This is an Accepted Manuscript for Epidemiology & Infection. Subject to change during the editing and production process.

DOI: 10.1017/S0950268825000111

1 Impact of temperatures on Malaria Incidence in vulnerable regions of Pakistan:

2 Empirical Evidence and Future Projections

3

4 Syeda Hira Fatima^{1,2, 3*}, Farrah Zaidi⁴, Javeria Rafiq⁴, Dinesh Bhandari^{3,5,6,7}, Asad Ali⁸, Peng Bi³

- 5
- 6 ¹ Global Ecology | Partuyarta Ngadluku Wardli Kuu, College of Science and Engineering, Flinders University,
- 7 Adelaide, South Australia, Australia
- 8 ² College of Medicine and Public Health, Flinders University, Australia
- 9 ³ School of Public Health, The University of Adelaide, Australia
- 10 ⁴ Zoology Department, Peshawar University, Pakistan
- 11 ⁵ School of Nursing and Midwifery, Monash University, Australia
- 12⁶ Monash Health and Climate Initiative, Monash University, Australia
- 13 ⁷ Monash Data Futures Institute, Monash University, Australia
- 14 ⁸ Statistics Department, Institute of Space Technology, Pakistan
- 15

16 Corresponding Author's name and complete contact information

- 17 Dr Syeda Hira Fatima
- 18 Global Ecology | Partuyarta Ngadluku Wardli Kuu, College of Science and Engineering,
- 19 College of Medicine and Public Health,
- 20 Flinders University, Bedford Park, South Australia, 5042
- 21 Email: <u>syeda.fatima@flinders.edu.au</u>
- 22 Declaration of conflicts of interest
- 23 The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

This is an Open Access article, distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives licence (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/bync-nd/4.0/), which permits non-commercial re-use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is unaltered and is properly cited. The written permission of Cambridge University Press must be obtained for commercial re-use or in order to create a derivative work.

24 Key findings

- 25 For every 1°C rise above optimal temperature, malaria risk increases by 9-10%.
- About 39.8% to 54.1% cases of malaria are attributable to heat.
- 27 Heat-related cases of malaria are projected to increase by 3.5% by 2060s in remote regions of
- 28 Pakistan.

29 Abstract

30 Malaria presents a significant health challenge in developing countries, especially as climate 31 change exacerbates its impact. Temperatures directly affect malaria transmission by 32 influencing the abundance of disease vectors and the development of the malaria parasite. 33 Pakistan, known for its warm, arid, and subtropical climate and frequent flooding, faces 34 increased risks, emphasising the need for research to understand how heat affects malaria 35 transmission. This study aims to provide empirical evidence of the relationship between 36 temperature and malaria cases in two remote but highly vulnerable districts: Bannu and Lakki 37 Marwat, with the goal of informing interventions to combat the negative effects of climate 38 change on malaria transmission in Pakistan. 39 The monthly confirmed malaria cases and environmental factors (temperature, precipitation, 40 and humidity) were analysed using a time-series study design with distributed lag nonlinear 41 models and quasi-Poisson regression models. Malaria datasets acquired from the Integrated 42 Vector Control/Malaria Control Program in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa were combined with 43 publicly available gridded meteorological data from Copernicus ERA5-Land, covering the 44 period from 2014 to 2022. The findings suggest that as temperatures exceed 22.4°C, malaria 45 transmission increases by 9 to 10% for every 1°C rise in both districts. In Bannu, up to 39.8% 46 of reported malaria cases could be attributed to heat, while in Lakki Marwat, 54.1% of cases 47 were attributable to heat.

Projections based on Shared Socio-Economic Pathways forecast an increase in heat-related malaria cases by 0.8 to 3.5% in both districts under high emission scenarios by 2060s. The relationship between temperature and malaria transmission is complex and is influenced by multiple factors, including human behaviour and environmental conditions such as precipitation and humidity.

53	Conducting empirical studies in highly vulnerable regions like Pakistan is crucial due to the
54	inadequate healthcare infrastructure and limited resources, which heighten the vulnerability
55	of populations to the impact of climate change. This study highlights the pressing need for
56	implementing climate change mitigation and adaptation measures. This urgency is
57	underscored by recent events in Pakistan, such as severe floods followed by a significant
58	increase in malaria cases. Allocating resources to strengthen healthcare systems and enhance
59	community resilience is especially critical in light of the recent challenges.

60 Keywords

61 Climate, Malaria, Epidemiology, Heat, Low and Middle-Income Countries

62 Introduction

Malaria stands as a prominent cause of morbidity and mortality in many developing nations.
As of 2015, which served as the baseline year for the Global Technical Strategy for Malaria

65 2016–2030 (GTS), an estimated 231 million cases of malaria were reported [1]. By 2022,

66 there was a notable increase with an estimated 249 million cases documented in 85 malaria-

67 endemic countries and regions (including French Guiana), marking an increase of five

68 million cases from 2021. Key contributors to this surge included Pakistan (+2.1 million),

69 Ethiopia (+1.3 million), Nigeria (+1.3 million), Uganda (+597,000), and Papua New Guinea

70 (+423,000) [1]. The ongoing threat of malaria affects over two billion individuals, including

both travellers and residents in endemic areas, resulting in an annual toll of about 608,000

72 deaths as of 2022 [1, 2].

73 In recent years, the profound impact of climate change on malaria has attracted significant 74 attention due to its potential to exacerbate the disease burden and alter transmission dynamics 75 [3]. While climate change affects various aspects of malaria transmission, including vector 76 abundance and pathogen development, rising temperatures are of paramount concern. Rising 77 temperatures can expand the geographic range and local abundance of malaria vectors, 78 Anopheles mosquitoes, which thrive in warm climates [4]. Furthermore, warmer temperatures 79 accelerate the development of malaria parasites within mosquitoes and shorten the incubation 80 period of the disease in humans, leading to an increased risk of transmission [5].

Many studies have incorporated climate change scenarios and geostatistical models to explain
and project future malaria incidence locally and globally. Various process-based or
mechanistic models have been proposed for the intricate and nonlinear weather-driven *Anopheles* lifecycle and malaria transmission dynamics. However, these models have yielded
somewhat divergent findings regarding the optimal temperatures for transmission and the

86	potential impact of rising temperatures and other extreme weather events on the distribution
87	of malaria. The projections differ: some suggest a significant increase in malaria-susceptible
88	areas, while others predict a shift in the geographical range of the disease [4].

89	Pakistan remains the most susceptible country to the repercussions of malaria, with the
90	disease ranking as the fourth-largest cause of death among infectious diseases. Pakistan and
91	other countries in the WHO Eastern Mediterranean Region, such as Afghanistan, Somalia,
92	Sudan and Yemen, jointly account for 95% of all malaria cases reported in the region [6].
93	Pakistan is considered to be hyperendemic for malaria, and the pooled malaria prevalence is
94	estimated at 23.3% [7]. Malaria is most prevalent in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) and
95	Balochistan provinces [7]. An. culicifacies, An. stephensi, An. subpictus, and An. superpictus
96	are the primary vectors for malaria and have been reported to be endemic in the region since
97	the early 1900s [8-9]. Plasmodium vivax (prevalence rate: 79.13%) and P. falciparum
98	(prevalence rate: 16.29%) are the predominant malaria parasite species [6-7]. Pakistan's
99	ecological conditions, characterised by a monsoon-fed agricultural landscape with flat terrain
100	towards the south, provide ideal settings for malaria transmission. Temperatures from
101	September to December and April to May frequently range between 20°C and 30°C,
102	facilitating mosquito breeding, while rainfall creates stagnant water pools essential for larvae
103	development. Higher humidity levels further enhance malaria transmission.
	C V
104	Over the years, entomological studies in Pakistan have elucidated the vector ecology of
105	Anopheles mosquitoes, and the prevalence and epidemiology of malaria [8-12]. The
106	government has launched malaria control efforts to curb the disease; however, Pakistan faces
107	challenges in reducing malaria incidence. These challenges could be partly attributed to
108	climate change, particularly the irregular temperature and rainfall patterns in recent years [7].

Recurrent massive flooding events have exacerbated these challenges by creating additional

breeding habitats for mosquitoes, thereby facilitating the spread of mosquito-borne diseasessuch as malaria and dengue [12].

Despite the pressing nature of this issue, there is a notable scarcity of empirical evidence on

113 how climate change specifically affects malaria in low and middle-income countries like 114 Pakistan. This scarcity creates a significant obstacle to fully understanding the extent of the 115 problem and implementing effective mitigation and adaptation strategies. 116 Recently, after catastrophic flooding in Pakistan in 2022 and subsequent increase in malaria 117 incidence, it has become imperative to estimate the climate change-attributed increase in the 118 risk of malaria. Understanding the role of climate change in the resurgence of malaria will 119 guide policy decisions aimed at achieving the ambitious goal of a 'Malaria-Free Pakistan by 120 2035' [13].

121 This study aims to provide empirical evidence of the influence of climate change, using high

122 temperature as an indicator, on malaria incidence in two highly vulnerable districts of

123 Pakistan and project future risk estimates. This will lay a solid foundation for informing

124 response strategies and addressing the uneven implementation of malaria interventions.

, ccei

125 Methods

126 Study settings

127 Bannu and Lakki Marwat districts are situated in the southern region of the KPK province in

- 128 Pakistan (Figure 1). Bannu covers an area of 1,227 sq. km with a population of 1,167,892,
- 129 while Lakki Marwat spans 3,296 sq. km and has a population of 876,182 (Pakistan Bureau of
- 130 Statistics, 2017). These districts are recognised as hyperendemic regions for malaria
- 131 incidence in KPK, Pakistan [6]. Bannu district has been known for its high malaria
- 132 prevalence since the British Raj [10]. In Bannu, *P. vivax* has a prevalence of 16.9% while *P*.
- 133 *falciparum* has a prevalence of 2.3%. In Lakki Marwat, one study estimated the prevalence of
- 134 *P. vivax* at 20.2% and *P. falciparum* at 0.2% [10]. Studies conducted in Pakistan provide
- evidence that malaria is predominantly a disease of rural areas (prevalence: 38.65%) where
- people live below the poverty line, as compared to urban areas (22.39%) [14]. Integrated
- 137 Vector Control/Malaria Control Program KPK (IVC/MCP-KP) and Frontier Primary Health
- 138 Care (FPHC) manage control interventions such as Indoor Residual Spraying (IRS),
- 139 widespread bed net distribution, provision of bed nets to pregnant women during antenatal
- 140 care, and community education campaigns. Antimalaria measures have been in practice since
- 141 the colonial era, including fumigating and spraying against adult mosquitos resting in
- 142 buildings, filling and draining breeding sites, treating them with oil or Paris Green, and, in the
- 143 case of the smaller irrigation channels, completely drying them out once a week [10]. In
- 144 terms of healthcare, in Pakistan, Chloroquine serves as the primary treatment for unconfirmed
- 145 malaria, Chloroquine-Primaquine is recommended for *P. vivax*, and Artesunate/Sulfadoxine-
- 146 Pyrimethamine (AS+SP) is employed for uncomplicated *P. falciparum* malaria, with severe
- 147 cases or treatment failures addressed using Artesunate, Artemether, or Quinine [6].
- The districts experience a semi-arid climate with hot and dry summers lasting seven months
 from April to October. June experiences maximum temperatures ranging from 42°C to 45°C,

and the average annual temperature is 24.2 °C. The annual rainfall in Bannu and Lakki
Marwat ranges from 120.0 to 270.0 mm, and rainfall is sporadic, occurring mainly during the
monsoon season. Both districts are predominantly rural, characterised by cropland and
shrubland cover. Sandstorms are periodic occurrences, particularly during May and June,
affecting the entire area.

155

-----Insert Figure 1 here-----

156 Environmental Data

157 Monthly gridded meteorological datasets were acquired for the period of 2014-2022 from

158 Copernicus ERA5-Land, featuring variables such as mean temperature (°C), precipitation

159 (mm), and dew point (°C), all at a resolution of 9x9 kilometres [15]. Relative humidity (%)

160 was estimated using dew point and mean temperature [16]. These datasets were extracted for

161 the two districts using centroid points.

162 Malaria Data

163 In KPK, Pakistan, lab-confirmed cases of malaria are administered by IVC/MCP-KP and

164 FPHC. Malaria diagnosis is conducted using microscopy and Rapid Diagnostic Tests (RDTs),

165 with microscopy being the gold standard. In areas where electricity and trained microscopists

are limited, RDTs are primarily used for diagnosis. The RDTs are procured through

167 international procurement from the World Health Organisation (WHO) approved list of

168 RDTs. The data at the health facility level is checked and verified by the district malaria

team, and further cross-checked at the provincial level to ensure credibility and reliability.

170 One Quality Assurance Officer and a microscopist at the provincial level audit the health

- 171 facilities to ensure accurate diagnosis and provide on-the-job training to malaria supervisors.
- 172 Monthly aggregated records of malaria cases from 2014 to 2022 were obtained from
- 173 IVC/MCP-KP, Directorate of General Health Services KPK. The data were already fully de-

174 identified at the source, provided in aggregated form, and contained no individual-level

175 patient information, ensuring there was no need for further anonymisation. Specifically, the

176 dataset included only the total number of positive malaria cases per month, disaggregated

177 into *P. vivax* (PV) and *P. falciparum* (PF) cases, as well as the number of RDTs conducted.

178 The use and publication of this aggregated, de-identified data were authorised through the

179 issuance of a No Objection Certificate from the IVC/MCP-KP, Directorate of General Health

180 Services KPK (NOC provided in Supplementary File).

181 Statistical Analysis

182 A time-series study design coupled with distributed lag nonlinear models was utilised to

assess the effects of ambient temperature on the risk of malaria transmission between 2014

and 2022 in the monsoon-fed semi-arid districts of Pakistan [17]. Monthly malaria datasets

185 were integrated with hydrometeorological variables to explore the association between mean

186 temperature and malaria. To model the effect of mean temperature on malaria cases,

187 generalised linear models fitted with distributed lags were applied, utilising a quasi-Poisson

188 distribution, for each district. A linear threshold function was defined for mean temperature at

189 22.4°C based on evidence suggesting that the biting activity of malaria-transmitting

190 mosquitoes is higher above 22.4°C [18].

191 To capture the optimal conditions for malaria transmission, predictions and attributable

192 fractions were estimated within the temperature range of 22.4°C to 35.3°C. This range was

193 selected to reflect the temperatures most conducive to mosquito activity and *Plasmodium*

- 194 parasite development [3, 18]. The lag dimension was modelled using an unconstrained
- 195 distributed lag function up to a period of three months. Natural cubic splines with two degree
- 196 of freedom per year were used to adjust the confounders that change slowly over time. The
- 197 logarithm of the population was used as an offset variable to account for differences in

198 populations sizes among observations. Relative humidity and precipitation were included as

199 covariates, as they are important factors regulating the growth and incubation period of

200 malaria vectors.

201 The final model was structured as follows:

202
$$\log(\mu) = \beta 0 + f_{cb}(cb) + f_{date}(time) + f_{RH}(relative humidity) + f_{Precip}(precipitation) +$$

203 $(\log(Population))$

204 Where $log(\mu)$ is the expected monthly count of malaria cases, modelled as a linear

205 combination of predictor variables. $\beta 0$ is the intercept. $f_{cb}(cb)$ represents the smooth function

206 for the bi-dimensional relationship between temperature at each lag and across different lags.

207 $f_{\rm RH}$ and $f_{\rm Precip}$ represent the smoothing functions for relative humidity and precipitation. Log

208 (Population) is the offset term.

The estimate for the overall effect of mean temperature, β^{\wedge} , was subsequently computed by summing all the contributions at different lags from the coefficients of the cross-basis. This model assumed a log-linear relationship between the expected number of malaria cases and the mean temperature. The results were expressed as Relative Risk (RR) estimates, obtained by exponentiating the estimated β^{\wedge} , representing the percent change in the risk of malaria per degree increase in temperature.

215 Estimation of Attributable Number (AN) and Attributable Fraction (AF)

216 Heat-related attributable numbers (AN) and attributable fractions (AF) of malaria cases were

217 calculated following the method outlined by Gasparrini and Leone [19]. The AN quantifies

218 the excess number of malaria cases attributable to heat exposure within the defined

temperature range (22.4°C to 35.3°C). The AN was computed using the formula:

220
$$AN = (1 - \exp(-\beta^{A} \times \Delta T) \times Y)$$

- 221 Where β^{\wedge} represents the coefficients derived from the DLNM, ΔT represents temperature
- levels during the observed or projected period, Y represents the observed counts of malariacases.
- 224 The AF was then calculated as the ratio of the AN to the total number of observed cases,
- 225 expressed as a percentage:
- 226

 $AF = AN / \sum Y \times 100$

227 The AF represents the proportion of malaria cases attributable to heat exposure within the

228 defined temperature range. To account for uncertainty in the coefficient estimates, 1,000

229 iterations of Monte Carlo simulations were performed, generating confidence intervals for the

AF estimates.

231 **Projections of Future Malaria Burden**

232 Projected future increases in mean temperature were obtained for two time slices (2044-2052

and 2064-2072) under different climate change scenarios. The data were sourced from the

234 World Bank's Climate Change Knowledge Portal (CCKP) (Table 1) [20]. The heat-related

AF was calculated under two Shared Socio-Economic Pathways (SSP2-4.5 and SSP2-8.5),

using baseline data from 2014 to 2022. The derived temperature effect estimate (β^{\wedge}) was used

to compute the RR and projected AN for future periods using the formula:

- 238 RR=exp($\beta^{A} \times \Delta T$)
- 239 Where ΔT is substituted with the projected mean annual increase in temperature for each
- 240 climate scenario. The projected AN and AF were calculated using the same approach as for
- the baseline period. In the absence of projected population data, we assumed no significant
- changes in the population when projecting the future burden of malaria.
- All data preprocessing and analyses were conducted using R software (R 4.1.0), with
- the **dlnm** and **mvmeta** packages for model fitting [21]. Reproducible code is provided in the
- 245 Supplementary File.

247	Results
248	The Relationship between Environmental Variables and Malaria Incidence
249	Descriptive statistics reveal that both Bannu and Lakki Marwat share similar climatic
250	conditions. Bannu experiences average temperatures ranging from 9.45°C to 35.05°C, while
251	Lakki Marwat's average temperatures span from 10.79°C to 35.35°C. Humidity levels
252	fluctuate between 19% and 74% in Bannu and 21% and 79% in Lakki Marwat (Table 2).
253	The calculated prevalence rates signify the occurrences of PV and PF per 1000 RDTs
254	conducted within the studied population or timeframe. Predominantly, PV constitutes the
255	majority of cases in both districts, with rates of 144.93 and 92.81 cases per 1000 RDTs in
256	Bannu and Lakki Marwat, respectively. PF cases show prevalence rates of 2.87 and 2.08 per
257	1000 RDTs conducted in these respective regions (Table 2).
258	Insert Table 2 here
259	The monthly time-series distribution depicted in Figure 2 and Figure 3 unveils the intricate
260	relationship between weather patterns and malaria cases in Bannu and Lakki Marwat. Figures
261	2 and 3 indicate the presence of distinct seasonal patterns, characterised by alternating highs
262	and lows in malaria cases. Notably, these fluctuations show a positive association between
263	monthly variations in temperature (Spearman's $\rho = 0.34$) and relative humidity (Spearman's ρ
264	= 0.28) with malaria cases throughout the region.
265	Average monthly trends of malaria, corresponding to variations in temperature and humidity
266	(Figures 2 and 3), underscore a noteworthy trend observed from 2014 onwards—an evident
267	decline in reported malaria cases. However, a significant surge becomes apparent in the year
260	2022

269	Insert Figure 2 here
270	Insert Figure 3 here
271	In both Bannu and Lakki Marwat, the risk of malaria cases increased with rising temperatures
272	above 22.4°C (Figures 4 and 5). In Bannu, for every 1°C increase above this threshold, there
273	was a 9.87% (95%CI: 4.86, 15.12) rise in the risk of malaria cases. Similarly, in Lakki
274	Marwat, the risk increased by 9.49% (95%CI: 5.25, 13.91) per 1°C rise in temperature.
275	The risk of PV infections followed a comparable pattern in both locations. In Bannu, the risk
276	of PV infections rose by an estimated 9.60% (95%CI: 4.50, 14.96) with temperature
277	increments, mirroring the trend in Lakki Marwat, where it increased by 9.48% (95%CI: 5.21,
278	13.93).
279	However, when considering PF infections, the contribution to higher risk varied between the
280	districts. In Bannu, a 1°C increase above 22.4°C was associated with a substantial 14.95%
281	(95%CI: 6.07, 24.57) rise in PF infections. In contrast, Lakki Marwat displayed a lower
282	association, with PF infection contributing to a 4.74% (95%CI: -2.96, 13.06) increase in risk.
283	Figures 4 and 5 further indicate that as the monthly lag increases from 0 to 3 months, there is
284	a noticeable escalation in the risk of malaria cases, with two distinct peaks observed at lag 1
285	and lag 3. In Bannu, the risk is estimated to be 3.66% (95%CI: 0.00, 7.44) at lag 1 and 6.00%
286	(95%CI: 2.77, 9.27) at lag 3. Similarly, in Lakki Marwat, the risk is estimated to be 6.28%
287	(95%CI: 1.85, 10.91) at lag 1 and 7.14% (95%CI: 3.61, 10.80) at lag 3. This suggests that
288	factors influencing malaria occurrence might have a delayed effect, becoming more
289	influential several months after their initial occurrence.
290	Insert Figure 4 here
291	Insert Figure 5 here

2	n	1
Z	У	2

293	Projected Association between Temperature and Malaria
294	The attributable fractions outlined in Table 3 provide compelling insights into the impact of
295	rising temperatures on malaria cases. In Bannu, up to 39.76% (95%CI: 23.19, 51.93) of
296	reported malaria instances are linked to temperatures ranging between 22.4°C and 35.3°C.
297	Similarly, in Lakki Marwat, 54.05% (95%CI: 34.64, 68.82) of cases are attributable to this
298	temperature range.
299	Projections based on the Shared Socio-Economic Pathways indicate a rise in the attributable
300	fraction of heat-related malaria cases in both districts.
301	Insert Table 3 here
302	Discussion
303	This study provides the first evidence from Pakistan taking into account temporal and lagged
304	dependencies in predicting the association between monthly temperature conditions and
305	malaria incidence and projecting future trends. The results indicate a direct association
306	between temperature and malaria incidence in the southern districts of KPK. Findings from
307	this study suggest that temperatures exceeding 22.4°C corresponded to a 9 to 10% increase in
308	malaria transmission for every 1°C rise. These findings are consistent with a recent study [22]
309	from Bannu, Pakistan, suggesting that with every 1°C increase in temperature, the percent
310	variation in the odds ratio of malaria incidence increases by 4%. Similarly, research
311	conducted in multiple Chinese provinces reported a 6.7 to 15.8% rise in malaria cases for
312	every 1°C increase in maximum temperature [23]. Several recent studies from developing
313	countries, such as Iran and Uganda, discerned similar patterns [24-25]. Numerous studies
314	indicate a rise in malaria transmission beyond specific temperature thresholds [26-27].
315	However, a few studies conducted in China and sub-Saharan Africa provide contrasting

316 evidence in the context of climate change [28-29]. The conflicting results could be attributed 317 to disparities in different modelling approaches [30]. Localised regional conditions play an 318 important role in the transmission dynamics of malaria and should be considered when 319 assessing the complex associations between environmental factors and malaria [31]. 320 The relationship between temperature and malaria transmission tends to be intricate, 321 influenced by multiple interacting variables such as humidity, rainfall patterns, other local 322 environmental conditions and human behavior. In tropical countries, such as sub-Saharan 323 Africa, where temperature remains consistently warm throughout the year, conducive 324 conditions for the breeding and survival of malaria-carrying mosquitoes persist [32]. 325 However, with reduced rainfall and hotter, drier conditions, the decrease in standing water 326 and consequent breeding sites might temporarily reduce mosquito populations, thus lowering 327 disease transmission. In subtropical monsoon-fed climates typical of Pakistan, temperature 328 and rainfall patterns vary annually. Monsoon summer seasons can create periods of increased 329 standing water, providing breeding grounds for mosquitoes. During these times, malaria 330 transmission may surge due to the shortened development time of the malaria parasite and the 331 availability of more habitats for mosquito breeding [1]. Other ecological factors, like 332 topography, also play a crucial role in malaria transmission. For example, the flat terrain of 333 Bannu and Lakki Marwat can lead to poor drainage of rainwater, resulting in standing 334 stagnant water [12]. The presence of rivers, canals, and irrigation systems in and around 335 southern districts of KPK, such as Bannu and Lakki Marwat, provide ample breeding places 336 for mosquitoes and play a key role in mosquito ecology and malaria transmission [12]. 337 Furthermore, since the 1930s, numerous irrigation channels in the Bannu cantonment have 338 served as primary mosquito breeding sites for Anopheles species, such as An. stephensi, An. 339 culicifacies, and An. subpictus [10]. Due to the endophilic behavior of Anopheles in Pakistan, 340 the species are generally found indoors [12]. In arid regions like Bannu and Lakki Marwat,

341 water is often stored in open containers inside houses, which can serve as breeding sites for 342 mosquitoes. Human factors such as poorly constructed housing, particularly in rural settings 343 (e.g., thatched roofs and unsealed walls), can increase exposure to mosquito bites. Nearly a 344 century ago, malaria surveys revealed that cases began to rise towards the end of August, 345 reaching their peak in October and November, before declining rapidly [10]. Today, peaks in 346 malaria transmission are observed during September to December and April to May, which 347 may be influenced by changing climatic patterns, including temperature, precipitation, 348 variations in rainy seasons, and agricultural activities [7, 9, 12]. Extensive agricultural 349 practices, particularly rice paddies and other water-intensive crops, as well as trade 350 (particularly the used tire trade, which is quite common in KPK) and close contact with 351 livestock in rural settings, can also facilitate malaria transmission. Many studies have 352 highlighted the role used tires in vector-borne disease transmission [33-34]. Used tires, when 353 stored, recycled, or discarded improperly, collect rainwater and create stagnant pools, 354 providing ideal breeding sites for mosquitoes. In addition, limited access to healthcare 355 facilities and resources, particularly for socioeconomically disadvantaged communities, can 356 hinder prompt diagnosis and treatment, exacerbating the spread of malaria. 357 Furthermore, this study reveals a delayed impact of mean temperature on the burden of 358 malaria, persisting for up to three months. The peak at a 1-month lag could be associated with 359 the Extrinsic Incubation Period (EIP) of malaria parasites within mosquitoes and accelerated 360 larval development. As temperatures rise, mosquitoes may become infectious more quickly, 361 leading to increased malaria transmission within one month. For example, within the 362 temperature range of 25-30°C, the EIP for *P. vivax* in mosquitoes is likely around 8-10 days, 363 whereas below 20°C, the EIP extend up to 35 days [35]. The peak at 3-month lag suggests a 364 more extended impact of temperature changes on the malaria transmission cycle. This could

365 be due to several factors, including i. sustained high temperatures over a period, which lead to

an increased and continuous population of infectious mosquitoes [36] ii. the compounding effect of multiple mosquito generations, where an initial temperature increase results in a progressively higher mosquito population over time [37] and iii. possible delays in human behaviour or environmental factors that influence mosquito breeding sites [38].

370 The increased overall risk can be linked to the faster reproduction rate triggered by warming 371 temperatures, thereby extending the time frame for mosquito breeding. The observed effect of 372 environmental covariates at each lag may represent a cumulative influence from preceding 373 lags [25]. Additionally, recent extreme environmental conditions, such as prolonged rainy seasons, could also contribute to the impact on malaria burden. This finding aligns with prior 374 375 studies highlighting how disease risk temporally shifts in response to temperature variations. 376 Importantly, an increase in temperature substantially amplifies the incidence rate of malaria, 377 both in the current month and in subsequent months [24, 25, 37, 38]. The month-lagged 378 effects of temperature offer a sufficient time-frame for designing interventions to interrupt 379 malaria transmission. These findings are crucial for administering institutes like IVC/MCP-380 KP and FPHC, which are responsible for malaria control in KPK, Pakistan. Building on their 381 existing efforts in distributing bed nets, conducting IRS, and managing cases with RDTs and 382 antimalarial treatments, a targeted approach could be employed considering the seasonal 383 nature and lagged effect of temperature on malaria transmission. For instance, mass 384 distribution of bed-nets before the transmission season, IRS before the monsoon, and 385 preventive treatment administration to vulnerable groups during peak periods could 386 significantly reduce malaria burden. Additionally, timely awareness campaigns and 387 healthcare worker training can better prepare communities for early detection and prevention. 388 Some of the challenges that hinder effective malaria control in Pakistan include the misuse 389 and overuse of antimalarial drugs, the use of substandard and counterfeit medications, limited

access to healthcare and infrastructure - particularly in rural and remote areas - inadequate
vector control programmes, lack of awareness about environmental factors that favour
mosquito breeding, socioeconomic barriers, inadequate preparedness for climatic challenges
and extreme weather conditions such as rainfall and floods, and overall political and financial
instability in the country [39].

395 This study further suggests that the temperature-related attributable fraction of malaria cases

is projected to increase from 39.8 to 43.3% and from 54.1 to 57.6% for the two districts in

397 projected scenarios (SSP2 4.5) as warmer temperatures become more frequent. These

398 findings indicate the critical role of temperature in malaria transmission, also suggesting that

399 climate change is likely to exacerbate malaria transmission. Pakistan already faces a high

400 burden of malaria and other infectious diseases. An increase in malaria cases due to warming

401 temperatures could lead to higher mortality and morbidity, further straining already

402 overstretched healthcare systems and causing significant economic impacts on

403 socioeconomically vulnerable communities [39]. Additionally, under high-emission scenarios

404 (SSP2 8.5), the attributable fractions show a slight reduction, likely due to the frequent

405 occurrence of extreme temperature conditions, which may not be conducive to malaria

406 transmission.

407 Climate change is anticipated to exert both direct and indirect influences on the transmission 408 of malaria, particularly affecting the most vulnerable communities. While there is limited 409 data on the long-term ramifications of climate change on malaria transmission, recent events 410 in Pakistan illustrate how extreme weather events, specifically floods, have led to a 411 substantially increased burden of malaria. As is evident in this study, despite the gradual 412 decline in malaria from 2014 onwards, a striking surge in malaria cases was observed in 413 2022. In that year, unprecedented flooding submerged one-third of the country, causing widespread devastation and health challenges, including a significant rise in malaria [1]. The
WHO reported a more than four-fold increase in malaria cases in Pakistan in 2022 compared
to 2021, totalling over 1.6 million cases [1].

417 Climate change is expected to impact malaria transmission across various scenarios, 418 potentially affecting both traditionally endemic tropical regions and historically non-endemic 419 areas, such as higher-altitude temperate zones [40]. Warmer temperatures can accelerate 420 parasite growth cycles in mosquitoes, amplifying transmission rates and altering the overall 421 burden of the disease. Shifts in temperature, rainfall, and humidity might expand the habitat 422 range of malaria-carrying mosquitoes, leading to transmission in previously unaffected areas, 423 such as the recent resurgence of malaria cases in Europe [40]. Conversely, increase in 424 heatwaves and extremely hot days may reduce malaria transmission in highly endemic areas. 425 Temperature and humidity intricately influence mosquito life cycles, potentially increasing 426 Anopheles mosquito frequency, biting rates, and shortening the extrinsic incubation period of 427 *Plasmodium* parasites [40]. This study provides compelling evidence of how temperature 428 changes likely contributed to malaria transmission in vulnerable regions. 429 Further, the broader impacts of climate change - such as adverse health effects and 430 socioeconomic setbacks - can impede disease control efforts, potentially fostering increased 431 malaria transmission. Vulnerable populations in low and middle-income countries facing 432 economic hardship and limited access to healthcare, are particularly susceptible. The 433 compounding impacts of rising temperatures and more frequent extreme weather events, such 434 as floods, significantly influence malaria prevalence and transmission. For example, during 435 the 2022 floods in Pakistan, extreme flooding displaced individuals from their residences, 436

436 exposing them to mosquito-infested environments. The stagnant water left behind created

437 optimal breeding grounds for mosquitoes, persisting for extended periods. Additionally, the

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0950268825000111 Published online by Cambridge University Press

inundation adversely affected healthcare facilities and disrupted transportation, leaving thoseafflicted with illness without access to treatment.

440	Climate change poses a threat to the intricate interplay between natural and human systems,
441	undermining various social determinants of good health, including livelihoods, nutrition,
442	security, and access to quality health services. In countries like Pakistan, facing the
443	compounded challenges of infectious diseases and climate change, urgent evidence-based
444	studies are crucial for crafting targeted policies. These studies need to focus on the intricate
445	relationship between changing climate patterns and malaria transmission within specific
446	localities. By establishing robust surveillance systems, fostering community engagement, and
447	integrating climate-resilient strategies into healthcare infrastructure, policymakers can
448	adaptively address the evolving risks. Cross-sector collaborations and investment in capacity
449	building will be pivotal, ensuring a comprehensive approach that not only targets malaria
450	control but also strengthens resilience against the health impacts of a changing climate.

451 Limitations

This study provides empirical evidence regarding the impacts of rising temperatures on
malaria transmission in two endemic districts of Pakistan and highlights the influence of
climate change on malaria dynamics. However, several limitations in the study design should
be noted.

Firstly, this study relied on temperature data from global gridded meteorological datasets to measure temperature exposure. While this method may overlook micro-scale spatial and temporal variations in temperature that are critical for mosquito distribution, it has been successfully used in previous studies to quantify the impacts of meteorological conditions on malaria transmission [25].

461 Secondly, analysing monthly average temperatures may obscure diurnal or daily temperature

462 variability, potentially masking the immediate impact of temperature fluctuations on

463 mosquito ecology and malaria transmission.

464 Thirdly, this study did not account for all possible environmental covariates, such as altitude,

465 land-use practices like agriculture, or vector distribution, which could influence malaria

466 transmission.

467 Fourth, malaria cases were diagnosed using both RDTs and microscopy. While microscopy is

the gold standard, RDTs were used in several locations due to resource constraints and cost

469 considerations, posing a risk of including false-positive cases. However, previous studies in

470 the region have shown significant agreement between microscopy and RDT results [6].

471 Therefore, data from both sources were integrated to provide a comprehensive view of472 malaria prevalence.

Despite these limitations, this study offers valuable population-level insights crucial for
understanding the current and projected impacts of temperature on malaria transmission
dynamics. Future research should prioritise integrating more detailed microclimatic data to
better quantify the influence of temperature and relative humidity on vector density.
Conducting vector sampling across diverse regions and seasons is essential to develop a
comprehensive spatiotemporal profile of vector distribution, providing critical evidence for

479 targeted malaria control interventions.

480 **Conclusions**

481 Changing climatic patterns and consequent extreme weather events are associated with

482 malaria resurgence in Pakistan. It is imperative to estimate the climate change-attributed

- 483 increase in the risk of malaria in vulnerable regions of Pakistan. This study provides evidence
- 484 showing a direct association between monthly temperature conditions and malaria incidence

485	in the southern districts of KPK, Pakistan. Specifically, temperatures exceeding 22.4°C
486	correspond to a 9-10% increase in malaria transmission for every 1°C rise. The relationship
487	between temperature and malaria transmission is intricate and is influenced by several factors
488	such as precipitation, humidity and other local environmental conditions and human
489	behaviour. The study reveals a lagged impact of mean temperature on malaria incidence,
490	persisting for up to three months. This lagged effect is likely due to the Extrinsic Incubation
491	Period (EIP) of malaria parasites within mosquitoes and accelerated larval development. The
492	lagged effects of temperature on malaria provide a sufficient timeframe for designing
493	interventions to interrupt malaria transmission. Effective malaria control measures include
494	vector control, chemoprevention, case management, surveillance, and community
495	engagement, such as community health education campaigns. The attributable fraction of
496	malaria cases associated with higher temperatures is projected to increase. Rising
497	temperatures and extreme weather events, such as the 2022 floods in Pakistan, have already
498	shown a significant impact on malaria incidence. Urgent, evidence-based studies are needed
499	to craft targeted policies addressing the interplay between climate change and malaria
500	transmission. Policymakers should focus on establishing robust surveillance systems,
501	fostering community engagement, and integrating climate-resilient strategies into healthcare
502	infrastructure.

503 Data Availability Statement

- 504 Malaria Data were acquired from Integrated Vector Control/Malaria Control Program, KPK,
- 505 Pakistan upon request. These datasets are not publicly available but can be obtained from the
- 506 data custodians in Directorate General of Health Services, KPK, Pakistan.
- 507 Environmental data were acquired from Copernicus ERA5-Land monthly averaged data,
- 508 which are publicly available and can be downloaded from the following link:
- 509 https://cds.climate.copernicus.eu/cdsapp#!/dataset/reanalysis-era5-land-monthly-
- 510 means?tab=overview.
- 511 All relevant R code used for the analyses and results is publicly available at
- 512 <u>https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.14751632</u>
- 513 CRediT Author Statement
- 514 SHF: Conceptualisation, Data Curation, Formal Analysis, Methodology, Writing original
- 515 draft
- 516 FZ: Conceptualisation, Validation, Visualisation, Writing original draft
- 517 JR: Data Curation, Methodology, Writing- review & editing
- 518 DB: Conceptualisation, Methodology, Validation, Writing review & editing
- 519 AA: Methodology, Validation, Writing review & editing
- 520 PB: Conceptualisation, Validation, Visualisation, Writing review & editing

521 References

522	1.	World Health Organization. (2023) World malaria report 2023. Retrieved
523		November 19, 2024, Available from:
524		https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240086173.
525	2.	Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. (n.d.) Impact and burden of malaria.
526		Retrieved November 19, 2024, Available
527		from: https://www.cdc.gov/malaria/php/impact/index.html
528	3.	Parham PE, Michael E. (2010) Modeling the effects of weather and climate change
529		on malaria transmission. Environmental Health Perspectives; 118: 620-626.
530	4.	Pascual M, et al. (2008) Shifting patterns: malaria dynamics and rainfall variability
531		in an African highland. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences; 275:
532		123-132.
533	5.	Rogers DJ. (1996) Changes in disease vector distributions. In: Hulme M, editor.
534		Climate change and southern Africa: an exploration of some potential impacts and
535		implications in the SADC region. Norwich: Climate Research Unit, University of East
536		Anglia; 49-55.
537	6.	Jahan F, et al. (2019) Malaria epidemiology and comparative reliability of diagnostic
538		tools in Bannu; an endemic malaria focus in south of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan.
539		Pathogens and Global Health; 113: 75-85.
540	7.	Khan MI, et al. (2023). Malaria prevalence in Pakistan: A systematic review and
541		meta-analysis (2006–2021). Heliyon.

542	8.	Barraud PJ. (1934) The Fauna of British India, Including Ceylon and Burma.
543		Diptera Vol 5, Family Culicidae. Tribe Megarhinini and Culicini. London: Taylor and
544		Francis; 463p.
545	9.	Khan MA. (2022) Seasonal variation in species composition and relative abundance
546		of mosquitoes in the District Bannu, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan: prospects of
547		dengue fever in the study area. International Journal of Tropical Insect Science; 42:
548		2221-2231.
549	10	Dogra JR. (1938). A clinical study of malaria amongst Indian troops at Bannu Jour
550		Malaria Inst India 1(1): 119-120.
551	11.	Reisen WK, Azra K, Mahmood F. (1982) Anopheles culicifacies (Diptera:
552		Culicidae): horizontal and vertical estimates of immature development and
553		survivorship in rural Punjab Province, Pakistan. Journal of Medical Entomology; 19:
554		413-422.
555	12	Herrel N, et al. (2004) Adult anopheline ecology and malaria transmission in
556		irrigated areas of South Punjab, Pakistan. Medical and Veterinary Entomology; 18:
557		141-152.
558	13	Ejov M. (2020). National Strategic Plan for MALARIA ELIMINATION in Pakistan
559		2021-2035. Available from:
560		https://www.apmen.org/sites/default/files/all_resources/Pakistan%20National%20Stra
561		tegic%20plan%20%28NSP%20MCE%202021-2035%29.pdf
562	14	Mukhtar EM, ed. (2004) Economic analysis for a national study on malaria control
563		in Pakistan. Islamabad: Malaria Control Programme, Ministry of Health.

564	15. Sabater MJ. (2019) ERA5-Land monthly averaged data from 1950 to present.
565	Copernicus Climate Change Service (C3S) Climate Data Store (CDS). DOI:
566	10.24381/cds.68d2bb30 (Accessed on 22-03-2024).
567	16. Lawrence MG. (2005). The relationship between relative humidity and the dewpoint
568	temperature in moist air: A simple conversion and applications. Bulletin of the
569	American Meteorological Society, 86(2), 225-234.
570	17. Gasparrini A, Armstrong B, Kenward MG. (2010). Distributed lag non-linear
571	models. <i>Statistics in medicine</i> , <i>29</i> (21), 2224-2234.
572	18. Suh E, et al. (2020) The influence of feeding behaviour and temperature on the
573	capacity of mosquitoes to transmit malaria. Nature Ecology & Evolution; 4: 940-951.
574	19. Gasparrini A, Leone M. (2014) Attributable risk from distributed lag models. BMC
575	Medical Research Methodology; 14: 1-8.
576	20. World Bank Group. Climate Change Knowledge Portal. Retrieved from:
577	https://climateknowledgeportal.worldbank.org/. Date Accessed: 03 December 2023.
578	21. Gasparrini A. (2011) Distributed lag linear and non-linear models in R: the package
579	dlnm. Journal of Statistical Software; 43: 1-20.
580	22. Haq IU, et al. (2024) Modeling the effect of climatic conditions and topography on
581	malaria incidence using Poisson regression: a Retrospective study in Bannu, Khyber
582	Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. Frontiers in Microbiology; 14: 1303087.
583	23. Xiang J, et al. (2018) Association between malaria incidence and meteorological
584	factors: a multi-location study in China, 2005-2012. Epidemiology & Infection; 146:
585	89-99.

586	24. Mohammadkhani M, et al. (2016) The relation between climatic factors and malaria
587	incidence in Kerman, South East of Iran. Parasite Epidemiology and Control; 1: 205-
588	210.
589	25. Okiring J, et al. (2021) Associations between environmental covariates and temporal
590	changes in malaria incidence in high transmission settings of Uganda: a distributed
591	lag nonlinear analysis. BMC Public Health; 21: 1-11.
592	26. Mordecai EA, et al. (2013) Optimal temperature for malaria transmission is
593	dramatically lower than previously predicted. Ecology Letters; 16: 22-30.
594	27. Sehgal M, Ghosh S. (2020) Exploring the Usefulness of Meteorological Data for
595	Predicting Malaria cases in Visakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh. Weather, Climate, and
596	Society; 12: 323-330.
597	28. Hay SI, et al. (2002) Climate change and the resurgence of malaria in the East
598	African highlands. Nature; 415: 905-909.
599	29. Wang Z, et al. (2022) The relationship between rising temperatures and malaria
600	incidence in Hainan, China, from 1984 to 2010: a longitudinal cohort study. The
601	Lancet Planetary Health; 6: e350-e358.
602	30. Beloconi A, et al. (2023). Malaria, climate variability, and interventions: modelling
603	transmission dynamics. Scientific Reports, 13(1), 7367.
604	31. Babaie J, et al. (2018). A systematic evidence review of the effect of climate change
605	on malaria in Iran. Journal of parasitic diseases, 42, 331-340.
606	32. Fall P, et al. (2023) Enhancing Understanding of the Impact of Climate Change on
607	Malaria in West Africa Using the Vector-Borne Disease Community Model of the

608	International Center for Theoretical Physics (VECTRI) and the Bias-Corrected Phase
609	6 Coupled Model Intercomparison Project Data (CMIP6). Microbiology Research; 14:
610	2148-2180.
611	33. Reiter P, Sprenger D. (1987). The used tire trade: a mechanism for the worldwide
612	dispersal of container breeding mosquitoes, 494-501
612	24 Estima SU at al (2018) Dettema of accumance of denous and shilturgunus and
015	54. Fatima SH, et al. (2018). Patterns of occurrence of dengue and chikungunya, and
614	spatial distribution of mosquito vector Aedes albopictus in Swabi district, Pakistan.
615	Tropical Medicine & International Health, 23(9), 1002-1013.
616	35. Queensland Health. Guideline for the management of community outbreaks and
617	epidemics of malaria in Torres Strait. 2011 [cited June 19, 2024]. Available from:
618	https://www.health.qld.gov.au/data/assets/pdf_file/0022/444325/malaria-gl.pdf.
619	36. Paaijmans KP, et al. (2010). Influence of climate on malaria transmission depends
620	on daily temperature variation. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences,
621	107(34), 15135-15139.
622	37. Beck-Johnson LM, et al. (2013). The effect of temperature on Anopheles mosquito
623	population dynamics and the potential for malaria transmission. PLOS one, 8(11),
624	e79276.
625	38. Zhao, X., et al (2014). Characterizing the effect of temperature fluctuation on the
626	incidence of malaria: an epidemiological study in south-west China using the varying
627	coefficient distributed lag non-linear model. Malaria journal, 13, 1-10.
628	39. Vohra LI, et al. (2023). Rising cases of Dengue and Malaria in Flood Affected Areas
(2)	C. D. Listen A. M. is a Thurston the Constant's Haultheaux Contain Disector Madicine
629	of Pakistan: A Major I freat to the Country's Healthcare System. Disaster Medicine

- 631 40. Fischer L, et al. (2020). Rising temperature and its impact on receptivity to malaria
- 632 transmission in Europe: a systematic review. *Travel medicine and infectious disease*,
- *633 36*, 101815.
- 634

Projection	Climate	Scenarios	Projection	Projected	Remarks	Data Source
coverage	model		years	increase in	1	
	used			temperature		
				(AT in °C)		
Pakistan	Multi-	SSP2-4.5	2040s	1.71	Average	https://climatekn
(KPK)	Model				Mean	wledgeportal.wo
25X25 Km	Ensemble				Surface Air	dbank.org/countr
	CMIP 6				Temperature	/pakistan/climate
						data-projections
					V	
				\mathbf{N}		
		X	5			
		08	5			
	~	, , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	5			
	ß		5			
	ß		5			
	S.S.		5			

635 Table 1: Characteristics of Projected Data Obtained from World Bank's CCKP.

638 Table 2: Descriptive Statistics on Environmental Variables and Malarial Incidence Per 1000 RDTs in

639 Bannu and Lakki Marwat.

	Monthly Median (range)							
Districts	Mean		Humidity	PV Prevalence	PF	Total Cases		
	Tempera	ature	(%)	Rates per 1000	Prevalence rate	Prevalence rate		
	(°C)			RDT cases	per 1000 RDT	per 1000 RDT		
					cases	cases		
Bannu	24.60	(9.45,	51.27 (19.57,	144.93 (15.66,	2.87 (0.00,	150.19 (16.65,		
	35.05)		74.30)	1998.52)	47.30)	2008.89)		
Lakki	25.70	(10.79,	53.38 (21.58,	92.81 (19.04,	2.08 (0.26,	95.36 (19.79,		
Marwat	35.35)		76.80)	229.30)	12.40)	232.35)		

640 641

https://doi.org/10.1017/S0950268825000111 Published online by Cambridge University Press

-92

642	Table 3: Attributable Fraction of Malarial Cases Associated with Mean Temperatures in Baseline Period
643	(2014-2022) and Projected Climate Change Scenarios (2044-2052 And 2064-2072) for Bannu and Lakki
644	Marwat.

City			Attributable	Attributable	Attributable
			Fraction PV	Fraction PF	Fraction Total
					Cases
Bannu		Baseline	39.1 (21.7, 51.7)	45.3 (24.1, 59.0)	39.8 (23.2, 51.9)
	2044-2052	SSP2 4.5	41.4 (23.4, 54.2)	51.3 (27.9, 65.8)	42.2 (25.0, 54.5)
		SSP5 8.5	42.3 (24.1, 55.0)	51.8 (28.4, 66.1)	43.0 (25.7, 55.3)
	2064-2072	SSP2 4.5	42.5 (24.2, 55.3)	52.5 (28.9, 66.9)	43.3 (25.8, 55.5)
		SSP5 8.5	39.9 (23.1, 51.2)	51.6 (28.9, 64.8)	40.6 (24.6, 51.6)
Lakki Marwat		Baseline	54.0 (34.4, 68.9)	28.8 (-32.0, 66.6)	54.1 (34.6, 68.8)
	2044-2052	SSP2 4.5	55.3 (35.7, 69.8)	30.9 (-35.9, 70.7)	55.4 (36.0, 69.8)
		SSP5 8.5	57.2 (37.3, 71.7)	32.5 (-38.8, 73.7)	57.3 (37.6, 71.8)
	2064-2072	SSP2 4.5	57.4 (37.5, 72.0)	32.6 (-39.1, 74.0)	57.6 (37.7, 72.0)
		SSP5 8.5	53.4 (35.2, 66.5)	33.1 (-40.9, 74.4)	53.7 (35.5, 66.7)











