

the identified theme. Matera's expertise is seen in his explanation of the verses, but the reader is left with an articulation that is much closer to theology than it is to spirituality. Matera does not entertain existential questions that arise as someone tries to live out this spirituality. Recognizing that Paul articulates a spirituality that is impacted by a twenty- to thirty-year gap between the lives of the followers of the earthly Jesus and those Paul is writing to, Matera does nothing to wrestle with the two-thousand-year gap between his readers and the people living in the churches Paul founded. Furthermore, by extracting the quotations from letters the historical exigencies that flesh out Paul's spiritual insights in each letter are lost, and so these insights become less rooted in life experience and therefore more difficult to apply to current life circumstances.

The book only partially succeeds. Matera's goal of writing for a wider audience is hindered by inadequate attention to the questions and problems that might emerge as members of that wider audience try to imitate Paul. This leads to a book that is closer to theology than it is to spirituality. Despite this limitation the book does provide the reader with a simple, clear, insightful center for Paul's spirituality and a succinct summary of themes in Paul that contribute to a fully formed Christian life.

PATRICIA SHARBAUGH
Saint Vincent College

Beyond Our Lights and Shadows: Charism and Institution in the Church. By Judith A. Merkle. London: Bloomsbury T&T Clark, 2016. xiv + 237 pages. \$106.04.

doi: 10.1017/hor.2018.116

The Spirit is free but everywhere is in ecclesiastical chains. This may be something of an overstatement, but it gets to the heart of the issue Judith Merkle sets out to address in her study of revitalization and adaptation in Roman Catholicism. Since at least the time of Max Weber, charism and institution have had something of a dialectical relation, the latter seen as the inevitable decline and capture of the former in what Robert Michels famously dubbed the "iron law of oligarchy." Notoriously obscure and ambiguous, on the one hand, and yet, greatly overdefined by Weber's typology, on the other, charism and its role within the church remain an underdeveloped aspect of the field of ecclesiology. This is complicated more for Catholics because of the association of charism with the institutions of religious orders. Merkle's work thus is a welcome contribution for its willingness to take on an often neglected and complex topic. Its central question focuses

on how charism offers a resource for faithful ecclesial renewal in a twenty-first-century context of globalism, secularism, pluralism, and advanced technology.

Written for those who want “more,” Merkle’s study seeks to offer construction materials, culled from sociology and theology, for those seeking to move down the paths of renewal, following on the trajectory of Vatican II. The initial three chapters of the book provide a theological, sociological, and ecclesial foundation for charism, exploring the notion and its use. Merkle provides a biblical and theological conception of charism as the Spirit-given power-to-human-flourishing, both in individuals and in institutions. This conception is then situated within the conditions of modern life, through an engagement with sociology. Part 1 concludes with a look at the role of community in contemporary life, indicating the role of the church in mediating, in and through charism, the *more* of human life.

Part 2 engages the reality of charism within a changing ecclesial context, offering a more detailed look at charism within the church, particularly focused on its presence in the laity. Merkle explores possibilities of renewal within newly emerging groups and communities where more meaningful and mutual connections are being established. She also shows how these new initiatives move beyond ideological entrenchments, tapping into deep desires and ushering in transformative movements that are beginning to reconfigure structures of participation. In part 3, Merkle offers an *aggiornamento* for charism within a contemporary framework, examining its place in a society of globalization, secularism, and technology. Parts 2 and 3 are the real purchase of the book, providing what I found to be a perceptive account of how an updating of charism might proceed within the church as well as how it might impact wider society. Indeed, Merkle’s stress on the need for new organizations and structures within the church that identify and incorporate the current expressions of charism, allowing them to reshape our communities, is prophetic and prescient. Additionally, her suggestion that the church needs to look to its charisms as a means of faithfully responding to forces of globalization and pluralism lays the groundwork for much fruitful reflection.

Yet, for all its insights, as a reader I remain confounded by the study’s failure to offer a richer ecclesiology. While the author is clear and adamant about the role of the institution and its tradition as well as emphasizing the gift of charism to each of the baptized, it is not always clear what real participation of the laity means for the church *as church*. Additionally, in her attempt to sketch an alternative to hierarchical and institutional conceptions of the church, Merkle tends to veer into a view that trades ecclesiology for cosmology wherein charism seems allied to a wider evolutionary movement

toward sacralization and purposiveness. I found this tension unresolved in the study, perhaps leaving the laity at times in the awkward position of being present and unnecessary as an ecclesiological member in a more universal search for meaning. The final few pages do turn toward the issue of church governance as well as the role of women in the church, but I think more space and detail should have been provided here. Whatever shortfalls I detect with Merkle's ecclesiology, however, I have no doubt that the volume will be of much help to institutions like my own, which seek to train the next leaders of the church for what will certainly be a disruptive century.

DANIEL P. RHODES

Institute of Pastoral Studies, Loyola University Chicago

The Prophetic Church: History and Doctrinal Development in John Henry Newman and Yves Congar. By Andrew Meszaros. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016. xv + 268 pages. \$99.00.
doi: 10.1017/hor.2018.111

With the publication of *The Prophetic Church*, Andrew Meszaros offers an impressive contribution to the ever-burgeoning field of Newman studies. Meszaros' work stands out from other recent studies of Newman's theology by offering an in-depth, carefully researched analysis of a topic that has yet to receive the kind of attention it deserves—namely, the reception of Newman's thought on the part of Yves Congar, one of the most important Catholic theologians of the twentieth century and an influential *peritus* at the Second Vatican Council. From the beginning, Meszaros rightly identifies Newman and Congar as two indispensable witnesses in theologians' ongoing efforts to articulate the truths of the Catholic faith in a way that is sufficiently attentive to the realities of historical conditioning and doctrinal development. As Meszaros observes, Newman's *Essay on Development* remains the *locus classicus* on the subject, while Congar's work, building on the structure that Newman set in place, constitutes a true landmark in the history of reception of Newman's theology.

The virtue of Congar and Newman is that both "were *historically conscious*, but they avoided *historicism*" (13). While working in eras when Catholic theology (at the official level) exhibited a certain level of wariness about the notion of doctrinal development, Newman and Congar conducted their work with eyes wide open, seeking to provide a coherent account of the reality of this development without compromising the objectivity of the deposit of faith. Ultimately, Congar—drawing from Newman—came to view