

help them to understand. In seven months of active service I have not once seen any group of men listening to a broadcast religious service or talk. These are switched off at once. This reprint, then, may be the means of reaching many who did not, and would not, hear the spoken word. It would be hard to say which of these clergymen has found the most, or least, successful line of approach; but Mr. Russell's blunt treatment of the problem of sexual morals and conduct seems to me good.

MICHAEL SEWELL.

MEDIAEVAL STUDIES

HISTORY OF THE SCHOOLMEN. By E. Crewdson Thomas. (Williams and Norgate, Ltd.; 30s.)

This volume is meant to be a History of Scholasticism from its origin up to the sixteenth century. Unhappily the author in attempting this work has not realised the magnitude of his undertaking. This is all the more to be regretted in that a good work in English on this subject would fulfil the growing need for a more detailed knowledge of Scholastic Philosophy. As it is, to say the least the book is disappointing. The author was optimistic in thinking that he had included sufficient documentation 'to provide a concise book of reference for those who may wish to elaborate any special point or undertake any particular line of research' (p. xiv). There is in fact no serious attempt at documentation. The few references to manuscripts are on the whole valueless. Those concerning French MSS. are nearly all borrowed from Hauréau's *Notices et Extraits*. It would surely have been of greater profit to the student had he been directed to Hauréau's books, with their useful information, than to have presented him with a citation like this: '5504, *Bibl. Nat.*' And, we may ask, what is the use of quoting a single manuscript, when a book, such as the Lombard's *Sentences*, has appeared in hundreds of editions? Further, we find no evidence that the author relied on original sources; rather, it would seem that his main source was Hauréau's *Histoire de la Philosophie Scolastique*, supplemented with some misquoted information from De Wulf's *History of Mediaeval Philosophy* (cited as: *Histoire de la Philosophie de Médiévale*), with Gilson for St. Thomas and St. Bonaventure, and D. Sharp for the English Franciscans. The result is a farrago of mistatements in the exposition of the most vital problems of philosophy, of misrepresentations in the appreciation of the Schoolmen and their teaching, and of countless inaccuracies in history and chronology.

Our charges may seem to some too harsh, but they will find evidence on almost any page in the 650 of the text. One or two instances taken at random will suffice. We read on p. 241 of the astonishing discovery that 'what is known as the *Hexameron* is his (Robert Grosseteste's) Commentary on the *Metaphysics* of Aristotle,

which unfortunately has been lost.' Again, the Dominican Cardinal Thomas of Jorz, who died in 1310, is identified with the Franciscan Thomas of York, who died *ca.* 1260 (pp. 470, 248). Peter of Spain (Pope John XXI) is described as a Dominican and a Thomist, and as 'a better logician than Pope' (p. 462). John Quidort is confused with *John Pungens Asinum* (*ib.*), the distance of more than fifty years between these two masters makes no difference for our author. Robert Kilwardby 'was a strong Augustinian and condemned thirty propositions circulating in Oxford, which were based on Aristotle's *Unity of Form* (sic!), but in spite of this, he was a Thomist' (p. 463). Ulrich of Strasbourg (p. 465), Vincent de Beauvais, whose 'original contributions to the problem of universals are of very doubtful value' (p. 466), Lambert of Auxerre (p. 467), Durand de St. Pourçain (pp. 475-7), Robert Holcot, 'a strong Nominalist, even for a Thomist' (p. 477), were all Thomists. Among the secular masters, Siger de Brabant, whose 'Averroistic opinions were controverted by St. Albertus Magnus in 1269' (p. 480) and by St. Thomas (p. 481), and John of Jandun (pp. 490-1) were also Thomists. Augustin d'Ancona 'was a strict follower of Giles of Rome, who was of the same Order (Augustinian), and thus he was a Thomist' (p. 491). The author occasionally mentions by name Augustinian, Aristotelian, Thomist, Averroist; but he has not begun to grasp the significance of such currents of thought as Augustinianism, Aristotelianism, Thomism, and Averroism. Among the misuse of sources we give only two examples. 'It was generally customary to identify him (Siger of Brabant) with the Siger who was said to be Dante's teacher in Paris and who is represented by Dante in his *Paradiso*, X, 136, as being a close acquaintance of St. Thomas Aquinas and his illustrious circle in Paradise; but according to Wulf this confusion has now been dispelled; nor was this Siger the Siger of Courtrai, d. 1341' (p. 480). Mr. Thomas has utterly misunderstood De Wulf. Then, on Ehrle and Pelster's authority he ascribes to Thomas of Sutton the *Concordantia Librorum Thomae*, adding: 'which according to the catalogue of Stams was included in the edition of St. Thomas's own works by Pius V' (p. 470). Can the author know what the catalogue of Stams is? The bibliography is inadequate, and often incorrect or out of date. The author is unacquainted with works on Scholastic philosophy published in the last fifty years. He is unaware of the great collections or periodicals dealing with mediaeval studies, except that he cites the *Bibliothèque Thomiste* and the *Archives d'Histoire doctrinale et littéraire du Moyen Age*, under the name of Longpré (obviously this citation has been borrowed from Miss Sharp), as also under Longpré he refers to the *Dictionnaire de Histoire Ecclésiastique* (!). Of Mandonnet he knows a single article translated into English, and of Grabmann only two works. Dinifle (misspelt Denfle) and Pelster (confused with Pelzer) appear twice, Ehrle and Sertillanges once, but without any reference. All other mediae-

valists are ignored. Ueberweg is cited from the English translation of 1872 and De Wulf from that of 1926. I can only refer to the innumerable misprints (or mistakes?) in the titles of books, particularly when cited in Latin.

All this error is very serious in a work purporting to be a reference book. And I have not even mentioned the graver doctrinal blunders. The author's aim in writing this book was to foster a deeper knowledge of Scholastic Philosophy. Unfortunately, it is to be feared that it will add to its disrepute and will increase the confusion of ideas about its most important tenets. DANIEL A. CALLUS, O.P.

BOOKS RECEIVED

- ALLEN & UNWIN: *The End of this War*, Storm Jameson (2/-).
 BLACK: *Back to the Country*, F. D. Smith and Barbara Wilcox (6/-). *
 BURNS OATES: *Catholic Diary* (2/- or 3/6); *Catholic Directory* (7/6); *Catholic Who's Who Supplement* (2/6); *Catholic Almanack* (4d.)—for 1942; *Some Mysteries of Jesus Christ*, Vincent McNabb, O.P. (2/6); *Old Catholic Lancashire*, Vol. 3, F. O. Blundell, O.S.B. (6/-); *Haven and other Poems*, Jack Gilbey (3/6).
 CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS: *Richard II*, Anthony Steel (16/-); *Democracy, The Threatened Foundations*, Reginald Lennard (3/6).
 CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY OF AMERICA PRESS: *The Feast of the Presentation of the Virgin Mary in the Temple*. Sr. Mary Jerome Kishpaugh, O.P. (n.p.).
 THE CHURCH UNION: *A Christian Realm* (2d.).
 DACRE PRESS: *Sacrificial Priesthood*, Joseph Barker, C.R. (1/6); *Return to Holiness*, W. G. Peck (5/-).
 DAKERS: *A Sling at the Philistines*, Denis Becker (9d.); *Passing into Aquarius*, Leo (5/-).
 EYRE & SPOTTISWOODE: *Not Such a Bad Life*, Sidney Dark (15/-).
 FABER: *The High Church Tradition*, G. W. O. Adleshaw (7/6); *The Church Looks Ahead*, various authors, edited by E. L. Mascall (3/6).
 THE FORUM PRESS: *Our Lady's Hours*, Mary Ryan (2/6); '... To one of these my least Brethren,' Charles K. Murphy (6d.).
 HENRY GEORGE FOUNDATION: *My Neighbour's Landmark*, Frederick Verinder (1/-).
 LONGMANS: *Seeking for Trouble*, Margaret T. Monro (5/-).
 MACMILLAN (NEW YORK): *Thomistic Psychology*, R. E. Brennan, O.P. (\$3.00).
 MACMILLAN: *Chartist Portraits*, G. D. H. Cole (15/-).
 MURRAY: *Poems of Cloister and Jungle*, Mrs. Rhys Davids (3/6).
 OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS: *Church and State in Fascist Italy*, D. A. Binchy (31/6); *The Starlit Dome*, G. Wilson Knight (16/-).
 PRINCETHORP PRIORY, RUGBY: *Saint Benedict*, S. Gregory the Great, trans. by Justin McCann, O.S.B. (1/-).
 PAULIST PRESS (New York): *Vanishing Homesteads*, E. Schmedeler, O.S.B.; *Designs for Social Action*, J. M. Hayes; *The Popes and Christian Citizenship*, F. J. Boland, C.S.C., Ph.D. (5 cents each).
 SECKER & WARBURG: *The Moral Blitz*, Bernard Causton (2/-).
 SHEED & WARD: *The Seven Gifts of the Holy Ghost*, Bernard Kelly, C.S.Sp. (5/-); *The Reformation in England, Edward VI*, Abbe G. Constant (16/-); *The Mystery of Faith, Book I, The Sacrifice of Our Lord*, Maurice de la Taille, S.J. (10/6).
 STUDENT CHRISTIAN MOVEMENT PRESS: *Christian Reunion*, Hugh Martin (6/-); *A Study of the Gospel*, Spencer Leeson (5/-); *Christian Realism*, John C. Bennett (6/-).