# The parasitoid communities associated with an invasive canola pest, *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae), in Ontario and Quebec, Canada

## P.G. Mason, J.H. Miall, P. Bouchard, D.R. Gillespie, A.B. Broadbent, G.A.P. Gibson

Abstract—Surveys were conducted to determine the parasitoid communities associated with the cabbage seedpod weevil, Ceutorhynchus obstrictus (Marsham), an important invasive pest of canola in Ontario and Quebec, Canada. More than 18 species of Chalcidoidea (Hymenoptera) were associated with this pest through mass rearings from canola siliques. In southwestern Ontario, the most abundant species were a species of Chlorocytus Graham (23.6%-48.6%), Lyrcus perdubius (Girault) (0%-53%), L. maculatus (Gahan) (2.8%-14.7%), and species of *Pteromalus* Swederus (0.6%-23.1%) (Pteromalidae). In contrast, the most abundant species in Quebec were Trichomalus lucidus (Walker) (Pteromalidae) (33.3%-56.4%), unidentified Eulophidae (2.1%-39.1%), Mesopolobus gemellus Baur and Muller (Pteromalidae) (1.3%-21.4%), and Necremnus tidius (Walker) (Eulophidae) (11.5%-19.3%). In the Ottawa, Ontario, area, parasitoids were first recovered in 2008, and Trichomalus perfectus (Walker) (Pteromalidae), M. gemellus, and species of Pteromalus were most prevalent. Mesopolobus gemellus and T. perfectus are reported in North America for the first time. Although existing communities appear to provide substantial parasitism (e.g., 6.3%-26.3% in 2006), species composition varies among years and differs from that in other regions in North America. Thus, parasitism levels and parasitoid communities of the cabbage seedpod weevil should be monitored to assess whether these will increase or there is a need to introduce more host-specific species from Europe that could provide greater mortality.

**Résumé**—On a entrepris cette étude dans le but d'identifier la communauté de parasitoïdes associée au charancon de la graine du chou, Ceutorhynchus obstrictus (Marsham), important ravageur envahissant du colza en Ontario et au Québec, Canada. On a recensé plus de 18 espèces de la superfamille des Chalcidoidea (Hymenoptera) en faisant l'élevage de masse à partir de siliques du colza. Les espèces les plus abondantes dans le sud-ouest de l'Ontario étaient une espèce de Chlorocytus Graham (23.6 %-48.6 %), Lyrcus perdubius (Girault) (0 %-53 %), L. maculatus (Gahan) (2.8 %-14.7 %), et des espèces du genre Pteromalus Swederus (0.6 %-23.1 %) (Pteromalidae). Par contre, les espèces les plus abondantes au Québec étaient Trichomalus lucidus (Walker) (Pteromalidae) (33.3 %-56.4 %), une espèce de la famille des Eulophidae non identifiée (2.1)%-39.1 %), Mesopolobus gemellus Baur et Muller (Pteromalidae) (1.3 %–21.4 %) et Necremnus tidius (Walker) (Eulophidae) (11.5 %–19.3 %). Trichomalus perfectus (Walker) (Pteromalidae), M. gemellus, et une espèce de Pteromalus sont les parasitoïdes qui ont été recensés en plus grand nombre en 2008 dans la région d'Ottawa, Ontario. On rapporte pour la première fois la présence de Mesopolobus gemellus et T. perfectus en Amérique du Nord. Bien que le taux de parasitisme soit significatif (par exemple entre 6.3 %

Received 14 April 2011. Accepted 4 June 2011.

<sup>1</sup>Corresponding author (e-mail: peter.mason@agr.gc.ca). doi: 10.4039/n11-041

Can. Entomol. 143: 524–537 (2011)

**P.G. Mason,**<sup>1</sup> **J.H. Miall, P. Bouchard, G.A.P. Gibson,** Research Centre, Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, K.W. Neatby Building, 960 Carling Avenue, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada K1A 0C6

**D.R. Gillespie**, Research Centre, Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, P.O. Box 1000, Agassiz, British Columbia, Canada V0M 1A0

A.B. Broadbent, Research Centre, Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada, 1391 Sandford Street, London, Ontario, Canada N5V 4T3

et 26.3 % en 2006), la composition de la communauté de parasitoïdes diffère d'année en année et par rapport à des communautés d'autres régions de l'Amérique du Nord. En conséquence, on recommande d'effectuer un suivi des taux de parasitisme et des communautés de parasitoïdes s'attaquant au charançon de la graine du chou afin de démontrer si il est nécessaire d'introduire d'autres espèces d'Europe présentant une plus grande spécificité à l'égard de l'hôte pour augmenter les taux de mortalité.

[Traduit par la Rédaction]

## Introduction

The cabbage seedpod weevil, Ceutorhynchus obstrictus (Marsham) (Coleoptera: Curculionidae), is an invasive alien species of European origin. It has established in North America at least twice in the last century (Laffin et al. 2005) and is an important pest of canola, Brassica napus L. and B. rapa L. (Brassicaceae), in western and eastern Canada (Dosdall and Mason 2010). It is estimated to cost Canadian canola producers in excess of \$300 million in losses annually (Colautti et al. 2006). An attempt in the 1940s to introduce chalcidoid parasitoids (Hymenoptera: Chalcidoidea) for biological control of C. obstrictus in British Columbia, Canada, was unsuccessful except for the establishment of Stenomalina gracilis (Walker) (Pteromalidae) (Gibson et al. 2005, 2006b; Gillespie et al. 2006). Two additional European parasitoids, Trichomalus perfectus (Walker) and Mesopolobus morys (Walker) (Pteromalidae), are currently being reassessed for reintroduction (Kuhlmann et al. 2002; Gillespie et al. 2006). Earlier studies documented the parasitoid communities in western Canada (Dosdall et al. 2006b, 2009; Gillespie et al. 2006) and Georgia, United States of America (Gibson et al. 2006a), which, except for S. gracilis, consisted of native or putatively Holarctic species such as *Necremnus tidius* (Walker) (Eulophidae) and Trichomalus lucidus (Walker). No studies have yet documented the parasitoid communities associated with C. obstrictus in the most recently invaded regions of Quebec and Ontario, Canada (Brodeur et al. 2001; Mason et al. 2004).

The objectives of this study were to (i) determine the parasitoid complexes associated with *C. obstrictus* infesting canola in Ontario and Quebec and (ii) assess the

impact of the parasitoids on this important pest.

## Materials and methods

Surveys were conducted in 2003–2009 in canola fields in southern Ontario and southern Quebec where C. obstrictus was present (Mason et al. 2004) or could potentially occur (Fig. 1). Sites were visited when the crop was in the silique stage of development (stages 73-79 of Lancashire et al. 1991) — in early July for winter canola and in late July to early August for spring varieties. Densities of adult C. obstrictus were estimated in 2006 and 2007 with a standard sweep net when the canola was flowering (stages 61–65). Samples were taken by sweeping 100 times in a 180° arc while walking from the edge toward the centre of a field. Samples were placed in 70% ethanol and processed in the laboratory. Data were reported as number of adult weevils per sweep to allow comparison with the economic threshold of three or four weevils per sweep, used for insecticidal control (Dosdall et al. 2001; Cárcamo et al. 2005).

To determine parasitism, 50 (2003–2004) or 100-1000 (2006-2009) canola siliques were harvested from racemes on the lower half of randomly selected plants in each field. In 2003, 2004, 2008, and 2009, samples of siliques were collected at only a few locations with a history of C. obstrictus infestation. In 2006 and 2007, larger surveys were conducted to provide semiquantitative data. Because in earlier surveys, C. obstrictus was recovered from wild radish, Raphanus raphanistrum L. (Brassicaceae), in and around canola fields (Mason et al. 2004), siliques were also collected from this non-native host plant. Siliques of another non-native plant, wild mustard, Sinapis arvensis L. (Brassicaceae),



Fig. 1. Localities surveyed for *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus* and parasitoids in Ontario and Quebec, Canada, from 2003 to 2009.

were also collected because this species has been implicated as a host of C. obstrictus (Doucett 1947). In 2003 and 2004, samples of 50 siliques were placed in 1 L paper buckets, whereas in each of 2006-2009, samples of approximately 1000 siliques were placed in  $30 \text{ cm} \times 30 \text{ cm} \times 30 \text{ cm}$  cardboard emergence boxes containing moistened fine vermiculite as a pupation substrate. A 2 cm diameter hole in one side of the bucket or box allowed insects to exit into plastic containers. The emergence buckets/boxes were placed in a lighted room at 22  $\pm$  1 °C. Collection containers were inspected every 1 or 2 days until no insects had emerged from the boxes for 30 consecutive days. Emerged insects were

placed in vials containing 70% ethanol, and weevils and parasitoids were sorted and counted. In 2006, percent parasitism was estimated on the basis of numbers of weevil larvae and parasitoid pupae found in the vermiculite substrate and of emerged adult weevils and adult parasitoids. Because of the large numbers of pods collected, it was impractical to dissect each pod to determine whether weevil remains or parasitoid pupae were present. Thus, estimates of parasitism may be slightly lower than actual levels. In 2009, parasitoid data from an ongoing life-table study of C. obstrictus in southwestern Ontario (A.B. Broadbent, G.A.P. Gibson, D.R. Gillespie, and P.G. Mason, unpublished data) were included for comparison with data from the Ottawa area. Parasitoids were critical-point dried and identified by G.A.P. Gibson; weevils were identified by P. Bouchard. Voucher specimens of weevils and parasitoids are deposited in the Canadian National Collection of Insects, Arachnids and Nematodes in Ottawa, Ontario. Specimen labels include site codes.

Means and standard errors were calculated using PROC Means of the SAS statistical software (SAS Institute Inc. 2008).

#### **Results**

## Ceutorhynchus obstrictus

The surveys in 2006 and 2007 demonstrated that *C. obstrictus* was widespread in canolagrowing areas south of Québec City and in southwestern Ontario, although weevils were not present at all sites surveyed (Table 1). *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus* was found in the Ottawa area for the first time in 2007 in spring canola on the Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada Central Experimental Farm (CEF). Individuals were subsequently reared in 2008 and 2009 from siliques of spring canola at the same location, indicating that a population had established.

In 2006, numbers of adult C. obstrictus per sweep ranged from <0.1 to 15.2 in winter canola and from <0.1 to 1.2 in spring canola in southwestern Ontario, and from 0.1 to 10.2 in spring canola in Quebec (Table 2). The numbers of weevil larvae per 100 siliques were also highly variable, but high numbers of adults collected at flowering were not indicative of high numbers of larvae in siliques. Mean numbers of C. obstrictus per 100 B. napus siliques were higher in winter canola (6.8 + 3.0) than in spring canola (1.0 + 0.1)in southwestern Ontario. In Quebec, mean numbers of C. obstrictus per 100 B. napus siliques in spring canola were similar to those in spring canola in southwestern Ontario crops but lower than in volunteer B. napus (26.7), though only two locations were sampled. Other species of Ceutorhynchinae were collected as adults on flowers during the project, but only *C. obstrictus* emerged from the siliques of *B. napus*.

# Parasitoids associated with C. obstrictus in B. napus

In 2003 and 2004, very few parasitoids were reared from siliques of B. napus. A total of three specimens of Lyrcus perdubius (Girault) (Hymenoptera: Pteromalidae) were reared from siliques in southwestern Ontario. In southern Quebec, one specimen each of Euderus glaucus Yoshimoto (Hymenoptera: Eulophidae) and an unidentified species of Trichomalus Thomson (Hymenoptera: Pteromalidae) were reared. In 2006-2009, at least 18 parasitoid species from five families of Chalcidoidea were reared, including at least 17 species from southwestern Ontario (Table 3) and 13 species from Quebec (Table 4). Parasitoids were not present at all sites, and some sites yielded parasitoids but no C. obstrictus (Table 1). Furthermore, not all parasitoid species were present at all sites surveyed, and because of the mass rearing method it is possible that some of the species recovered in low numbers (e.g., a single specimen of Chlorocytus "sp. 2" in Ontario) were actually associated with other host species contaminating the siliques. Some specimens of other chalcidoid genera and families as well as the superfamilies Ceraphronoidea, Cynipoidea, Ichneumonoidea, and Platygastroidea were reared but are not included in Tables 3 and 4 because known host relationships indicate that they were associated with such contaminants as the diamondback moth, Plutella xylostella L., (Lepidoptera: Plutellidae), aphids (Hemiptera: Aphididae), plant bugs (Hemiptera: Miridae), and miscellaneous plant-mining Diptera, which also emerged from our samples.

Two parasitoid species, *Mesopolobus gemellus* Baur and Muller and *T. perfectus*, previously reared in Europe from *Ceutorhynchus typhae* (Herbst) (Baur *et al.* 2007; Muller *et al.* 2011) and *C. obstrictus* (Haye *et al.* 2010), respectively, were reared from siliques of canola and are reported for the first time in North America. Prior to 2009, *T. perfectus* had not been reared from siliques of canola

Table 1. Numbers of localities in Ontario and Quebec, Canada, surveyed in 2003 and 2004 and 2006–2009	9
where Ceutorhynchus obstrictus was present at flowering and parasitoids of C. obstrictus were present in	
siliques of Brassica napus.	

	Ontario					Quebec						
	2003	2004	2006	2007	2008	2009	2003	2004	2006	2007	2008	2009
Number of localities surveyed	53	39	29	26	2	1	12	16	20	11	2	1
No. of localities with <i>C. obstrictus</i> present	45	25	27	20	2	1	10	13	12	6	2	1
No. of localities with parasitoids present	1	1	19	20	2	1	0	2	15	8	2	1
No. of localities with <i>C. obstrictus</i> and parasitoids present	1	1	18	16	2	1		2	7	5	2	1

Table 2. Incidence and parasitism of *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus* (CSW) during winter and spring and in volunteer *Brassica napus* plantings in Ontario and Quebec, Canada, in 2006.

Location	<i>Brassica napus</i> plant type	CSW/ sweep*	Pod- collection date	No. of CSW/ 100 siliques	Percent parasitism <sup>†</sup>	No. of parasitoid species
Ontario						
42°32.052′N,	Winter	‡	22 June	4.7	8.6 (8)	2
42°32.053′N,	Winter	_	22 June	0.5	33.3 ( 3)	2
43°38.835′N,	Winter	15.18	21 June	4.6	0	_
42°37.052′N,	Winter	_	22 June	10.2	7.4 (15)	4
42°37.391′N,	Winter		22 June	2.3	8.7 (4)	1
42°45.013′N, 82°17.002′W	Winter	—	22 June	13.4	0.4 (1)	1
42°51.594′N, 82°14.902′W	Winter	—	22 June	0.2	0	—
44°00.705′N, 77°23.664′W	Winter	0.02	13 July <sup>§</sup>	0.5	100.0 ( 9)	3
44°29.619′N, 80°41.016′W	Winter	—	21 June	30.8	7.4 (49)	5
44°30.852′N, 80°36 799′W	Winter	0.01	21 June	0.5	30.0 (3)	2
Average $(\pm SE)$				$6.8(\pm 3.0)$		
43°54.038′N, 78°38 900′W	Spring	—	14 July	1.3	0	_
43°57.122′N, 78°47 777′W	Spring	0.62	14 July	0.8	12.5 ( 2)	1
43°58.111′N, 78°53.664′W	Spring	—	26 July	0.8	12.5 ( 2)	2
43°58.465′N, 78°50.265′W	Spring	0.25	14 July	1.2	0	—
Average $(\pm SE)$				$1.0(\pm 0.1)$		

Table 2 (concluded).

Location	Brassica napus plant type	CSW/ sweep*	Pod- collection date	No. of CSW/ 100 siliques	Percent parasitism <sup>†</sup>	No. of parasitoid species
Quebec						
46°32.520′N, 72°13.694′W	Volunteer	0.82	1 August	45.6	16.1 (55)	4
46°40.957′N, 71°40.112′W	Volunteer	3.28	1 August	7.8	36.4 (28)	2
Average				26.7		
46°33.768′N, 70°50.010′W	Spring	10.22	2 August	6.8	19.1 (13)	1
46°35.577′N, 70°50 976′W	Spring	3.05	2 August	1.4	21.4 (3)	1
46°36.645′N, 70°59.252′W	Spring	_	2 August	3.4	29.4 (10)	1
46°37.336′N, 70°59.606′W	Spring	1.53	2 August	0.7	28.6 (2)	1
Average $(\pm SE)$				3.1 (±1.4)		

\*Sweep samples were taken during flowering, approximately 4 weeks before pod collections.

<sup>†</sup>Numbers in parentheses show the sample size.

<sup>‡</sup>Samples were not taken, owing to rain.

<sup>§</sup>Pod samples were taken very late (therefore parasitoid numbers were normal but weevil numbers decreased).

**Table 3.** Species composition (%) of Chalcidoidea parasitoids reared from collections of approximately 1000 siliques of *Brassica napus* in 2006–2009 in southern Ontario, Canada, and putatively associated with *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus*.

			2008		20	09
Parasitoid species	2006	2007	Southwestern Ontario*	Ottawa*	London <sup>†</sup>	Ottawa*
Chalcididae Conura albifrons (Walsh)	_		_			_
Eulophidae Euderus albitarsis (Zetterstedt) Euderus glaucus Yoshimoto Euderus sp. Necremnus tidius (Walker) Unidentified taxa	0.6 	 0.4 2.7 8.8	 7.0 12.7	69.4 		
Eupelmidae Eupelmus vesicularis (Retzius)	0.6	0.2	_		_	_
Eurytomidae Eurytoma sp. (probably E. tylodermatis Ashmead)	_	0.6	1.4	_	_	_
Pteromalidae Chlorocytus sp. Chlorocytus sp. 2 Lyrcus incertus (Ashmead) Lyrcus maculatus (Gaban)	48.6   14.7	23.6 	29.6 — — 4 2		63.5 1.0 	

			2008	2009		
Parasitoid species	2006	2007	Southwestern Ontario*	Ottawa*	London <sup>†</sup>	Ottawa*
Lyrcus perdubius (Girault)	13.0	53.0			1.0	
Mesopolobus gemellus Baur and Muller	1.1	0.4		25.0	1.9	
Mesopolobus moryoides Gibson	3.4	0.8	9.9		2.9	
Neocatolaccus tylodermae (Ashmead)	0.6					
Pteromalus spp.	4.1	0.6	33.8	2.8	10.6	56.3
Trichomalus lucidus (Walker)	8.5	3.6	1.4		6.7	
Trichomalus perfectus (Walker)						46.7
Number of specimens	177	525	71	36	104	16

#### Table 3 (concluded).

\*Pod collections are from a single location.

<sup>†</sup>Pod collections were made weekly from two locations in the London area.

**Table 4.** Species composition (%) of Chalcidoidea parasitoids reared from collections of approximately 1000 siliques of *Brassica napus* in 2006–2009 in southern Quebec, Canada, and putatively associated with *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus*.

Parasitoid species	2006	2007	2008	2009
Chalcididae				
Conura albifrons (Walsh)	—	1.3	—	
Eulophidae				
Euderus albitarsis (Zetterstedt)	1.4			
Euderus glaucus Yoshimoto		0.6		
Euderus sp.				
Necremnus tidius (Walker)	19.3	11.5	13.0	
Unidentified taxa	2.1	23.7	39.1	
Eupelmidae				
Eupelmus vesicularis (Retzius)				
Eurytomidae				
Eurytoma sp. (probably E. tylodermatis Ashmead)		0.6		
Pteromalidae				
Chlorocytus sp.	0.7	0.6	8.7	
Chlorocytus sp. 2				
Lyrcus incertus (Ashmead)				
Lyrcus maculatus (Gahan)				
Lyrcus perdubius (Girault)		1.3		
Mesopolobus gemellus Baur and Muller	21.4	1.3	8.7	
Mesopolobus moryoides Gibson		0.6	4.3	50.0
Neocatolaccus tylodermae (Ashmead)				
Pteromalus spp.	0.7	1.9	17.4	10.0
Trichomalus lucidus (Walker)	54.5	56.4	33.3	
Trichomalus perfectus (Walker)		—	—	40.0
Number of specimens	145	156	23	10

or wild radish in Canada or elsewhere in North America, even though this name was erroneously used in the literature prior to Gibson *et al.* (2005).

The parasitoid complex associated with *C. obstrictus* differed between Ontario and Quebec. In southwestern Ontario, the most abundant species were a species of *Chlorocytus* 

© 2011 Entomological Society of Canada

			Quebec					
	Wi	nter	Spring		Volun	teer	Spring	
	2006 ( <i>n</i> = 13)	2007 ( <i>n</i> = 14)	2006 ( <i>n</i> = 1)	2007 ( <i>n</i> = 11)	2006 ( <i>n</i> = 3)	2007 ( <i>n</i> = 1)	2006 ( <i>n</i> = 11)	2007 ( <i>n</i> = 6)
Chlorocytus sp.	6.7 (2.4)	8.0 (3.1)	1	1.1 (0.6)	0.3 (0.3)	1	0	0
Lyrcus incertus (Ashmead)	0	0.7 (0.4)	0	0	0	0	0	0
Lyrcus maculatus (Gahan)	1.62 (0.2)	1.3 (0.7)	4	0.1 (0.1)	0	0	0	0
<i>Lyrcus perdubius</i> (Girault)	1.54 (0.7)	19.7 (11.0)	1	0	0	2	0	0
Necremnus tidius (Walker)	0.62 (0.2)	0.9 (0.3)	1	0.1 (0.1)	8.7 (7.7)	10	0.1 (0.1)	1.3 (1.0)
Mesopolobus gemellus Baur and Muller	0.15 (0.2)	0	0	0	10.3 (7.5)	1	0	0.2 (0.2)
Mesopolobus moryoides Gibson	0	0	1	0.3 (0.1)	0	0	0	0.2 (0.2)
Pteromalus spp.	0.85 (0.4)	0.1 (0.1)	2	0.1 (0.1)	0.3 (0.3)	1	0	0.3 (0.3)
Trichomalus lucidus (Walker)	1.08 (1.1)	0	0	1.7 (1.5)	8.3 (7.8)	4	5.0 (1.1)	14.0 (11.6)

**Table 5.** Numbers of the most common parasitoids of *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus* at all sites in Ontario and Quebec, Canada, in 2006 and 2007 where collections of approximately 1000 siliques were made.

Note: All species belong to the Pteromalidae, except *Necremnus tidius*, which belongs to the Eulophidae; *n* is the number of sites from which approximately 1000 siliques were collected and parasitoids emerged. Numbers in parentheses show the mean  $\pm$  SE.

Graham (23.6%–48.6%) and *L. perdubius* (0%–53%), followed by *Lyrcus maculatus* (Gahan) (2.8%–14.7%) and species of *Pteromalus* Swederus (0.6%–23.1%) (Pteromalidae). In contrast, the most abundant species in Quebec were *T. lucidus* (33.3%–56.4%), followed by unidentified species of Eulophidae (2.1%–39.1%), *N. tidius* (11.5%–19.3%), and *M. gemellus* (1.3%–21.4%). Among the most abundant species, *Chlorocytus* sp. in southwestern Ontario and *T. lucidus* in Quebec constituted a relatively high proportion of the parasitoid community each year during the 2006 and 2007 surveys.

In 2008, parasitoids were recovered for the first time in Ottawa, Ontario, from *C. obstrictus* in a spring canola field on the CEF. *Euderus glaucus* and *M. gemellus* were the most abundant species (69.4% and 25.0%, respectively). In 2009, only *Pteromalus* spp. (56.3%) and *T. perfectus* (46.7%) were collected from the CEF. *Chlorocytus* sp. and L. perdubius, two of the most prevalent parasitoid species in southwestern Ontario, were absent at the CEF location, whereas *T. perfectus* was present at this site and absent from southwestern Ontario (Table 3). *Trichomalus perfectus* was also reared from *C. obstrictus* in Quebec in 2009. In 2006 and 2007, mean numbers of the nine most common parasitoids (Table 5) differed between southwestern Ontario and Quebec and varied among years and between early season (winter or volunteer) and summer (spring) *B. napus* siliques. These differences appear to be random.

# Parasitoids associated with *C. obstrictus* in noncrop Brassicaceae

Collections of *R. raphanistrum* siliques from southern Quebec and the CEF site in 2007– 2009 yielded adult *C. obstrictus* (data not shown) and seven ectoparasitoid species (Table 6). In 2007, one specimen each

532

**Table 6.** Species composition of Chalcidoidea parasitoids reared from collections of siliques of *Raphanus raphanistrum* from southern Quebec and southern Ontario, Canada, in 2007–2009 and putatively associated with *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus*.

Parasitoid species	Number of specimens									
r urusitoru spoolos		Ontario			Quebec					
	2007	2008	2009	2007	2008	2009				
Chalcididae										
Conura albifrons (Walsh)				1						
Eulophidae										
Necremnus tidius (Walker)				2		1				
Unidentified taxa		3				3				
Pteromalidae										
Chlorocytus sp.				3	2					
Pteromalus spp.			3	1						
Trichomalus lucidus (Walker)				2						
Trichomalus perfectus (Walker)			1							
Number of specimens	0	3	4	9	2	4				

of Conura albifrons (Walsh) (Chalcididae), N. tidius, and Chlorocytus sp. and two specimens of T. lucidus were reared from a single southern Quebec location (46°03.647'N, 72°03.476'W), whereas a single specimen of Chlorocytus sp. was reared from each of two additional locations (46°13.118'N, 72°25. 515'W and 45°56.570'N, 73°04.168'W). In 2008, one specimen of Chlorocytus was reared from each of two locations in southern Quebec (45°58.691'N, 72°48.062'W and 45°57.267'N, 72°27.886'W) and three specimens of Eulophidae were reared from one site in southwestern Ontario (42°59.000'N, 80°22.882'W). In 2009, one specimen of N. tidius and one unidentified eulophid were reared from each of two locations in southern Quebec (46°11.264'N, 72°21.201'W and 45°50.179'N, 73°50.724'W, respectively) and three specimens of Pteromalus sp. and one specimen of T. perfectus were reared from the CEF site (45°23.308'N, 75°42.780'W).

Collections of *S. arvensis* siliques from 34 sites in 2006–2008 yielded no *C. obstrictus*. One unidentified eulophid emerged from siliques collected at one site in Ontario (42°48.384'N, 81°52.220'W) in 2007 (n = 1) and two sites in Quebec (45°17.299'N, 73°41.200'W and 45°13.874'N 73°48.891'W) in 2007 (n = 1 at each site) and one site (45°13.872'N, 73°48.919'W) in 2008 (n = 4).

The host of these unidentified parasitoids could belong to any one of a number of insect families (see Yu 2005).

# Discussion

Our survey showed that populations of C. obstrictus have continued to spread in eastern Canada. Densities of weevils varied among locations and years and between early-developing (winter/volunteer) and latedeveloping (spring) plant types. Early flowering/ silique-producing plants supported higher numbers of C. obstrictus and associated parasitoids than plants that flowered and produced siliques later in the season (Table 2). Because C. obstrictus overwinters in the adult stage (Dosdall and Mason 2010 and references therein), heavy attacks on siliques of early-developing host plants would enable this pest to maximally exploit available resources. The early-season occurrence of volunteer canola and other weedy Brassicaceae (see below) ensures that populations of C. obstrictus will persist and continue to spread. Attacking early-maturing plants is the basis of pest management using trap crops (Cárcamo et al. 2007), together with late seeding of harvestable crops (Dosdall et al. 2006a).

*Ceutorhynchus obstrictus* was found in the Ottawa area for the first time in 2007, and this represents a major range extension because it was absent from earlier surveys in eastern Ontario (Mason *et al.* 2004). The use of wild radish and wild mustard as host plants by *C. obstrictus* (Mason *et al.* 2004) and the widespread occurrence of these plant species in southern Quebec and southern Ontario (Mulligan and Bailey 1975; Warwick *et al.* 2000; Warwick and Francis 2005) may have provided a pathway for dispersal of *C. obstrictus*.

The reason for lack of parasitoids at some locations sampled may have been that too few siliques were collected (approximately 50 per site in 2003 and 2004) to yield parasitoids at low population levels, samples being collected before parasitism occurred, or a non-uniform distribution of parasitoids. The fact that only parasitoids were found in some locations may indicate that these species were associated with non-weevil hosts known to be present or were locations where healthy weevils had emerged before siliques were sampled (parasitoids emerge from siliques approximately 2–3 weeks after *C. obstrictus*).

Gibson *et al.* (2006b) verified that T. perfectus was intentionally introduced in British Columbia from Europe in 1949 for biological control of C. obstrictus, but it did not establish (Gillespie et al. (2006). The recent occurrence of T. perfectus in Ottawa, Ontario (45°29.121'N, 75°42.311'W), and St-Célestin, Quebec (46°11.264′N, 72°21.201′W), in 2009 suggests that this species is adventive in eastern Canada and has attained a wide regional distribution in a relatively short time. Because C. obstrictus was first reported in Ottawa in 2007, even though surveys have been ongoing since 2000 (Mason et al. 2004), it is likely that C. obstrictus and at least some of its parasitoids moved west to the Ottawa area from Quebec via the Ottawa Valley. Detailed population studies are required to validate this hypothesis because all other parasitoids associated with C. obstrictus at the CEF location in Ottawa were found in both southwestern Ontario and Quebec.

Identification of the complex of parasitoids attacking larvae of *C. obstrictus* in south-

western Ontario and Quebec is consistent with findings in other regions of North America (Gillespie et al. 2006; Gibson et al. 2006b; Dosdall et al. 2009), though different species dominate the complexes in different regions. The occurrence of the European species M. gemellus at all sites in this study and T. perfectus in Quebec and the Ottawa area suggests that these species are adventive, and both may have been introduced at the same time as the Quebec C. obstrictus population. However, because of host association it is more likely that M. gemellus was introduced with C. typhae, an adventive species that is widespread in eastern Canada (Ontario, Quebec, New Brunswick, Nova Scotia, and Newfoundland) (Bousquet 1991; Bouchard et al. 2005). In Europe, M. gemellus is recorded as the major parasitoid of C. typhae, which feeds in siliques of shepherd's purse, Capsella bursa-pastoris (L.) Medik. (Brassicaceae) (Baur et al. 2007; Muller et al. 2011), a common invasive weed in canola and other crops in North America (Moss 1959; Budd and Best 1969). The emergence of M. gemellus from siliques of canola (i.e., from C. obstrictus) represents a curious new host association. Mesopolobus morys Walker (Pteromalidae), which is not known from North America (Gibson et al. 2006b), is the species of Mesopolobus that parasitizes C. obstrictus in Europe (Williams 2003; Haye et al. 2010).

The hypothesis that *T. perfectus* and *M. gemellus* were introduced accidentally in eastern Canada is supported by the absence of *T. perfectus* from southwestern Ontario (this study) as well as from British Columbia, Alberta, and Saskatchewan in Canada and Georgia in the United States of America (Gillespie *et al.* 2006; Dosdall *et al.* 2009; Gibson *et al.* 2006b) and the presence of *C. typhae* in southwestern Ontario, the Ottawa area, and southern Quebec but not in western Canada. Furthermore, the absence of *M. gemellus* from Georgia also suggests accidental introduction in eastern Canada.

The North American parasitoid communities of *C. obstrictus* vary among regions from 8 to 17 species (Table 7). In British Columbia, *T. lucidus*, *S. gracilis*, and *Mesopolobus* 

**Table 7.** Species composition (%) of Chalcidoidea parasitoids reared from collections of siliques of *Brassica napus* and *B. rapa* and putatively associated with *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus* in British Columbia (2005), southern Alberta and Saskatchewan (2003–2005), and Ontario and Quebec (2007) in Canada and Georgia, United States of America (1998).

	British Columbia (Gillespie <i>et al.</i> 2006)	A Sa (Dosc	Alberta an skatchev lall <i>et al</i> .	nd van . 2009)	Georgia (Gibson et al. 2006a)	Ontario	Quebec
Parasitoid species	2005	2003	2004	2005	1998	2007	2007
Chalcididae							
Conura albifrons (Walsh)	0.1	13.0	0.9	2.1	—		1.3
Conura torvina (Cresson)	—	16.2	0.5	10.4	0.8		_
Eulophidae							
Euderus albitarsus (Zetterstedt)*	—	0.8	1.1	1.1	—	0.6	—
Euderus glaucus Yoshimoto	—				0.2	0.4	0.6
Necremnus tidius (Walker)*	7.3	25.2	75.0	27.9	0.5	2.7	11.5
Unidentified taxa	—	_		_	—	8.8	23.7
Eupelmidae							
Brasema allynii (French)	—	_		_	0.5		_
Eupelmus cyaniceps Ashmead	—		_	_	0.4	_	—
Eupelmus vesicularis (Retzius)*	1.8	_	_	_	—	0.2	_
Eurytomidae							
Eurytoma tylodermatis Ashmead	0.8	0.0	0.7	0.0	2.2	0.6	0.6
Pteromalidae							
Catolaccus aenoviridis (Girault)	—	13.8	0.2	1.1	—	—	—
Chlorocvtus sp.	_	6.7	7.5	26.9	_	23.6	0.6
Lyrcus incertus (Ashmead)	_	0.0	0.0	0.4	0.5	1.9	
Lyrcus maculatus (Gahan)	_	0.0	0.9	3.2	86.0	3.6	
Lyrcus perdubius (Girault)	_	_	0.4		5.3	53.0	1.3
Mesopolobus gemellus Baur and Muller <sup>†</sup>	_	—	—	_	_	0.4	1.3
Mesopolobus moryoides Gibson	10.8	2.4	0.2	1.1	0.2	0.8	0.6
Mesopolobus sp.	0.3				_	_	
Neocatolaccus tylodermae (Ashmead)	_	—	—	_	2.9	_	—
Pteromalus cerealellae (Ashmead)	—		_	_	0.1	_	—
Pteromalus spp. <sup>‡</sup>	_	13.8	8.2	13.8	0.4	0.6	1.9
Stenomalinus gracilis (Walker)*	29.6			_	_	_	_
Trichomalus lucidus (Walker)*	49.6	8.1	4.8	12.0	—	3.6	56.4
Trichomalus perfectus (Walker) <sup>†</sup>	_	—	—	—	_	§	§

\*Palaearctic Region.

<sup>†</sup>New record for North America.

<sup>‡</sup>At least two undescribed species.

<sup>§</sup>Although *T. perfectus* was not found in 2007, it was found in Ontario (Ottawa) and Quebec in 2009.

morvoides Gibson are dominant (Gillespie et al. 2006), whereas N. tidius dominates in the Canadian prairies (Dosdall et al. 2009), L. maculatus is most abundant in Georgia (Gibson et al. 2006b), Chlorocytus sp. and L. perdubius dominate in southwestern Ontario (this study), and T. lucidus and unidentified species of Eulophidae are most abundant in Quebec (this study). Three species, N. tidius, Eurytoma tylodermatis Ashmead (Hymenoptera: Eurytomidae), and M. moryoides are present in all regions where C. obstrictus occurs, although E. tylodermatis constitutes a very small proportion of the parasitoid complex (< 0.2%, except in Georgia, where it is 2.2%). Among the 24 larval parasitoids reported as associated with C. obstrictus in North America, 8 are also reported from the Palaearctic Region. Of these, S. gracilis was intentionally introduced to North America (Gibson et al. 2006b), but whether the others are naturally occurring Holarctic species or were accidentally introduced is uncertain. For example, *Eupelmus vesicularis* (Retzius) (Eupelmidae) is transcontinental in North America, but is thought likely to have been introduced from Europe in straw with early European settlers (Gibson 1990). It is a broad generalist, with over 130 known hosts, as are most of the other known parasitoids of C. obstrictus (Yu 2005; Dosdall et al. 2006b), though *M. morvoides* is as yet associated only with this weevil, and M. gemellus has previously been associated only with C. typhae except for a single female from Ceutorhynchus turbatus Schultze (Baur et al. 2007). The incidence of even the dominant parasitoid species varies over time (Tables 3-5, 7), although sampling protocols likely influence these estimates (*i.e.*, patchiness of hosts and parasitoids; see Dosdall et al. 2009).

In Europe, 32 parasitoids, including 17 chalcidoids, have been associated with *C. obstrictus* (Ulber *et al.* 2010). Although the complex varies among regions, three ectoparasitoid species, *M. morys, S. gracilis*, and *T. perfectus*, have been reared from *C. obstrictus* in all areas where it is present. Haye *et al.* (2010) determined that larval mortality due to parasitism accounted for 45.5%–51.9% of the seasonal mortality of

C. obstrictus in Europe, the dominant parasitoid species being M. morvs (44%-48%) and T. perfectus (37%–48%). Veromann et al. (2011) found substantial parasitism (up to 96%) in Estonia, a relatively new area for C. obstrictus and its parasitoids. Although parasitoids of the egg and adult stages of C. obstrictus occur in Europe, these species do not cause significant mortality (Williams 2003; Ulber et al. 2010). Microctonus melanopus Ruthe (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonoidea: Braconidae), a parasitoid of adults, has also been reported from North America but has a limited distribution (Idaho, Alberta) and has little impact on C. obstrictus mortality (Dosdall and Mason 2010).

The complex of parasitoids associated with *C. obstrictus* on Brassicaceae other than *B. napus* is poorly understood. Fewer species appear to be associated with *C. obstrictus* infesting siliques of wild radish (Table 6), although those that occurred tended to be the major species that attacked *C. obstrictus* in canola. The eastern Canadian populations of *C. obstrictus* did not appear to attack wild mustard. Doucette (1947) concluded that *C. obstrictus* could complete its development in wild mustard, although this was not a preferred host.

Ceutorhynchus obstrictus continues to expand its range in North America. Parasitoid communities composed of Nearctic, putatively Holarctic, and introduced species have assembled on this host, but these communities vary in composition among the regions that have been surveyed. Although existing communities appear to provide substantial parasitism, the dominant species vary among years. Overall parasitism currently does not reduce C. obstrictus populations sufficiently to eliminate economic loss in eastern Canada, and this is also the case elsewhere in North America (Dosdall et al. 2009). Monitoring of parasitism levels should continue, to assess whether the current assemblages of species will increase and disperse across the entire range of C. obstrictus or there is a need to introduce more host-specific species from Europe that will provide greater mortality of C. obstrictus. The establishment in Canada of T. perfectus, the most effective parasitoid of C. obstrictus in Europe (Williams 2003; Haye *et al.* 2010; Veromann *et al.* 2011), provides an opportunity to track the spread and determine the impact of this important species. Finally, because the community of parasitoids has likely assembled from locally occurring weevil species in the subfamily Ceutorhynchinae, it will be important to determine whether or not the same parasitoid communities, or components thereof, are also associated with native species and (or) species introduced for the biological control of weeds.

## Acknowledgements

Erin Adams, Jane Allison, Margaret Aslanian, Ahmed Badiss, Lisa Bartels, Andrea Brauner, Ana Maria Farmakis, Gabriel Gregorich, Lola Gualtieri, Tom Hay, Shashi Juneja, James Knechtel, Kevin Macwan, Kathryn Makela, Christie Martin, Richard Muth, and Michael Wogin provided technical assistance. Tracey Baute and Michèle Roy provided information on sampling locations in Ontario and Quebec, respectively. This project was funded in part by Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada's Pest Management Centre Improving Farming Systems and Practices Initiative Project PRR03-370.

## References

- Baur, H., Muller, F.J., Gibson, G.A.P., Mason, P.G., and Kuhlmann, U. 2007. A review of the species of *Mesopolobus* (Chalcidoidea: Pteromalidae) associated with *Ceutorhynchus* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) host-species of European origin. Bulletin of Entomological Research, 97: 387– 397.
- Bouchard, P., Lesage, L., Goulet, H., Bostanian, N.J., Vincent, C., Zmudzinska, A., and Lasnier, J. 2005. Weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionoidea) diversity and abundance in two Québec vineyards. Annals of the Entomological Society of America, 98: 565–574.
- Bousquet, Y. 1991. Checklist of beetles of Canada and Alaska. Agriculture Canada Publication No. 1861/E.
- Brodeur, J., Leclerc, L., Fournier, M., and Roy, M. 2001. Cabbage seedpod weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae): a new pest of canola in northeastern North America. The Canadian Entomologist, **133**: 709–711.

- Budd, A.C., and Best, K.F. 1969. Wild plants of the Canadian prairies. Canada Department of Agriculture Research Branch Publication No. 983.
- Cárcamo, H.A., Dosdall, L.M, Johnson, D., and Olfert, O. 2005. Evaluation of foliar and seed treatments for control of the cabbage seedpod weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) in canola. The Canadian Entomologist, **137**: 476–487.
- Cárcamo, H.A., Dunn, R., Dosdall, L.M., and Olfert, O. 2007. Managing cabbage seedpod weevil in canola using a trap crop — a commercial field-scale study in western Canada. Crop Protection, **26**: 1325–1334.
- Colautti, R.I., Bailey, S.A., Overdijk, C.D.A.V., Amundsen, K., and MacIsaac, H.J. 2006. Characterised and projected costs of nonindigenous species in Canada. Biological Invasions, 8: 45–59.
- Dosdall, L.M., and Mason, P.G. 2010. Key pests and parasitoids of oilseed rape or canola in North America and the importance of parasitoids in integrated management. *In* Biocontrolbased integrated management of oilseed rape pests. *Edited by* I.H. Williams. Springer-Verlag, Dordrecht, The Netherlands. pp. 167–214.
- Dosdall, L.M., Moisey, D., Cárcamo, H.A., and Dunn, R. 2001. Cabbage seedpod weevil fact sheet. Agdex 622–21, Alberta Agriculture, Food and Rural Development, Edmonton, Alberta.
- Dosdall, L.M., Moisey, D., Kott, L., Keddie, B.A., Good, A., Rahman, H., et al. 2006*a*. Integrated management of the cabbage seedpod weevil. University of Alberta Technical Report.
- Dosdall, L.M., Ulmer, B.J., Gibson, G.A.P., and Cárcamo, H.A. 2006b. The spatio-temporal distribution dynamics of the cabbage seedpod weevil, *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae), and its larval parasitoids in canola in western Canada. Biocontrol Science and Technology, **16**: 987–1006.
- Dosdall, L.M., Gibson, G.A.P., Olfert, O.O., and Mason, P.G. 2009. Responses of Chalcidoidea (Hymenoptera) parasitoids to invasion of the cabbage seedpod weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) in western Canada. Biological Invasions, 11: 109–125.
- Doucette, C.F. 1947. Host plants of the cabbage seedpod weevil. Journal of Economic Entomology, **40**: 838–840.
- Gibson, G.A.P. 1990. Revision of the genus *Macroneura* Walker in America north of Mexico (Hymenoptera: Eupelmidae). The Canadian Entomologist, **122**: 837–873.
- Gibson, G.A.P., Baur, H, Ulmer, B., Dosdall, L., and Muller, F. 2005. On the misidentification of chalcid (Hymenoptera: Chalcidoidea) parasitoids of the cabbage seedpod weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) in North America. The Canadian Entomologist, **137**: 381–403.

- Gibson, G.A.P., Gates, M.W., and Buntin, G.D. 2006*a*. Parasitoids (Hymenoptera: Chalcidoidea) of the cabbage seedpod weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) in Georgia, USA. Journal of Hymenoptera Research, **15**: 187–207.
- Gibson, G.A.P., Gillespie, D.R., and Dosdall, L. 2006b. The species of Chalcidoidea (Hymenoptera) introduced to North America for biological control of the cabbage seedpod weevil, and the first recovery of *Stenomalina gracilis* (Chalcidoidea: Pteromalidae). The Canadian Entomologist, **138**: 285–291.
- Gillespie, D.R., Mason, P.G., Dosdall, L.M., Bouchard, P., and Gibson, G.A.P. 2006. Importance of long-term research in classical biological control: an analytical review of a release against the cabbage seedpod weevil in North America. Journal of Applied Entomology, **130**: 401–409.
- Haye, T., Mason, P.G., Dosdall, L.M., and Kuhlmann, U. 2010. Mortality factors affecting the cabbage seedpod weevil, *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus* (Marsham), in its area of origin: a life table analysis. Biological Control, **54**: 331–341.
- Kuhlmann, U., Dosdall, L.M., and Mason, P.G. 2002. Ceutorhynchus obstrictus (Marsham), cabbage seedpod weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae). In Biological control programmes in Canada, 1981–2000. Edited by P.G. Mason and J.T. Huber. CABI Publishing, Wallingford, U.K. pp. 52–58
- Laffin, R.D., Dosdall, L.M., and Sperling, F.A.H. 2005. Population structure of the cabbage seedpod weevil, *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus* (Marsham) (Coleoptera Curculionidae): origins of North American introductions. Molecular Ecology and Evolution, **34**: 504–510.
- Lancashire, P.D., Bleiholder, H., van den Boom, T., Langelüddeke, P., Strauss, R., Weber, E., and Witzenberger, A. 1991. A uniform decimal code for growth stages of crops and weeds. Annals of Applied Biology, **119**: 561–601.
- Mason, P.G., Baute, T., Olfert, O., and Roy, M. 2004. Cabbage seedpod weevil, *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus* (Marsham) (Coleoptera: Curculionidae)

in Ontario and Québec. Journal of the Entomological Society of Ontario, **134**: 107–113.

- Moss, E.H. 1959. Flora of Alberta. University of Toronto Press, Toronto, Ont.
- Muller, F.J., Dosdall, L.M., Mason, P.G., and Kuhlmann, U. 2011. Larval phenologies and parasitoids of two seed-feeding weevils associated with hoary cress and shepherd's purse (Brassicaceae) in Europe. The Canadian Entomologist, 143: 399–410.
- Mulligan, G.A., and Bailey, L.G. 1975. The biology of Canadian weeds. 8. *Sinapis arvensis* L. Canadian Journal of Plant Science, 55: 171–183.
- SAS Institute Inc. 2008. SAS<sup>®</sup>. Version 9.2. SAS Institute Inc., Cary, North Carolina.
- Ulber, B., Williams, I.H., Klukowski, Z., Luik, A., and Nilsson, C. 2010. Parasitoids of oilseed rape pests in Europe: key species for conservation biocontrol. *In* Biocontrol-based integrated management of oilseed rape pests. *Edited by* I.H. Williams. Springer-Verlag, Dordrecht, The Netherlands. pp. 45–76.
- Veromann, E., Williams, I.H., Kaasik, R., and Luik, A. 2011. Potential of parasitoids to control populations of the weevil *Ceutorhynchus obstrictus* (Marsham) on winter oilseed rape. International Journal of Pest Management, 57: 85–92.
- Warwick, S.I., and Francis, A. 2005. The biology of Canadian weeds. 132. *Raphanus raphanistrum* L. Canadian Journal of Plant Science, 85: 709–733.
- Warwick, S.I., Beckie, H.J., Thomas, A.G., and MacDonald, T. 2000. The biology of Canadian weeds. 8. Sinapis arvensis L. (updated). Canadian Journal of Plant Science, 80: 939–961.
- Williams, I.H. 2003. Parasitoids of the cabbage seed weevil. *In* Biocontrol of oilseed rape pests. *Edited* by D.V. Alford. Blackwell, Oxford, U.K. pp. 97– 112.
- Yu, D.S. 2005. Taxapad: scientific names for information management [online]. Available from http://www.taxapad.com/taxapadmain.php [accessed 5 April 2011].