

disputes over dancing in English churchyards sets the pace for bringing largely ignored material to light. Eric Nelson presents the story of the shrine of Saint Martin at Tours, a relic shrine nearly totally destroyed by Huguenots in 1563; once routed, the Catholic ministry took on the challenge of reconstructing the shrine. Over time, the narratives, liturgies, and spaces underwent specific changes, in part to present Saint Martin as newly—and again—martyred by the Huguenot destruction. Conflicts within the Catholic community constitute the issues addressed by John Hunt in his study of some of the popular practices common to the period of the *sede vacante* in Rome. Hunt brings to light popular attacks on the statues of deceased popes, understood as both temporal and spiritual rulers. Among the statues conserved on the Capitoline Hill and destroyed during these raucous periods was that of Paul IV, which in 1559 suffered the same punishments papal authorities afflicted on miscreants—cutting off nose, ears, and right arm; removal of the papal tiara; decapitation; and, finally, procession through the city to suffer the taunts and abuse of citizens. A second appropriation of urban space to challenge papal authority involved Rome's famous speaking statues, *statue parlanti*, such as the famous Pasquino in the Parione district. Finally, David Stiles studies the conflicts between Jesuit missionaries and the Spanish Crown in the South American region of Rio de la Plata, in 1750–67, including the violent destruction of the missions by the Crown in the Guarani War of 1756. Though the Jesuits were uninterested in territorial or economic expansion, to the Crown sacred communities governed by deeply Catholic principles constituted challenges to Spanish authority and, especially, the Crown's desire to exploit and control the region.

This fine collection opens debate on issues that vexed ecclesiastical authorities in Reformation and Counter-Reformation Europe, in ways that extend well beyond this period. Studies that include nonecclesiastical sacred spaces would further define the parameters of the sacred in these early modern settings, as would analyses of such spaces that originated in popular practices. That relatively few illustrations, plans, or maps accompany most of the texts is puzzling, as they would surely have clarified the contours of some of these highly specific and complex sites.

Diane Y. F. Ghirardo, *University of Southern California*
doi:10.1017/rqx.2019.196

The Avignon Papacy Contested: An Intellectual History from Dante to Catherine of Siena. Unn Falkeid.

I Tatti Studies in Italian Renaissance History. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2017. 270 pp. \$49.95.

This book deals with the intellectual resistance confronting the papacy during its stay in Avignon (1309–77). Two motives for such a resistance were conflated: first, the

criticism of growing papal power vis-à-vis secular princes; second, the idea that the natural seat of the papacy was Rome, while Avignon was seen as an exile. Unn Falkeid has chosen an array of figures to explore the testimonies of intellectual critics of the papacy: the poets Dante and Petrarch, the political philosophers William of Ockham and Marsilius of Padua, and the saintly mystics Birgitta of Sweden and Catherine of Siena. Although the papacy had successfully used reform ideas in the preceding quarter millennium, since Pope Gregory VII (1073–85), to exalt its position, its secular power reached new heights during the Avignon papacy.

Dante, in his *De monarchia* (On monarchy, ca. 1313), rejected the notion that the empire derived its political authority from the papacy (chapter 1). Both Marsilius of Padua and William of Ockham, who spoke out against the extent of papal power, were branded as heretics and lived under the protection of Louis IV the Bavarian, Holy Roman emperor. Marsilius developed a secular concept of the state and argued in his *Defensor pacis* (Defender of the peace) that the powers of the church hierarchy must be limited (chapter 2). William, in his *Breviloquium de principatu tyrannico* (Short discourse on tyrannical government), defended the poverty of Franciscans and argued against papal absolutism (chapter 3). Petrarch, on the other hand, evoked nostalgia of ancient Rome and deplored its abandonment by the popes. After all, wrote Petrarch, Rome was “the capital of the world, the queen of the cities, the seat of the empire, the citadel of the Catholic faith, and the source of all remarkable models of virtue” (97). I found Falkeid’s treatment of these thinkers solid and careful, despite the occasional Latin mistake in the main text.

One of the main aims of this book is to try and rehabilitate Catherine of Siena and Birgitta of Sweden as political theorists. As women, they were excluded from institutions such as the universities and the ranks of the clergy. Falkeid’s sections on Birgitta and Catherine (chapters 5–6) give us some fascinating glimpses of how they cloaked their political ideas in spiritual and mystical discourses, and how, using this method, they applied considerable pressure on public opinion. Birgitta’s *Revelaciones* insistently called for both a renewal of the church and a return of the papacy to Rome. Catherine, in her *Dialogo della divina provvidenza*, employed the concept of the mystical body of the church to sound an emphatic call for ecclesiastical reform.

Falkeid cautions her readers that one should not apply a too narrow definition of what a political thinker is. Because such misguided categories were used by previous scholars, Catherine and Birgitta were “more or less wiped out of the historical-political scenery.” Restricted definitions of this type may even have limited “our understanding of a whole period” (8). If this was indeed the case, then it would perhaps have been fruitful and exciting to write an entire book on Catherine and Birgitta, rather than trying to tease new insights also out of the relatively well-known texts of Dante, Petrarch, William of Ockham, and Marsilius of Padua. A separate book-length study of the two highly important female writers might be a welcome and worthwhile sequel.

Books in the I Tatti series are beautifully presented, but the endnotes that they contain are more cumbersome to consult than footnotes. On the upside, this volume, in contrast to some other titles in the series (such as that by Gary Ianziti on Bruni), has a helpful bibliography of primary sources and secondary literature.

Stefan Bauer, *University of York*
doi:10.1017/rqx.2019.197

Late Medieval Papal Legation: Between the Councils and the Reformation.
Antonín Kalous.

Viella History, Art and Humanities Collection 3. Rome: Viella, 2017. 256 pp. €35.

In this impressively researched volume, Antonín Kalous focuses closely on how papal legations in the fifteenth century operated: what was the basis of legatine authority; how did that authority work (or not), especially depending on political and diplomatic contexts; and what were the logistical circumstances of a legation? Legates essentially functioned as papal fixers acting canonically within existing hierarchical structures, but at the same time as a sort of interference in and even imposition on local affairs, which was surely not always welcome. Building on his prior works on the prosopography and functions of papal legates in Central Europe, Kalous breaks his material into four categories, with one chapter for each: theory and practice, rights and powers, *modus operandi* (the most tedious chapter, it must be said, but one that provides necessary and precise information), and politics and diplomacy. An introduction places late medieval legations into a longer context, beginning with the creation of the papal monarchy during the eleventh-century Gregorian Revolution as a means to counter secular monarchies and to extend papal authority descending from Rome into large regions and smaller locales. Greater attention might have been paid here to the concomitant development of the college of cardinals. Although not all legates in the high and later medieval centuries had to be cardinals, Kalous points out they were increasingly so in the period under examination. Regardless of church rank, the *legati de latere* “became an alter ego of the vicar of Christ with the highest possible authority” (9); so a legate *de latere* who was also a cardinal functioned as a formidable combination.

Kalous concentrates on the role legates played in the restorationist agenda of fifteenth-century popes, such as Eugenius IV, Nicholas V, and their successors, as they sought to recover the advantage after the damage done by the Avignon papacy, the Great Western Schism, and conciliarism’s challenges. He spreads his prior work further than Central Europe, although examples from those regions dominate, as in table 2 (206–08), delineating papal legates and nuncios in German and Central European territories from 1447 to 1525. He presents a valuable case study of source issues in section 1.2.1, on the legation of Bishop Angelo Pecchinoli as a nuncio *cum potestate legati de*