

# International and Comparative Law Quarterly

(incorporating the *Quarterly* of the Society of Comparative Legislation  
and International Law and the *Transactions* of the Grotius Society)

VOLUME 49

LONDON

THE BRITISH INSTITUTE OF INTERNATIONAL AND  
COMPARATIVE LAW

2000

# International and Comparative Law Quarterly

(incorporating the *Quarterly* of the Society of Comparative Legislation  
and International Law and the *Transactions* of the Grotius Society)

## BOARD OF EDITORS

*General Editor:* ALAN BOYLE

*Assistant General Editor:* JOE MACDONALD HILL

*Assistant Editor:* MARGARET WILKERSON

MADS ANDENAS

MICHAEL ANDERSON

JOHN BELL

P. B. CARTER

LAWRENCE COLLINS

HAZEL FOX

PIERS GARDNER

JOHN A. USHER

# The British Institute of International and Comparative Law

## COUNCIL OF MANAGEMENT

*Chairman:* THE RT. HON. THE LORD GOFF OF CHIEVELEY, D.C.L., F.B.A.

*Chairman of the Executive Committee:* MICHAEL HUTCHINGS

|   |  |
|---|--|
| M. P. S. Barton   | The Hon. Adv. G. Francis Jacobs,<br>Q.C.                   |
| Sir Christopher Bellamy, Q.C.                                       | H.E. Judge Sir Robert Jennings,<br>Q.C.                    |
| Sir Franklin Berman, K.C.M.G., Q.C.                                 | The Rt. Hon. Antonio Lamer                                 |
| The Hon. Sir Nicolas Bratza, Q.C.                                   | Jeremy Lever, Q.C.   |
| Professor Ian Brownlie, C.B.E.,<br>Q.C., F.B.A., D.C.L.             | Professor A. Vaughan Lowe                                  |
| Jeremy Carver, C.B.E.   | Professor B. S. Markesinis,<br>D.IUR, LL.D., D.IUR (H C)   |
| Dr. Lawrence Collins, Q.C., LL.D.,<br>F.B.A.                        | The Rt. Hon. the Lord Phillips of<br>Worth Matravers, Q.C. |
| Professor J. Crawford, S.C.   | The Rt. Hon. the Lord Neill of<br>Bladen, Q.C.             |
| Lloyd N. Cutler   | Sir Peter North, C.B.E., D.C.L.,<br>F.B.A.                 |
| Professor A. L. Diamond, Q.C.,<br>LL.M., HON. D.C.L., HON. M.R.C.P. | D. A. G. Sarre   |
| Sir Vincent Evans, G.C.M.G., M.B.E.,<br>Q.C.                        | The Rt. Hon. Sir Konrad<br>Schiemann                       |
| Lady Fox, Q.C.  | R. L. Sigmon   |
| N. Fox Bassett  | Sir Ian Sinclair, K.C.M.G., Q.C.                           |
| Professor Sir Roy Goode, C.B.E.,<br>Q.C., LL.D., F.B.A.             | The Rt. Hon. the Lord Slynn of<br>Hadley                   |
| H.E. Judge Rosalyn Higgins,<br>D.B.E., Q.C.                         | David Vaughan, Q.C.  |
| The Rt. Hon. the Lord Hoffmann                                      | Sir Arthur Watts, K.C.M.G., Q.C.                           |
| The Rt. Hon. the Lord Hope of<br>Craighead                          |  |

## ADVISORY BOARD

### Public International Law Section

*Chairman:* H.E. JUDGE ROSALYN HIGGINS, D.B.E., Q.C.

### Private International Law Section

*Chairman:* DR. LAWRENCE COLLINS, Q.C., LL.D., F.B.A.

### European Community Law Section

*Chairman:* THE HON. ADV. G. FRANCIS JACOBS, Q.C.

### Comparative Law Section

*Chairman:* THE RT. HON. LORD JUSTICE SCHIEMANN

DIRECTOR  
MADS ANDENAS

*Published by the British  
Institute of International  
and Comparative Law;  
typeset by Mendip Com-  
munications Ltd and  
printed in the United King-  
dom by Bell and Bain Ltd,  
Glasgow.*

© 2000

**British Institute of International and Comparative Law**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

(an alphabetical list of contributors, a subject index, an index of cases noted and an index of book reviews and reviewers will be found at the end of this volume)

### ARTICLES

|   | PAGE |
|---|------|
| THE AREA OF "FREEDOM, SECURITY AND JUSTICE" AND THE EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE—A PERSONAL VIEW<br><i>Nial Fennelly</i>                                       | 1    |
| INDEPENDENCE: IN OR OUT OF EUROPE? AN INDEPENDENT SCOTLAND AND THE EUROPEAN UNION<br><i>Matthew Happold</i>   | 15   |
| DEVELOPING STATES AND INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW: THE IMPORTANCE OF DIFFERENTIATED RESPONSIBILITIES<br><i>Duncan French</i>                            | 35   |
| ON DEFINING THE CULTURAL HERITAGE<br><i>Janet Blake</i>   | 61   |
| HABITUAL RESIDENCE: THE NEW DOMICILE?<br><i>Pippa Rogerson</i>  | 86   |
| FORUM NON CONVENIENS: A CARIBBEAN RESPONSE TO XENOPHOBIA IN AMERICAN COURTS<br><i>Zanifa McDowell</i>   | 108  |
| THE INTERFACE BETWEEN AMERICAN AND FOREIGN LIBEL LAW: U.S. COURTS REFUSE TO ENFORCE ENGLISH LIBEL JUDGMENTS<br><i>Kyu Ho Youm</i>                           | 131  |
| THE COMPULSORY JURISDICTION OF THE INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE: A MYTH?<br><i>Judge Shigeru Oda</i>  | 251  |
| LOCKERBIE: THE OTHER CASE<br><i>Anthony Aust</i>  | 278  |
| CAN GAIUS REALLY BE COMPARED TO DARWIN?<br><i>Geoffrey Samuel</i>   | 297  |
| THE KOSOVO CRISIS AND NATO'S APPLICATION OF ARMED FORCE AGAINST THE FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF YUGOSLAVIA<br><i>Dino Kritsiotis</i>                                | 330  |
| LEGAL AID BEFORE HUMAN RIGHTS TREATY MONITORING BODIES<br><i>Andrew S. Butler</i>   | 360  |
| ENHANCING ECONOMIC CO-OPERATION: A REGIONAL ARBITRATION CENTRE FOR ASEAN?<br><i>Pearlie M.C. Koh</i>  | 390  |
| LEGAL PRACTICE RIGHTS OF DOMESTIC AND FOREIGN LAWYERS IN THE UNITED STATES<br><i>Roger J. Goebel</i>  | 413  |
| MAKING PUBLIC LAW "PUBLIC": AN ANALYSIS OF THE QUEBEC REFERENCE CASE AND ITS SIGNIFICANCE FOR COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS<br><i>James T. McHugh</i> | 445  |
| ECHR REMEDIES FROM A COMMON LAW PERSPECTIVE<br><i>Sir Robert Carnwath</i>   | 517  |
| THE ROLE OF ARTICLE 50 OF THE UN CHARTER IN THE SEARCH FOR INTERNATIONAL PEACE AND SECURITY<br><i>Jeremy Carver &amp; Jenine Hulsmann</i>                   | 528  |

|   |  |     |
|---|--|-----|
| THE GENOCIDE DEFINITION IN THE JURISPRUDENCE OF THE AD HOC TRIBUNALS  | <i>Guglielmo Verdirame</i>             | 578 |
| TRUST WITHOUT EQUITY  | <i>George L. Gretton</i>               | 599 |
| CENTROS LTD—A COMPLETE U-TURN IN THE RIGHT OF ESTABLISHMENT FOR COMPANIES?  | <i>Anne Looijestijn-Clearie</i>        | 621 |
| RATIONALITY AND CULTURAL PLURALISM IN THE NON-RECOGNITION OF FOREIGN MARRIAGES  | <i>John Murphy</i>                     | 643 |
| CONSTITUTIONAL CHALLENGES TO SEXUAL ORIENTATION DISCRIMINATION  | <i>Kenneth McK. Norrie</i>             | 755 |
| EFFECTIVE LEGAL SYSTEMS AND FOREIGN DIRECT INVESTMENT: IN SEARCH OF THE EVIDENCE  | <i>Amanda Perry</i>                    | 779 |
| COMPARATIVE LAW BEYOND POST-MODERNISM   | <i>Anne Peters and Heiner Schwenke</i> | 800 |
| THE CARTAGENA PROTOCOL ON BIOSAFETY AND THE WTO—COEXISTENCE OR INCOHERENCE?   | <i>Asif H. Qureshi</i>                 | 835 |
| <b>SHORTER ARTICLES, COMMENTS AND NOTES</b>   |  |     |
| Antisuit Injunctions and the Brussels Jurisdiction and Judgments Convention   | <i>Trever C. Hartley</i>               | 166 |
| The European Commission's Extraterritorial Powers within the Field of Merger Control—A Comment on the Court of First Instance's Judgment in <i>Gencor v. Commission</i> | <i>Morten Broberg</i>                  | 172 |
| The Basic Law of the Special Administrative Region of Macau: Some Reflections   | <i>Yash Ghai</i>                       | 183 |
| Private Life and Public Image—Privacy Legislation in France   | <i>Helen Trouille</i>                  | 199 |
| <i>Thomas &amp; Hilaire v. Baptiste and the Attorney-General of Trinidad and Tobago</i> : Rights Arising after the Promulgation of Fundamental Right and Freedoms       | <i>Margaret DeMerieux</i>              | 463 |
| The M/V Saiga (No. 2) Case: ( <i>St. Vincent and the Grenadines v. Guinea</i> ), Judgment   | <i>Louise de la Fayette</i>            | 467 |
| Celebrating 200 years of the Conseil d'Etat   | <i>John Bell</i>                       | 660 |
| What is the Function of the Conseil d'Etat in the Preparation of Legislation?   | <i>John Bell</i>                       | 661 |
| Do the Opinions expressed by the Conseil d'Etat in its capacity as legal adviser to the Government influence policy?  | <i>Nicole Questiaux</i>                | 672 |
| Conseil d'Etat: The French Layer of Turkish Administrative Law  | <i>Esin Örüçü</i>                      | 679 |
| The Influence of the Conseil d'Etat Outside France  | <i>Jean-Michel Galabert</i>            | 700 |
| Separating law from facts: the difficulties faced by the Italian Corte di Cassazione in an appeal for illegality of reasoning   | <i>Rachel Anne Fenton</i>              | 709 |
| International Trade in Living Modified Organisms: The New Regimes   | <i>Thomas Schoenbaum</i>               | 856 |
| Enforcement of Hong Kong SAR Court Judgments in the People's Republic of China  | <i>Qingjiang Kong</i>                  | 867 |
| Kosovo Crisis Inquiry: Memoranda on the International Law Aspects   | <i>Ian Brownlie</i>                    | 878 |

|  |                              |     |
|--|------------------------------|-----|
| The Legality of NATO's Action in the Former Republic of Yugoslavia (FRY) under International Law | <i>Christine Chinkin</i>     | 910 |
| International Law and the NATO Intervention in Kosovo  | <i>Christopher Greenwood</i> | 926 |
| International Legal Issues Arising in the Kosovo Crisis  | <i>Vaughan Lowe</i>          | 934 |

## **CURRENT DEVELOPMENTS: EUROPEAN COMMUNITY LAW, PRIVATE AND PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW**

|  |                            |     |
|--|----------------------------|-----|
| Agriculture, Fisheries, and Environment  | <i>Stephen Enchelmaier</i> | 209 |
| Justice and Home Affairs   | <i>Steve Peers</i>         | 222 |
| Competition  | <i>Robert Lane</i>         | 227 |
| Excise, VAT and Customs  | <i>Michael Michael</i>     | 234 |
| Drug Trafficking at Sea: The Case of <i>R. v. Charrington and Others</i>                                       | <i>William Gilmore</i>     | 477 |
| Judicial Jurisdiction and Abuse of Process   | <i>Colin Warbrick</i>      | 489 |
| Family Law; Civil and Commercial Matters; the Hague Conventions in the Internet Age                            | <i>Wendy Kennett</i>       | 497 |
| Treaties   | <i>Colin Warbrick</i>      | 944 |
| Fourteen against One: The EU Member States' response to Freedom Party participation in the Austrian government | <i>Matthew Happold</i>     | 953 |

## **DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS**

|  |                        |     |
|--|------------------------|-----|
| Case concerning Kasikili/Sedudu Island (Botswana/Namibia)  | <i>Malcolm Shaw</i>    | 964 |
| International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea: The Southern Bluefin Tuna Cases ( <i>New Zealand v. Japan; Australia v. Japan</i> ): Order for Provisional Measures of 27 August 1999 | <i>Robin Churchill</i> | 979 |

## **INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE: RECENT CASES**

|   |                          |     |
|---|--------------------------|-----|
| The Land and Maritime Boundary Case ( <i>Cameroon v. Nigeria</i> )—The Intervention by Equatorial Guinea  | <i>J. G. Merrills</i>    | 720 |
| Difference Relating to Immunity from Legal Process of a Special Rapporteur of the Commission on Human Rights  | <i>C. Wickremasinghe</i> | 724 |
| Legality of Use of Force ( <i>Yugoslavia v. Belgium</i> ) ( <i>Yugoslavia v. Canada</i> ) ( <i>Yugoslavia v. France</i> ) ( <i>Yugoslavia v. Germany</i> ) ( <i>Yugoslavia v. Italy</i> ) ( <i>Yugoslavia v. Netherlands</i> ) ( <i>Yugoslavia v. Portugal</i> ) ( <i>Yugoslavia v. Spain</i> ) ( <i>Yugoslavia v. United Kingdom</i> ) ( <i>Yugoslavia v. United States of America</i> ): Provisional Measures | <i>Christine Gray</i>    | 730 |
| Cases before the Court  | <i>Malcolm Evans</i>     | 736 |
| Other developments  | <i>Malcolm Evans</i>     | 742 |

|                |                    |
|----------------|--------------------|
| BOOK REVIEWS   | 242, 508, 744, 991 |
| BOOKS RECEIVED | 247, 514, 751, 999 |

## **INDEX FOR VOLUME 49**

|  |      |
|--|------|
| Contributors of Articles, Shorter Articles, Comments and Notes | 1002 |
|--|------|

|  |             |
|--|-------------|
| <b>Subject Index</b>                       | <b>1004</b> |
| <b>Index of Cases Noted</b>                | <b>1007</b> |
| <b>Index of Book Reviews and Reviewers</b> | <b>1016</b> |

---