

# Israel Law Review

A journal of human rights, public and international law

## **SPECIAL ISSUE The Constitutional Crisis in Israel**

Introduction

***Malcolm N Shaw KC, Yuval Shany and Yaël Ronen***

## **SYMPOSIUM ARTICLES**

Judicial Reform or Abusive Constitutionalism in Israel

***Yaniv Roznai, Rosalind Dixon and David E Landau***

The Two Revolutions of Israel's National Identity

***Barak Medina and Ofra Bloch***

Politics in Legal Disguise

***Daniel Friedmann***

Releasing the Government from Acting Reasonably; or, the Government Says  
Goodbye to Reasonableness

***Mordechai Kremnitzer***

Constitutionalising Israel's Constitutional System

***Manal Totry-Jubran***

Political Polarisation and the Constitutional Crisis in Israel

***Iddo Porat***

The Long Hand of Anti-Corruption: Israeli Judicial Reform in Comparative Perspective

***Tom Ginsburg***

The 'Constitutional Reform' and the Occupation

***David Kretzmer***

The Constitutional Overhaul and the West Bank: Is Israel's Constitutional Moment Occupied?

***Tamar Hostovsky Brandes***

*List of articles continued on back cover*



מרכז מינרבה לזכויות האדם  
The Minerva Center for Human Rights  
مركز مينيرفا لحقوق الإنسان



Faculty of Law,  
The Hebrew University  
of Jerusalem



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

### EDITORS-IN-CHIEF

Professor Malcolm N Shaw KC, *Senior Fellow, Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge and practising barrister, Essex Court Chambers, London*  
Professor Yuval Shany, *Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

### EXECUTIVE EDITOR

Advocate Danny Evron, *Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

### ACADEMIC EDITOR

Professor Yaël Ronen, *Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

### DEPUTY EDITORS

*Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

Guy Elzam

Ohad Weschler

Rivka (Riki) Klein Bednarsh

### STUDENT EDITORS

*Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

Yonatan Adler

Noam Nadler

Hamutal Erlich

Gal Offer

Eden Ravid Freundlich

Clara Qubty

Ayelet Wimpfheimer Hadar

Shony Ranen

Abigail Halevy Laher

Naomi Shapiro

Niv Meirson

Talia Sigad

### INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY BOARD

Justice Rosalie Abella, *Supreme Court of Canada, Canada*

Professor Dapo Akande, *University of Oxford, UK*

Professor Daphne Barak-Erez, *Tel Aviv University, Israel*

Professor Eyal Benvenisti, *University of Cambridge, UK*

*and Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

Professor Jutta Brunnée, *University of Toronto, Canada*

Professor Tom Ginsburg, *University of Chicago, USA*

Professor Dr Ivana Jelić, *European Court of Human Rights*

Professor Michael Karayanni, *Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

Professor Kieran McEvoy, *Queen's University Belfast, UK*

Professor Barak Medina, *Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

Justice Professor Andreas Paulus, *Federal Constitutional Court of Germany, Germany*

Professor Anne Peters, *Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law, Heidelberg, Germany*

Professor Monica Pinto, *University of Buenos Aires, Argentina*

Professor Yutaka Takahashi-Arai, *Brussels School of International Studies (BSIS), University of Kent, Belgium*

Professor Mohammed Wattad, *Zefat Academic College, Israel*

Focusing on law in times of tension and conflict, the *Israel Law Review* is a leading publication in the field of human rights, public law and international law.

The *Review* is a peer-reviewed journal with a long-standing reputation for excellence, and attracts a combination of established authors and new voices writing on cutting-edge topics. It is the oldest and most acclaimed Israeli law journal published in English, established in 1966.

The *Israel Law Review* is published under the auspices and management of the Minerva Center for Human Rights at the Law Faculty of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. Under this stewardship, it focuses on scholarship in the fields of human rights, public law and international law. It also examines the application of legal norms under conditions of conflict and political uncertainty, highlighting the relevance of the Israeli experience in these fields to other parts of the world and that of other societies to Israel.

# ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

---

---

Volume 56

Number 3

2023

---

---

## SPECIAL ISSUE The Constitutional Crisis in Israel

### Introduction

*Malcolm N Shaw KC, Yuval Shany and Yaël Ronen* ..... 289

### SYMPOSIUM ARTICLES

#### Judicial Reform or Abusive Constitutionalism in Israel

*Yaniv Roznai, Rosalind Dixon and David E Landau* ..... 292

#### The Two Revolutions of Israel's National Identity

*Barak Medina and Ofra Bloch* ..... 305

#### Politics in Legal Disguise

*Daniel Friedmann* ..... 320

#### Releasing the Government from Acting Reasonably; or, the Government Says Goodbye to Reasonableness

*Mordechai Kremnitzer* ..... 343

#### Constitutionalising Israel's Constitutional System

*Manal Totry-Jubran* ..... 355

#### Political Polarisation and the Constitutional Crisis in Israel

*Iddo Porat* ..... 369

#### The Long Hand of Anti-Corruption: Israeli Judicial Reform in Comparative Perspective

*Tom Ginsburg* ..... 385

#### The 'Constitutional Reform' and the Occupation

*David Kretzmer* ..... 397

#### The Constitutional Overhaul and the West Bank: Is Israel's Constitutional Moment Occupied?

*Tamar Hostovsky Brandes* ..... 415

#### Is There a 'Constitutional Moment' in Israel and Hungary?

*Gábor Halmai* ..... 426

Reforming the Israeli High Court of Justice: Proposed versus Desirable	
<i>Joshua Segev</i> .....	440
The Attempt to Capture the Courts in Israel	
<i>Guy Lurie</i> .....	456
Reflections on Constitutional Adjudication in a Democracy	
<i>Andreas Paulus</i> .....	471
An Overview of Israel's 'Judicial Overhaul': Small Parts of a Big Populist Picture	
<i>Suzie Navot</i> .....	482
Populist Constitutionalism and the Judicial Overhaul in Israel	
<i>Yaniv Roznai and Amichai Cohen</i> .....	502
Israel's Constitutional Moment	
<i>Yoav Dotan</i> .....	521

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The *Israel Law Review* gratefully acknowledges the financial assistance provided by the permanent endowment fund established by Abraham D. Slavitt of Norwalk, Connecticut, USA, in memory of his beloved wife, Jennie A. Slavitt; by the Minerva Foundation, through the Minerva Center for Human Rights at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem; by the Faculty of Law at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem; and by the Bruce W. Wayne Chair in International Law at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem.