

were no less than 223 crimes that could in theory be punished by execution. By 1839 there were only nine. The book is particularly noteworthy in showing the importance of Evangelicalism in motivating and driving forward a process hitherto primarily associated with Benthamite utilitarianism. Although the key promoters of reform, Samuel Romilly, James Mackintosh and, eventually, Robert Peel, were not themselves Evangelicals, it is Follett's contention that their achievement was crucially dependent on Evangelical support. Not only was there the parliamentary assistance of men such as William Wilberforce and Thomas Fowell Buxton, but also Evangelical networks and publications were important in mobilising public opinion. Moreover, Evangelical theology was a major ideological force leading to demands for the limitation of capital punishment. Although, at first sight, belief in human depravity and eternal punishment might be used to justify capital punishment, in reality, Follett argues, the weight of Evangelical influence was very much in the other direction. From an Evangelical perspective it was important both to maintain the biblical principle that punishment should be proportionate to the offence, and to provide the offender with an opportunity before death for amendment of life and conversion to Christ. Follett's ambitious intellectual agenda at times gives the book a somewhat disjointed texture, as he moves between his specific concern with Evangelicals and his wider narrative of the penal reform campaigns. There would be scope for discussion of a broader spectrum of religious opinion: William Paley features as a prominent theological defender of the conservative doctrine of maximum deterrence, but it is not clear how far he was representative of non-Evangelical Anglican views. There are intriguing incidental references to Dissenting support for criminal law reform, which would have merited more purposeful development. Nevertheless, while a book that pursued such lines of enquiry in more depth might have been more immediately satisfying for ecclesiastical historians, the great merit of Follett's study is as a very worthwhile addition to the growing body of literature that effectively explores the rich interconnectedness of the religious and the political worlds in this period.

THE OPEN UNIVERSITY

JOHN WOLFFE

*Kierkegaard. A biography.* By Alastair Hannay. Pp. xvi + 496 + 8 plates. Cambridge:

Cambridge University Press, 2001. £30. 0 521 56077 2

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904210788

Kierkegaard has attracted the interest of biographers since the time when books began to be written about him. Indeed, the first monograph, by the secularist critic George Brandes, took an explicitly biographical form, in keeping with Brandes's opinion that literature is to be understood in terms of its psychological and social context and that these also had to be seen in developmental terms. As Brandes himself concludes, Kierkegaard

can only be understood when one attempts to make clear the history of his genius in terms of the formation of his character and his productivity from their very earliest seeds, and, as well as one can, follows the criss-crossing lines of his development from their first beginnings through to their final results, without leaping over a single starting-point or intermediary position, yet without trying to be more consistent and linear than nature herself is.

A tall order, and, inevitably, most Kierkegaard biographies have sought to make sense of the whole in terms of one or other element or ideological position in Kierkegaard's protean authorship. There have been hagiographies which, though rarely totally oblivious to Kierkegaard's patent failings, wrote him up as a champion of a new reformation and precursor of the twentieth century's radical theology (thus Lowrie). And there have also been exercises in demythologising which, though rarely without acknowledgement of their subject's singular pathos, portray him as some kind of phantom-existence trapped in a weird sort of parallel universe (thus Josiah Thompson). The most recent Danish biography, the award-winning *SAK: Søren Aabye Kierkegaard* by Joakim Garff, fills in much of the hitherto unnoticed fine detail of Kierkegaard's daily life, though it also tends in the demythologising direction, with much to say on such subjects as masturbation and epilepsy. The more rigorous philosophical and theological treatments of Kierkegaard's work have, of course, tried to look away from any such biographical facts, but even the most rigorous tend not to be averse – in this case at least – to dropping the odd biographical claim to clinch a point for or against (usually against) 'the melancholy Dane'.

Hannay – who has a solid body of purely philosophical writing about Kierkegaard to his credit – is neither a hagiographer nor a debunker. Precisely as a philosopher he is convinced that whatever Kierkegaard did mean in his complex and sometimes rather ingrown authorship cannot but be illuminated by setting it in the context of the intellectual environment of the time and tracing how Kierkegaard himself responded to the moving currents of contemporary intellectual life. And this, it should be said, is very much an intellectual biography. The gloomy father and the broken engagement are not overlooked, but Hannay's interest is in how the life illuminates the work, not *vice versa*, and he says nothing about masturbation. Consciously or not, Hannay has been at pains to follow Brandes's advice, cited at the beginning of this review, which makes for a painstaking but rewarding study. A very large part of the book is devoted to Kierkegaard's student years, maybe too great a part, but this at least gets us to see how varied were the 'earliest seeds' and how complex the 'first beginnings' and 'starting-points' of Kierkegaard's intellectual career. It also shows us how tangibly Kierkegaard was, so to speak, 'on the scene' of contemporary student debate – far from the brooding, isolated individual of Kierkegaard-mythology.

As a philosopher, Hannay is, naturally enough, primarily interested in the philosophical side of Kierkegaard's work. Here there is no doubt that his book marks a watershed in English-language Kierkegaard literature and should serve to put to rest the all-too frequent misrepresentations of Kierkegaard battling in splendid isolation against a monolithic Hegelian establishment. The reality was very different, and Kierkegaard proves to be one of many gifted contributors to a fast-moving and many-sided debate about philosophy, culture and religion in 1840s Denmark. Yet though Kierkegaard's great religious contemporaries, such as Grundtvig and Mynster in Denmark and Schleiermacher in Germany, get due mention, one senses that Kierkegaard's significance for modern Christianity and church life is not where Hannay's heart lies. Significantly, and as in most of the secondary literature, the directly religious works get next to no mention. From the point of view of church history, a very different biography might therefore have been written. This is not in itself a reproach against Hannay's achievement, but it leaves open the

possibility that, milestone as it undoubtedly is, this is not the last word in Kierkegaard biography.

CHRIST CHURCH,  
OXFORD

GEORGE PATTISON

*Anglican resurgence under W. F. Hook in early Victorian Leeds. Church life in a Nonconformist town, 1836–1851.* By Harry W. Dalton. (Second Ser. for 2001, 12.) Pp. xiii + 158 incl. 5 tables. Leeds: Thoresby Society, 2002. £15 plus £1.50 post and packing. 0 900 741 60 0; 0082 4232

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904220784

Walter Farquhar Hook, vicar of Leeds 1837–59 and dean of Chichester 1859–75, was one of the most important ecclesiastical figures of his generation yet he has been largely neglected by historians. Part of the reason for this is the excellent, though partial, biography by his son-in-law, W. R. W. Stephens; another is the fact that Hook left comparatively few personal papers, most of which are still in private custody and therefore somewhat inaccessible. Although Dalton sets out with a revisionist agenda he ends up painting a picture of Hook, and of his impact on Leeds, that is not very different from that of previous scholars, though he introduces a good deal of new evidence, especially in relation to the church extension programme in Leeds between the 1820s and 1850s. Dalton thinks that Hook's disagreements with Tractarians and ritualists, especially over the crises at the new district church of St Saviour, moved him closer to Evangelical opinion (p. 112), but there is no evidence in his later writings to support this view. Recent research on the strength of traditional pre-Tractarian High Churchmanship within the Church of England until well into the second half of the nineteenth century would suggest that the theological isolationism attributed to Hook in the 1850s and 1860s has been misplaced, and that he had no need to make new alliances with Evangelicals or Broad Churchmen after his temporary breach with the Tractarians. It is also unfortunate that Dalton chooses to terminate his study of Hook in 1851, rather than extending it to 1859, and that he provides no concluding chapter offering a wide-ranging assessment of Hook's overall contribution to the religious life of early Victorian Leeds.

UNIVERSITY OF WALES,  
LAMPETER

NIGEL YATES

*An introduction to the Oxford Movement.* By Michael Chandler. Pp. xi + 148. London: SPCK, 2003. £12.00 (paper). 0 218 05517 3

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904230780

This is a useful and readable account of the Oxford Movement in the nineteenth century although there is nothing original about it. Chandler takes a largely narrative approach up to 1850, the year of the Gorham judgement which triggered a second wave of Anglican converts to Rome, following so soon after Newman's secession in 1845: one chapter guides us deftly through the controversy over *Tract 90*. He then sketches the progress of the Oxford Movement in the parishes, concentrating on ritualism and the revival of sacramental confessions and ends with an

attempt to assess the success of the movement within the Church of England. He several times refers to the subtleties of Dean Church's classic account of the movement and he also draws on some important recent work notably that of Nockles and Herring.

BRISTOL

PETER G. COBB

*Italia liberale e protestanti*. By Giorgio Spini. (Studi storici.) Pp. 423 + 32 black-and-white plates. Turin: Claudiana, 2002. €29.50 (paper). 88 7016 390 3

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904240787

A veteran of the Resistance (cf. his *La strada della liberazione*, Turin 2002) and one of the most dynamic intellectuals in post-war Italy, Spini has played a crucial role in the renewal of historical studies in his country over the past sixty years. Challenging the parochialism which dominated Italian academia, Spini was a pioneer in the exploration of the 'encounters' between cultural and religious traditions across national and confessional boundaries. His historical curiosity was sharpened by his belonging to the tiny but lively minority of Italian Protestants, who traditionally have looked across the Alps for support and solidarity. The present volume is the second of a series which started with Spini's classic *Risorgimento e protestanti* (1956, republished 1998). In the first volume Spini studied the emergence of a more tolerant and pluralist political environment under the impact of revolutions and national unification. *Italia liberale e protestanti* deals with the period from 1861 to the mid-1920s, from the liberal hegemony to Mussolini's seizure of power, when religious liberty became again a luxury, first for the Protestants and then for the Jews. In the 1850s the so-called 'moral crisis' of the Risorgimento prepared the ground for religious revivals within and without the existing Churches. Religious freedom from 1861 facilitated the growth of the Reformed Waldensian Church, while many Protestant converts from the virulently anticlerical democratic party – impatient of Presbyterian discipline – broke away to establish the more exuberant and aggressive 'Free Church'. Foreign missionary intervention led to the establishment of Baptist, Methodist and – eventually – Salvationist and Pentecostal communities in various parts of the country, while the Italian equivalent of the Plymouth Brethren (*Fratelli*) drew on native pietism and imported millenarianism. Spini shows how each of these Churches developed specific national peculiarities: for example, the Methodist ministry attracted a comparatively large number of converted Catholic priests, while later the rapid Pentecostal expansion relied on the enthusiasm of the *americani*, the Italian emigrants who had returned from the United States. Intellectually and theologically, for most of the nineteenth century Italian Protestantism was influenced more by British Evangelicalism and the Swiss and French *Réveille* than by contemporary German theology. Socially, it appealed to urban artisans, factory workers and peasants, who accounted for 50 per cent of Italian Protestants by the 1880s. Of particular interest was Protestant expansion in Sicily, where Baptists, Methodists and Waldensians spread among miners and farmers in the teeth of intense Mafia opposition, partly as a result of Protestant free primary schools and a related proto-liberationist gospel. Numerically, there was no dramatic breakthrough, but Protestant numbers increased four-fold in forty years, from 30,000 in 1861 to 120,000 in 1911, despite their Churches being constantly depleted by mass emigration to

America. This growth met with stiff resistance from the Roman Catholic Church. Its hierarchy kept the state under constant pressure to restrain 'heretic' proselytism, and parish priests were involved in local riots leading to the destruction of chapels and sometimes the lynching of pastors. Despite his empathy with the subject, Spini does not hesitate to expose the sectarianism and petty rivalries which plagued Italian Protestantism in these years, especially among the most radical groups, such as the Free Church and the Brethren. The Free Church was deeply involved with the Freemasons, though some other Protestant groups were either too cautious or ascetic to become involved with political organisations. Spini is interested not only in the dynamic of conversions and church planting, but also in Protestantism's impact on contemporary culture and society, including modernist Catholic thought, socialist politics, civil rights campaigns and contemporary art. Elegantly written in an inimitably ironic style, this book is a pleasure to read. It is based on an impressive amount of research which reflects the author's unparalleled mastery of sources and historiography in four languages. The robust footnotes and detailed index will make this volume easy to use as a reference work.

ROBINSON COLLEGE,  
CAMBRIDGE

EUGENIO BIAGINI

*Florence Nightingale. An introduction to her life and family.* Edited by Lynn McDonald. (The Collected Works of Florence Nightingale, 1.) Pp. xii + 908 + 9 plates. Ontario: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2001. \$95. 0 88920 387 3

*Florence Nightingale's spiritual journey. Biblical annotations, sermons and journal notes.* Edited by Lynn McDonald. (The Collected Works of Florence Nightingale, 2.) Pp. xii + 586 + 8 plates. Ontario: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2001. \$85. 0 88920 366 0

*Florence Nightingale's theology. Essays, letters and journal notes.* Edited by Lynn McDonald. (The Collected Works of Florence Nightingale, 3.) Pp. xii + 678 + 8 plates. Ontario: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2002. \$95. 0 88920 387 3

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904250783

These are the first three volumes of a projected sixteen which will, for the first time, bring the complete published and unpublished works of Florence Nightingale (1820–1910) into the public domain. These writings have been collected from more than 150 archives and private collections world-wide in a project sponsored by the Social Sciences and Research Council of Canada and the University of Guelph, Ontario. The published volumes are arranged thematically, with a minimal amount of selection; the full texts, transcribed without editing, will form a searchable electronic 'I-text'. So far only the volumes under review are available, but it is clear that this is an academic project of the highest importance and integrity. It will have an impact on the work of scholars far beyond the immediate field of health history. Nightingale's interests were wide-ranging and her correspondents included some of the leading thinkers of her day.

Nightingale's work at Scutari Hospital during the Crimean War and her major contribution to the creation of the modern nursing profession is well known. Less celebrated, perhaps, are her unstinting efforts over many years to improve public health in India and her insistence, in all her enterprises, on the need for accurate

record-keeping and statistical data. This data formed the basis for many government reports and made her, in the view of Lynn McDonald and other social scientists, an important contributor to the development of their discipline. Of direct interest to readers of this JOURNAL is her interest in contemporary spirituality, which extended far beyond the Anglicanism in which she was brought up, and her correspondence with leading clerical figures such as Henry Manning and Benjamin Jowett. Her religious writings are the focus of at least four volumes: those under review together with volume iv, which will document her deep interest in mysticism and eastern religions. *Suggestions for thought*, her long study of 'religious truth' and the mission to the unchurched working classes, will appear in volume viii. Only one section of this has previously been published, 'Cassandra', her impassioned autobiographical outcry against the unbearable restraints placed by the conventional Victorian family on its clever daughters. (Nancy Boyd's excellent discussion of *Suggestions for thought* and Nightingale's theology generally in *Three Victorian women who changed their world*, New York–Oxford 1982, is omitted from McDonald's bibliography.)

McDonald judges, rightly, that Nightingale's faith was the foundation of all her work, both theoretical and practical, and so places her main writings on spirituality in early volumes, ii and iii. (Volume i contains selections concerning her family.) Nightingale received a 'call' to enter nursing at the age of sixteen, a call which caused her to forswear marriage and struggle against her family's wishes, before finally taking up her profession at the age of thirty-one. She continued her campaigns despite being confined to bed for many years with a disease about which there has been much speculation, but which McDonald suggests was brucellosis, contracted in the Crimea. Despite these heroic efforts, Nightingale doubted throughout her life whether she had adequately answered her call. This is apparent from her personal notes and journals, like the 1877 diary (vol. ii), which makes painful reading.

Nightingale studied her Bible intensely, bringing her own incisive intellect, her classical education and her extensive spiritual reading to bear on many passages. This is shown by the annotations to the Bible which she used throughout her adult life, which occupy 230 pages of volume ii. These indicate her complete reliance on her own interpretations, even when they led to an unorthodox conclusion. For example, she rejected belief in miracles and interpreted the Resurrection story as an allegory (ii. 251–2). In a note to Jowett, she comments that 'it is such a poor tale, so evidently put together afterwards' and that it provided no promise of immortality (iii. 189). Yet she believed in an afterlife, as a moving selection of her condolence letters (iii. 194–213) clearly shows.

Nightingale's relationship with Benjamin Jowett generated and sustained a great deal of her religious writing. They were friends and regular correspondents for more than thirty years and shared many concerns and obsessions. Lynn McDonald has, indeed, found it hard to distinguish the original author of some of the large number of notes and drafts which regularly passed between them. These are reproduced in volume iii and do, as she suggests, contain 'new and fresh material' (p. 572). Although Jowett greatly esteemed Nightingale and may even have proposed marriage, it is unlikely that he used any of her suggested sermons (volume ii), containing such statements as 'it is probable that the virgin never lived at all' and that Abraham, Isaac and Jacob were 'a parcel of three rascals' (p. 327). On the whole, Nightingale's essays and 'sermons' are disappointingly tortuous in style and

focus ‘relentlessly’, as McDonald comments, on very limited themes: ‘the perfection of God, God’s thoughts/laws and the human role as active co-workers’ (p. 570). It is not surprising that they found few publishers or preachers. Her letters and working notes, for example on the production, with Jowett, of a ‘Children’s Bible’ (volume iii), are often more illuminating and attractive.

In early adulthood Nightingale was attracted by Roman Catholicism, particularly because of the work it offered for women in sisterhoods. Her correspondence with Henry Manning, which ended after a quarrel over his treatment of the Sisters of Mercy, is reproduced in volume iii (pp. 242–75). She found herself unable to accept central Catholic doctrines like papal infallibility. In adulthood, Nightingale stopped attending church completely, although she regularly received the sacrament at home from Jowett.

The editing of these volumes is exemplary. Every reference has been followed up, including the identification of minor *dramatis personae*. Important personalities are accorded short biographies. On every page there are biblical allusions, which are faithfully identified. Each thematic section has an introductory essay and these are amplified by a full outline of Nightingale’s life and thought in volume i. This project makes a major contribution to scholarship which will be of permanent value.

Readers may follow further progress for themselves on the publishers’ website, [www.wlupress.wlu.ca](http://www.wlupress.wlu.ca). The website for the collected works is [www.sociology.uoguelph.ca/fnightingale](http://www.sociology.uoguelph.ca/fnightingale).

UNIVERSITY OF SHEFFIELD

HELEN MATHERS

*Les Maasai et le christianisme. Le temps du grand refus.* By V. Neckebrouck. (Annuua Nuntia Lovaniensia, 41.) Pp. ix + 108. Leuven–Paris–Sterling, VA: Peeters, 2002. €20 (paper). 90 429 2083 6

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690426078X

The Maasai in Kenya have until recently, according to Neckebrouck, resisted Christian evangelisation efforts, with few converts as compared to the time and energy expended by various missionary groups. How, he asks, can we account for their enduring refusal to become Christians? In this book, he briefly surveys and rejects a range of explanations proposed by historians, anthropologists, missionaries and others. These include their nomadic lifestyle, wealth, enforced spatial and social isolation during the colonial period, military strength, innate mentality, ecological habitat, social relations between junior and elder men, their morality and their religion. These arguments, according to Neckebrouck, are either too singular, simplistic, essentialist or tautological or are undermined by their own or comparative evidence. Instead, he proposes that the key to Maasai conservatism lies in the socialisation and enculturation of young boys to be the fierce, independent, self-reliant men necessary to endure and overcome the challenges of maintaining the pastoral way of life. Although he cautions against an overly mechanistic application of this argument, he believes that, by combining aspects of the other explanations, it offers a more complex and enlightening rationale. Perhaps. But Neckebrouck himself is guilty of some of the errors he attributes to others. Despite his pleas to consider social differences among Maasai, he refers throughout to ‘the Maasai’ as some kind of homogeneous, ahistorical, collective being. He does note the

significance of the distinct ideals and practices of the *ilmurran* (junior men, often glossed as ‘warriors’) and the *ilpayiani* (elder men), but even these social categories are generalised. Moreover, as with much Maasai scholarship, the experience of Maasai men is taken as the norm for all Maasai. But how do Maasai women fit into explanations that draw on the male age-set system, the socialisation of boys, the ferocity of warriors and the authority of male elders to explain Maasai ‘culture’? This is not merely a critique of an outdated, androcentric mode of analysis, but a challenge to the very premise of this book, since large numbers of Maasai women in Kenya and Tanzania have been attracted to the Christian Churches. This fact complicates rather than undermines Neckebrouck’s thesis since, as he notes, few Maasai men convert. It does, however, highlight the importance of making gender a central category for any analysis of the encounter between Maasai and Christianity.

RUTGERS UNIVERSITY

DOROTHY L. HODGSON

*History of New Testament research, II: From Jonathan Edwards to Rudolf Bultmann.* By William Baird. Pp. xxi + 565. Minneapolis, MN: Augsburg Fortress, 2003(2). \$40.00 8006 2627 3

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904270786

The second volume of William Baird’s *History of New Testament research* covers 1870 through 1940, a formative period during which a moderate form of historical criticism won acceptance, though not without resistance, in most Protestant denominations. The reference in the subtitle to Jonathan Edwards, who was not a biblical scholar and who lived in the wrong century (1703–58), is due simply to the fact that he is mentioned at the start of the chapter on nineteenth-century New Testament research in America – on which there is precious little to report in any case. Rudolf Bultmann is not the natural terminus at the other end of period, either – his *History of the synoptic tradition* of 1921 figures half way through this volume but evaluation of his classic, *New Testament theology* of 1948 is reserved for the promised third volume. Presumably Bultmann was given the privilege of a special mention because he outlived most other scholars under discussion: he died in 1976, at the age of ninety-four.

The delineation of historical periods is a tricky business, even for a professional historian. For an exegete like Baird, the problem of organising his material has obviously been a major headache. In the end, he has decided on a compromise between a basically chronological arrangement and various other factors, political, geographical, biographical and thematic. Thus, the book is divided into two parts, ‘the era of expanding empire’ and ‘the era of global conflict’ – but most New Testament research has been entirely oblivious to the political turmoils of its day. North America gets a separate chapter in both halves; and in the second the work of some great scholars like Moffatt (a Scot, admittedly) Bacon and Goodspeed is deservedly recalled. It is a pity that James Hardy Ropes (1866–1933) is passed over, for he was a creative and original thinker, despite his modest output. Once an author is introduced, Baird’s normal practice is to provide a short biography and then summarise all his major books even if this distorts the chronological sequence. The thematic divisions are sometimes appropriate – nineteenth-century German ‘liberalism’ and subsequent ‘skepticism’, for example – but sometimes they are unclear



and unnatural, such as ‘methodological developments’ hardly distinguishable from ‘the refining of historical criticism’ and they disrupt the underlying chronology. It is, of course, easier to criticise the weakness of the resulting presentation, than to suggest a better way of doing it.

Most readers, no doubt, will consult this book for the summaries it contains of the different views of scholars from the past whose works are hard to find and written in German, sometimes in Gothic script. But this is where the survey is something of a disappointment. While accurate and readable, the summaries include points where a particular author was simply following a general trend, along with others which were genuinely innovatory: the non-specialist would have been grateful for more help in sifting the wheat from the chaff. Furthermore, Baird hardly ever offers his own assessment or critique of the material he presents: the only exception is where he detects antisemitism – Bousset, Schürer (treated in the twentieth-century section) and Billerbeck are duly taken to task.

While the scale and comprehensiveness of this history of New Testament research is impressive, the question arises whether it will fully replace the earlier standard work on the subject, W. G. Kümmel’s *The New Testament: the history of the investigation of its problems* (1970; English trans. London 1973); though written from an almost exclusively German perspective, it includes long excerpts from the most important books and articles which manage better than Baird to convey the flavour and style of the main intellectual debates within the discipline. Simply for reference purposes, the two-volume *Dictionary of biblical interpretation*, ed. J. H. Hayes, Nashville 1999, is easier to access and more judiciously critical.

The bibliography runs to fifty-eight pages, arranged according to topics and key personalities: it could prove to be the most valuable part of the book.

MANSFIELD COLLEGE,  
OXFORD

JOHN MUDDIMAN

*Taking up serpents. Snake handlers of eastern Kentucky.* By David L. Kimbrough. Pp. xvi + 232 incl. 53 ills. Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 2002. \$19 (paper).  
o 86554 798 X

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904280782

Independent scholar David Kimbrough’s examination of Appalachian snake-handling Pentecostals – one of a handful of sympathetic studies that have appeared in the last decade – was originally published in 1995 by the University of North Carolina Press and has now been reprinted, unchanged from its original form. Using an ethnographic approach that relies heavily on field research, personal interviews and newspaper accounts, Kimbrough focuses on the activities of George Went Hensley – considered by scholars the founder of the snake-handling movement – and the Saylor family of eastern Kentucky. While the book consists largely of descriptive anecdote, Kimbrough offers some analysis as well. He notes doctrinal differences within the movement, emphasises the centrality of the ideas of ‘anointment’ and biblical ‘signs’ to its system of belief and practice, traces its roots to the trans-Appalachian revivals and camp meetings of the early nineteenth century and attributes its emergence to the proletarianisation of poorer Appalachians under the impact of industrial capitalism and its genteel Home Mission supporters in the

late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The focus on the Saylor allows an impressively detailed look at the experience of Holiness and snake-handling in a social context that shifts from subsistence farming in the early to mid-nineteenth century, to coal mining in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, to Midwestern industrial centres in the mid- to late twentieth century. Yet the detail, which includes snakebite victims' sometimes gruesome symptoms and times of death, is in many cases gratuitous. More important, the book's oral history approach, concentration on one family and interpretive perspective impose unfortunate limits on the reach of its analysis. The focus on the Saylor leaves one wondering whether snake-handling attracted others than poor native-born whites, particularly as it grew in the increasingly multiracial and multiethnic northern urban cities of the early twentieth century; the economic explanation for snake-handling tends toward a reductionism that religion scholars have sought to avoid in recent years; and the emphasis on oral accounts and ethnographic detail inhibits the development of a strong analytical framework and the kind of sustained historiographic engagement with existing scholarship that many scholars might expect. Still, Kimbrough's is a well-researched study; its abundant detail will prove useful to scholars and fascinating to readers.

CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY,  
STANISLAUS

BRET E. CARROLL

*The Christian communities of Jerusalem and the Holy Land. Studies in History, religion and politics.* By Anthony O'Mahony. Pp. viii + 210. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2003. £40. 0 7083 1772 3  
JEH (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904290789

Six contributors, with the editor responsible for historical overview and the chapter (iv) on 'the Latins', offer detailed studies of six Christian (mainly focused on two recent centuries) 'presences', Greek, Armenian, Roman Catholic, Coptic, Ethiopian and Anglican in Jerusalem and the Holy Land, with detailed discussion of the controlling role of the first three in the sacred sites of the Holy City. The significance of the Russian 'dimension' might have received more than incidental treatment, given the twin chapters available to the Anglicans thanks to an interest in their missionary women. For the most part there is a careful sifting of sources, copiously annotated so that – if at times the book reads rather tediously – it provides and garners material not otherwise accessible. The complexity of inter-communal relations during the Ottoman period and the years of the British Mandate is sadly familiar enough, typified in the tensions around the Holy Sepulchre, territorially told inside it. The editor's two contributions bring out more basic, if less readily noted, aspects of faiths at issue in politics, namely the leading role that Christian Arabs had in the late nineteenth, early twentieth-century renewal of Arabism, its language and political will, emerging from within a retreating Ottomanism, to fructify in 'the Arab Revolt' and undergo the frustrations that followed. To that experience his second emphasis relates, namely the steady attrition of a Christian element inside the Palestinian shape of that Arabism – an attrition resulting from the steady, seemingly inexorable Judaisation of Jerusalem and 'the land' – resolving 'the holy places' into 'antiquities' deprived of the living presence (*qua* faith and fealty) from which alone

they draw their relevance. It is this ‘acquaintance with grief’ – which truly read meets all three major faiths, Judaic, Christian and Muslim, in the entail of political Zionism – that makes it the more sad that the present, able group of papers has no plea for the grief they are for each other in and because of the very place where each most urgently belongs. But that, plainly, was not their assignment.

OXFORD

KENNETH CRAGG

*Österreich und der heilige Stuhl im 19. und 20. Jahrhundert.* Edited by Hans Paarhammer and Alfred Rinnerthaler. (Veröffentlichungen des internationalen Forschungszentrums für Grundlagenforschungen der Wissenschaften Salzburg, New Ser., 78.) Pp. 600. Frankfurt-am-Main: Peter Lang, 2001. £50. 3 631 37591 3  
*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904300783

*Österreich und der heilige Stuhl im 19. und 20. Jahrhundert* collects papers presented at a conference in Salzburg in 2000. The remarkably short time between the presentation of the papers and the publication of the book is a clear sign of the interest in relations between the Vatican and Austria in the modern period. Unfortunately, some of the contributions to this volume have suffered because of the quick publishing schedule; they read like undigested papers which need an editorial and perhaps theoretical reworking. The introduction to the volume, for example, seems to be a verbatim rendering of opening remarks given at the conference. Surely the editors could have prepared a scholarly introduction for the publication of these essays? Similarly, there is no formal conclusion to the collection. No attempt is made, therefore, to link the individual contributions theoretically at either the beginning or the end of the book. True, the separate pieces have one overarching theme – the political, religious, social and cultural relationship between the Vatican and Austria – but this is a large topic and one would welcome more of a guide through the essays, which vary greatly in research base, presentation style and length.

The lack of framing arguments and conclusions does not mean, however, that this volume does not have its own merits. There are some excellent pieces by leading scholars. For example, Rupert Klieber’s study of Austrian monetary and moral support for the papacy – Peter’s pence, Catholic clubs – is an interesting and largely successful attempt to link the economics of local and regional organisations to large political questions. Klieber is able to show regional differences within Austria and changes over time in support for the pope. Further, he shows how collecting money, signing petitions and club activities led to a more politically-aware Catholic *milieu* in Austria. This *milieu* defined itself not only in terms of these activities, but increasingly in the second half of the nineteenth century in opposition to anti-Catholic movements.

Franz Ortner analyses ecclesiastical appointments in the Salzburg province in the nineteenth century. Throughout its history, Salzburg had many bishoprics under its administration. Thus, whoever was in control there was by definition an important figure in the Austrian Catholic Church and usually a central character in all discussions between Rome and the Habsburg lands. Ortner gives us a strong, traditional story of Church–State politics and the struggles to control the religious agenda in Austria from the top down, namely by appointing bishops and

archbishops politically friendly to the state. Ortner concludes that the Austrian government throughout the nineteenth century operated in a late Josephinist framework which viewed high-ranking churchmen first and foremost as 'servants of the state and its interests'. This is not a surprising conclusion and it is line with most current research on the nineteenth-century Austrian Catholic Church.

Perhaps the strongest contribution to the volume is Alfred Rinnerthaler's discussion of 'Der Fall Wahrmond'. Rinnerthaler, one of the general editors of the volume, focuses on the career of Ludwig Wahrmond, a Vienna-born professor, who became embroiled in early twentieth-century debates about modernism, modernity and the Catholic Church. One of the virtues of this piece is that the author is careful to place the controversial figure in intellectual, personal and political contexts and to show how religious disputes can be examined simultaneously on multiple levels. In many ways, Rinnerthaler's essay could serve as a model for scholars approaching such topics.

There are also several interesting contributions on various cultural contexts within the Rome–Austria relationship. Rudolf Zinnhobler discusses liturgical reform and the Second Vatican Council, for example. Richard Potz and Brigitte Schinkele do a fine job of analysing Church–State issues through the prism of marriage law and practices in the 1950s. The volume also contains some strong treatments of more institutional aspects of Church–State relations. Wilhelm Rees looks at the position of theological faculties in their relationship to both the State and Church. He outlines the political and practical points of tension between the two in shaping important educational institutions in Austria. Johann Hirnsperger examines the institutional position of cathedral chapters over a substantial period of time and finds that under various legal arrangements in Austria the chapters remained influential in diocesan affairs.

On the other hand, the essays on papal representatives in Vienna and Austria's diplomats in Rome are primarily lists of the men who operated in these respective capacities. We are introduced to the individuals who shaped Church–State relations and policies and told something about their styles and views, but these essays need more analysis and a more comprehensive presentation of the issues which confronted diplomatic representatives on both sides of the aisle.

Moreover, some of the pieces, regardless of their merits, focus on rather small aspects of the Church–State relationship in Austria. Thus, Franz-Heinz Hye's contribution on the Canisianum in Innsbruck is a fine piece of local history (and of interest to those of us who have lived in the residence), but a more formal and wider treatment of the issues involved in the creation of new religious houses in the twentieth century would be welcome.

Although *Österreich und der heilige Stuhl im 19. und 20. Jahrhundert* is in many respects a mixed bag of scholarly approaches and results, it should be of interest to scholars of modern Austria and Catholicism more generally. It will appeal particularly to those interested in the political dimensions of what was often a difficult relationship between the papacy and one of the leading states in Europe. There is, however, still plenty of scholarly room for collections of essays and monographs which focus as much on the relationship of religion and society as they do on Church–State relations in Austria. The best pieces in this volume do both.

GETTYSBURG COLLEGE

WILLIAM D. BOWMAN

*Fortress Church. The English Roman Catholic bishops and politics, 1903–63.* By Kester Aspden. Pp. x + 353 incl. 8 ills. Leominster: Gracewing, 2002. £20 (paper).  
 o 85244 203 3  
*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S002204690431078X

Kester Aspden's innovative study of the political attitudes and involvement of the Roman Catholic bishops of England and Wales from 1903 to the Second Vatican Council of the 1960s is an important contribution to the historiography of 'the Fortress Church'. In particular, it provides new insights into the influence of the Catholic hierarchy in public life. His subjects, with their clerical formation and their predominantly bureaucratic concerns, do not make an obviously attractive group and are lacklustre in comparison to at least some of their Victorian predecessors; there is no Manning here. Worthy but dull, the occasional scholar like David Mathew apart, they were dedicated and hard-working pastors rather than inspirational or prophetic voices. Aspden points out their shared characteristics and their sometimes surprising diversity. The issues they faced in the early twentieth century were crucial ones and in some matters, notably on Irish affairs, the rise of fascism in Catholic Europe and on the education question, their voice was important and not always predictable. Aspden's book is important in at least three ways. First, while not ignoring his obvious lack of leadership qualities, he to some degree rehabilitates the reputation of Cardinal Francis Bourne, the longest-serving and quietest of the archbishops of Westminster. Secondly, and more important, he shifts the centre of attention from London to the provinces and reveals some exceptional figures like Archbishops Downey and Keating of Liverpool and Casartelli of Salford whose ideas had a strong local impact. Paternalism and a lack of trust shown towards lay opinion may have been the order of the day but a thoughtful engagement in wider issues was characteristic of this group of largely forgotten men. Thirdly, the author makes wider use of the increasingly available Catholic archives, especially of the dioceses, and is skilled in using such material. There are some strange slips. Bishop Joseph Rudderham of Clifton (p. 299n) is said not to have taken a degree at Cambridge; a cursory reading of the university's *Annual Register* suggests that he proceeded to the degrees of BA (1922) and MA (1927) in the usual way.

DOWNSIDE ABBEY

DOM AIDAN BELLENGER

*The correspondence of Roland H. Bainton and Delio Cantimori, 1932–1966. An enduring transatlantic friendship between two historians of religious toleration. With an appendix of documents.* Edited by John Tedeschi. (Studi e Testi per la Storia della Tolleranza in Europa nei secoli XVI–XVIII, 6.) Pp. xii + 313. Florence: Olschki, 2002. €29 (paper). 88 222 5119 9

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904320786

This handsome volume contains all the known surviving correspondence between two of the most distinguished religious historians of the twentieth century, Roland Bainton (1894–1994) and Delio Cantimori (1904–66), whose studies of the Italian Reformers, the Radical Reformation and the great themes of religious liberty and toleration remain standard works and, in some instances, have become classics. The letters have been critically edited by John Tedeschi, a scholar and librarian at the University of Wisconsin, Madison, and supplemented by him with notes rich in

bibliographical and historical detail and with a substantial introduction that narrates the life, times and scholarly pursuits of the subjects of the book. An index and register of the correspondence greatly facilitates the use of the volume. Bainton and Cantimori met only once and briefly almost two decades after they began to correspond. Their correspondence was founded and sustained on their scholarly interests, and the letters provide a continuing record of projects planned or completed, together with queries and comments on their own writings and of those by others related to them. All in all, then, these letters record an important phase of ecclesiastical history during the fateful middle decades of the last century and document the travail of scholars who persisted in their endeavours and maintained international associations in spite of world political obstacles that were put in their way. An appendix to this collection includes correspondence between Paul Oskar Kristeller, the eminent historian of Renaissance philosophy, and Bainton and Cantimori who assisted him successfully to find refuge and an academic position in the United States.

MIDDLEBURY COLLEGE

VICTOR NUOVO

*Eesti Evangeeliumi Luteriusu Kirik ja Nõukogude Riik, 1944–1949*. By Riho Altnurme. Pp. 322 incl. 23 ills. Tartu: Tartu University Press, 2001. €6.50. 9985 56 559 2  
*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904330782

The Soviet period has been under intense scrutiny in Estonia since the collapse of Communism. Originally a doctoral dissertation in church history at the University of Tartu, *The Estonian Evangelical Lutheran Church and the Soviet state, 1944–1949* by Riho Altnurme is a ground-breaking achievement. Altnurme is the first to analyse Church–State relations in Soviet Estonia in detail on the basis of archival documents. He examines on the one hand the Lutheran Church’s independence of and on the other hand its subordination to the Soviet state.

Soviet power was established in Estonia in the autumn of 1944. The bishop of the Estonian Lutheran Church, Johan Kõpp, and a large section of the clergy had fled to Sweden and Germany. The state soon took control of the local churches through the Estonian representative of the Moscow-based Council for the Affairs of Religious Cults. Altnurme’s work draws heavily on the archives of the Estonian representative, Mr Johannes Kivi. His other sources include Communist party and security ministry archives in Estonia and Russia and the archives of the Lutheran consistory in Tallinn.

Three different stages can be seen in the development of Church–State relations in Estonia. Until 1947 the Lutheran Church faced no worse restrictions than other Estonian institutions. Even occasional protests by the church leadership against the authorities were tolerated. Although the Council for the Affairs of Religious Cults was in general hostile to Lutheran Churches because of their alleged collaboration with the Germans during the war, the new leadership of the Estonian Lutheran Church was considered politically loyal from the beginning.

By 1947 the authorities had begun to regard the Church as too influential a factor in society and only pretending to be loyal to the state. Most church property was confiscated and the authorities purged the consistory of members perceived as disloyal to the system, replacing them with persons regarded as unlikely to cause trouble. Many of the new members also acted as informers for the security organs. A

wave of arrests among the clergy commenced. Altogether twenty-two clergy were arrested in 1944–9. The security organs also initiated an operation to assimilate the influential lay movement of the Moravian Brethren into the Lutheran Church.

After the mass deportations in March 1949, the Church lost its last vestiges of independence. Confirmation classes were prohibited. The authorities replaced August Pähn, who from 1945 had been the acting bishop, by Jaan Kiivit, a pastor who was raised to this position because of his ‘patriotic work’. Whereas Pähn had merely dissimulated allegiance to the system, only waiting for it to collapse, Kiivit was apparently convinced of the permanence of Soviet power and acted accordingly. In October 1949 he received the title of archbishop. This was an invention of the state authorities who were thus striving to enhance the independence of the Estonian Lutheran Church from its legitimate leadership in exile.

UNIVERSITY OF HELSINKI

MIKKO KETOLA

*Religion and the cold war*. Edited by Dianne Kirby. (Cold War History.) Pp. xiii + 245.

Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003. £45. 0 333 99398 5

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904340789

*Religion and the cold war* is in Palgrave Macmillan’s *Cold War History Series*. Although this venture reflects the emergence of cold war studies as a specialism with an ever-lengthening bibliography, this volume can also be seen as significant of another emerging trend in the writing of contemporary history. This investigates the involvement of religion, and in particular Christianity – the religion in question in this book – in the wider political world. As organiser of what Bruce Kent describes in the foreword as the ‘ground breaking conference’ from which this book came, and herself a prolific author on the relationship between the Church of England and the British state in the 1940s and 50s, Dianne Kirby is in the vanguard of this movement. Unlike the disparate contents of some collected works, the twelve chapters which follow Kirby’s introduction are, almost without exception, clear and focused. Among other reasons, this is achieved by concentrating predominantly on the 1940s and 50s. Naturally the Vatican and Washington receive substantial attention, between them being the subjects of five substantive chapters concentrating on high politics. The other five chapters dealing with western countries are more disparate in both their approach and topics. Of these, in a departure from the usual emphasis on elite transactions, Ian Jones studies the impact of the conflict at local level in England and Paul Hainsworth examines transactions at both elite and grassroots levels in the complex relationships between Communist and Catholic in France. The piece by George Egerton dealing with religious aspects of the debate on human rights in Canada also points to their role in cold war discourse. Tony Shaw provides an entertaining investigation of religious themes in popular film on both sides of the iron curtain. Perhaps more attention to the eastern side of the conflict might have been desirable, although the collection does include two chapters which deal with Soviet foreign policy and Church–State relations in the 1940s, and the evolution of the historiographical profile of Martin Luther and Thomas Müntzer in the German Democratic Republic. Matthew Hockenos’s study of German Protestantism’s struggle to come to terms with its response to Nazism, whilst good in itself, is one of the few points where the collection is not in such close touch with its central

theme. A slim volume like this is constrained in what it can achieve, but it manages to do a lot. Most especially, it achieves its aim of showing that the relations between religious and political institutions should not be reductively explained in terms of the simple instrumental use of the former by the latter. Finally, *Religion and the cold war* will be appreciated not only for its substance, but for suggesting opportunities for further work in this fascinating, but under-researched field.

UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW

PHILIP M. COUPLAND

*The transformation of American religion. The story of a late twentieth-century awakening.* By Amanda Porterfield. Pp. x + 262. New York–Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001. £18. 0 19 513137 1

*Saint Thomas Church Fifth Avenue.* By Robert J. Wright. Pp. xiv + 314 incl. 53 black-and-white ills and 4 colour plates. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans/New York: Saint Thomas Church Fifth Avenue, 2001. £40.99 (\$65). 0 8028 3912 6

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904350785

In her study of twentieth-century religious trends, Amanda Porterfield maintains that the growth of a relativistic understanding of religion, the elevation of personal spiritual experience over institutional loyalties and the pragmatic emphasis on religion's therapeutic qualities can be understood as part of a religious awakening, rather than as a sign of secularisation. Intellectually rooted in the Puritan heritage, these tendencies indicate 'the endurance of certain Protestant attitudes, ideas, and principles' despite the decline of Protestant institutional authority (pp. 5–6).

Porterfield traces the efficacy of these mental habits in managing the transition to a post-Protestant setting in six chapters, which are designed as case studies, rather than as a comprehensive overview. Chapter i fleshes out her argument in a discussion of the missionary impulse in Protestantism. She maintains that missionary activism, despite being dominated in the post-World War II era by conservative groups, encouraged a spirit of world engagement and social reform. Liberal Protestantism's missionary impulse laid the intellectual foundations for liberation theology, the spirit of ecumenism and cultural relativism as a renewal of the faith. Chapter ii describes how Catholicism flourished within a culture shaped by Protestant thought. Catholic ecumenism succeeded in incorporating religious practices from outside the Judeo-Christian tradition, marking both the decline of Protestant hegemony and the survival of its intellectual legacy.

Chapter iii deals more specifically with the impact of the political and cultural upheavals of the 1960s and the Vietnam War. The disenchantment with government and institutional authority caused many Americans to resort to a prophetic understanding of religion, which, in conjunction with the cult of personality nurtured in the 1950s and the ethical impulses of the insurgent movements of the 1960s, encouraged a renewed emphasis on inner spirituality. This found expression in post-modern composite religions which drew upon both traditional Protestant sentiments and a counter-cultural identification with non-Judeo-Christian traditions.

Porterfield expands upon this in chapter iv in a discussion of the impact of Buddhism. She concludes that Buddhism's 'emphasis on individual experience as



the doorway to cosmic consciousness ... worked to confirm and further advance this emphasis on individual experience as the matrix of religious life, which had been developed in Anglo-Protestant thought' (p. 131). The focus on subjectivity, paired with the desire to overcome it, found its most powerful intellectual expression in poststructuralism, which is further explored in chapter v in an exploration of gender consciousness and body awareness. Analysing the role of religion in the social construction of gender norms had a liberating effect which fed into the spiritual revival of the post-60s era, Porterfield suggests. Deconstruction and gender analysis humanised religion and introduced a new emphasis on the body, which can none the less be traced back to Puritan roots.

In the final chapter, Porterfield maintains that the American constitutional order and the academic study of religion promoted a tolerant climate of opinion which emphasised individual religious experience over institutional authority, and conceptualised religion as a universal human phenomenon. This particular trajectory was again deeply influenced by Protestant traditions, and she concludes that the late twentieth-century revival is 'an awakening to the social and psychological construction of religion as much as an awakening of religious feeling' (p. 230).

The book is richly textured, well-informed and discusses a wide variety of religious, sociological and anthropological concepts in accessible prose. Porterfield's arguments are lucid and cogent. Keenly aware of the ambiguities involved in the personalisation of faith in the twentieth century, she maintains that attributing normative status to individual spiritual experience subordinated other religious expressions to personal proclivities and thus 'carried a predatory dimension as self-serving as any missionary endeavour' (p. 226).

However, the book largely neglects the resurgence of evangelical and fundamentalist Protestantism, which combines spiritual subjectivity with moral and theological orthodoxy and thus question Porterfield's contention that the awareness of the social construction of religion is part of the awakening. One might also question the usefulness of the theme of revivalism for understanding American culture, since there is hardly a time period which has not been claimed as showing definite signs of an awakening. Moreover, one might ask whether the mental outlook Porterfield describes is really rooted in Protestant concepts, or whether it derives from more secular impulses of both the Enlightenment and Romanticism. However, one particular typographical error in the book has Porterfield borrowing William James's 'smile,' rather than his 'simile,' which might reveal a deeper truth after all.

J. Robert Wright's history of New York's Saint Thomas Church indicates that the intellectual and cultural changes described by Porterfield had little impact on this particular pillar of Episcopalian respectability. Although some debates about women's roles, ecumenism and liturgical texts crop up, the story of the church is marked by an unwavering adherence to High Church tradition, Anglo-Catholicism and liturgical conservatism. The book itself, while diligently researched and well illustrated, is written in the tradition of church chronicles and is thus of little interest to a wider audience. The author also focuses on the clergy, rather than on a 'bottom-up' approach – which in any case would have been a top-down one, considering that most of the parishioners hailed from the upper crust of New York society.

The text mainly describes the rectors and their involvement in ministering, setting up committees, organising church finances, building new structures and promoting charities. The book is interspersed with comments on general historical developments, but these are ancillary and there is little sense of the relationship between the church and the larger socio-economic and intellectual transformations of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Except for fleeting references to the problem of the continuous growth of the city and the mobility of the parishioners, there is little sustained discussion of the church in relationship to the neighbourhood or its role in facilitating the interaction between commercial and political elites in the city. None the less, those who are interested in the architectural and institutional history of a leading New York church, a ministry directed at the socially privileged and the persistence of a High Church legacy under the anti-institutional tendencies described by Porterfield, will find this book a rich resource.

UNIVERSITY OF KEELE

AXEL R. SCHÄFER

*Europe. The exceptional case. Parameters of faith in the modern world.* By Grace Davie. (Sarum Theological Lectures.) Pp. xii + 180 incl. 4 tables. London: Darton, Longman and Todd, 2002. £10.95 (paper). 0 232 52425 4

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904360781

Grace Davie is an experienced sociologist of religion writing within a Christian tradition, and she knows well enough that the crisis of the Churches in Europe demonstrates beyond doubt the invalidity of the old theory of American exceptionalism. This had dominated studies of secularisation for decades, positing that secularisation everywhere was inevitable, gradual and inexorable, but the apparent buoyancy of churchgoing and patriotic religiosity in the USA could be explained by the underlying theological and spiritual vacuity of the world's most secular society. As she most clearly shows, this was wrong – Europe is the exceptional case. In western Europe especially (but including Canada and one might argue Australasia), the extent of deChristianisation is the most advanced in the world, whilst the religious culture of the USA mirrors, rather than contrasts, that of pentecostal-led Central and South America, and Africa. Europe becomes exceptional not just within Christendom, but within world religions. It is the world's first secular continent. Davie's scheme is to devote a chapter to Christianity in each continent – Europe, the US, Latin America, Africa and 'the Far East'. For each, she uses a sociological rather than historical method, surveying the statistics and then sociologists' analyses of religion in community. Evaluating American Rational Choice Theory as useful in America but less useful in Europe (where secularisation theory has dominated in the past), she shows the lack of international comparability in scholarly comprehension of religious change. She draws from Latin American Pentecostal growth lessons for European Christians, and agrees with David Martin that Europe may now be ripe for a surge of New World-style voluntary denominationalism. Africa is now a religion-exporting rather than religion-importing continent, and its Christian development is important in democratisation at home and re-evangelising abroad (including in Europe, where African and Caribbean churches constitute almost the only growing Christian community). Concluding with case studies of the Philippines and South Korea (which Christianised very late in the

twentieth century), we in Europe are reminded of the vigour and volatility of religion. Davie's reportage of religious diversity in the world is wholly convincing. Her explanations less so. She adopts a very traditional social-context approach to explain religious change (using economy, demography and health crises), arguing for the analytical possibilities of 'multiple modernities' theory to explain cultural divergence between Europe and elsewhere. This essentially Enlightenment model of religion bypasses recent postmodernist theories in religious studies and cultural history for re-conceptualising religion and religious change. As she says, 'it is as modern to draw from the resources of religion in order to critique the secular as it is to draw from the secular in order to critique the religious' (p. 161). This is an Enlightenment circularity with no way out.

UNIVERSITY OF STRATHCLYDE

CALLUM G. BROWN

*Religion, nationalism, and civil society in eastern Europe. The postcommunist palimpsest.* By

Ina Merdjanova. (Studies in Religion and Society, 58.) Pp. xix + 172.

Lewiston–Queenston–Lampeter: Edwin Mellen Press, 2002. £64.95 (\$99.95).

0 7734 6949 4; 0 88946 863 X

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904370788

Well into the second decade after the collapse of communism a generation of sociologists of religion is beginning to emerge in Eastern Europe. The work of their predecessors was tainted, either by censorship of what they wrote or – more seriously – by political control of the basic research itself. Ina Merdjanova is one of the best-read of the new school and her emergence in Bulgaria is particularly welcome, her country being far from the academic mainstream of a fast-developing Europe. By any standards, her bibliography is impressive, amounting as it does to over 200 titles (pp. 153–66). Accordingly, the scope of this book is immense, despite its modest length. The title is original and clever, a 'palimpsest' being new writing superimposed on old in a manuscript. This means, in Merdjanova's words: 'the communist past still has bearing on the shaping and defining the present, and traces of it often reappear in most sudden and unexpected ways and places'. This is a fascinating topic, though perhaps one wishes that the author might have drawn on her personal experiences of this a little more, while relying to a lesser extent on the observations of predominantly western sociologists of religion whom she so abundantly quotes. The author divides her text into three long essays. The first, 'Religion in postcommunist society', contains a useful survey of the complexity of religion in the former communist bloc, concentrating principally on the new religious movements, mainly imported from abroad, which have made considerable incursions into these countries. Here she states: 'The guarantee of equal rights to all of them is a *sine qua non* for the processes of democratisation in postcommunist society.' The Soviet government, with its restrictive legislation, would strongly disagree, while inevitably progress – the painful steps towards democratic freedom – dictates that, short of the reimposition of dictatorship, Merdjanova's view will eventually predominate. Further, those Churches which collaborated most closely with the old regimes have found it difficult to adapt to new circumstances, while the new religions which have appeared are not so tainted. The challenge which the latter present is positive and demands serious thought and planning by the traditional

Churches to counteract it (p. 49). In her own country of Bulgaria, she finds that many people are innately opposed to the development of democracy, in that they 'are not ready to accept the legitimisation of alternative religious formations to coexist peacefully with them' (p. 55). Merdjanova is well placed to become a significant voice for the development of true freedom of religion in her area of study.

KESTON INSTITUTE,  
OXFORD

MICHAEL BOURDEAUX

*Religious liberty and human rights*. Edited by Mark Hill. Pp. xx + 224. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2002. £35. 0 7083 1758 8

*JEH* (55) 2004; DOI: 10.1017/S0022046904380784

This essay collection will itself, in time, form part of England's ecclesiastical history. It reflects the early expectations of those concerned with the law affecting religious bodies, principally the Church of England, as to the likely effect of the Human Rights Act 1998 upon this field of law. It grew out of an Ecclesiastical Law Society conference with the same title, held six months after the act took effect, with additional contributions written in immediately succeeding months. As English jurisprudence on other aspects of the act has multiplied, early expectations have often been modified, and the same may prove true in the religious field; but this book will stand as a record of some earliest hopes and fears.

One feature characterises the work as a whole. Its concern is with *collective* freedom of religion, rather than that of the individual. The voice of those who would defend isolated dissidents from hierarchical tyranny, invoking neutral public authority to see fair play, will not be heard in its pages – save, significantly, in Lord Justice Sedley's foreword. The evangelical Protestant and Roman Catholic backgrounds of the principal lawyer contributors makes this understandable; it is from liberal Christianity that another approach may be expected.

Surveys of past trends at the European Court of Human Rights, and of the interpretation of the American Constitution's First Amendment, are complemented by scholarly reflection on whether religious bodies can be 'public authorities' within the 1998 act's provisions. This review finds an appeal court decision considered by a contributor still awaiting House of Lords resolution. Another chapter focuses more narrowly on issues of ecclesiastical employment and religious involvement in public education. A suggestion runs throughout that the 1998 act and early domestic decisions may not in fact be doing justice to the importance ascribed elsewhere to ecclesiastical autonomy. Unsurprising, one may consider, in a legal system whose religious provisions were so long rooted in the assertion that England is fully competent to make up its own mind in the spiritual sphere without outside aid.

Flanking these more overtly legal pieces, two theologians sketch the history of Christian thought on 'natural rights', and the case against individualism comes out strongly. Finally a distinguished exponent of the theology to be found in canonical norms seeks to draw human rights conclusions from his comparison of rules and structures of Churches in the English Prayer Book tradition across the globe.

Sincere religion arouses strong feelings. Relationships and sexuality, among the matters where religion can be most judgemental, arouse equally rooted feelings in response; as may sincere atheism. We can expect the issues raised in this book to

become more, and not less topical; and its interdisciplinary essays, generously referenced, well-indexed and co-ordinated in an opening chapter in Chancellor Hill's inimitable style, will remain invaluable reference points for those seeking to grapple with them as the 1998 act begins to bite.

CARDIFF LAW SCHOOL

AUGUR PEARCE