

## Reviews of books

Editors:

PETER BORSAY and BARRY DOYLE

Dept of History, University College of Wales Lampeter, Ceredigion, SA48 7ED  
School of Law, Arts and Humanities, University of Teesside, Middlesbrough,  
TS1 3BA

**David J. Siddle (ed.)**, *Migration, Mobility and Modernization*. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2000. viii + 225pp. 35 figures. 23 tables. £32.00 hbk, £14.95 pbk.

DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802212109

Small is beautiful. The 'big picture' has been distorted by the methodological deficiencies of our previous approaches to the past, and the certainties of previous laws and models rendered decidedly unstable under an increasingly critical – and inventive – modern academic gaze. So at least we might read the general import of this varied collection of essays brought together as the latest volume in the *Liverpool Studies in European Population* series. Eight substantive, profusely (though not always clearly) illustrated articles are included, offering at times close and complex analyses of frequently unconventional textual and statistical sources relating to mobility, kinship and life-cycle issues in various urban and rural contexts in central and western Europe during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Much of the material is explicitly urban (Vienna, Dublin, Rheims, Liverpool), but one of the welcome aspects of the book is the authors' emphasis on individual experience, and the way migrants moved if not always easily then certainly repeatedly between different places, communities and cultural worlds, destabilizing as they went any modern attempt to represent their life histories in manichean terms of 'town' and 'country' or 'farming' and 'industry'. Thus in challenging conventional readings of Alpine outmigration which see this in terms of crisis response in marginal upland economies and the periodic 'decanting' of surplus population into the urban network, Fontaine and Siddle argue that some at least of these movements were in fact articulated by persistent, complex, kinship-based trading networks. These survived from the sixteenth to the nineteenth centuries and linked major merchant houses – themselves of migrant origin – in towns such as Lyons and Strasbourg with upland communities in Savoy and elsewhere. In Vienna, similar external connectivities also survived the onset of factory-based industrialization. Ehmer uses Viennese guild and trade association records to demonstrate the importance throughout the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries of long-distance flows of 'tramping artisans' in supplying the city's fluctuating demand for labour in trades such as baking, cabinet-making and tailoring. Perceived as a potential threat to civic order, artisans were closely regulated through a system of travel documentation or *Kunderschaften*, later *Wanderbüchen*. By contrast, in contemporary Lancashire, Langton shows that the rapid and uneven expansion of coal

production in the south-west of the county was characterized by a strongly localized labour culture, which was grounded in an economy part urban, part rural. Clannish, well paid and 'feckless', miners enjoyed a high degree of self-regulation over their own informal working practices. Here, Langton argues, local ethnographies were synthesized by industrialization, not broken down by it.

This theme of localism, of specific migrant experience in particular places, inflects the remaining chapters. Pooley and Turnbull reassess the importance of towns to the migration process in north-west England since the early eighteenth century, using for the purpose several thousand 'longitudinal' life histories solicited from genealogists and family historians – itself an interesting tactic of potentially wider utility. Their conclusion, that most movements were between small places of much the same size, involving short-term circulatory shifts invisible to earlier census-based analyses concurs with Ashcroft and Lewis' more detailed study of eighteenth-century migrant behaviour in Liverpool, and Prunty's analysis of female mobility in nineteenth-century Dublin. Both chapters demonstrate the sheer complexity of the moves that might be made by ordinary and therefore generally anonymous people within the fragmented and imbricated urban worlds of modern historic Europe. Smyth's chapter on rural inheritance and mobility in nineteenth-century Tipperary reminds us that these moves might connect with equally teeming and unstable rural worlds.

**Lindsay J. Proudfoot**

Queen's University, Belfast

**David Allen (ed.)**, *Ipswich Borough Archives 1255–1835. A Catalogue*. Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2000. ix + 611pp. 4 plates. 24 figures. £45.00.

DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802222105

However much historians dispute the value of one another's findings, research methods and interpretations, there is no denying the universal appreciation of those who smooth the way to important sources. Researchers in many different fields will have reason to thank David Allen and the Suffolk Records Society for this excellent catalogue of the archives of the Corporation of Ipswich.

Published to mark the 800th anniversary of Ipswich's first royal charter, this volume presents a much needed re-cataloguing of one of the richest borough archives in England. The new catalogue reveals the collection's vast range of materials relating to the borough's evolving constitutional status as well as the political, judicial and administrative activities of its courts and officers from the first royal charter to the dissolution of the ancient corporation in 1835. The archive also includes the substantial records of the town's many charities from the thirteenth to the nineteenth centuries. These records trace the evolution of Ipswich from a medieval cloth town to a distribution centre and gentry resort sustained by the agricultural boom of the eighteenth century. As the catalogue suggests, there is much in this archive that will be of interest to social, economic and cultural historians, as well as researchers concerned more directly with urban politics and governance.

The arrangement of the catalogue and the compiler's notes will greatly assist researchers new to this type of archive and who might otherwise be daunted by the sometimes arcane and technically fraught corporation records. The old catalogue's fourteen sections have been reduced to six, and the compiler has laudably not adhered to strict archival principles, so that documents have been organized by subject rather than by the office or agency which produced or received them. Thus land and window tax records fall under the heading of 'taxation' within the section entitled 'Status, Title, and External Obligations', rather than under 'Justice and the Courts', even though they are formally records of the General Sessions. A detailed list of catalogue contents and cross-referencing in the notes ensures that researchers will be able to locate related documents which are listed under other headings.

The brief essays which preface many sections of the catalogue and the notes on various items within the collection provide a highly informed commentary on the archive. The changing nature of various classes of records, their production, function and custody is explained in ways most helpful to those unfamiliar with these types of sources. Indeed, taken together, these notes provide a very informative guide to the institutional history of the corporation and related bodies of governance in Ipswich from the thirteenth to the nineteenth centuries. The volume also includes essays on the governance of Ipswich from its origins to c. 1550 by Geoffrey Martin, and from c. 1550 to 1835 by Frank Grace. The essays usefully explain the constitutional and political context in which the borough records developed.

This handsome, well-produced volume contains four colour plates and twenty-four black and white illustrations of various documents. These will further whet researchers' appetites for a trip to the Suffolk Record Office at Ipswich to explore the borough archive.

**David Clemis**

Workers' Educational Association

**Diana Dunn (ed.)**, *War and Society in Medieval and Early Modern Britain*. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2000. ix + 213pp. 3 figures. Bibliography. Index. £32.00 hbk, £14.95 pbk.  
DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802232101

This is a very enjoyable collection of essays exploring the social aspects of war: raising issues of military professionalism alongside gender, topography, reportage, nationality and race. The book comprises nine essays grouped into three temporal units, centring upon the civil wars of Stephen and Matilda; the Wars of the Roses; and the Civil Wars of the seventeenth century. The international context is recognized and thus one essay looks at the latter stages of the Hundred Years War.

Military professionalism and chivalry is examined by Hugh Collins in his study of the argument between the Earl of Shrewsbury and Sir John Fastolf. The latter's retreat during the battle of Patay was a natural reaction for a man who combined chivalric duty with the need to have a profitable career, but could be considered at odds with duty to the Prince. Gender considerations of military service are discussed by Diana Dunn who asks important questions about

Margaret of Anjou's role in the military affairs of the fifteenth century. Dunn sets Margaret within the context of her militaristic predecessors and the role of women married to weak husbands. It is an issue that could be usefully pursued with regard to her successors. Philip Morgan addresses the question of naming battlefields and the relationship between this and the loss of some sites. Locating battles with no specific geographical links suffers from the decline of the dominant ideology with which the original battle-name was associated.

The important contribution of reportage to historical understanding is well explored by Christopher Allmand who suggests that changes in reporting war coincided with the extension of the effects of war to a wider society. The church's attempts to promote peace and order during the anarchy of Stephen's reign, sometimes out of self-interest, is examined in an essay by Paul Dalton, whilst Graeme White discusses county and regional administration by focusing on the appointment of earls during the conflict. Nationality and race are the focus of essays by Matthew Bennett and Mark Stoyle. Bennett looks at the treatment of foreign nationals fighting as mercenaries or agents of political masters in England. The vilification heaped upon them seems to have overemphasized their contribution to these wars and often sprang from the conflict of military cultures, which their employment brought to the attention of contemporaries. Stoyle's essay is another important contribution to the issues of race during the civil wars in Britain and Ireland, so much of which has already come from his pen.

For the urban historian it is the latter chapter, Peter Gaunt's essay on Montgomery during the Civil Wars, which will hold most interest. Montgomery, whilst one of the region's important centres, had only 500 or 600 inhabitants. It was a parliamentary borough, but needed the assistance of the county's other boroughs to pay the MP a wage. Civil war brought about the destruction of the fabric of the castle which dominated the town: it also saw the decline of the Herbert family's dominance of the town's oligarchy, leaving Montgomery to develop as a bustling market town after the Restoration. The collection is an important set of essays, useful to anyone working or teaching in the field of war and society.

**Martyn Bennett**

Nottingham Trent University

**Trevor Dean (ed.)**, *The Towns of Italy in the Later Middle Ages. Selected Sources Translated and Annotated*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2000. ix + 252pp. 1 map. Bibliography. £45.00 hbk, £15.99 pbk.  
DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802242108

A valuable 'transferable skill' once encouraged in many British universities was the ability to study history through a foreign language. This has long ago been benchmarked out of the system, but what still remains – at least for now – is an appreciation of the value of studying primary sources, albeit in translation. Here students and teachers of late medieval and Renaissance Italian history are relatively well provided for, with sources available in English on history, literature, humanism, political thought and the fine arts. There are also useful collections of documents on Florence (Brucker) and Venice (Chambers and Pullan).

In this book Dean increases the range of accessible source material, even if the 'towns' covered are mostly cities, and largely drawn from the more familiar north of Italy. The documents chosen are from the period c. 1250–c. 1400 and touch on a wide range of issues reflecting clearly the author's own wide and perceptive reading. They are also drawn from a variety of source material: poetry, statutes and ordinances, chronicles, account books. Some documents are grouped under more traditional headings, for example the promotion of local industries appears in the section on the 'Urban economy' while the election of a doge of Venice is described under the heading of 'Political structures'. Other documents chosen reflect more recent historical interests and fashions; so 'Cross dressing' is found under 'Social organisation and tensions' and the provision of clean drinking water in Perugia under 'The physical environment and social services'.

There are, however, some strange omissions. Although the collection is concerned with towns and cities, their dependence on the countryside – where most of the population lived, even in heavily urbanized Tuscany or Lombardy – is not acknowledged. If a few documents deal with the issues of the environment and health, there ought to have been more recognition of the impact of plague and disease. The presence of signorial households and courts in most of the cities of northern Italy in the period deserves fuller coverage, and it is strange that the impact of war and taxation – major and growing preoccupations of urban communities of every size and type – is ignored.

Dean keeps introductory material and bibliographical references to a minimum, but in the case of the former that should probably be welcomed, though his comments are consistently lively, well informed and perceptive. Students too often cling on to editorial remarks rather than confronting the texts themselves. That comment is offered by a reviewer who has used this collection for teaching. It proved extremely useful, if some of the documents are 'meatier' than others, while in other cases – for example on sumptuary legislation – the coverage was perhaps rather too generous. Throughout the translations read well, and at an affordable price this collection is likely to enhance the teaching, not only of later medieval Italy, but of such subjects as urban history, and lay piety, which is well documented here.

**J.E. Law**

University of Wales, Swansea

*Das Königreich der Täufer. Reformation und Herrschaft der Täufer in Münster.* Münster: Stadtmuseum Münster, 2000. 2 vols. 252pp; 240pp. Over 200 plates. Bibliography. No price stated.

DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802252104

The rise of the Anabaptist Kingdom of Münster was an event unique in the history of the Reformation. Only in the Westphalian city of Münster did the radical evangelical tradition succeed in establishing a religious community true to the principles of its faith. From February 1534 to June 1535, as both Catholic and Lutheran forces lay siege to the town, the Anabaptist faithful effected a complete transformation of the social and religious relations of the day. The impact on contemporary perception was immediate, and the legacy for the European imagination, as the two volumes under review demonstrate, has been

profound. *Das Königreich der Täufer* is the companion text to the recent exhibition that was held in the Stadtmuseum Münster. The aim of both the text and the exhibition was to extend the fruits of recent research to the public. As the museum director Barbara Rommé explains in the introduction, the main purpose in mind was to illustrate both the event itself, the actual history of the Anabaptist kingdom, and the understanding of the event as its memory has been passed down the centuries. Six essays guide the reader through the collection. In addition, there are over 200 exhibits, each with substantial supporting text, ranged according to the themes discussed. Wilhelm Ribhegge surveys the condition of the Empire on the eve of the Anabaptist kingdom. He reminds us how polarized the religious culture of Germany was during this period, and how many different forces and figures converged on Münster in the spring of 1534. Ralf Klötzer follows this overview with a more detailed study of the Reformation in the city. In its origins, the evangelical movement in Münster was similar to those experienced in the rest of urban Germany. In its course of development, however, as tensions in the town intensified and divisions between the council and the bishop broadened, the reform initiative in Münster took its own fateful course. The result, as Klötzer illustrates in the third contribution, was the Kingdom of the Anabaptists in Münster, the one location in Europe where the so-called radical evangelical tradition was able to set itself up as the dominant community of worship. The history of this community is well known; less well known, however, is how events have been perceived by later generations. This is the concern of the second volume. Bernd Thier begins with a look at how the city itself has come to terms with its famous past. Much can be learned about Münster's developing sense of identity by examining its own understanding of the Anabaptist kingdom. Equally, as Katja Schupp demonstrates in the piece which follows, historians can learn much about broader aspects of European culture over the years by looking at the myriad ways in which commentators – from historians, artists, composers, journalists, to politicians – have portrayed the event. The volume ends with a final contribution by Bernd Thier, a critical study of how the history of the Anabaptist Kingdom has been cast in images and illustrations throughout the years. Like the rest of the contributions, Thier's essay provides the reader with a balanced and informative introduction to the collection of museum exhibits which follow.

The Stadtmuseum Münster has put together a fascinating exhibition, and the publication does an excellent job of guiding the reader through the history of the kingdom. The contributions are lucid, the shorter essays provide a helpful context for understanding the individual items, and the reader is reminded throughout that this is more than just a collection of antiquities. There are two histories on display: the history of the Anabaptist Kingdom in Münster, in itself one of the epochal events of the Reformation age, and the history of its perception, from the early confessional histories to the later novels, poems, operas and television serials. For the people of Münster it has not always been a welcome memory, but it refuses to fade away, and the Anabaptist Kingdom continues to preoccupy the European imagination. Indeed, there could not be better testimony to the lasting resonance of the event than the collection of essays and exhibits assembled in *Das Königreich der Täufer*.

**C. Scott Dixon**

The Queen's University of Belfast

**Christine Kooi**, *Liberty and Religion. Church and State in Leiden's Reformation, 1572–1620*. Leiden: Brill, 2000. xii + 243pp. Bibliography. Approx. £48.00.

DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802262100

In what ways and to what extent was the Dutch Reformed Church able to provide the spiritual expression of a new-born European republican state generated in a libertarian revolution, of which Kooi's Leiden was the iconic urban symbol, the Boston of the Dutch War of Independence from 1572 onwards? Calvinism provided the moral spine for resistance to Catholic Spain, but amidst the confessional heterogeneity of the emergent Dutch Republic, the Reformed Church sought to maintain its sacramental purity by restricting its fullest membership to a professing elite. Coming from a different direction, the Republic's political constitution, the inter-provincial alliance against Philip II, the Union of Utrecht of 1579, had the effect of making church membership voluntary by barring coercion into membership, and, clearly, large numbers of Dutch citizens took advantage of this novel freedom, 50 per cent of Haarlem people in 1620 not being members of any church. Celebrated for their anticipations of modernity, did Dutch urban communities, in a society half of whose population was urbanized, point towards the extensive de-sacralization of modern European civic life? Christine Kooi's meticulously scholarly study of Leiden's process of Reformation between the later sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries points us assuredly in the direction of answers.

Undergoing an industrial renaissance as a key centre of the new draperies and as a powerhouse of the vitality of the United Provinces' economy under independence from Spain, early modern Leiden was a magnet for economic migrants from the reconquered Habsburg South Netherlands, people who were also reputed to bring a sharply edged Calvinism with them. If they did, they found in the Holland textile metropolis, which had upheld a characteristically vigorous Dutch late medieval urban Catholic piety, strong manifestations of the Catholicism that they might have thought they had left behind in Flanders and Brabant: the city, with thirty Mass centres by 1641, was a front runner in the vigorous seventeenth-century Dutch Catholic revival and Catholics there, as elsewhere in Dutch cities in the Golden Age, were proscribed – and irrepressible.

However, reinvigorated Catholicism was not the sole feature of Leiden's complex religious sociology, for Mennonite Baptist and Lutheran congregations were only two of the sectarian minorities that coexisted alongside the evolving schism over grace and election amongst the Dutch Reformed themselves. As in the other Netherlands cities surveyed by Kooi in this fine book, the major challenge for the city government – a remarkably durable oligarchy throughout revolt and Reformation – was to maintain an internal civic peace of religion, magisterial fingers held in the Leiden dike holding back the potentially destructive floods of religious pluralism. As Kooi shows in this thorough and readable study, the function and achievement of the civic state of Leiden, in its *cura religionis*, was to uphold on its own watch the conditions of intercommunal truce that made the Dutch Republic such an astonishing spectacle to its visitors.

**Michael Mullett**

University of Lancaster



**Pierre de la Ruffinière du Prey**, *Hawksmoor's London Churches. Architecture and Theology*. Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 2000. xviii + 179pp. 12 colour plates. 65 figures. Bibliography. No price stated.

DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802272107

This is a handsomely produced and significant book. It is of crucial importance to historians of London because the six white-limestone churches designed by Hawksmoor, which were commissioned as part of the 50 new churches act of 1711 to provide new areas of population growth with places of worship, were features of the capital's skyline in the eighteenth century, and they still have a visual impact today. The author is an architectural historian who has immersed himself in the primary and secondary literature relating to religious and theological debates of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries and the result is an extremely impressive interdisciplinary study which explores the impact of theology and architectural design on one another. The book is divided into three parts. The first discusses Wren's influence on Hawksmoor and the general interest in the period in the ancient wonders of the world. The second looks at the work of the commissioners and Hawksmoor's connections with them. The third focuses on the churches themselves, and pays especial attention to the design of the steeples. The book's central argument is to demonstrate the importance of the primitive Church on the thinking of the parliamentary commissioners and to show how Hawksmoor translated theological ideas into architectural form through what du Prey calls 'imaginary restitution'. The urge to return to the purity of the primitive church fascinated Anglicans of the period, and allying themselves with early Christianity was one way of countering the threats of Roman Catholicism and nonconformity.

Hawksmoor (who never went abroad) had been educated by Wren and both architects were fascinated by accounts of the primitive churches in the near east, most notably by travellers, and his churches resembled primitive Christian ones as he imagined they must have looked: with a powerful sense of mass, a love of overall symmetry and strict east-west orientation. Du Prey shows clearly how Hawksmoor was able to fuse classical and Christian elements in his designs. Pliny's description of the mausoleum at Halicanassus took form in the church tower of St George's Bloomsbury and in the same church Hawksmoor was influenced by ideas about the Temple of Jerusalem. On the latter, Hawksmoor was well read in seventeenth-century temple studies and was aware of the vogue for primitivism by authorities such as William Beveridge and William Cave. Du Prey has some fascinating accounts of Hawksmoor's planning and design techniques. He suggests that in the variety of forms, shapes and styles in his steeples, Hawksmoor was expressing the idea of early Christian builders piecing together a church tower out of remains taken from antique temples. At Christ Church, Spitalfields, for example, the tower resembles an obelisk as much as a medieval spire. This, for du Prey, confirms Hawksmoor's understanding of the Christian Middle Ages as growing out of the classical period rather than reacting against it. Hawksmoor's own eclectic style can be seen to have been inspired by what he believed to have been an 'early Christian freewheeling architectural practice' and this encouraged him to depart from the canon. Du Prey has provided us with what is likely to be the definitive study of the intellectual



context behind the design of Hawksmoor's London churches. It will, however, remain to be seen how far social historians of the city are convinced by his argument that Hawksmoor took pains to match the design of his churches and steeples to the social context of the church's location. While in fashionable Bloomsbury or the conservative City, his churches, we are told, had allusions to Greek and Latin, those he designed for the East End were more humble, being designed, according to du Prey, in an 'architectural cockney'.

**Jeremy Gregory**

University of Manchester

**Peter King**, *Crime, Justice, and Discretion in England 1740–1820*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000. xiv + 383pp. 18 figures. 53 tables. £55.00.  
DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802282103

Over the past fifteen years or so Peter King has, in a series of incisive and important articles, established himself as one of the leading experts on the history of crime in eighteenth-century England. These articles, it was generally known, were the precursors of a major work whose publication was eagerly awaited among historians of crime and, more generally, among historians with an interest in eighteenth-century society. Their high expectations have been met by a powerful, well-researched, and massively thoughtful and insightful book which makes a contribution of fundamental importance to our understanding of the functioning of criminal justice in eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century England.

King bases his findings on records relating to the county of Essex. His main concern is with offences against property: property crime, he contends convincingly, was a centrally important and culturally contested aspect of the criminal law in this period. Successive chapters explore a number of major themes relevant to the prosecution of such offences. Thus pretrial processes are examined in a chapter dealing with victims, informal negotiations and prosecution options, the role of victims being further examined in a chapter dealing with the resources available to them, the most important of these being public funding, the associations for prosecution which flourished in the period, the use of advertisements in local newspapers, and police agencies. This section is rounded off by an analysis of that hitherto little-known topic, the practices of magistrates and summary courts. The second part of the book deals more specifically with property offences and offenders. King links fluctuations in these to patterns of deprivation, arguing that years of dearth, like years of demobilization after a war, did not necessarily lead to a rise in property offences and that, although such connections could sometimes be made, it was variations in the levels of willingness of victims to prosecute which was the key to fluctuations in levels of recorded crime. Part three, entitled 'From trial to punishment', deals with trials, verdicts and courtroom interactions; with sentencing policy, and especially how sentencing policy was affected by the age and gender of the offender; with pardoning policies; and with the rituals of punishment. Finally, a conclusion attempts to bring the main themes of the book together in a discussion of the interplay of law and social relations in the period in question.

This is a big, detailed and well-produced work, full of figures and tables, very

much the type of thoroughly researched monographs which one is delighted are still being produced. King argues, to some extent following lines pioneered by Edward Thompson, that the law was a multiple use-right and constituted not a single entity but rather a series of cultural processes. Above all, King's interpretation emphasizes that the law-enforcement system in this period was essentially a discretionary one. He acknowledges that discretionary elements are present in many (indeed, one suspects all) such systems, but he argues that, as far as England was concerned, the eighteenth century, certainly if the focus is on property offences, could be regarded as the golden age of discretionary justice. He contends that the high acquittal rates which obtained up to about 1800, as well as the bringing of partial verdicts by juries and the high proportion of indictments not found points to a high level of nullification and mitigation of prosecutions by jurors. Moreover, this was a period when judges had access to a wider range of sentencing options than ever before, and that in particular heavy use was made of reprieves and pardons. Such findings are not, perhaps, particularly novel, but the detailed analysis of how the criminal justice system operated which King provides certainly is. Constantly, the reader is struck by the depth of King's research, his knowledge of the sources, his ability to throw new light on familiar problems, and his sheer historical imagination. Dealing as it does with what was essentially a rural county, the work may have little direct relevance to urban history: yet it remains an important book and an admirable piece of scholarship.

**J.A. Sharpe**

University of York

**Shani D'Cruze (ed.)**, *Everyday Violence in Britain, 1850–1950*. Harlow: Pearson Education, 2000. xii + 233pp. Bibliography. £17.99.

**Yvonne Svanstrom**, *Policing Public Women. The Regulation of Prostitution in Stockholm 1812–1880*. Stockholm: Atlas Akademi, 2000. xix + 502pp. 10 figures. 14 tables. 2 maps. No price stated.

DOI: 10.1017/S096392680229210X

Shani D'Cruze's *Everyday Violence in Britain, 1850–1950* is divided into three sections – the uses of violence, the regulation of violence and the representation of violence – and provides a major contribution to the debate about the history of violence. This is a wide-ranging book which achieves a high degree of coherence as a result of the editor's expressed policy: to examine the experience of violence by exploring the 'history of how violence impinged on people's lives' and to move away from the position where women are regarded as the inevitable victims of crime to an altogether more nuanced approach where routine categorizations of class and gender are found to be inadequate.

The book gains immensely from an introductory chapter that outlines the prevailing political, social, economic and legal frameworks within which everyday violence took place. Thereafter, the best chapters are those which use research to provide a historical critique of cultures that were specific in time and place – here writers keep to chronological conventions and do not presume that what was true at the beginning of the nineteenth century can be applied to any later period, let alone to the twentieth century. Of course, the law may be made in

one decade but the ways in which it is enacted (or ignored) reflect the political, social and economic climate of the time.

Margaret Arnot's chapter on new-born child murder in Victorian England adds a psychological dimension to the tragic story of a domestic servant who killed her new-born baby. This is the story of Elizabeth Cronwell, aged 38, who gives birth to her baby in a chamber pot and disposes of the dead body in a water closet. Margaret Arnot's fascinating research into Elizabeth's frame of mind sharpens our understanding about attitudes towards single mothers, about female poverty and about lack of control over reproduction. Strangely, this moving story of one individual coping in distressing circumstances puts into focus much of what we already know about the effects of industrialization and urbanization on social cohesion. Lucy Bland's research into the murder trial of a white woman who allegedly killed her Egyptian husband is a paradigm of feminist research methodology and provides perceptive comments on the complexities of gender and 'race'. Of course, history is about continuity as well as change as Kim Stevenson's chapter on legal and public perceptions of sexual violence affirms. She all too clearly demonstrates how rape victims have always had to defend their reputations in court, and how the depressingly patriarchal nature of the British legal system affects public attitudes to the detriment of fairness and justice.

In a book so wide-ranging it is not surprising to find some variation in the quality of chapters. Catherine Euler's chapter, which examines a number of leading reformers including Butler and Hopkins, somehow disappoints and seems less fresh than might be expected – the fact that both Butler and Hopkins have been so thoroughly researched by other colleagues may account for this. In some cases a writer's interests exceed the 1850–1950 boundary. For example, Anna Clark's research into wife-beating seems altogether too rooted in the early nineteenth century as the Old Bailey Session Papers that form the base of her argument all date before 1850.

Judith Rowbotham's examination of Victorian stereotypes of violence is wonderfully provocative – indeed, one of the most powerful subtexts within this book is the message that the history of violence is an exciting and fertile area for further research. Joanne Jones' excellent chapter on sexual violence against women in Manchester will no doubt stimulate future researchers to examine sexual violence in other major cities. There is work to be done on the history of the NSPCC and on the everyday violence that prostituted women undoubtedly faced. For those who – like me – believe that the history of violence has the potential to become a major area of development within women's history, this book makes a notable and engaging starting point. It deserves to be widely read.

Yvonne Svanstrom's *Policing Public Women: The Regulation of Prostitution in Stockholm 1812–1880* explores the way that once Stockholm's authorities had become fearful that venereal disease would spread throughout their city and maybe beyond, they decided to attach the blame to prostitutes and to introduce a regime for regulating their behaviour. The book is divided into four main sections. The first section outlines the historiography, the methodology and the intellectual framework of the study as well as providing a useful geographical contextualization of Stockholm in the period under investigation; the second section examines the regulatory framework of Sweden and other European countries; the third

discusses the various, and changing, discourses surrounding the issues of prostitution; and the last section analyses the actual policing of prostitutes.

Svanstrom uses Carole Patemen's sexual contract theory as an analytical framework for her discussion of the regulation of prostitution in Stockholm and the similarities between Sweden and the rest of Europe are very evident throughout her analysis. Prostitution was seen to be the major cause of venereal disease and prostitutes the main carriers of infection, so that women in Stockholm were forced to submit to medical examinations and were sent to the *kurhus* (lock hospital) for treatment. Of course it is important not to underestimate geographical, as well as historical, specificity. Prostituted women in other parts of Sweden were charged under local fornication laws – for illegitimate sexual intercourse offended against certain by-laws and a woman who had 'let herself be used for fornication' could find herself arrested, sentenced to forced labour and, if the offence was repeated, flogged.

There were other interesting differences across Sweden. Stockholm was thought to be more tolerant of sexual nonconformity than elsewhere so that long-term liaisons came to be called 'Stockholm marriages'. But in 1812, although a Royal Circular stated that both men and women were responsible for the spread of venereal disease, in practice it was women, rather than men, who were taken into custody and subjected to inspection. In the 1830s, the Royal Health Committee 'genderized' venereal disease by making clear that it was women who were responsible for its spread: their report proposed that women working in inns, coffee houses and taverns should be medically examined. In 1838, Stockholm established two municipal brothels to control prostitution further – the *Stadt Hamburg* and the *London* were supervised by the police and medically inspected by physicians. At the same time although women were officially allowed to walk around the city freely, in practice they were barred from walking around the area of the royal castle, around the sidewalk in front of the Opera house and around certain hotels. A number of other streets were also out of bounds. In 1847, a medical Inspection Bureau was established and in 1859 a separate division within the police force was set up called the Prostitution Police. By the 1870s this had become a well-organized tyranny and women were regularly apprehended on suspicion of being venereally infected.

This impressively researched book details the full legal, medical and governmental responses to one particular problem: how to control the spread of venereal disease. Prostitutes in Sweden, as elsewhere, were regarded as contaminants and were detained, examined and treated in extremely humiliating circumstances. Today the situation is reversed. In 1999, Sweden outlawed the purchase – not the selling – of sexual services: the men who used prostitutes, and not the prostitutes themselves, were criminalized and began to experience the stigma of shame, revulsion and humiliation which, until then, had been reserved exclusively for women.

**Paula Bartley**

University of Wolverhampton

**Peter C. Baldwin**, *Domesticating the Street: The Reform of Public Space in Hartford, 1850–1930*. Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 1999. 336pp.  
DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802302104

The relationship between public space and the regulation of the streetscape has increasingly become a focus for historians of social reform, architecture, and cultural geography. Hence, the work of Elizabeth Wilson (for London) and Timothy Gilfoyle (for New York) has explored the historical development of the fight for control of urban space, but also the way in which the growth and diversification of the city has been fundamentally embedded in notions of reform, politics, gender and commerce. For many such historians the great age of urban renewal has been from the mid-nineteenth century. Such fundamental changes to the urban infrastructure as those wrought by the new traffic systems and slum clearance were both the result and the cause of the shifts recorded and explored in Baldwin's book on Hartford, Connecticut. Baldwin presents the development of Hartford's streets in the language of conflict. Thus by the 1930s, he argues, community and vitality (however venal) had been replaced by segregation and zoning, neighbourhoods became defined by the tracks of the new automobile age. Inadvertently, through their pacification of street-life, their 'domestication' of space, Hartford's reformers had privatized public space: 'Space within metropolitan Hartford became increasingly segregated and narrowly defined for specific functions' (p. 266). Baldwin's account, however, is not a simple requiem for a lost age of community and sociability, swept aside by modernity. Rather, as he points out, the reform of public space was rooted in antithetical notions of how such space should be used. In this sense, this work has much in common with similar explorations of the reform of working-class streets and institutions in cities like New York and London. He is concerned with the way in which cities became more orderly by the early twentieth century. Control of vice, zoning of street commercial activity, the regulation and segregation of play, were all areas in which reformers and city fathers worked together to achieve 'social harmony'. What interests Baldwin is the motivation behind this reforming enterprise. He emphasizes the role of actors rather than space, thus the reform campaigns of Congregationalist pastor Horace Bushnell, with his aim of reinstating 'civic harmony', mark the starting point for Baldwin's exploration. A central theme in this discussion is the conflict of gendered uses and appropriations of public space. As in Wilson's work, women were the focus of attempts to purify the city: moreover, anti-prostitution, or the control of vice, provided an alternative sphere, a space of reform in which the middle-class women involved in the Women's Aid Society (formed in 1878) could conquer their wayward sisters. Bushnell himself had focused his reordering of Hartford on the family trope, his vision of a domestic space brought outdoors, 'a way of extending female values outside the home' (p. 26). The first part of this book, consequently, is a careful account of what Baldwin sees as the 'feminisation' of Hartford's streets, tracing the evolution from Bushnell's prioritizing of female values to the politicization of middle-class female moral reformers, and by extension, the emergence of suffrage, particularly in the shape of Katherine Houghton Hepburn. It might be said that Baldwin's analysis offers little advance on the accounts mentioned earlier. Certainly a more comparative framework would have been welcome. However, he does not limit his discussion to the Victorian

purity campaign but considers the broader context of control. Hence, the gender schism continues in a chapter on the control of street commerce, in particular the newspaper trade. By the turn of the century, presumably in parallel to the domestication of the streets, concerns were being voiced about young girls selling newspapers. As Baldwin points out, the campaign to remove girls from street commerce had many echoes with the anti-prostitution movement. But the control of female morality (or immorality) was not the only motivation of the reformers. As Baldwin shows in a later chapter, the cleansing of the public streets of unruly street play, and shifting of disorderly children and youths into specific spaces such as the boys' clubs and vacation schools, can also be seen as part of the broader move towards social zoning and segregation embodied in new public parks and pavements, and represented in the city plans drawn up in the early twentieth century. As a result, Baldwin's account is a clear and interesting analysis of the impact of social reform on one provincial American City in the progressive era of American domestic politics.

**Heather Shore**

University College Northampton

**Maria Balshaw and Liam Kennedy (eds)**, *Urban Space and Representation*. London: Pluto Press, 2000. viii + 201pp. 2 figures. £14.99 pbk.

**Robert Freestone (ed.)**, *Urban Planning in a Changing World: The Twentieth Century Experience*. London: E. & F.N. Spon, 2000. ix + 293pp. 29 figures. 1 table. £45.00.

**Eric Mumford**, *The CIAM Discourse on Urbanism, 1928–1960*. Cambridge, Mass.: The MIT Press, 2000. xvii + 375pp. 107 illustrations. Bibliography. £29.95.

DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802312100

These three books approach the modern city from three very different directions. Some of the essays brought together by Maria Balshaw and Liam Kennedy are perhaps most exciting and challenging to the urban historian; Eric Mumford's examination of CIAM is one of those exhaustive studies of a major movement for which every other historian is very grateful, and the contributors to Robert Freestone's edited collection provide a masterful summary of twentieth-century urban planning.

Balshaw and Kennedy's precise discussion of the symbolic and imaginary production of urban space, 'practices of reading and seeing', and the role of representation in the making of particular, partial spaces and 'spatialised identities' is an excellent short summary of the chief conceptual approaches and problems in this genre of urban writing. Yet its lessons are not always followed by the essay writers. In particular, Balshaw and Kennedy's claim that 'we can analyse the formation of conscious and unconscious responses to urban scenes in literary and visual representations' and understand 'the fears and fantasies of urban living' (p. 6) demands very careful attention to the question of *whose* fears and fantasies and *whose* responses are visible in the urban imaginary. The best essays in this collection – Myrto Konstantarakos' analysis of the representation of social fractures in the *banlieu* films, Peter Brooker's inspiring account of 'neighbourhood stories' as tools for transforming the present, Maria Balshaw's study of

Harlem, African-American urbanity and the cultural possibilities of prideful black style, and Gargi Bhattacharyya's brilliant dissection of place-making and myth-making in Birmingham – all take very seriously the importance of particular places and specific struggles over identity and meaning. They capture the power of material and symbolic places for the real 'city people', those whose everyday imaginings, nostalgias and practices promise limited but real victories for different urban possibilities. They are conscious of power, and in particular the ways in which urban populations become resources for the projects of the powerful. They also move beyond the 'mere descriptions' first criticized by Henri Lefebvre to tackle the disruptive and even liberating capacity of representations that reverse, challenge and undermine dominant versions. On the other hand, some writers too easily assume that elite production somehow leads to mass consumption: Pascal Pinck's chapter on the 'televised' city is a case in point, while Liam Kennedy's evocation of a 'paranoid spatiality' in such American films as *Falling Down* talks of a 'television which projects on to the city the fears and anxieties of its populace' (p. 126) without really analysing just whose paranoia we might be witnessing in Hollywood's fantasies about beleaguered white men.

The authors brought together in Robert Freestone's *Urban Planning in a Changing World* are just as concerned with the complexities and possibilities of modernity, represented here by a century of planning. As Freestone notes in his introduction, histories have always been an integral part of planning: each urban plan, in a way, writes a history of what must be changed and overcome, and each generates a demand for reflection, revision and retrospect. This collection, he says, is a 'drawing of breath' when, 'at the close of the twentieth century, we can in fact perceive a flux of powerful forces akin to the turmoil that gave birth to modern planning at the end of the nineteenth century' (p. 16). Of course, Freestone and his contributors recognize that the century's turn is in one sense all too convenient, and that their subjects have a history before and a future after the confines of 1900–2000. Yet the strongly retrospective nature of this volume, its insistence that there are lessons to be learned from historical investigation, is its greatest asset. All of the chapters take a broad sweep, and all help form an invaluable and powerful synthesis about the century of 'planning modernity'. It is the kind of book that should be compulsory reading for urban planners, architects and engineers. While it accordingly seems a little invidious to single out individual contributions, there are particularly important essays on the city beautiful idea by Gilbert Stetler, on anti-sprawl reform by Robert Bruegmann and on neighbourhood paradigms by Dirk Schubert. Raphaël Fischler's comprehensive survey of planning's goals for social betterment analyses the shift from 'standard of living' to 'quality of life'. The final essay in the collection, Brendan Gleeson and Nicholas Low's 'Is Planning History?', is perhaps the single most important contribution, especially because it takes as its central theme the increasing power of 'anti-planning' practices and language. Any history of urban planning must take as a central theme the ebb and flow of those forces that resist systematic and purposeful attempts to control the production of urban space, and must take on the conservative ideological critiques that have so weakened the emphasis on social justice and redistribution as a central element in urban policy. Gleeson and Low also ensure that this volume ends with something of a call to arms, and a voice for planning's future.



Eric Mumford's narrative history of the Congrès Internationaux d'Architecture Moderne (CIAM) is painstakingly detailed and comprehensive. It covers all of the CIAM congresses and meetings, introduces and tracks each of the major characters and, in its very exhaustiveness, undermines a received history of the movement that has tended to see CIAM only as Le Corbusier writ large. About the only issue that Mumford seems slightly to neglect is the particularly interesting role of women architects in CIAM: the extent to which women did or did not bring different perspectives to bear upon the crucial questions of urban design is not really addressed. That aside, this book fulfils its great ambitions. CIAM is important because more than any other coalition of forces it formed and defined the 'modern movement' in architecture; in Mumford's account, CIAM also serves as one of the most important expressions of modernism's possibilities, ambiguities and failings. This is an intellectual genealogy of CIAM that highlights the connections it forged between utopian politics and specific planning and architectural practices, and successfully links its discussions to the broader ideas and debates of mid-century urbanism. Mumford also attempts to recover its sense of the future: this was, after all, 'a new and perhaps overly ambitious socially transformative role for architects and architecture . . . combining certain design strategies with a passionately held conviction that architecture should serve the many and not the few' (pp. 4–5). Of course, CIAM expressed modernism's limitations. Mumford shows particularly well how CIAM's uncertainties about popular appeal – and the political weight that might accompany it – made it at best an uncertain avant-garde; indeed, by the late 1940s, it was more easily characterized as a 'detached, self-appointed elite' (p. 195). And he is as critical as any late twentieth-century observer must be of its over-confident and often arrogant assumption that conclusions about human life and human needs built largely from European elite experience were self-evident to 'rational minds' and could be applied to a world still peopled by 'primitive cultures' and 'poorer classes'. In hindsight, though, it is all too easy to reduce modernism and modernity to the exploded fragments of Pruitt-Ingoe or the more fanciful of Le Corbusier's radiances. CIAM's work may well function as 'the shared negative symbol of the failures of modern architecture' (p. 268), but in Mumford's hands, it also becomes something more: an assumption that planning and good architecture matter, and that planners and architects must serve the many and not the few. If the modernists were often all too eager to lead the many where they had no real reason or desire to go, and whatever their neglect of differences and the possibilities of disorder, they nonetheless got some things right. If there is a common thread to these collections of essays and this book, perhaps it lies in the continuing task of critically assessing modernity's claims, and in the significance of constructing and not simply deconstructing the urban future.

**Mark Peel**

Monash University

**Arturo Almandoz**, *Ensayos de cultura urbana*. Caracas: Fundarte, 2000. 216pp. Price not stated.  
DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802322107

Urban history is still a developing field in Latin America and outlets for scholarly work are hard to find. Arturo Almandoz, a very distinguished scientific and literary observer of urban matters in Venezuela, with a growing reputation throughout Latin America, decided some years ago to publish his observations in magazines and journals. In particular, he wanted to educate a broad public in the structure and functioning of the city as a prelude to their participation in urban issues. Now, his *Ensayos de cultura urbana* combines some of these striking essays with new work, offering a clear and lively introduction to *urbanismo* in its Latin American format. *Urbanismo*, which in its mid-Atlantic form of 'urbanism' is already making inroads into traditional Anglo-American formulations such as 'urban planning', 'urban geography' and 'urban history', includes all of these plus architecture, building, politics, art, sociology, film and television, with a dash of critical theory and cultural studies. Its linguistic origins date back to the early lectures of Marcel Poëte on *urbanisme* in Paris in the early 1900s. Its universal adoption thereafter in Latin America reflects the powerful influence of French culture and science, which has partially survived the new wave of American influence on urban affairs since about 1940.

The founder of urban history as we still largely know it, H.J. Dyos, would have admired this approach. Dyos detected an urban dimension throughout human history, creating an 'urban history' stretching across the centuries and across our planet without division into conventional historical periods or political territories. Dyos drew on every relevant scientific discipline and creative field, whether historical or not, to enhance this perspective. Some that were not relevant were tried and sometimes dropped in a limitless and endless debate which some admirers described as 'free-wheeling'. Dyos' great annual conferences, attracting urban historians and related scholars from all over the world, provided Britain's most exciting and creative historical arena from the 1960s to the end of the 1970s.

Arturo Almandoz, who has taken over the mantle of the late, greatly regretted, Jorge Hardoy as the leader of Latin American historical urbanism, is already editing books and organizing conferences of continental scope. As this book demonstrates, Almandoz is an impressive figure. He reads widely, drawing on European and American literature to augment the more limited Latino sources. He is not afraid to draw on novels, poetry and art. Much of his general culture is French, as evidenced by his use of Baudelaire as the exemplar of the urban researcher. Like Baudelaire, he wanders through the city, seeing, learning and above all experiencing at the same time. Here he has much to teach the British urban historian, who rarely deigns to go out into the streets or to meet people. Above all, Almandoz offers experience and understanding, much as the social observers of London did at the end of the nineteenth century. As a young city, Caracas is still fresh and exciting, not yet clogged by 'rigorous' urban science and fixed political positions.

The essays begin with a head-on confrontation with the perennial problem of the nature of 'the urban'. English urban historians gave up on this one years ago, but Almandoz is not afraid to honour the comprehensive approach of Geddes,

Mumford, Wirth and a clutch of early German sociologists, followed by such as Henri Lefebvre and Richard Sennett. He discusses concentration, specialization, mobility, opportunity and other features of cities. His reflections on physical form isolate building types, technology and transport. The central section of the book discusses space in its various formats and uses, including cafés, streets and urban districts. When we remember that this material was written for, literally, the man on the *La Trinidad* express bus, a picture builds up of a literate and highly informed citizenry. This again recalls nineteenth-century London, before the Welfare State let us assume that all urban issues were well in hand. The Caracas of Arturo Almandoz can be espied as a vital urban society, its great problems counterbalanced by individual and social initiative.

The last group of essays deals with images, memory, perception, art, architecture, and episodes in the planning of Caracas since 1900. Here, as elsewhere, Almandoz is well abreast of the latest literature in cultural studies and critical theory, and existentialist concepts inform much of his thinking. He is also ready to draw on the writings of those early sociologists, such as Park, who sought to comprehend the city as a whole. As so often, he is conceptually well ahead of most British urban historians, who would make little of '*fabulación*' (p. 140), '*memoria vivencial*' (pp. 141–6), or the Sombart-inspired '*concepto memorioso*' (pp. 147–8). With Almandoz we see it all afresh, our jaded concepts come alive again, and we look forward to new debates and new perceptions, as Latin America takes its place in the world's array of urban historiography.

**Anthony Sutcliffe**

University of Nottingham

**Lillian Serece Williams**, *Strangers in the Land of Paradise: The Creation of an African American Community, Buffalo, New York, 1900–1940*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1999. xvii + 272pp. 3 tables. 39 illustrations. 3 appendices. Bibliography. \$22.95.

DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802332103

Although we know remarkably little about the experience of black suburbanites, and how their experiences compare with their white or Latino counterparts, the explosion in African American history in the past three decades has produced an impressive number of studies on the black experience in urban America, spanning the colonial era to the present. Lillian Serece Williams' important study, *Strangers in the Land of Paradise: The Creation of an African American Community, Buffalo, New York, 1900–1940*, contributes to this growing list. Based upon strong research in newspapers, manuscript census returns for New York State, and scattered archival collections, Williams makes an impressive case that African Americans in Buffalo, despite a persistent pattern of racial discrimination in employment and housing, and intermittent discrimination in public accommodations, built a strong and vibrant community, challenged racial oppression, and took an active role in shaping their own destiny. In tandem with their black counterparts in other cities with small African American populations prior to 1940, such as San Francisco, Milwaukee, or Evansville, Indiana, Buffalo's black leaders perceived themselves as racially progressive and sought to align their

own struggle for equality and dignity with black communities throughout the nation.

African Americans traced their roots as residents of Buffalo to 1792, yet despite Buffalo's reputation as a stop on the Underground Railroad, the black population remained small throughout the nineteenth century. Nevertheless, African Americans created numerous community institutions, such as schools, churches and women's clubs, in addition to forming antislavery societies and assisting fugitive slaves. The most renowned community leader was William Wells Brown, who established a national reputation as an antislavery lecturer. To her credit, Williams also introduces several lesser known reformers, such as Mary Burnett Talbert, an Oberlin College graduate and founder of the Phillis Wheatley Club (affiliated with the National Association of Colored Women), and the Reverend Joseph Robert Love, a prominent Episcopalian minister and the first African American to graduate from the University of Buffalo School of Medicine. Such leaders worked closely with Buffalo's white leadership, but they were particularly pivotal in the formation of race-based institutions that stressed self-help and racial uplift.

The economic status of African Americans in this industrial city was always more precarious than that of their white counterparts, yet African Americans readily found work on the railroads, in steel and lumber factories, and as maids, porters and waiters in posh hotels such as the Buffalo Statler. Some enterprising individuals ran their own businesses. Black professionals, however, made almost no progress in gaining employment in the fields for which they were trained, and African American women made the least progress of any group. Williams does an excellent job illustrating how black occupational progress ebbed and flowed over time and how new employment opportunities expanded during the era of the First World War.

The possibility of industrial jobs during the First World War was a magnet for southern black workers to the industrial north, in what has become known as the Great Migration. For Buffalo, the Great Migration meant that the city's African American population, which numbered a mere 1,200 residents in 1905, boomed to 9,000 by 1920. By 1931, an astonishing 98 per cent of Buffalo's African American workers were southern-born.

The strength of Williams' study is her meticulous analysis of community building and the creation of black institutions, which comprise the book's final three chapters. Here, she carefully examines both the philosophy and the reality of philanthropy and uplift which sustained Buffalo's black community through difficult times. The role of such black organizations as the YMCA (Buffalo, like many American cities, had a segregated branch of the YMCA) and the Urban League offered a wealth of resources to black residents, including recreation, job placement and lodging. These organizations also taught many young men and women leadership skills and, like settlement houses, sometimes served as a temporary refuge for black southern migrants as they acclimated to the pace and demands of urban life.

*Strangers in the Land of Paradise*, despite its judicious scholarship and important analysis of class, leadership and gender in the African American community, does a poor job of expanding our knowledge of African Americans in Buffalo during the Great Depression and New Deal. Additionally, Williams' analysis of black employment gains and losses over time would have been far more

compelling if she had consistently compared these figures with the white native and ethnic immigrant populations. This reviewer was also disturbed to see that colloquial expressions had occasionally crept into the author's prose, and that several misspelled words were not caught. The eminent black leader Martin R. Delany, for example, is spelled 'Delaney'. These reservations notwithstanding, Williams has written a fine book, and one that significantly enhances our understanding of the processes of gender, community building and the struggle for equality and dignity that African Americans in Buffalo waged between 1900 and 1940.

**Albert S. Broussard**  
Texas A&M University

**Robin Walz**, *Pulp Surrealism: Insolent Popular Culture in Early Twentieth-Century Paris*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000. xii + 206pp. 8 plates. 3 tables. Bibliography. £21.95; \$35.

**Valérie Montens**, *Le Palais des Beaux-Arts: la création d'un haut lieu de culture à Bruxelles (1928–1945)*. Bruxelles: Editions de l'Université de Bruxelles, 2000. viii + 376pp. BF1200; FF222.

DOI: 10.1017/S096392680234210X

These two works explore very different aspects of urban history in France and Belgium. Walz's *Pulp Surrealism* offers an imaginative and well-rehearsed reinterpretation of the surrealist movement. The introduction to this work is particularly forcefully and convincingly written and, indeed, can be read as an essay in its own right. Walz first provides a concise description of surrealism: its goal 'was not simply to create an artistic movement but to reconfigure human consciousness' in accordance with the new and changing realities of the urban scene (p. 3). The setting for this movement, according to Walz, was the clash between nineteenth-century and twentieth-century modernities in Paris.

Walz argues that previous commentators have exaggerated or overestimated the influence of both major philosophical currents and the historical cataclysm of the First World War on the emergence of the surrealist movement. He invites us, instead, to turn to popular culture in order to understand the roots of surrealism, offering 'a "secret history" of popular culture in early twentieth-century France' (p. 8). Surrealist texts can be used as 'guides' from which to survey and evaluate developments and innovations in popular culture. Following this imaginative introduction, however, Walz's book changes course. The bulk of the chapters which follow consist of extremely detailed comparisons between surrealist texts and their cultural context. On the one hand, one can admire the care and dedication with which – for example – Walz chases down references and implications in Louis Aragon's celebrated surrealist text, *Le Paysan de Paris*, to the Opera arcade. In a sense, Walz presents a micro-urban history of a particular site. On the other hand, this type of obsessive concentration on details and extremely small-scale points does make this work 'feel' as if Walz has taken us well off the beaten track. The three succeeding substantive chapters all follow similar patterns: intense, detailed analyses of popular novels, of a sensationalized murder trial, and of the reporting of suicide cases. In each case, Walz is certainly

more than informative, but in none of these chapters is the argument opened up into a commentary on the surrealist movement as a whole.

Somewhere Blake writes that he wants 'to see the world in a grain of sand'. Obviously, Walz is aiming to do something on these lines, but in these chapters we are given detailed descriptions of the grain, with little about the world.

Montens' work is significantly different. Her book analyses the Palais des Beaux-Arts (PBA) in Brussels, an institution which seems to have had the same centrality for the formation of the Brussels bourgeois identity as the Liceo opera house in Barcelona. This work is clearly argued and luxuriously illustrated. It presents a convincing and well-rounded description of the varied activities of the PBA, which included theatre, opera, concerts and assistance to artists and writers. Some controversial points are raised. The book notes the thorny question of the relationship of the Francophone PBA with the marginalized Flemish culture, the participation of the working class and even of the organized labour movement within the PBA's mission to encourage cultural developments in Brussels, and the dilemma of the role and purpose of the PBA during the Occupation years. However, Montens' history suffers from its apparent status as an 'authorized' history. Very few criticisms are made of the PBA's performance, and its backers and directors are nearly always presented in the most positive light possible. This is a shame: there is clearly another history of the PBA which could have been written which would have addressed these controversial points in a more critical manner.

Both these works have their strengths but, regrettably, neither can be wholeheartedly recommended.

**S. Gemie**

University of Glamorgan

**Marc Stein**, *City of Sisterly and Brotherly Loves: Lesbian and Gay Philadelphia, 1945–1972*. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2000. xi + 457pp. 38 figures. \$35; £24.50.  
DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802352106

Marc Stein's *City of Sisterly and Brotherly Love* is clearly intended as a companion volume to George Chauncey's *Gay New York*, but also to present what Stein believes to be a very different manifestation of gay culture. Stein sets out to argue that Philadelphia gay life prior to the 1970s was more heterosocial than that of New York or San Francisco, produced political patterns distinctly its own, and handled social tensions between white and black, men and women in very different ways. However, while he very successfully outlines the Philadelphia narrative, the absence of any direct comparison means that this is not a book that stands on its own, but can only be read alongside the other urban studies to which he refers in his introduction.

The scope of the material Stein presents, from the delineation of gay ghettos through the conflict over the emergence of gay male sex magazines within the homophile movement, is impressive, but the *City of Sisterly and Brotherly Love* is a very self-conscious and overtly constructed book. Each chapter contains three distinct approaches: the initial narrative, constructed from a range of histories and secondary sources; evidence drawn from interviews with forty-five respon-

dents; and a concluding and summarizing paragraph which seeks to create an embracing analysis of the chapter. Stein's narratives are strong, and in those chapters which foreground the narrative, such as the discussion of Mayor Rizzo's clean-up campaigns, and on Gay Liberation in Philadelphia, the book becomes racy, informative and a pleasure to read, but much of this very valuable material is overwhelmed by Stein's refusal to discriminate or prioritize.

A number of the chapters begin with the provision of a wider historical context, although the relevance of this is frequently unclear. This is followed by a short argument or statement of an idea, succeeded by numerous anecdotes and quotes, in no particular order and with little attempt to structure them in such a way as to support or undermine the argument. This is particularly problematic when Stein discusses the extent of gay/lesbian interaction, for his interviewees contradict each other. Stein's failure to sum up the weight of opinion, or to provide links between each anecdote mean that we are either left confused or are forced to accept the single paragraph analysis with which he concluded the chapter.

Stein's determination to force understanding upon the audience is problematic throughout the book but seems to be intrinsic to his approach to his sources. Stein's respondents never 'argue' or 'suggest', they always 'state'. While Stein does justify viewpoint with a reference to context (he repeatedly informs us that gay men do not necessarily recognize the presence of gay women) there remains the impression that he has not understood the role of constructed narrative in oral history. This tendency to take evidence at face value is displayed best in the use of photographs; there are rather too many of these which contain pictures of two people, but are identified as a picture of one named individual and we are apparently expected to know to which we are being referred. In contrast, we are also treated to a dose of artificial scepticism; throughout the book words appear in inverted commas. There is no necessity for a term such as 'hanging out' or 'unmarried' to appear in such a way. It is not at all clear whose definitions we are supposed to be challenging.

Stein's *City of Sisterly and Brotherly Love* is undoubtedly an interesting book, well worth investigating for the material it presents, but while the research is here, the digestion is not.

**F.J. Mendlesohn**

Middlesex University

**Sidney Fine**, *'Expanding the Frontiers of Civil Rights': Michigan, 1948–1968*. Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2000. 441pp. Bibliography. \$44.95.

**James K. Wellman, Jr**, *The Gold Coast Church and the Ghetto: Christ and Culture in Mainline Protestantism*. Champaign, Illinois: University of Illinois Press, 1999. xv + 257pp. 8 plates. Bibliography. \$21.95 pbk, \$49.95 hbk.

DOI: 10.1017/S0963926802362102

These two studies explore the themes of continuity and change in the responses of a state government (Michigan) and a religious institution (Chicago's prestigious Fourth Presbyterian) to social and economic problems. Both relate instances



of success and failure by ministers of religion and elected politicians in their perception and alleviation of suffering, exploitation and racism.

Sidney Fine's persuasive contention is that civil rights policies in Michigan underwent a significant transformation in the twenty years after the state's Committee on Civil Rights had pronounced the condition of minority groups 'an ugly picture'. Three successive Michigan governors – the Democrats G. Mennen Williams (1949–60) and John Swainson (1961–62), and the Republican George Romney (1963–69) – turned their attention to the plight of African Americans, migrant workers, the physically and mentally handicapped, Native Americans and the elderly. With the help of religious groups and organized labour, Williams and Swainson – despite facing a legislature unsympathetic to their proposals – had some successes: a Fair Employment Practices law (1955), partial desegregation of the state National Guard, and the appointments of women and minorities to state offices. George Romney, taking full advantage of the civil rights provisions in Michigan's 1963 constitution, gained bipartisan support for a range of measures, including a strong fair housing statute, passed after the devastating Detroit race riot of 1967.

When Romney left office, Fine concludes, Michigan could claim some tangible achievements in the areas of public housing, the awarding of government contracts and entry into the state civil service, and limited gains in education, age and sex discrimination, and employment in the private sector. But the state's Native Americans and migrant farm workers remained decidedly second-class citizens. This exhaustively researched and meticulously presented analysis of civil rights issues in a single state demonstrates the shift in focus of recent African American (and related) historiography from agencies at the national to those at a local level. It will engage and inform students of race, politics and urban history.

James K. Wellman Jr offers a complementary account of the interpretation of Christian dogmas and temporal issues by successive pastors of Fourth Presbyterian Church. *The Gold Coast Church and the Ghetto*, presented as a 'study in historical ethnography', suggests that in the course of the twentieth century American 'Mainline' Protestant churches moved from an unequivocal endorsement of the capitalist status quo to a growing (if intermittent) concern with social issues.

From 1916 to 1920, approximately 50,000 African Americans settled in Chicago, a prime destination of blacks from the impoverished and segregated South seeking better opportunities in the great urban centres of the North. But the growth of the black ghetto on the city's South Side, and competition for jobs between African Americans and other ethnic groups, produced racial and class antagonisms, which erupted in the riot of 1919. The Protestant establishment, rooted in 'the values of the Puritan past', Wellman asserts, was largely indifferent to the plight of black Chicagoans. Yet by the 1920s, the (white) Protestant churches had suffered a decline in status, as they became 'one pillar among many' in American culture. By the 1960s, Fourth Presbyterian (an imposing American Gothic structure) had been literally as well as metaphorically dwarfed by new high rise luxury apartments and skyscrapers – notably the John Hancock Building – and had become 'a downtown church by default'.

The dynamic of the civil rights movement in the 1960s, and Chicago's growing patterns and practices of racial segregation and discrimination, prompted some

Protestant denominations to embrace a new form of the Social Gospel. Fourth Presbyterian Church was physically close to the dilapidated and dangerous public housing project of Cabrini-Green that had predominantly African American and Hispanic residents – the doubtful beneficiaries of policies of urban renewal initiated and implemented by the powerful political machine headed by Mayor Richard Daley. Under the leadership of its ‘charismatic’ pastor Ellam Davis, and his successor, John Buchanan, Fourth Presbyterian began to reach out to black and Hispanic children and teenagers on the Near North Side. It also joined with an ecumenical community group, the Committee of Community Organisation (COCO), concerned to curb juvenile delinquency, gang warfare and police brutality.

In 1966 Martin Luther King Jr and the Southern Christian Leadership Conference (SCLC) arrived in Chicago to campaign for better schools, housing and job opportunities for the city’s black underclass. But the church signally failed to comment on the attacks by working-class ‘white ethnics’ on the SCLC and its supporters – with King himself the prime target of mob violence. Yet following King’s assassination in Memphis in 1968, pastor Davies and his colleagues became actively involved with rehabilitation and educational programmes for the disillusioned youths of Cabrini-Green.

By the 1990s, Fourth Presbyterian, still an affluent and middle-class institution, preached a ‘lay liberal’ message of social inclusion. In making the transition from ‘a cultural Protestant church’ that had earlier used its considerable resources to spread the gospel abroad, it now attempted to engage with the problems of the turbulent 1960s, with some (limited) success. Wellman’s book is as much a work of religious as it is of urban history, and given the plethora of scholarly work on Chicago’s ethnic and political experiences, its significance might appear to be limited or parochial. This would be a pity. Both of these valuable analyses suggest that strong and committed *leadership* – whether lay or clerical – did promote improvements in the lives of at least some of the exploited and underprivileged residents of Michigan and Chicago.

**John White**

University of Hull