

The book contains no general conclusion, but ends with an appendix in which Baldin motivates his choice not to deal with Hobbes's *Short Tract*. One of the greatest merits of the book is that it sheds light on the evolution of Hobbes's thought on the issues under discussion and on the difficulties that Hobbes encountered in trying to account for physical phenomena such as terrestrial rotation, the tides, and the fluidity of bodies in mechanistic terms. However, Baldin's reconstruction of this evolution suffers from two shortcomings. One is that it sometimes downplays the influence of important thinkers who propelled Hobbes's thought in new directions. Baldin mentions, for example, a possible influence of Gassendi on Hobbes's notions of inertia and gravity, but is silent about the strong similarities between Gassendi's and Hobbes's reinterpretations of Galileo's theory of tides. The other defect is that Baldin handles the notion of "mechanical philosophy" as if it designated a monolithic whole, thereby neglecting the tension, to which Dijksterhuis and Westfall pointed long ago, between the ambition to explain the hidden corpuscular mechanisms behind phenomena and the attempt to describe them instead through exact mathematical laws. It is precisely this tension that, in my view, explains the discrepancies between mathematical descriptions and physical explanations that are so frequently present in Hobbes's physics.

Carla Rita Palmerino, *Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen*
doi:10.1017/rqx.2019.333

Liberté de conscience et arts de penser (XVI^e–XVIII^e siècle): Mélanges en l'honneur d'Antony McKenna. Christelle Bahier-Porte, Pierre-François Moreau, and Delphine Reguig, eds.

Les dix-huitièmes siècles 197. Paris: Honoré Champion, 2017. 850 pp. €98.

The preface of this homage to Antony McKenna underlines his career as professor at the Université Jean Monnet (France). A long bibliography includes more than two hundred publications (books, articles, direction of publications and periodicals, direction of collected works, etc.) testifying to his influence on a wide variety of subjects, such as the history of ideas in the seventeenth century, Jansenism, Pierre Bayle, Protestant literature, and erudite and philosophical libertinism. The book is divided into five parts and offers an interesting collection of fifty-one scholarly studies on the theme of liberty of conscience and ways of thinking, over three centuries, covering McKenna's own views and offering new directions.

It first examines "Methodological Approaches," particularly through the work of McKenna himself, whose research inaugurated a way of reading past philosophers through new criteria. D. Reguig shows how McKenna's thesis (1985) and the *Port-Royal Dictionary* (2005) employed new methodological tools to read the literature of

the seventeenth century. He linked together theology and intellectual literature to reexamine the principle of reason, going further than exclusively Cartesian-based interpretations to uncover the historical bases for philosophical developments in this period. Indeed, McKenna identified a classical network that contributed to the history of ideas and defined the intellectual climate of the age, showing, for example, that some Augustinians did exist and exercised influence. D. Antoine-Mahut adds that McKenna also discovered a few minor texts of the century, such as clandestine manuscripts or correspondences, contributing to interdisciplinary studies. P.-Fr. Moreau offers an interesting summary about New Science and Christianity in the seventeenth century, and M. S. Seguin addresses the real meaning of erudite libertinism.

The second part is composed of twenty papers on "Literature and Philosophy," dealing with the major philosophical questions of that time, including "Epicurean Theology" in A. Mothu's paper. L. Simonutti's essay treats tolerance and the demands of conscience that produced libertinism and atheism. Hermetism is addressed by B. Roche, and libertinism by J.-F. Lattarico and M. Rosellini (who demonstrates originality by asking the question, "Is Corneille a libertine?"). We also find articles about Pascal (B. Descotes, B. Bah Ostrowiesky), Pyrrhonism (C. Borghero), reason versus faith in Malebranche (A. Del Prete), and Spinozism (W. Van Bunge, L. Bove, C. Secretan). L. Thiroin provides an original approach to *Dom Juan*, and J. Israel gives a surprising account of "Spinozism and the Erotic." M. Clément sorts out the relationship between fiction (especially the sexual imaginary) and history.

The third part, "Around Pierre Bayle," takes the title of McKenna's last book. We can read new approaches: G. Mori discusses two mysterious, anonymous writings attributed to Bayle; H. Bost examines the relationship between the theological and political aspects of soul and right; J.-M. Gros places Bayle between *Moby Dick* and *Bartleby*, because of Bayle's fight against evil (as the myth inside *Moby Dick* and because of the parallel between Bayle and Bartleby, the hero of a tolerant way of thinking). We also find more traditional studies on books written by Bayle (J. Sgard, L. Bianchi, M. Bokobza Kahan, S. Brogi). Some research deals with Bayle's link with famous thinkers, such as Houdard de La Motte (Ch. Bahier-Porte), Descartes (M. Pécharman), or an aspect of Bayle's correspondence (Ch. Albertan). The classical intellectual network exposed by McKenna is treated in the fourth part in four precise papers on previously unpublished correspondences concerning Des Maizeaux, Joncourt, Jean Le Clerc, and Perard and Marchand. The relationship between censorship, clandestineness, and free thinking in the seventeenth century is studied in the fifth part, with analysis by ten writers on censorship and philosophical connections.

The book (complete with an *index nominum*) is a good opportunity for current scholars to sum up topics while also offering some original approaches. For example, the book offers a newly mysterious Bayle. We can also learn, in particular through

McKenna's important contribution to university research, how libertinism forms a real intellectual heritage, similar to a network, in early modern philosophy.

Alexandra W. Albertini, *Université de Corse Pascal Paoli*
doi:10.1017/rqx.2019.334

A Critical Companion to Medieval Motets. Jared C. Hartt, ed.
Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2018. xx + 400 pp. \$99.

This collection of essays concerning the medieval motet represents the most recent and exhaustive contribution to a well-represented area of study and teaching on a genre that has fascinated scholars as far back as the eighteenth century (Haines, 175). The editor Jared C. Hartt has drawn together here wide-ranging perspectives on the thirteenth- and fourteenth-century motet. The main goal of the collection is compared by Hartt to the genre itself: the book is “partly a debate genre, and partly a polyphonic motet of its own making” (13), bringing together at times contrary interpretations and analyses (a feature of the motet discussed by S. Clark in chapter 10). The volume as a whole both defends more traditional views of the motet and overturns previous scholarship that, at times, essentialized and limited the scope and definition of the genre.

As the abstract for the book notes, this is the first edited collection dealing solely with medieval motets, differentiating it from, for example, the 1997 collection edited by Dolores Pesce, *Hearing the Motet: Essays on the Motet of the Middle Ages and Renaissance* (Pesce herself contributes chapter 6 in the volume under review). There are several single-author books on the medieval motet, of course, and many of these writers appear here as contributors or via citation (the latter category includes Mark Everist, Emma Dillon, Christopher Page, and Sylvia Huot). The *Critical Companion* appears alongside several important books published in 2018 by its contributors: Catherine A. Bradley, *Polyphony in Medieval Paris: The Art of Composing with Plainchant*; Anna Zayaruznaya, *Upper-Voice Structures and Compositional Process in the Ars Nova Motet*; and an edited collection by Bradley and Karen Desmond, *The Montpellier Codex: The Final Fascicle: Contents, Contexts, Chronologies*. To say it has been a good year for scholarship on the medieval motet would be an understatement.

With seventeen chapters and an introduction, the *Critical Companion* reflects the highly varied subfield of musicology and music theory and includes scholars of diverse ranks; the gender parity is also notable. The book is organized into two parts: the first comprises “fundamental topics” (chapters 1–8) and the second case studies (chapters 9–17). Some admixture occurs, with Pesce's chapter 6 just as easily a case study as a “fundamental topic.” Hartt offers a thorough overview in his introduction, including summaries and discussions of all chapters (4–11). This alone is an invaluable service for