

VOLUME 17  
NUMBER 2  
JUNE 1994

An International Journal of Current Research  
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

---

# Behavioral and Brain Sciences

---

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

**The representing brain: Neural correlates of motor intention  
and imagery** M. Jeannerod

**A theory of visual stability across saccadic eye movements**  
Bruce Bridgeman, A. H. C. Van der Heijden & Boris M. Velichkovsky

**Motion perception during self-motion: The direct versus inferential  
controversy revisited** Alexander H. Wertheim

Also, Continuing Commentary on  
"Language, tools and brain: The ontogeny and phylogeny  
of hierarchically organized sequential behavior" (Greenfield)

**NEW EDITORIAL OFFICE: See Last Page for Details**

**CAMBRIDGE**

ISSN 0140-525X

# Behavioral and Brain Sciences

## Editor

Stevan Harnad

E-mail: [harnad@clarity.princeton.edu](mailto:harnad@clarity.princeton.edu) or  
[harnad@pucc.bitnet](mailto:harnad@pucc.bitnet)  
20 Nassau St., Suite 240  
Princeton, NJ 08542

## Managing Editor

Nancy Simon

## Chief Copy Editor

Avis Kniffin

## Associate Editors

### *Behavioral Biology*

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin  
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

### *Biosocial Behavior*

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

### *Cognition and Artificial Intelligence*

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

### *Cognitive Development*

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

### *Evolutionary Biology*

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

### *Experimental Analysis of Behavior*

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

### *History and Systems*

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

### *Language and Cognition*

Philip Johnson-Laird/Princeton

### *Language and Language Disorders*

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

### *Linguistics*

Robert Freidin/Princeton

### *Neurobiology*

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

### *Neurobehavioral Genetics*

Wim E. Crusio/Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique

### *Neuropsychology*

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London  
John C. Marshall/Radcliffe Infirmary, Oxford

### *Neurophysiology*

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

### *Paleoneurology*

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

### *Perception*

Bruce Bridgeman/U. California  
Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

### *Philosophy*

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts  
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

### *Philosophy of Science*

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh  
Massimo Piatelli-Palmarini/MIT

### *Primatology*

Horst D. Steklis/Rutgers

### *Psychobiology*

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut

### *Vision and Artificial Intelligence*

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

**Editorial Policy** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary\* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

**Copying** This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (222 Rosewood Dr., Danvers, MA 01923). Orga-

nizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

**Subscriptions** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price for institutions of Volume 17 (1994) is US \$210.00 net in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £141.00 in the rest of the world; for individuals US \$85.00 net (£57.00); for BBS Associates and for students (in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico only) with proof of eligibility with order US \$49.00 net (£36.00); for APA, APS, and ASA members US \$68.00 net (£36.00) with proof of eligibility with order. Subscription price includes postage.

Single parts cost US \$54.00 net (£36.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y., and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211.

**Advertising** Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

\*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

# Contents Volume 17:2 June 1994

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>Jeannerod, M.</b> The representing brain: Neural correlates of motor intention and imagery   | 187 |
| <b>Open Peer Commentary</b>   |     |
| <b>Bajcsy, R.</b> Do object affordances represent the functionality of an object?   | 202 |
| <b>Buneo, C. A. &amp; Flanders, M.</b> On the limitations of imaging imagining  | 202 |
| <b>Chua, R. &amp; Weeks, D. J.</b> Cognitive and motor implications of mental imagery   | 203 |
| <b>Contreras-Vidal, J. L., Banquet, J. P., Brebion, J. &amp; Smith, M. J.</b> The creative brain: Symmetry breaking in motor imagery                        | 204 |
| <b>Corcus, D. M.</b> Temporal representation in the control of movement   | 206 |
| <b>Dufour, R., Fischer, M. H. &amp; Rosenbaum, D. A.</b> Moving beyond imagination  | 206 |
| <b>Elliott, D. &amp; Maraj, B. K. V.</b> Visual-spatial movement goals  | 207 |
| <b>Fuster, J. M.</b> Call it what it is: Motor memory   | 208 |
| <b>Gandevia, S. C.</b> Peripheral and central correlates of attempted voluntary movements   | 208 |
| <b>Grush, R.</b> Motor models as steps to higher cognition  | 209 |
| <b>Hallett, M., Fieldman, J., Cohen, L. G., Sadato, N. &amp; Pascual-Leone, A.</b> Involvement of primary motor cortex in motor imagery and mental practice | 210 |
| <b>Ingvar, D. H.</b> Motor memory – a memory of the future  | 210 |
| <b>Jackendoff, R. &amp; Landau, B.</b> What is coded in parietal representations?   | 211 |
| <b>Kainen, P. C.</b> Synergy versus schema  | 212 |
| <b>Klatzky, R. L.</b> On the relation between motor imagery and visual imagery  | 212 |
| <b>Milner, A. D., Carey, D. P. &amp; Harvey, M.</b> Visually guided action and the “need to know”   | 213 |
| <b>Mitchell, R. W.</b> Are motor images based on kinesthetic-visual matching?   | 214 |
| <b>Morton, A.</b> Motor simulation  | 215 |
| <b>Pailhous, J. &amp; Bonnard, M.</b> Jeannerod’s representing brain: Image or illusion?  | 215 |
| <b>Pellizzer, G. &amp; Georgopoulos, A. P.</b> Representations of movement and representations in movement  | 216 |
| <b>Prinz, W.</b> Motor images are action plans  | 218 |
| <b>Requin, J.</b> To dream is not to (intend to) do   | 218 |
| <b>Rizzolatti, G.</b> Nonconscious motor images   | 220 |
| <b>Roll, J. P., Gilhodes, J. C. &amp; Roll, R.</b> Kinaesthetic illusions as tools in understanding motor imagery   | 220 |
| <b>Sanes, J. N.</b> Neurophysiology of preparation, movement and imagery  | 221 |
| <b>Sinha, C.</b> Canonical representations and constructive praxis: Some developmental and linguistic considerations  | 223 |
| <b>Skokowski, P. G.</b> How do we satisfy our goals?  | 224 |
| <b>Strong, G. W.</b> Separability of reference frame distinctions from motor and visual images  | 224 |
| <b>Van der Heijden, A. H. C. &amp; Bridgeman, B.</b> Action and attention   | 225 |
| <b>Vogt, S.</b> Imagery needs preparation too   | 226 |
| <b>Walter, C. B. &amp; Swinnen, S. P.</b> Potential disparities between imagining and preparing motor skills  | 227 |
| <b>Whiting, H. T. A. &amp; Ingvaldsen, R. P.</b> The mystery-mastery-imagery complex  | 228 |
| <b>Author’s Response</b>  |     |
| <b>Jeannerod, M.</b> Motor representations and reality  | 229 |
| <b>Bridgeman, B., Van der Heijden, A. H. C. &amp; Velichkovsky, B. M.</b> A theory of visual stability across saccadic eye movements                        | 247 |
| <b>Open Peer Commentary</b>   |     |
| <b>Chekaluk, E.</b> Is there a role for extraretinal factors in the maintenance of stability in a structured environment?                                   | 258 |
| <b>Dassonville, P., Schlag, J. &amp; Schlag-Rey, M.</b> Just how different are perceptual and visuomotor localization abilities?                            | 258 |
| <b>Deubel, H. &amp; Schneider, W. X.</b> Perceptual stability and postsaccadic visual information: Can man bridge a gap?                                    | 259 |
| <b>Enright, J. T.</b> Voluntary oscillopsia: Watching the world go round  | 260 |
| <b>Grüsser, O.-J.</b> Early concepts on efference copy and reafference  | 262 |
| <b>Harris, L. R.</b> Keeping track of visual codes that move from cell to cell during eye movements   | 265 |
| <b>Irwin, D. E., McConkie, G. W., Carlson-Radvansky, L. A. &amp; Currie, C.</b> A localist evaluation solution for visual stability across saccades         | 265 |
| <b>Jüttner, M.</b> Visual stability and transsaccadic information processing  | 266 |
| <b>Karn, K. S., Lachter, J., Møller, P. &amp; Hayhoe, M.</b> Task dependent spatial memory across saccades  | 267 |
| <b>Mateeff, S. &amp; Hohnsbein, J.</b> Is there any essential difference between the “calibration” and “elimination” solutions?                             | 268 |
| <b>Mittelstaedt, H.</b> Theory of coordinate transformation by efference copy survives another attack   | 269 |
| <b>O’Regan, J. K.</b> The world as an outside iconic memory – no strong internal metric means no problem of visual stability                                | 270 |
| <b>Owens, D. A. &amp; Reed, E. S.</b> Seeing where we look: Fixation as extraretinal information  | 271 |
| <b>Paillard, J., Fleury, M., Teasdale, N., Bard, C. &amp; Nougier, V.</b> The perceptual stability of the visual field: What is calibration for?            | 272 |
| <b>Petrov, A. P.</b> The “calibration” solution still leaves much work to be done   | 273 |
| <b>Pouget, A. &amp; Sejnowski, T. J.</b> Is perception isomorphic with neural activity?   | 274 |
| <b>Prablanc, C.</b> Neuronal death of the cancellation theory?  | 274 |
| <b>Robinson, D. N.</b> On the locus of visual stability   | 275 |
| <b>Shebilske, W. L.</b> Calibration models and ecological efference mediation theory: Toward a synthesis of indirect and direct perception theories         | 276 |
| <b>Smeets, J. B. J. &amp; Brenner, E.</b> Stability relative to what?   | 277 |
| <b>Sokolov, E. N.</b> Vector code in space constancy  | 278 |
| <b>Stoper, A. E.</b> The translation solution plus motion suppression account for perceived stability   | 278 |
| <b>Strong, G. W.</b> There is no “point” to space   | 279 |



|  |     |   |     |
|--|-----|---|-----|
| Trehub, A. What does calibration solve?                          | 279 | <b>Authors' Response</b>  |     |
| van Donkelaar, P. & Windhorst, U. Visual stability: What is new? | 280 | Bridgeman, B., Van der Heijden, A. H. C. & Velichkovsky, B. M. How our world remains stable despite disturbing influences | 282 |
| Wertheim, A. H. Fixations or smooth eye movements?               | 281 |   |     |

## Wertheim, A. H. Motion perception during self-motion: The direct versus inferential controversy revisited 293

### Open Peer Commentary

|   |     |  |     |
|---|-----|--|-----|
| Andersen, G. J. Analysis of information for 3-D motion perception: The role of eye movements  | 311 | Rieser, J. J. Ego-centered and environment-centered perceptions of self-movement   | 328 |
| Becker, W. & Mergner, T. A theory of the perceptual stability of the visual world rather than of motion perception                                | 312 | Ross, H. E. Active and passive head and body movements   | 329 |
| Belopolsky, V. I. Frame and metrics for the reference signal  | 313 | Sauvan, X. M. What does linear vection tell us about the optokinetic pathway?  | 330 |
| Boothe, R. G. Biological perception of self-motion  | 314 | Shebilske, W. L. Ecological efference mediation theory and motion perception during self-motion  | 330 |
| Bridgeman, B. & Blouin, J. Extending reference signal theory to rapid movements   | 315 | Skavenski, A. A. The idea that space perception involves more than eye movement signals and the position of the retinal image has come up before | 331 |
| Büttner, U. & Straube, A. Ego- and object-motion perception: Where does it take place?  | 316 | Stroffregen, T. A. "Sensory" reference frames and the information for self-motion versus object motion   | 332 |
| Coombs, D. Sensor fusion in motion perception   | 317 | Stoper, A. E. Does the reference signal cancel visual field motion?  | 333 |
| da Vitoria Lobo, N. Direct perception theory needs to include computational reasoning, not extraretinal information                               | 318 | Swanston, M. Spatial motion perception requires the perception of distance   | 334 |
| Gregson, R. A. M. Ambiguities in mathematically modelling the dynamics of motion perception   | 318 | Thier, P., Erickson, R. G. & Dichgans, J. A cortical substrate for motion perception during self-motion  | 335 |
| Hadani, I. & Julesz, B. Computational aspects of motion perception during self-motion   | 319 | Tresilian, J. R. Two straw men stay silent when asked about the "direct" versus "inferential" controversy  | 335 |
| Held, R. The inferential model of motion perception during self-motion cannot apply at constant velocity  | 320 | Velichkovsky, B. M. & Van der Heijden, A. H. C. Space as reference signal? Elaborate it in depth!  | 337 |
| Honda, H. Some problems with the gain of the reference signal   | 321 | Wann, J. & Rushton, S. The illusion of self-motion in virtual reality environments   | 338 |
| Kim, N.-G. & Turvey, M. T. Optical foundations of perceived ego motion  | 322 | Yardley, L. The significance of the active pick-up of information in ecological theories of motion perception                                    | 340 |
| Mateeff, S. & Hohnsbein, J. Wertheim's "reference" signal: Successful in explaining perception of absolute motion, but how about relative motion? | 323 | <b>Author's Response</b>   |     |
| Previc, F. H. Inferring the visual reference  | 324 | Wertheim, A. H. Motion perception: Rights, wrongs and further speculations   | 340 |
| Probst, T. Why another alternative optokinetic model?   | 325 |  |     |
| Riccio, G. E. Perception of motion with respect to multiple criteria  | 326 |  |     |

### Continuing Commentary

On Greenfield, P. M. (1991) Language, tools and brain: The ontogeny and phylogeny of hierarchically organized sequential behavior. *BBS* 14:531–595. 357

|  |     |   |     |
|--|-----|---|-----|
| Andrae, J. H. & Ryan, S. W. Associative learning and task complexity           | 357 | <b>Authors' Response</b>  |     |
| Pepperberg, I. M. Language and cognition: The interesting case of subjects "P" | 359 | Piñon, D. & Greenfield, P. M. Does everybody do it? Hierarchically organized sequential activity in robots, birds and monkeys | 361 |
| Westergaard, G. C. Language, tools and neurobehavioral laterality              | 360 |   |     |

#### David S. Olton (1943–1994)

We must sadly announce the death of David S. Olton, Professor of Psychology at Johns Hopkins University and *BBS* Associate Editor for Psychobiology. Our deepest sympathies to his family and friends.