reliability of the veteran. These songs are manifestly the work of one whose counsel to himself has been as follows:

> Let me navigate in the knowledge
> that I am alone on this earth
> then my mind will not flinch
> before terrors, before the unknown.
> ('Schiffers Scheidelied': disc 33; track 14)

Schubert is revered because he combines the archetypal roles of Orpheus and Mnemosyne, being capable of both rhapsody and reflection: 'Now a new light has dawned, the time of sadness is past, and many join me on my path' ('Am Fenster', disc 32, track 2). When you peruse such settings you want him as your critic, your counsellor, your companion. And when you listen to these recordings, his wisdom, musical abundance and acuity are made even more available to you, and you realize that you did not overestimate him in any of these roles.

His timelessness is audible in the performance of every song. His lieder satisfy the appetite for seriousness and joy that the word 'song' awakens. He restores the child's eternity at the water's edge, but equally registers the adult's dismay that his name is 'writ on water'; his mortal knowledge that 'I do not have much further to walk with my staff'.[7] He helps the rest of us to keep faith with those moments when we are suddenly alive to the sweetness of living in the body, yet he won't absolve us from the penalties of being human.

Lorraine Byrne Bodley
National University of Ireland at Maynooth

Discs 35–38

That the Hyperion Schubert Edition (as it sometimes calls itself) is indisputably a landmark achievement there can be no question. An accompanying book, together with the sleeve notes that come with the original CDs, will no doubt serve as the source of much of what most listeners will come to know about Schubert and his songs. Graham Johnson, its author, modestly subtitles its preface 'An accompanist's memories'. Johnson, however, is no mere accompanist, but rather the *spiritus rector* of the project. In the opening lines of his prefatory remarks, Johnson writes, 'It took Franz Schubert eighteen years (1810–1828) to write his lieder. It has taken Hyperion Records exactly the same amount of time (1987–2005) to record all the songs, to issue them on thirty-seven separate discs (with over sixty solo singers), and now to re-issue the vocal music with piano in an edition remastered in the order of their composition'. Beneath the modesty, a bolder ambition might be teased from this innocent comparison: to be to the performance of Schubert's songs what Schubert was to the composition of them. There is indeed something seductive in this. A project engaging more than 60 solo singers will ensure a considerable range of performing styles, of interpretive modes. And there is the figure of Johnson himself, at the keyboard for virtually the entire 18 years. His keen sense of a Schubert style is very much of its time and place: of music-making in the England of the past twenty-some years. These

[7] Franz Schubert/ Wilhelm Müller: *Winterreise* D911 15, 'Die Krähe', ll.9–10. Disc 34, track 8, sung by Matthias Goerne.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409800003499 Published online by Cambridge University Press

performances, to the extent that one might generalize, are clean, temperate, informed, and often quite a bit more than that.

The volumes reviewed here are extraordinary in content. If Schubert in his final year was deeply engaged in major projects in virtually every genre – one thinks of the three final piano sonatas, the Fantasy in F minor for piano four hands, the unfinished but now considerably admired fragment of the opera *Der Graf von Gleichen* (begun in June 1827, but still occupying Schubert's thoughts in his dying days), the String Quintet in C, the great Mass in E♭ major, and much else – he was no less signally engaged in the composition of lieder. The range is considerable: ten settings (three of them left as fragments) to poems by Leitner, from the autumn and winter of 1827–28; the four genial *Refrainlieder* (D. 866) to texts by Seidl, presumably from the summer of 1828, and published as a set as Op. 95 in August of that year; the singular 'Glaube, Hoffnung und Liebe' (D. 955), on a text by Christoph Kuffner, composed in August 1828; and two imposing groups of songs, on texts by Ludwig Rellstab and Heinrich Heine (D. 957), compiled by Schubert in a single large autograph manuscript and – together with a final song, 'Die Taubenpost' (D. 965a) on a poem by Seidl, composed in October 1828 – published misleadingly as *Schwanengesang* by Tobias Haslinger in May 1829. *Winterreise* (reviewed elsewhere) occupied Schubert during these months, the second part published by Haslinger only a month after Schubert's death. Then there are the two uncommonly long songs with an additional solo instrument: the pervasively lyrical 'Auf dem Strom' (D. 943) on a text by Rellstab, from March 1828, lovingly performed by tenor Michael Schade and hornist David Pyatt; and, from October 1828, 'Der Hirt auf dem Felsen' (D. 964, with clarinet) on a text apparently cobbled together from a long poem by Wilhelm Müller and, it is thought, Helmina von Chézy. Two other Rellstab songs are included. 'Lebensmut' (D. 937), which survives only as a fragment (but sufficiently complete as to allow a performance), was conceived originally to set off the group ultimately written into the so-called *Schwanengesang* autograph, but early abandoned. 'Herbst' (D. 945), which Schubert wrote out for the autograph album of the violinist Heinrich Panofka in April 1828, is very much more than a memento, and it remains something of a riddle why Schubert let this exquisite song out of his sight.

Among the familiar Leitner settings are three fragments completed by Reinhard van Hoorickx, the late Belgian scholar well known for his modest, unobtrusive completions of a great many unfinished works by Schubert. If what Schubert left of 'Fröhliches Scheiden' (D. 896) is barely sufficient to the claim that we have here a complete song in the rough, the other two are less secure in that regard. Neither draft is graced with even a word of text or title, and it is only their propinquity on the page to 'Fröhliches Scheiden' that led van Hoorickx to seek and propose likely candidates in Leitner's *Gedichte* of 1825: 'Wolke und Quelle' and 'Sie in jedem Lieder'. To his great credit, there is something uncanny in the fitting of music to this latter poem, the musings of a love-sick poet-musician whose fantasy grows increasingly erotic until a rude awakening at the end of its fifth strophe: 'Ah, only in life, harsh and gloomy, does the hostile hand of fate sunder us'. In the fitful, unhinged music of these final lines, the sundering is played out, moving from a tonic B♭ major precipitously to B♭ minor and G♭ major. A big half-cadence in E♭ minor, one that does violence to the poetic syntax – 'trennt uns des Schicksals [interruption] feindliches Hand' – is then answered by a return to B♭; the phrase earlier in G♭ is now sung in F♯ minor, setting off a difficult return whose complex inner voicings (left only to the imagination, for we have only the voice part) would be bold in the extreme. Was Schubert willing

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409800003499 Published online by Cambridge University Press

to pursue the audacity of this setting, or did he pull back? In some respects, this is a song not quite under control, and one might think that Schubert was unwilling to tame it. The graceful performance here only points up the paradox of a fragment passed off as something else.

The very odd performance of 'Glaube, Hoffnung und Liebe', an *unicum* in several senses, wants comment here. The Kuffner poem is in five strophes. Its three central stanzas – each a reflection on the three virtues in Paul's first letter to the Corinthians (13:13) – are set strophically to music that moves through E♭ minor and G♭ major to an ecstatic cadence in C♭ major. The outer strophes, sung to slower music, have a palindromic aspect, growing from a subtly wrought opening phrase, setting the words 'Glaube, hoffe, liebe', which returns only at the very end of the fifth strophe, where it is sung twice – but with a difference. Graham Johnson thought it fitting to endow each of the three virtues with its own voice, so that John Mark Ainsley, Anthony Rolfe Johnson and Michael Schade each sing one of the three middle strophes. Ainsley is given the first and fifth strophes as well, with the exception of the opening phrase, where the three words are sung *seriatim*, one each by Ainsley, Johnson and Schade. In the fifth strophe, the music takes a bold turn: this opening phrase, now a concluding one, is transported to G♭ major, an especially poignant moment which Schubert's *pianissimo* only underscores. An immediate repetition of the phrase, now returned to the tonic E♭ and sung *forte*, has a sobering effect (a final echo in the piano is marked *pianissimo*). How do these musicians respond to Schubert's complex (and conceptually problematical) close? The phrase in G♭ is again divided among the three singers. Schade, whose voice is the most appealing of the three in its slightly grainy timbre, is given the plaintive reach up to the G♭ at 'liebe'. At the repetition, the three voices sing together, and must negotiate in unison an embellishing turn that Schubert wrote as a sign over the long penultimate note. Mandyzweski, the estimable editor of the old Breitkopf *Gesamtausgabe*, apparently knew only the Diabelli first edition (the song was published in October 1828, the last song to have been published in Schubert's lifetime) and suspected meddling on Diabelli's part: 'Ob der Mordent im vorletzten Takt der Singstimme von Schubert herrührt, bleibt zweifelhaft' (It remains doubtful whether the mordent in the penultimate measure of the voice part originated with Schubert), he surmised. If the autograph solves that riddle, Mandyzweski was right to question the taste of an ornament that merely prettifies a gesture that wants purity and not embellishment. The effect, when sung in unison by three voices of different timbre (even impeccably sung, as it is here), borders on kitsch – a kind of 'three tenors' moment. The song is ruined. (It is blemished as well in the puzzling substitution of an E♭ for an F in an inner voice in the piano at bars 32 and 34. This is not quite as trivial as it might seem, for the substitution implicates parallel fifths that Schubert's notation studiously avoids.)

Among the lieder of Schubert's last months, the main event is in two parts: the groups of settings by Rellstab and Heine that were published without Schubert's authorization, posthumously, as a single work. But in a well-known letter dated 2 October 1828, Schubert wrote to the Leipzig publisher Probst: 'Auch habe ich mehrere Lieder von Heine aus Hamburg gesetzt, welche hier außerordentlich gefielen' (I've composed several songs by Heine of Hamburg which have been received here with uncommon pleasure) – evidence that Schubert, at this very late date, thought of the Heine songs as a group to itself. In the original Hyperion Schubert Edition, vol. 37 [CD J33037], the separation between the two groups is even more sharply etched, with 'Glaube, Hoffnung und Liebe' interpolated

between Rellstab and Heine. Ainsley sings the Rellstab group, Johnson sings Heine. These are both singers with big, operatic voices. If 'Kriegers Ahnung' (Rellstab), 'Der Doppelgänger' and 'Der Atlas' (Heine) are songs that can tolerate the grand gesture and commodious vibrato, 'Das Fischermädchen' (Heine), 'Liebesbotschaft' and 'Abschied' (Rellstab) want a different quality. I longed for Schade here, or Bostridge, or Schreier.

If this is largely a matter of taste, the critique that follows opens onto larger issues. At the end of this 18-year project – at the end of Schubert's flight and Graham Johnson's pilgrimage – expectations run high that we will have performances that plumb the imponderable meanings of these songs, that navigate the unsettling currents that run through them. One such current is the idea that each group constitutes a kind of cycle. I use the term in a generic sense, meant to embrace any group of works that together intimate a narrative, musical and poetic, and formulate a discourse whose continuities and discontinuities are somehow legible in narrative terms. A group that opens, as do the Rellstab songs, with the epistolary 'Liebesbotschaft', redolent both of the poetic messaging of Beethoven's *An die ferne Geliebte* and a 'Wohin?'-like wandering at the outset of an earlier Schubert cycle, and closes with 'Abschied' is surely suggestive of such cycle-making, even if its inner songs tell no perfectly lucid story. It is the music, imposing its own narrative, that is telling. The Heine songs formulate a problem of another kind, for it has been argued (by myself and others) that when these songs are realigned to follow the order in Heine's *Heimkehr* – a practice that Schubert generally follows when reading in a poet's book – they constitute a musical narrative that makes sense of a group of songs that, in all published versions, offers no pretence to coherence.[1] The most powerful evidence for the restoring of this hypothetical order comes in the persuasive conviction of performance. To sing them this way, to hear them engaged as a cycle, is to be moved by the great good sense that each song now makes in a narrative of considerable eloquence. 'Das Fischermädchen' is the model of the so-called *Gehlied* with which Schubert often gets cycles underway. The famous opening sonority of 'Das Meer' inflects A♭, the tonic with which 'Das Fischermädchen' closes, as a new and powerful dissonance, and sets the internal narrative into action. 'Der Atlas', even in its chilling, brutal final phrase (taking a page from the final bars of the finale of the Quintet in C major, D. 956, composed perhaps within weeks of the song) is as resounding a final cadence as one could want. Restoring the 'etwas geschwind' of 'Das Fischermädchen', 'Der Atlas' is the only one of the six songs to *begin* with a *forte*. These are merely the most provocative signals that something is amiss in the version that survived in publication.

Graham Johnson wants no part of such speculative adventure. 'Schubert's selectivity as far as the choosing of the songs is evident from their order in the published editions', he writes of the Heine songs. 'There is little reason to suppose that his own re-ordering of the poems was not deliberate.' But there is every reason to suppose that Schubert, the business of composition behind him, routinely put together groups of incompatible songs in an effort to please a public and a publisher. To contend with such apparent contradiction between the conceiving of the work and its marketing is to engage in critical practice. When our Hyperion CD brings us the brutalizing opening bars of 'Der Atlas'

[1] The argument is proposed in my *Distant Cycles: Schubert and the Conceiving of Song* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994): 125–47; and rehearsed in 'Against Recycling', *19th-Century Music,* XX/2 (autumn 1996): 185–9.

a mere second or two after the closing bars of 'Abschied', we are victimized by the hegemony, the implicit authority, of the digital recording, with its claim to museum-like permanence. The opportunity for a revelatory hearing of these astonishing songs is abused.

The decision to sing the Heine songs in their published order has consequences for the performance of the individual songs. The very articulation of the opening bars of 'Das Fischermädchen' – Schubert pointedly writes no slurs here – is foggy. Those first bars want something more cleanly articulate, with perhaps a deeper touch and a bit of pedal at the change of harmony in bar 3. Johnson pedals from the beginning. These opening bars ought to establish an esprit, a mood, for the whole song. This, however, is a sluggish 'Fischermädchen', and perhaps that comes from having performed it only after 'Der Atlas', with its 'ganze Welt der Schmerzen', and the penetrating sadness of 'Ihr Bild', following which the innocence, genuine or feigned, of this lovely song makes little sense.

'Der Doppelgänger' drives relentlessly to a catastrophic cadence at 'der Mond zeigt mir mein eigne Gestalt', a phrase which Schubert deftly revised in the autograph so as to have the voice break off on the high G♮, a dissonant ninth above the dominant, resolved only in the tenor and bass registers of the piano at the last possible moment, quietly. Schubert wanted the G♮, held for four beats, to resonate for another two, across rests, while the piano makes its reluctant resolution: six beats in all. Johnson, perhaps overcome by the tension, resolves much too soon, destroying what is arguably the crux of the song. Was the effect intended? Are we meant to be swept along with Johnson here, impatient, in the intensity of the moment, with Schubert's full six beats? That is hard to accept.

Rhythmic distortion of another kind plagues the seven-bar phrase at the beginning of 'In der Ferne', and at each repetition. The triplet at bar 3 is notated to come at the second half of the beat. Rather, Johnson plays it as though it were a quaver triplet. In other songs, the problem of the quaver followed by a semiquaver is often resolved as though coincident with the notation of Schubert's ubiquitous quaver triplets. This is of course a disputed matter. Still, one longs for a bit more edge to the pointed rhythms of 'Die Stadt'. The middle strophe, an elaboration of a single diminished seventh, might even have been pedalled all the way through its 12 sultry bars: Schubert writes 'con Pedale' at the very beginning of the song, an invitation to work those pedals a bit. Johnson elects to raise the dampers only at the broken diminished seventh, a kind of motto, in bar 3. Schubert wants a hushed music through the first two strophes; he writes *pianissimo* at the outset, and *leise* (softly) at the entrance of the voice, and then nothing until the third strophe, which is marked *forte* and *starke* (loudly). This too is a song that cries out for imaginative, even extreme performance (answered here in certain respects), but it demands scrupulous attention as well to the coordination between voice and piano, more than is always evident in this performance.

And then there is 'Frühlingssehnsucht', the exquisite third song in the Rellstab group. At the end of each of its first four strophes, Schubert sets Rellstab's questioning ('Wohin?', 'hinab?', 'Warum?', 'und du?') with a breathtaking phrase that probes a harmonic labyrinth, seeking answers to those questions. The urgency of its impetuous $\frac{6}{8}$ rhythm is suspended. Time seems to stop. But of course it doesn't, and it is crucial to a performance that these eight meditative bars which deftly re-establish the tonic are heard against the implacable rhythm of the larger phrase. Johnson chooses to make an audible *ritardando* at each of these moments, disabling Schubert's carefully wrought metrics.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409800003499 Published online by Cambridge University Press

This brings us finally to 'Am Meer'. 'Heine's pathos is surely part of the expressive legacy of the Jewish tradition he shared with Mahler', writes Johnson, and he continues:

> Which leads us to remember that in July 1828, probably at about the same time he was writing this song, Schubert set Psalm 93 [*recte*: 92] for his friend the rabbi and cantor, Salomon Sulzer. In order to do so he must have listened to Jewish liturgical music and learned something about Hebrew. This is worth mentioning here because, if the plaintive sound of cantorial music is to be found anywhere in Schubert's lieder, it is in the elegiac desperation of 'Am Meer', the very tessitura of the voice appropriate for a call to prayer. (Even the decorations at the ends of the words 'Abendscheine' and 'gesunken' have the in-built flourishes of that tradition.) Because 'Am Meer' is a song at twilight, we might also mention that 'Im Abendrot', another *alla breve* prayer at sunset, is written in the same exacting tessitura. 'O wie schön ist deine Welt' says the poet Lappe ('O how beautiful is your world'), which is in the spirit of Heine's nature description too. If prayer played a part in the song's genesis (and this would involve Schubert's having chosen to show in musical terms that he understood something of the poet's Jewish background) the ritualistic nature of the music would be more understandable.

Johnson may be the first to hear the song with such inflections. 'Am Meer', in both Heine's *Heimkehr* and in Schubert's setting, is about love: simple on the surface, mysterious and turbulent beneath it, like the sea. It is not about liturgy (except perhaps as a vaguely metaphorical allusion), and it is not about Heine's *Yiddishkeit*, or an effort on Schubert's part to acknowledge that he 'understood something of the poet's Jewish background', whatever that could possibly mean. Can we seriously believe that Schubert might have 'understood' something that Heine, baptized as Protestant in 1825, spent his life trying to unpack, even if the poems of *Heimkehr* offer sardonic glimpes into scenes of conflicted identity? The setting of the 92nd Psalm (D. 953) to a Hebrew text – a performance is conveniently furnished in *The Complete Songs* 36 – reveals only the occasional gesture that one has come to associate with a generalized sacred style. If the music had survived only in a version with some Latin paraphrase, no 'Jewish' aspect of the music would leap out in contradiction.

Mahler returns, as though a source for Schubert's Heine style. 'The parallel sixths of "unglücksel'ge Weib"', Johnson writes, 'are once again Mahlerian, this time uncannily prophetic of "Oft denk' ich, sie sind nur ausgegangen!" from *Kindertotenlieder*. The final "vergiftet mit ihren Tränen" is set to the same doleful music, suggestive of ritual, as before'. In performance, of course, Schubert's written sixths are not sixths at all, for the tenor sings an octave lower than written, and thus *beneath* the treble piano, whose reach up to the high, dissonant A♭ – a grating minor ninth against the G in the bass, much like the G♮ against the F♯ at the climactic moment of 'Der Doppelgänger' – is at the crux of the phrase, a pitch heavily invested as the hinge between the first and second songs in the cycle (see above). This is a matter neither of declamation nor of 'word painting'. We are meant to feel the abrasive burn of the poisoning here, and it is the A♭ in the piano that must make that happen, even if it strains against the voice. Johnson's decorum, his deference to the voice, understates an extreme moment in the song, one that must have resonated deeply with Schubert. With Heine, love is never a simple thing: the apparent innocence of the verse covers an abrasive irony bordering on the neurotic. How this penetrates to the core of Schubert's searing phrase is a question that continues to haunt us.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409800003499 Published online by Cambridge University Press

* * *

As an intriguing afterbeat to these recordings, I have as well Volume 38, titled *Songs by Schubert's friends and contemporaries – I* (the first of a three-part survey). All the usual suspects are here, along with some unsuspected ones. Johann Friedrich Reichardt is well represented with four Goethe settings, of which the least known is the provocatively titled 'Monolog aus Göthe's Iphigenia als eine Probe musikalischer Behandlung jenes Meisterwerkes', published in 1798, here sung with great feeling (Reichardt marks one touching passage 'Etwas gesungen'!) by Susan Gritton. Schubert actually copied out the lengthy score in 1815, obviously a work from which he thought something useful might be learned. Luise Reichardt (Johann Friedrich's daughter) follows with a little-known setting of one of the 'Hymnen an die Nacht' by Novalis, a poem that would challenge Schubert to a profound setting (D. 687) in 1820. What is of interest here is the extent to which Reichardt's lovely setting, published in 1819, is still very much grounded in the eighteenth century, even in its hearing of Novalis's new, deeply Romantic poetry; born in 1779, she was seven years younger than Novalis. Schubert's music makes something very different of the poem, probing its mysticism in a tonal expedition at the extremes of his language.

It is good to have Zumsteeg's seemingly endless setting of Schiller's 'Die Erwartung' (ten and a half minutes of it in this performance), long known as the model for Schubert's ambitious early setting (D. 159) of 1816. There are as well five lieder by Zelter, all on Goethe texts that Schubert also set. The surprise here is 'Rastlose Liebe', a tempestuous, moving piece that might lead one to rethink Zelter's much maligned reputation. It was, however, the earlier of two settings by Reichardt of Goethe's poem, included on this disc as well, that seems to have influenced Schubert's setting of 1815 (D. 138).

Finally, Mark Padmore sings *An die ferne Geliebte* in a voice well tuned to the subtle accents of Beethoven's cycle. It is not always easy to understand how this signal novelty of 1816 might be written into the larger history of Schubert's cycle-making. Perhaps it is only in the Rellstab and Heine groups, each in its own way, that the deeper implications of Beethoven's radically simple concept take hold. The more conventional discursive modes of the Müller cycles are drawn taut, the lyricism intensified and distilled. In any case it is good to be reminded of the extent to which Beethoven's Olympian figure, even in these modest, folk-like songs, seems ever to hover about this introverted singer.

Richard Kramer
Graduate Center of the City University of New York

Discs 38–40: Schubert's Friends and Contemporaries

Let me begin by repeating a truism: whatever else art (of any kind) is about, it is also always about other art – in this instance, the music composed before the individual work was created and the musical environment that surrounded its inception. Once a song is printed and available both locally and beyond its native borders, it can in turn become part of the musical inheritance of those composers who follow in its wake. This vast array of prequels, present moments and aftermaths (the best works are all of the above) is much richer than one might suppose from posterity's subsequent winnowing out of 'the lesser' in favour of 'the greater'. In song circles, history's selectivity has been severe. Not

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409800003499 Published online by Cambridge University Press