issues, etc. What Colburn presents as a collection of objective pictures is, on the contrary, a biased narrative borrowing its basic presumptions from a particular conservative ideological matrix. Certainly, there is poverty, environmental degradation, crime and unemployment in Latin America, even at rates not known before. But there is also a collective search for alternatives to them, which involves conflict, dissent and struggle – all conspicuously absent from Colburn's stories. It is also impossible to figure out how things came to be as they are, and there is no reason to think that this is a relevant issue in the author's intellectual matrix. While Francis Fukuyama fantasised with the 'end of history', Colburn seems to pretend that history starts right now.

To his moral credit, Colburn is not happy with most of the things he writes about in this book. Yet, the intellectual repertoire he appeals to prevents him from reaching a more insightful perspective. Real life goes far beyond personal impressions or testimonial experiences. That is one of the basic reasons for the usefulness of the social sciences and of academic methodologies. Had the author appealed to these more conventional disciplines, he could have avoided becoming the prisoner of subjective illusion or obvious mistakes. Thus, when dealing with

Latin American liberalism, one has to look not to the British Lockean tradition (as Colburn does in chapter two), but to the French and Spanish one in the early 1800s; as any Latin American high school student knows, it was not *The Second Treatise ...* but *Le Contrat Social* and the *Constitución de Cádiz* that provided the early sources of Latin American liberalism. Nor has equality ever been an ingredient of the Latin American version of liberalism, save in a very restricted formal legal format with no systematic implementation. If a Mexican peasant believes that Mexico's president 'is Spanish' (p. 23) he is culturally correct: for most of Central American aboriginal peasants, white countrymen are called 'españoles' (or *Ispail nani*, as the Mískitu Indians put it). And when social or political tensions, conflicts and contradictions are reduced to mere 'puzzles' (p. 15), there is scant room for meaningful discussion.

In a certain sense, Colburn's book resembles the seventeenth to nineteenth century literature of European travellers, whose recollections were a mixture of benevolence, aloofness and astonishment. Coming back home from some extended journey into the mysteries, wonders or curiosities of the New World, this literature inflamed the fantasies of its readers. Resorting in our day to such an outdated style frees the author to submit ideas and statements to the relentless discipline of the academic profession.

*Universidad Nacional de Lanús*

CARLOS M. VILAS

*J. Lat. Amer. Stud.* 35 (2003). DOI: 10.1017/S0022216X03506940

Pablo Toral, *The Reconquest of the New World: Multinational Enterprises and Spain's Direct Investment in Latin America* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001), pp. xv + 230, £42.50, hb.

In the space of a decade a small band of Spanish companies made a series of preemptive strikes at targets in Latin America. Ninety per cent of their investment was concentrated in just three sectors: banking, telecommunications and energy. Among them, two banking groups spent \$25.5 billion in the region, which became home to a third of their assets and source of up to half of their earnings.<sup>1</sup> The assault was audacious, at times dramatic and on a scale that invites serious analysis. What were the strategies, the risk assessments, who made the decisions and how?

Pablo Toral sketches the history of Spanish overseas investment from colonial times. He explains the liberalising reforms of the post-Franco era, Spain's accession to the EU and the competitive threats to Spanish companies. He describes the similar but somewhat later trend to liberalisation and privatisation in Latin America. He argues that Spanish companies were ideally equipped from their experiences at home to understand these markets and export their skills to Latin America, so as to manage the modernisation and rapid expansion of infrastructure required by growing economies. With growth rates slowing in Spain, they were obliged to look for opportunities abroad which promised above average rates of return. Indeed, the Spanish government, he claims, actively pushed Spanish companies abroad, while Latin American governments wanted to access their recent and relevant Spanish expertise and, at the same time, to redress the preponderance of US investors in the region.

<sup>1</sup> 'Spain still banking on a Latin American bonanza,' *Financial Times*, 1 February 2002. Toral, who quotes extensively from *ABC Electrónico*, *El País Digital*, *El Nuevo Herald* and *The Miami Herald*, does not provide comparable totals for cumulative investment by the Spanish banks.

Toral has set himself a daunting task. He aims to chart the investments of a number of Spanish companies, groups and more or less stable alliances, spread over a decade and some twenty countries. Chronology is largely abandoned in the attempt to impose a single matrix on the Spanish investors' motives and decision-making. In reality, the reform of Latin American markets, including the large scale privatisations which created many of the landmark opportunities for foreign investment, was a continuously changing phenomenon, as successive governments chose to join the bandwagon. Toral implies that much of the credit for creative policy-making should go to Spain, when the real role-models, admit it or not, were Pinochet's Chile and Thatcher's Britain.

Toral overlays his account with an extended and procrustean attempt to find which academic theory of global Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) best fits the Spanish incursions into the region. He appears to conclude that no theory fits: Spanish companies responded to opportunities because they were there. They paid preemptive prices because, as Toral quotes Ignacio Santillana, who had just decided to pay 100 per cent more than the next bidder in Peru, 'Telefónica has a very different idea of risk.' But even he was upstaged by Emilio Botín of Banco Santander, who paid three times as much as his nearest rival for control of Banespa in Brazil.<sup>2</sup>

Toral chooses to ignore the role of the capital markets, both in Spain's own privatisations, the urge to invest in growth and in the motivation of managers, whose remuneration was geared to stock options. When Endesa was first privatised in 1988 and Spain was still categorised by the investment community as an 'emerging market', its shares were offered round the world as the 'Story of Spain', interpreted as exponential growth and soaring stock prices. The same routine was performed in successive sales in Latin America. The magic of the emerging markets boom transformed many calamitously loss-making public sector monopolies into global investment stars.<sup>3</sup>

It is unfortunate for Toral that his work should be reviewed at a time when Argentina's convertibility has collapsed and substantially all of Spanish investment in the country has been written off. His complacent acceptance of the claims of Spanish companies about their achievements leaves, however, too many hostages to fortune in a continent with a recurrent propensity to investment risk.

For a book on *Reconquest*, Toral's work is curiously disembodied, as if he were discussing the epistemology of conquest rather than the campaigns of Cortés and Pizarro. Thus Mira Wilkins and the many other contributors to the theories of FDI rate a dozen index entries apiece, while the latter-day *conquistador* Juan Villalonga – the colourful but ultimately doomed chairman of Telefónica in its most expansionary phase – merits only one passing mention. Yet it was the chairmen and board members of these Spanish companies who formulated strategies, agreed prices and accepted – or ignored – the investment risks.

The book is sadly marred by a number of repetitions, inconsistencies and uneven editing. Toral brings most of his data up to 1997, but then slips in late-breaking news, such as a single sentence on the largest single investment ever made in the

<sup>2</sup> *Financial Times*, 1 February 2002.

<sup>3</sup> As one example, the prospectus for the Initial Public Offering of shares in Telefónica de Argentina – a condition of its privatisation and a successful sale internationally and within Argentina – did not contain an opening balance sheet, as the company was unable to establish in accounting terms what it had acquired from its predecessor, Entel.



region, Repsol's purchase of YPF. His grasp of financial terms is shaky, as when he confuses a bank's 'franchise value' with its liquidity ratio, and a lapse into spanglish reverses the sense he intends: 'Access to some economic sectors, deemed sensible for national security purposes, was restricted to foreigners in some cases.'

The story of Spanish investment in the region continues to unfold and still merits further work.

MAURICE DE BUNSEN