the Gulf's "increasing integration into the world economy" (p. 212) preceded the discovery of oil and was based on the growing demand for dates and pearls and the introduction of the steamship and the telegraph. These economic changes, as Hala Fattah explains in a subsequent chapter, also brought about the "emergence of detribalized or semi-tribalized migrants and labourers" (p. 256) in pearling and seafaring. Still, Frauke Heard-Bey argues that older sources of authority, such as tribal and Wahhabi traditions, determined the nature of the Gulf states to a greater extent than the British withdrawal in 1971. In the final chapter, Steffen Hertog concludes that societies in the region "shifted from statelessness or very weak states in the eighteenth century to comprehensive state dominance in the early twenty-first" (p. 348). Rather than being based on agriculture, he nevertheless maintains that nation-building was "oil-driven".

The close co-ordination of a group of senior Anglophone specialists has resulted in a very well-written, theoretically strong and yet accessible book. However, it has perhaps also contributed to a neglect of scholarship in languages other than English and of sub-disciplines not represented by any of the authors, such as environmental history. The bibliographical essays at the end of most chapters repeatedly mention well-known works such as Rosemarie Said Zahlan's *The Making of the Modern Gulf States: Kuwait, Bahrain, Qatar, the United Arab Emirates and Oman* (London, 1989) and J.G. Lorimer's *Gazetteer of the Persian Gulf, 'Omān, and Central Arabia* (Calcutta, 1908, 1915). Yet these essays hardly discuss any publications in Arabic. A sub-chapter by Lawrence Potter on "Arabia and Iran" makes little reference to either Arabic or Persian texts in its bibliography. Among environmental historians, neither Benjamin James Reilly nor Toby Craig Jones are cited, leading to an oversight of the scarcity and management of fresh water as crucial factors in the history of the Arabian peninsula. Jones's book, *Desert Kingdom: How Oil and Water Forged Modern Saudi Arabia* (Cambridge, 2010), in particular, would have been very relevant for discussions about state-building.

Despite these shortcomings, *The Emergence of the Gulf States* is one of the best and most comprehensive books on the modern history of the region. Peterson went to great lengths to recruit some of the finest scholars in the field and ensured that their chapters build on, and speak to, one another. The result is a very inspiring, interesting and valuable reference work for both general readers and specialized researchers alike.

Jörg Matthias Determann
Virginia Commonwealth University in Qatar

SOUTH ASIA

R. SATHYANARAYANAN (ed.) (with an introduction by DOMINIC GOODALL):
Śaiva Rites of Expiation. A First Edition and Translation of Trilocanaśiva's Twelfth-century Prāyaścittasamuccaya.
(Collection Indologie 127.) 651 pp. Pondicherry: Institut français de Pondichéry and Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient, 2015. ISBN 978 81 8470 203 3.
doi:10.1017/S0041977X16000859

In this welcome addition to the illustrious Collection Indologie of the Institut français de Pondichéry and Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient, R. Sathyanarayanan presents   a   first   critical   edition   and   annotated   translation   of   the

Prāyaścittasamuccaya, a compendium (*samuccaya*) of passages on methods of expiation (*prāyaścitta*) compiled by Trilocanaśiva, a disciple of the famous Saiddhāntika exegete Aghoraśiva. Trilocanaśiva lived in south India in the twelfth century CE and is known to have composed a number of other important Saiddhāntika texts. His *Prāyaścittasamuccaya* contains a total of 828 verses, which are primarily quotations from texts ranging from the *c*. sixth-century *Puṣkara-Pārameśvara* to the *c*. twelfth-century *Uttara-Kāmikāgama* describing atonements for faults of commission or omission by Śaiva initiates. The quotations are not identified by Trilocanaśiva, but an earlier text also called the *Prāyaścittasamuccaya* and compiled by a certain Hṛdayaśiva, which survives in a Nepalese palm-leaf manuscript dated 1157–58 and which, unlike Trilocanaśiva's compendium, presents and identifies entire chapters from a wide range of Śaiva texts, includes many of the passages found in Trilocanaśiva's text, thus allowing their source texts to be identified. A transcription of this manuscript is included as a lengthy appendix to the edition and translation of Trilocanaśiva's text.

The edition and translation are preceded by a rich introduction by Dominic Goodall which not only introduces the text, its author and its edition, but also succinctly contextualizes the text's teachings within the broader history of Śaivism by showing how its concerns pertain to a Śaiva social reality quite different from that which can be inferred from earlier Śaiva texts. The Śaivasiddhānta of Trilocanaśiva was no longer a private cult for male brahmin initiates but had become a more public and hierarchized religion centred on monasteries and rich householder gurus. Goodall's introduction also includes a survey of the role of women in the Śaivasiddhānta inspired by their relative prominence in Trilocanaśiva's work, which he sees as evidence of greater participation by women in initiatory Śaiva religion as a reflex of Śaivism acquiring a broader social base. Reflecting on the history of *prāyaścitta* itself, Goodall shows how the earliest Śaiva tantras taught rules (*samaya*) but not expiations for their trangression (*prāyaścitta*) and suggests that the subsequent inclusion of *prāyaścitta* in Śaiva tantras was the result of influence from Brahmanical *dharmaśāstra*s, adducing the absence of a similar development in Buddhist tantric works, whose authors would have been less in the thrall of the prescriptions of *dharmaśāstra*, in support of this theory. Towards the end of the introduction, Goodall contextualizes Trilocanaśiva's *Prāyaścittasamuccaya* within the history of temple worship in south India. In somewhat complex discussions about the authorship of the *Prāyaścittavidhi* (which he shows to have been falsely attributed to Aghoraśiva) and parallel passages in the *Prāyaścittasamuccaya* and *Uttara-Kāmikāgama*, he shows that Trilocanaśiva probably knew the *Uttara-Kāmikāgama*, one of the first south Indian Temple Āgamas, and so was aware of the new Saiddhāntika concern with public religion, despite concerning himself only with rites related to individuals.

Sathyanarayanan's edition is based on eleven south Indian witnesses, none of which appears to be especially old. These are eight palm-leaf manuscripts in Grantha script, one paper transcript in Grantha script and two paper transcripts in devanāgarī. A tentative stemma of the witnesses is provided, but because of contamination between them readings have not been adopted through simple mechanical means. The text is presented together with a positive critical apparatus and a register identifying the sources of the passages quoted by Trilocanaśiva. In general the text is well supported by the witnesses; conjectural emendations are only occasionally required. A pāda-index is included as an appendix, as in all editions in the Collection Indologie. In this age of e-texts such indexes seem unnecessary, but in this case, by also indexing the pādas of Hṛdayaśiva's *Prāyaścittasamuccaya*, it functions as a useful concordance.

The faults for which atonements are prescribed in Trilocanaśiva's *Prāyaścittasamuccaya* include many that are not specific to initiates of the Śaiva Siddhānta, such as those committed while eating, bathing, urinating, excreting, having sex or menstruating (the detailed list of the latter being the inspiration for Goodall's analysis of the role of women in the Śaiva Siddhānta), those pertaining to the use of books or those incurred by being born or dying, and the five great sins or *mahāpātaka*s. There are also offences relating to the practices of Saiddhāntika initiates such as mistakes in the performance of worship, defilement of a *śivaliṅga* and misbehaviour in the presence of the guru. The methods of atonement themselves may consist of ways of purifying objects that have been defiled or of purifying the person who is at fault. The latter most commonly involves the repetition of a mantra, usually one of the five *brahmamantra*s; of them, it is the Aghora mantra which is most commonly prescribed. Indeed, the Aghora mantra is a cure-all; verse 496 says "As for when a combination of many sins arises, one should recite the Aghora mantra until one's mind is set at ease". Bathing, fasting and consuming the *pañcagavya*, the five products of the cow, are also regularly prescribed as methods of atonement, and details of different types of fast and the preparation of the *pañcagavya* are given in the text. The specific types of fault described attest to a rigidly stratified and sectarian society: penances are graded not only according to which level of initiate is at fault, but also according to their *varṇa* and, where the fault involves interaction with someone else, that person's religion, *varṇa* and *jāti*.

This is an excellent work firmly in the tradition of the publications of the Institut français de Pondichéry and Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient in that it presents a truly critical edition of an important but recently neglected text together with an annotated translation and introduction that use the meticulous text-critical scholarship involved in producing the edition to draw conclusions about the historical context of the text's production.

<div style="text-align: right">

James Mallinson
SOAS University of London

</div>

BRIAN BLACK and LAURIE PATTON (eds):
Dialogue in Early South Asian Religions: Hindu, Buddhist, and Jain Traditions.
(Dialogues in South Asian Traditions: Religion, Philosophy, Literature and History.) xi, 265 pp. Farnham: Ashgate, 2015. ISBN 978 1 4094 4012 3.
doi:10.1017/S0041977X16000914

Dialogue in Early South Asian Religions. Hindu, Buddhist, and Jain Traditions constitutes the fourth volume in the series "Dialogues in South Asian Traditions: Religion, Philosophy, Literature and History" which will seek to examine "the use of the dialogical genre in South Asian religious and cultural traditions" (preface). Based on the premise that "face-to-face conversation and dialogue are defining features of South Asian traditional texts, ritual and practice", the series aims at establishing a "dynamic historical and literary mode of analysis" (preface) suited to the South Asian pluri-religious context. The contributions gathered in this volume are a welcome addition to the series.