

## REVIEWS

### AKSUM

*The Monuments of Aksum*. Edited and annotated by DAVID W. PHILLIPSON. Addis Ababa and London: Addis Ababa University Press in collaboration with The British Institute in Eastern Africa, 1997. Pp. 201. £45 (ISBN 1-872566-11-1).  
*Ancient Ethiopia*. By DAVID W. PHILLIPSON. London: British Museum Press, 1998. Pp. 76. £20 (ISBN 0-7141-2539-3).

David Phillipson has done a signal service to those interested in Aksum and its exploration in presenting this summary of the work of the Deutsche Aksum-Expedition nearly a century after their visit to Ethiopia, particularly in adding to the photographic record some of their unpublished material from the archives of the Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin. The book concentrates on the monuments of the city, providing also reproductions of the drawings from the DAE volumes, and some translations from the German text by Rosalind Bedlow. A brief final chapter adds to this most useful compendium a number of the monuments discovered by Neville Chittick's team in 1973–4, the excavation of which was completed recently by Phillipson himself in the 1990s.

*Ancient Ethiopia* presents a brief account of Ethiopian history from the earliest hominids to the Zagwé period, with by far the greatest emphasis on the civilisation of the Aksumite period and its monuments. In this, it inevitably repeats almost unchanged a good deal of the information provided by previous accounts. However, it does not attempt to offer a connected history of Aksum; the book's chief value is the updating to include information (generally already published by the author in several different archaeological reports) from the latest series of excavations at the ancient Ethiopian capital city, including illustrations of many monuments and finds, some in colour. This adds some useful insights, such as details about ivory working, and in addition it is tantalisingly apparent from the text that a great deal of ongoing study on the finds is in progress, which will supply further information in due course. Phillipson's treatment, as one would expect, is in general sound, precise and clear; but there are certain disadvantages in the way the book is presented.

Aksum is, for one of Africa's great ancient civilisations, exceptionally under-represented in published works, although since 1966 when Kobishchanov's *Axum* was first published in Russian a number of general works have appeared in English, French and Amharic. Later work has been hampered by events in Ethiopia itself. The writer of this review, for example, when completing his own history of Aksum during the Mengistu period, was not permitted to travel in Tigray to check certain points better explored on site. In contrast, fresh from five years' excavation work on Aksum, some of it re-opening Neville Chittick's discoveries of 1973–4, some of it aimed at new themes, David Phillipson was in an ideal position to offer a new presentation of Aksumite achievements.

This he has done, although in the event, the publishers have perhaps not done the author a service by settling for so limited a treatment of a very large and potentially exciting theme. The format is much too restricted to provide for a properly underpinned description of Aksum, its civilisation and its environment, let alone for dealing adequately with Ethiopian prehistory, Aksum's successor state(s), and critical evaluation of such themes as continuity, the dating of the Labibela churches, and the role of the *Kebra Nagast*. In a mere 100 or so pages of

text – accompanied by *c.* 40 pages of (albeit very useful) black and white in-text illustrations – there is no room for the fuller description, or wider discussion, which are not only necessary to present these subjects adequately, but which would have been an advantage in certain chapters given the author's wide experience in general African prehistory, and in the recent excavation work at Aksum itself.

The book thus avoids the challenges which interpretations and reinterpretations of certain issues might present. Where it touches briefly on the position of the Falasha in Ethiopia, for example, the book repeats a point of view which takes none of the intensive recent research, with its very different results, into account. In discussion about tradition and continuity, too, the presentation is far too brief to be able to describe even the essential aspects (see, for example, Grierson and Munro-Hay, *The Ark of the Covenant*, for an attempt to place the *Kebrā Nagast* and the Ark traditions in their proper perspective). On the other hand, the work is not written to appeal to a popular audience either, being couched in the rather arid language of an academic work. Falling as it does between two categories, and published before the full analysis of all the newly discovered material from Phillipson's excavations that would inevitably have enhanced its contribution, the book's value is inevitably somewhat diminished. It will nevertheless be encouraging to see another book on Ethiopian history in the British Museum bookshop, which until now has limited itself solely to *African Zion*.

S. C. MUNRO HAY

## AFRICAN CHRISTIANITY

*A History of Christianity in Africa: From Antiquity to the Present.* By ELIZABETH ISICHEI. London: SPCK, 1995. Pp. xi + 420. £25, paperback (ISBN 0-281-04764-2).

Any author taking on such an enormous task as encompassed by this book has to decide how to arrange material. Isichei has opted for a structure which is part chronological, part geographical. The first two chapters deal with North African Christianity of the Early Christian centuries; the third the bridging Christianity of 1500 to 1800; the following three chapters deal separately with Southern Africa, East and East Central Africa, and West Africa, each to 1900. The next two chapters on West Africa and North Africa reach right up to the present day. Chapter 9 deals with East and East Central Africa 1900–1960, chapter 10 with West Africa over the same period, chapter 11 with Southern Africa since 1900, and the final chapter with independent Black Africa since 1960.

This is quite a personal book. The author can write as an insider, having lived in Africa for 16 years before returning to her native New Zealand. In the introduction she admits she is less assured than she used to be on all sorts of things. She utilises poetry and novels, and feels free to draw parallels with the Pacific or New Zealand. Her own sympathies are with a committed Christianity, or a 'preferential option for the poor', and she often makes little attempt to hide what she approves and disapproves. Frequently she uses exclamation marks to emphasize her personal perspective. She often refers to the inadequacy of statistics, the lack of research on even quite important areas, academic fashions which ensure that some minor sectors are well researched but more important ones relatively unknown.

The major themes are African agency in the spread of Christianity, and how Africans have continually made Christianity their own. However, having chosen to structure the book chronologically–geographically rather than thematically, it is not the themes that remain in the reader's mind, but the individual narratives, the

particular illustrations, examples, vignettes. Isichei displays an amazing breadth. Many individual narratives are particularly well done; for example, those dealing with Uganda, Sierra Leone, Ethiopia, the Aladura, Braide and Harris. One is constantly amazed by her command of material, and impressed by the way she can refer to her own previous works on so many topics (not just modern Nigeria, but early North African theologians). In many cases she reveals in a footnote which authority she is primarily dependent on at any particular stage. Her knowledge of Catholic Christianity, indeed her grasp of the intricacies of Catholic religious orders, is as strong as you would expect, but other sectors do not suffer by comparison; her treatment of various faith missions and independent churches is equally assured. She is very sure-footed in the mind-boggling complexity of the Democratic Republic of the Congo (formerly Zaire). She feels free to approve of or criticise allcomers. Among those criticised are Idowu and Mbiti for their 'distorting Christian spectacles' (p. 325), Lavigerie for his lack of respect for 'the Other' (p. 222), Vincent Donovan's almost cult book on inculturation, *Christianity Rediscovered*, for its paternalism (p. 261), Blyden for his 'largely misdirected' great energies (p. 166) and Uganda's *balokole* movement for, among other things, its 'fissiparous tendency' (p. 242).

As in any book of this size and scope, there are emphases with which one could disagree. The author was writing too soon after the genocide in Rwanda to have the perspective entirely right. The oriental Orthodox churches which Isichei in chapter 1 calls 'monophysite' much prefer a more neutral term like 'pre-Chalcedonian'. Falwell, though a televangelist, belongs to another stream of Christianity than the faith gospel. And it is doubtful whether by any mode of reckoning the Jehovah's Witnesses are the largest church in Zambia today (p. 349). There are some minor factual errors: the last book of the New Testament is Revelation, not Revelations; Smith's UDI was 1965 not 1964 (p. 231); the originator of the faith gospel is Hagin, not Hagan (p. 336). There are editorial lapses too: there are six references on p. 403 which refer to no text. Passing references like those to 'Zik', 'the Magnificat', a 'Prefect Apostolic' presume considerable background, and might have done with some explanatory comment in a general history. The method of referring to numbers ('150 thousand') seems somewhat odd. A bibliography and more comprehensive index added to the excellent maps might have made the book's riches more readily accessible. But overall, this is a sympathetic (if ultimately rather sombre), insider's treatment, containing a mine of information.

*School of Oriental and African Studies*  
*University of London*

PAUL GIFFORD

## CRUISING ALONG THE EAST AFRICAN COAST

*Port Cities and Intruders: The Swahili Coast, India and Portugal in the Early Modern Era.* By MICHAEL N. PEARSON. Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1998. Pp. x + 202. £30 (ISBN 0-8018-5692-2).

The introduction announces this book as an attempt to present the history of the East African coast in the Portuguese period as a 'world-history', by which Pearson means a study which transcends national boundaries and tries to understand regional themes and larger systems. The author, whose knowledge of East Africa is derived very largely from secondary sources, promises insights gained from his work on Indian history. It is a good idea, but a disappointing book. Pearson tells us that there was a lot of commerce along the coast; that in the north (on the coast of modern Kenya) this commerce had little effect beyond the coast, while in the

south the gold of the Zimbabwe plateau encouraged much wider commercial networks and more contact between coast and interior. No surprises there. His comparisons with India reveal that the situation was very different there, with a great deal more political and social continuity between coast and interior – but tells us no more than that.

One suspects that Pearson's project was subverted by an unfortunate circumstance. The recent historiography of the East African coast, and especially the work of archaeologists, has urged very insistently the view that the Swahili settlements of the coast were 'indigenous'. Their inhabitants were Africans, not Middle Eastern settlers; their economies were local, not orientated to overseas trade. Pearson's study might by its very nature be assumed to run counter to this new orthodoxy – since it focuses on the coast as part of a regional system – and the points of contrast which he raises with the Indian situation do rather suggest the comparative isolation and distinctness of the Swahili settlements. But Pearson seems anxious to avoid any direct challenge to the 'indigenous' presentation.

This concern encourages a distinctly circuitous writing style which does little for clarity and leads to both repetition and contradiction. We never find out what a 'port city' really was, or how the port cities related to the many other Swahili settlements of the coast (though we are told that they were the 'jewels in the necklace of the whole coast'). Pearson tells us (pp. 42–3) that the traders of the East African coast in 1500 were of local origin (how does he know?) and that the stories of the exotic origins of ruling groups were pure ideology; he later suggests that traders, of foreign origin, provided the rulers of the 'port cities' (p. 59). He mulls at length over the arguments about the extent of inland trade from the northern coast before he plucks up courage to say that the port cities of the north coast were really entrepôts, part of a long distance seaborne trade in luxuries between Mozambique and India (though he has earlier offered rather cryptic reference to the 'neglected' importance of a more local trade in foodstuffs and mangrove wood). Pearson might have got out of this conceptual bind by thinking about the relationship of 'port cities' to other settlements on the coast, or through discussion of the internal social structures of coastal societies; he might even, dare one say it, have taken issue with the assumption that to be 'African' coastal settlements had to be harmoniously integrated into a particularly local economy. But he does not.

Pearson has read widely, but there are a few uncomfortable errors or gaps in understanding. T. Hoffman (sic) would be surprised to find himself described as an 'older scholar' in a British historiographical tradition which Pearson criticizes; reference is made to a caliph in Cairo in 1507; students of later history will wince at the reference to 'rampant black African leaders' and at the passing assertion that colonial enforcement of a private market in land caused widespread landlessness in Kenya. While Pearson has absorbed the argument about Swahili culture being indigenous, his understanding of other aspects of African history seems a little dated. 'Tribesmen' lived on the coast; they were 'Bantus' and ricocheted around as discrete groups.

There is information here, and since this is (I think) the only book-length study of the Portuguese period on the coast since Strandes' *Portuguese Period* (which, curiously, is not referred to here) Pearson's work does serve a purpose. But it is unfortunate that it really says so little. Pearson tells us nothing about the nature of East African coastal society in 1500, and the central question of Portuguese interaction with this society is relegated to a couple of pages. Portuguese engagement with coastal political structures receive even shorter shrift, with brief references to the establishment of 'puppet' rulers. The theoretical digressions – on definitions of 'hinterland' and on Wallerstein's idea of 'world-systems' – raise useful issues but do not really get very far. But there is some unintended humour: Pearson's discussion of the alleged difficulties of crossing the arid '*nyika*' of Kenya

concludes with the knockout argument '... as I have traveled by train from Nairobi to Mombasa I have found myself wondering what all the fuss was about'. Quite.

*University of Cambridge*

JUSTIN WILLIS

## GENERATIONAL HISTORIES

*Conflict, Age and Power in North East Africa: Age Systems in Transition*. Edited by EISEI KURIMOTO AND SIMON SIMONSE. Oxford: James Currey; Nairobi: East African Educational Publishing; Kampala: Fountain Publishers; Athens: Ohio University Press, 1998. Pp. xiv + 270. £40 (ISBN 0-85255-252-1); £14.95, paperback (ISBN 0-85255-251-3).

This edited collection consists of papers from the third symposium on north-eastern African herders organized by the National Museum of Ethnology in Osaka.<sup>1</sup> The introduction by Kurimoto and Simonse sets out an original approach to the interpretation of age-sets. Criticizing earlier analyses of age-sets, focused on their integrative function in providing a social identity and structure of authority that cut across allegiances based on kinship, the editors stress instead their role as 'arenas' of conflict between mutually antagonistic groups – senior and junior men, men and women or different territorial or ethnic groups. Rather than seeing age-sets as mechanisms to distribute wealth, women and power in a hierarchical and complementary fashion, then, they see them as vehicles by which opposed groups contest power with one another and constitute themselves in the process.

Further, the editors see age-sets as regional systems that transcend individual ethnic, linguistic and cultural groups, allowing them to interact with one another in accord with a common set of rules. They identify five such regional complexes, each of which is discussed in the studies that follow: the *monyomiji* group in the southern Sudan, the Karimojong or *asapan* system in northern Uganda, the *gada* complex among Oromo peoples of Ethiopia and Kenya and the Maasai and Kalenjin systems of Kenya and Tanzania. Within these regional systems, age-set institutions provide a common arena in which different ethnic groups establish themselves and their identity by means of organized violence.

The individual papers that follow each focus on a particular set of antagonisms, starting with age. Whereas previous studies tended to focus on the complementary distribution of social, economic and ritual roles, Simonse, Spencer, Tornay and Sato all focus on ways in which social relations between seniors and juniors are also antagonistic. Tension between the two groups mounts as juniors seek to challenge the wealth and power of elders and elders try to maintain their economic and ritual control, until juniors are able to force a breach and be initiated into the ranks of elders. Thus, as individual age-sets form, mature and advance in status, social relations alternate between complementary relations and antagonistic ones in an ongoing historical cycle.

While such alternations frequently cycle around a historical mean, however, more forceful alternations can lead to permanent shifts in power between elders and juniors. For Lamphear, such shifts were brought about in the nineteenth century in Maasai and Turkana societies by new prophets and diviners able to displace the elders, exert centralized authority over the warriors and direct the military expansion of both societies. Conversely, Nagashima demonstrates how age-sets declined in Iteso in the twentieth century in the face of alternative means

<sup>1</sup> Papers from the earlier two symposia have previously been published in Katsuyoshi Fukui and David Turton (eds.), *Warfare among East African Herders* (1979) and Katsuyoshi Fukui and John Markakis (eds.), *Ethnicity and Conflict in the Horn of Africa* (1994).

of acquiring wealth and power through cash-crop production, employment and education, while Komma shows how they became transformed in Kipsigis society with enrollment in the King's African Rifles and rising Kalenjin ethnicity in reaction to Kikuyu settlement in the Rift Valley.

Shifting the focus from age to ethnicity, Kurimoto and Schlee each show how particular age-set institutions spread across linguistic and ethnic boundaries to become regional meta-systems in which shared codes of behavior resonated with one another to make meaningful interaction among different ethnic groups possible. As such institutions became synchronized with one another, interethnic violence became a function of internal contests for power, rippling across whole regions in repetitive cycles of organized violence. Interestingly, Simonse demonstrates elsewhere how such periodic cycles continue to influence the ebb and flow of civil war in the southern Sudan.

The shift in these studies from an interpretation based on internal harmony to one based on struggles for power played out on a regional level provides a welcome dynamic view, but most of the studies are more structural or processual than historical. One also tends to lose sight of the fact, noted by Simonse and Spencer, that such struggles are invariably over access to the very resources that normally constitute hierarchical relations and involve a significant transformation of irrepressible youth into responsible elders in the process. After all, it is precisely the control of wealth, women and power that juniors seek to establish and then to exercise and keep from others after attaining elderhood themselves. And the roles of women in these struggles are barely touched upon, aside from a single brief study by Kawai.

*University of Wisconsin-Madison*

THOMAS SPEAR

### 'BIOGRAPHY' OF AN AFRICAN DEITY

*Africa's Ogun: Old World and New*. Edited by SANDRA T. BARNES. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1997. 2nd, expanded ed. Pp. xxi + 389. £37.50 (ISBN 0-253-33251-6); £14.99, paperback (ISBN 0-253-21083-6).

The second, expanded, edition of *Africa's Ogun* adds five new chapters to the ten already existing in the 1989 first edition. A new introduction to the second edition by Sandra T. Barnes completes the new material in this publication. Already in 1989, *Africa's Ogun* was an innovative book in its attempt to analyse and conceptualise the diversity of expressions and cultural referents associated with the West African *orisha* Ogun, popularly known in West Africa as the deity of iron, warfare and hunting. As the title suggests, the domain of study is not limited to the West African contexts where Ogun was nurtured, but it includes the New World, where African slaves and their descendants perpetuated his worship. In the context of African and Afro-American religious studies, the thematic focus on a single deity as a strategy to address wider theoretical issues is not unique, but it is quite rare. This methodological approach provides a suitable framework to reveal the dynamics of transformation and the creative adaptive nature of West African religious concepts and practices in different cultural contexts.

As John Peel warns in this volume, Ogun can neither be essentialised nor considered in isolation. Depending on the historical moment and geographical area, Ogun, the civilizer-destroyer, the opener of the path, can develop one or several of his various aspects, and in any case Ogun is always inserted, whether in religion, art or popular culture, within a complex dynamic system of interrelations. Hence, in this publication, Ogun is treated from a multiplicity of perspectives

corresponding to the interests and disciplines of the various contributors to this collection. Their studies range from historical contextualization, to the analysis of sacred texts, the performative aspects of ritual or the elaboration of Ogun's representations in folklore, fine arts or literature. This interdisciplinary collection constitutes a rich and valuable source of ethnographic data, but perhaps the underlying theme is the continuous process of recreation and reinterpretation 'that shapes the ways people experience, define and construct the sacred aspects of existence, represent them in human life and make them manifest in religious practice' (p. xiv).

The first edition of *Africa's Ogun* provided a historical perspective to Ogun's spread and transformations, which is enriched in this new edition by a new chapter by John Peel. Based on a comparative analysis of missionary data from the second half of the nineteenth century, Peel shows how Ogun's pre-colonial manifestations varied significantly from place to place in Yorubaland. This well-documented evidence demonstrates that the variability in form and meaning present in contemporary manifestations of Ogun is the result of a long historical process, a factor which should always be taken into account when seeking to understand present realities.

Compared with the first edition, this second edition places more emphasis on the processes of transformation experienced by Ogun in the New World. The dialectic between continuity and innovation of Afro-American culture in relation to African sources, which is a central theme of Afro-American studies, is treated in depth by showing and analysing the great variability of cultural expressions emerging in different geographical areas. Chapters in the first edition by Ortiz and M. Drewal on Ogun in Brazil, and by McCarthy Brown on Ogun in Haiti, are complemented by new ones. H. J. Drewal and John Mason deal with aspects of Ogun in relation to scarification and body-painting rituals in Yorubaland, Cuba and North America. Mason, who is a priest of the Afro-Cuban Santeria in Brooklyn, writes in another chapter about the historical and contemporary meanings of Ogun in the Lucumi tradition which exists in Brooklyn. Don Cosentino writes about another insider-intellectual who lives in Los Angeles, the Puerto Rican Ysamur Flores, and analyses his idiosyncratic interpretation of Ogun. He also addresses the process of Catholic 'syncretism' of Haitian Vodou and Ogun's presence in Soyinka's literature. Philip Sher discusses how in Trinidad and Tobago the African tradition of the *orichas* is constantly being negotiated according to the interests and ideologies of different groups in what could be called the politics of heritage.

The emphasis in this book on Ogun in the New World is not fortuitous; it responds to the increasing awareness of the trans-Atlantic dimension of West African culture, and the importance that the Diaspora plays in the articulation of a wider 'Black Atlantic World'. It also serves to address theoretical concepts like globalisation, pastiche or hybridity in relation to contemporary religious practice. This stress on the American manifestations of Ogun suggests the contemporary vitality of an ancient Yoruba deity who through intricate historical processes of cultural blending has transcended boundaries of ethnicity, race and class to become a trans-cultural and multi-dimensional symbol of human projections.

*Universidade Federal da Bahia*

LUIS NICOLAU

## THE ETHIOPIAN STATE

*The Evolution of Ethiopian Absolutism: The Genesis and the Making of the Fiscal Military State, 1696–1913.* (Studia Historica Uppsaliensia 180) By TSEGAYE TEGENU. Uppsala: Uppsala University, 1996. Pp. 286. SEK 198 (ISBN 91-554-3856-3).

German and Scandinavian universities have developed the tradition of instantaneous publication of PhD theses. This has both advantages and disadvantages. The disadvantage is that writers do not have the opportunity to revise and polish before they go public. The advantage is that it saves many a valuable thesis from being consigned to obscure corners of library shelves, which is the fate of many a thesis in other universities.

The publication of Tsegaye Tegenu's PhD thesis clearly proves the latter point. For it is a work of painstaking research which deserves the attention of all those engaged in the study of the economic basis of the Ethiopian state. The author sets out 'to identify and explain the resource base of the Ethiopian state during its process of organising into a centralised power in the period 1696 to 1913', and he succeeds considerably in this respect by marshalling a vast array of Ethiopian and foreign sources. The exhaustive use of that veritable gold mine of information on Ethiopian land and taxation, *Zekra Nagar* (by the celebrated compiler, *Blattengeta Mahtama-Sellase Walda-Masqal*), stands out as perhaps the single outstanding methodological contribution of the work.

The author begins his analysis with a survey of the theories and perceptions of absolutism, preferring Perry Anderson's theory of the absolutist state for 'his structural approach and his association of absolutism with the transition from feudal to capitalist mode of production'. In applying this theory to the Ethiopian situation, he departs from earlier works by identifying two phases: the 'fiscal military state' (1855–1913) and the 'enlightened absolutist state' (1916–1974). He traces the origins of the first phase to the early eighteenth century with the emergence of the Shawan state (in south-central Ethiopia), which had the requisite material conditions (including private land ownership system) to address the prevalent political crisis of the sixteenth century. Thus the Shawan *Gabar Madarya* system came to replace the *Amisho Rim* system of Gondar and the *Rist Gult* system of the medieval period.

In the subsequent chapters, the author focuses on the crucial period of 1815–1913 and discusses in considerable detail: the evolution of a standardised system of taxation, more particularly the introduction of *qalad* (land measurement) and *asrat* (tithe); the size of government revenue; the structure and size of the military; the nature of government expenditure; and what the author terms 'government economic reforms'. The book ends with a fleeting consideration of issues of 'economic dynamism', namely, trade and urbanisation, aristocratic patrimony and ideas of development.

The subject dealt with in the book is vast in scope and intractable in nature. The author is to be commended for addressing the issues with remarkable conscientiousness and a reasonable degree of competence. Moreover, the work is underpinned by a wide reading on the theory and historiography of the subject. Understandably in a work of such complex nature, a number of problems arise. To begin with, the idea of pushing the organisation of centralised power to the eighteenth century seems far-fetched, just as the importance attached to the year 1696 seems somewhat over-blown. Nor do the 'absolutist' attributes of the Ethiopian state from 1855–1913 emerge so clearly; more accurately, the author prefers instead to characterise it consistently as 'the fiscal military state'. While the author makes a brave effort (pp. 49–56) to analyse the vast literature on that period,



he does not do justice to the complexity of the views contained in all those works. For instance, it is not true that all the works focused merely 'on understanding the motives and meanings of individual actions and events' (p. 54).

Emperor Tewodros's famous motto of '*hagar bage*' revolved around land, and not so much on governorship; at any rate, Tewodros did not abolish hereditary governorship, as witnessed in his policy towards Shawa and Tegra. The author's explanation for Menilek's establishment of ministries, while original (because it is related to the evolution of fiscal and military administration), strikes one at the same time as rather benign. Perhaps the most ambitious undertaking in the work has been the attempt to determine the size of government revenue and that of the army. Figures have been thrown out so capriciously in the literature that it is perilous to base one's computation on them. Valuable as it is, *Zekra Nagar* is not always reliable in this regard, as the figures are invariably not complete. Recourse to the prolific Pankhurst is no solution, either, in as much as he has not always shown selectivity and rigour in his use of those figures. The concept of 'economic reform' to describe the measures taken mostly by Menilek to consolidate the 'fiscal military state' is also misleading, the more so as the author himself assures us that, for instance, 'The reforms in agriculture were not of the kind which would encourage an increase in surplus nor release the labour tied to the land' (p. 213).

Nevertheless, these shortcomings do not minimise the importance of the work under review. The author has tackled a difficult topic with considerable expertise and broadened our perception of it – and hence of Ethiopian history – considerably.

*Addis Ababa University*

BAHRU ZEWDE

## GONJA HISTORIOGRAPHY

*History and Traditions of the Gonja*. By J. A. BRAIMAH, H. H. TOMLINSON and OSAFROADU AMANKWATIA. (African Occasional Papers, no. 6) Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 1997. Pp. viii + 184. \$15, paperback (ISBN 1-895176-38-7).

In this volume Peter Shinnie, as general editor of Calgary's African Occasional Papers, has brought together three unrelated texts. The most recent, 'Gonja traditional and customary practice and procedure in chieftaincy matters since 1923', is by Osafroadu Amankwatia, an Asante lawyer employed by the northern regional House of Chiefs. It is a brief but useful description of the 'traditional' distribution of chiefly authority, written about 1975, when Acheampong and his National Redemption Council presided over the affairs of Ghana. The regime was committed to decentralising authority to new district councils, and this treatise, at least in the form we have it here, was probably intended as a guide, approved by the Gonja Traditional Council, for elected councillors having to deal with traditional chiefly matters.

H. H. Tomlinson's lengthier 'The customs, constitution and history of the Gonja people', was completed in 1954. It is, the author says, 'an exposition of fact', based on the record books, diaries and files of colonial administrators, works in Arabic by Gonja Muslims, and the oral testimony of those versed in 'tribal history and custom'. Tomlinson was himself a District Commissioner in Gonja in the early 1950s. At this time the feasibility of 'indirect rule' was still a matter of faith for the administration. Although Nkrumah's rising Convention People's Party seemed intent on the abolition of chieftaincy, certainly in northern Ghana it was difficult to envisage any system of local government that was not based upon

it. Tomlinson's treatise was, and probably still is, the best available 'A to Z' for Gonja.

The controversial item in this book is J. A. Braimah's 'A history of the Gonja state'. Braimah, once Nkrumah's Minister of Communications and Works, returned from the modern to the traditional sector, and died in 1987 as Yagbumwura, Paramount Chief of Gonja. He was a prolific writer, and some fifteen years ago I accepted an invitation from Shinnie to edit, with Braimah's agreement, a selection of his works. As Shinnie notes in the introduction to *History and Traditions of the Gonja*, I subsequently withdrew from this commitment. I did so with regret – since I had worked closely with Braimah in 1964 – but after careful consideration. The problem was, as I saw it, that Braimah's views on the origins and development of the Gonja state were largely shaped by, first, the repertoires of the Gonja *kuntungkurbe* and other drummers and, second, various Arabic chronicles and the like written by Gonja Muslims, of which the earliest are from the first half of the eighteenth century. Unfortunately his use of both was badly flawed.

Braimah himself [*Gonja Drums*, nd. but c. 1983] produced a mimeographed corpus of drum recitals in English translations the quality of which is highly uneven. Esther and Jack Goody have given us a preview of their major work on the drum texts in *Africa*, 62 (2) 1992. I cite from this one particularly alarming translation in illustration of the problem. The drummers say, *Bulimpe nya wulin-dzi*. The Goody translation, which is correct, is, 'the lion arises to become chief'. The Braimah translation is, 'the Vice (star) of the town of Bullom'. On the basis of this mistranslation, in several of his works Braimah postulates a link between Gonja and the Bulom of Sierra Leone.

The Gonja chronicles have now been published, in the Arabic original and English translation [I. Wilks, N. Levzion and B. Haight, *Chronicles from Gonja*, Cambridge University Press, 1986]. Braimah died before he could consult this collection, and used instead earlier translations often badly done into English via Hausa. Some of these will be found in the appendices to Tomlinson's study. Again, Braimah could be, and sometimes was, led into serious error by his use of these corrupt texts. They gave rise, for example, to a monumental confusion between on the one hand Bighu, the Juula entrepot on the fringes of the Akan forestlands, and on the other, Segou, the Bambara capital on the Middle Niger.

Working on Braimah's manuscripts, I came to doubt the wisdom of publishing even a selection of them. I felt that they were likely to derail, as it were, Gonja historiography just at a time when carefully edited texts of the drum recitals and the Arabic chronicles were (to mix metaphors) in the pipeline. I urged, nevertheless, that the whole Braimah corpus should be made available for consultation in appropriate archival and library collections. To my way of thinking, Braimah was unfortunate in being in the right place at the wrong time. This said, I should add that Shinnie has, in my opinion, elected to publish the most scholarly, since least speculative, of all Braimah's writings. *History and Traditions of the Gonja* is a most useful addition to the growing body of literature on Gonja, and we are in Shinnie's debt.

*Northwestern University*

IVOR WILKS

## BORGU'S 'PROBABLE PAST'

*Wasangari und Wangara : Borgu und seine Nachbarn in historischer Perspektive*. Bei RICHARD KUBA. Hamburg: Lit, 1996. Pp. 401. No price given (ISBN 3-8258-2802-6).

Although the history of pre-colonial states and societies in the West African savanna seems to be quite well established, there are still several historically obscure regions. Such an area is pre-colonial Borgu in today's western Nigeria and northern Benin. Whereas the history of Borgu's neighbours is better documented and thus easier to access, Borgu has been left on the periphery of historical scholarship. Richard Kuba's *Wasangari und Wangara* fills this gap, in which Borgu emerges as an important cross-roads between north and south as well as east and west.

The lack of internal written sources has forced Kuba to undertake a meticulous search for other sources – the written sources of Borgu's neighbours, external sources such as travel reports, colonial reports and oral traditions as well as archaeological, linguistic and ethnographic evidence. This is also the strength of Kuba's research, especially his extensive efforts to collect oral traditions. He has interviewed individuals from various social strata, including emirs and *sarkis*, courtiers, *griots* and earth priests as well as ordinary people. In chapter one, Kuba presents a very detailed account and evaluation of his sources as well as methodological considerations. Here he also discusses previous research on the topic, giving special credit to the unpublished dissertation of the late Musa Baba Idriss.<sup>1</sup>

Kuba presents new considerations and interpretations of the political and religious structures in pre-colonial Borgu. His detailed study of the earth priests points to the emergence of political structures before the coming of the Wasangari warrior aristocracy. Thus in chapters two to four, Kuba looks at the internal processes of social organisation in Borgu and traces the history of a pre-Wasangari state, Dako. On the basis of linguistic evidence, he rejects the previous hypothesis of a political influence of the empire of Mali on state formation in (Mande-speaking) Borgu. Next, Kuba investigates the origins of the Wasangari and their arrival in Borgu, which he dates at the latest to the first half of the fifteenth century. He rejects the idea that the Kisra legend was a mere ideological, anti-Islamic construction. Instead, he associates the legend and the immigration of the Wasangari with political and social developments in the Central Sudan during the first half of the second millennium. According to Kuba, the 'carriers of the Kisra legend' were a faction of the anti-Islamic Duguwa dynasty of Borno, who were ousted from power by the Sayfawa dynasty between the thirteenth and fifteenth century. Arriving in the Borgu states, the Wasangari removed the indigenous local rulers from their political posts but accepted them as earth priests. He therefore sees the immigration of the Wasangari as more of an infiltration than an invasion, and argues that the original identity of the Wasangari was soon blurred due to intermarriage with the local people.

In chapters five to eight, Kuba investigates the various connections between the Borgu states and their northern, eastern and southern neighbours. He presents the region as a centre for the exchange of political, ideological and religious ideas, as well as a junction of trade routes connecting the empires of the savanna with the

<sup>1</sup> Musa Baba Idris, 'Political and economic relations in the Bariba states: an introduction to the historical study of a plural society from the traditions of origin to the colonial period', 1973. This thesis was never examined owing to the tragic and untimely death of the author.

states in the south. The Wasangari entered Borgu from the north, having established a joking relationship with the Songhay. However, with the collapse of Songhay, the old established north–south trade network from Mali/Songhay to the Yoruba states disintegrated and was replaced by the rising trade network from Hausaland to Gonja.

The Wasangari also expanded into northern Yorubaland, where they established new ruling dynasties at Oyo and Sabe, thus laying the ground for their joking relationship with the Yoruba (in today's Benin). Even more profound was the affiliation between the Wasangari and the rulers of Borno; as late as the early colonial period, Bussa annually sent presents to Borno.

For a reader fluent in German, Kuba's investigation provides a fascinating reinterpretation, what he calls a 'probable past', for not only the pre-colonial history of Borgu but for the whole Central Sudan.

*University of Helsinki*

HOLGER WEISS

### THE LITERARY OEUVRE OF A 'REMARKABLE WOMAN'

*Collected Works of Nana Asma'u, Daughter of Usman dan Fodio (1793–1864)*. By JEAN BOYD and BEVERLY B. MACK. (African Historical Sources Series, no. 9) East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 1997. Pp. xxx + 753. \$49.95 (ISBN 0-87013-475-2).

To be aged 21 and at the heart of a revolution must have been exciting. To have lived within the family that brought about the replacement of ruler after ruler with one's own relatives must have been a heady experience. To have been a part of the intellectual powerhouse that thought through a new basis for society within a reformed, just and legal Islamic polity must have been absorbing to say the least. To be able to look back over a long life of debate, writing and action must have been a cause for at least some satisfaction.

Remarkable times produce remarkable people. But it is not of Napoleon Bonaparte that I speak, rather a near contemporary of his in a very different part of the world. A woman, a scholar, an intellectual, an organiser and a linguist, Nana Asma'u, was a leading figure in the establishment of what came to be known as the Sokoto Caliphate. Her thought and her life are not gleaned from scraps of hearsay and reconstruction; for the first time we have available in English translation and in Hausa her voice, *in extenso*, on many different issues, and in verse with commentarial additions from two of the leading authorities in the field. During her seventy-two years from 1793 this remarkable woman produced translations, commentaries, exhortations, elegies and histories, mostly in verse, and working with at least four languages – Arabic, Hausa, Tuareg, and her mother tongue, Fulfulde (Fulani). Her oeuvre has been preserved by her descendants and, most particularly, the family of the late Waziri Junaidu of Sokoto, with whom one of the authors of this volume, Jean Boyd, has worked closely. Her writings, collected here, were one aspect of her life, as a son of the Waziri says in a foreword to this book; she also 'organised a public education system for women and was at the heart of a sisterhood which esteemed service to the community'. A remarkable woman indeed.

This volume of works, mostly from the collection of Waziri Junaidu, presents some 54 original poems and prose texts in English translation, with a number of variants and additional items by others concerning Nana Asma'u. A first appendix gives the Hausa text in Roman characters of fifteen of the poems, and a second appendix gives facsimiles of *ajami* texts produced by copyists working on

transliterations and translations at the Islamic College in Sokoto between 1975 and 1978 (p. xviii). Each text is preceded by an introduction giving provenance, background and cross-referencing while footnotes provide clarification on elements within the translated text itself. A general introduction to Nana Asma'u is complemented by an outline chronology of her life. The texts fall into a number of categories reflecting the preoccupations of her life: elegies and appreciations of people around her, exhortation and celebration of victories in the battle to establish the Caliphate, didactic verse intended for the convert or the student of Islam, and exchanges with other scholars and writers.

The texts are fluently and readably translated within the constraints imposed by the cultural specificity and the religiosity of the original materials. The helpful footnoting and cross-referencing builds up a picture of the interrelatedness of much of the material and its embeddedness within the discourse of an Islamic community of scholars living and working within the western Sudan at the period. The work of translation and annotation has been herculean, with additional aids for the student being provided through glossaries of terms, place names, individuals, as well as an extensive bibliography and six maps. The text has, though, been presented to the publishers as camera-ready copy and thus perhaps has lacked the final scrutiny of a copy editor, resulting in a number of minor blemishes. In the contents pages the transfer of electronic copy to another printer appears to have substituted a circumflex 'û' for the 'hooked k' and an unlauded 'ë' for the 'hooked d' in italic versions of the Hausa alphabet. The header in the index pages erroneously retains 'Appendix B', while a number of typos have not been picked up. The only seriously unhelpful omission is that the contents page (or the beginning of Appendix B) does not list the *ajami* manuscripts with page numbers, thereby setting a time-consuming trawl for the reader who wants to find the *ajami* text that corresponds with either the Roman Hausa text (happily listed with page numbers in the contents under Appendix A) or the English translation. But these are minor defects in what is a major contribution to the scholarly work on this remarkable woman. This volume will constitute a useful companion volume of source materials to the forthcoming book by the same authors entitled, *One Woman's Jihad: Nana Asma'u 1793–1864*.

*School of Oriental and African Studies*  
*University of London*

GRAHAM FURNISS

## LOVEDU HISTORY

*Die Lobedu Südafrikas : Mythos und Realität der Regenkönigin Modjadji. (Missions-geschichtliches Archiv, 4).* Bei ELFRIED HÖCKNER. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner, 1998. Pp. 260. DM 88 (ISBN 3-515-06794-9).

The author of this PhD thesis in ethnology at Vienna University sets out to place the Lovedu in the context of the evolution of society propounded by Walter Dostal on the basis of ethnographic material from Arabia. This aim is really only discussed in two brief final chapters, where the conclusion is that the data did not permit an answer! The introductory chapter contains a truncated account of South African history, although it does not provide even a brief summary of the troubled history of the eastern Transvaal during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries that should have been attempted in order to place the main section of the book in historical perspective. The second chapter consists of notes on sources and their authors.

The long chapter three comprises two parts. The first is a précis of the Berlin missionary Friedrich Reuter's journal, correspondence, and notes from 1881 to

1899, with comments. It is the most valuable section of the book, especially for those interested in the history of the eastern Transvaal, as it contains frequent verbatim quotes. Read critically, it provides interesting insights into the structure and transformation of Lovedu society, the subjugation of the indigenous societies of the eastern Transvaal by the Boers and the proletarianisation of migratory labourers forced to proceed to the Witwatersrand to earn money. The second part consists of a mutilating summary of J. D. and Eileen J. Krige's work on the Lovedu, whose *The Realm of a Rain-Queen* (1943) will always retain its honoured place on this reviewer's bookshelf. The author does not seem to have understood the detailed description and lucid analysis of the intricate system of kinship and marriage among the Lovedu by the Kriges that was interwoven with the delicate system of checks and balances constituting the political structure of their kingdom. No real attempt is made to relate the work of the two anthropologists to that of Reuter, however, who died only in 1950. Höckner should have concentrated on Reuter and attempted a critical analysis of his work.

This reviewer cannot refrain from quoting instances of the indifferent quality of the German, the use of the word 'verunmöglichen' (p. 39), for instance, or 'Supervision' (p. 28), or 'inkludierte' (pp. 50, 137), or the phrase 'In der königlichen Struktur der Lobedu...' (p. 170). More serious is the confusion concerning technical terms in social anthropology, e.g. 'Polygamie' (pp. 106ff.) and 'Polygynie' (pp. 162ff.). The series editor says in his preface that since the early nineties the apartheid view of history has been in the process of being revised, and that German historians should contribute to this. This reviewer dates the commencement of the rewriting of South African history at the very latest back to Monica Wilson's 1959 article in *African Studies* where – using Portuguese sources – she proved that people speaking Bantu languages had been in the Eastern Cape at least since the circumnavigation of the Cape. There is absolutely no need for German historians to teach any historians of South Africa outside Germany how to do critical history. Or does he really think this volume is a patch on Delius's *A Lion Amongst the Cattle* or Van Onselen's *The Seed is Mine*? It isn't. What German historians *can* do is to point to material in German missionary archives and translate it. When doing so, however, they should critically evaluate the often biased stance of German missionaries, whose ideology contributed to that of apartheid, and should show how they were – like Reuter – implicated in the expulsion of Africans from their land by border ruffians and settlers.

University of Munich

JOHANNES W. RAUM

## NIUMI IN WORLD HISTORY

*The World and a Very Small Place in Africa*. By DONALD R. WRIGHT. Armonk, NY and London: M. E. Sharp, 1997. Pp. xv + 278. £50.50 (ISBN 1-56324-959-6); £15.95, paperback (ISBN 1-56324-960-X).

The book does as the title promises: it seeks to position a small and ancient West African state, Niumi, in the broad currents of world history over the last five centuries. From the mid-fifteenth century, Niumi, located on the northern shore of the Gambia River estuary, became increasingly linked to and influenced by the outside world, until it was swallowed by the British colony of Gambia. It is now part of the Republic of Gambia. In order to analyse the fortunes of Niumi in the process of globalization, the author adopted Immanuel Wallerstein's world-system theory: Niumi is shown gradually to change from a small player external to the evolving capitalist world-system into a peripheral one, losing its power, prosperity and political identity in the process. This broad characterization, as well as the

chapter titles and subheadings, might give the impression that the book is doctrinal and its portrayal of Niumi's history almost cardboard. This is not the case. Wright offers a rich, objective and sensitive reconstruction of the history of Niumi, weighing shrewdly and skillfully the internal, regional and global factors at play.

Part I places Niumi in its regional and world context prior to the arrival of the Europeans. Part II links the growing Atlantic trade and the evolving American plantation complex with the fortunes of Niumi as a regional African power able to control and exact profit from the traffic along the Gambia River. Wright demonstrates that the first three centuries of Niumi's involvement in the Atlantic trade did not lead either to impoverishment or peripherisation of Niumi. Until the mid-eighteenth century, Niumi prospered, both politically and economically. While this is particularly true of the state and the ruling class, ordinary people, except for slaves, were also able to benefit from the increased wealth and expansion of their world. The growing incorporation into the outside world had its downside: Niumi developed dependence on imported goods and on foreign markets. Niumi's vulnerability was first revealed in the second half of the eighteenth century, amidst agricultural problems and political instability. As Part III shows, however, Niumi entered a steep decline only in the nineteenth century. It was caught between three competing forces: economic change, the rising power of the British and Muslim militancy that weakened the ruling families of Niumi and facilitated British colonial takeover. While in the past the British were forced to concede Niumi's demands, the political, technological and military change in the West in the first half of the nineteenth century made it possible for them to act from a position of strength, and eventually strip Niumi of access to the Gambia River. The loss of revenues from the river traffic and the growing dependence on peanut exports led to a deepening economic malaise, which increased during the colonial period.

The colonial period for Niumi began long before 1897, the date of the formal British takeover. The colonial government directly and indirectly promoted peanut cultivation and eventually adopted a pro-Islam policy, thus profoundly reshaping many aspects of life in the former Niumi. The dependence on peanut exports left the Niumi area extremely vulnerable to the swings of global economy, as the Depression and post-World-War-II era clearly proved. Niumi, like most of Gambia, emerged from this period with a very thin elite and an impoverished majority.

The establishment of independent Gambia did not, or perhaps could not, improve the situation in the former Niumi. The dependence on imports and therefore on production for exports, and the abject poverty of most of the population continued. As one of Wright's subheadings puts it there were 'New rulers, [but] old rules' (Ch. 7).

The book closes with a touching journalistic window onto a descendent of one Niumi's ruling family, the Manneh, who despite his poverty is optimistic about the future. It is at the very end of the book that the reader sees clearly why Wright chose the world-system theory to inform his story of Niumi. While most of the book would have done better without the steady references to the 'world-system', the final paragraph, where he expresses scepticism about Manneh's optimism, brings the point home:

As I thought...of his [Manneh's] skinny frame and sore leg, of the empty rice bags from Taiwan, of the pathetic millet and bitter-tomato stew that was to be his daily meal, of the scrawny goats and chicken...of the unemployed young men and hard-working young women and the runny-nosed kids – I had my doubts (p. 254).

Wright's book is a successful effort to link world and local history. The reconstruction of the dynamics of Niumi's past is rich, original, extremely well-

researched and compelling. The passages summarizing relevant trends in world history are by necessity shallower and in the first half a little artificial. Overall, however, the book is informed and informing, well-balanced, well-written, and very insightful.

Trent University, Ontario

IVANA ELBL

## EUROPE OVERSEAS

*Imperialism and Colonialism: Essays on the History of European Expansion.* By H. L. WESSELING. Westport: Greenwood Press, 1997. Pp. x + 212. £47.50 (ISBN 0-313-30431-0).

This collection brings together twelve essays by H. L. Wesseling, the Rector of the Netherlands Institute for Advanced Study (though he is probably better known in the English-speaking academic world as the director for many years of the Leiden Centre for the History of European Expansion). The essays themselves, almost all of which have been published before, are arranged here under three broad headings: 'Colonialism', 'Imperialism' and 'Decolonization and After'. Taken together, they illustrate very well the remarkable breadth of Professor Wesseling's interests: colonial wars, the nature of French and Dutch imperialism, the partition of Africa, the significance of decolonization, and the writing of overseas history, both generally and especially in the Netherlands.

Students of European expansion will, I suspect, already be familiar with most of the essays in this collection. Three of them have appeared in *Itinerario*, the journal of the Leiden centre, and one, as it happens, here ('The Netherlands and the partition of Africa', *Journal of African History* 22 (1981).) Others have been published in such prominent historical journals as *The Journal of Contemporary History* and the *Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History*, or in well-known collections as *Imperialism and War: Essays on Colonial Wars in Asia and Africa*, which Wesseling himself edited with J. A. de Moor. Even the piece on the impact of the 'Dutch colonial model' on British, Belgian, German and French colonial theory and practice is effectively a study of this impact on the French, a topic on which Professor Wesseling has written elsewhere, both in English and in French ('The Dutch colonial model in French colonial theory, 1890-1914', *Proceedings of the Second Meeting of the French Colonial Historical Society*, 1977; 'Le modèle colonial hollandais dans la théorie coloniale française, 1880-1914', *Revue française d'Histoire d'Outre-Mer*, 63 (1976).) Although some of the papers have been revised for this edition, the revisions have not been very extensive. For example, 'The debate on French imperialism, 1960-1975', which first appeared in 1977, has been updated to include a reference to Jacques Marseille's *Empire colonial et capitalisme français: histoire d'un divorce*, one of the most influential contributions to the debate since the 1970s; but there is no attempt to summarize his argument beyond a cryptic comment that 'it settled the question'. However, a brief summary of Marseille's principal arguments is presented several essays later, in 'Overseas history, 1945-1995'.

The treatment of Marseille illustrates another problem with collections of previously published articles such as this. That problem is not so much one of occasional repetition, which Professor Wesseling recognizes, as one of occasional inconsistency. For example, the fanciful statistical survey of J. D. Singer and J. M. Small in *The Wages of War, 1816-1945* is rightly treated with considerable scepticism in 'Colonial wars and armed peace, 1871-1914', but it is regarded much more favourably in 'The Berlin conference of 1884-1885'. Similarly, the 'cultivation system' in Java is referred to in 'The Netherlands as a colonial model',



but readers unfamiliar with Dutch colonial history must wait until 'The strange case of Dutch imperialism', two essays later, to learn that the system entailed the compulsory cultivation of cash crops for the government at rates determined unilaterally by the government.

Nevertheless, *Imperialism and Colonialism* remains a useful collection. Professor Wesseling's ideas are always interesting, and he presents them with both clarity and verve. Even those revisiting some of these papers after a lapse of several years will be struck by how well they still read.

York University, Toronto

A. S. KANYA-FORSTNER

## IMPERIAL VISIONS OF GENDER

*Domesticating the Empire: Race, Gender and Family Life in French and Dutch Colonialism*. Edited by JULIA CLANCY-SMITH and FRANCES GOUDA. Charlottesville and London: University Press of Virginia, 1998. Pp. xi + 348. \$59.50 (ISBN 0-8139-1780-8); \$19.50, paperback (ISBN 0-8139-1781-6).

This carefully edited collection of twelve essays on imperial gender ideologies is a welcome addition to reading lists on imperial ideologies in general and the history of gender relations in an imperial context in particular. It is particularly useful from a comparative perspective, as its contributors have consciously chosen to concentrate on Dutch and French imperial discourses on how to 'civilize' or 'domesticate' the dangerous beast of sexuality, rather than to add to the already substantial body of literature on the British Empire. Any student of gendered language interested in the question of how both the imagery and the conceptualisation of gender shaped the perception as well as the re-ordering of the imperial 'self' and the colonial 'other', often in the language of mother-child relationships, will be delighted by the wealth of case-studies in this book.

The study of Locher-Scholten which examines the Dutch rhetoric on Javanese servants is particularly penetrating, because it places the colonial discourse of such literature as manuals for newcomers to the Netherlands East Indies and children's books firmly in the context of the changing reality of the colonial household. This serves well to uncover the ambiguities of a rhetoric which was based on the somewhat contradictory notions of social distance and paternalistic structures. Horne's discussion of the visions of social reform by the French republican thinker *Musée Social*, as well as Pedersen's of the French discussion of paternity suits and their admissibility in the Empire convince because they firmly link developments in France to those abroad, from the ideas of upholding divisions of class and race to the notion of women as agents of 'moral and cultural betterment'. This became particularly poignant, as Conklin demonstrates, when increasing numbers of French women were accepted into the Empire after World War I – which constitutes a striking parallel to developments in British imperialism. Bowlan shows plausibly, however, how the idea of educating 'the veiled Muslim woman' actually constituted a threat to the notion of an eternal civilizing mission, while Kipp discusses how Dutch missionary gender concepts were rather conservative by comparison with the realities of Karo women in Sumatra. Clancy-Smith convincingly shows the underlying fears of cultural hybridity in the development of a particular notion of the Algerian woman by both the French and European Algerians.

Rutherford and Simpson Fletcher explore the depiction of Algeria and Papua New Guinea in gendered terms and their role for the French and Dutch national and imperial projects, while Gouda shows how nationalists could provoke by playing on such imagery in their criticism of the imperial project. Novels are a

particularly rich field in which visions of the empire could be played out, and Edwards interestingly links the feminine portrayal of Cambodia in fiction to western women's emancipation. Pattynama, on the other hand, spoils the exposure of Dutch colonial fantasies of the transgression of racial boundaries by her somewhat pretentious rhetoric: 'The novel's haunting ambiguities emerge from this submerged space' (p. 104).

If there is one desideratum which emerges from reading this as well as other books on gender and empire, it is the question whether the approaches by Gouda and Rutherford could not be carried further. It might be fruitful if future research confronted imperial visions of gender more systematically with the realities of the colonised, with their gender ideologies and their gendered depictions of the imperial powers.

*School of Oriental and African Studies,  
University of London*

ULRIKE FREITAG

### GENDERED FREEDOMS

*Liberating the Family? Gender and British Slave Emancipation in the Rural Western Cape, South Africa, 1823–1853.* By PAMELA SCULLY. Cape Town: David Philip, Oxford: James Currey, Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann, 1997. Pp. xiii + 210. £40 (ISBN 0-85255-678-0); £15.95, paperback (ISBN 0-85255-628-4).

Locating gender at the centre of historical analysis, *Liberating the family?* demonstrates that 'amelioration and emancipation from the 1820s through the 1840s mark an important period in the making of social and economic categories in South Africa... Ideas held by different participants about the capacities and roles of men and women crucially shaped the world of freedom into which ex-slave women and men were liberated in 1838.' (pp. 2–3) *Liberating the family?* aims 'to unite a concern with ideological contests over family formation [particularly in struggles over labour] with attention to the emotional lives of people freed from slavery.' (p. 11) Scully attends to this task with sensitivity, although at times rather more is deduced about the inner lives and beliefs of freed people – or, indeed, of settlers – than the evidence seems to warrant (e.g. p. 67).

The book's agenda is set by a series of questions. Firstly, 'how widespread was the twinning of freedom and masculine authority, of freedom and feminine subordination, in the ideologies of Abolition?' The first part of the book discusses the gendered nature of amelioration at the Cape. Ameliorative legislation would influence later labour laws, which were also profoundly gendered (ch. 5). Scully goes on to ask the central question: what did freedom mean? 'Did slave women and men share this gendered vision of freedom? And did significant disjunctures exist between freed peoples' experience of emancipation in the Cape Colony and the different ideologies of gender promoted by abolitionists, missionaries and government officials?' Scully painstakingly explores these issues, in the context of major source difficulties which force a heavy reliance on anecdotal evidence. While settlers are excluded from the above questions, they too are significant (if somewhat two-dimensional) actors in this narrative.

Struggles over gender and the family are placed at the centre of historical processes that shaped the post-emancipation rural Western Cape, where most former slaves resided and worked in the decades after 1838. Part 2, 'Liberating the family?' focuses on 'landscapes of emancipation' and 'labouring families', presenting a fascinating analysis of gendered labour legislation in this era, and the differences between theory and practice, but presenting freed families in a wholly positive light. The third part of the book is entitled 'Sexuality, race and colonial

identities'; it is here that 'the family' is shown to be a site of gendered struggle. Thus we read that 'for women freedom... did not necessarily entail liberation from violent assault on their persons, either by the men they married or lived with or by men in colonial society in general' (p. 129).

Nevertheless, freed people, men and women, struggled to control their and their families' (including children's) labour and lives in the post-emancipation era, against what is presented as largely ungendered and monochromatically unsympathetic settlers (and other, somewhat more nuanced, colonial authorities and missionaries). Missionaries loom large in this narrative. Although only 12 per cent of former slaves entered mission stations after emancipation (most through familial connections), Scully demonstrates the missions' symbolic value as an alternative – albeit unrealisable – way of life that was a crucial source of tension between the various colonial actors.

Freed people played a significant role in shaping the post-emancipation socio-economic landscape. Strategies to control their own labour – and thereby enact their own freedom – included women's withdrawal from domestic labour for farmers, and a preference for casual labour rather than the longer-term contracts favoured by farmers in the context of the post-emancipation labour legislation of the 1840s and 1850s. Scully argues that 'the movement from domestic work for employers into domestic work for one's own household came to signify liberty from slavery, and an entry into womanhood for some freed women' (p. 94). Frustratingly, no evidence is presented to support this contention. Ultimately, however, 'economics rather than ideology mainly seems to have determined the nature of married women's [and men's and children's] work' (p. 95).

*Liberating the Family* explores the ideological, socio-economic, and emotional forces shaping freed people's experiences of freedom through various lenses. Scully explores different ways in which women in particular were constructed in this period (there is less on constructions of masculinity). Thus in Part 3 she argues 'that ideologies of gender, race and sexuality themselves helped shape and produce particular colonial narratives and experiences'. Crucially, Scully brings rape, sexuality, infanticide into the mainstream – as crucial locations of official colonial discourse as well as central to constructions of freedom and identity of freed women and men. It is a pity that these chapters are relegated to a separate, final section in the book. Nevertheless, throughout this book, Scully demonstrates that 'in their struggles to define the meanings of freedom, different groups invoked [different] connections between gender, class, and racial categories which helped define the post-emancipation era at the Cape in part as a struggle over the meanings of masculinity and femininity' (p. 15). *Liberating the family?* is path-breaking; it is elegantly argued and written, and should be read by everyone interested in the histories of southern Africa.

*University of Cape Town*

PATRICIA VAN DER SPUY

#### ANGLO-AFRIKANER RELATIONS IN THE CAPE

*Cecil Rhodes and the Cape Afrikaners: The Imperial Colossus and the Colonial Parish Pump.* By MORDECHAI TAMARKIN. London: Frank Cass, 1996. Pp. x + 339. £35 (ISBN 0-7146-4627x); £16, paperback (ISBN 0-7146-4267-3).

Tamarkin's scholarly and succinct appraisal of key aspects of the political career of Cecil Rhodes in many respects represents a watershed in both indigenous South African and broader British imperial historiography. His intricate focus upon a key lacuna, the dynamics behind Rhodes' short-lived but nevertheless extraordinary political alliance forged with large sections of Cape Afrikanerdom, throws fresh

light upon the origins of the second Anglo-Boer War as well as the murky melting pot of 'mutton, mines, vines' and extra-territorial ambitions, issues which dominated Cape political life in the late nineteenth century.

In his opening chapters Tamarkin reveals the essential ingredients of this unholy alliance, or, using his own original metaphorical terminology, the 'marriage' consummated between these two potentially antagonistic partners. Both 'bride' and 'bridegroom' had much to offer each other. For Rhodes it was a case of using local Afrikanerdom as a crucial support to realise his territorial ambitions north of the Zambesi and, ultimately, north of the Limpopo River. It was also an alliance of necessity: the English-speaking political groupings were far too fragmented to provide local regional backing for his schemes compared to an increasingly Anglicised and far more cohesive Afrikaner Bond. For many Cape Afrikaners the motivation for such a political alliance was primarily racial and economic. Rhodes was the imperialist they thought they could trust. He was, apparently, far removed from the interfering 'trust' and welfare policies of the imperial metropole. Hence Rhodes' support for the infamous 1894 Glen Grey Act which ensured a regular African labour supply and which effectively disenfranchised many African voters was welcomed by many Cape Afrikaner farmers and industrialists. Similarly, Afrikaner politicians were granted full access to Rhodes' formidable electoral machine which thrived in the highly corruptible Cape political arena. In these different ways Rhodes could be seen to be acting in defence of an indigenous 'South African order' as opposed to the much feared and potentially politically suffocating, 'imperial order'.

Nevertheless, as Tamarkin contends, 'underneath the solid crust of the alliance' there was 'a threatening gulf between the Cape centricism of the Bond and the aggressive imperialism of Rhodes. Only the Cape-centric guise of Rhodes' imperial vision lured the Bond into the alliance' (p. 134). It was always therefore a fragile coalition. Rhodes' tacit support for the 1895 Jameson raid, a high risk attempt to destroy Krugerism, the last main obstacle to his imperial dreams, served only to revive kith and kinship amongst *all* Afrikaners, expose his political cynicism and effectively precipitate 'the re-racialisation of Cape politics' (p. 269) – English against Afrikaner.

While Rhodes was exposed as an imposter and jingoist to his Cape Afrikaner allies, Tamarkin challenges previous writers by emphasising the incompleteness of their 'divorce'. The partnership was slow to disengage and friendships between Rhodes and leading Afrikaners survived, testifying to the deep personal factors which had also once cemented this uneasy alliance. Indeed, it was such social bonds that possibly saved Rhodes from the consequences of the earlier anti-Scab legislation of 1894–5, which, while designed to prevent a debilitating disease prevalent amongst sheep herds, aroused considerable opposition from cost-conscious Afrikaner wool farmers in the Western Cape.

In summary, Tamarkin's study provides a radical and well-substantiated reinterpretation of this crucial period of Anglo-Afrikaner relations. His thesis further challenges the earlier crude ethnicised vision of 'Boer and Briton' locked in inevitable conflict and reveals the subtle social and economic nuances which governed a highly complex political environment in South Africa during the closing decades of the nineteenth century. At times the 'weight' of evidence becomes, perhaps, too overwhelming for even the specialised reader easily to absorb. There are, for example, instances of the excessive use of quotations in support of merely one argument or contention. Aside from these minor stylistic shortfalls, this book will emerge as a landmark in the study of Afrikaner, indeed, white identity during this turbulent period of South African history. More tantalisingly it will inevitably invite the reader to speculate upon *alternative* political consequences had Jameson's 'deathblow' not occurred. Could, for

instance, the Anglo-Boer War of 1899–1902 been limited, moderated or even averted by the survival, even extension of this remarkable political alliance? Or was the conflict inevitably the product of a much wider and deeper socio-economic racial/class divide, which transcended any such localised political brokerage and, which primarily reflected both the consequences of the recent massive industrialisation of South Africa and the concomitant rapacious imperial interventionism? This book has stimulated an important debate which must be continued.

*Royal Military Academy, Sandhurst*

EDMUND YORKE

## FRANCO-MUSLIM RELATIONS IN THE SAHARA

*La légende noire de la Sanûsiyya : Une confrérie musulmane saharienne sous le regard français, 1840–1930.* 2 vols. Par JEAN-LOUIS TRIAUD. Paris: Editions de la Maison des Sciences de l'Homme, 1995. Pp. xiii + 1151. FF 250 (ISBN 2-7351-0584-9).

The Sanusiyya played an important role in the revitalization of Islam in the western Islamic lands in the nineteenth century. Triaud explores the history of this movement within the context of European and especially French expansion in North Africa and the Sahara, and with particular reference to the origins and evolution of the systematic anti-Sanusi discourse which was perpetrated by French colonial writers and officials, the *légende noire* of the title. The history of the Sanusiyya was complex. From its formal origins in about 1837 in Arabia, its founder Muhammad al-Sanusi (1787–1859) established his first African *zawiya* in Libya in the 1840s. Expansion into the Sahara occurred under his son, Muhammad al-Mahdi (1844–1902), who transferred the centre of the movement southward as an expression of withdrawal, or *hijra*. Al-Mahdi's cousin, Ahmad al-Sharif (1867–1933), waged jihad in the attempt to maintain independence from colonial rule, and thus the movement played itself out as an intellectual, religious and political reaction to European expansion.

As Triaud demonstrates, by the end of the nineteenth century a Sanusiyya presence extended across the Sahara, from Benghazi in the north to Kanem, northeast of Lake Chad; Sanusiyya lodges were also established in many of the major cities of the Sokoto caliphate and Borno. The southern orientation is particularly important. The available documentation further demonstrates the extensive written interaction among the various Muslim governments and religious communities throughout the Sahara, the sahel and the northern Sudan, and the extent that political and religious rivalries connected sub-Saharan Muslim communities with the central Islamic lands. In a masterful way, Triaud applies the rigorous standards of diplomatic history in his effort to understand the relationships among the various powers vying to control the regions bordering the Sahara in the nineteenth century.

The Sanusiyya are to be compared with other Islamic reform movements, particularly those associated with the Tijaniyya, Qadiriyya and Mahdiyya. Each of these movements began at *zawiya* established by followers of particular *tariqa* from which they extended their influence over large, multi-ethnic regions, sometimes in the form of direct political control through the waging of jihad. Understandably, scholars will want to know the similarities and differences in responses to European expansion, in the relationship of the different movements to the Ottoman Porte, and the economic and social consequences of these movements, especially in relation to slavery and the institution of Islamic legal and social norms. Triaud's massive study of the Sanusiyya is a major contribution to our understanding of Islamic reform movements and their relationship to European expansion.

Triaud draws on a great range of sources, including material from the major French archives, as well as those in Tunisia, Mali, Niger, and Senegal. However, he does not seem to have consulted archival materials in Libyan, Italian, or Ottoman archives, although he has used some materials published in Libya. It can be expected, therefore, that there is considerably more to be learned about the Sanusiyya. Appendices include 24 Arabic documents and translations. There is an excellent chronological table, and a detailed bibliography.

York University, Toronto

PAUL E. LOVEJOY

### THE FRENCH COLONIAL EMPIRE

*Greater France: A History of French Overseas Expansion.* By ROBERT ALDRICH. (European Studies Series) Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1996. Pp. xvi + 369. £14.99, paperback (ISBN 0-333-56740-4).

During the past decade or so, a surprising number of works on the French colonial empire have been published in French, among them a five-volume popular series (*L'aventure coloniale de la France*, Paris, 1987–90), two lengthy surveys intended for a more specialist audience (*Histoire de la France coloniale*, Paris, 1990–91; *L'histoire de la colonisation française*, Paris, 1991), and several briefer studies as well (Guy Pervillé, *De l'empire français à la décolonisation*, Paris, 1991; Jacques Binoche-Guedra, *La France d'outre-mer, 1815–1962*, Paris, 1992). By contrast, the most recent general account in English is still Raymond Betts' extended (and a shade idiosyncratic) essay, *Tricouleur: The French Overseas Empire* (New York, 1978), now twenty years old. The publication of Robert Aldrich's *Greater France* is thus nothing if not timely, and all the more welcome for helping to fill a major gap in the literature available to Anglophone undergraduate students of French history in Britain and North America, very few of whom now possess a reading knowledge of French.

Despite its subtitle, *Greater France* is not primarily a history of French overseas expansion in the narrow sense of that term. The acquisition and loss of the first French colonial empire is disposed of in a brief prologue. The construction of the second is dealt with in two chapters divided geographically, one on Africa, Madagascar and the Comoros Islands, the other on Asia (including the Middle Eastern mandates) and the Pacific. There is also a chapter on the growth of colonial nationalism and decolonization, as well as a brief epilogue on the DOM-TOMs, *la Francophonie* and the impact of immigration on French politics and society. Well over half of the book, however, is devoted to a description of the colonial empire and how it functioned under the Third Republic. All the major imperial themes are touched upon. The process of colonial policy making, the role of the colonialist movement and the emergence of anti-colonialist sentiments in metropolitan France are all briefly discussed. So too are the activities of Frenchmen (and women) overseas: explorers, missionaries, soldiers and sailors, civilian administrators and settlers. One chapter deals with the economic development of the empire, another with the relations between France and those over whom she imposed her domination. Special attention is also given to social and cultural topics, including the impact of the colonial experience on French art and literature and the place of women, both French and indigenous, in the empire.

Short books on large subjects are never easy to write, and *Greater France* has not entirely succeeded in avoiding all the pitfalls involved in such an exercise. Inevitably, given the scope of the work, a few minor (and one or two more serious) slips have found their way into the text. For example, the British did not declare a protectorate over Egypt in 1882; the naval officer who annexed the Marquesas

and established the French protectorate over Tahiti was called Dupetit-Thouars, not Dupetit-Thouard, and the number of colonial firms represented in the *Union coloniale française* at its formation in 1893 was about 40, not 400. There is also a curious lack of balance in the chapters dealing with the colonial conquests of the nineteenth century.

In a work of this length, no specific instance of colonial expansion can be discussed in any great detail, which makes it all the more difficult to understand why the occupation of the Comoros Islands, however interesting a story in its own right, is accorded more space than the conquest of Madagascar, or the Kerguelen Islands (effectively uninhabited) more than the Middle Eastern mandates. More seriously, though perhaps understandably given the nature of his book, the author has been a little too reluctant to advance any arguments of his own. For example, nobody could possibly disagree with his claim that 'decolonization... was a product of changing economic, political and military circumstances in France and the wider world, joined to the growth of colonial nationalism and the triumph of independence movements'. But the same could be said about decolonization anywhere, and Professor Aldrich makes no attempt to explain what made the French experience of decolonization different from, say, the British.

These quibbles aside, however, Professor Aldrich has managed to produce a remarkably clear, full and up-to-date survey, both simple enough to be accessible to undergraduates with no prior knowledge of the subject and sophisticated enough to make reading it worthwhile. *Greater France* is likely to remain the standard undergraduate text on its subject for many years to come.

York University, Toronto

A. S. KANYA-FORSTNER

## POSTCOLONIAL DIALOGUES ON SAHARAN HISTORY

*Nomades et commandants. Administration et sociétés nomades dans l'ancienne A.O.F.* Sous la direction de EDMOND BERNUS, PIERRE BOILLEY, JEAN CLAUZEL et JEAN-LOUIS TRIAUD. Paris: Editions Karthala, 1993. Pp. 246. FF 150, paperback (ISBN 2-86537-420-3).

What a wonderful idea to organize a dialogue among former nomads and administrators from the former French West African Sahara and contemporary scholars, for whom these people are 'subjects' of research and sources of evidence. What a disappointment when neither the promised dialogue nor the anticipated analysis materializes.

Twenty-three short papers, some accompanied by resums of workshop discussions, are presented in this book in three briefly-introduced sections: conquest (the 'time of bandits'), ten chapters; colonialism (the 'time of Christian peace'), eleven chapters; and decolonisation (the 'time of good-byes'), two chapters. Unfortunately, as Edmond Bernus acknowledges, very few persons who experienced colonial rule – as distinct from those who define(d) it – participated in this project, a rather critical omission considering the aims of the book.

The attempt to open a 'dialogue' between the subjects of academic enquiry (administered and administrators) and the scholars who study them (French and African) is an exercise in post-colonial discourse as well as a measure of the penetration of that discourse into French studies of colonialism. Four voices should be heard in such a dialogue, but that of the administered is virtually absent here, as is that of African scholars – themselves a 'product' of colonialism's most lasting legacy, western intellectual formation. These silences speak volumes in the first section. Former administrators and French academics perceive and present historical reality in much the same way. Some differences of opinion and emphasis

emerge in varying accounts, but these differences remain confined to more or less the same conceptual framework. By contrast, the contribution of the Tuareg scholar, Rissalan ag Alfarouk, which draws more on oral than archival sources, tends not to respect the temporal framework of the section in which it appears. This author addresses the unstated theme of 'resistance to conquest' from the perspective of those who refused to be educated in French established schools, whereas for the editors, 'education' is a subject more appropriate to the section on the 'time of Christian peace'. Questions therefore arise about how broadly representative are the 'eras' conceptualized by the editors. More importantly, where is the dialogue that should tie these disparate perspectives and voices together?

Similar difficulties are also evidenced in 'the time of Christian peace'. There are wonderfully rich 'memoirs' here in need of response and analysis. Gabriel Feral's contribution, for example, contrasts with more traditional views of the comparative 'Moor' and Tuareg experience in underscoring not ethnographic identities but the particularisms of conquest and their legacies, and the significance of having created a Tuareg minority situation in a colonial state dominated by the needs of a black, sedentary majority.

The study of colonial Africa has recently drawn attention to two issues also raised in this book: schooling and slavery. As research shows here and elsewhere, children of the elite – envisaged by colonial authorities as future leaders of 'friendly' (ex) colonies – often resisted attending school. Slaves, freed slaves, 'marginals' and low-castes took their places in the classroom – with all that this implies in terms of short- and long-range consequence for social and political evolution. The administrators also chronicle the defeat of 'nomadic education'. The need to centralize services in permanent buildings, the removal of children from camps to attend upper-level town schools, the levying of costly 'school-fees' in kind (food, labor, animals) ultimately undermined all efforts to innovate. These insights add considerably to our current understanding of colonial education more generally in these regions, which has focused on the role of religion in challenging schooling policies, and suggested new angles to explore in 'processes' like sedentarization, social-class formation and political democratization.

The contributions on slavery are largely descriptions of colonial policy. The very absence of the kind of 'case-study', culturally-nuanced material one finds in other studies of African slavery under colonialism illuminates again the dearth of published research on the subject in the Saharan context. These highlight the need for more comparative work between desert peoples, between nomads and 'sedentaries', and between the colonial and post-colonial 'servile' condition. The conference discussion seems to have broached (but not developed) a fascinating question, that of colonial 'slave language'. The French imposed their ideology of 'moving from slavery to freedom' on the very terminology they used to interpret Saharan reality, yet in local reality, the terms used to designate various 'slave conditions' distinguished subtly different but nonetheless distinct social identities which had nothing to do with concepts or gradations of freedom.

The 'time of good-byes' seems an afterthought. An extensive and extremely rich interview with a Tuareg in his fifties, ag Acherif (presented by Pierre Boilley), reaffirms the potential of this exercise really to open up the colonial experience. His testimony leads into the final account (by Boilley) of efforts to create a virtually autonomous 'French Sahara' (the *Organisation Commune des Régions Sahariennes*) at independence. This fascinating account could have been used to give coherence and relevance to the preceding contributions, for example, by articulating how the differing colonial experiences of the Mauriticians and the Tuareg shaped the post-colonial Saharan world; how French perceptions of their destiny in the Sahara were so much a product of those experiences; how our understanding of post-



colonialism – even with the extensive theoretical work available – still misses so much of the internal complexity and contradiction which was the painful reality of ‘being’ colonial.

*University of Alberta*

E. ANN MCDUGALL

### AFRICAN STUDENTS IN EUROPE

*West Africans in Britain, 1900–1960.* By HAKIM ADI. London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1998. Pp. 224. £13.99, paperback (ISBN 0-85315-848-7).

*Les étudiants africains en France, 1950–1965.* Par FABIENNE GUIMONT. Paris: L’Harmattan, 1997. Pp. 333. FF 160, paperback (ISBN 2-7384-6288-X).

While the position of Africans in French society remains a contemporary political issue, this echoes policy from the mid-1950s when the French sought to restrict the volume of Africans studying in France. However, while today’s petty nationalism seeks to make Africans the scapegoat for France’s economic tribulations, the author of *Les étudiants africains en France* claims that policy during the period of decolonisation was motivated by a well-intended (if paternalistic) concern for Africans and their education. Guimont attributes this policy to a need to control the explosion in numbers which had led to administrative difficulties and a surplus of graduates while employment prospects for well qualified Africans remained scarce. In addition, it was held to be undesirable that African families should waste money funding non-scholars at second-rate institutions in the pursuit of the prestige concomitant with education in France itself, while simultaneously undermining attempts to develop education in West Africa.

This is a convincing case as far as it goes, but it neglects the underlying thread of anti-communist paranoia that runs through much of the relevant documentation produced by the Ministry for Overseas France at the time. Perhaps the more pragmatic line predominates in the material unearthed by Guimont, although she does mention the alleged ‘cryptocommunist’ of the main student union (p. 120). My study of the ministry’s archives (files unfortunately not discussed by Guimont) suggests a more definitely geo-politically motivated policy, similar to that attempted by the British, which sought to isolate West African students from the dangerous political influences then current on European campuses. Such flirtation with communism is explored in Adi’s *West Africans in Britain*, which details the life and politics of West Africans studying at British universities between the turn of the century and the end of colonial rule. Colonial students are a particularly fascinating and complex group, standing as they did at the intersection of multiple cultures. On the one hand, they tended to come from the economic elite or sometimes even the African nobility; on the other, they owed much of their emerging bourgeois status to their interaction with Europeans. However, while their education had led them to adopt western cultural norms, it also drove them to take up their responsibilities as proponents of African nationalism. The reality of living as Africans in the metropolitan capitals only reinforced their awareness of the inequities of colonialism, thus simultaneously inflaming their politics and provoking British and French authorities to seek to contain student radicalism. Both Guimont and Adi discuss affairs of immediate relevance to the lives of colonial students, nested within an analysis of their broader socio-political status and significance.

Both these volumes are concisely written and synthesise primary material that has not previously received adequate scholarly attention. Adi refers largely to PRO records and student publications now held in the British Library. He has drawn extensively on his doctoral thesis in preparing this book and as a consequence it is

thoroughly documented in addition to providing a well-researched link between student politics and the wider body of work on Pan-Africanism. Guimont's sources are less extensive, but she makes good use of the newly available archives of the Office de Coopération et d'Accueil Universitaire, which is all the more impressive as the book was based on research undertaken for a *maîtrise*. Both volumes provide a valuable addition to the literatures concerning the presence of West Africans in Europe and education in West Africa. The past few years have seen a proliferation of studies in the latter field, both published and in thesis form, adding new perspectives to the canon established by Ashby, Foster, Clignet and Bouche. Readers are now able to profit from valuable new work by those who can draw on their personal experience, such as Boahen's history of Mfantsipim school and the retrospective upon African higher education by Ade Ajayi *et al.* The work of younger authors should also be considered, such as Lebeau, Nwauwa, Bianchini, Chafer, in addition to Adi and Guimont.

Guimont's volume provides a critical balance not present in the accounts by Charles Diané and Sékou Traoré that draw upon their own student years in France. While not wanting to detract from the importance of their records as primary actors, such work has to be seen in the light of its often polemical content. However, those who feel that historians should investigate all the available evidence will regret the lack of interviews by both Guimont and Adi. Many of the key actors are still alive and can speak to questions raised by the documentary evidence and challenge alleged biases and omissions in the written record. It is one thing for Adi to rely on the colonial record for his assertion that Nkrumah and Botsio were closely connected with the Communist Party and 'regarded themselves as communists' (p. 142). To get closer to the truth, one has to put the question to Botsio himself; however, constraints of space prevent me from discussing Botsio's reply here!

*St Antony's College, Oxford*

KATYA LENEY

### CHRISTIANITY AND PAN-AFRICANISM

*Orishatukeh Faduma: Liberal Theology and Evangelical Pan-Africanism, 1857–1946.* By MOSES N. MOORE. Lanham, MD and London: The American Theological Library Association and the Scarecrow Press, 1996. Pp. xiii + 289. £47.05 (ISBN 0-8108-3091-4).

Orishatukeh Faduma (1857–1946) was a lifelong exponent of liberal Christianity and pan-Africanism. He was born William J. Davis in British Guiana in the West Indies where his parents, rescued by the Royal Navy from a slave ship on the high seas, had been settled. Shortly after his birth, the family moved to Sierra Leone. His intelligence and Sierra Leone's church schools took him in 1882 to Wesley College in Taunton and then to a bachelor's degree at London University, before he returned to Sierra Leone in 1885. Here he involved himself in the cultural reform movement, adopting his African name in 1887. He moved in 1891 to the USA, studying in Yale Divinity School 1891–4, after which he was ordained for the Congregational ministry in 1895. Intending to return to Sierra Leone, he was thwarted in his efforts to gain a missionary appointment there, so he remained as a missionary to African Americans in the South, both as a pastor and educationalist, with an 'accommodationalist' approach similar to Booker T. Washington's.

He moved in 1913 to Oklahoma, not least because of the racism he encountered in North Carolina, and because in this new territory hopes were high that blacks could take more control of their own lives. When these hopes were dashed, he became involved in the Back to Africa movement of Chief Alfred Sam (a

foreshadowing of Marcus Garvey's later and better known movement), and was both its publicist and one of the 60 pioneers who returned to the Gold Coast in 1914 in the first wave of resettlement. This experiment foundered, largely through deficient organisation and British colonial obstruction, and Faduma returned to educational posts in Sierra Leone, where, along with his prolific lecturing and writing, he played a large part in the National Congress of British West Africa. This movement foundered, too, largely because of the divisive Christian ethos fostered by its elite – although decidedly not by Faduma, who had always advocated wide inclusivism. In 1923, he returned to the USA where till his death in 1946 he continued to advocate his liberal Christianity and pan-Africanism, although by this time his variants of both were being superseded by other forms.

This book is not strictly a biography – we learn surprisingly little of events of a personal nature, and hear nothing of his family, almost nothing of his wife. It is essentially a picture of Faduma's intellectual development, dutifully reconstructed from his voluminous writing – most of it superior journalism. Perhaps development is not the right word, for the overall impression is just how consistent Faduma remained throughout his life (with only a shift towards more realism in about 1923). His main theological emphases were: the incorporation of the findings of modern scientific scholarship; a greater respect for, and appreciation of, non-Christian religions and cultures; the indigenisation of Christian ritual and personnel; the disassociation of mission efforts from western racial, cultural, political and religious chauvinism; a stress on the social dimensions of mission; a call for ecumenical and cooperative effort; and the ending of paternalist relations. He was an articulate exponent of all these attitudes.

The book is a fascinating account of the contribution of one of the less well known black intellectuals, an associate of – but more than a mere disciple of – the more famous Blyden. Moore gives a picture of the wider Christian and black intellectual worlds at this time, both in West Africa and the USA. Moore's main interest is Faduma's theological ideas (the book began life as a PhD thesis at New York's Union Theological Seminary), and he shows well how this strand of theological liberalism (often ignored, with all attention given to conservative evangelicalism) exerted its influence among a small though significant group of Africans and African Americans. These ideas made a sizeable contribution in the early years of Pan-Africanism, even if this Christian component had been superseded, even repudiated, by the Fifth Pan-African Congress in 1945.

*School of Oriental and African Studies,  
University of London*

PAUL GIFFORD

## THE GERMAN COLONIAL PRESS AND NAMIBIA

*Die 'Eingeborenen' Deutsch-Südwestafrikas: Ihr Bild in deutschen Kolonialzeitschriften von 1884 bis 1918.* Bei PETER SCHEULEN. (History, Cultural Traditions and Innovations in Southern Africa, 5). Cologne: Rüdiger Köppe, 1998. Pp. 203. DM 48 (ISBN 3-89645-054-9).

*The 'Natives' of German South West Africa: Their Image in the German Colonial Press, 1884–1918* is a welcome addition to the literature about European perceptions of colonial Africa. Though limited in its scope, it provides a useful account of German views on these issues in the period before World War I.

Of all German colonies, South West Africa's African population has probably received the most intensive attention by the colonial press, because today's Namibia constituted Germany's most important settler colony, and because of the major war between the Germans and the Herero and Nama in 1904–8.

Scheulen's book contains an annotated bibliography of about 50 titles from the pre-World War I German colonial press, including a number of missionary journals. The author focuses on texts in about 30 journals published by the Colonial Office, various colonial interest groups, or individuals.

The first part of the book is mainly descriptive, summarizing perceptions of the various African groups living in the territory. Authors in the German colonial press employed ethnic stereotypes which, consisting of a mix of individual experiences and generalized views, frequently contradicted each other. Expectedly, Scheulen found numerous negative and outright racist statements. The more positive descriptions documented may be more interesting. Some authors saw the Herero, especially before the 1904–8 war, as a 'master race' (*Herrenvolk*, pp. 78–80), as opposed to the Ovambo agriculturalists described as hard-working, but displaying a subaltern mentality. In a similar vein, the Nama were sometimes described as especially intelligent, and the Basters as the 'most industrious and progressive of all Coloureds in the Protectorate' (p. 73). The experience of the 1904–8 war naturally led to increased fears about the 'black danger' (*schwarze Gefahr*), but also made some authors to acknowledge the military capabilities of Africans (pp. 80–2).

The second part of the book undertakes a 'structural evaluation' of the material. Scheulen argues that 'utilitarian' motives, viewing Africans primarily in terms of their ability to work for the colonists, was the single most widespread perspective taken, influencing the authors' views on 'native education', demography, and commercial relations. Scheulen furthermore looks at how the authors evaluated the social and cultural features of African societies, identifying a number of debates among them, for example about the degree to which the 'natives' should be regarded as 'capable of culture' (*kulturfähig*, p. 146) and legally responsible (*rechtsfähig*, pp. 147–9). Before the turn of the century authors frequently subscribed to a theory of culture as determined by environmental conditions, informed by evolutionistic models. Later on, a racism based on anthropological reasoning became widespread, sometimes culminating in a type of cultural Darwinism that forecast the extinction (*Aussterben*) of the 'yellow race' (Nama and Khoi-San, pp. 166–9).

While the articles in the colonial press at times provide important bits and pieces of factual information about African societies, Scheulen rightly concludes that 'many of the judgements made in the colonial press say more about the observers than the observed.' (p. 184). He notes some of the theoretical concepts upon which the authors' views of African societies were based, but rarely explores this dimension in greater detail. Neither does he give much attention to the policy consequences of this type of thought, except in a few cases (like the prohibition of mixed marriages between European and Africans, pp. 137–9). While viewing the Herero as 'aristocrats', the Germans did their best to exterminate them physically by means of war in 1904 – this most dramatic difference between perception and practice remains unexplored. The comparison between the mainstream colonial press and missionary journals, parts of which draw 'a considerably more differentiated picture' (p. 175) of African societies, remains cursory.

*Centre for Modern Oriental Studies, Berlin*

AXEL HARNEIT-SIEVERS

## COLONIAL NAMIBIA

*Namibia under South African Rule: Mobility and Containment, 1915–46*. Edited by PATRICIA HAYES, JEREMY SILVESTER, MARION WALLACE and WOLFRAM HARTMANN. Oxford: James Currey, 1998. Pp. xx + 330. £45 (ISBN 0-85255-748-5); £15.95, paperback (ISBN 0-85255-747-7).

This book presents a selection of twelve papers from the ‘Trees never Meet’ conference, which took place in Windhoek in 1994, and focused on a neglected period in Namibian historiography. The editors have shunned a rigid chronological approach in favour of a loosely connected discussion of various themes. The richly annotated introductory chapter, which was co-written by Jeremy Silvester, Marion Wallace and Patricia Hayes, probes the ambiguities of colonial power, which had to be continuously negotiated in the varying contexts of economic, social, political and particularly gender relations. Moreover, the authors make the important point that a transplantation of explanatory models from the South African context to Namibia is inadequate in explaining the peculiarities of Namibian history (pp. 16, 18).

Hayes argues against a merely ‘recuperative agenda’ of the early positivist phase in feminist studies and focuses instead on female agency as an integrative part of historical transformation (p. 118). Her study of the ‘famine of the dams’ shows how colonial administrators and chiefs collaborated in preventing the migration of African women out of Ovamboland (p. 125). Thus, she emphasizes the non-economic rationality behind the state-encouraged migration of Ovambo men to the south during economic recession. In her view, the state indulged in a fantasy about a gendered colonial society, rather than combating economic problems by rational means (pp. 137–8).

In a similar vein, Wallace describes how medical tests for venereal disease in Windhoek were conducted rather haphazardly among African women, as if they were ‘not a genuine response to medical necessity’ but to visceral fears of social contamination and disorder (p. 82). These anxieties intensified in the 1930s due to demographic shifts and the growing concern among Europeans about an imagined physical degeneration of the ‘imperial race’ (p. 85).

Meredith McKittrick adds ‘generation’ as another important analytical category to the gender perspective (pp. 241–62). She shows how young Ovambo women had to negotiate the social barriers that were constituted by the overlapping categories of race, class, gender and seniority.

In a particularly illuminating contribution, Robert Gordon shifts the focus from the ‘instrumentality of vagrancy legislation’ to its inherent contradictions and thus to the cultural meaning of the control of labour (p. 53). He provides a sharp analysis of what he calls the ‘Prozac factor’ in colonial law, i.e. the functionality of colonial legislation in terms of the soothing effects it promised to the settlers, and not merely in terms of the overall rationality of social engineering. Gordon argues against the Foucauldian model that there was little appreciation among colonial administrators of the scientific study of African societies. He concludes that power is not always manifest in the accumulation and control of knowledge, but also in the deliberate ignorance of rulers. Expert knowledge of African culture was perceived as an almost inbred constituent of the colonial mind, authenticated by proximity to, and day-to-day experience with, ‘the native’.

It is in the nature of an anthology that the editors have tried to establish a tone which is not always sustained by the various contributors. This is not to denigrate the achievements of individual authors – each chapter is well written and provides the reader with new insights into neglected aspects of Namibian history – but it is perhaps inevitable that some of the authors should have responded less en-

thusiastically to the editors' invitation to consider carefully the complexities of gender and the reinvention of tradition.

In their discussion of the revival of Herero society, Gesine Krüger and Dag Henrichsen focus extensively on the Herero *Truppspieler*. Anxious to discard the view that the adoption of German uniforms and militarist symbols by the Herero amounted to a mindless imitation of the colonial oppressors, the authors express their reluctance to use this term. Evidence which they present, however, seems to suggest that it was used by the participants themselves (p. 161). Rather than seeing 'troop players' as a derogatory term, it could be read as a reflection of the playful and inventive way in which the Herero tried to reconstruct their identity after the disastrous war against the Germans. There is relatively little on the gender aspects of the *otjiserandu*, apart from pointing out that women too were members of the organization. One would like to know more about how the female participants dealt with the reinvention of a specifically male identity, which must have flourished in *Truppspieler* ranks.

Ben Fuller's detailed account of the increasing tension between the Damara and Herero in the Otjimbingwe reserve in the 1940s provides interesting information about ethnic identity in a changing colonial environment. He argues that Heinrich Vedder's Eurocentric 'holy writ' on 'tribal' divisions helped to foment conflict around the drawing of boundaries between the two indigenous groups (p. 212). However, this critique of the patriarch of Namibian colonial historiography claims rather sweepingly that conflict arose because the adversaries suddenly and 'tragically' began to 'believe' in Vedder's categorization of the Damara as slaves (p. 213). A more detailed analysis would have cast more light on African motivation and initiative in this reinvention of tradition, rather than depicting the influential amateur historian as some kind of omnipotent mastermind.

In spite of the editors' admission that this book leaves important gaps, it must be deplored that Jeremy Silvester's excellent article on the reconstruction of pastoral economies in southern Namibia is the only account of that region and its Khoisan inhabitants. Conversely, the book's emphasis on Ovamboland reflects the recent scholarly rediscovery of a region that was not only remote, but also inaccessible because of a bitter war.

While a lack of space does not permit a more extensive discussion of this fascinating and lavishly produced book, it would be an omission not to mention that all contributions are based on recent and original research. It is to be hoped that the collection will inspire more work on the many grey areas that remain unexplored in Namibian history.

*University of South Africa*

TILMAN DEDERING

## WOMEN IN COLONIAL SENEGAL

*Der Reichtum der Frauen: Leben und Arbeit der weiblichen Bevölkerung in Siin/Senegal unter dem Einfluß der französischen Kolonisation.* Bei BRIGITTE REINWALD. Hamburg: LIT, 1995. Pp. 512. DM 68.60, paperback (ISBN 3-89473-778-6).

Senegal may be regarded as one of the most extensively researched regions of Africa in almost all of the humanities and social sciences. However, much of this research has concentrated on the Islamic societies of the Wolof and the Halpulaaren, while societies such as the Sereer of Siin, which have been Islamized only in recent times, have failed to attract comparable attention. Furthermore, research on African societies until recently has tended to neglect gender issues. One merit of Brigitte Reinwald's work on the life and work of Sereer women is that it

contributes to filling these two considerable gaps in research, namely, the development of Sereer society under colonial rule and the contribution of women to the development of this society.

After a detailed presentation of women's studies in African historiography, Reinwald shows how Sereer women were affected by the economic and social transformations that took place in the Fatick area during the colonial period. The author repeatedly emphasizes the fact that until the twentieth century, in economic, cultural and political terms, women had a very strong position in Sereer society. However, the establishment of colonial rule led to an increasing marginalization of women. Thus, the colonial administration simply took no notice of the fact that women played a major role in the production not only of food crops like rice and millet, but also of cash crops such as groundnuts and cotton (p. 177). Usually, only Sereer men were perceived as producers by the colonial administration and consequently were granted access to agricultural development services provided by the colonial administration. As a result of this policy, Sereer women were forced to go through their husbands in order to gain access to new technologies, credit and marketing facilities (p. 209). At the end of the colonial period, female agricultural productivity was also significantly lower than male agricultural productivity (p. 237). The dynamics of colonial rule, however, not only led to the marginalization of Sereer women as independent producers but also to their exclusion from the political process. Colonial rule thus supported the formation of a new political arena increasingly dominated by men, either French colonial administrators or local notables and chiefs. The author finally shows that the imposition of colonial rule stimulated processes of conversion to Christianity and Islam that became particularly accentuated in the 1950s. These processes of conversion again tended to reinforce existing male-dominated interpretations of social relations and, for instance, enhanced the shift from bilinear to patrilinear structures of descent and inheritance (p. 245).

Yet, women were not passive victims of these processes of change, they tried actively to develop strategies which would enable them to come to terms with these structural changes and to survive under conditions of extreme stress. Thus, women not only started to cultivate cash crops in order to improve their financial position and set up trading networks of their own, they also tried to evade 'well-meant' forms of colonial patronage. Sereer women, for instance, boycotted regulations of the colonial health service that tried to impose compulsory delivery in the new maternity hospitals. Until the early 1930s, Sereer women who refused to give birth in the colonial clinics were in fact forcibly brought there and forced to undergo courses in childcare and hygiene. They were not allowed to leave the hospital and had to be fed by relatives (p. 284). Manifestations of female resistance to colonial rule were, however, usually disregarded by the male-dominated colonial administration and, if perceived at all, were described as 'forms of female hysteria' (p. 263).

Research for this study was based on both archival material and interviews conducted with women in the Fatick area of Siin, sources which permit the author to give a well-balanced account of the everyday life of women in Siin during the colonial period and to show how they managed to develop initiatives enabling them to retain at least part of their social influence on society during the colonial period. Thus, Reinwald's study may be seen as a welcome complement to Jean-Marc Gastellu's pioneering analysis *L'égalitarisme économique des Serer du Sénégal* (Paris 1981), which concentrated on the post-colonial period.

*University of Bayreuth*

ROMAN LOIMEIER

## FORCED COTTON PRODUCTION

*Rural Society and Cotton in Colonial Zaire*. By OSUMAKA LIKAKA. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1997. Pp. xvi + 189. £38.50 (ISBN 0-299-15330-4); £15.95, paperback (ISBN 0-299-15334-7).

Osumaka Likaka's book would perhaps better be entitled *Forced Cotton Production in Colonial Zaire*, for coercion and its effect is the dominant theme of the book. Furthermore, the book's selected time frame is from 1917, when the colonial administration began requiring cotton production in designated provinces of the colony, to 1959 when legislated requirements and commercial concessions were abandoned.

Apparently cotton was not grown indigenously in precolonial Congo (though one wishes Likaka had addressed this issue directly, given the widespread evidence for small amounts of cotton produced in other parts of precolonial Africa) and hence the colonial government had to assign and supply the means and technology of production: seeds, gins, markets and plots for cultivation. The latter were assigned according to the number of 'healthy adult males' per village which, given that women did most of the farming and transporting, and chiefs and elders never did, provoked some interesting generational and gender dynamics, all well delineated and discussed by Likaka. Except in one region of the southern Belgian Congo where several companies were licensed and competed for purchasing cotton, an exception which Likaka unfortunately does not examine explicitly for comparisons, the African producer was required to market his/her cotton to the concessionaire of his/her district.

In chapters on social control and social inequality Likaka then draws a bleak picture of compulsion, beatings, taxes, fines, imprisonment, passive resistance, cheating, theft, flight, domestic conflict and bitter compliance that all too often were concomitant with colonialism. Oral interviews, court records, colonial agricultural reports, and some company documents are skillfully used to convince the reader. So persuaded and persuasive is Likaka of the leviathan nature of the colonial regime that even the act of providing African farmers with hoes is seen as a sinister plot to manipulate and control.

Likaka also depicts the unevenness and complexity of such exploitation. He readily demonstrates the benefits that accrued to chiefs at the expense of subjects, and, to a lesser extent, male heads of household at the expense of females in the system. In an effort to reveal peasant agency and not only victimization, Likaka also discusses peasant resistance. This section reaches a bit far, however, casually implying that any insurgent ideology or any act of defiance against a chief or colonial official that occurred in a cotton growing district was *ipso facto* due to compulsory cotton production. Likewise Likaka is never clear about whether producers were demanding the complete abolition of cotton production or merely seeking to improve the terms of production and 'negotiate' higher prices – a difference that should matter to social as well as economic historians.

By the 1930s even colonial officials recognized that compulsory policies were counter-productive, in part because Africans had indirectly been forced to neglect their food crops and malnutrition became widespread. The government therefore set up a marketing-board type of purchasing arrangement, with higher, fixed producer prices. However these purchase prices were still always lower than world market prices, and thus the system still relegated all risk to the producer. The world/local price differential was ostensibly designated for market, product and producer development. Here also Likaka persuasively exposes the manipulative, exploitative and coercive nature of even prizes (such as bicycles and sewing machines), cloth and salt bonuses, production premiums, propaganda and agri-



cultural fairs. Likaka is at his best when demonstrating and analyzing this data in terms of social history.

The book is less impressive when it comes to economic data and analysis. His charts are few, and only the most cursory references are made to comparative productivity between regions or buying stations which might have resulted from variations in rainfall, communications, local policy implementation, competitive labor opportunities, local market demand for foodstuffs, and/or international variations in world supply circumstances. Such data might have provided insights into producer motivation. Likaka acknowledges several times that competition for labor among varying sectors of the colonial economy, such as mining, affected the organization of cotton production, yet he never presents any wage or labor statistics to substantiate satisfactorily the rather obvious generalizations.

The book is nevertheless a healthy refutation of any idea that Belgian colonialism provided free market opportunities for African producers, or that cotton production in the Congo was the outcome of a rational response to the financial benefits of cash cropping. As such it should be of considerable interest to scholars engaged in vent-for-surplus and centre-periphery studies.

*University of Northern Iowa*

DONNA J. MAIER

### THE ECONOMICS OF REBELLION

*Mau Mau and Kenya: An Analysis of a Peasant Revolt.* By WUNYABARI O. MALOBA. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1998. Pp. xiii + 228. £28.95 (ISBN 0-253-33664-3).

*Mau Mau and Kenya* is a well written work which provides a clear and candid picture of the highly complex movements that were Mau Mau. It is divided into three parts: 'The background to the revolt', 'The military and ideological phase' and 'Rehabilitation, independence and legacy'. Professor Maloba surveys the major publications appropriate to each section, giving a thoughtful and candid analysis, asking questions and probing answers. In so doing he illuminates not only what we 'know', but also the contradictions and lacunae which abound. Although all sections deserve attention and raise questions for further research, this review concentrates on 'The background to the revolt', and particularly on the economic factors which led to the tribulation-prone birth of early nationalism and the events of 1952, and ultimately to the declaration of the Emergency.

Dr Maloba correctly identifies the strong influence of economic factors. Among these, land alienation stands out as it ultimately undermined the agrarian base of Kikuyu society, preventing land owners from giving land in use to the landless. They in turn, unable to become landed elsewhere, became dependent on an urban or rural settler wage economy. The rewards of labour fell well below those of land: most wages provided for little more than bare survival. The system was one of human waste; it ignored that many workers had little if any additional income, that they had families which needed food, clothing and medical care, and that children needed education if they were to participate in the future.

Maloba's attempts to explain Kikuyu colonial adaptations rely heavily on his analysis of their pre-colonial past. He also argues that the Kikuyu, particularly the educated and those fortunate enough to be able to afford education (as well as land for cashcrops, and eventually for sons and grandsons), should bear some of the blame for the poverty of their fellows. The view, though fashionable for a time, that the mission-educated teachers and clerks, together with chiefs and tribunal elders introduced 'land aggrandizement' and 'individualism' in Kikuyu society,

abandoning customary obligations is based on misconceptions. This romantic view of pre-colonial conditions is not borne out by available evidence.

Among the valuable data the author provides are statistics showing the dire situation of many Nairobi African workers, most likely predominantly Kikuyu some 50 years after the European invasion. While the Carpenter Report's strong criticism of labour conditions and wages provided evidence of growing government awareness that African wages were insufficient to provide for most of the work force, still less for their families, the report is also evidence of the continuing European bias which presumed that African labour had land and supportive kin groups in the reserves so that wages need not cover all the needs of the workers. That many had neither land nor kin which could support them, and that wages often condemned workers to abject poverty, was not seriously considered. When the report noted that 'approximately 72 per cent of workers' income is spent on food', it did not ask how other needs were to be met from the little which remained, nor did it show concern that the most frequently mentioned foodstuffs, though cheap, fell far short of an adequate diet, able to maintain basic health and prevent disease.

Among the statistics cited by Maloba is a comparison of wages for African males in 1947 and 1951, which suggests that the post-World War II economy was demanding more educated workers but had fewer places for illiterate ones. One can also safely surmise that the illiterate workers of 1951 were unlikely to be able to opt out of the wage economy because they had fortuitously inherited land. One wonders whether they swelled the desperate, crime-prone populations of the Nairobi locations described by Maloba, which made differentiating between Mau Mau and crime difficult if not impossible.

In his introduction, Maloba discusses the worldwide phenomenon of 'peasant-based revolutionary movements'. While it is undoubtedly true that the Kikuyu in pre-colonial times were dependent on agriculture and fairly extensive herding, he does not clarify whether he classifies them as 'peasants' because they relied on land. Using that broad definition, data make it clear that the overwhelming number of Mau Mau participants could no longer rely on land and consequently should not be called 'peasants'. Conversely, if one would like to reserve the term 'peasant' for those whose land provided sustenance and surplus which – by trade or barter – allowed the acquisition of goods to satisfy needs which the land itself could not, then many twentieth-century Kikuyu were not peasants either. Data show that Mau Mau participation correlated with lack of land and resistance to Mau Mau with land-based sufficiency. Mau Mau may have been a movement of men and women who – in the economy of their time – aspired to becoming peasants.

Maloba several times raises the important question of whether Mau Mau should be regarded as a predominantly ethnic movement or whether it can lay claim to having been a national movement. He concludes that the colonial context of Kenya as a whole would not have allowed freedom for one part of Kenya only. Mau Mau undoubtedly contributed to the British desire to divest itself of the burden of colonial rule. In that sense Mau Mau contributed to the cause of freedom, not just for the Kikuyu, but for Kenya as a whole. Only time and history can tell whether ethnic freedom can be translated into a sense of common nationhood.

In spite of some minor criticisms and questions which remain, Maloba has produced a solid, evenhanded introduction to one of the more important colonial movements.

*Claremont, California*

GREET KERSHAW

## POPULARIZING HISTORICAL MEMORY

*Guerrilla Snuff*. By MAFURANHUNZI GUMBO. Harare: Baobab Books, 1995. Pp. xiv + 210. \$15.00 (ISBN 0-908311-73-7).

*Guerrilla Snuff*, writes Mafuranhunzi Gumbo, 'is not a textbook. It has no footnotes, no source references to bolster the concept of objectivity'. For this reason, firstly, the professional historian will probably find this book not very useful. The second disappointment is that the historian who has closely studied the history of guerrilla warfare in Zimbabwe is likely to discover that there is nothing new for him/her in Gumbo's book. There is nothing new about the role of African traditional religion in the first (1896–7 risings) and second (1966–1980) *zvimurenga/umvukela*, as this subject has received considerable attention from a number of scholars, such as David Beach and Terence Ranger. David Lan's book, *Guns and Rain: Guerrilla and Spirit Mediums in Zimbabwe* (London 1985), offers probably the most authoritative account on this subject to date.

It is a widely held view, especially in Zimbabwe, that whilst there have been numerous scholarly publications on and about the armed liberation struggle, most of this invaluable knowledge remains inaccessible to the public because it was written for purely academic consumption. *Guerrilla Snuff* unlocks and unpacks this knowledge by popularising in a folkloric genre 'history and myth for the benefit of our modern world, as well as for rural men and women sitting in the shade of a *muchakata* tree, far from from the madding academic crowd' (p. xi).

Written by Inus Daneel who changed his name to Mafuranhunzi Gumbo after his adoption by the Gumbo Rufura people of Gutu in the 1960s, *Guerrilla Snuff* is a book that fictionalises *chimurenga* history with particular emphasis on the role of African traditional religion and beliefs. The author also gives prominence to other themes such as the battles that were lost and won by guerrillas, issues of discipline and forms of heroism. He also notes how oral tradition was invoked to inspire confidence and a sense of heroism in the guerrillas, an approach which makes the subject more accessible to a wider readership.

Inspired by the post-war reburial of guerrilla fighters who died during the armed struggle in Gutu district in Masvingo province, Gumbo takes the reader back in time, through a series of reflections and recollections of how the struggle was waged. Drawing on information he gathered during his travels with ex-guerrillas, spirit mediums, Mwari cultists and independent church prophets to 'the battlefields, the caves where they lay hidden, the land-mine and ambush sites, places of worship', Gumbo weaves a fascinating tale of how the guerrillas survived and what spurred them on even in the thickest of offensive assaults by their enemy. *Guerrilla Snuff* points to the central tenets upon which guerrilla warfare thrived, namely, the symbiotic relationship between guerrillas and the peasants in the rural areas. Guerrillas adopted the Maoist philosophy about guerrilla tactics: 'Out of the water a fish cannot live', which meant that 'without the support of the people guerrillas cannot survive'.

Following from this idea, guerrillas were incorporated into local social categories; through the agency of the spirit mediums those based in Gutu, for example, were considered descendants and placed under the protection of the great ancestor Mabwazhe, who was known for his legendary hunting skills and for killing big game at close range (p. 53). *Guerrilla Snuff* highlights some of the miraculous and unusual occurrences bordering on myth that took place during the war. Thus, Gumbo writes of a mythical world in which wild animals protected the guerrillas, trees talked and birds gave warnings: 'All of nature spoke to you in watime. The birds and the animals became allies. Through them the ancestors whispered caution and encouragement' (p. 85).

That guerrillas had to be placed under the 'care' of the ancestors in operational areas was not without purpose. Since they arrived among peasants as 'strangers', the contribution of the spirit mediums to guerrilla warfare, according to Lan, was that 'they made the acceptance of the guerrillas easier, quicker, more binding and more profound by allowing this new feature in the experience of the peasantry to be assimilated to established symbolic categories' (p. 165). Besides, the reliance on ancestors and spirit mediums was also conveniently used by the nationalist movement in a manner that legitimized armed resistance and violent insurrection and encouraged mutual respect between guerrillas and peasants.

*Guerrilla Snuff* ends on a note that reminds both the people of Gutu and the Zimbabwean nation as a whole that '*Chimurenga* is not yet over', as there are still many battles to be fought such as land redistribution and economic development. Notwithstanding the fact that Gumbo's main preoccupation was with reconstructing the course of the liberation war, a book published in 1995 could not have failed to extend its epilogue and give a synopsis of how, for example, some of these 'sons of the soil', whose bravery and prowess he celebrates, are now 'squatters' in a land they fought to liberate. An exploration of the theme of betrayal as a follow-up to *Guerrilla Snuff* would have been in place.

University of Minnesota–Twin Cities

MUCHAPARARA MUSEMWA

### LIFE HISTORIES AND NATIONALIST HISTORY

*TANU Women. Gender and Culture in the Making of Tanganyikan Nationalism, 1955–1965.* By SUSAN GEIGER. Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann; Oxford: James Currey; Dar es Salaam: Mkuki na Nyota, 1997. Pp. xix + 217. \$60 (ISBN 0-435-07254-4); \$23.95, paperback (ISBN 0-435-07421-0).

*TANU Women* is a much needed counterbalance to the dominant narrative of Tanzanian statehood that has depicted the forging of Tanzanian nationalism as the product of a western-educated African male elite, particularly Julius Nyerere, leader of the Tanganyika African National Union (TANU) in the 1950s and first president of independent Tanzania.<sup>1</sup> According to that metanarrative, the male elite ignited the Tanzanian masses to participate in the independence movement that forced the British to leave Tanzania relatively easily, and with little bloodshed.

As Geiger notes, the metanarrative omits the role of Tanzanian women as the broad base of TANU support, and of TANU women activists as shapers of TANU organization and ideology. A central figure in Tanzanian nationalism and this book is Bibi Titi Mohamed, the most widely recognized TANU leader aside from Nyerere himself. Using a life-history approach, this book allows TANU women activists to articulate their involvement in, aspirations for and expectations of Tanzanian independence. *TANU Women* is many things: nationalist history, life history and collective biography. This life history of Bibi Titi Mohamed is the thread that unites the book from the beginning in the early 1950s, when women activists began to enter into the nationalist struggle, to the early 1990s, when several TANU veterans voice their perspectives on the meaning of the nationalist movement for addressing women's participation and place in the post-colonial Tanzanian state.

<sup>1</sup> That this metanarrative remains strong in the literature on Tanzanian nationalism can be seen in the recent collection of essays on Nyerere's place in Tanzanian history, which accords no role to women as actors in modern Tanzania: Colin Legum and Geoffrey Mmari (eds.), *Mwalimu: The Influence of Nyerere* (London: James Currey, 1995).

The story of women's involvement in TANU is rich and complex. Beginning with a core group of women in Dar es Salaam, Geiger paints a picture of women activists of the 1950s: self-employed, Muslim, urban dwellers, often divorced, with few children, and no particular ethnic consciousness. Whereas most urban men were afraid to identify openly with TANU for fear of losing their positions in the lower rungs of the colonial state, TANU women of Dar es Salaam had no vested role in the colonial system and thus became the force for popularizing the nationalist cause. Most women activists belonged to *ngoma* dance societies, so that TANU women were literally 'constructing, embodying and performing' Tanzanian nationalism as they participated in the struggle (p. 14). *Ngoma* societies emerge in this history as the glue that made TANU political mobilization possible.

Several chapters move beyond Dar es Salaam to examine 'the hinterland' of TANU nationalism, focusing on Moshi, Kilimanjaro and Mwanza, where the social circumstances, colonial impact and political culture differed vastly from that of Dar es Salaam. In these regions women tended to be more educated, of Christian background and politically active before the emergence of TANU as a result of prior mobilization against local colonial policies. As in Dar es Salaam, many participated in *ngoma*, which they used to create networks that enabled TANU leaders to mobilize local support for independence. About 20 women activists are highlighted and their voices come through most profoundly when articulating their reasons for involvement in the nationalist cause. Embedded in the texts are tensions between these women and their husbands and fathers, their reasons for joining TANU, and their expectations of what an independent Tanzania would bring women. The implicit question of whether life for Tanzanian women has improved since independence is addressed most effectively by Lucy Lameck, a Kilimanjaro activist, who stresses the importance of having an articulate leader like Nyerere 'to whom we could entrust our country', and an independent state within which to fight for better conditions for women (p. 199).

Geiger's account does not focus simply on women's participation in the success story of Tanzanian nationalism and independence. The tensions between the independent state's sponsorship of the Umoja wa Wanawake wa Tanzania (Union of Tanzanian Women), a legacy of colonial developmentalist paradigms that viewed women as objects for improvement and the assertive, self-empowering nationalism of Bibi Titi and her cohorts are laid bare in several concluding chapters. Bibi Titi's troubled relations with the increasingly authoritarian state following independence, her fall from grace, imprisonment, and eventual 'rehabilitation' in 1984, are disturbing, but important, chapters of the story of Tanzanian nationalism.

This is an important work for Tanzanian history, but also for the methodology of oral history. Geiger's interviews were gathered over a period of ten years, when major transformations were taking place in the Tanzanian state and its leadership structure, economic circumstances and the international political context. The questions Geiger asks of her informants, such as whether their expectations of TANU from the 1950s were realized in the post-colonial state, have different meanings depending on the timing of the interview, who was present (such as neighbors, family or party functionaries), and who was asking the questions. The reader is often left wondering how these women's responses to questions from the 1980s would differ if asked in the mid-1990s.

The book's strength is that it exposes the shifting historical ground which is the context for oral history, and in so doing makes the life-history approach to writing history a 'relationship between the present and the past' (p. 6) rather than a static, immutable truth. Geiger is not just interested in a revised, corrective meta-narrative. This book is about the process and circumstances of remembering and

recording the past as much as about finding the cultural context for the shaping of Tanzanian nationalism.

Colorado State University

THADDEUS SUNSERI

## HOUSING POLICIES IN COLONIAL ALGIERS

*Urban Forms and Colonial Confrontations: Algiers under French Rule.* By ZEYNEP ÇELİK. Berkeley and London: University of California Press, 1997. Pp. 236. £29.95 (ISBN 0-5202-0457-3).

The aim of Zeynep Çelik's study is to 'look at Algiers as the site of colonial policies, based on an understanding that architecture and urban forms are key players in definitions of culture and identity' (p. 1). More precisely, she seeks to study government housing policies in Algiers as a fundamental aspect of cultural imperialism. To decide how the Algerian people should live by organizing their space, not only the general planning of cities but also their living quarters, is indeed a direct way of dominating their lives through their mental and physical environment. In this regard Algiers is an interesting case-study because it developed into a major North African city during more than a century of French colonial rule, and its status as a settler colony greatly affected town planning.

The book is organized chronologically. The first chapter deals with the old city, the site of early colonial intervention in the nineteenth century when there was no concern about preserving local architecture or urban forms. Algeria was administered by the military until 1870, and their agenda was defense; Algiers was initially planned not for Algerians but for expatriates and as a symbol of power.

The second chapter offers a general survey of town planning policy, including the first plan in 1884 by Eugène de Redon, the master plan approved in 1931 designed by Henri Prost (the famous architect and town-planner who worked in Morocco), and the *plan d'urbanisme* of 1948. As often occurred in the colonial context, more projects were proposed than actually implemented due to lack of political will and financial means.

The three last chapters form the core of the study; they explore public housing policy, a term that the author does not use but which seems appropriate. Here the author traces the influence on policy of the rural 'indigenous house' (ch. 3) as described by ethnologists, a model which was not suitable for the cities. The work of several female researchers emphasized the role of women and their specific spaces, although their findings generated a stereotyped image of local housing and implied a static view of the gendered use of space.

The discussion of general housing policy (ch. 4) is divided into several phases. After a long period of non-intervention in the nineteenth century, the first *cités indigènes*, influenced by hygienic theories, were built in the 1930s. In the 1950s, both as a response to demographic growth and in an effort to reconcile the Algerians with French power, major new projects were launched, first under Mayor Chevallier (1954–8), and later with the implementation of the Plan de Constantine (1959–62). Finally, the author provides detailed analyses of numerous other housing projects, notably by Fernand Pouillon and Roland Simounet.

Despite the amount of fascinating and useful information in this book, this reader would have welcomed further exploration of certain aspects of the topic. For example, far more plans and building projects were proposed than implemented; one would like to know much more about the process of decision-making, both in Algiers and in Paris. Little is said about the structure of local government or the participation in it of Algerians, a portion of whom had reformist ideas. The

Algerian population is largely portrayed as homogenous and is surprisingly absent from a study which focuses on housing for Algerians. The examination of how housing was used to separate Europeans from Algerians, both aesthetically and spatially (different architectural styles, different districts) is certainly an innovative perspective, but the book does not provide any general sense of the city, the spatial disposition of its population or its patterns of segregation.

Although this book fits into the recent trend of studies on colonial cities and gives some inspiring new insights, the author only refers in passing to similar studies (e.g. on Morocco). Reference to comparative material on French West Africa, Indochina or the West Indies would have shown that the idea of building policy started generally in the 1950s, and for similar reasons: to appeal to members of the middle class at a time of expected political turmoil. Even more fundamentally, the policy implemented in Algiers should have been situated more directly in a general context: the birth of urban planning in the second half of the nineteenth century in Europe, the transition from military to civil administration which saw the passing from defence imperatives to privileges for the settlers, and lack of interest for the Algerian population.

The author extends her reflections to the post-independence period to stress the continuity of policy, sometimes with the same architects. She gives a detailed overview of housing policies over three decades and provides useful examples of how colonial policies influenced the metropole.

The book is well illustrated, with 104 illustrations, pictures and maps; it is a valuable contribution to the field and will be of interest to specialists as well as to those generally interested in colonial policy.

*Université Marc Bloch, Strasbourg*

ODILE GOERG

## COLONIAL AND POSTCOLONIAL ABIDJAN

*L'énergie sociale à Abidjan: Economie politique de la ville en Afrique noire, 1930-1995.* Par MARC LE PAPE. Paris: Editions Karthala, 1997. Pp. 164. FF 100 (ISBN 2-86537-766-0).

In France, as well as in Francophone Africa, the city stands as a favorite object of study for social scientists. For readers unfamiliar with these approaches, Marc Le Pape's book, a sociological study of Abidjan, presents a number of useful epistemological orientations. Focusing primarily on the contemporary economic crisis in the capital of Côte d'Ivoire, the book is of interest for historians because it claims to shed light on the formation of urban middle classes since the colonial period, and on the elaboration of bodies of knowledge about the city and its inhabitants since the 1930s.

Le Pape undertook sociological surveys of Abidjan in 1979, 1985 and 1992, and thus has a long familiarity with the field. However, the book departs from a classical attitude in privileging individual strategies and life stories rather than collective patterns of survival and prosperity in the city. The first part of the book focuses on the colonial period, a time when Abidjan experienced consistent economic prosperity and demographic growth. Chapters 2 to 4 address discourses and policies of tentative control over wage-earners from the 1930s to the 1950s, and display a classic picture of stabilization policies. Chapter 3 uses judicial archives from Abidjan's first degree tribunal between 1923 and 1940. Through a few case studies, Le Pape examines the vulnerability of city dwellers' positions, who had to rely primarily on capitalizing a proper 'reputation' in order to build social status. Violence broke out because of the uncertain and fluctuating nature of these

positions. At moments of crisis, successful urbanites emerged as the ones who mobilized a tightly knit network of family, friends, and clients who would testify to such a reputation. Finally, Le Pape engages in deconstructing an analytical category used by colonial and postcolonial statistics, *le ménage* (household). His field research shows that the notion does not take into account the separation between men and women, and fails to understand how powerful communities were elaborated around the economic and social autonomy built by women, even married ones. Statistics also do not recover a crucial aspect of urban experience, one that consumed important amounts of social 'energy' from city residents: the unavoidable public nature of their life.

The last chapters (ch. 6 to 8) analyze the contemporary economic crisis that began in the late 1970s. In 1985, 10 per cent of Côte d'Ivoire's population lived in extreme poverty. By 1993, this figure had increased to 33 per cent. The ratio remains much smaller in Abidjan, demonstrating that the city still stands as a refuge during periods of economic hardship. Nonetheless, the capital has been hit by the crisis. Le Pape reflects on long-term trends such as the increasing number of polynuclear families, and the consistent decline of wage-earners positions. As a result, men appear as the social category most affected by the crisis. Less engaged in wage-earning positions, and more in petty trade and *artisanat*, women now manage to capture an increasing role in urban economics. The book concludes by examining the rise of new public sentiments in the mid-1990s: first, the emergence of a new concept of national identity that increasingly portrays aliens, in a xenophobic fashion, as a single category. Second, the author discusses the new rupture between rich and poor people. During times of prosperity, the success story of Côte d'Ivoire was based on a model of enrichment as a shared social myth linking higher and lower classes. Higher classes were seen as models, and their strategies of economic accumulation as possible paths for everyone's success. In the 1990s, the dominant perception among middle and lower classes is that of an irrecoverable gap between rich and the poor. Interestingly, Le Pape argues that Ivoriens remain strongly attached to social and political stability, and still believe in economic mobility. The endurance of the Ivory Coast model is suggested by the relatively bloodless and quiet war of succession following President Houphouët-Boigny's death in 1993, and by the lack of violent protests after the devaluation of the CFA franc in 1994.

Le Pape's use of life stories, and his focus on practical strategies of urban actors is much in the vein of the new sociology inaugurated by Claudine Vidal's, *Sociologie des passions* (Paris: 1991). However, his analysis lacks solidity and scope. Chapter 2 for example, on the regulation of labour in the 1930s, is only 11 pages long, and fails to place administrative policies in larger perspective. This short book, had it been more firmly developed, could have been an important one.

University of Wisconsin-Madison

FLORENCE BERNAULT

## THE FEMALE URBAN EXPERIENCE

*Courtyards, Markets, City Streets: Urban Women in Africa*. Edited by KATHLEEN SHELDON. Oxford: Westview Press, 1996. Pp. x+342. £51.50 (ISBN 0-8133-8685-3); £16.95, paperback (ISBN 0-8133-8686-1).

Towns are growing rapidly in sub-Saharan Africa, and increasing proportions of populations live in urban environments. However, according to Kathleen Sheldon, most urban studies discuss the roles of women and gender in this process simply as 'add-ons', to be noted in passing, rather than as integral to the process of urban



growth and development. Her edited collection is intended as a corrective, setting out to 'present all areas of women's lives as central to an understanding of urban Africa' and to 'take a gendered approach to the process of urbanization' (p. 4).

The book certainly contains a huge amount of data about the experiences of women in urban Africa. As a text in English, there is perhaps an inevitable bias towards Anglophone states, but there are also chapters on Senegal (Antoine and Nanitelamio), Zaire (Schoepf) and Cameroon (Beat Songue). There is an extensive (though not exhaustive) bibliography compiled by Sheldon, as well as detailed references at the end of each chapter. Sheldon's introduction is a valuable bibliographic survey, which situates the geographically-specific chapters within the broader literature from across the continent. The introduction also sets out Sheldon's organising principle of four aspects to women's involvement in urban Africa: migration, courtyards (family), markets (economy) and city streets (political activism). Above all, the introduction demonstrates the heterogeneity of women's experiences of urbanization, showing, for example, that in Ghana, urban women prefer to remain single than marry an unsatisfactory partner, while in Senegal, they want to marry at all costs. Despite its claims to the contrary, the introduction shows that there are few, if any, common patterns to women's urban experiences across the continent, beyond the broadest shared context of struggle between men and women.

There is, however, a difficulty with the book's claim to take a gendered approach to the *process* of urbanization. This claim implies that the book will demonstrate how women have shaped, or are shaping, the urban environment, and its economy, society, and geography. Questions of process must consider not only how, but why, women have affected the urban spaces, and the urban spaces have affected women.

The most successful essays deal effectively with this question of interaction between gender and urbanization. The explicit focus on the historical process of urbanization in the section on 'migration' lends itself to insights into how and why gender issues interact with urban environments. Robertson, for example, writing on Nairobi, demonstrates how it was as much the attempt to keep women *out of* town, as the presence of women *in* the towns, which shaped the social, economic and political life of the city. Moreover, the attack on women shifted from a question of control over women's sexuality to a question of control over their economic activities as the urban environment changed. A similar dialectic is seen in Coles' essay on Hausa women in Kaduna, which highlights how women have defined the imagined community of the town; these definitions are to some extent shared by men and women, and have changed over time as women have found new ways to live in, and recreate, the city.

This dialectic between town and gender is seen in few of the other essays. In the section on markets, Osirim shows how women are forming the urban economy in Harare and Bulawayo, and the chapter works well both as urban study and as gender study. Hansen's chapter on civil courts in Lusaka demonstrates how urbanization has influenced 'traditional' family forms, and shows women taking an active part in reshaping the experience of marriage for both urban men and urban women. It provides an interesting contrast with Nauright's piece on Alexandra Township outside Johannesburg, where women's agency in preserving municipal rights, and the very existence of the township as part of the city, is explained in part by the urban setting itself, which facilitated women's networking and co-operation. By contrast, Hansen shows that conflicts between women were exacerbated by the urban setting. Both essays demonstrate a sensitivity to the dialectic between gender and urban environment, while highlighting that there is no common female urban experience, even within sub-regions of the continent.

Other essays are much less successful in this respect. Antoine and Nanitelamio's chapter on polygyny in Dakar, like Hansen's essay, examines the reforming of

'traditional' family forms in the urban environment, although the urban aspect is almost incidental. Similarly, the otherwise excellent piece by Schoepf on AIDS in Kinshasa is set in town, but the urban environment is not explicitly part of the explanatory framework. Tripp's chapter on women's political activism in East Africa is extremely interesting, but urban issues do not appear in the essay at all.

It is no criticism of these less successful essays to suggest that they tell us little about the interaction between gender and urbanization. It seems a pity, though, that some of them may be overlooked as 'urban studies' when they are making valuable contributions in other fields, such as medical or political studies. Overall, the collection is undoubtedly valuable as a resource on many aspects of female urban experience. As an argument about the gendered process of urbanization, however, it too often fails to live up to its promise.

*University of the West of England*

DIANA JEATER

### PROPERTY, POLITICS AND HISTORY

*The Transformation of Property Rights in the Gold Coast: An Empirical Analysis Applying Rational Choice Theory.* By KATHRYN FIRMIN-SELLERS. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996. Pp. xii+200. £35/\$54.95 (ISBN 0-521-55593-5).

This book starts from the assumption that African poverty is partly the result of underuse of land, which in turn is the result of insecure property rights: the insecurity discouraging investment. Firmin-Sellers considers aspects of the origins and persistence of such insecurity in relation to the late colonial period in southern Ghana. Within African historiography the book's main contribution is to introduce the language of 'new institutionalist', rational-choice, political economy to the history of property rights in southern Ghana. Within (and outside) the family of rational-choice political economists, the author argues against the economic-determinist assumption that, in response to demand, the rules surrounding economic activity gradually become more efficient at promoting economic growth. Rather, she emphasises the importance and complexity of the political obstacles to such an outcome. In particular, she points to conflict of sectional interest groups; to the costs of enforcing formal rules; to information asymmetries within principal-agent relations (for example, subordinates lacking incentive to give higher authority all the relevant information they possess); and to 'path-dependence' (not defined, but in this context apparently meaning the constraints which past choices impose on future ones).

The empirical discussion centres on a comparison of the Ga and Akyem Abuakwa 'traditional states'. Firmin-Sellers argues that in both cases there was prolonged conflict between different indigenous interests each seeking to establish different systems of property in land. In the Ga case neither side achieved dominance in local politics, and as a result property rights remained insecure. In Akyem Abuakwa, in contrast, Okyenhene Ofori Atta I and J. B. Danquah achieved political control by the end of the 1930s. By restraining opportunistic behaviour by stool authorities at all levels (stopping sub-chiefs selling stool land for private gain, ending the inflation of court fees), they demonstrated a 'credible commitment' to respect property rights. This was rewarded by rising tax revenue during the 1940s, which Firmin-Sellers assumes is evidence of increased willingness to 'invest' in the state and its development budget (she dismisses in an endnote the possibility that it might have reflected stronger enforcement: perhaps as a result of the very fact that the Okyenhene had consolidated his authority). This argument is at least

consistent with the findings of a quantification of different categories of stool income and expenditure during this decade: the fact that she has attempted this tricky exercise is itself valuable. In the 1950s, she argues, the settlement in Akyem Abuakwa was dissolved by the CPP, which reinforced the insecurity of property rights nationwide. Nkrumah's party had achieved political control but used it in ways that undermined rather than guaranteed property rights. Firmin-Sellers offers a useful account, framed in terms of path-dependence, of how the stages of constitution-building which the British and the CPP's more conservative opponents went through during 1948–51 established some of the mechanisms for a dominant central government which were then taken over by Nkrumah.

The general argument is interesting and suggestive, but as yet is too slight empirically to be convincing. Firmin-Sellers has used colonial and (in Akyem Abuakwa) chieftaincy archives, but with major gaps. In particular, there is no reference to provincial or district records, whether administrative or judicial, and none to the rich unofficial collection of papers in Rhodes House. Perhaps because of this, the author seems to have lacked the access to detailed correspondence and minutes that would have helped avoid a tendency to assert rather than to document motive or ignorance on the part of colonial officials. A recurrent theme is information: Firmin-Sellers argues that the colonial government, lacking 'the most basic information about the African populations' (p. 20), and unwilling to pay the costs of gathering the information itself, relied on the chiefs: but this control of information gave the chiefs, above all Ofori Atta, the chance to manipulate colonial officials. Up to a point such a view of indirect rule is almost unexceptionable. But by the period with which the author is concerned, it is questionable whether the British were really without 'the most basic information': the adjectives are not defined, but under perhaps the most obvious definitions such data were published in Cardinal's *The Gold Coast, 1931* (n.d., but c. 1932), which is not cited. Again, while it is well established that the colonial government essentially backed Ofori Atta against his African opponents, it is not clear – and the book does not demonstrate – that this was out of any lack of information about alternatives. The author seems to overlook the fact that colonial government contacts with African subjects were far from confined to paramount chiefs, as an examination of district commissioners' diaries and correspondence would show. Again, the British had only to read the Cape Coast press to gain access to the views of Ofori Atta's critics. More generally, Kobina Sekyi was scarcely a slouch at making his positions known. If the British preferred Ofori Atta's position, their choice may have been informed; to test this, one could examine the relevant papers.

While plausibly rejecting simple economic determination of institutional change, the author is rather uncritical about the reverse relationship; she assumes that institutional phenomena have determinate economic consequences – specifically, that insecure property rights seriously inhibited productive investment. For Accra, this claim is left precisely as an assumption, no evidence being given about the level of investment (p. 52). Similarly, the discussion of Akyem Abuakwa does not confront the fact that the cocoa take-off of the 1890s–1900s had occurred within what, on the author's account, was presumably an insecure property rights regime. Even more strikingly, the second great boom in Ghanaian cocoa planting, in the mid- and late-1950s, took place precisely when – as Firmin-Sellers argues – such insecurity was being reinforced. These apparent paradoxes may be capable of resolution, but I suggest that this would require an examination of the detailed evolution of land tenure, something which does not fit into a volume whose empirical content is mainly about politics, local and national.

Firmin-Sellers's book is important for its promising conceptual framework, which is used to suggest some interesting conclusions. The empirical work shows

ingenuity but is limited by its own brevity, in pages, and probably in years. A thorough test of the potential of the framework and of the validity of the conclusions requires historical research on a scale perhaps greater than was permitted by contemporary institutional constraints.

*London School of Economics and Political Science*

GARETH AUSTIN

## ELECTIONS WITHOUT DEMOCRACY

*Multi-Party Politics in Kenya: The Kenyatta and Moi States and the Triumph of the System in the 1992 Election.* By DAVID THROUP and CHARLES HORNSBY. Oxford: James Currey, Nairobi: E.A.E.P., and Athens: Ohio University Press. Pp. x + 660. £19.95, paperback (ISBN 0-85255-804-X).

Why do multi-party elections not necessarily constitute democracy? When do ethnic differences become dangerous? How may economic liberalization threaten political stability or democratization? Such questions preoccupy scholars of African politics, a domain enlivened during the 1990s by a resurgence of multi-party politics and pressures to 'democratize'. Kenya's crucial turning point was its 1992 election, the country's first multi-party contest since the 1960s. David Throup and Charles Hornsby's volume offers an extraordinarily detailed account of that event.

The authors demonstrate a superb command of constituency politics, candidates' biographies, and the jealousies, rivalries, and day-to-day changes of political fortune that underwrite Kenya's lively factional politics. After briefly discussing the independence struggle, the Kenyatta state, and the pre-1990 Moi state, the authors devote 500 pages (five-sixths of the book) to the period from January 1990 to December 1992. Chapter themes include the Moi regime in crisis, the rise and fall of the opposition, ruling party repression, the electoral process, the campaign, party primary elections, polling day events, and election results (including a 50-page district-by-district analysis of apparent electoral malpractices, which inflated the size of the ruling party's parliamentary majority but did not affect the presidency). Detailed appendices present constituency vote totals for primary, parliamentary and presidential contests. Completed before Kenya's 1997 multi-party election (when Moi was re-elected). The book also includes a postscript on 1994-7 politics, 1997 election predictions and an appendix of 1993-7 by-election results. The authors draw largely on Kenyan newspapers and news journals, reports of election observer groups, and their own interviews with political and business elites.

A conclusion familiar to those who follow African politics is that the 1992 return of multipartyism in Kenya did not produce democracy (p. 591). Instead multi-party politics brought continued autocratic rule, state-sponsored 'ethnic' violence, widespread voter registration irregularities, electoral fraud, denial of media coverage and of public speaking opportunities to opposition politicians, abductions and harassment of opposition candidates, and financial scandals. Whatever the 1992 election outcome, the ruling party (Kenya African National Union or KANU) had no intention of relinquishing power. The news, however, is not entirely gloomy; the authors suggest that the 1992 multi-party competition forced the ruling party to 'rebuild its mass support' and brought it 'closer to the grassroots' (p. 584).

The composition of the political elite changed little, but democratization 'broadened political and social freedoms in Kenya significantly, and empowered a

lively and controversial press, although this has come under sustained attack' (p. 592). Daunting economic problems remain, and the authors suggest that the economic instability neoliberal reforms create may eventually end KANU rule by destroying the party's patron-client political system. To rebuild the economy, incentives must be offered to Kikuyu cash crop production, rewarding regions and ethnic groups that have opposed the Moi regime.

The controversial issue of ethnicity lies at the centre of Throup and Hornsby's analysis. Ethnicity, they argue, is the 'most powerful force in Kenyan politics' (p. 141); personalities and ethnic loyalties override ideology or class (p. 127) and opportunism eclipses principle (p. 220). Ethnicity is a particularly sensitive issue in Kenya, where a 1992 parliamentary inquiry into the so-called ethnic clashes concluded that the ruling party had sponsored 'ethnic' conflict in order to persuade citizens of the inevitability of such violence under multi-party rule (and to remove presumed opposition voters from key constituencies).

Ethnic concerns have prompted reconsideration of possible forms of power-sharing and decentralization or federalism (though the latter is associated with incendiary rhetorics of *majimboism* and ethnic cleansing in the early 1990s). Other reformers call for attention to malapportioned parliamentary constituency boundaries, which underrepresent some opposition strongholds and overrepresent sparsely-populated rural areas loyal to the ruling party. Throup and Hornsby do not urge any particular constitutional reforms that would address ethnic politics. Indeed, it is not always clear to what extent they believe ethnic cleavages are a reversion to a 'natural' or primordial condition, as opposed to malleable identities shaped historically by colonial and post-colonial political systems, and sometimes accentuated by repressive ruling party strategies to retain power.

This decade's momentous political changes in Africa have inspired scholars such as Michael Bratton, John Harbeson, Richard Joseph and Nicolas Van de Walle to rethink earlier theories of democratization. Curiously, Throup and Hornsby's book appears to disregard the vast scholarly literature on comparative democratization or theories of democratic transition and consolidation. Their volume is surprisingly silent as well on most of the historical and social science literature on Kenya.

This rich case study's great strength lies in its authors' impressive command of day-to-day Kenyan politics and in its sheer mass of meticulous details – though these may overpower readers who are new to the topic. Interested readers who have some knowledge of Kenya will find this account engaging and usefully encyclopedic.

*University of Denver*

ANGELIQUE HAUGERUD

## HISTORICIZING CULTURAL EXPRESSION

*Inventing Masks: Agency and History in the Art of the Central Pende.* By Z. S. STROTHER. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1998. Pp. xxvii + 348. \$49.95 (ISBN 0-226-77732-4).

Since the academic study of African art took off in the 1960s, new and often controversial ideas have succeeded one another with increasing rapidity. Fundamentally, the critical process has been dedicated to breaking down the century-old concept of Primitive Art, which defines it by contrast with Fine Art. Talk about Art is in effect part of the political struggle to define civilization, to defend or oppose relations of dominance within and between societies. Unlike Fine Art,

Primitive Art was supposedly the work of anonymous artisans, compelled by collective ancestral tradition and therefore lacking in creative genius, whose products, intended for religious purposes, could only be recognized as Art by enlightened and discriminating foreign collectors. Zoë Strother's study of the masks made and used by the Pende in the southwestern part of the Democratic Republic of Congo goes far towards the complete demolition of this condescending view. It is one of a number of excellent recent studies which take the study of 'art' out of the museum and into the field. Innovative methods enable the author to propose a precolonial history of Pende art.

Strother begins with the question of authorship: who invents masks? For the Pende, a mask is above all a dance with a theme. One invents a song, then develops a dance to go with it, and a suitable name. Then the rhythm is worked out with expert drummers. Finally, a sculptor is asked to make an appropriate face-piece for the costume, an object which later may become a museum's 'Pende mask'. Inventors are usually young men eager to make a name for themselves; elders who invented a famous mask are anxious (even after death) that it not be forgotten.

Mask themes include representations of personality types or situations that have caught the imagination. Pende believe that the sexes have distinctly different personalities reflected in their faces, and therefore in male and female masks. Sculpture is judged by how well it abstracts from the 'real' appearance of persons to express ontological truths by the treatment of eyes, forehead, chin and other features. 'It was the sculptor's task to give the audience a perfected vision in which movement and inner character were stamped on the face through his mastery of physiognomic theory' (p. 137). Strother compares Pende physiognomy with the parallels nineteenth-century European thought established between human types and animal species and concludes that both systems serve powerfully 'to naturalize social and cultural difference by making it seem innate, inalienable and inevitable' (p. 106).

The mask costume as a whole is intended to enhance, visually and acoustically, the dancer's movement. Pende pay great attention to gestures, hairstyle and bodily form, all considered indicative of degrees of panache. Distinguished performers go to great trouble and expense to acquire the right kind of foot-rattles to accent the rhythm; three different kinds of rattle are each proper to different kinds of mask. 'Any dancer or musician, blindfolded, is able to identify a mask by the sound of its foot rattles alone' (p. 46).

A great mask, like great plays in western theater, 'elicits reinvention', without which it would disappear. Strother compares masks to popular television programmes, which are shaped by, even in anticipation of, audience reaction. In the process of reinvention, masks, like folksongs, gradually take on classical qualities of perfection. In their journeys across time and space, the facepiece, costume, name and other elements may change, but the fact that the dance remains the same enables Strother to conclude that formally different face-pieces, which would normally be regarded as different masks, in fact belong to the same genre. She goes on to identify the oldest masks by their distribution in different parts of the country which have had different political histories, and finds that although many masks nowadays are primarily regarded as entertainment, the oldest were means of facilitating communication with the dead.

During the colonial period a revolutionary category of masks appeared, introduced by the first age-grades of men to experience the colonial system of forced labour. Unlike the more traditional masks, these took the form of frightening apparitions. They show that the colonial occupation was experienced as a sorcery attack that threatened to destroy every decency of life and 'witness to a real fear of annihilation' brought on by the demands of tax collectors, labour recruiters, medical officers, merchants, missionaries and agricultural monitors.

This is an original and many-sided work of unusual historical depth which manages to relate close visual critique of the art forms both to the creative process and to the values and practices of everyday life.

*University of Louisville*

WYATT MACGAFFEY

## HYPOTHESES

*The Making of Bamana Sculpture: Creativity and Gender.* By SARAH C. BRETT-SMITH. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994. Pp. xx + 352. £55 (ISBN 0-521-44484-5).

This book is primarily based on fieldwork carried out in 1983–5 in the Beledugu and Kita areas of Mali. It also draws upon earlier fieldwork about the symbolism of *bògòlan* (mud cloth) dyeing, carried out in 1976–9, mainly in the Beledugu. Earlier fieldwork resulted in a Yale doctoral dissertation (defended in 1982), as well as several articles, most of which have appeared in the journal *Res*. The book, which has a substantial anthropological as well as art historical focus, joins the burgeoning literature on Bamana craftspersons and, more generally, ‘caste people’ (*nyamakalaw*).

Brett-Smith’s major claims are that carving ritual sculpture is symbolically equivalent to sexual intercourse, and that the ritual objects are equivalent to children. Secondary claims, which in Brett-Smith’s argumentation are intended to support the previous ones, include assertions that the sculptor is dependent, for success in his work, on the inspiration and protection provided by usually female *djinn*; that many successful sculptors progressively assume a feminine gender identity; that some exceptionally powerful ritual objects are secretly carved by uncircumcised boys, and yet others by adult married women, of blacksmith status; that blacksmiths formerly had a special set of tools for carving ritual objects; and that the female sexual organs are extolled in a secret Komo song. (The Komo is an adult men’s initiation society.)

Brett-Smith’s informants are not precisely located in space or social structure. In accordance with a frequent practice in ethnographic writing, aimed at protecting informants’ identities, Brett-Smith does not provide her interviewees’ real names. Instead, she provides them with elaborate fictional names (personal names, clan names, and even, apparently, in one case, a nickname). This is potentially misleading, since clan names are closely related to social status, while other kinds of names may connote both social status and particular circumstances of a person’s life history. I would suggest using first names only, clan names only, initials, or even numbers, but not fabricated full names. Worse, the only geographical indications – ‘Kita area’ and ‘Beledugu area’ – are far too vague. Each of these areas measures several thousand square kilometres, and is therefore characterized by considerable variation in both culture and social structure. The author should have at least mentioned the *arrondissement* in which each of her informants habitually resided.

The book is marred too by frequent errors of translation. Most significantly, Brett-Smith claims that *fura ci* designates a girls’ excision ceremony, that this expression literally means ‘breaking a leaf’, and that it is an allusion to the physical operation. However, in both the Beledugu and the Kita areas, *fura* refers to boys’ circumcision as well as girls’ excision. In the Beledugu area only, *fura* also denotes the last in a series of marriage rituals, following which the wife may reside in her husband’s household on a continuous basis. *Fura*, the designation for the above ceremonies, carries a low tone, whereas *fúra*, meaning a leaf, carries a high tone; they are, thus, two totally distinct words, which cannot be confused by any

Bamana, and have no etymological connection. *Si* (not *ci*) means a ceremony taking place at night; in its verbal usages, it also means 'to pass the night' (asleep or awake, depending on context). Thus, *fura si* means a nocturnal ceremony, preceding any of the above rituals. In the Beledugu only, *si fura* refers to a ceremony held by women in the earlier part of the night to celebrate an abundant shea-nut harvest; bilingual informants invariably translate this term as 'le mariage du karité' ('the shea nut's wedding'). (*Si*, meaning a shea nut or tree, carries a rising tone, and is therefore distinct from the previous *si*, which has a low tone). Brett-Smith's misinterpretation of the expression *fura si* not only weakens her discussion of Bamana ideas about sexuality and reproduction, but calls into question the specific analogies she draws among the blacksmith's varied activities (excision [which, she believes, was often performed by men of this status]; wood carving; and the fabrication of agricultural implements). Inexplicably, *to*, the staple millet paste food, is spelled *tot* throughout the book.

Brett-Smith presents several folk etymologies that I have never encountered in the field, and that were denied, upon inquiry, by my informants. In her own interpretations of the etymologies and deeper meanings of Bamana words, Brett-Smith seems to proceed by focusing on just a few of the varied meanings of each word, and occasionally confuses unrelated words. Given the wide meaning range of certain Bamana words, and the fact that they do not map easily onto the semantic categories of English and other Western European languages, it is possible to prove almost anything using this method. Consider, for example, the case of *jigin*, a word that appears in Brett-Smith's book with the meanings of 'to descend' and 'to give birth', but that is not extensively analyzed. The word's meanings also include: to reveal (the Koran); to memorize (especially an Arabic book); and to manifest itself (said of the masks of certain initiation societies). Nevertheless, Muslim informants would surely deny that the revelation of the Koran to the Prophet Muhammad was in any way like a birth, nor does it necessarily follow (though the possibility may be worth investigating) that some persons perceive an analogy between memorization of the Koran and the initial revelation, or between the Koranic revelation and some masquerades. Quite probably, the only element of meaning common to all the above uses of *jigin* is that of a (literal or metaphorical) change of position.

A penultimate point. Brett-Smith repeatedly implies that she is continuing the research tradition inaugurated by Marcel Griaule and Germaine Dieterlen; she stresses that, like them, she privileges the statements of several exceptionally knowledgeable informants. However, it must be noted that, whatever its other shortcomings, Marcel Griaule's and Germaine Dieterlen's work on the Dogon was based on – and presents – the results of interviews with a large number of informants; clearly identifies all informants; involved long-term personal relationships with key informants; and was not based on systematic mistranslation, though it may well contain some errors (more excusable in the context of the 1930s to 1950s than in that of the 1970s to 1990s).

In conclusion, Sarah Brett-Smith has presented us with several hypotheses. However, given the weakness of her fieldwork methods, each of her findings will have to be independently corroborated before it is accepted.



## SHORTER NOTICES

*Malagasy, 'un pas de plus'. L'unification de Madagascar. Tome III: 1895-1905.* By MICHEL PROU. Paris et Montréal: L'Harmattan, 1997. Pp. 476. FF 260 (ISBN 2-7384-5074-1).

There is a long tradition of foreign visitors to Madagascar who have been inspired to write on the history of the Great Red Island. Many are people who, like Michel Prou, are not professional historians but first came to know the island in some other capacity and were then led to do further research. In this case, the fascination exercised by Madagascar has resulted in the production of a trilogy on the long nineteenth-century history of Imerina, the central region of the island which has constituted its political centre of gravity throughout the last two centuries. This third and final volume of the series deals with the French invasion of 1895, the suppression of various armed resistance movements and governorship of General Gallieni which did so much to mould the subsequent history of French colonization. Gallieni is the central figure of this volume and is seen as providing the climax to the unification of the island.

M. Prou provides us with a detailed reconstruction of the actions of the French colonial government through the reports of the officers who imposed colonial administration on every region of Madagascar. Although the book is based on extensive archival research, it includes no footnotes because, the author tells us, to include them would have doubled the length of an already long text. This is indicative of a failure to think through exactly for whom the book is intended: it is far too detailed to attract any general reader or even professional historians of anywhere except Madagascar, but at the same time lacks the scholarly apparatus or the attention to various scholarly debates which specialist *malgachisants* would expect. At the same time it is written in a narrative style which, while having the virtue of being quite readable, is hardly enough in itself to attract a general readership. The net result is a rather old-fashioned narrative which, while based on scrupulous research, pays scant attention to the inner workings of Malagasy society and passes over many aspects of social, intellectual and economic history. It provides probably the most detailed account yet produced of the bureaucratic history of the ten years of French colonization.

*Afrika-studiecentrum, Leiden*

STEPHEN ELLIS

*Transatlantic Slavery: Against Human Dignity.* Edited by ANTHONY TIBBLES. London: HMSO, 1994. Pp 168. £14.95, paperback (ISBN: 0-11-290539-9).

This book is the catalogue of the permanent exhibition on the Atlantic slave trade recently opened in the Merseyside Maritime Museum in Liverpool. It comprises, besides numerous illustrations, fifteen brief essays on aspects of the operation, impact and longer-term consequences of the slave trade in Africa, Europe and the Americas; and a concluding 'catalogue' of the exhibits (the great majority of which are actually illustrated in the book). The essays are mostly written by academics who served as guest curators in the preparation of the exhibition, and are described as being 'adaptations of briefing papers prepared for the gallery' (p. 14). They differ markedly in character, however, including both attempts at balanced synthesis and personal (in one or two cases, polemical) statements; and their sequence and scope do not seem to correspond with the organization of the exhibition itself, as reflected in the catalogue. Nevertheless, their authors include some of the leading authorities in relevant fields, and the best of them represent excellent examples of brevity without sacrificing clarity or

evading the complexity and contested nature of the issues, though some (including, oddly, some of the best) lack footnotes which might direct an interested reader to further literature. For those interested specifically in the history of Africa, the most useful will probably be Patrick Manning's treatment of 'The impact of the slave trade on the societies of West and Central Africa'. (By comparison, Mary Modupe Kolawole's 'An African view of transatlantic slavery' is more idiosyncratic than synthetic, and tangential to the central concerns of the historiography.) Standards of detailed accuracy are in general high, though one page (p. 108) contrives to combine a number of mis-statements within two brief paragraphs on the history of Dahomey, including attributing the conquest of that kingdom in 1892 to the Germans rather than the French and crediting its 'Amazon' army with repelling hitherto undocumented earlier military 'incursions from...European slave-traders'.

Both the essays and the exhibition begin with the origins of trans-Atlantic slavery in the rise of the European Atlantic empires from the fifteenth century (the easy, another excellent one, by David Richardson). This is, historically, fair enough; but from the point of view of an exhibition directed to a wider public it has the disadvantage of leaving the specificity of the trans-Atlantic slave trade, by comparison with other (both earlier and contemporary) slave trades, unclear. It is not until page 117, in a contribution by Preston King, that the reader is offered an explicit attempt to define 'slavery' in general, and American 'chattel slavery' as opposed to other (including African) forms of the institution; and the definition of 'chattel slavery' then offered (as involving the denial of 'all legal or civic rights') does not seem all that helpful. The Merseyside Maritime Museum is nevertheless to be commended for its honesty and courage in confronting such a politically sensitive and intellectually controversial subject, and for its success in involving a number of our academic colleagues in the sort of project of 'popularization' of historical knowledge which is as essential as it is generally (in the Anglophone world, at least) neglected by professional historians.

*University of Stirling*

ROBIN LAW

*La recherche en histoire et l'enseignement de l'histoire en Afrique centrale francophone : Actes du colloque international organisé par l'Université de Yaoundé, l'Université de Buéa, l'Université de Provence, l'Université de Bangui, Aix-en-Provence, 24-25 et 26 avril 1995.* Institut d'Histoire Comparée des Civilisations, Université de Provence. Aix-en-Provence: Publications de l'Université de Provence, 1997. Pp. 426. FF 280 (ISBN 2-85399-397-3).

Included in this volume are the programme, opening and closing remarks, summary of discussions and all but two of the thirty papers presented at this 1995 conference devoted to historical research and teaching in the former French colonies of central Africa. More archival document than edited publication, the reader encounters both dross and riches. There are reports on teaching and research climates in Cameroon, the Central African Republic, Mali, Congo-Brazzaville, Chad, Senegal, Gabon and the United States. Only in America are things going at all well, as universities and pedagogical institutes on the African continent uniformly share a lack of resources as well as a complex participation in the politics of developing and disseminating nationalist history.

There are papers from prominent historians of Central Africa based in the west – notably Catherine Coquery-Vidrovitch, Phyllis Martin and David Birmingham – but this volume's greatest contribution is to voice the concerns pressing upon francophone African scholars located in Libreville, Ndjamena, Bangui, Buéa and Yaoundé. With half the papers focusing on Cameroon, a number of scholars –

Thierno Bah, Martin Njeuma and Yvette Monga among others – discuss the political and institutional difficulties of establishing a nationalist history in a country where the pre-colonial heritage stretches from the decentralised societies of the equatorial forest to the Islamic states of the Sahel, where colonial rule was both British and French, and where the most important event of the late colonial period – the UPC rebellion – long remained a taboo subject for research, let alone integration into the national heritage.

The publication of these papers performs a valuable service in providing information on the trials and tribulations of francophone African historians and their institutions; that they largely reveal widespread frustration and stagnation should give historians in the west pause.

*Florida International University*

CHRISTOPHER GRAY

*Historical Dictionary of Tunisia.* By KENNETH J. PERKINS. London: The Scarecrow Press, Inc. 1997. 2nd edition. Pp. xxvii + 311. £61.30 (ISBN 0-8108-3286-0).

This volume provides a wealth of information for scholars, students, and others interested in Tunisia. Tunisia itself has a long, complex, and in some ways unique history. For example, the country has been a cross-roads of civilization since Phoenician times. More recently, although its Arab and Islamic personality predominates, it has been heavily influenced by Mediterranean cultural currents as well.

Other distinguishing characteristics include the country's experience in the nineteenth century with modernization and reform; the character of its successful struggle against French colonialism; the highly effective single-party regime that emerged after independence; programmes of radical reform in such areas as religion and women's rights, the latter contributing to Tunisia's striking success in family planning and birth control; an early transition from socialism to state capitalism and subsequently to privatization; and the rise and decline of several experiments in political liberalization.

To provide information about these and many other topics, Kenneth Perkins' valuable volume offers a detailed chronology, a list of Tunisian rulers since 800, and a thoughtful introductory essay describing the country's geography, population, economy and history. The heart of the book is the dictionary itself, which provides short, and sometimes not-so-short, accounts of hundreds of events, places and personalities, and such diverse topics as music, olives, women and the Young Tunisian Movement. Finally, the book contains a 'Selected twentieth-century bibliography', which lists hundreds of books and articles grouped according time period or topic. The latter includes domestic politics, Islam and politics, international relations, education and culture, language, the media, religion, women and more.

All who are interested in Tunisia owe Perkins a debt for his fine contribution. While it is possible to quibble here and there with a particular dictionary account or with failure to include an entry that might have been useful, overall, this volume, is an enormously valuable reference work.

*University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee*

MARK TESSLER

*Histoire de la Grande Isle Madagascar*. Par ÉTIENNE DE FLACOURT. Edition présentée et annotée par CLAUDE ALLIBERT. Paris: Éditions Karthala et INALCO, 1995. Pp. 656. No price given, paperback (ISBN 2-86537-578-1).

As Claude Allibert points out in his introduction to this re-edition of a book first published in 1658, there are still many documents on the earlier history of Madagascar waiting to be discovered, or at least to be systematically exploited by historians (p. 15). By the same token, there is a great deal to be discovered about the early history of Madagascar (and no doubt other parts of Africa) by a careful re-reading of some early travellers' accounts, especially if they are edited with attention to the minutiae of the text and original maps and illustrations, due regard for the early orthography of proper names, and so forth. Such is the case with this new edition of the history of Madagascar written by Étienne de Flacourt, the governor of a French colony at the southern tip of the island, who lived in Madagascar from 1648 to 1655 and died at sea, en route to Madagascar, in 1660.

Flacourt's text has long been well-known to scholars of Madagascar. Twice published in the seventeenth century, reprinted as part of a nine-volume anthology by Grandidier *père et fils* in 1913, it has been widely used, and sometimes plagiarised, by other writers. But these earlier editions of Flacourt have become difficult to find. It is thus most welcome to have a new edition, and even more so one presented with such meticulous scholarship as this version which contains an introductory essay of 80-odd pages, 180 pages of notes and bibliography, and no less than six indexes. The introduction alone constitutes an important essay on Madagascar's place in the maritime history of the seventeenth century. M. Allibert is to be congratulated on an achievement which must have taken years of painstaking toil.

The book which Flacourt wrote after his return to France was divided into two parts, one dealing with the history, geography, ethnography and flora and fauna of Madagascar, the second dealing with the troubled history of the settlement at Fort Dauphin which he governed on behalf of the Compagnie des Indes. The whole is a mine of information. Flacourt is a major source on the early history of royal dynasties in Madagascar, most notably the ZafiRaminia, and also of ethnographic data. His book also constitutes a major source for those interested in environmental history, and, of course, for historians of French maritime endeavour.

*Afrika-studiecentrum, Leiden*

STEPHEN ELLIS

*Slave Captain: The Career of James Irving in the Liverpool Slave Trade*. Edited, with an introduction, by SUZANNE SCHWARZ. Wrexham, Clwyd: Bridge Books, 1995. Pp. 164. £8.95, paperback (ISBN 1-872424-42-2).

*Slave Captain* relates the story of Captain James Irving, a Scot in the Liverpool slave trade, who, along with ten crew (including his cousin and namesake), was shipwrecked and enslaved in Morocco for 14 months in 1789–90. While in captivity, Irving wrote a 10,000-word journal of his experiences, a transcription of which was deposited anonymously in the Lancashire Record Office in 1977. Suzanne Schwarz reproduces this manuscript in section two, and corroborates its details through careful examination of shipping documents, the Irvings' personal correspondence and Foreign Office papers in the Public Record Office relating to British attempts to negotiate their freedom. The letters regarding Captain Irving's slave-trade career and his later African captivity are reproduced in section three.

Schwarz's introduction first places Irving's career in the context of the late eighteenth-century British slave trade. We learn that Irving worked as surgeon on five Liverpool slave voyages before attaining command of a small slaving schooner

in 1789. After surviving his ordeal in Morocco, Irving shipped out again as captain and died in 1791 on the Middle Passage. His letters to his wife report only small details of trade on the coast of Africa and in the Americas. More interesting are his views of slaving as an ‘unnatural accursed trade’ and African captives as a ‘very disagreeable cargo’ and ‘intolerably noisy’ ‘black cattle’ (pp. 66–7, 112–3).

An examination of the shipwreck and captivity follows. Schwarz recounts how Irving and crew were separated when purchased by nomadic slave-traders, probably Sunni Muslims, who weighted the costs of keeping the sailors alive against the profits to be made by ransom. (Here a more detailed map plotting the captives’ journeys would have been useful). The British consulate at Mogodore (Essaouira, Morocco) negotiated with the Emperor of Morocco on behalf of the Christian prisoners but, as Schwarz discusses effectively, efforts were hampered by political intrigues within the sultanate and British–Moroccan disputes over trade. The release of the crew occurred suddenly; Schwarz is unable to offer a full explanation of this action, though she believes that the ‘persistence of diplomatic endeavour undoubtedly played a part’ (p. 61).

This reviewer would have welcomed more analysis on the systems of slavery in Africa and on the marketing of European (Christian) slaves in the Islamic/Arabic world. Further, the weakness of the British position vis-à-vis the North African states is a topic worth exploring. A reasonably-priced and well-written book, *Slave Captain* is the account of a slave-ship captain who was ‘enslaved’ in Africa and unaware of the irony of his situation.

*Harvard University*

STEPHEN D. BEHRENDT

*Journal of a Missionary Tour to the Labaya Country (Guinea/Conakry) in 1850.* By Revd. JOHN ULRICH GRAF (Edited by BRUCE L. MOUSER). Leipzig: University of Leipzig (Papers on Africa, History and Culture Series, no. 1) 1998. Pp. v + 52. No price given (ISBN 3-932632-20-6).

John Ulrich Graf was a Swiss (or German) native who served for many years as a missionary to the ‘liberated Africans’ of the Sierra Leone colony. In 1850, he was commissioned by the Church Missionary Society to lead an expedition to the Susu-speaking region to the north of the colony. Accompanied by six members of his Gloucester congregation, Graf sought out areas where Islam was not yet so entrenched as to elide the Christian message. The expedition followed the Konkouré river inland, and Graf had hoped to continue to the Solima Yalunka kingdom. This plan was abandoned when an illness exacerbated his frustration with local protocols of travel. The expedition turned for home shortly after reaching Doubouya in Labaya country.

Bruce Mouser’s edited transcript of Graf’s journal appears here in the first of a new series of research papers, published by the University of Leipzig under the general editorship of Adam Jones. Alterations to the original (English) text are kept to a minimum, and editorial contributions amount to an introduction, a comprehensive index and numerous informative footnotes. By these means, the reader’s attention is drawn to issues of comparative historical interest. Graf’s operational methods are particularly noteworthy. In order to cut costs, Graf was determined to pay directly for food and lodging. This represented a departure from the established practice whereby a local leader would accept a gift from a traveller on the understanding that, as ‘landlord’, he would provide hospitality and safe passage to the next major town. Graf’s stubborn adherence to his own methods frequently tried the patience of his hosts – especially when he arrived, unannounced, in villages holding initiation ceremonies.

Many European and Krio travellers in the pre-colonial Upper Guinea Coast

shared Graf's belief that the 'rules of the road' operated for the sole benefit of 'landlords'. Yet Graf's lengthy justifications of his own methods (he had little to report on the evangelical front) provide uncommonly vivid insights into the practical application of contemporary African protocols of travel, and signal their importance in the commercial and political life of a region that had become deeply involved in the Atlantic trade long before the nineteenth century.

*Croydon, Surrey*

RICHARD FANTHORPE

*La répression de la traite des Noirs au XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle : L'action des croisières françaises sur les côtes occidentales de l'Afrique (1817-1850)*. Par SERGE DAGET. Paris: Éditions Karthala, 1997. Pp. 626. FF 190, paperback (ISBN 2-86537-771-7).

This posthumous publication, based on a 1989 thesis, now somewhat abbreviated, has appeared partly as a tribute to a distinguished historian of the later stages of the Atlantic slave trade, who himself spent time editing the census of French slavers assembled by Jean Mettas, another historian who also died prematurely. Daget deals courageously and doggedly with a subject delicate for a French historian. After Waterloo, the terms of peace pushed France into measures against the slave trade. From 1818, a French navel fleet operated off western Africa, ostensibly to help to suppress the trade, but in actuality, up to at least the 1830s, more to hold off British seizure of French slavers. Repression was regarded in Paris as another trick of perfidious Albion, laid on in order to damage French economic interests in Africa. Hence, support for naval action against slave ships was deliberately weak and devious. Only slowly was effective legislation enacted. 'L'égoïsme national prime et la cause des nègres dans tout cela paraît bien lointaine' (p. 10) – so the editor in his preface summarises Daget's argument. While the validity of the claim is better left to French historians to assess, the exhaustive detail supplied by Daget about the period's illegal or dubiously legal French slaving voyages contains much of direct interest to African historians.

On relevant sections of the coast, such as Sierra Leone and the Niger delta, unpublished sources in French and British archives are lavishly cited. Some voyages are described in detail; while in general, what can be quantified is counted and presented in tables. A certain amount is learned about some of the African polities of the coast, their trading elites and their reactions to intensifying European contacts. Anglo-French rivalry produced one minor benefit for students of the pre-1850 Guinea coast who are attempting to identify localities and toponyms. The early close mapping of the Guinea coast by the Hydrographic Section of the British navy, resulting in the *African Pilot* as well as a series of standard charts, was rapidly followed up and challenged by French naval hydrographers, notably Bouët-Willamez, who published his *Description nautique* in 1848. However, the immediate effect of the rivalry was to determine to some extent the pattern of subsequent colonial expansion – not merely that West Africa would be divided between Britain and France but that each would gain favoured places on the coast. Daget concludes by pointing out that humanitarian sentiments eventually overcame diplomatic and economic constraints, but did so only by the acceptance of the view that to enslave Africans was to practise the barbarity of the Africans themselves, from which they could only be positively relieved by the *mission civilisatrice* of colonial rule.

*University of Liverpool*

P. E. H. HAIR