

allows a privately Catholic interior to rest comfortably in a system of institutionalized economic self-interest.

My summary fails in justice to Borghesi. He allows neoconservative voices and their critics, in both Italy and the United States, to speak for themselves. Lengthy citations give depth to such phrases as “Catho-capitalism.” For those who know Francis’ thought, chapters 2 and 3 cover familiar ground. What makes them important, however, is Borghesi’s framing Francis’ program as a real Christian alternative to the neoconservative project of neoliberal world order. For example, Francis is as opposed to abortion as any US culture warrior, but his opposition is based on a broader, gospel-based rejection of “throw-away” culture rather than on a beleaguered defense of select “Western” values.

Questions remain. Most important: What were Popes John Paul II and Benedict doing while neoconservatives hijacked their thought? Though he is careful to distinguish authentic papal teaching from neoconservative manipulations and cites contemporary critiques of these distortions in detail, Borghesi’s narrative portrays the popes as passive victims. For example, if “the neocons entered the Italian publishing market in force” (97) in the 1990s, who financed them? Who finances the “Centesimus Annus Seminar on the Free Society,” founded by Novak, Weigel, and Neuhaus, renamed the “Tertio Millennio Seminar” in 2000, and meeting annually in Krakow since 1994 (73, n. 67)? Borghesi fails to follow the flow of conservative US Catholic money. Nor does he ask if this money was the price of watered-down social teaching.

Catholic Discordance is, nevertheless, an indispensable book for a changed era. No one knows the thought of Pope Francis better than Borghesi. His compelling framing of it as an intentional alternative to “Catho-capitalism” and “theo-populism” should be part of courses and faculty discussions on Catholic social teaching and the thought of Pope Francis. Highly recommended.

WILLIAM L. PORTIER
 University of Dayton, USA
wportier1@udayton.edu

The Sacraments and Consumer Culture. By Timothy Brunk. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2020. xv+ 212 pages. \$24.95 (paper).

doi: 10.1017/hor.2022.79

In this provocative and well-researched text, Timothy Brunk applies careful scholarly analysis to one of the most insidious pastoral problems facing celebrating communities today, the consumer attitude toward the sacraments and the liturgy. Brunk approaches the issue through a systematic

examination of the seven sacraments of the church by noting how contemporary consumer culture contributes to a shallow assimilation of the meaning of each sacrament, thereby leading to the inability of the sacramental experience to speak to the depth of human experience. For each sacrament Brunk provides a brief but in-depth historical review of its development. This then helps as he examines each sacrament for its openness to manipulation by a consumer culture. Thus, he proves what pastorally many who minister have long suspected; the end result of such maneuvering by a self-serving worldview is the evisceration of the sacraments' power to turn the individual outward toward the other as part of their lifelong journey of metanoia. Brunk finds that the danger of a dominant consumerism robs the sacraments of their ability to transform human persons in light of the paschal mystery. It leaves the sacramental experience, one that is individualistic, ultimately failing to penetrate the daily lives and social consciences of those who celebrate them.

Each chapter provides a unique approach to the argument regarding the impact of consumerism on sacramental life. And in each case, Brunk provides the necessary historical review (though condensed) to help students comprehend the depth of the sacrament as well as those soft moments in sacramental celebration where a turn toward consumer culture subverts the meaning of the sacrament. The footnotes are an excellent resource in this text and, alone, provide a review of some of the major "must reads" for the foundational theology behind each sacrament.

The text is laid out in a logical order familiar to those who teach liturgy and sacraments, beginning with the sacraments of initiation, followed by the sacraments of reconciliation, anointing of the sick, marriage, and holy orders. One addition that would have pulled the narrative analytical line through to the end would have been to conclude with a focus on the theology of the liturgy as a whole. Though there are comments throughout the text regarding the impact of consumer culture on the liturgical life of a community, a final summation that looked at liturgical theology considering what had preceded it would have strengthened an already strong text. As is, *The Sacraments and Consumer Culture* is an excellent addition to a course on sacramental theology at the graduate level. It would be especially helpful in such a course during a discussion concerning the challenges of contemporary culture to our present pastoral reality, hence my recommendation that it be used in a graduate-level course or with working liturgists who could draw from their pastoral experiences when reading and discussing the content of the text.

RODICA M. M. STOICOIU
 Independent academic, USA
rodocastoicoiuphd@gmail.com