

Shore's essay on scandals at a Jesuit-run university in seventeenth-century Moravia and Francisco Malta Romeiras's contribution on the suppression of the Jesuits in Portugal, but the position's significance is amply conveyed in Robert Emmett Curran's consideration of the early nineteenth-century Maryland Mission. Once again, issues of national identity required a visitation, this time to sort out clashes between American-born Jesuits and *émigré* members of the Society. National tensions between empire and colonies, as well as a four-way clash between Belgian, English, Polish and German Jesuits feature strongly in Festo Mkenda's chapter on the Zambesi Mission visitation of 1924, while more disagreements are evident in Klaus Schatz's retelling of the visitation of the province of Lower Germany in 1931. The latter chapter might have benefited from a little more contextualisation, as would David Strong's focus on the visitation of the Australian province in 1961. The volume closes with Oliver Rafferty's excellent study of one of the last Visitors, this time sent to evaluate the English province in the mid-1960s. One small gripe about the volume is the lack of contributor biographies, but overall this is a readable collection that convinces of the importance of the role of the Visitor, with much to interest scholars of religious history and particularly its globalisation. Equally, it makes clear how even in a notionally uniform religious organisation like the Jesuits, national and ethnic identity tensions remained. So, in short, do not let your aversion to management structures put you off a book well worth reading.

DURHAM UNIVERSITY

JAMES E. KELLY

*Testing ground for Jesuit accommodation in early modern India. Francisco Ros sj in Malabar (16th–17th centuries.)* By Antony Mecherry sj. (Bibliotheca Institutii Historici Societatis Iesu, 79.) Pp. 1+494 incl. 1 colour ill and 2 maps. Rome: Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu, 2019. €60. 978 88 7041 379 3

*JEH* (71) 2020; doi:10.1017/S0022046920000378

A dissertation submitted at the Pontifical Gregorian University, this work represents a classic missiological study: drawing from ecclesiastical archives, it focuses on the work of one Jesuit missionary, the Catalan Francisco Ros, and on one missiological theme, namely the encounter between Roman Catholic missionaries and Malabar Christians who practised Syrian rites. Mecherry's contention is that Ros has been overlooked in Jesuit historiography; in fact, he argues, the Catalan was the pioneer in developing an accommodationist method during his decades of work among Thomas Christians of the Malabar coast, initially as the first Jesuit to learn Syriac, the liturgical language of the Thomas Christians, and later as the first Latin bishop of the archdiocese of Angamaly, one of the two centres of Thomas Christian communities. The significance of Ros for the history of missions, in Mecherry's estimation, is on a par with that of Alessandro Valignano, Matteo Ricci and Roberto Nobili.

After a long introduction in which the author discusses his research questions, sources and methods, he proceeds to present a more-or-less chronological picture of the Jesuit mission in Malabar from 1542 to the 1630s, both before and beyond the timespan of Ros's own missionary work in India. Chapter i, 'From Francis Xavier to Francisco Ros: a contextual analysis of the Jesuit mission in Malabar (1542–83)', focuses on four themes: the first generation of Jesuits in

Malabar; their relationship with Mar Abraham, the bishop sent by the East Syrian Church and leader of the Thomas Christian communities; the views of the Jesuit Visitor Alessandro Valignano regarding the 'reduction' of Thomas Christians to the Latin Church; and the consolidation of mission methods. Chapter ii describes the early work of Ros in Malabar between the years 1584 and 1598. Selected as the first missionary to study Syriac by Valignano, Ros fulfilled his task by composing *De erroribus Nestorianorum* (1587). This work, based on a reading of the Syriac manuscripts in the possession of Mar Abraham, was meant to identify and refute the heretical doctrines held by Thomas Christians as alleged by Valignano and the Roman Catholic hierarchy in Portuguese India. If language study represented a method of accommodation, it was, in the case of Malabar, a highly ambivalent enterprise: it was the means to the end of ultimately uniting the Thomas Christians to Roman Catholicism by suppressing their ancestral customs and liturgy, to eliminate a historic and traditional identity by incorporating them as subjects to the Portuguese Padroado and, by extension, to Latin Christianity. The complicated and less than edifying manoeuvres to bar Syrian missionaries, the efforts to label Mar Abraham a heretic and the jostling for ecclesiastical authority are laid out in this chapter as well. A turning point was reached with the death of Mar Abraham and the appointment of Ros as the first Latin archbishop of Angamaly, which leads into chapter iii.

While carrying forward the narrative to 1609, Ros repeats many of the themes already stated: the conflict over ecclesiastical jurisdiction, between the metropolitans of Goa and Angamaly, between Angamaly and Cochin, between the Jesuits and the Franciscans, and between the Portuguese Padroado and the papacy. There are detailed summaries of ecclesiastical legislation, of the various synods and provincial councils, of statutes, protestations and revisions, making this chapter perhaps the duller for readers.

Chapter iv, 'Rosian accommodation, 1610–1624', is really the heart of the author's analysis. These decades represented the height of Ros's activities in Malabar, when he fiercely defended his ecclesiastical turf as archbishop of Angamaly against encroachments from Goa and Crangalore, and continued to argue for the necessity of training the clergy in Syriac as well as Latin, and of respecting Syriac rites against arguments for the complete Latinisation of Thomas Christian communities. In this fight, his was a powerful but minority voice both within his order and his Church, the archbishop of Goa and the Jesuit Provincial in India both being fierce critics. No doubt due to these pressures, Ros employed increasingly coercive measures. In Mecherry's words: 'he [Ros] often lost sight of the basic praxis of the principle of accommodation that required him to embrace a gentle way to resolve crises' (p. 349). Here is the paradox: the most eminent Syriac scholar among the Jesuits in India, who confined some Syriac texts to the fire; a bishop who loved his flock and respected their social, linguistic and ritual traditions, but whose ultimate intention was to assimilate Thomas Christians into the universal Roman Catholic fold. To the extent that accommodation worked partially under Ros, the project came to a standstill because no Syriac-speaking Jesuit could be found to replace him. Eventually, in the later seventeenth century, a part of the Thomas Christian community would break with Rome and revert to its ancient traditions.

If there was a major contribution to accommodation on Ros's part, it was his unflinching support of the Italian Jesuit Roberto Nobili, who 'went native' in the inland

Madurai mission, dressing as a Brahmin and permitting high-caste converts to Christianity to retain their Brahminic symbols of social status. Although we know this story in much greater detail from the superb analysis of Ines Županov (*Disputed mission: Jesuit experiments and Brahminical knowledge in seventeenth-century India*, New Delhi 1999), Mechery has added new information by documenting the strong defence and support that he provided for the beleaguered Jesuit-guru. The support of Ros most certainly contributed to the approval of the Madurai Mission by the papacy in 1615, despite the unrelenting hostility of almost all Portuguese Jesuits.

*Testing ground* is less a biography than a missiological study. As an individual, Ros does not really come alive in these pages, unlike portraits that we have of Valignano, Ricci and Nobili. In part this is due to the limitations of the sources, the greatest part of which concern questions of ecclesiastical jurisdiction and doctrine. There is considerable repetition in the writing as Mechery scrupulously sticks to his sources and takes care to analyse all of his documents, sacrificing readability in the process. Ultimately, Ros was working in a mission subject partially to the military and political influence of Portuguese India, unlike the territories where Ricci and Nobili would labour. This salient historical fact would explain the differences in accommodation and inculturation between these missions and help the reader in evaluating the historical significance of this Catalan Jesuit.

PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY

R. PO-CHIA HSIA

*Encounters between Jesuits and Protestants in Asia and the Americas*. Edited by Jorge Cañizares-Esguerra, Aleksander Maryks and R. P. Hsia. (Jesuit Studies, 14; Boston College International Symposia on Jesuit Studies, 3.) Pp. x + 365 incl. 28 black-and-white and colour ills. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2018. €135. 978 90 04 35768; 2214 3289

*JEH* (71) 2020; doi:10.1017/S0022046920000159

Nearly five hundred years have passed since the Protestant Reformation and the founding of the Society of Jesus. Over the centuries much has been said about the animosity that supposedly marked interactions between Jesuits and Protestants on the mission field. In June 2017 a group of scholars from around the world gathered at Boston College to reexamine this relationship with respect to Asian and American contexts. The fourteen papers from the conference included in this volume are divided evenly between the two regions, and present a wide range of scholarship. As befits a publication of the Institute for Advanced Jesuit Studies, this is a collection primarily about Jesuits, touching on Protestants mostly in comparative perspective. While all the essays are historical, they range so widely (the Incan Empire, Tokugawa Japan, Civil War America, etc.) that few readers will be able to engage fully with every contribution. This is not a criticism of the scholarship on display, for interested parties will find plenty to explore – and some articles worthy of particular attention. Hsia's introduction to the Asia section provides a useful outline for understanding the significant connections between the early Jesuits who served in Asia and the Protestant missionaries who followed in their footsteps – particularly in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Mendonça's essay on early developments in India is an admirable attempt to combine the Protestant and Jesuit experiences into one integrated narrative.