# Physiological linkage in co-variation of foliar nitrogen and phosphorus in tropical tree species along a gradient of soil phosphorus availability

# Amane Hidaka<sup>1</sup> and Kanehiro Kitayama

Graduate School of Agriculture, Kyoto University, Kyoto, 606-8502, Japan (Received 7 February 2014; revised 10 March 2015; accepted 10 March 2015)

**Abstract:** In order to understand the stoichiometric balance between foliar nitrogen (N) and phosphorus (P) on P-poor soils, we investigated how foliar N and P attributes (i.e. N and P concentrations in green and senesced leaves, N and P resorption efficiencies) of 30 tropical tree species co-vary along a gradient of soil P availability across three forests on Mount Kinabalu, Borneo. We found strong and positive correlations between foliar N and P in the concentrations and resorption efficiencies within each forest and across the three forests. Slopes of standardized major axis between foliar N and P concentrations for both green and senesced leaves were not different among the three forests, although the values of the scaling exponent in the relationships of foliar N to P across the three forests were significantly lower than 1. We suggest that down-regulation of N concentrations in green leaves on P-poor soils is one of several possible mechanisms explaining why N concentrations decrease with decreasing P concentrations in both green and senesced leaves toward a lower P availability in soils. On the other hand, the physiological and ecological reasons why N and P resorption efficiencies are positively correlated with each other across tree species remain unclear.

**Key Words:** leaf traits, litter, nitrogen, nutrient limitation, phosphorus, resorption, stoichiometry, tropical montane rain forest

# INTRODUCTION

Nitrogen (N) and phosphorus (P) are essential nutrients in plant metabolism (Marschner 1995), and their availabilities in soils frequently regulate plant growth and productivity in terrestrial ecosystems (Elser et al. 2007, Harpole et al. 2011). N and P concentrations in green leaves are important leaf traits of plant species, because they relate functionally to photosynthetic assimilation rates and growth rates (Aerts & Chapin 2000, Ågren 2008, Wright et al. 2004). In addition, foliar N and P are the important components controlling carbon and nutrient cycles and food webs in terrestrial ecosystems (Chapin et al. 2011). Therefore, knowledge of foliar N and P attributes in relation to nutrient availabilities provides important insight into understanding plant nutritional strategies and terrestrial ecosystem functions. In tropical regions, tree growth and productivity are frequently

limited by low P availability in soils (Cleveland *et al.* 2011, Vitousek 1984). Therefore, foliar P attributes and P-use strategies of tropical tree species have been investigated in relation to soil P availability (Cordell *et al.* 2001, Hidaka & Kitayama 2009, 2011). On the other hand, how tropical tree species control foliar N dynamics in relation to efficient foliar P-use under P limitation remains unclear, although it is suggested that soil P availability may influence N cycle in tropical rain forests (Hall *et al.* 2004, Kitayama *et al.* 1998, Quesada *et al.* 2010).

The stoichiometric balance between N and P in green leaves has been a particular focus in understanding lifehistory strategies of plant species (e.g. photosynthesis and growth rates) (Ågren 2008, Niklas *et al.* 2005, Reich *et al.* 2009). Earlier studies showed that N and P concentrations in green leaves are positively correlated with each other within and among various plant species (Kerkhoff *et al.* 2006, Niklas *et al.* 2005, Reich *et al.* 2010, Wright *et al.* 2004). It was suggested that a general 2/3- or 3/4power law exists in the scaling relationship of N to P concentrations in green leaves among plant species across biomes (Niklas *et al.* 2005, Reich *et al.* 2010). This finding suggests that foliar N:P ratio increases with decreasing foliar P concentration among plant species, although

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Corresponding author. Current address: Network Center of Forest and Grassland Survey in Monitoring Sites 1000 Project, Japan Wildlife Research Center, c/o Tomakomai Research Station, Field Science Center for Northern Biosphere, Hokkaido University, Tomakomai, Hokkaido 053-0035, Japan. Email: amanehidaka.ecology@gmail.com

foliar N concentration decreases with decreasing foliar P concentration. Because foliar P concentration generally decreases with decreasing soil P availability (Cleveland *et al.* 2011, Hidaka & Kitayama 2009), plant species will control the stoichiometric balance between N and P in green leaves and consequently disproportionately increase foliar N:P ratio in response to a lower P availability in soils. On the other hand, how the positive correlation between foliar N and P varies in response to a lower P availability in soils is poorly understood.

Nutrient resorption prior to leaf abscission is one of the important foliar strategies to conserve growth-limiting nutrients, because the retranslocated nutrients are used for new leaves and other organs for plant productivity and growth (Aerts 1996, Killingbeck 1996). Specieslevel N and P resorption efficiencies (i.e. the proportion of reduction in N and P concentration from green to senesced leaves) (NRE and PRE, respectively) have been frequently investigated in various vegetations (Kobe et al. 2005, Vergutz et al. 2012, Yuan & Chen 2009). Reed et al. (2012) suggested that the ratio of NRE per PRE (i.e. N:P resorption ratio) reflects soil P availability in tropical rain forests, and that tropical tree species growing on P-poor soils translocate more P than N prior to leaf abscission. On the other hand, the importance of N resorption of tropical tree species is not well characterized with soil P availability. Although several experiments showed that P fertilization decreases or does not change NRE of tropical tree species (Cordell et al. 2001, Mayor et al. 2014, Treseder & Vitousek 2001), how tropical tree species control N resorption on P-poor soils remains unclear.

Our aim in this study is to test the following hypotheses for understanding how foliar N and P attributes co-vary with each other along a gradient of soil P availability. First, the magnitude of reduction of foliar N concentration with decreasing P availability is smaller than that of foliar P concentration, because soil P availability more strongly and directly influences foliar P than foliar N. Secondly, tree species translocate more P than N prior to leaf abscission and N:P resorption ratio decreases with decreasing P availability. We investigated N and P concentrations and N:P ratios in green and senesced leaves, NRE, PRE and N:P resorption ratio of 30 tropical tree species across three forests with differing soil P availability on Mount Kinabalu, Borneo.

#### METHODS

#### Study sites

This study was conducted in three tropical montane rain forests on the southern slopes of Mount Kinabalu ( $6^{\circ}05'$  N,  $116^{\circ}33'$  E, 4095 m asl), Sabah, Malaysian Borneo. These forests are the same as those in Hidaka & Kitayama (2011)

**Table 1.** Soil properties (top 15 cm depth) of nitrogen (N) and phosphorus (P) in three tropical montane rain forests on Mount Kinabalu. Data are from Takyu *et al.* (2002, 2003).

|   | Site 1        | Site 2        | Site 3        |
|---|---------------|---------------|---------------|
| C:N ratio                               | 20.3          | 17.4          | 13.0          |
| Inorganic N                             |               |               |               |
| NH <sub>4</sub> -N (g m <sup>-2</sup> ) | $1.27\pm0.34$ | $1.54\pm0.37$ | $0.66\pm0.19$ |
| $NO_3$ -N (g m <sup>-2</sup> )          | $0.02\pm0.01$ | $0.01\pm0.02$ | $1.11\pm0.24$ |
| $NH_4 + NO_3 - N (g m^{-2})$            | 1.29          | 1.56          | 1.77          |
| Soluble $P(g m^{-2})$                   | $0.02\pm0.16$ | $0.12\pm0.03$ | $0.19\pm0.09$ |
|   |               |               |               |

and are called lower slope sites in Takyu *et al.* (2002). The three study sites were nearly the same in altitude (1560-1860 m asl) and had a comparable climate (mean annual air temperature was 18°C and mean annual precipitation was 2700 mm) (Kitayama 1992). On the other hand, the three sites were different in soil P availability due to the differences in geological substrates (Quaternary and Tertiary sedimentary rocks and ultrabasic rock) (Takyu *et al.* 2002). Hereafter, we name the three sites as Site 1 (ultrabasic), Site 2 (Tertiary sediment) and Site 3 (Quaternary sediment) in the increasing order of soil P availability (0.02, 0.12 and 0.19 g m<sup>-2</sup> soluble P, respectively) (Table 1). Inorganic-N pool (i.e.  $NO_3$  + NH<sub>4</sub>) in soils and rates of net soil N mineralization decreased, and soil C:N ratio increased with decreasing soil P availability across the three forests (Table 1) (Hall et al. 2004, Kitayama et al. 2004, Takyu et al. 2002). It was suggested that soil N availability was down-regulated by soil P availability via activity of microbes (i.e. ammonifier and nitrifying bacteria) (Hall *et al.* 2004, Kitayama *et al.* 1998, 2004). Although soil N availability decreased with decreasing soil P availability across the three sites, the magnitude of soil P variation was greater than that of soil N variation, and soil P availability rather than soil N availability more strongly influenced plant nutritional strategies and ecosystem processes (Kitayama & Aiba 2002, Kitayama et al. 2004, Takyu et al. 2003).

#### Sampling and chemical analysis

In each forest, we selected 10 dominant tree species (Table 2), of which seven species were previously studied for understanding foliar P-use strategies (Hidaka & Kitayama 2011) and three species were additionally selected in this study. We collected sun leaves of three to five trees per species from crown tops using a catapult, and collected fresh fallen leaf litter at 2-d intervals using litter traps on the ground within each permanent plot (2000 m<sup>2</sup> in Site 1, 10000 m<sup>2</sup> in Site 2 and Site 3). After drying these samples at  $60^{\circ}$ - $70^{\circ}$ C for 72 h to a constant weight, each sample including veins after removing petiole was ground for the measurement of nutrients. N concentration was measured using a CN

**Table 2.** Nitrogen (N) and phosphorus (P) concentrations (mg  $g^{-1}$ ) and N:P ratios (mass basis) in green and senesced leaves, N and P resorption efficiencies corrected with calcium concentrations (NRE and PRE, respectively) (%), and N:P resorption ratio (i.e. ratio of NRE per PRE) of 30 tree species in three tropical montane rain forests on Mount Kinabalu. A part of the data is from Hidaka & Kitayama (2011).

|                                       |                | Green leaves |      | Senesced leaves |      | Resorption |       |      |      |      |
|---------------------------------------|----------------|--------------|------|-----------------|------|------------|-------|------|------|------|
| Species                               | Family         | N            | Р    | N:P             | N    | Р          | N:P   | NRE  | PRE  | N:P  |
| Site 1                                |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Agathis kinabaluensis de Laub.        | Araucariaceae  | 11.1         | 0.37 | 29.8            | 6.5  | 0.10       | 62.1  | 51.6 | 76.9 | 0.67 |
| Dacrydium pectinatum de Laub.         | Podocarpaceae  | 9.9          | 0.42 | 23.5            | 6.3  | 0.11       | 55.5  | 47.5 | 77.7 | 0.61 |
| Garcinia sp.                          | Clusiaceae     | 10.0         | 0.31 | 32.4            | 7.8  | 0.14       | 54.2  | 23.0 | 53.8 | 0.43 |
| <i>Gynotroches axillaris</i> Blume    | Rhizophoraceae | 13.2         | 0.47 | 28.3            | 9.2  | 0.19       | 47.8  | 37.9 | 63.4 | 0.60 |
| Lithocarpus rigidus Soepadmo          | Fagaceae       | 10.0         | 0.25 | 39.5            | 5.4  | 0.08       | 68.4  | 53.0 | 73.0 | 0.73 |
| Podocarpus gibbsiae N.E.Gray          | Podocarpaceae  | 9.7          | 0.27 | 36.0            | 6.9  | 0.12       | 59.6  | 59.6 | 75.5 | 0.79 |
| Quercus lowii King                    | Fagaceae       | 11.6         | 0.33 | 35.5            | 7.1  | 0.09       | 76.6  | 58.5 | 80.8 | 0.72 |
| Tristaniopsis cf. elliptica           | Myrtaceae      | 10.4         | 0.28 | 37.9            | 4.5  | 0.04       | 110.3 | 48.2 | 82.2 | 0.59 |
| (Stapf) Peter G.Wilson & J.T.Waterh.  |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Weinmannia cf. blumei A.Gray          | Cunoniaceae    | 9.7          | 0.24 | 41.0            | 3.8  | 0.05       | 71.3  | 64.6 | 79.7 | 0.81 |
| Xanthophyllum tenue Chodat            | Polygalaceae   | 20.8         | 0.49 | 42.4            | 13.5 | 0.22       | 61.3  | 54.8 | 68.7 | 0.80 |
| Site 2                                |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Aglaia squamulosa King                | Meliaceae      | 25.5         | 1.06 | 24.2            | 13.4 | 0.29       | 46.2  | 67.0 | 82.8 | 0.81 |
| Dacrycarpus imbricatus                | Podocarpaceae  | 15.1         | 0.74 | 20.5            | 9.3  | 0.26       | 35.6  | 57.8 | 75.8 | 0.76 |
| (Blume) de Laub.                      | -              |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Dacrydium gracile de Laub.            | Podocarpaceae  | 14.0         | 0.54 | 25.7            | 7.5  | 0.20       | 37.6  | 50.6 | 66.2 | 0.76 |
| Lithocarpus clementianus              | Fagaceae       | 13.7         | 0.44 | 30.9            | 8.9  | 0.15       | 57.6  | 67.8 | 82.8 | 0.82 |
| (King ex Hook.f.) A.Camus             |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Payena microphylla                    | Sapotaceae     | 14.3         | 0.53 | 26.9            | 9.9  | 0.25       | 39.0  | 52.3 | 67.1 | 0.78 |
| (de Vriese) Burck                     |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Syzygium kunstleri                    | Myrtaceae      | 13.0         | 0.75 | 17.4            | 6.6  | 0.17       | 39.1  | 68.8 | 86.1 | 0.80 |
| (King) Bahadur & R.C.Gaur             |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Syzygium napiforme                    | Myrtaceae      | 12.4         | 0.43 | 29.0            | 5.9  | 0.15       | 38.6  | 66.9 | 75.1 | 0.89 |
| (Koord. & Valeton) Merr. & L.M.Perry  |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Syzygium pachysepalum                 | Myrtaceae      | 11.0         | 0.41 | 26.5            | 5.3  | 0.14       | 37.8  | 60.7 | 72.4 | 0.84 |
| Merr. & L.M.Perry                     |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Tristaniopsis clementis               | Myrtaceae      | 10.2         | 0.42 | 24.1            | 4.1  | 0.08       | 54.3  | 48.1 | 76.9 | 0.63 |
| (Merr.) Peter G.Wilson & J.T.Waterh.  |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Tristaniopsis sp.                     | Myrtaceae      | 14.9         | 0.49 | 30.7            | 7.7  | 0.20       | 39.4  | 66.0 | 73.6 | 0.90 |
| Site 3                                |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Cinnamomum subcuneatum Miq.           | Lauraceae      | 16.2         | 0.66 | 24.6            | 15.7 | 0.63       | 25.2  | 8.0  | 9.8  | 0.82 |
| Lithocarpus confertus Soepadmo        | Fagaceae       | 18.7         | 0.66 | 28.2            | 17.6 | 0.63       | 28.0  | 11.8 | 11.2 | 1.05 |
| Lithocarpus lampadarius               | Fagaceae       | 16.5         | 0.62 | 26.5            | 13.2 | 0.49       | 27.1  | 22.1 | 24.2 | 0.91 |
| (Gamble) A.Camus                      |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Litsea ochracea (Blume) Boerl.        | Lauraceae      | 17.6         | 0.83 | 21.3            | 11.3 | 0.28       | 40.1  | 37.2 | 66.7 | 0.56 |
| Madhuca endertii H.J.Lam              | Sapotaceae     | 18.1         | 0.70 | 26.1            | 14.9 | 0.65       | 23.0  | 19.0 | 8.6  | 2.21 |
| Magnolia carsonii Dandy ex Noot.      | Magnoliaceae   | 19.8         | 0.75 | 26.2            | 15.9 | 0.55       | 29.0  | 29.8 | 36.4 | 0.82 |
| Syzygium castaneum                    | Myrtaceae      | 17.3         | 0.68 | 25.4            | 11.1 | 0.51       | 21.8  | 41.1 | 31.5 | 1.30 |
| (Merr.) Merr. & L.M.Perry             |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Syzygium napiforme                    | Myrtaceae      | 12.3         | 0.56 | 22.0            | 5.6  | 0.21       | 26.6  | 70.2 | 75.4 | 0.93 |
| (Koord. & Valeton) Merr. & L.M.Perry  |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Syzygium pachysepalum                 | Myrtaceae      | 13.9         | 0.46 | 29.9            | 7.9  | 0.34       | 23.4  | 50.8 | 36.9 | 1.38 |
| Merr. & L.M.Perry                     |                |              |      |                 |      |            |       |      |      |      |
| Ternstroemia magnifica Stapf ex Ridl. | Theaceae       | 11.6         | 0.44 | 26.7            | 7.2  | 0.23       | 31.4  | 44.7 | 53.1 | 0.84 |

analyser (JM 1000CN, J-Science Lab Co., Kyoto, Japan). P and calcium (Ca) concentrations were measured using an inductively coupled plasma atomic emission spectrometer (ICPS-7510; Shimadzu Co., Kyoto, Japan) after digesting samples with  $H_2SO_4$  and  $H_2O_2$ . After calculating mean concentrations of N, P and Ca in green and senesced leaves in each species, mean NRE and PRE per species was respectively calculated as the following equation for correcting a loss of leaf mass by using Ca concentrations: NRE (%) or PRE (%) = 100 – (N or P concentration in green leaves/N or P concentration in senesced leaves)  $\times$  (Ca concentration in senesced leaves/Ca concentration in green leaves)  $\times$  100.

# Statistical analysis

We tested the differences in mean values of foliar N and P attributes among the three forests by ANOVA with a post hoc Tukey HSD test. The relationships of

| of tree species on three tropical montane rain forests with differing soil P availability on Mount Kinabalu, Borneo. P-values are shown for testing |                             |                            |                                     |                              |          |  |
|---|-----------------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|----------|--|
|   | All $(n = 30 \text{ spp.})$ | Site 1 (n = 10 spp.)       | Site 2 (n = 10 spp.)                | Site 3 (n = 10 spp.)         | P-values |  |
| Green leaves  |                             |                            |                                     |                              |          |  |
| $N (mg g^{-1})$   | $14.1 \pm 0.7 (27.6)$       | $11.6^{b} \pm 1.1 (29.2)$  | $14.4^{\mathrm{ab}} \pm 1.3(29.2)$  | $16.2^{a} \pm 0.9 (16.9)$    | 0.02     |  |
| $P(mg g^{-1})$  | $0.52 \pm 0.04 (37.2)$      | $0.34^{b} \pm 0.03 (26.5)$ | $0.58^{a} \pm 0.07 (36.0)$          | $0.64^{a} \pm 0.04(19.1)$    | < 0.001  |  |
| N:P ratio   | $28.6 \pm 1.9(36.7)$        | $34.6^{a} \pm 1.9(36.7)$   | $25.6^{b} \pm 1.4 (16.8)$           | $25.7^{b} \pm 0.8 (10.1)$    | < 0.001  |  |
| Senesced leaves   |                             |                            |                                     |                              |          |  |
| $N (mg g^{-1})$   | $9.0 \pm 0.7 (42.6)$        | $7.1^{b} \pm 0.9 (38.6)$   | $7.9^{b} \pm 0.8 (34.0)$            | $12.0^{a} \pm 1.3(34.2)$     | 0.004    |  |
| $P(mg g^{-1})$  | $0.25 \pm 0.03 (72.4)$      | $0.11^{b} \pm 0.02 (50.0)$ | $0.19^{b} \pm 0.02 (33.9)$          | $0.45^{a} \pm 0.05(38.1)$    | < 0.001  |  |
| N:P ratio   | $45.6 \pm 3.6 (43.4)$       | $66.7^{a} \pm 5.5(26.3)$   | $42.5^{b} \pm 2.4(17.9)$            | $27.6^{\circ} \pm 1.7(19.2)$ | < 0.001  |  |
| Resorption  |                             |                            |                                     |                              |          |  |
| NRE (%)   | $48.0 \pm 3.2 (36.5)$       | $49.9^{a} \pm 3.8(24.1)$   | $60.6^{a} \pm 2.5 (13.0)$           | $33.5^{b} \pm 6.1(57.4)$     | < 0.001  |  |
| PRE (%)   | $61.5 \pm 4.3 (38.6)$       | $73.2^{a} \pm 2.8 (12.2)$  | $75.9^{a} \pm 2.1 (8.7)$            | $35.4^{b} \pm 7.4(66.6)$     | < 0.001  |  |
| NRE:PRE   | $0.85 \pm 0.06  (37.6)$     | $0.68^{b} \pm 0.04 (17.8)$ | $0.80^{\mathrm{ab}} \pm 0.02 (9.6)$ | $1.08^{a} \pm 0.15 (42.8)$   | 0.01     |  |

Table 3. Mean values  $\pm$  SE (CV) of nitrogen (N) and phosphorus (P) concentrations (mg g<sup>-1</sup>) and N:P ratios (mass basis) in green and senesced leaves, N and P resorption efficiencies corrected with calcium concentrations (NRE and PRE, respectively) (%), and N:P resorption ratio (NRE:PRE)

nutrient concentrations between green and senesced leaves, and between N and P concentrations in green and senesced leaves were analysed after base-10 logtransformation, because earlier studies have shown that these are best expressed as scaling relationships (Kobe et al. 2005, Reich et al. 2010). We also tested the difference in their relationships in standardized major axis (SMA) among the three forests by using SMATR (Warton et al. 2012). According to our hypothesis, slopes of SMA between foliar N and P concentrations for both green and senesced leaves will become flatter with decreasing P availability, although foliar N concentration decreases with decreasing P availability. Statistical analyses were performed using R 2.14.1 (http://www.R-project.org).

#### RESULTS

# Foliar N concentrations and N resorption efficiency

N concentration in green leaves (N<sub>G</sub>) varied 2.6-fold from 9.7 mg  $g^{-1}$  in Podocarpus gibbsiae and Weinmannia cf. blumei at Site 1 to 25.5 mg g<sup>-1</sup> in Aglaia squamulosa at Site 2, and N concentration in senesced leaves (N<sub>S</sub>) varied 4.6-fold from 3.8 mg  $g^{-1}$  in Weinmannia cf. blumei at Site 1 to 17.6 mg  $g^{-1}$  in Lithocarpus confertus at Site 3 (Table 2). Both mean N<sub>G</sub> and N<sub>S</sub> significantly increased from Site 1 to Site 3 with increasing soil P availability (Table 3). Across the three sites, N<sub>G</sub> and N<sub>S</sub> were positively correlated with each other, and the value of the scaling exponent in the relationship was significantly higher than 1 (1.40  $\pm$  0.15) (Figure 1a), and the SMA slope of N<sub>S</sub> to  $N_G$  was significantly higher than 1 (Table 4).  $N_G$  and N<sub>S</sub> were also significantly and positively correlated with each other within each site, and the SMA slopes were higher than 1 at Site 3, but not different from 1 at Site 1 and Site 2, and were not different among the three sites

(Figure 1c, Table 4). N resorption efficiency varied 8.6fold from 8.0% in Cinnamomum subcuneatum at Site 3 to 68.8% in Syzygium kunstleri at Site 2 (Table 2), and the mean was significantly higher at Site 1 and Site 2 than at Site 3 (Table 3).

## Foliar P concentrations and P resorption efficiency

P concentration in green leaves  $(P_G)$  varied 4.4-fold from  $0.24 \text{ mg g}^{-1}$  in Weinmannia cf. blumei at Site 1 to 1.06 mg  $g^{-1}$  in Aglaia squamulosa at Site 2, and P concentration in senesced leaves (P<sub>s</sub>) varied 16-fold from 0.04 mg  $g^{-1}$ in Tristaniopsis cf. elliptica at Site 1 to 0.65 mg  $g^{-1}$  in *Madhuca endertii* at Site 3 (Table 2). Both mean  $P_G$  and  $P_S$ significantly increased from Site 1 to Site 3 with increasing soil P availability (Table 3). Across the three sites,  $P_G$ and P<sub>s</sub> were positively correlated with each other, and the value of the scaling exponent in the relationship was significantly higher than  $1(1.55 \pm 0.22)$  (Figure 1b), and the SMA slope of  $P_S$  to  $P_G$  was significantly higher than 1 (Table 4).  $P_G$  and  $P_S$  were also positively correlated with each other at Site 1 and Site 2 but not at Site 3, and the SMA slopes were higher than 1 at Site 1, but not different from 1 at Site 2 (Figure 1d, Table 4). Presorption efficiency varied 10-fold from 8.6% in Madhuca endertii at Site 3 to 86.1% in Syzygium kunstleri at Site 2 (Table 2), and the mean was significantly higher at Site 1 and Site 2 than at Site 3 (Table 3).

# Relationships between foliar N and P in the concentrations and resorption efficiencies

N and P concentrations were positively correlated with each other in both green and senesced leaves across the three sites, and the values of the scaling exponent in

**Table 4.** Standardized major axis (SMA) relationships of N and P concentrations in green and senesced leaves ( $N_G$ ,  $P_G$ ,  $N_S$  and  $P_S$ , respectively) and of N and P resorption efficiencies (NRE and PRE, respectively) of tree species on three tropical montane rain forests with differing soil P availability on Mount Kinabalu, Borneo. Slopes (lower and upper 95% confidence intervals) for SMA regressions in the upper line and  $R^2$  and P-values in the lower line. P-values are shown for testing differences in slopes among the three sites.

| Y   | Х       | All $(n = 30 \text{ spp.})$ | Site 1 ( $n = 10$ spp.) | Site 2 ( $n = 10$ spp.) | Site 3 $(n = 10 \text{ spp.})$ | P-values |
|-----|---------|-----------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------------|----------|
| Ns  | NG      | 1.62 (1.33, 1.96)           | 1.52 (0.95, 2.42)       | 1.38 (0.97, 1.96)       | 2.14 (1.50, 3.05)              | 0.17     |
|     |         | 0.75, <0.001                | 0.65, 0.005             | 0.81, <0.001            | 0.80, <0.001                   |          |
| Ps  | $P_{G}$ | 1.96 (1.55, 2.48)           | 2.07 (1.24, 3.45)       | 1.19 (0.69, 2.07)       | 2.15(1.11, 4.15)               | NA       |
|     |         | 0.63, <0.001                | 0.57, 0.01              | 0.50, 0.02              | 0.25, 0.14                     |          |
| NG  | $P_{G}$ | 0.69 (0.56, 0.85)           | 0.91 (0.53, 1.56)       | 0.78 (0.50, 1.23)       | 0.89 (0.59, 1.35)              | 0.87     |
|     |         | 0.72, <0.001                | 0.53, 0.02              | 0.67, 0.004             | 0.73, 0.002                    |          |
| Ns  | $P_S$   | 0.57(0.47, 0.68)            | 0.67 (0.50, 0.89)       | 0.90(0.64, 1.28)        | 0.89 (0.64, 1.24)              | 0.25     |
|     |         | 0.78, <0.001                | 0.87, <0.001            | 0.81, <0.001            | 0.83, <0.001                   |          |
| NRE | PRE     | 0.74(0.61,0.90)             | 1.35(0.85, 2.14)        | 1.20(0.68, 2.12)        | 0.81 (0.54, 1.23)              | 0.22     |
|     |         | 0.74, <0.001                | 0.66, 0.004             | 0.46, 0.03              | 0.73, 0.002                    |          |



**Figure 1.** The relationships of N (a) and P (b) concentrations in green and senesced leaves, and their relationships in standardized major axis (SMA) after base-10 log-transformation (c, d) of 30 tropical tree species on Mount Kinabalu. Symbols: Site 1 (solid circles), Site 2 (triangles) and Site 3 (open circles). Detailed SMA slopes are shown in Table 3.

the relationships were both significantly lower than 1 (0.58  $\pm$  0.07 in green leaves, 0.50  $\pm$  0.05 in senesced leaves) (Figure 2a, b), and the SMA slopes of N<sub>G</sub> to P<sub>G</sub> and of N<sub>S</sub> to P<sub>S</sub> across three forests were significantly lower than 1 (Table 4). N and P concentrations were also positively correlated with each other in both green and senesced leaves within each site (all P < 0.05) (Figure 2d, e, Table 4), and the SMA slopes of N<sub>G</sub> to P<sub>S</sub> and of N<sub>S</sub> to P<sub>S</sub> within each site were not different among sites (Table 4).

N:P ratio in green leaves varied 2.4-fold from 17.4 in *Syzygium kunstleri* at Site 2 to 42.4 in *Xanthophyllum tenue* at Site 1 (Table 2), and the mean was significantly higher at Site 1 than at Site 2 and Site 3 (Table 3). N:P ratio in senesced leaves varied 5.1-fold from 21.8 in *Syzygium castaneum* at Site 3 to 110 in *Tristaniopsis* cf. *elliptica* at Site 1 (Table 2), and the mean value increased significantly with decreasing soil P availability (Table 3).



**Figure 2.** The relationships between N and P concentrations in green (a) and senesced (b) leaves, and between N- and P-resorption efficiencies (c), and their relationships in standardized major axis (SMA) after base-10 log-transformation (d, e, f) of 30 tropical tree species on Mount Kinabalu. Symbols are the same as in Figure 1. Detailed SMA slopes are shown in Table 3.

NRE and PRE were positively correlated with each other across the three sites (P < 0.001) (Figure 2c) and within each site (all P < 0.05) (Figure 2f). N:P resorption ratio was significantly higher at Site 3 than at Site 1, and was not different between Site 1 and Site 2 and between Site 2 and Site 3 (Table 3).

# DISCUSSION

In this study, we found strong and positive correlations between foliar N and P in the concentrations and resorption efficiencies within each forest and across the three forests with differing soil P availability. Such positive correlations across the forests may be partly influenced by the difference of soil N availability among the forests; it was suggested that soil N availability was downregulated by soil P availability in our study sites (Hall *et al.* 2004, Kitayama *et al.* 1998, 2004). On the other hand, the positive correlations within each forest cannot be explained by co-variation of soil N and P availability alone, because the small-scale spatial heterogeneity of soil N does not always correspond to soil P. Rather, observed patterns within each forest can be explained by plant nutritional strategies; foliar N-use strategy is influenced by foliar P-use strategy in each tree species in response to soil P availability.

Against our hypothesis, there was no difference in SMA slopes between foliar N and P concentration for both green and senesced leaves among the three forests. This result suggests that foliar N strongly decreases with decreasing foliar P within each forest and across the three forests, although the scaling relationship of foliar N to P (Figure 2a, b) suggests that soil P availability more strongly and directly influences the variation of foliar P than that of foliar N. We suggest that downregulation of N concentrations in green leaves on P-poor soils is one of several possible mechanisms explaining why N concentrations decrease with decreasing P concentrations in both green and senesced leaves. When photosynthetic rates are limited by low P concentrations in green leaves, tree species will down-regulate the investment of N to the proteins of photosynthetic machinery (i.e. ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase oxygenase). In addition, in order to prolong leaf lifespan as a strategy of conserving P on P-poor soils, tree species on P-poor soils tend to have tougher leaves and/or decrease N concentration of green leaves to reduce herbivory risks (Coley et al. 1985, Endara & Coley 2011). Such downregulation of foliar N may give rise to the observed positive correlation between foliar N and P concentrations

along a gradient of soil P availability. Furthermore, the down-regulation of foliar N coupled with low foliar P concentrations will decrease decomposition rates and consequently decrease soil N availability on P-poor soils, eventually causing a positive correlation between foliar N and P.

Stoichiometry of N and P in plant cells provides another explanation. Theoretical studies have applied a biochemical relationship in plant cells between N in proteins and P in ribosomes used for protein synthesis (Ågren 2008, Niklas et al. 2005), and suggest that the scaling exponent of N to P in green leaves becomes lower than 2/3 or 3/4 when plants have relatively slow growth rates under P limitation. In agreement with their suggestion, our species have a lower value (0.582) than 2/3 or 3/4 in the scaling exponent of N to P in green leaves (Figure 2a) under P limitation, which is suggested by the extremely high foliar N:P ratios of our species (Table 1) compared with those of other tropical regions (mean value 26.1 on relatively P-poor Oxisols and Ultisols, Townsend et al. 2007). An experimental observation suggests that relative growth rates partly explain a within-site variation of foliar N:P ratios among tropical tree species (Cernusak et al. 2010). On the other hand, some studies argue that such a stoichiometric view based on plant growth rates does not always explain the balance between foliar N and P, because various forms of P-containing biochemical compounds in addition to ribosomes are involved in determining the relationship between foliar N and P (Hidaka & Kitayama 2011, Matzek & Vitousek 2009). In addition, such a stoichiometric view based on plant growth rates does not consider that plants store excess P in vacuoles, but not N (Ostertag 2010, Veneklaas et al. 2012). Further physiological and ecological studies are necessary to explain why N concentration tightly and positively relates to P concentration in green leaves and how high foliar N:P ratios are regulated on P-poor soils in tropical rain forests.

Reed et al. (2012) suggested that the ratio of NRE per PRE (i.e. N:P resorption ratio) reflects soil P availability in tropical rain forests. Our result that N:P resorption ratio increased with decreasing soil P availability agrees with their suggestion. Tree species translocate more P than N prior to leaf abscission with decreasing soil P availability. On the other hand, the reason why NRE and PRE are positively correlated with each other across tree species within each forest (Table 4, Figure 2f) remains unclear. Such a positive correlation between NRE and PRE was found also in other tropical forests (Cai & Bongers 2007, Lal et al. 2001) and in wetlands (Güsewell 2005). In addition, Tully et al. (2013) found a positive correlation between NRE and PRE in a symbiotic N-fixing tree species irrespective of soil P availability in tropical rain forests in Costa Rica. Earlier studies suggested that interspecific variation in NRE and PRE within a tropical rain forest reflect small-scale edaphic differences (Reed *et al.* 2012) or a wide range of adaptive nutrient-use strategies and genetically constrained flexibility in nutrient resorption among tree species (Hättenschwiler et al. 2008, Mayor et al. 2014). As stated earlier, the co-variation of soil N and P availabilities within a forest is unlikely. Tree species at Site 1 (lower P availability) translocated P from their leaves by hydrolysing phospholipids and nucleic acids (Hidaka & Kitayama 2011), although PRE was not different between Site 1 and Site 2 (Table 3). Because nutrient resorption costs carbon and N in enzymes such as protease and phosphatase to hydrolyse highmolecular-weight compounds to simpler compounds (Wright & Westoby 2003), nutritional strategies and genetically constrained flexibility (Mayor et al. 2014, Treseder & Vitousek 2001) will be different among tree species in response to soil P availability. A high NRE on P-poor soils implies that tree species hydrolyse Ncontaining compounds with a cost of N while hydrolysing P-containing compounds. The reason why tree species on P-poor soils need to hydrolyse N-containing compounds, which is an additional cost of N, remains unclear.

We have demonstrated that plant nutritional strategies balance N and P and form a basis of ecosystem N and P stoichiometry. The positive correlations between foliar N and P in concentrations and resorption efficiency along a gradient of soil P availability will influence consequent soil processes and may feed back to plant nutrient uses. Further analyses are needed to elucidate the physiological background of the correlation.

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research was supported by a grant-in-aid from the Japanese MESSC (18255003 & 22255002) to K.K. and by a grant-in-aid from JSPS for Young Scientists (08J03021) and the Sasakawa Scientific Research Grant from The Japan Science Society (23-510) to A.H.

# LITERATURE CITED

- AERTS, R. 1996. Nutrient resorption from senescing leaves of perennials: are there general patterns? *Journal of Ecology* 84:597–608.
- AERTS, R. & CHAPIN, F. S. 2000. The mineral nutrition of wild plants revisited: a re-evaluation of processes and patterns. *Advances in Ecological Research* 30:1–67.
- ÅGREN, G. I. 2008. Stoichiometry and nutrition of plant growth in natural communities. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics* 39:153–170.
- CAI, Z. & BONGERS, F. 2007. Contrasting nitrogen and phosphorus resorption efficiencies in trees and lianas from a tropical montane

rain forest in Xishuangbanna, south-west China. *Journal of Tropical Ecology* 23:115–118.

- CERNUSAK, L. A., WINTER, K. & TURNER, B. L. 2010. Leaf nitrogen to phosphorus ratios of tropical trees: experimental assessment of physiological and environmental controls. *New Phytologist* 185:770– 779.
- CHAPIN, F. S., MATSON, P. A. & VITOUSEK, P. M. 2011. Principles of terrestrial ecosystem ecology. (Second edition). Springer, New York. 350 pp.
- CLEVELAND, C. C., TOWNSEND, A. R., TAYLOR, P., ALVAREZ-CLARE, S., BUSTAMANTE, M. M. C., CHUYONG, G., DOBROWSKI, S. Z., GRIERSON, P., HARMS, K. E., HOULTON, B. Z., MARKLEIN, A., PARTON, W., PORDER, S., REED, S. C., SIERRA, C. A., SILVER, W. L., TANNER, E. V. J. & WIEDER, W. R. 2011. Relationships among net primary productivity, nutrients and climate in tropical rain forest: a pan-tropical analysis. *Ecology Letters* 14:939–947.
- COLEY, P. D., BRYANT, J. P. & CHAPIN, F. S. 1985. Resource availability and plant anti-herbivore defense. *Science* 230:895–899.
- CORDELL, S., GOLDSTEIN, G., MEINZER, F. C. & VITOUSEK, P. M. 2001. Regulation of leaf life-span and nutrient-use efficiency of *Metrosideros polymorpha* trees at two extremes of a long chronosequence in Hawaii. *Oecologia* 127:198–206.
- ELSER, J. J., BRACKEN, M. E. S., CLELAND, E. E., GRUNER, D. S., HARPOLE, W. S., HILLEBRAND, H., NAGI, J. T., SEABLOOM, E. W., SHURIN, J. B. & SMITH, J. E. 2007. Global analysis of nitrogen and phosphorus limitation of primary producers in freshwater, marine and terrestrial ecosystems. *Ecology Letters* 10:1135–1142.
- ENDARA, M.-J. & COLEY, P. D. 2011. The resource availability hypothesis revisited: a meta-analysis. *Functional Ecology* 25:389– 398.
- GÜSEWELL, S. 2005. Nutrient resorption of wetland graminoids is related to the type of nutrient limitation. *Functional Ecology* 19:344–354.
- HALL, S. J., ASNER, G. P. & KITAYAMA, K. 2004. Substrate, climate, and land use controls over soil N dynamics and N-oxide emissions in Borneo. *Biogeochemistry* 70:27–58.
- HARPOLE, W. S., NGAI, J. T., CLELAND, E. E., SEABLOOM, E. W., BORER, E. T., BRACKEN, M. E. S., ELSER, J. J., GRUNER, D. S., HILLEBRAND, H., SHURIN, J. B. & SMITH, J. E. 2011. Nutrient colimitation of primary producer communities. *Ecology Letters* 14:852– 862.
- HÄTTENSCHWILER, S., AESCHLIMANN, B., COŨTEAUX, M.-M., ROY, J.&BONAL, D. 2008. High variation in foliage and leaflitter chemistry among 45 tree species of a neotropical rainforest community. *New Phytologist* 179:165–175.
- HIDAKA, A. & KITAYAMA, K. 2009. Divergent patterns of photosynthetic phosphorus-use efficiency versus nitrogen-use efficiency of tree leaves along nutrient-availability gradients. *Journal* of Ecology 97:984–991.
- HIDAKA, A. & KITAYAMA, K. 2011. Allocation of foliar phosphorus fractions and leaf traits of tropical tree species in response to decreased soil phosphorus availability on Mount Kinabalu, Borneo. *Journal of Ecology* 99:849–857.
- KERKHOFF, A. J., FAGAN, W. F., ELSER, J. J. & ENQUIST, B. J. 2006. Phylogenetic and growth form variation in the scaling of nitrogen

and phosphorus in the seed plants. *American Naturalist* 168:E103–E122.

- KILLINGBECK, K. T. 1996. Nutrients in senesced leaves: keys to the search for potential resorption and resorption proficiency. *Ecology* 77:1716–1727.
- KITAYAMA, K. 1992. An altitudinal transect study of the vegetation on Mount Kinabalu, Borneo. *Vegetatio* 102:149–171.
- KITAYAMA, K. & AIBA, S. 2002. Ecosystem structure and productivity of tropical rain forests along altitudinal gradients with contrasting soil phosphorus pools on Mount Kinabalu, Borneo. *Journal of Ecology* 90:37–51.
- KITAYAMA, K., AIBA, S., MAJALAP, N. & OHSAWA, M. 1998. Soil nitrogen mineralization rates of rainforests in a matrix of elevations and geological substrates on Mount Kinabalu, Borneo. *Ecological Research* 13:301–312.
- KITAYAMA, K., AIBA, S., TAKYU, M., MAJALAP, N. & WAGAI, R. 2004. Soil phosphorus fractionation and phosphorus-use efficiency of a Bornean tropical montane rain forest during soil aging with podzolization. *Ecosystems* 7:259–274.
- KOBE, R. K., LEPCZYK, C. A. & IYER, M. 2005. Resorption efficiency decreases with increasing green leaf nutrients in a global data set. *Ecology* 86:2780–2792.
- LAL, C. B., ANNAPURNA, C., RAGHUBANSHI, A. S. & SINGH, J. S. 2001. Effect of leaf habit and soil type on nutrient resorption and conservation in woody species of a dry tropical environment. *Canadian Journal of Botany* 79:1066–1075.
- MARSCHNER, H. 1995. *Mineral nutrition of higher plants*. (Second edition). Academic Press, London. 889 pp.
- MATZEK, V. & VITOUSEK, P. M. 2009. N:P stoichiometry and protein:RNA ratios in vascular plants: an evaluation of the growth-rate hypothesis. *Ecology Letters* 12:765–771.
- MAYOR, J. R., WRIGHT, S. J. & TURNER, B. L. 2014. Species-specific responses of foliar nutrients to long-term nitrogen and phosphorus additions in a lowland tropical forests. *Journal of Ecology* 102:36–44.
- NIKLAS, K. J., OWENS, T., REICH, P. B. & COBB, E. D. 2005. Nitrogen/phosphorus leaf stoichiometry and the scaling of plant growth. *Ecology Letters* 8:636–642.
- OSTERTAG, R. 2010. Foliar nitrogen and phosphorus accumulation responses after fertilization: an example from nutrient-limited Hawaiian forests. *Plant and Soil* 334:85–98.
- QUESADA, C. A., LLOYD, J., SCHWARZ, M., PATINO, S., BAKER, T. R., CZIMCZIK, C., FYLLAS, N. M., MARTINELLI, L., NARDOTO, G. B., SCHMERLER, J., SANTOS, A. J. B., HODNETT, M. G., HERRERA, R., LUIZÃO, F. J., ARNETH, A., LLOYD, G., DEZZEO, N., HILKE, I., KUHLMANN, I., RAESSLER, M., BRAND, W. A., GEILMANN, H., MORAES FILHO, J. O., CARVALHO, F. P., ARAUJO FILHO, R. N., CHAVES, J. E., CRUZ JUNIOR, O. F., PIMENTEL, T. P. & PAIVA, R. 2010. Variations in chemical and physical properties of Amazon forest soils in relation to their genesis. *Biogeosciences* 7:1515–1541.
- REED, S. C., TOWNSEND, A. R., DAVIDSON, E. A. & CLEVELAND, C. C. 2012. Stoichiometric patterns in foliar nutrient resorption across multiple scales. *New Phytologist* 196:173–180.
- REICH, P. B., OLEKSYN, J. & WRIGHT, I. J. 2009. Leaf phosphorus influences the photosynthesis–nitrogen relation: a cross-biome analysis of 314 species. *Oecologia* 160:207–212.

- REICH, P. B., OLEKSYN, J., WRIGHT, I. J., NIKLAS, K. J., HEDIN, L. & ELSER, J. J. 2010. Evidence of a general 2/3-power law of scaling leaf nitrogen to phosphorus among major plant groups and biomes. *Proceeding of the Royal Society of London. Series B: Biological Sciences* 277:877–883.
- TAKYU, M., AIBA, S. & KITAYAMA, K. 2002. Effects of topography on tropical lower montane forests under different geological conditions on Mount Kinabalu, Borneo. *Plant Ecology* 159:35–49.
- TAKYU, M., AIBA, S. & KITAYAMA, K. 2003. Changes in biomass, productivity and decomposition along topographical gradients under different geological conditions in tropical lower montane forests on Mount Kinabalu, Borneo. *Oecologia* 134:397–404.
- TOWNSEND, A. R., CLEVELAND, C. C., ASNER, G. P. & BUSTAMANTE, M. M. C. 2007. Controls over foliar N:P ratios in tropical rain forests. *Ecology* 88:107–118.
- TRESEDER, K. K. & VITOUSEK, P. M. 2001. Potential ecosystemlevel effects of genetic variation among populations of *Metrosideros polymorpha* from a soil fertility gradient in Hawaii. *Oecologia* 126:266– 275.
- TULLY, K. L., WOOD, T. E., SCHWANTES, A. M. & LAWRENCE, D. 2013. Soil nutrient availability and reproductive effort drive patterns in nutrient resorption in *Pentaclethra macroloba*. *Ecology* 93:930– 940.
- VENEKLAAS, E. J., LAMBERS, H., BRAGG, J., FINNEGAN, P. M., LOVELOCK, C. E., PLAXTON, W. C., PRICE, C. A., SCHEIBLE, W.-R., SHANE, M. W., WHITE, P. J. & RAVEN, J. A. 2012. Opportunities for

improving phosphorus-use efficiency in crop plants. *New Phytologist* 195:306–320.

- VERGUTZ, L., MANZONI, S., PORPORATO, A., NOVAI, R. F. & JACKSON, R. B. 2012. Global resorption efficiencies and concentrations of carbon and nutrients in leaves of terrestrial plants. *Ecological Monographs* 82:205–220.
- VITOUSEK, P. M. 1984. Litterfall, nutrient cycling, and nutrient limitation in tropical forests. *Ecology* 65:285–298.
- WARTON, D. I., DUURSMA, R. A., FALSTER, D. S. & TASKINEN, S. 2012. smatr 3 – an R package for estimation and inference about allometric lines. *Methods in Ecology and Evolution* 3:257–259.
- WRIGHT, I. J. & WESTOBY, M. 2003. Nutrient concentration, resorption and lifespan: leaf traits of Australian sclerophyll species. *Functional Ecology* 17:10–19.
- WRIGHT, I. J., REICH, P. B., WESTOBY, M., ACKERLY, D. D., BARUCH, Z., BONGERS, F., CAVENDER-BARES, J., CHAPIN, F. S., CORNELISSEN, J. H. C., DIEMER, M., FLEXAS, J., GARNIER, E., GROOM, P. K., GULIAS, J., HIKOSAKA, K., LAMONT, B. B., LEE, T., LEE, W., LUSK, C., MIDGLEY, J. J., NAVAS, M-L., NIINEMETS, Ü., OLEKSYN, J., OSADA, N., POORTER, H., POOT, P., PRIOR, L., PYANKOV, V. I., ROUMET, C., THOMAS, S. C., TJOELKER, M. G., VENEKLAAS, E. & VILLAR, R. 2004. The world-wide leaf economics spectrum. *Nature* 428:821–827.
- YUAN, Z.Y. & CHEN, H. Y. H. 2009. Global-scale patterns of nutrient resorption associated with latitude, temperature and precipitation. *Global Ecology and Biogeography* 18:11–18.