

CARDINAL PAUL CULLEN AND HIS WORLD. Edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. Pp 470, illus. Dublin: Four Courts Press. 2011. €55.

The job of editing a collection of academic essays can be a thankless one, and sometimes, it must be admitted, deservedly so. The editors of *Cardinal Paul Cullen and his world* are therefore to be commended (and, yes, thanked) for rising to their task with considerable, albeit subtle, skill. While good editing inevitably involves a deal of cat-herding of authors to meet publishers' deadlines and a mundane proofing of texts, it should also, and above all, be an exercise in judicious selection. Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell may not trumpet their achievement in an (usually customary) editorial introduction, but they have assembled an excellent mix of contributors to what is a most welcome and illuminating book. The volume results from a double-headed conference in the two cities – Dublin and Rome – with which its subject was most associated; we surmise that a third event in Armagh, Cullen's first, brief, episcopal appointment on leaving the rectorship of the Irish College, Rome, in 1850, would have been inadvisable given his views on the city. It was, he asserted, 'a desolate place', its cathedral 'a hole' (pp 98, 65). Indeed, the frankness of these remarks illustrates the worth of the wider project of which the present book is a first taste. The eventual publication of Cullen's correspondence – culled from more than sixty archives worldwide – will be an exciting development for scholars of all aspects of nineteenth-century Ireland.

Nevertheless, for the moment, these twenty-seven wide-ranging essays offer much to consider. Many of the anticipated scholars are present and (more or less) correct. To Emmet Larkin, fittingly, goes the task of opening the volume, and he does so by revisiting some of the abiding themes of his influential career. Sean Connolly contributes a masterly reflection on the 'devotional revolution' which Larkin first identified, and, by way of a fresh examination of Catholic practice in Belfast, makes a strong case for its continued relevance for historians. Cullen's most recent biographer, Ciarán O'Carroll, meanwhile, adds to the debate over the centrality of the cardinal's role in that 'revolution'. Perhaps the greatest pleasure of this collection, however, is in its more unexpected contributors. 'The priest in politics' and the politics of Paul Cullen in particular, have been subject to much circular discussion over the years, so it is refreshing to read Matthew Kelly's considered and lively take on the issue. In particular, the author does well to deliberately avoid the easy, reductive question of whether or not Cullen was an Irish nationalist, and instead – making excellent use of an underexploited body of sermons and pastoral letters – probes what he terms 'the deeper logic of his thinking' (p. 328). That Kelly cannot resist concluding with a probably unnecessary designation of Cullen as a 'conditional unionist' does not take away from the preceding discussion (p. 328). Meanwhile, Virginia Crossman renders equally good service by looking beyond Cullen's well-rehearsed involvement in moves to reform education to examine his thoughts and actions in relation to poverty and its relief. While emphasising his genuine, humane concern for the poor, Crossman also alludes to the ultimately damaging results of the version of Church-controlled welfare that Cullen advocated.

The analysis of Cullen that emerges from both of these essays, and several others here besides, is therefore a highly complex one, that neither defends nor condemns, but endeavours simply to explain. As Colin Barr's very fine closing essay on 'Cullen and the historians' suggests, that has not always been the case, and more such measured scholarship on a man routinely labelled 'enigmatic' is certainly needed. This collection is not, then, the final word on its subject, nor could it or does it claim to be. It is, however, an interesting and very readable illustration both of the breadth of Cullen's involvement in contemporary Irish and international Catholic life and of the extent of the task facing any author of the comprehensive biography he still awaits.

Having begun by lauding the editors, a minor criticism can perhaps be made. Given the number of essays, and the common threads that bind some of them, it may have been preferable to divide the book into appropriate sections – for example, Cullen and

missions; Cullen and art; Cullen and Rome; contemporary perceptions of Cullen – the better to showcase the richness of the Cullen archive and the wide reach of its appeal. Regardless, this book is a well-judged, necessary and important addition to our understanding of a key figure in Irish history.

SARAH RODDY

*School of Arts, Histories and Cultures, University of Manchester*

IMPERIAL SPACES: PLACING THE IRISH AND SCOTS IN COLONIAL AUSTRALIA. By Lindsay Proudfoot and Dianne Hall. Pp xiii, 248. Manchester: Manchester University Press. 2011. £65.

Comparative studies of Ireland and Scotland and their respective migrant groups have deepened in recent years. This co-authored book by historical geographer, Lindsay Proudfoot, and historian, Dianne Hall, examines the settler experience of the Irish and Scots in Australia. Their objective is to search for ‘evidence for ethnicity and other markers of identity’ (p. 9) through a place-centred analysis which prioritises the local, in their case four small towns in New South Wales and Victoria.

The book comprises eight chapters and a conclusion, minus a bibliography. While chapter one is a standard introduction, the following two chapters are overviews of the scholarly literature of empire and diaspora. Here Proudfoot and Hall utilise the work of others to point to the limited coverage given to the colonies of white settlement and the male-centred, Eurocentric perspectives of traditional imperial scholars. While recognising the diverse concerns of the new imperial historians with gender, ethnicity, race, and representation, the authors lament the limited acknowledgement of the various ethnic identities among migrants from Britain and Ireland. Similar criticisms of a restricted focus are made in their overview of the literature relating to diaspora, including the tendency to focus on Catholic Irish identity and its emphasis on exile and injustice and the dominance of coercion and forced movement as influencing the flow from Scotland.

Moving on from these detailed though at times jargon-heavy overviews, the remaining five chapters explore some key themes including the voyage, land and legislation, pastoral landscapes, urban spaces, and religious sites. Drawing on twenty-three voyage diaries written mainly by first- and second-class passengers travelling between Australia and the British Isles between 1836 and 1892, Proudfoot and Hall reveal that ethnic allegiances were evident, but so too were shipboard surveillance and gendered spaces. It would have been useful to know, though, how these diaries differed from other accounts of the voyage in letters, or with the shipboard experiences of the Irish and the Scots moving to other destinations. Indeed, the relative lack of engagement with the blossoming scholarly literature on the experiences of the Irish and the Scots in other destinations is a key absence from this study. Its major strength, however, is its sustained engagement with the background of these migrants in Ireland and Scotland.

In their examination of land and legislation, for instance, Hall and Proudfoot demonstrate the significance of land issues in Ireland and Scotland. They point to the Scots having greater pastoral involvement than the Irish, suggesting this may reflect more extensive capitalisation among the Scots as well as ‘Scottish sheep farming [providing a] better experience for would-be emigrants than the labour-intensive potato and dairying economy of pre-Famine Ireland’ (p. 117). A pastoral focus, meanwhile, throws up differences with the homelands, and it is suggested that past knowledge and experience was largely immaterial in Australia as newcomers contended with an environment characterised by floods and bushfires. Houses, too, were more inclined to reflect local conditions, such as the construction of verandas to combat the intense heat. Housing also testified to the status of settlers in Australia rather than their origins. Likewise, properties