

of Christ's body through the power of the words spoken over the bread and wine' (p. 237). Zwingli did not believe 'that the words brought Christ's body, but instead taught the spiritual communion of Christ's body and blood that occurred when the bread and wine were eaten by believers' – in faith (p. 237).

Differences between Oecolampadius and Bucer with Zwingli heightened tensions. The Strassburgers could agree with the Wittenbergers that sacraments could convey grace (*vs.* Zwingli). But these 'sacramentarians' also 'remained united on the question of whether the bread and wine could in any way contain Christ's body and blood' (p. 295).

Marburg produced fourteen articles of agreement. But the carefully crafted and balanced Article 15 on the Lord's Supper could not hide the fact that the two sides continued to disagree on 'whether "the true body and blood of Christ were bodily in the bread and wine"'. While the Article states that 'each side would "show Christian love to the other insofar as their consciences would allow", it could not be hidden that "the evangelicals could not agree regarding Christ's bodily presence"' (pp. 294–5).

The result of Marburg was not an end to the evangelicals' crisis of authority. But it did begin a movement toward 'confessions' assuming a more dominant place over the personal authority of individual reformers. For magisterial Protestant Churches, definitions of orthodoxy were to become enshrined in confessional statements, of which the Colloquy of Marburg was a precursor.

Print continued to shape and spread theological views. It helped to remove theology's isolation and embed theology in forms of communication which could disseminate its viewpoints and help shape the culture of theologians themselves. Print was indispensable to the spread of the emerging views of new theologians – such as John Calvin.

GERMANTOWN,
TENNESSEE

DONALD K. MCKIM

Fruits of migration. Heterodox Italian migrants and central European culture, 1550–1620.

Edited by Cornel Zwierlein and Vincenzo Lavenia. (Intersections, 57.) Pp. xiv + 402 incl. 13 colour and black-and-white ills. Leiden–Boston: Brill, 2018. €127. 978 90 04 34566 9; 1568 1181

JEH (70) 2019; doi:10.1017/S0022046919001702

According to a long historiographical tradition, Italian migrants played a fundamental part in the development of European culture and did so out of all proportion to their numbers. These essays are broadly in agreement, but with a different slant in that they focus on Italians and their texts in Central Europe, a relatively neglected area. The editors suggest a tripartite division for these 'fruits of migration': travel and the diffusion of texts; lives of individual migrants; and the transfer of ideas. The first section begins with Marco Cavarzere's lucid study of 'an uninterrupted chain of book exchanges between Frankfurt and Venice'. Booksellers in Venice had contacts in the empire and produced lists of books coming from the Frankfurt fair. Around 1600 they had to be very cautious, but censorship became less rigorous after the 1650s. The concluding section on elites goes to the

paradoxical heart of matter: if privileged readers wanted forbidden books in Venice they could get them from Germany – whilst continuing to support censorship in Italy. Margherita Palumbo's 'books on the run' are those of the philosopher Francesco Patrizi, 'destroyer of the perfect image' of Aristotle. The reception into (mostly) Aristotelian Germany of Patrizi's ideas was often *via* clandestine, 'subterranean', non-academic routes and occasionally through plagiarism. Helped by her elegant use of English, Palumbo demonstrates expertly the ambivalence of German reactions. Alessandra Quaranta's migrant medics 'religionis causa' were usually a generous trio, good at gifts (shades of Natalie Zemon Davis) and at sharing the products of their pharmacies; also brave, especially the medical humanist Girolamo Donzellino. One conclusion of this neat chapter deserves further study: Quaranta finds that none of her chosen exiles shows the 'indisputable link' between newly adopted religious views and scientific observation which was evident in the case of Miguel Servetus. Why did this great leap in religion not inspire new medicine?

The second, biographical, section of the book begins with Kenneth Austin's profound chapter on Immanuel Tremellius, Hebraist, one-time Jew, later 'Catholic', then 'Protestant', perhaps above all, international scholar, who taught in Heidelberg from 1562 until 1577. Austin's concluding pages pose searching questions that should be asked of all these migrants – did migration make them less 'Italian', more 'international', more likely to give up hope of *rapprochement*, especially after Trent? Did their own 'ongoing struggle' make them see northern reformers as stay-at-homes who had not needed to summon courage for exile? Perhaps a niggling envy marked the quarrels of many Italian refugees with their Protestant hosts. Like Bernardino Ochino ... Michele Camaioni probes a rarely investigated time in Ochino's long exile: his relations with city of Augsburg, 1545–7. He spoke little of the language but his writings were translated and 'used' as propaganda for the local Protestant cause (the same would happen in Edwardian England). His Augsburg texts reveal the combustible mix of his ('charming'?) spirituality, with radical anti-papalism and criticism of his hosts: 'you are divided in so many sects'. Early signs of a cuckoo in sectarian nests? Lucia Felici shows how Olympia Fulvia Morata was first trained at the heterodox Ferrarese court and guided by Celio Secondo Curione. Felici is good at revealing shades of grey. Once in exile and happily married to a German doctor, Morata recognised that Germany was a chaotic mix, Catholic and Protestant, of 'idolatry and the Word of God'. Aware of the debate about Nicodemism, she shared 'a sense of precariousness' but knew that 'the crown is not given except to those who complete'. Dirk Jacob Jansen's subject is the Mantuan nobleman Jacopo Strada, who became architect and antiquary at Emperor Maximilian II's court. Art and architecture are often neglected in discussions of Italian migration, so this well-illustrated piece is welcome. Yet the net is cast too wide, making the essay unwieldy. In an excellent conclusion, Jansen probes the knotty question of Strada's own confessional position. Inquisitors condemned him *in absentia* but 'I have never changed my religion', he wrote. Games of 'catch-me-if-you-can' were often a fruit of migration.

In the book's third section, about the transfer of ideas, Giovanni Ferroni summarises two prejudices affecting reception of the poet Marcantonio Flaminio's work. First, the 'Erasmian' one: all Italian humanists were irrevocably steeped in

paganism. Second the ‘Calvinist’ one, which saw all reformers who had stayed in Italy as Nicodemites. None the less, German evangelical humanists praised the Italian’s Latin poetry and piety and that aided the survival of his work. Ferroni comments on the poet’s ‘lack of interest in dogmatic discussions’. That was certainly Flaminio’s favourite self-presentation, but Ferroni acknowledges that he has not taken into account the anonymous (and dogmatic?) *Il beneficio di Cristo*, partly written by Flaminio. Maria Elena Severini’s chapter records the diffusion of Francesco Guicciardini’s *Ricordi* in German universities, in ‘translations of translations’, and through the work of Celio Secondo Curione and Arnold Clapmar. In a fine, more analytic, conclusion, Severini shows how reception of Guicciardini’s ideas in German lands relied on long-term developments like the growth of politics as an independent discipline, acceptance of the ‘counsellor-courtier’ and of the need for secrecy in public affairs. Lucia Bianchin reveals the steady exchange of jurisdictional theory as German jurists looked south to Italian cities and Italian migrants observed imperial free cities and their traditions. Italian ‘political prudence’ regarding ‘preservation’ rather than ‘enlargement’ of a state was often welcome amidst Central European political tensions. Scipione Gentili (brother of Alberico) emerges as an important figure in this transfer. He finished his studies in Tübingen, Wittenberg and Leiden and his work, as jurist, philologist and poet, was often cited in German literary culture. In his essay on the transfer of Machiavelli’s ideas, Cornel Zwielerin distinguishes carefully between ‘the real’ Machiavelli’s writings and distorted accounts of his views. Zwielerin suggests two main routes of reception: from the West (*via* vernacular translations and pamphlets associated with the Dutch and French religious wars); from the South (*via* Italian migrants and Latin texts made known in Central European universities and courts). Often admired as the brilliant political analyst, Machiavelli fast became a cipher for duplicitous, amoral (mostly Catholic) political thinking. Neil Tarrant’s clear and concise concluding essay examines the ‘liberal’ historiographical tradition, continued by Delio Cantimori and Luigi Firpo, which saw migrants outside Italy as important forerunners of Enlightenment. Yet Tarrant’s modifications are important: ‘Firpo, however, did not argue that Northern Europe offered (Giordano) Bruno or (Francesco) Pucci, or indeed anyone else, complete freedom of expression.’ Tarrant highlights the need to shake off present-centred interpretations, rejecting ideas that Italian migrants were liberals or tolerationists before their time.

The editors of this volume, Cornel Zwielerin and Vincenzo Lavenia, have identified a gap in research: despite the fervour and longevity of ‘Cantimorian’ interpretations, Central Europe has not been sufficiently studied. Yet in this collection cross-referencing between contributors needed much more sustained attention. My main concluding comment does not apply to all chapters, but many. ‘Too long’ was my frequent reaction: wordy, unfocused introductions and panoramas, meandering sentences, footnotes and uninterrupted quotations almost covering whole pages. All these were unnecessarily long, and so were several chapters, in some cases 40 pages (not counting illustrations). Encouraging use of an editorial red pen would have highlighted the flair of many of these essays. None the less a spirit of collaboration across many universities was apparent throughout: these editors have gathered a group of mostly young

scholars, and supported them generously, as witnessed by tributes from individual contributors.

DURHAM UNIVERSITY

M. ANNE OVERELL

Suffering and happiness in England, 1550–1850. Narratives and representations. A collection to honour Paul Slack. Edited by Michael J. Braddick and Joanna Innes. (The Past and Present Book Series.) Pp. xii + 260 incl. frontispiece, 13 figs and 2 tables. Oxford–New York: Oxford University Press, 2017. £65. 978 0 19 8744826

JEH (70) 2019; doi:10.1017/S0022046919001295

The history of emotions is flourishing as a discipline; yet whether happiness and suffering properly belong to the category of emotion has long been the topic of philosophical discussion and debate due to their greater association with the body and the senses, rather than the mind. *Suffering and happiness* contributes to this conversation through an exploration of these themes at a moment when, it has been argued, happiness moved from an aspiration to be achieved in the hereafter to a condition that could be produced on earth through the alleviation of suffering and the pursuit, if with some limitations, of everyday pleasures. After a scholarly introduction, this collection offers eleven chapters from a prestigious line-up of English social historians across three sections. Early chapters offer an overview of the concept across the early modern period and into the nineteenth century, reflecting on changing meanings in secular and religious contexts. Part II looks at how the language of happiness and suffering was deployed for social and political ends, such as in petitioning or print culture. Part III turns to more personal considerations, with chapters exploring how individuals accounted for happiness, pleasure or pain in their own writings, or in relation to belongings or practices like breastfeeding. The volume is marked by a consideration of the lives of ‘ordinary’ people and particularly the poor, providing a novel and useful contribution to a set of emotions often located as the domain of art and philosophy. If the history of emotions tends to be closely associated with cultural history and its methods, this volume is resolutely social history. It feels somewhat at odds with developments in the broader field that have sought to think about emotional language and its relationship to experience through a different set of lenses, but may well be more suitable for emotions that are not quite emotions. The essays are richly researched, offering novel insights and rewarding reading.

UNIVERSITY OF ADELAIDE

KATIE BARCLAY

Studies on the history of the Reformation in Hungary and Transylvania. By Katalin Péter (edited by Gabriella Erdélyi). (Refo500 Academic Studies, 45.) Pp. 214 incl. 10 figs and 6 tables. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2018. €80. 978 3 525 55271 1; 2198 3089

JEH (70) 2019; doi:10.1017/S0022046919001593

This very welcome volume presents aspects of Katalin Péter’s analysis of the social history of religion in Hungary and Transylvania. The editor has included the