

## REVIEWS

### THE NUBIAN EXPERIENCE OF PHARONIC EGYPT

doi:10.1017/S0021853706212064

*From Slave to Pharaoh: The Black Experience of Ancient Egypt.* By DONALD B. REDFORD. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2004. Pp. x+218. \$44.95/£32 (ISBN 0-8018-7814-4).

KEY WORDS: Egyptology, Egypt, Sudan, archaeology.

Do not be misled by the title, which must have been manufactured by the publisher for the Afro-centrist market. This volume is, at least in large measure, a strong insightful assessment of Egyptian political history during the later New Kingdom (Dynasties 19–20), Third Intermediate Period (Dynasties 21–4) and most importantly, the 25th (Nubian) Dynasty. It is *not* a history of Nubia and the Sudan in antiquity (p. ix, author's emphasis). Begun as a study of Dynasty 25 achievements in Egypt, he explains it was expanded for a general overview of the Nubian experience of Egyptian expansionism and culture. The first eight chapters introduce the complex rationale behind the Nubian 'invasion' that begins Dynasty 25 in Egypt. The volume concludes with the last Nubian pharaoh retreating from Egypt before the Assyrians in 671 BC. The author promises a sequel going up to the invasion of Alexander the Great, anticipated by a very short epilogue summarising events to AD 320.

Redford now begins when both regions were at a generally similar evolutionary stage, tracing the alternating ebb and flow of their relationship. He essentially skims through the gradual rise of the Kushite states in Nubia, famously the 'first in black Africa'. Much of his evidence is textual for, as he points out, we should 'allow their statements to speak for themselves'. The vast majority are by or for Egyptians, not the Nubians about whom the texts speak. This evidence, therefore, is one-sided: what Egyptians thought about Nubians, not what Nubians thought about themselves or Egyptians. Other evidence, chiefly archaeological, also is employed and the result is a general introduction to what both elite and common Nubians might expect in their dealings with elite and common Egyptians – emphasis on the former as textual records naturally favour individuals by and about whom texts were recorded; many are 'official' documents. Can we take these often boastful and politically motivated statements literally, as Redford does in some instances, yet interpreting with considerable insight the 'actual' events behind the words in others? Egyptian descriptions and epithets for Nubia/Nubians often are the result of the purpose(s) for which texts were written. Ordinary day-to-day encounters appear far less 'hierarchical' and confrontational than they imply. The rapid pace of the first six chapters over several thousand years cannot be considered in-depth, and recent archaeological evidence – often contradicting textual evidence as it deals more with the 'common' people – is either downplayed or not considered. There is, for example, so little archaeological and survey evidence for a New Kingdom Egyptian presence in Upper Nubia (now heavily surveyed) beyond the immediate Cataract areas that we must conclude they were hardly, if ever, there.

The meat of the volume lies in the succeeding chapters, the history of the Napatan period from the 12th century BC, briefly in Nubia but predominantly in Egypt as the period of Dynasties 22–5. These are clear, penetrating analyses of

events in this incredibly complicated period. First, Redford covers those leading to the Nubian 'invasion' of Egypt in chapter 8, then Piankhy's (Redford's preferred identification for this ruler, now usually called Piy or Pi[ankh]y with the 'ankh' sign considered an epithet not part of his name) march down the Nile in chapter 9. Chapters 10 (Egypt's Dynasty 24), 11 (Piankhy's successors) and 12 (Taharqa, the last Nubian pharaoh) are straight political history outlines with commentary, emphasizing Egyptian history. Chapters 13 and 14 outline the social effects of these political changes in Egypt and Thebes itself (the account of the latter employs evidence from Redford's own East Karnak excavations, these levels largely unpublished) over the period, before the final chapter analysing the end of the dynasty in Egypt with Taharqa's retreat back to Nubia and Napata. The evidence here largely is textual, the *specific* words and phrases used often analysed to indicate what is (or is *not*) being stated and implied, and Redford's skilful interpretation of events. Individual personalities, their strengths and weaknesses, are brought to the fore, and the result is a logical cohesive presentation of the rise and fall in fortunes over time.

The main text is abundantly served by detailed endnotes, discussing specific points not easily incorporated into the main textual flow, as well as further references. The scattering of photographs are clear but nonetheless rather pale as printed, although often the point of their inclusion relative to the text is elusive. A timeline or chronological chart would have been useful. It must also be noted that Redford prefers the high chronology in his earlier chapters where, for example, Akhenaten's reign is 'early 14th century' rather than within the third quarter of that century, as is now usually cited. The most notable drawback to the book is that the maps fail to show many sites mentioned in the text, including those described as boundaries for defined cultural and political areas. The reference to 'UE VII' on p. 28 should be explained as the 7th Upper Egyptian *nome* (province), just south of Abydos in the area of Diospolis Parva (see Map 2). The Elephantine region map (Fig. 4) inexplicably is post-AD 1969, indicating the High Dam. These are small quibbles to an easily readable volume that offers considerable insight into a convoluted period of Egyptian history.

*University of Cambridge*

JACKE PHILLIPS

## EXPLORING AND POPULARIZING AFRICAN HISTORY

doi:10.1017/S0021853706222060

*The Power of African Cultures*. By TOYIN FALOLA. Rochester NY: University of Rochester Press, 2003. Pp. xiii + 354. \$75/£50 (ISBN 1-58046-139-5).

KEY WORDS: Culture, historiography, politics.

Without question, Professor Falola is the most prolific African historian writing today, and one of the most influential scholars in African studies. Falola has published at least 40 books, many of them co-edited with colleagues and graduate students. Not only has he contributed to Yoruba studies, for which he may well receive his greatest recognition, but his edited collections and reflections on African history more generally deserve, and are receiving, considerable attention. His autobiography has received recognition as an outstanding contribution to African studies as well.<sup>1</sup> For the profession, it is essential to know how a scholar of

<sup>1</sup> *A Mouth Sweeter than Salt*, which was nominated for the Herskovits award of the African Studies Association (USA).

Falola's achievement is presenting African history to the informed public. In this volume, as in his recent autobiography, his exploration of the power of African cultures exposes his public personae to be forceful and political. His understanding of African history requires careful consideration.

The papers in *The Power of African Cultures* are derived from public lectures. Hence, the essays attempt to communicate the findings of Africanist scholarship in a form that is intended to reach non-specialists and the interested public. Thus to assess this volume from a strictly scholarly perspective would miss the point. While primary research and the scholarly literature amply inform the various chapters, the book is most interesting in exposing Falola's imagination and inspirations. We are presented with a view into how a distinguished Africanist, and a Nigerian, views the historiography and cultural analysis that has characterized the study of Africa over the past two or three decades. Despite the great number of scholars in Africa who have contributed to the advancement of knowledge and the consolidation of an Africanist perspective, the role of scholars trained in Africa is often overlooked in a scholarly environment that mainly recognizes achievement through publication in North America and Europe, and largely in English, and to a lesser extent in French. The result of Falola's odyssey is an insightful venture into what we think we know, who revealed what we have come to accept and debate and specifically the role of students and scholars in and of Africa in setting the agenda of historical discussion. One of Falola's achievements as a scholar is his recognition of the scholarship of colleagues at African universities, whose research has been important in the evolution of the discipline, at the same time that most of these scholars suffer from inadequate library resources, erratic publication venues and limited access to the Internet. He privileges the voices and analysis of Africans, which serves as an important correction to the substantial contributions of scholars from Europe and North America.

Falola is a dynamic lecturer. He approaches the subject of African history and cultural transformation with enthusiasm and conviction. His basic technique in popularizing African history is to explore relevant issues of historiography and contemporary politics in a manner that draws on apparent contradictions and unusual detail. Hence he explores the culture of politics and the politics of culture in assessing the modern thought of African intellectuals, especially those writing and teaching in English. This involves an examination of the dilemmas and contradictions of slavery and the slave trade, European imperialism, colonialism and the rise of nationalism – all familiar themes but presented here with a twist that touches the nerve of Africanist scholarship in a manner that conveys the intellectual ferment arising from African universities and transferred through scholarly migration to universities in North America.

It is appropriate that the publisher is the University of Rochester Press, which recruited Falola to launch what has become an important series in the study of African history and the African diaspora. Falola has not only published extensively himself, but he is responsible for the publication of many other volumes and for co-editing the journal, *African Economic History*. Professor Falola is truly a most distinguished Africanist historian, with a reflective and critical voice that builds on the fine tradition of Nigerian scholarship of Ajayi, Afigbo, Alagoa and others.

*York University, Canada*

PAUL E. LOVEJOY

## PROFESSOR AFIGBO AND THE IBADAN TRADITION

doi:10.1017/S0021853706232067

*Nigerian History, Politics and Affairs: The Collected Essays of Adiele Afigbo*. Edited by TOYIN FALOLA. Trenton NJ and Asmara: Africa World Press, 2005. Pp. x + 722. \$119.95 (ISBN 1-59221-323-5); \$39.95, paperback (ISBN 1-59221-324-3). KEY WORDS: Nigeria, historiography.

Adiele Afigbo is a doyen of Nigerian history and a founding father of the 'Ibadan School', so-called because its members were associated with the then University College, Ibadan, either as doctoral students or, later, as scholars who concentrated on the specific historical themes pioneered there. He is perhaps best known for his detailed study of the administrative chaos that was British colonial rule in Igboland, titled *The Warrant Chiefs: Indirect Rule in Southeastern Nigeria* (1972). Its close examination of how colonial rule worked (and failed) in a specific locality places it firmly in the nationalist tradition of the Ibadan School which sought to construct a mainstream political history of Nigeria through a series of local accounts – of how colonial subjects both collaborated with and resisted British imperial imposition. In later years, he pioneered the study of precolonial Igbo history, with his magisterial *Ropes of Sand: Studies in Igbo History and Culture* (1981).

This enormous volume (in excess of 700 pages) presents a collection of essays, many previously published, which are very much in the Ibadan School tradition. The first twenty-two chapters cover 'History, politics and affairs' while the remaining thirteen address 'Education, development and affairs'. Within these two parts, the book is ordered more or less chronologically, moving from the pre-colonial period, through the colonial era and finally to the challenges faced by independent Nigeria. Given that so much of Afigbo's scholarship argued against the imposition of such rigid sequential categories on the Nigerian past, this is somewhat surprising. However, three commentaries by younger Nigerian scholars provide a useful overview and critique of Afigbo's scholarship. Olukoju's contribution is particularly welcome for identifying a series of shared themes carried through the volume which take readers beyond its self-imposed temporal strait-jacket.

As a compendium of secondary literature which adopts a particular approach to the Nigerian past, the book is very useful. The section on the precolonial period is firmly focused on the southeastern region. Nevertheless, its attention to the complexity of social, political and economic relations within and between various communities and how these played out in processes of state formation takes us well beyond the banal anthropological model of 'stateless societies' as applied to eastern Nigeria. Afigbo's characteristically lucid and illuminating writing style conveys these complex historical processes in a most accessible way, making the first five chapters of the book very useful for undergraduate teaching. The following eleven chapters on the colonial period are less rewarding, mainly because they cover such familiar ground. Similarly, twelve chapters on federalism and the significance of the colonial past to postcolonial Nigeria offer little that is new. The final six chapters on education are statements of a public commentator rather than an historian. The more one reads through the book, the more its main shortcoming – the lack of engagement with Nigerian history published after 1985 – becomes evident and disappointing. There is a missed opportunity here to re-visit debates about the making of the Nigerian state through a concise critical commentary of historiography rather than simply a lengthy regurgitation of it. A sage of Nigerian history, who has witnessed and struggled against the depressing decline of the history

academy in his country, Afigbo is a towering figure. It is a pity that this book simply reminds a future generation of Nigerian historians of the passing of a glorious tradition rather than inspiring them towards creating a new one.

*Birkbeck College, University of London*

RUTH WATSON

## BOAHEN'S WRITINGS: FROM PRECOLONIAL TO POSTCOLONIAL GHANA AND WEST AFRICA

doi:10.1017/S0021853706242063

*Africa in the Twentieth Century: The Adu Boahen Reader*. Edited by TOYIN FALOLA. Trenton NJ and Asmara: Africa World Press, 2004. Pp. 667. \$39.95, paperback (ISBN 1-59221-297-2).

KEY WORDS: West Africa, Ghana, historiography, precolonial, colonial, post-colonial, nationalism, politics, democracy.

Adu Boahen is among that handful of pioneers within Africa who changed the face of the history taught in the universities of the newly independent states over the past forty-five years. His influence within the University of Ghana (where he graduated in 1956) as a lecturer and finally as Emeritus Professor has been profound and has reached well beyond West Africa. Boahen has, however, been more than a historian; as a political commentator and activist he challenged the military rulers in Ghana in the 1970s and late 1980s and then stood for the New Patriotic Party (NPP) in an unsuccessful bid to oust Rawlings in the presidential elections of 1992. So it was fitting that a *festschrift* in his honour should appear in 2003 (reviewed in this journal 45, 1 [2004], pp. 126–8), and a further mark of his significance is this 'Boahen reader' that brings together much unpublished material.

The book is introduced by 'Commentaries' from four scholars, two Ghanaian and two non-African, on Boahen's intellectual life and accomplishments. This is then followed by four thematic parts. Part one deals with 'Precolonial Ghana' and contains a good sample of the ideas that he contributed in his own textbooks, *Topics in West African History* (1966), and (with J. B. Webster) *West Africa since 1800: The Revolutionary Years* (1967), and in the *Transactions of the Historical Society of Ghana*, as well as several unpublished papers that span the 1960s–80s. Part two, on 'Colonial Ghana', includes his early work on the *Asantehene* Prempeh in exile, a topic that Boahen has since revisited, and a number of unpublished papers including a very useful one, given in August 1997, reasserting the central role of J. B. Danquah and the United Gold Coast Convention (UGCC) as 'the real founders of the present nation-state of Ghana'. Part three moves chronologically forward to 'Politics in modern Ghana', mostly unpublished lectures that provide an insight into Boahen's own political thinking and action within what he sees as the constitutionalist legacy of Danquah. The final part is thematic, 'Reflections on Africa and African history', mostly unpublished lectures and speeches.

Forty-five years ago, just after Boahen had submitted his London thesis on the African Association (an African scholar writing critically and perceptively about a British institution) and had taken a post at the University of Ghana, the history curriculum there was largely cast in a Eurocentric mould. Boahen and his African colleagues rapidly changed that, giving students a different perspective on Africa, looking from within rather than by aliens from without. This revisionist interpretation certainly relied on European sources although using a greater range of

non-English texts. These included Arabic sources, oral evidence and the findings of archaeology and other disciplines that African historians, with varying degrees of confidence, turned to in order to unravel the story of Africa's past. The starting point was not the arrival of Europeans but the activities of African peoples who lived in that particular part of West Africa and, with nation building in mind, that inhabited the new Ghana. Boahen delighted in the controversy that this raised and the opportunities to assault and dismantle the ideas of other historians, irrespective of rank or reputation, and to build different edifices from Clio's new bricks. That reputation for combative engagement with the past and the present has remained a key part of Boahen's life as an historian. It has marked his scholarship within the academy, but this active engagement has extended to the history curriculum in the school system, and to the political importance of Ghana's recent history to a new generation of voters.

So it is useful to have these various texts within the covers of a single book. However, there are problems with a 'reader' of this kind that deals with the work of a contemporary historian: who are the potential readers, and how might the book be used? At one level this 'reader' makes available several texts of substance not previously published. Scholars will be pleased to have those on their shelves, and to be able to direct students to them, but perhaps they will be less eager to pay for pages of Boahen's early textbooks that are already on library shelves. If the 'reader' is intended for students then it would be better ordered in a different way, briefer, and accompanied by a parallel commentary to give a clearer picture of the development of Boahen's ideas than is provided by the 'Commentaries' of the four scholars. As it is, texts from different dates are pushed together thematically so that it is difficult to disaggregate these to show how his ideas changed over time. There is no index and the process of scanning texts and laboriously reconstructing them has not been matched by careful proof-reading.

*Goldsmiths College and Institute of  
Commonwealth Studies, University of London*

DAVID KILLINGRAY

## LIVING SLAVERY, CREATING A CREOLE SOCIETY

doi:10.1017/S002185370625206X

*Creating the Creole Island: Slavery in Eighteenth-Century Mauritius.* By MEGAN VAUGHAN. Durham, NC and London: Duke University Press, 2005. Pp. xiv + 341. £64 (ISBN 0-8223-3402-3402-x); £15.95, paperback (ISBN 0-8223-3399-6).

KEY WORDS: Mauritius, colonial, slavery, creole, cultural, social.

This magnificent book makes a major contribution to historical writing both on Mauritius and on comparative slavery in the Indian Ocean region. Although there is an introductory section on the initial Dutch colonization and a final chapter on the transitions to sugar and emancipation in the British period, the main focus is on a much neglected period of Mauritian history when the island was under French rule. This study places eighteenth-century Mauritius firmly in the wider context of both the western Indian Ocean region and of colonial slave societies more broadly.

Slavery has recently become a key topic for Mauritius, both in historical scholarship (although this has mainly focused on the plantation era of the nineteenth century) and in popular and political discourse on the island. The 'malaise creole' which has led to considerable social inequality and popular mobilization is largely

attributable to the legacy of a slave past. Vaughan's book places these debates into a new context by exploring what it meant to create a creole society founded on slavery not in pre-determined racial terms, but in relation to the gendered, social and psychological realities of lived experience.

Vaughan makes central use of the rich court case sources to do this. Each chapter begins with an episode from the court records, which is then deconstructed in microanalytical ways to explore the complexity and nuances of colonial French Mauritius. In so doing, she applies the techniques of early modern European scholars as well as those of other slave societies, such as the Cape. Like them, Vaughan has an eye for the telling detail which opens up new avenues of thinking. Like them she also freely uses speculation and poses alternatives, eschewing the claim to present a single truth. But she goes further. She uses the theories of postcolonial social science and literature to probe beneath the details. Insights from Foucault, Fanon, Derrida and Bhabha jostle with those of more historically orientated writers such as Stoler, in ways which never privilege the theory over the specific of time and place. As such the book is a model of how historians should use theory without sacrificing clarity.

Vaughan shows that creolization was not only a demographic and cultural feature but also a psychological one. The ways in which men and women, both free and slave, perceived themselves and others underwent important shifts in the course of the eighteenth century, although never in a single trajectory. The creation of a distinctively local creole culture was constantly interrupted by imports of new slaves from outside the island, while the newly forged social order was threatened by constant instabilities and anxieties, not least during the period of revolutionary events in the French metropole and St. Domingue.

*Creating the Creole Island* presents a host of insights, many of which challenge existing orthodoxies and which will also be of interest to those for whom Mauritius or even slavery are not central concerns. For example, maroons were a constant presence, both literally and in the imaginations of settlers and slaves, although the island was small and relatively intensively settled. The legal system recognized the free will of slaves and judgements by colonial courts did not inevitably discriminate against them. Traditions within slave culture were as much the product of invention as in any other. Concepts of whiteness, as well as blackness, were fluid and unstable. The family and lineage was an important means of social control in both free and slave society, but the patriarchal order was often subverted. Linguistic loss was as central to the creation of creole language as creative innovation. Anxiety about sexual transgression was not only, or even primarily, racial but centred on shared concepts of honour and status.

The one weakness of the book is not the fault of the author, but rather of her predecessors. Her pioneering account of French colonial slavery in Mauritius comes at a time when the new cultural history is at its height and economics is out of fashion. But for Mauritius it was never in fashion: as Vaughan states, 'the economic history of the island in the eighteenth century has yet to be written' (p. 181). It is necessary for the reader of this book to be reminded that slavery was an economic institution as well as a cultural one. Given the stimulus of Gwyn Campbell's recent economic history of neighbouring Madagascar (from which many of the Mauritian slaves were imported), and the richness of material on nineteenth-century plantation economies in Mauritius, this is a gap which urgently needs to be filled.

*University of Cape Town*

NIGEL WORDEN

## APARTHEID AND ECONOMIC GROWTH

doi:10.1017/S0021853706262066

*An Economic History of South Africa: Conquest, Discrimination and Development.*

By CHARLES H. FEINSTEIN. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005. Pp. xxxiii + 302. £45 (ISBN 0-521-85091-6); £19.99, paperback (ISBN 0-521-61641-7).

KEY WORDS: South Africa, colonial, apartheid, economic.

This is the first major economic history of South Africa since the publication of de Kiewiet's landmark work (*A History of South Africa, Social and Economic*, 1941). The late Charles Feinstein has provided a masterful contribution to our understanding of the interplay between the processes of conquest, discrimination and economic development in South Africa up until the advent of democracy in 1994. For readers less acquainted with South Africa, the book contains a series of detailed annexures on population, geography and the labour force as well as a guide to further reading.

The early phase of development was characterized by economic stagnation with the little growth that occurred mainly linked to the limited export of agricultural commodities. The mineral revolution, first diamonds and then gold, provided a major impetus in the second half of the nineteenth century. Political unification was followed in 1924 by the emergence of the Pact government, which adopted a policy of tariff protection to promote industrialization. The manufacturing sector grew rapidly but its long-term development was constrained by an inability to compete in international markets. Following the introduction of formal apartheid in 1948, growth was maintained for nearly three decades. But the economy was faltering and the 1980s marked a period of severe economic and political crisis. The book provides an excellent survey of these developments, which were all fundamentally shaped by the dispossession of land through conquest and legislation as well as a barrage of discriminatory legislation.

A central thread in the book is to explain the relative and absolute deterioration in economic performance that took place in South Africa during the sequence of phases 1913–50, 1950–73 and 1973–94. Feinstein has been particularly effective in marshalling long-term data and locating South Africa's development in comparative international perspective.

What is clear is that South Africa's relative economic performance was woeful. Even during the period 1950–73 which included the 1960s when the apartheid republic was at its zenith both politically and economically, the South African economy grew less rapidly than the booming world economy. From 1973 to 1994 per capita incomes declined and this economic deterioration played a major role in bringing political change.

An influential view in the 1970s and 1980s was the radical perspective that apartheid was functional to economic growth because it provided cheap labour. In analysing the links between political and economic developments, Feinstein systematically dismantles this argument showing that it never really stood up even during the relatively rapid growth phase of the 1960s. Uneducated and unskilled labour is not necessarily cheap and while the system of institutionalized migrant labour may have kept mine wages down, it stultified development both in the short and long term.

The book runs up to the first democratic election and the coming to power of the ANC government which is now attempting to deal with the legacy of poverty, inequality and the systematic under-provision of education and skills to the black majority. There is considerable debate in South Africa currently about the possibility of raising growth rates to 6 per cent. Certainly 1994 marked a major



structural break with the past and the ensuing macroeconomic reforms and capital inflows have established a much sounder basis for sustained expansion. While growth is accelerating, unemployment remains at appalling levels. This book explains the long-term processes which have led to this situation. Land dispossession, the collapse of peasant agriculture, state-supported commercialization of the large-scale, white commercial farming sector and the under-provision of education for blacks laid the ground work. All that was then needed was the economic stagnation of the 1980s and early 1990s to bring about an unemployment problem of grave proportions. So as South Africa faces up to the task of economic and social reconstruction, Feinstein soberly concludes that its 'past will exert a powerful influence on its present and future for a long time to come and these huge tasks will not be swiftly or easily accomplished'.

For those seeking to understand South Africa's past as well as for analysts and policy makers concerned with its future, this book is essential. It is all the more tragic that Feinstein's probing insights could not be brought to bear in analysing the current phase of South Africa's economic development.

*University of Cape Town*

ANTHONY BLACK

## THE JAMESON RAID OF ITS DAY

doi:10.1017/S0021853706272062

*The Transvaal Rebellion: The First Boer War, 1880-1881.* By JOHN LABAND.

Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2005. Pp. xii + 264. £19.99 (ISBN 0-582-77261-3).

KEY WORDS: South Africa, imperialism, war, politics, nationalism.

In the Second Ashanti War of the 1870s, the commander of Britain's expeditionary force to the Gold Coast, General Garnet Wolseley, so despaired of operational difficulties caused by searing temperatures and continuous rains that he ended up putting his faith in two last things. One was God. The other was Lieutenant-Colonel George Colley, his well-educated transport staff officer. Then, Colley evidently provided sufficient West African salvation to become a member of the imperial army's 'Ashanti Club', and a key figure in Wolseley's favoured officer clique or 'Ring'. Several years later, he found himself perilously at sea when it came to the game of empire in South Africa's restive Transvaal.

In February 1881, a British contingent of around 600 men, lubricated by African guides and servants, was mauled on the summit of Majuba mountain by a force of bearded Boers. The Boers lost one man. Broken and in panicky flight, the British lost over half their complement, dead, wounded or captured. Among the redcoat dead was the Governor of Natal and High Commissioner for Southeast Africa, Major-General George Pomeroy Colley. Once it had become unbearably smelly, his corpse was delivered to the British camp by the Boer general, Piet Joubert. In the history of ineptly conducted modern warfare, the name of General Colley is forever associated with the Battle of Majuba, rather like Custer and Little Big Horn or Haig and the Somme.

Britain's Majuba debacle occupies just fifteen pages of *The Transvaal Rebellion*, a highly impressive book which gives it its due, and a great deal more besides. John Laband, by some stretch the most compelling interpreter of the Zulu wars of the later nineteenth century, has now turned his expert gaze upon the small first Anglo-Boer War or Transvaal Rebellion which broke out at the beginning of the 1880s. The assertion of British paramountcy over the Transvaal in 1877, through annexation without popular consent in order to hurry on a South African

confederation, did not take long to backfire. As the author shows, in a highveld version of a familiar imperial scenario, the British got it all hopelessly wrong, with London believing hopelessly ignorant reports from its colonial officials of the growing decency and fair-mindedness of the Transvaal Boer citizenry. In reality, by 1880 their influential leaders had decided that they had had enough of being 'British Afrikaners' and, concluding that 'further meetings and protests were useless' (p. 28), began to stock up arms for a show-down with their detested imperial rulers.

The 1880–1 war that came was a classic underdog rebellion, in which snapping Boer commandos ambushed light British forces and besieged small and scattered garrisons. It was, as the author illustrates deftly, entirely characteristic of African campaigning, with hostilities conducted across forbidding distances, along barely navigable terrain, and in rather testing weather for Victorian soldiers in serge. As if this were not bad enough for the British, the persistence of their quaint belief in 'the moral effect of wearing scarlet' (p. 72) steadied rather than shook the hands of crack Boer riflemen, whose war effort was marked by 'sophisticated coordinated fire and movement tactics, superior marksmanship and mobility' (p. 81). They had, moreover, the further fervent Calvinist protection of God's hand in a heroic war of self-defence. In eagerly throwing in a relief invasion force from neighbouring Natal, Colley's task was not merely to relieve embattled British positions in the Transvaal, but to end the conflict swiftly by routing the Boer rebels and restoring British administration before the rest of the region could get singed by the flames. It was too tall an order for a British command which failed to adapt its culture of war organization to choppy terrain and a highly mobile, skirmishing enemy. Following three humiliating border defeats, ending with Majuba, all that remained was armistice and a peace agreement, the 1881 Pretoria Convention. A muddy kind of settlement, conceding the substance of Transvaal independence while clinging to a residual Crown 'suzerainty', its legacy was, as Professor Laband emphasizes, 'trouble stored up for the future' (p. 223). His book rightly establishes, or, perhaps, re-establishes, the small Transvaal War as a decisive stage towards the big war of 1899–1902 which would do so much to shape the history of South Africa for the ensuing century. If its fertilizing impact on Afrikaner national consciousness was undoubtedly less than that of the empire–republican tensions of the 1890s, no reader can fail to appreciate the 1880–1 mess as the Jameson Raid of its day.

If this was a small colonial war rather than a total war, what John Laband provides is a total history of this brief yet convoluted Victorian conflict. While the core of this study is an assured outline and precise analysis of opposing cultures of war-making, and an energetic and sensitive depiction of fighting in which mostly exposed British were toppled by slithering and drably-dressed Boers, little of the larger political, diplomatic and social context is left out, including the issue of African attitudes towards the war and peripheral participation in hostilities. With elegant and exact prose, evocative descriptions that bring places and people alive, and discriminating judgements of motive and behaviour, this very attractively produced book is a first-rate narrative to be recommended to anyone with an interest in the 'imperial factor' in nineteenth-century Southern Africa.

*University of Cape Town*

BILL NASSON

## GANDHI JUNIOR AND THE STRUGGLE AGAINST APARTHEID

doi:10.1017/S0021853706282069

*Gandhi's Prisoner?: The Life of Gandhi's Son Manilal.* By UMA DHUPELIA-MESTHRIE. Cape Town: Kwela Books, 2004; New Delhi: Permanent Black, 2005. Pp. 419. Rand 175 (ISBN 0-7957-0176-4).

KEY WORDS: South Africa, apartheid, protest, biography.

This long-awaited biography of Mahatma Gandhi's second son Manilal (1891–1956) has two aims: to examine whether Gandhi's autocratic control rendered Manilal his 'prisoner', and restore Manilal's political contribution to the anti-apartheid struggle in South Africa. Manilal, born in Porbandar in 1891, joined his father in South Africa as a young child. Gandhi comes across as a harsh patriarch. For example, when young Manilal forgot his glasses at home, Gandhi exhorted 'we can't afford to forget such things, can we?', and made him walk five miles to retrieve them. The exhausted and tearful youngster learnt that 'you cannot afford to forget things' (p. 57). There were many such incidents. It is for the reader to determine whether these austere measures reflect parental love or were extreme. Throughout, Gandhi sought to shape Manilal in his own image. He denied him formal education which he distrusted; instead he made him spend hours doing manual labour to develop his character and humility. Gandhi even declined an opportunity to send Manilal to London. The thwarting of Manilal's ambitions produced feelings of inferiority and frustration. After participating in the Satyagraha struggle between 1910 and 1913, Manilal went to India in 1914 with Gandhi, but returned to South Africa in 1918 to edit *Indian Opinion*, the paper Gandhi had founded. He had to remain in Phoenix because Gandhi wanted him to place 'dharma (duty) over desire' (p. 251). Gandhi even forbade Manilal from marrying Fatima Gool because she was Muslim. When Manilal refused to remain celibate, Gandhi chose a Hindu wife for him, the daughter of a wealthy property-owner and fervent Gandhi supporter (pp. 170–83). While the author mentions these incidents, she does not explore Gandhi's views on sex and marriage and his family's challenging them.

Manilal was intimately involved in the Natal Indian Congress (NIC). While visiting India in 1930 he participated in salt marches and spent nine months in prison. This radicalized Manilal who supported militants within the NIC from the late 1930s even though he opposed communism. While Manilal supported African resistance, he was only prepared to collaborate where there was 'a possibility of action' (p. 260). Manilal, through *Indian Opinion*, supported Gandhi and the Indian National Congress, and opposed the creation of Pakistan. He emerged from Gandhi's shadow after his father's death: he visited India, London, Europe and the United States, meeting dignitaries and activist groups. As apartheid gathered momentum in South Africa, Manilal advocated *Satyagraha* as a means of resistance. But he lacked the moral authority of his father and this, together with his distrust of communists, kept him out of the mainstream of resistance as the country moved towards joint defiance. Manilal joined the campaign under the banner of the white-dominated Liberal Party. One of his last public acts was to attend the Congress of the People in June 1955, where the Freedom Charter was adopted. He suffered a stroke in November 1955 and died on 5 April 1956. Unlike Gandhi, he achieved little that was tangible in the struggle against apartheid. His embracing non-violence and obsessive anti-communism left him in the political wilderness. This has taken some of the shine off Manilal's contribution. Manilal's anti-communism is not sufficiently explored.

Manilal's biography makes absorbing reading as it explores whether he was the true heir to Gandhi's spiritual and political legacy. The central question is whether he was his own man or one struggling to live up to the expectations of a father whose shoes he could not fill. Gandhi's influence on Manilal was such that family members used words like 'captive' and 'enslaved' to describe their relationship (p. 24). Dhupelia-Mesthrie argues that Manilal accepted Gandhi's advice because he had a genuine commitment to 'simple living, high thinking and passive resistance to injustice' (p. 399). Why is Manilal's story important? The author provides a clue in the introduction when she writes that it was her mother Sita's wish that Manilal be given appropriate recognition in his own right. While Manilal is given a personality, he is still seen primarily from Gandhi's perspective. There are few direct references to his private thoughts as hardly any of his letters to Gandhi have survived. The author seems, at times, to be caught between being a professional historian and Manilal's granddaughter. She states that she had to 'take care to consider the feelings of my family' although 'there has been no censorship' (p. 27). This raises the broader historiographical question of objectivity when one is so close to the subject. Notwithstanding this, *Gandhi's Prisoner?* is a well-researched biography which offers many new insights into Gandhi the family man and his relationship with his family. This is an absorbing study of the personal and political lives of Mahatma and Manilal Gandhi, as well as the Phoenix Settlement and *Indian Opinion*, set against the background of political developments in South Africa and India during these important decades.

*University of Kwazulu-Natal*

GOOLAM VAHED

## A HISTORY OF STRUGGLE

doi:10.1017/S0021853706292065

*The History of Black Mineworkers in South Africa* (3 vols.). Volume I: *Mining in South Africa and the Genesis of Apartheid 1871-1948*. Volume II: *Apartheid Repression and Dissent in the Mines 1948-1982*. Volume III: *Organise or Die! 1982-1994*. By V. L. ALLEN (vol. III assisted by Kate Carey). Keighley: Moor Press; London: Merlin, 1992, 2003, 2003. Pp. (I) xx+491; (II) xx+489; (III) xxiii+745. £100 the set of 3 vols. (ISBN 0-85036-5651; 0-85036-566x; 0-85036-567-8).

KEY WORDS: South Africa, apartheid, labour, mining.

Allen, a retired Leeds University industrial sociologist, has produced a monumental history of black mining labour in South Africa, focused mainly on the gold mines. Allen became interested in miners in newly independent Africa at the beginning of the 1960s and he recounts his experiences travelling through Africa, including South Africa, in that era. In 1989, Allen encountered Cyril Ramaphosa and James Motlatsi of the National Union of Mineworkers in Cuba and they convinced him to concentrate on South African mining history. The union not only eased his entry into South Africa but obviously facilitated his research tasks enormously: it is listed as the distributor of the first volume. This project is thus conceived as part of an engaged struggle history intended to highlight the miners' background, problems and efforts to improve their lot – integrated tightly with the broader history of black insurgent politics in white-dominated South Africa. Thus Allen has felt it necessary as a white foreigner to explain his 'credentials' for writing such a history. This apologia allows him to tell the very interesting tale of

his adventures in and impressions of Africa, notably at the mercy of a conservative Nigerian government that gaoled him as a Communist agent in 1964.

A second aspect of the conception behind this trilogy, one which is not overt, is rooted in the sympathetic fascination of the British left with the anti-apartheid struggle: an assumption that the reader is likely to have almost no knowledge of South African society and history. As a result, Allen feels obliged to summarize and synthesize knowledge about South African political and economic history at considerable length. At times, as when he claims the emancipation of the slaves in 1833 was of little significance or that the Freedom Charter of 1955 was relatively uncontroversial, solving the ANC's problem of how to conceptualize race in South Africa, this leads him towards an overly triumphalist party history liberation narrative. In general, however, his judgement is sound enough and based on wide and thoughtful reading. The problem rather is that for readers of this journal, this aspect of the book enormously and unnecessarily adds to its length and could have the effect of masking what is best in it.

What Allen, who has extensively researched mining in different countries, adds to the literature is his excellent sense for the material conditions of mining and the meaning of the mining experience. He has also made a major effort to use his research situation to try to think through the views of the black miners at the rock face and in the hostels. While this last aspect was very difficult to apply to the far or even medium past, where he could actually access working or recently retired men, this dimension is effective and important. In consequence, the value of the trilogy disproportionately lies in the final volume, itself much longer than most contemporary historical monographs.

The first volume will detain this review least. Covering the period up to the 1946 miners' strike, its most interesting element concerns that strike. Allen argues that it had little chance of succeeding although he believes equally that strikes are historic learning experiences for workers that contribute to their development even when lost. It helped to bring the ANC and the SACP together in anticipation of the alliance forged in the following decade. This first volume has already been available to the public for well over a decade and mostly covers issues derived from elsewhere in the scholarly literature. Perhaps, though, Allen's forthright and detailed comments on the arrogant and hostile attitude of the mining companies towards independent scholarly research beyond their control, something which has persisted, should be underscored. Unfortunately they fit all too well his general assessment of how these companies have operated within the broader South African society.

The second volume provides detailed discussions of recruitment, training, the use of language, sociability and the complex issues relating to injury and ill-health engendered by this massive industry. As Allen points out, this was the heyday of South African mining and a number of mining products, notably coal, took their place with gold as major exports. Allen's discussions of health and safety issues are painstakingly thought-provoking. Perhaps its strongest event-centred feature is the extensive account of the Coalbrook colliery disaster of 1960 when 437 miners died in a vast roof fall in the northern Orange Free State. Virtually no punishment of any sort was meted out to management or supervisors.

The second volume, despite problems of evidence, has a certain richness because important and problematic shifts in the situation of labour on the gold mines in the 1970s briefly led to a kind of glasnost era when a number of significant researchers, notably Merle Lipton and J. K. McNamara (with important work also by Dunbar Moodie and Wilmot James) were able to open up a field of study based on solid evidence. Ironically, it was the willingness of the gold mines to increase wages for black miners – but on the basis of the beginnings of differentiated categories of

remuneration – that did the most to inaugurate a period of intense violence on the mines, especially characterized by so-called faction fighting. Allen rejects by omission Moodie's emphasis on the moral economy of the mines in his assessment of the 1946 strike but it seems that this new element of stratification enforces Moodie's view of a historic breakdown of how workers conceived of what they were doing. They were unwilling to accept categories of differentiation not based on the sweat of their brows and the common migrant experience.

One element of change at the mineface was the introduction of machinery, some of it labour-saving. A large proportion of mine workers re-enlisted for their jobs so regularly and speedily that they had really become proletarians who took leave periods in impoverished rural communities rather than genuine migrant workers. More dramatically than ever before, the mines companies shifted rapidly between different national and regional supply sources. Seniority and skill levels became roughly identifiable with place of origins, often with growingly different political traditions. Mozambican miners, for instance, were significantly affected by the dynamism of African nationalism in Mozambique and the coming of FRELIMO to power. Later on, however, they were relatively indifferent to a politicization that focused on South African politics. Lesotho miners often related to a politics that was hostile to the Lesotho government which collaborated with the apartheid authorities. But then the Jonathan government effectively changed sides, creating a more complex situation. One major shift which began to be more typical was access by miners to the outside world, whether to commute back to a household in Lesotho for a weekend or to confront the increasingly politicized atmosphere within smouldering Highveld townships. Under these various pressures, the *induna* system of labour control at the lowest level started to come into question. Allen is also very good on the oppressive racial regime and the way that black resistance outside the mines began to find echoes within. The crude face of *baaskap* in the stopes was the very essence of the long-enduring racist character of the social system more generally. The mines, and especially the compounds where miners stayed, became extremely turbulent and violent.

It was educated white-collar workers on the mines who first became enthusiastic about the possibilities of unionization. Given the difficulties experienced by the mining companies, allowing union organization in the hope that it could actually assist in the renewal of a somewhat modernized social order at work, made some sense to the more enlightened managers. On this basis, the National Union of Mineworkers was born as a union affiliated to a group linked to the black consciousness tradition and began to organize in 1982. The third volume is essentially the history of the NUM, a history indissoluble from the broader history of insurgency in the last decade of apartheid South Africa. Here Allen is a guide with first-hand knowledge and consistent critical judgement of organization, leadership and conjuncture. With Karl von Holdt's recently published study of Highveld Steel and Glenn Adler's Columbia University Ph.D. on Volkswagen workers in the eastern Cape, this is the most important detailed look at the industrial and political struggles of black workers during this period.

Very quickly, management learnt that the rise of the NUM unleashed forces which would not easily fit into their model of a labour regime. The picture created by Allen of the union is of a duality. On the one hand, there is central office, ably guided by the statesman-like Cyril Ramaphosa, who abandons his Black Consciousness roots and moves towards the ANC tradition, jousting with top management and dependent on increasingly generous foreign assistance as he begins to broach the big political questions of the day. On the other is the vast, often uncontrollable, set of forces operating from below and brought into motion by the key areas of conflict experienced by underground workers, prepared to

question far more than management found palatable. Shaft stewards emerging from the ranks challenged the paternalistic *induna* system of control with few resources and very limited assistance from the union. The sheer violence between black and white over conventional racial boundaries of behaviour became a major part of the drama. Many of the mines employed far more than 10,000 workers and conflicts involved a host of actors in labour organization and security and took on the form of battles and quasi-military campaigns. Brutal internal violence amongst miners constantly punctuated straightforward fights between unions and management.

The culminating event was the massive 1987 strike to which many major gold and coal mines adhered. The NUM was able to hold out and survive this event but it was not ready to face the massive dismissals that management ordained and suffered a critical defeat. The hopes of miners that the union could genuinely transfer the way mining work was done were permanently shattered and class struggle took the form of defensive action against dismissals. Since 1987 not only has the mine labour force diminished very considerably, the role of mining in the economy from every point of view has declined, especially gold mining. Asbestos mining (with little history of organization), to which Allen devotes considerable attention and is the most problematic of all for health, has almost entirely ceased. Platinum mining, focused on Northwest Province, is by contrast a major factor in contemporary South African economic growth. In one recent year it overtook gold as South Africa's major export by value.

This massive project ends with the electoral triumph of the ANC in 1994, albeit in a context where it had to make important social and economic concessions. Today, ownership in mining is changing as Black Economic Empowerment guidelines and public-private linkages transform the boardroom. However, the basic conditions under which large numbers of poorly paid workers experience very high risks to life, limb and health and where living conditions often remain reminiscent of those in a conscript army have changed far less, and this in the context of general economic decline within this sector. During most of the narrative of the final volume, Allen quite effectively keeps in tension the relationship between the struggles on the mines and the wider political context. This once close relationship now again experiences considerable distance, as Allen with his concern for the lives of the working miners grimly observes towards the end of this volume.

*University of KwaZulu-Natal*

BILL FREUND

## THE RAND REVOLT

doi:10.1017/S002185370630206X

*White Rising: The 1922 Insurrection and Racial Killing in South Africa.* By JEREMY KRIKLER. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2005. Pp. xvii + 405. £25 (ISBN 0-7190-6844-4).

KEY WORDS: South Africa, labour, miners, rebellion, strikes, apartheid.

The 1922 Rand Revolt offers good opportunities for historians, providing as it does rich narrative material and raising complex analytical questions. The episode highlights and encapsulates the race/class enigma that has for long enlivened and perplexed South African social science, and which continues to impinge heavily on the politics of the post-apartheid era.

In this fine book Jeremy Krikler ably exploits the narrative opportunities, and perceptively broadens the analytical framework in which the revolt can be examined. Specific events are vividly recounted: the battle of Brakpan, the aerial bombing of Benoni, the attack on the Imperial Light Horse at the Ellis Park military depot, the attempt to assassinate Smuts, to name a few. There are colourful characters too: Percy Fisher, 'who propagated unremitting class warfare and whose opposition to capitalism was of the kind that would lead him to sacrifice his life' (p. 216). Or Samuel Long, who, together with two other rebel leaders, went bravely to the gallows singing defiantly.

Krikler departs from standard historical accounts which have focused on the origins, results and political economy of the insurrection. Rather, his approach is phenomenological, as he strives to capture 'the manifold experiences of the strike and the rebellion' (p. 292). There is indeed a wealth of detail, accumulated during the twelve years of research that went into the book. Through his phenomenological approach Krikler develops a degree of empathy for his protagonists, white mineworkers rising in revolt against hard-nosed, profit-driven mineowners firmly backed by the Smuts government. But such empathy also creates dilemmas for Krikler, as these rebel mineworkers were fighting in defence of their racial privilege, striving to protect the job colour bar in the face of attempts by the mining companies to erode it. Moreover the rebellion would take some brutal, ugly turns. The worst of these were the racial killings – the wanton, random attacks on Africans, comparable to Barend Strydom's later massacre of eight innocent black bystanders in Pretoria in 1988.

Krikler tries to work his way through the dilemma – always a challenge when there is a hint of relativism – by highlighting the ambiguities of the revolt: there was 'a denial of solidarity with black workers and yet the assertion of proletarian rights; the most cowardly brutality (racial killing) and a brave rising against impossible odds ... There was both dignity and pathology, honour and horror, in this confused and hopeless struggle' (p. 293). A pithy summation, but not an entirely convincing resolution of the dilemma.

Krikler pays considerable attention to a central question – why and how was it that a strike escalated into a full-scale rebellion? His handling of this question is one of the main strengths of the book. In particular he highlights a militaristic culture brought to the mines by those workers who had fought in the First World War. Historians have for long connected this culture to the rise of far-right militancy in fascist Europe, but rarely examined its influence on labour and socialist movements. In what is perhaps the most original contribution of the book, Krikler brings out well the military character and elements of the revolt: the military structure of the rebel commandos, the nomenclature and insignia, the marching, the parade-ground assemblies, the court martials. Here were war veterans bringing the culture and experience of the western front to the Witwatersrand.

The book recounts well the rising tide of militancy and the drift towards insurrection in February and early March 1922. More radical groupings assumed direction of the struggle. Smuts provocatively threw the government's weight behind the mineowners. Then came the dramatic five-day insurrection itself from 10 to 14 March. For the first two days all went the way of the rebels. Almost the whole of the Rand came under their sway, as a number of police stations fell to commando attacks. The rebels had destroyed state authority in much of Johannesburg. But on 12 March the tide turned as Smuts brought troops and the air force into play. De Havilland aircraft, armed with machine guns and bombs, were deployed. The rebels were heavily outnumbered and outgunned. By 14 March the insurrection was effectively over.



These were momentous days in South African history. Krikler has a vivid story to recount – and it is perhaps unfortunate that he chose to locate his major narrative section (chapter 7) towards the end of the work. The book would have read better had the main narrative preceded the more analytical chapters.

Reviewers often make the mistake of criticizing a book for not doing what they think should be done, and fail to take proper account of the author's intentions. Without wanting to fall into that trap, I do venture a few critical comments. I was surprised that there was hardly a mention of the 1920 African mineworkers' strike. After all, it has been suggested (maybe wrongly) that there was a connection between the two strikes – that the mineowners wanted to relax the job colour bar not only to reduce production costs, but also to appease black mineworkers. I would also like to have had a clearer picture of the rebels' ultimate goals. Did they have clear objectives, or was this a frenzied rush into insurrection? Once they had overwhelmed the police what did they expect to happen? Was the objective to secure the job colour bar, or something more revolutionary?

I found the last two pages of the book particularly powerful. Here Krikler brings out poignantly some of the horrors and brutality of the revolt – the racial killings, the innocent bystanders caught in cross-fire, the impact of aerial bombing. The destructiveness of the rising could have been more fully documented and emphasized. We are told that hundreds of people were killed or wounded in the conflict. A more precise computation of deaths could have been provided, as well as a fuller indication of infrastructural damage. Such detail would serve to underline that this was a foolhardy rebellion rather than an heroic struggle.

This is not to detract from an admirable study. The depth and breadth of Krikler's research has enabled him to uncover incidents and events long hidden, to recount individual experiences and tribulations and to subject the whole rebellion to a deep, probing, nuanced analysis.

*Department of History, Rhodes University*

PAUL MAYLAM

## WILD ANIMALS AND POLITICAL CONFLICT IN COLONIAL KENYA

doi:10.1017/S0021853706312066

*Black Poachers, White Hunters: A Social History of Hunting in Colonial Kenya.*

By EDWARD I. STEINHART. Oxford: James Currey, 2006. Pp. viii + 248. £50 (ISBN 0-85255-961-5); £15.95, paperback (ISBN 0-85255-960-7).

KEY WORDS: Kenya, precolonial, colonial, conservation, hunting, politics, social, tourism, wild animals.

Historians have very often seen land alienation as the driving force behind colonial Kenya's politics. There is now a great body of scholarship demonstrating how different agricultural or pastoral communities were dispossessed of their land and how, in experiencing this loss, some Africans were fired by an outrage that fed radical politics. Edward Steinhart's new book invites Kenya's historians to expand our understanding of colonial political life. Steinhart convincingly shows that the control over wild animals was a key area of conflict between Africans, settlers and colonial officials. Where in precolonial eastern Kenya people developed a dynamic hunting tradition, white settlers and government officials presumed that they were naturally the owners of Kenya's wildlife. White hunters disparaged Africans'

courage and skill, while post-Second World War conservationists regarded African hunters as poachers, illegally intruding on sacrosanct national parks. Debates over the ownership of Kenya's wildlife, argues Steinhart, were central in the definition of 'what it has meant to be Kenyan, what is meant to be male, and what it continues to mean to be "civilized"' (p. 13).

Hunting was by no means marginal to precolonial African economic life. Even proud cattle keepers periodically took to the bush in pursuit of game, argues Steinhart. Sometime before the nineteenth century Bantu hunters learned new techniques from Waata indigenes, who used heavy bows and poisoned arrows to pursue elephant and other game. Ivory harvesting peaked in the late nineteenth century, when Kamba hunters raised their part-time hunting activities to the 'motor force of their social and economic life' (p. 45). Steinhart demonstrates how existing Kamba work groups expanded into large-scale hunting parties, led by expert hunters called Waathi. Hunting technique in precolonial eastern Kenya was, in summary, a 'changing, adaptive, and inventive ... praxis' (p. 208), not simply an act of desperation.

Africans' conceptions about hunting were vital in shaping colonial Kenya's distinctive contribution to worldwide tourism, the safari. Steinhart argues that the safari was the 'central arena where European and African ideas about hunting met and merged to create a truly Euro-African synthesis by the 1930s' (p. 114). European hunters who were pursuing eastern Africa's game by the late nineteenth century, were heirs to an aristocratic culture that linked hunting with military skill, athleticism and manliness. Steinhart locates the origins of Kenya's safari culture in the travels of Theodore Roosevelt, who spent several months in Kenya in 1909. The extravagance of Roosevelt's expedition set a glamorous standard reproduced in the late 1920s travels of the Prince of Wales and in the contemporaneous literature of Ernest Hemmingway. These and other expeditions employed African labour and rested on African expertise. But this relationship was never acknowledged in hunters' memoirs, which celebrated the exclusively 'white' virtues of honesty and courage proven through the hunt.

The denigration of African hunting expertise was carried forward by the modern conservation movement. The earliest official guardian of Kenya's wildlife was the Game Department, a corps of white settlers and African gamekeepers created to curb animals' incursions into farmland. By the 1930s, an international consensus emphasized that wilderness should be territorialized and guarded against human interference. Kenya's first national parks were created near Nairobi in 1946 and in Tsavo in 1948. Their creation was not simply a victory for Kenya's fauna, says Steinhart. In 1956–7, African hunters in Tsavo were pursued by government agents who had trained in military practice while fighting against Mau Mau. Like an earlier generation of white hunters, conservationists assumed that the best guardians of nature were the imperial and colonial ruling classes (p. 174), and regarded African hunters as poachers.

Where scholars have often characterized colonial Kenya's history as a struggle over land and labour, this book enables us to see how debates over the control of animals shaped colonial political life. But the book has too little to say about the changing practice of African hunting during colonial times. Steinhart borrows from Mary Louise Pratt in arguing that the big game safari was 'about synthesis, the negotiation of a truly transcultural production' (p. 137). This statement is repeated several times in the book (pp. 2, 109, 114, 137, 209, 211). But Steinhart nowhere analyses Africans' manifold contributions to big game safaris. There is no description of the various tasks that African guides, porters or gunbearers undertook, nor are there biographies of the African experts who aided white hunters. In consequence, the contention that the safari was a 'synthesis' of African and

European values is largely unproven. Neither is the experience of African hunting communities during colonial times analysed, save in two paragraphs at the end of the book (pp. 202–3).

Its limits notwithstanding, this readable book deserves attention both from Kenya's political historians and from the growing company of scholars exploring the problematic origins of conservationism.

*Selwyn College, University of Cambridge*

DEREK R. PETERSON

## MEDICINE MURDERS AND COLONIAL RULE: THE LESOTHO CASE

doi:10.1017/S0021853706322062

*Medicine Murder in Colonial Lesotho*. By COLIN MURRAY and PETER SANDERS. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2005. Pp. xvi + 493. £50 (ISBN 0-7486-2285-4).

KEY WORDS: Lesotho, colonial, violence, witchcraft.

A series of gruesome medicine murders in the 1940s and 1950s known in Sesotho as *liretlo* or *diretlo* besmirched the reputation of the Basotho as one of the more progressive African peoples. The violence was a blot on British colonialism before world opinion and a rallying point for the nascent Lesotho nationalist movement. Attempts to suppress it and to contain the political damage included hanging two of the most senior chiefs in the native administration and executing female conspirators. Yet at the same time, the British were also rumoured to be protecting the most powerful of alleged instigators, the paramount chieftainess, Amelia Mantšebo Seiso.

In this climate of intense suspicion, fear and secrecy, both the murders and British responses were often characterized in extreme terms, from proof of supposedly intrinsic African savagery to evidence of British deviousness. Prominent Basotho, dismissing the importance of sometimes-horribly mutilated bodies and courtroom confessions, even denied the existence of *liretlo* except as a conspiracy by the British to lay the ground for incorporating the territory into South Africa. Foreign scholars subsequently tended to emphasize select aspects of the story without conducting dedicated research.

Nearly six decades have passed since the height of the *liretlo* crisis. At last, two distinguished scholars have gone back to primary sources to try to sort truths from speculation and polemics. Colin Murray, an anthropologist, and Peter Sanders, a historian, set themselves six principal objectives: to establish whether *liretlo* murders did indeed take place (yes, they did); to test contemporary claims that there was a 'startling' increase in *liretlo* that could be linked to changes in the native administration (no and yes); to assess the causes of *liretlo*; to assess the meaning of 'moral crisis' specifically in the 1940s and 1950s (given that *liretlo* cases also happened before and after those years); to reflect on the reliability of the principal primary sources in light of the methods purportedly used by the police and courts (collective punishment, incentives to perjury and so on); and to suggest potential avenues for comparative ethnographic and historical research on 'witchcraft' or medicine murders elsewhere in Africa. Murray and Sanders provide four detailed case studies of especially significant trials, an overview of the way the murders have been treated in works of fiction and an appendix of over 100 pages that summarizes all of the murders, trials and sources that the authors

identified through their research. They largely exonerate the colonial administration from the strongest accusations against it. They confirm, with important qualifications, that the moral crisis was rooted in Sesotho culture but exacerbated by economic stress and (unavoidable?) rapid social and political change.

Murray and Sanders have uncovered a wealth of hitherto overlooked documents. They have also drawn on oral interviews with former colonial officials and Basotho who were involved in some of the more spectacular cases. They do not make use of the voluminous archives of the Roman Catholic mission. This, together with the fact that Sanders was a mid-ranking member of the Basutoland administration from 1961 to 1966, may have influenced the analysis. While meticulous in attention to detail, for example, the authors tend strongly to give the benefit of the doubt to the British. One of many instances would be the admiring portrayal of High Commissioner Evelyn Baring, who was no doubt an impressive man but whose inflammatory rhetoric and undiplomatic treatment of Basotho chiefs almost certainly exacerbated underlying political tensions. At other times Murray and Sanders seem almost sarcastic toward those foreign scholars who have, in their view, been naïve or too sympathetic to Basotho complaints about British bullying, duplicity and racism or sexism.

Sceptics may not be fully convinced by the analysis. Notably, Murray and Sanders convict Mantšebo as a 'shadow instigator' on much the same circumstantial evidence as was rumoured in the 1950s, citing, among other things, the British anthropologists who identified her as a guilty party in 1951. A small number of Basotho (including a police constable) provide oral testimony that corroborates the official view. Again, this may well be true. But it would also be a simple matter today to find just as many Basotho who would passionately testify the precise opposite. And how far, really, can we trust the views of either the British officials (who had good reasons to deflect attention from their manifold, manifest bumbling) or an anthropologist of Nigeria (who did not speak Sesotho and who enjoyed the hospitality of those same British officials throughout his four and a half months in the country)?

To their credit, Murray and Sanders acknowledge these problems and generally couch their claims in cautious language. They shed new light on the personalities and motivations of key actors in a formative period of Lesotho's history, and pose provocative questions to researchers in several disciplines including what might be termed 'witchcraft studies'. No serious scholar of Lesotho or of African social history in South Africa can afford to overlook this book.

*Queen's University, Canada*

MARC EPPRECHT

## ETHNICITY: A PROBLEM FOR DEMOCRACY IN AFRICA?

doi:10.1017/S0021853706332069

*Ethnicity and Democracy in Africa*. Edited by BRUCE BERMAN, DICKSON EYOH and WILL KYMLICKA. Oxford: James Currey, 2004. Pp. xv + 336. £50 (ISBN 0-85255-861-9); £18.95, paperback (ISBN 0-85255-860-0).

KEY WORDS: Colonial, postcolonial, democracy, ethnicity, politics.

The liberal insistence on the equality of individuals finds its flipside in laws and policies that are blind to difference. One of the most prolific political philosophers to amend conventional liberal theories so that they might accommodate cultural,

linguistic and religious diversity is Will Kymlicka. The influence and applications of his ideas now extend far beyond his native Canada, discussed variously under the broad themes of multiculturalism, citizenship and, as here, ethnicity. For example, *Ethnicity and Democracy in Africa* has been followed by *Multiculturalism in Asia*, co-edited by Kymlicka and Benogang He (Oxford University Press, 2005). An earlier volume, co-edited by Kymlicka and Magda Opalski (Oxford University Press, 2001), asked in its title the question that runs through these trans-continental debates: *Can Liberal Pluralism Be Exported?* Such is Kymlicka's status as the sage in these debates that Opalski gave her chapter the title 'Can Will Kymlicka be exported to Russia?'

The answers to these questions have usually been cautious in their support for Kymlicka's arguments, but significant is the way the parameters of debate have been defined by a liberal theory which developed under specific historical circumstances. The eighteen chapters in *Ethnicity and Democracy in Africa* present enough empirical and analytical diversity to mitigate reductionism, but its early contextualizing chapters and its conclusion tend to perpetuate the habit of regarding African circumstances as secondary to Euro-American models of liberalism. Kymlicka himself, whose 'scheduling conflicts' prevented him from participating in the conference from which this volume originated, is explicit about the order of the comparative enterprise. His question is whether Western models of minority rights and nation-building are relevant to Africa. The question probably emerges from Kymlicka's self-reported lack of expertise in African affairs, a condition that may also explain the curious paradox that his is the chapter where a previously unknown ethnic group appears: 'Chewi' people who, so Kymlicka claims, live in Malawi.

Nobody in this volume, Kymlicka included, proposes a transplantation of Western models to Africa. All are sufficiently enchanted by the academic version of current liberalism to grant Africa its own modernities. Yet some readers may wonder why authors with life-long exposure to Africa would want to subscribe to Kymlicka's order of comparison. It is hard to avoid the impression that, for example, Bruce Berman's erudite chapter on the emergence of trust in modern bureaucracies presents a narrative where Africa's place is defined in terms of lack and absence. According to this narrative, what Africans do possess – the loyalties and personal ties of kinship and ethnicity – never quite compensate for their lack of a public arena where universalistic norms and civic trust prevail. The narrative is historical, of course, and it accords due weight to the colonial period. What remains constant in this narrative, however, is the definition of liberal democracy in which European civil servants' 'austere commitment to nation-building' (p. 53) leaves, from the outset, African ethnicity without a positive value.

Berman acknowledges John Lonsdale's seminal distinction between moral ethnicity and political tribalism, but not only does he devote most of his account to the latter, moral ethnicity also assumes the potentially pathological trait of keeping social trust 'contained within ethnic communities' (p. 47). The argument risks losing the considerable intellectual resources that Lonsdale's distinction makes available. As Lonsdale observes in his own chapter, 'ethnicity is a universal cradle of civility' (p. 77). The perspective qualifies instrumental, top-down and state-centred approaches with a sense of 'an argued, negotiated' (p. 79) process of politics. Lonsdale's chapter inaugurates a stream of substantial chapters, whose informative analyses are likely to be this volume's greatest service to students. Lonsdale's Kenyan case is complemented by two more chapters on that country, and South Africa is also the focus of three chapters while Nigeria figures in two. Botswana, Cameroon, the Democratic Republic of Congo and Senegal each get a chapter's worth of specialist attention. These chapters share a delightful

appreciation of the 'argued and negotiated' processes by which ethnicity assumes its position in African pluralism. Inevitably, a good deal of discussion revolves around intellectuals, whether as driving forces behind cultural associations in Jacqueline Solway's Botswana case, shrewd manipulators of regional alliances in Dickson Eyoh's Cameroon case, or separatists in Mamadou Diouf's account of the Casamance crisis in Senegal. A. S. Atieno Odhiambo offers the most audible voice of dissent against the volume's Kymlicka-inspired preoccupation with liberal democracy. He laments the fact that the efforts to envisage African variants of democracy in the early 1960s were deleted from the debates in the 1990s. Particularly welcome is his ability to go beyond the focus on intellectuals through a subtle discussion of how cultural practices such as male circumcision and cliter-ideotomy could foster a Gikuyu sense of civil society.

Perhaps the greatest challenge that African history might present to the current liberal model of pluralism is precisely the opposite to the premise of this book. Despite insisting on the modernity and legitimacy of ethnicity in Africa, the book continues a long tradition of identifying ethnicity as a problem for democracy, now filtered through a theory of multiculturalism. Whereas Kymlicka has based his theory on the assumption that individuals belong to distinct cultures (in, for example, *Multicultural Citizenship* [Oxford, 1995]), multiple identities and cross-cutting ties have long presented opportunities to either transcend or constructively appropriate ethnic identities in Africa. Through its very focus on ethnic groups as individuating cultures, *Ethnicity and Democracy in Africa* sees in inter-ethnic alliances little else than the prospect of some ethnic groups becoming 'culturally and linguistically assimilated into larger, culturally related groups' (p. 319). The persistent assumption among liberal multiculturalists that individuals belong to distinct ethnic or cultural groups is probably an important reason why the promise of moral ethnicity remains largely unrecognized, both conceptually and politically.

University of Cambridge

HARRI ENGLUND

## GENDER AND NATIONALISM IN GUINEA

doi:10.1017/S0021853706342065

*Mobilizing the Masses: Gender, Ethnicity, and Class in the Nationalist Movement in Guinea, 1939–1958.* By ELIZABETH SCHMIDT. Portsmouth NH: Heinemann, 2005. Pp. xv + 293. \$99.95 (ISBN 0-325-07031-8); \$27.95, paperback (ISBN 0-325-07030-x).

KEY WORDS: Guinea, decolonization, gender, nationalism.

Elizabeth Schmidt's new book considers the nationalist movement in Guinea-Conakry, and the people and forces that propelled Guinea's 'No' vote in the referendum of 1958. In that referendum, inhabitants of French colonies decided whether to remain in a reconstituted French Community. As the only French colony to reject the proposal, Guinea gained immediate independence. Sékou Touré, leader of the Guinean branch of the Rassemblement Démocratique Africain (RDA), became Guinea's first president.

In general terms, Guinea's path to independence, encapsulated by Touré's declaration that 'We prefer poverty in liberty to riches in slavery' is well known. But by focusing on the base of support that Touré rode to power, Schmidt moves beyond the male leaders of the RDA to consider the women and men who fueled

the nationalist movement. In applying the sources and methods of social history to a political process, Schmidt shows how military veterans, peasants, trade unionists and women drove the RDA to power. Members of the RDA shared common grievances against the colonial system but differences in class, ethnicity and gender also generated fissures that challenged the party's leadership.

This book shines where it focuses on a subject of enduring interest to Schmidt. Building on questions about gender relations and women's roles that informed her book, *Peasants, Traders, and Wives* (Portsmouth NH: Heinemann, 1992), Schmidt brings substance and nuance to the axiom that women figured centrally in Guinea's independence movement. Drawing on a variety of sources including interviews, Schmidt shows how women stepped out of their 'traditional' roles to take actions they thought critical to improving their own future and that of their families. Women supported labor strikes and joined the RDA, where they shaped the party's platform. Women of various ethnic and class backgrounds led membership drives and gave public speeches. They took advantage of their daily interactions to spread news, gather support and compose songs and slogans for their cause. Although exceptional, some RDA women organized 'shock troops' and used violence and its threat to promote their goals and protect their members. These brigades, as well as other conflicts that erupted along regional and ethnic lines, indicate that an undercurrent of violence also figured in Guinea's nationalist struggle.

Schmidt uses with sensitivity the interviews and other sources on women's activism, revealing how personal concerns and hopes translated into a political movement. She also flags carefully how the passage of time, changed priorities and the charged political context of the 1990s, when these interviews took place, shaped the environment in which men and women were willing to talk (or not) about events that took place a half-century prior.

In analyzing the contributions of other people to the nationalist movement, in particular those of peasants, urban workers and military veterans, Schmidt relies more on secondary texts and archival evidence, particularly police reports filed by spies and informers. These sources do not, however, have the same perspective or dynamism as those that inform Schmidt's discussions of women and gender. Given the national scope of this grass-roots movement, as well as its ethnic and regional tensions, this book also would have benefited from more interviews outside Conakry, where Schmidt carried out almost all of her oral research. Finally, a topic left surprisingly unexplored is that of women's suffrage. Schmidt notes that women in Guinea and French West Africa earned the right to vote in 1956 (pp. 173, 178). Was this viewed as a victory by the women of the RDA, or was it incidental to their political aims? How did suffrage change party politics and the household and marital conflicts that Schmidt brings to light? How did women voters affect the outcome of the 1958 referendum?

*Mobilizing the Masses* concludes with the RDA-led 'No' vote of 1958 and Guinea's independence. The vote demonstrates that a political culture had taken root that encouraged party formation and political participation by both women and men. But this optimistic finale avoids mention of what became of Guinea's nascent democratic tradition. As has been documented elsewhere, Touré, who served as Guinea's first president from 1958 to 1984, developed a dictatorial grip on power. (As of 2005, Guinea has had only two presidents.) While Touré remained consistent in his support of women during his presidency, he also imprisoned thousands of people and his policies propelled thousands more to flee the country. This subsequent transformation of Guinea's political culture – from one that mobilized people from all levels of the social order to one dominated by a hard-fisted ruler – is a change that deserves note, and invites further research at grass-roots level.

This book makes a welcome contribution to studies of independence movements, gender roles and political participation, and Guinea's tumultuous and rich history. It also opens the door to more investigations on political participation and mobilization in Guinea.

*University of Notre Dame*

EMILY LYNN OSBORN

## THE NIGERIAN NATIONAL QUESTION

doi:10.1017/S0021853706352061

*The Amalgamation and Its Enemies: An Interpretive History of Modern Nigeria.*

Edited by RICHARD A. OLANIYAN. Ile Ife: Obafemi Awolowo University Press, 2003 (distributed by African Books Collective, Oxford). Pp. xxiii + 242. £18.95/\$30.95 (ISBN 9-78136-134-4).

KEY WORDS: Nigeria, colonial, postcolonial, state.

Nearly one century after his amalgamation of Northern and Southern Nigeria, Sir Fredrick Lugard continues to cast a long shadow over the debate about the political future of Nigeria. This edited volume is a bold attempt to examine the legacies of this political achievement. For the contributors, the key question is: why, nearly a century after its forced amalgamation, has Nigeria remained a country in search of unity and identity, 'a state without citizens' and 'a rich country full of poor people'? To put it in another way, why has the amalgamation project been seriously subverted by socio-political and ethno-sectarian contradictions? Wherein lie the enemies of amalgamation? This, in brief, is the Nigerian National Question, over which much ink and blood had been split since independence. It is to provide answers to this Question that the ten contributors to this volume, five historians and five political scientists, drawn from five Nigerian universities, have directed their attention.

On the rationale for the amalgamation, there is very little dissonance among the contributors, nearly all of whom criticize Lugard for his misguided and short-sighted vision for the country he had been sent to integrate and administer. Meant to be purely a political and economic expedient, amalgamation was designed to create 'a more profitable union of an impoverished North and an economically better-off South' (Olaniyan and Akin Alao, p. 7), while involving 'as little dislocation of existing conditions as possible' (Ehimika Ifidon, p. 34). Lugard had his wish. Over the next several decades, under the tutelage of successive colonial governors, and as shown in the chapters by Leo Otoide, Rufus Akinyele and another by Ifidon, the colonized groups pursued a policy of 'tribal separatism', remaining isolated, suspicious and hesitant in their interactions with one another. Ethnic chauvinism deepened at the expense of national consciousness; national unity remained, at worst, a chimera, and at best, an aspiration. Following this line of analysis, Dauda Abubakar showed how British rule created a system of decentralized despotism as well as a bifurcated state, which reinforced division and tribal parochialism rather than integration, and which, according to Alade Fawole, decades of post-independence militarism and centralized despotism have been unable to unravel. To further compound the crisis, and as Adigun Agbaje and Adewole Adebawo argued, the entrenchment of a political culture of economic irresponsibility and rapaciousness by the postcolonial Nigerian state, and its failure to protect basic rights and deliver basic amenities to the Nigerian people, resulted in the denial by the people to the state of duties that would have facilitated the



construction of a viable statehood beyond the artificiality of the 1914 contraption. The book concludes on a fairly optimistic note in the chapter by Olaniyan, 'The future of the amalgamation', with a set of impressive but hard to implement recommendations on how to make the amalgamation project a reality.

Much can be said about the merit of this book. With few exceptions, the chapters are well written, comprehensive and perceptive in their coverage, even though the attempts by each contributor to replicate the story of amalgamation often made for some ponderous reading. More importantly, this is not a book about the 1914 amalgamation, but rather an attempt to explain the failure of the postcolonial Nigerian state at nation-building. Many of the contributors presented the amalgamation as a mistake, without seriously considering the viability and the problematics of other alternatives left to the British in 1914 in organizing and administering a territorial entity made up of over 350 ethno-linguistic groups. However, whatever 'mistakes' were made in 1914 will neither explain nor absolve the failure of the Nigerian post-independent elite to unite to ensure political stability and socio-economic development for their newly formed nation. Nearly all the contributors ignored the warnings of Adiele Afigbo who, in his fascinating contribution to the volume, dismissed much of what has been written on the subject by colonists as well as by modern scholars as nothing short of 'myths, howlers, and heresies', since they have all, almost without exception, obfuscated our understanding, by their failure to grasp the fact that amalgamation was not a 'one-shot affair but a continuing and expanding project', to be assiduously worked for and achieved.

In spite of claims by the editor to national representation, many voices are silenced by their absences. While it will not be entirely fair to accuse the contributors of having a jaundiced view of the Nigerian crisis, all the contributors, except one, are southerners, working in southern universities. There was no contribution by a woman nor was there any reference to, not to speak of analysis of, the role of women in the Nigerian national project. With its heterogeneity, a plurality of voices would no doubt have enlivened and enriched the discourse. On the technical side, a few of the pages in the volume are misaligned, while the index, by limiting itself only to names of individuals, is too attenuated conceptually. For a book on political history, a thematic-subject matter indexing would have been more useful. Nevertheless, these criticisms notwithstanding, this is a timely and valuable contribution to the study of modern Nigerian and African history and politics.

*University of New Hampshire*

FUNSO AFOLAYAN

## BLOOD INTO MONEY: THE NIGERIAN POSTCOLONIAL STATE

doi:10.1017/S0021853706362068

*The Pan-African Nation: Oil and the Spectacle of Culture in Nigeria.* By ANDREW APTER. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005. Pp. x + 334. \$24/£17, paperback (ISBN 0-226-02355-9).

KEY WORDS: Nigeria, postcolonial, culture, nationalism, state.

Why did the Nigeria of the 1970s – confident, flush with oil money and apparently developing rapidly – descend into economic, ecological and political chaos within two decades? To answer this question, Apter explores the underlying

contradictions of oil capitalism in Nigeria's enclave economy. These contradictions are approached, not from the perspective of economic exploitation, but through an exploration of the production of culture in postcolonial Nigeria. Taking as a starting point that the notions of national culture and national economy are intrinsically linked, he examines FESTAC, the global festival of black culture hosted by Nigeria in 1977. The Nigerian state spent vast amounts of money on FESTAC, which not only functioned as an inclusive celebration of African culture worldwide, but also more specifically as a showcase for Nigeria's new-found wealth as an oil-producing country and as evidence of its importance in the West African region. The model of national culture put forward, like that of the oil economy, is that of circulation: oil money circulated throughout the national economy, resulting in an accelerated flow of money and commodities that masked the contradictions of expansion without development. The Nigerian state's heavy investment in FESTAC was part of this circulation, resulting in a form of deficit production that converted oil – the lifeblood of the economy – into national culture.

The chapters about FESTAC itself provide a beautifully detailed analysis, not only of the organization of the festival, with its staggering levels of waste and corruption, but also of the process through which the cultural objects that it showcased had been acquired. The mode through which local arts and crafts were bought up for the festival, and accorded extraordinary value as national culture, privileged the distribution of objects over their production, while reducing consumption to display. Apter notes how the state converted the cultural commodity into a different form of value, that of national recognition of and by the state. However, the national culture thus created was shaped not just through the circulation economy of oil, but also by earlier colonial cultural interactions. Careful discussions of two FESTAC events showcasing Nigerian regional culture, the northern Durbar and the southern Regatta, show convincingly how accepted understandings of what constituted Nigerian precolonial culture, followed from the highly invented idioms of ceremonial interaction between colonial officers and traditional rulers. FESTAC's modes of showcasing traditional culture thus indigenized colonial practices.

Subsequent chapters discuss what happened after the oil boom ended and Nigeria's money lost its purchasing power and material value, resulting in a crisis of representation and social credibility that eroded the foundations of civil society. Apter regards the 'national culture' of financial fraud and trickery that is known as '419' as a continuation of the symbolic foundations of inverted production that had emerged during the oil boom. Even the extent to which '419' relies on 'make believe' is thought to flow from the years of the oil boom, which produced large numbers of *nouveaux riches*, who engaged in processes of self-fashioning that bordered on the impersonation of social standing. As with the art of FESTAC, the performance art of the '419' relies on the real or perceived endorsement of the state, as expressed through official letters and registration forms. This 'tissue of illusion' came to include the Nigerian state, and General Babangida's military government's long-drawn-out process of democratization came to be seen as yet another '419'.

Apter notes that: 'The naira is still the naira, but it is now worthless. The same holds for the state, the civil service, and most important of all, even oil. The lifeblood of the nation has become anaemic, undermining its credibility at home and abroad.' This observation draws attention to the central metaphor of the book: the conversion of blood into money. Since the 1980s, studies of witchcraft and of popular culture have drawn attention to the pervasiveness of notions of 'bad' wealth and 'hot' money gained not through hard work but by nefarious means, and have explained these notions as being linked to the ambiguities of the 'petro-naira'.

A ritual transformation of blood into money is thought to be effectuated through witchcraft, often at the expense of close family members, who are of course ultimately more valuable than the money generated in this fashion. Moreover, this wealth proves unproductive and brings its owners no luck. To apply this concept of sterile money to an academic analysis of the actual functioning of the economy and the state is a bold project, but also one that reflects the ways in which Nigerians have been talking about their state for years. Apter's analysis adds dimensions to this, by bringing in recent literature on the nature of the postcolonial state in Africa, as well as Baudrillard's theoretical perspective on the political economy of the sign.

The great value of this book is that from its focus on the production of culture, it is able to suggest connections between diverse spheres at various locations and at various points in time, that are not made in other studies analysing postcolonial Nigeria. The book uses culture as a 'mirror' that allows us to see a deeper, fundamental pattern in Nigerian political economy, which is then replicated in many different variations. Generally, the book proceeds through the interpretation of outside features of activities on different levels and at different times. This makes it a great book to think with, as it encourages the reader to examine familiar interpretations in a new light, drawing attention to many interesting parallels. However, it does not prove influences or connections between the features described; it merely assumes their existence through the comparison of similarities. This is consistently applied as a methodology, but Apter's conclusions about the nature of the state and civil society are not particularly different from other recent studies of African postcolonial states. To me, it really is the process through which the conclusions are produced that is so interesting – even inspiring – about this book, rather than the conclusions as such.

*University of Liverpool*

DMITRI VAN DEN BERSELAAR

### 'PARTIAL REFORM SYNDROME' IN ZAMBIA

doi:10.1017/S0021853706372064

*Political and Economic Liberalisation in Zambia 1991–2001*. By LISE RAKNER. Uppsala: Nordic Africa Institute, 2003. Pp. 235. SEK 220/€25/£16.95/\$ 27.95 (ISBN 91-7106-506-7).

KEY WORDS: Zambia, postcolonial, democracy, economic liberalization.

In 1991 the United National Independence Party (UNIP) of President Kenneth Kaunda was defeated in multiparty elections, and the Movement for Multiparty Democracy (MMD) under Frederick Chiluba swept into office with an ambitious programme of political and economic reforms. Between 1991 and 2001 Zambians experienced three sets of multiparty elections, and saw their currency plummet from 127 Kwacha to 3,611 Kwacha to the US dollar, a devaluation of well nigh 3,000 per cent. The economy shrunk, formal employment decreased, per capita income collapsed and poverty and infant mortality rose (pp. 78–9). Rakner has written a book for those in the development community who may wonder why it was that, in contrast to the proudly touted models of the World Bank and the IMF, and despite the enormous and ambitious political and economic reforms implemented in Zambia between 1991 and 2001, impoverishment increased, whilst political participation decreased, as did access to schooling and medical services. Far from economic and political liberalization having led to the betterment of the

majority, a decade of reform created a position in which people were worse off than before.

Rakner's work, developed from a doctoral thesis submitted in Bergen in 1998, seeks to provide an overview of the manner in which political and economic liberalization hindered or facilitated one another in Zambia between 1991 and 2001. The work concludes that the process of liberalization stalled, and that Zambia is afflicted by 'Partial Reform Syndrome'.

The Zambia that forms the basis of Rakner's analysis is a state subjected to the implementation of policies based on ideas that developed within the development community in the late 1980s, that processes of economic liberalization and political reform were mutually reinforcing and that attempts should be made to implement both simultaneously. According to this model economic and political interest would balance one another whereby economically disadvantaged groups would be able to gain recompense through access to interest groups in the political arena. Rakner notes that 'transitional governments attempting to implement an economic austerity programme, whilst at the same time consolidating the political reform process, were advised to take advantage of the expected political period of grace ['honeymoon'] ... in order to overcome political dilemmas associated with the dual reform process' (p. 15). According to this perspective in the following elections governments would then seek political support from those sections that had gained from the reform process. However in contrast to the modelled expectations it was discovered that, apart from the fact that the economy literally collapsed, the process of political reform did not result in increased political participation. Rakner concludes: 'the Zambian case suggests that the political practices associated with one-party rule, such as centralisation of power in the presidential office and extensive use of state patronage for political gain, may prevail within the formal structures of democracy and a market economy' (p. 16). Furthermore, in those instances where a recipient country 'follows the economic policy prescriptions, lack of adherence to principles of democracy will not be challenged by the donors' (p. 18).

Written in the notably austere language that appears to be the forte of development studies texts, and deploying a two-level game analysis between three sets of actors, Rakner's work leads the reader through the convoluted relationship between (i) government that wishes to remain in power, (ii) international funding bodies (external actors) and (iii) labour, industry, agricultural and business (domestic actors). In a situation where the state is effectively the largest ongoing economic activity in Zambia, it cannot be considered surprising that politicians should seek to retain their access by remaining in office. Nevertheless, the sub-text in the book is that this is in some manner inappropriate and thus morally reprehensible: 'From the mid-1990s onwards, economic policymaking by the MMD government became subordinated to political objectives, most notably, winning the 1996 and 2001 elections' (p. 175).

Rakner argues that the influence of the donors diminished between 1991 and 2001. Indeed, 'the fact that conditionality instruments were employed with no results clearly weakened the credibility of the donors' conditionality instruments' (p. 188). This, for Rakner, reflected continuity rather than a shift in donor-government relations, 'a partial reform syndrome was supported and maintained by the inability of donors to apply the conditionality instruments in a coherent manner' (p. 18). Thus, in the end, a select number of African politicians got the better of donors unable to bring their models to fruition.

In concluding, what troubled me most was not so much the jargon as the simple fact that at no stage does the book come down from the level of models to that of normal everyday living human beings. At no stage does one come across

people, the Zambians, who survived the collapse of their society between 1991 and 2001.

*University of Leiden*

JAN-BART GEWALD

## SHORTER NOTICES

doi:10.1017/S0021853706382060

*Historical Archaeology of Bagamoyo: Excavations at the Caravan-Serai*. By FELIX CHAMI, ELIWASA MARO, JANE KESSY and SIMON ODUNGA. Dar es Salaam: Dar es Salaam University Press, 2004 (distributed by African Books Collective, Oxford). Pp. vi + 77. £9.95/\$12.95, paperback (ISBN 9976-60-402-5).

KEY WORDS: Archaeology.

Bagamoyo, a convenient entrepôt on the African mainland for the Omani sultans' capital on Zanzibar Island, was a major terminus for slaving caravans and European expeditions of exploration into the East African interior in the late nineteenth century. It was here that Livingstone's body reached the coast in 1874 on its long journey back to England. Later the town was briefly the capital of German East Africa, boasting several impressive, though now mostly dilapidated, colonial buildings. For much of the twentieth century, however, Bagamoyo was a quintessentially sleepy town. Now a renaissance has begun, following EU-funded reconstruction of the main road to Dar es Salaam. With Swedish financial support, Tanzanian authorities are attempting to have Bagamoyo added to the UNESCO list of World Heritage sites, a designation that should provide some protection to the town's historic architecture and a boost to tourism. It is within this framework that the Tanzanian Antiquities Unit commissioned Professor Chami and his colleagues to undertake excavations in 2001 and 2002 in the walled compound known as the 'caravan-serai'.

This very slender volume reports the results of the excavations, which were designed to investigate whether the caravan-serai housed an inn for travellers, as the name implies, or whether it was 'a place to store slaves'. Several chapters explore the history of Bagamoyo in some detail, paying particular attention to the question of why Bagamoyo supplanted Kaole as the major town on this stretch of coast. Here the authors expand upon Walter Brown's history published in *Tanzania Notes and Records* in 1970. The excavations themselves are carefully described, with stratigraphic and numismatic evidence being put to good use to establish a detailed chronology for the compound's history. The authors argue that the compound was indeed an inn, though the description and discussion of the artefacts found in and adjacent to the compound is rather perfunctory. Perhaps most intriguing is the discovery of pottery otherwise known only from the southwest of the country and the Great Lakes region, where it has been identified with the Sukuma.

The discussions of both the town's history and the excavations may offer more detail than most tourists would care to read, but for academics it is heartening to see Tanzanians dipping their toes into Bagamoyo's historical archaeology. Bagamoyo's multiethnic population and its turbulent history offer a great opportunity for a major project in historical archaeology.

*California State University, San Bernardino*

PETER ROBERTSHAW

doi:10.1017/S0021853706392067

*Hunting for Development: People, Land and Wildlife in Southern Zimbabwe.* By PER ZACHRISSON. Göteborg: University of Göteborg, 2004. Pp. v+277. No price given (ISBN 91-628-6329-0).

KEY WORDS: Zimbabwe, colonial, postcolonial, development, conservation.

Per Zachrisson's book, his doctoral dissertation in social anthropology, is the result of his fieldwork in Zimbabwe in the late 1990s in two villages in the Gwanda South district along the animal-rich border of Botswana in southern Zimbabwe. True to dissertation style, in the first two parts of the book Zachrisson provides a detailed socio-economic overview of the area and peoples, as well as a survey of the pressing problems peoples in Gwanda South face. What Zachrisson finds is a 'fractured' community in all ways: culturally, historically, economically, politically and socially. Though Zachrisson discusses recent disruptions, such as drought and new patterns of labor migration to Botswana and South Africa, he concentrates on the lasting effects of colonial intrusion. At the center of competing demands in Gwanda South was 'Tuli Circle', which local peoples used for grazing, hunting and for the gathering of fruits and edible caterpillars. Zachrisson shows how the interests of pioneers, ranchers, tourism agents and hunters obscured the concerns of local peoples. Zachrisson focuses his criticism on the colonial period, which, he argues, established intractable circuits of power that excluded local peoples. As Zachrisson's study makes clear, the settler government at best neglected and, at worst, castigated peoples' resource use as destructive and illegal. The policies of the postcolonial government have perpetuated the colonial inheritance of local disempowerment.

The third section of the thesis is the real heart of Zachrisson's argument. Here he pulls together his ethnographic study and the history of the peoples of the area in order to understand the particular problems of the Campfire scheme. They are many and often ironic. Campfire was intended to address two claims on the wildlife that historically conflicted: settler demands to protect animals and the local demand for development. In 1995 Tuli Circle became a protected safari area under the Campfire program with the idea that monies from safari hunters would help local peoples pay for development projects they themselves chose. However the most lasting effect of the Campfire project has been to restrict peoples' access to resources and marginalize local institutions, especially 'traditional' rulers. And contrary to the conservation goals of Campfire, the program has encouraged 'poaching' for subsistence and profit, and increased competition for land. In all ways, then, Campfire has complicated rather than ameliorated poverty and marginalization.

Unfortunately, Zachrisson does not discuss at any length how the liberation war or the post-independence violence in Matabeleland affected peoples' ideas about land and power. And while he recognizes how state power shapes local peoples' options, he does not explore this in any satisfying depth. Zachrisson's snapshots of Campfire meetings and local episodes reveal some of the texture of local and national power relations; though, again, these meanings might be more fully explored.

Scholars interested in Gwanda South and Campfire will want to consult this thesis for its thick description and broad overview. At the same time, Zachrisson should publish some of his most significant findings more concisely and readably.

*Hendrix College*

ALLISON K. SHUTT

doi:10.1017/S0021853706402061

*Britain, South Africa and the East Africa Campaign, 1914–1918. The Union Comes of Age.* By ANNE SAMSON. London: Tauris, 2006. Pp. x+262. £47.50 (ISBN 1-8511-040-4).

KEY WORDS: East Africa, South Africa, imperialism, war.

An archivally well-grounded, detailed and thoughtful study which looks at the war in East Africa and, even more, the governmental politics around it from the perspective of both Britain and South Africa. Unlike Hew Strachan's study, this is a book about politics, and not an operational account. This is an approach which, as Dr. Samson argues, permits the investigation of the interdependency of imperial nations, as well as the extent and process of South African nation building. Other perspectives, most obviously those of black people, receive little attention. In practice, as Samson's book makes clear, there was a multiplicity of players involved, including initially neutral Portugal, and also Indian forces. The latter's defeat at Tanga, combined with South Africa's victory over German South West Africa, reinforced white South African prejudices. In East and Southeast Africa, as elsewhere, the war served as an opportunity to push territorial claims. In return for its dispatch of troops to East Africa, where they arrived in January 1916, South Africa sought the gain of Delagoa Bay in Mozambique from Portugal in exchange for part of German East Africa. The issue was confused by the claim of the British South Africa Company, which administered Southern Rhodesia, that it be given control over Beira and Delagoa Bay. Its Director argued, in 1917, that the Union government was 'not progressive', that the Dutch in South Africa were 'anti-native' and that the Company's territory was contiguous with the German colony. The British government, however, did not take the issue forward. Nevertheless, the Union government failed both to obtain the desired territory (Portugal refused) and to unite the white population in war. Instead, the war reinforced the division between white South Africans. Samson includes an interesting brief account of national memory. She suggests that the failure to remember the East Africa campaign in part arose from the lack of white unity, although she also points out that, whereas the men who died at Delville Wood on the Western Front and are remembered, fought as a unit, those in East Africa frequently changed brigades and had scant chance to develop a level of fraternity.

*University of Exeter*

JEREMY BLACK