

will be best indicated by a summary of the work accomplished, which he gives in the introduction to his Report. It would be difficult to praise too highly the ability and diligence displayed by Dr. Norton Manning in the performance of the mission entrusted to him.

With regard to the use of restraint, Dr. Norton Manning reports that in America restraint is even more largely used than on the Continent. At the Criminal Asylum, Auburn, U.S., there is (he writes) a liberal use of handcuffs, besides other means; and in the City Asylum of Philadelphia men are also to be seen with heavy wristlets fastened to a chain passed round the waist; but these (he adds) are exceptional cases. In the State asylums and lunatic hospitals, the camisole, muff, wrist-band and bed-straps form the chief means of restraint; but in some cases chair-straps and crib-beds are used.

Dr. A. O. Kellogg on the Non-Restraint System.

In the April number of the *Journal of Mental Science* we noticed in one of these "*Occasional Notes of the Quarter*" a paper in the *American Journal of Insanity*, for January, 1869, containing Notes of a visit by Dr. Kellogg, to some of the principal Hospitals for the Insane in Great Britain, France, and Germany, with observations on the use of Mechanical Restraint in the treatment of the insane. We referred to his description* of the "refractory bath," which he found in use

* "As the 'refractory bath' is, we believe, unknown in this country, we will try in this place to give some idea of what it is. It consists of an ordinary bath tub, covered with a board in which there is a round opening, just large enough to grasp the neck of the patient securely, leaving the head to be showered, perhaps, with cold water above, while the body is in the bath below; reminding one of the stocks anciently in use in England for offenders, with this important difference, that whereas only the feet of the criminal were 'in chancery' the head of the 'refractory' insane man was in this position, thus confining him as effectually as though it was in the ancient pillory. We saw in England the head of one unfortunate in this modern one, and were told he had been treated thus during several hours a day for a week at a time. We asked the young physician who conducted us, if this part of the non-restraint system was looked upon as medical and curative, or moral and disciplinary. 'Both,' was the prompt reply. 'Do you blister,' we continued, 'in certain cases?' 'Certainly,' said he. 'And do you regard the blister as a medical or moral means?' we continued. He smiled, and said that the blister was also regarded as having a two-fold efficacy in certain cases. Now, we object to such means, as being neither medical nor moral; and question the consistency of those who seek to disparage a camisole or muff put on a violent patient, or one who persistently denudes himself, because public sentiment is opposed to it, while he takes his own patient to this 'refractory bath,' and puts his head through a hole in its cover just large enough to encircle his neck, whether he calls the operation a medical or moral means—restraint or non-restraint."—Dr. A. O. Kellogg. *Notes of a Visit, &c., &c. American Journal of Insanity.* January, 1869.

he said in one of the English County Asylums; a description which we said would be as novel to the readers of the *Journal of Mental Science* as to Dr. Kellogg's across the Atlantic, and we further ventured to remark "We are very unwilling to cast doubt upon the veracity of any gentleman. We may, however, state with some confidence that the Commissioners in Lunacy are ignorant of the whereabouts of this 'refractory bath,' and we think that Dr. Kellogg is bound to furnish them with the locality. We should also like to know the name of the 'young physician' whom he thus, as we believe, libels in the above extract."

The English County Asylum, indicated by Dr. Kellogg, was evidently that for the county of Lancashire at Prestwich. The following note has, with reference to Dr. Kellogg's article, been circulated with the annual report of that asylum:—

Since writing the foregoing Report, my attention has been drawn by the Commissioners in Lunacy to some serious misstatements, published by Dr. Kellogg in the *American Journal of Insanity*, in reference to certain practices alleged by him to be in vogue in the Prestwich Asylum.

Dr. Kellogg states that "bleeding, bathing, and, in some cases, large doses of tartarised antimony are used freely with patients who are greatly disturbed; and those who persist in soiling themselves are treated to the 'Refractory Bath,' and that, too, continued longer than is absolutely necessary for mere cleanliness."

All this I most emphatically deny.

I have been upwards of six and twenty years connected with lunatic asylums, and in that time have but *once* resorted to venesection; the exceptional case being one of puerperal convulsions, which occurred subsequently to Dr. Kellogg's visit to this asylum.

Tartarised antimony I but seldom give, and then only in small doses.

The "Refractory Bath" which Dr. Kellogg so graphically describes in another part of his article, I have neither seen here nor elsewhere. Indeed, until my attention was drawn to that gentleman's observations, I had never even heard of such an ingenious device for correcting dirty habits.

(Signed) J. HOLLAND,
Medical Superintendent.

Prestwich Asylum, 25th March, 1869.

After this temperate but decided contradiction Dr. Kellogg will, perhaps, see the necessity of retracting and apologising for a statement which, in any case, seemed sensational, and now must be branded as false.