

also demonstrates that other theologians of the Roman School were also advocates of Newman's work, and Newman's theory of doctrinal development was influential in Pope Pius IX's thought leading up to the promulgation of *Ineffabilis Deus* in 1854, which defined the dogma of the Immaculate Conception. It is important to note that Shea is careful not to portray Newman's theory of doctrinal development as entirely accepted, either. Rather, Shea's thesis demonstrates the complex nature of its reception history. It was neither completely rejected nor completely accepted by those in Rome and on the Continent during Newman's lifetime.

This book is best suited for the graduate classroom and beyond, though the advanced undergraduate with adequate knowledge of Newman's theory of doctrinal development and its reception history would find this work useful. Shea's work is notably a reappraisal of a long-held narrative of the reception of Newman's *Essay on Development*, which is one of the most influential theology works of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Shea's work, most importantly, demonstrates that Newman's theory of doctrinal development gained traction much earlier than the Second Vatican Council. Because of this, Newman scholars and historical theologians interested in nineteenth-century European reception history should be acquainted with Shea's thesis.

ELIZABETH H. FARNSWORTH

National Institute for Newman Studies

Mothers of Faith: Motherhood in the Christian Tradition. By Wilfred M. Sumani, SJ. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2017. xviii + 298 pages. \$28.00.
doi: 10.1017/hor.2018.96

I must confess that I normally find myself a bit wary when priests write about women's experience, but despite this I was pleasantly surprised by Fr. Wilfred M. Sumani's text, *Mothers of Faith*. This book comes out of the African theological tradition, taking primarily a narrative approach to motherhood in the Christian tradition. It is divided into four parts: the first three provide the stories of these mothers—from the Old Testament, the New Testament, and subsequent Christian history—while the final part is a reflection on motherhood as a theological analogy.

In the introduction, Sumani frames his work clearly in the African tradition. His key point, however, is that "motherhood is one of the most theologically fertile human and Christian experiences" (xv), and that we do not have to turn to science or psychology to understand this experience because religion, and especially, in this case, the Christian tradition, have their own

resources to draw on. One thing to note is that in this text Sumani brings together a variety of traditions and sources to analyze the theology of motherhood: biblical texts, Christian theology, African traditions, and—importantly—his own conversations with mothers.

The chapters in the next three parts are primarily narrative, and all have the same basic structure: an introduction to the mother being discussed, a narrative that tells their story, a reflection on the theological import of and what we can learn from that story (though this is sometimes not distinguished from the narrative), a conclusion, and a prayer that draws on the themes and models of the mothers in question. There is no consistent length to these chapters, some of them—like that of the Virgin Mary—are much longer than others. In the first two parts the narratives incorporate modern biblical scholarship that helps to contextualize the mothers historically, and the writings of Church Fathers help both to interpret and to enhance these stories. What is especially good about this section is that the narratives help to give a voice to these mothers, which can become lost by itself in the biblical text. Sumani often speculates on their thoughts and feelings—for example, the difficulty and inconveniences “of having to deliver one’s first-born son in a squalid environment,” as Mary did (142). These are aspects of the biblical narrative that are not explicit and too easy to overlook. In this way, Sumani is approaching the biblical text through Ignatian contemplation, helping to draw the reader into the story itself. This allows him also to rehabilitate, in some ways, mother figures, like Eve, who have garnered primarily negative interpretations over the centuries. Overall, these chapters would help to enhance the experiences of undergraduates when read alongside the biblical texts themselves, provide helpful reflections in a parish setting, or offer material for personal reflection, especially by mothers.

I was, however, less impressed by the theological reflection on motherhood that comes in the final part of the text. Sumani divides this part into four chapters, looking at aspects of motherhood in the three Persons of the Trinity in relation to earth. He begins this part with an introduction on the use of analogy in theology, almost a preemptive defense of what he is about to do in the following chapters. What I liked most in these chapters was his drawing on African traditions to enhance Christian theology and reinforce the ways in which we can understand God as Mother. What I disliked is the reliance on traditional and stereotypical characteristics of women and mothers for this theological analysis. For example, I would really hate to think that things like comfort, care, and protection are characteristic only of mothers and not of fathers. Finally, what is missing in this part is a chapter on the church as a mother, although this concept is mentioned earlier in the text. It would also have been nice to have more connections made between

the narratives in the first three parts and this final part. However, my critique here is primarily a critique of Sumani's theology in these final chapters, and so does not take away from the overall value of this text as a narrative theological reflection on motherhood in the African and Christian tradition.

ELISSA CUTTER

Loyola Marymount University

Contemporary Art and the Church: A Conversation between Two Worlds. Edited by W. David O. Taylor and Taylor Worley. Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2017. 280 pages. \$29.99 (paper).

doi: 10.1017/hor.2018.120

W. David O. Taylor and Taylor Worley's text enters as the third of six recent titles released in rapid succession into IVP's Studies in Theology and the Arts series. The editors have assembled the presented essays from the 2015 Christians in the Visual Arts (CIVA) Biennial Conference.

Arguing that the arts and the church are two distinct worlds, the editors suggest that these worlds have "their own logics, ... gravitational fields, ... ecologies, ... and their own motley collection of communities" (1). As many others have also noted, the relationships between these worlds are often characterized by frigidity, indifference, mistrust, and strong judgment. Rather than deepening this dichotomy, the writers in this volume seek to deal seriously with the other through "openness, charity, curiosity, and creative partnership" (4).

As each community is often misguided about the other, mending these complex relations requires deliberate and clear definitions to begin the process. In the editors' view, contemporary art refers to artwork employing narratives of "marginal voices, transgressive activities, and the social and kinesthetic body," while also alerting viewers to injustice, and playing with both banality and the exotic (2). By the "church," the authors intend both local and universal aspects of the "one, holy, catholic, and apostolic church ... scattered across time and space in the communion of Christ" (2).

The text is divided into four sections: "Starting Points," "Theology," "Worship," and "Culture." In these sections the authors seek to address three primary questions: What does God have to do with contemporary art? What does the church have to do with contemporary art? And, what does the church's corporate worship have to do with contemporary art? (4).

Wayne Roosa's essay is a fine example of the desire to reckon seriously and charitably with the arts. Taking a cue from the conference and book title, Roosa begins his essay by deescalating the conversation. He deftly shifts the focus away from a demarcation of boundaries and territories by