

## Book Reviews

**Constructing Musical Healing: The Wounds that Sing** by June Boyce-Tillman. London: Jessica Kingsley, 2000. 304 pp, £19.95 paperback.

As a young head of music in a London comprehensive school back in the late 1950s, I recall a general inspector advising me to transform the music room into a more humane place, an attractive area that would help induce feelings of empathy and humanity. He suggested that this might inspire the pupils to adopt a qualitatively different set of attitudes and values than those that might be prevailing in some other parts of the school.

June Boyce-Tillman's new book identifies and discusses the very issues that could render the education that we offer through music more engaging and relevant to those whom we teach. Nothing has done more harm to the cause of music education than the separation of the pursuit of music from the human and personal concerns of those who pursue it. Maslow (1971) once suggested that music has the capacity to become the model for the whole school curriculum in that it can satisfy many different human needs, and offers those 'peak experiences' that engage people at the depths of their psychology. Educators have rarely grasped the opportunities that the power of music offers people in real educational alliance.

There are immeasurable benefits from engaging in music beyond the merely cognitive and technical aspects which have largely occupied the minds of curriculum reformers. These relate to the deeper, more subjective, emotional and spiritual aspects of human existence that have only been fully acknowledged and mobilised by groups of music therapists. The power of the unconscious parts of our nature, particularly in relation to creative and symbolic impulse, is left relatively unconsidered by the majority of music teachers,

with the consequence that the very seat of motivation, the individual's personal experience and response to music, remains unrecognised. We then ask why music continues to be one of the least popular subjects within the curriculum. The separation of everyday life's experiences from educational content, particularly in the context of those areas of the curriculum that have significant affective components, has done much to alienate learners. In several senses we have failed to engage with our young people in those life-giving aspects which can be considered as engendering spiritual and moral well-being, nurturing and valuing individuality (Giddens, 1991; Yates, 2001).

The book presents a wide-ranging and rich mix of psychological, ethnomusicological, philosophical, educational, mythological and theological material. Into this rich tapestry is woven a concern to consider seriously New Age phenomena and to empathise with people's experiences and life stories.

In her introductory chapter June Boyce-Tillman's breadth of educational thinking is brought to bear on notions relating to self-knowledge and well-being. She confidently and knowledgeably addresses questions concerning the place of music in the process of healing in its widest sense, as well as describing its role in bringing about wholeness through a variety of forms of engagement. The wide-ranging subsections, on community/individualism, containment/freedom, expression/confidentiality, unity/diversity, challenge/nurture, excitement/relaxation, embodiment/transcendence, are revisited and further developed in the chapters that follow, offering the book, despite its all-embracing nature, a matrix-like structure. As the book unfolds, each of these aspects takes on new and powerful significance.

In her second chapter, which reviews the

work of a number of philosophers and thinkers, she further explores the notions of community, artistic freedom, the diversity of meanings of music, transcendence and beauty. This leads on naturally to her third chapter, which focuses on the healing qualities of music. Here Boyce-Tillman explores the healing power of music within Shamanic cultures to induce states of trance and possession, placing importance on movement and drumming in the nurturing and empowerment of the individual.

Chapter 4 explores New Age phenomena and its multiplicity of traditions that are emphasised as a necessary counterbalance against elitism, commercialism, materialism, racism and sexism. Boyce-Tillman sees these as the means of escape from the constraints of the Western classical tradition and of creating a unity between the energy of the cosmos and the self. She stresses the healing power of chanting, repetitive patterns and mantric syllables which induce transcendent states that are intrinsically healing.

The matrix-like structure of the book continues in Chapter 5, in which the author draws on the literature of therapeutic work through music with psychiatric patients and those with learning difficulties. The therapeutic alliance is seen as centrally important in inducing healing qualities of music. Here, Boyce-Tillman draws heavily on psychoanalytic theory and music therapy literature, exploring the role of free improvisation to engender feelings of confidence and containment in those patients whose personalities require a greater sense of integration.

In her final chapter, June Boyce-Tillman skilfully draws together the extraordinary amount of material she has covered by stressing the aspects of the individual, his or her need for containment and safety, particularly in improvisational activity. She goes on to see personal maturity as a balance between the creativity of the individual and personal engagement with the cultural environment. By

these means the individual is empowered. In her summary of the chapter the significance of the sub-title of the book becomes clear. Music may well manifest itself in the individual's search for a sense of wholeness and well-being, it may take root in association with feelings of incompleteness or even pain – indeed, wounds that sing.

This is essentially a book that considers the spirit in which we engage in music with others in all contexts; it is not essentially about the materials and techniques of teaching. Despite that, the book concludes with an appendix that offers some exemplars that relate to the sub-sections adopted throughout the book. This is followed by an appendix of useful addresses, comprehensive references, and the usual subject and author indices.

Very occasionally, a book is published that has the potential of seriously challenging current orthodoxy and practice. This is such a book. There is much here that will make some musicians and music teachers uncomfortable. References to spirituality, New Age, mysticism, transcendence, therapy, healing and wholeness will suggest to them that the book lies well outside the mainstream concerns of the real musician and educator. My great fear is that it will remain unread by those who are complacently comfortable with the current state of music education. Musicians, teachers, lecturers and student music teachers would all benefit from reading this book: it may assist them in widening their horizons beyond the constraints of the National Curriculum.

Those who know June Boyce-Tillman knew that this was the kind of book that she would eventually write. For it takes someone with insight, imagination and courage to write such a book. She has surpassed all expectations and in so doing has identified the very route that music education will need to take to emerge from its present cul-de-sac.

## References

- Giddens, A. (1991) *Modernity and Self-Identity: Self and Society in the Late Modern Age*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Maslow, A. (1971) 'What is a Taoistic teacher?' In L. J. Bubin (Ed), *Facts and Feelings in the Classroom*. London: Ward Lock.
- Yates, P. (2001) 'The experience of schooling and the sequestration of the spirit'. Unpublished paper given at the Eighth Annual Conference on Education, Spirituality and the Whole Child, 21–23 June, University of Surrey Roehampton.

ANTHONY KEMP  
University of Surrey Roehampton  
University of Reading

---

**Issues in Music Teaching** by C. Philpott and C. Plummeridge (Eds). London: Routledge Falmer, 2001. 258 pp, £15.99 paperback.

This book puts a rather bland title on a vibrant pink cover: fortunately, the vibrancy carries through into the writing within, and the contemplation of vague 'issues' is rare in the 18 wide-ranging chapters. The chapters are divided into three groups: a philosophical and reflective cluster, looking at the nature of music and its place in society; then a group more specifically focused on the curriculum, including discussion of assessment, instrumental teaching and ICT; and finally a section on professional development, which aims to send the reader to further sources of research and professional inspiration. Within each of these sections, the chapters vary in their approach and scope, with some clearly aiming to advise new and trainee teachers, whilst others present recent research in a less applied way, so encouraging critical thinking at all professional levels.

Philpott and Plummeridge begin their editorial introduction in confrontational mode, highlighting the spirit of diversity that has

remained unbroken despite government attempts to establish 'a kind of educational orthodoxy' (p. 1). They claim that the book is not 'simply a critique of government policy' (p. 1), and, indeed, the overall tone is one of commitment to the future of music education, with very little dwelling on the political and practical struggles of the recent past. This makes refreshing reading, and is a welcome move in the direction of professional autonomy. Plummeridge tackles other misperceptions of music teaching elsewhere in the book (Chapter 2, 'The justification for music education'), when he deals swiftly and decisively with current interest in the 'extra-musical benefits' of music learning (p. 24). He is perhaps unfair in attributing such beliefs to the researchers themselves, but certainly the media interpretation that 'Mozart makes you smarter' has disturbing implications for music in the curriculum, and requires a cautiously critical response from teachers. This chapter, along with those by Spruce and Kwami, challenges established definitions of music in education, and emphasises the importance of having a clear, individual rationale for everyday practice. These may be familiar messages, but it is refreshing to have them communicated in such an optimistic and direct way.

The editors state that the individual chapters 'represent a personal perspective' (p. 1), and whilst this absence of a central message gives the book part of its character, there is a discontinuity in the depth and scope of discussion across chapters which can be frustrating. Hennessy, in her chapter on the links between research and practice, questions the usefulness of 'all this rhetoric, advocacy, proselytising and articulate rationales' (p. 241). Theoretical writing has its place, but the more successful chapters in this volume tend to be those that focus on a particular research project and then connect those findings with the broader picture. Cox's historical survey of press coverage of music education over the past 75

years is one of the most satisfyingly self-contained of the chapters. He gives a snapshot summary of professional journals, including *Music in Education* and *Music Teacher*, using articles and readers' letters to form a picture of the main concerns of each historical moment, before drawing conclusions about how these changing priorities are of relevance to today's teachers. This is an example of an intriguing project, manageable enough to be carried out by practising teachers, which provides a model of the critical thinking necessary to read both media and research publications in the field of music education.

Another chapter that reports original research is Green's on 'Music in education and society', where she condenses a large-scale project on music and social groupings into a highly readable summary that should make new readers want to go on and find more of her work. Green's observations on gender and inclusivity are followed by Hallam's consideration of these ideas as they affect the instrumental lesson. It seems incongruous to start such a chapter with the statement 'Man created music' (p. 61) – in all other respects the book scores well for inclusive language within a coherent written style. Setting that aside, Hallam's ideas are interesting, and make useful connections between the classroom and the instrumental lesson, and between school and the child's wider environment. The interest in activities beyond school is taken up by Adams, in her survey of community music-making, and indeed this book is full of such connections, which allow the reader to flit from one chapter to another, forming a view of music education that draws on research in a diversity of related disciplines.

Each chapter concludes with three or four 'questions for discussion', a device which gives the book a more didactic tone than might otherwise have been the case. Some of these questions are interesting and engaging: 'The prevailing paradigm of the Western classical

music tradition needs to be changed if music education in educational institutions is to do justice to the world's music. Discuss' (p. 154). At other times, the questions are little more than comprehension tests on the preceding chapter: 'Why have combined arts declined in popularity in recent years?' (p. 140); or else are so loaded as to close down any discussion that might follow: 'Are there moral issues surrounding access to musical tuition and musical achievement?' (p. 168). These questions make a contribution to the book's usefulness as a course text, but might also have the effect of distancing the more general reader by taking a more overtly 'instructive' stance than is usually found within the chapters.

The most interesting question comes on the back cover: 'What does it mean to be musically educated?' This, of course, is at the heart of all practice and research in music education. Multi-faceted answers are to be found within *Issues in Music Teaching*: if to be 'musically educated' means to have experienced a wide variety of music and musical activities, practitioners will find valuable reflections on many of them here. If it means to have attempted to understand what music *is*, there are thought-provoking discussions within this volume too which broaden the debate beyond the practicalities of the classroom. This book takes its place alongside a number of similar publications: a new version of Spruce's (1996) edited volume *Teaching Music* is in preparation, and there are recent guides to specific aspects of teaching music by other authors in this volume, including Cain (1998), Hallam (1998) and Hennessy (1998). Where this book differs is in its variety of approaches, so that the authors between them offer practical and philosophical perspectives on many aspects of the music teacher's role. The close connections between research and practice are also a welcome feature, demonstrating the relevance of much current academic thinking, and making

research in the classroom a more realistic proposition. I would recommend this book to all who are interested in the current state of music education, not least because its authors – and particularly its editors – present a refreshingly optimistic and energetic view of music in schools. This is idealism rooted in reality – surely the most healthy perspective for anyone involved in education.

#### References

- CAIN, T. (1998) *Keynote*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- HALLAM, S. (1998) *Instrumental Teaching: A Practical Guide to Better Teaching and Learning*. Oxford: Heinemann.
- HENNESSY, S. (1998) *Coordinating Music Across the Primary School*. London: Falmer Press.
- SPRUCE, G. (Ed) (1996) *Teaching Music*. London: Routledge.

STEPHANIE PITTS  
University of Sheffield

---

#### Composing in the Classroom: The Creative

**Dream** by Anice Paterson. UK: The National Association of Music Educators (NAME) and Bath Spa University College, 2000. 41 pp, £5.00 paperback.

*Composing in the Classroom* is a booklet which offers a guide to effective practice in the teaching of composing in secondary schools. Through shared findings of research drawn from observations and discussion with teachers and pupils from 26 volunteer secondary schools across the UK, this booklet offers important insights into the nature and potential, the complexity and diversity, of the creative experience of pupils composing at Key Stage 3 in the present National Curriculum in Music for England and Wales. The research findings support a set of principles based on the effective practice of teaching composing in classrooms.

The booklet is divided into seven sections. The opening section introduces the research methodology and the closing section summarises the research findings. These sections flank the five middle sections which concern: (i) the composing process; (ii) curriculum aspects; (iii) managing creative work; (iv) use of sound sources; and (v) resource management. Interwoven into each section are case studies from project schools designed to provide models of good teaching practice. The case studies provide exemplars from a range of school contexts, within classrooms from Years 7–11 where pupils were observed composing in response to varied tasks and teaching methods.

Each section is organised around six brief perspectives. Rendered in different text types, these include: (i) general editorial discussion; (ii) what pupils say; (iii) what teachers say; (iv) what the research tells us; (v) summary statements from the questionnaires; (vi) springboards for suggested activities; and (vii) thumbnail sketches of good practice observed in the teaching of composing. Each section offers a glimpse of the nature and diversity of compositional activities as both formative and reflective of musical understanding. This is one of the most refreshing aspects of the booklet, in the sense that it acknowledges a pluralistic perspective for developing understanding of composing in classrooms and of the importance of reflective engagement. However, whether this approach really gets inside the issues sufficiently to render them as understanding for changing practice remains to be seen.

The research project includes data collected from observations, interviews and questionnaires and builds on the substantial work done by Professor George Odam in curriculum and Jo Glover on composing in the primary school (see Odam (2000) for full report).

A number of key research questions are asked which concern the nature of composing and the skills young people in schools need to

develop, as well as particular methodologies and conditions appropriate for effective music practice. The value to teachers of these questions might be to help think about how we acknowledge the range of perspectives that exists in our classrooms – the multiple lenses through which our students view how composing works as self-expression, craft, learning strategy, and about the judgements made and assessment of learning. These are things about which pupils can talk eloquently and act on a basis of common experience. What this booklet does well is promote the importance of listening to pupils talking and watching them in action and in interaction. This is particularly important as the effectiveness of music in the curriculum is put increasingly into question.

Paterson (and team researcher Odam) uses the notion of ‘the creative dream’, borrowed from Professor John Paynter, as a metaphor for reflecting on important influences on music education, and reminding us that the notion of fostering musical understanding through composition remains at the heart of the music curriculum. This project warmly acknowledges, both historically and philosophically, John Paynter’s legacy of a creative vision for the music curriculum in schools. The project is forward-looking in its desire to renew and revive the ‘dream’ by identifying what constitutes good practice in the teaching of composing in secondary school classrooms.

But how has composing been conceived within the work of the creative dream? Whilst composing in classrooms can be approached as a craft, skill, as creative self-expression, as social interaction, a teaching and learning strategy, with music and musical understanding as the priorities, what is not clear in this project is precisely *what* constitutes composing and *why* improvising and composing are subsumed ‘under the one heading of Composing’. Despite a section which acknowledges there is no clear consensus about what constitutes ‘improvising and composing’, there is no attempt to probe

inside the conflation of terms, nor to explore the relationship between improvising and composing as they pertain to composing in classrooms.

The idea that there is ‘all the way through the process of composing’ (p. 9) a pathway along which all composers pass, suggests that activities may be limited, or may be detached from rather than connected to the lived experience of young people. Here, I am thinking of the different processes which children would use to ‘compose a piece using the same technique as a piece the class has heard by Berio; pupils work in pairs or threes with acoustic instruments’ (see Case Study of a Year 8 class, p. 22) as compared to ‘composing a piece on keyboards in the lab to a given structure’ (Case Study of a Year 8 class, p. 33) or the aural process of composing more frequently used by bands. The notion that there is a variety of approaches to composing in classrooms – whether in groups or as individuals, on acoustic or digital instruments, dealing with pupils with or without formal musical training from a variety of cultures – appears to be largely ignored. This leads me to ask to what extent as teachers we acknowledge the range of culturally defined musical practices that exists, and the degree to which our views on composing need to be reconceptualised.

One of the strengths of this booklet is that the writing is overwhelmingly approachable, serving the needs of teachers in secondary, middle and primary schools. Another strength includes its wealth of pupil and teacher talk. The extracts from interview transcripts are interesting in their own right. I was struck particularly by the differing views about the effects of performance skills on composing. One pupil said ‘there are two groups of people: one lot who can get Grade VIII practical but can’t compose at all and those who feel that composing is about feeling and not about being able to play’ (p. 8). In contrast, another pupil said: ‘My composing improves as I get better at

playing my own instrument' (p. 17). Here, one is reminded of Swanwick & Franca's (1999) important findings on the differences between performance skills in composition and performance itself. They concluded that 'the problem of (in)appropriateness of skills in instrumental performance needs to be put into perspective' (ibid., p. 13). Other readers will have their own favourite quotations which draw attention to the relationship between revealing understanding and developing understanding – and psychological barriers to musical creativity.

Some of the subtle ways teaching pedagogy serves to promote creativity in composing is illustrated in examples from the classroom. A wealth of invaluable practical planning tips are also offered (for example, 'Try This' sections offer suggested activities, and 'Features of a Noisy Classroom' will interest teachers in secondary and primary schools), with snapshots of useful case studies which set out to illustrate the practical problems to consider when planning for composing in a way that focuses on educating for an awareness of and respect for the creative process.

The creative dream challenges us to value creative diversity in our classrooms and questions notions of how we acquire the language of music and provide appropriate classroom conditions and resources, to allow learning through composing that includes opportunities for application, aesthetic engagement and reflection. Whilst examples derive from secondary classrooms, they offer such rich ideas that they could be modified in many cases for younger groups. Sections contain so much other rich content for reflection that I am sure teachers across a broad range of levels will find invaluable insights for practical application.

What the creative dream does promote is the need to listen to children talking and to watch them in action and in interaction as teachers and as teacher-researchers. It also promotes the need to know what opportunities

composing offers for young people to play out their competitions for ownerships or less cooperative struggles of the individual against the group. In other words, what priority pupils give to certain tasks over others. The creative dream is about ways of meeting these challenges.

This booklet will be of interest to many readers, including teachers, teacher-researchers and trainees alike. It is a helpful resource because it is about looking ahead, recognising what is effective music teaching; it acknowledges the importance of the pupil voice, it provides a set of teaching resources for classroom music teachers and the post-primary music curriculum, it promotes ways of thinking about, to dialogue with, guide, and above all to witness the creative process and the role of creativity in composing. In my view, this booklet is a 'must' for teachers (and researchers) who want to cherish and nurture 'the creative dream' – this booklet goes a long way towards encouraging its realisation.

#### References

- ODAM, G. (2000) 'Teaching composing in secondary schools: the creative dream'. *British Journal of Music Education*, **17**, 2, 109–27.
- SWANWICK, K. & FRANCA, C. C. (1999) 'Composing, performing and audience-listening as indicators of musical understanding'. *British Journal of Music Education*, **16**, 1, 5–19.

PAMELA BURNARD  
University of Cambridge

---

#### Ongoma! Notes on Namibian Music

**Instruments** by Minette Mans. Namibia: Gamsberg Macmillan Publishers (Pty) Ltd, 2000 (reprint). 135 pp, R69.00 paperback.

One of the reasons that the author gives for writing this book is to give learners 'the

opportunity to *make* music'. The author goes on to state that she has 'provided some ideas for classroom activities' in order to 'encourage creative thinking (without being prescriptive)'. She wants teachers to tap into their own resourcefulness as the 'activities suggested . . . are only a beginning, and are an attempt to break away from knowledge based on facts alone' (p. vii). Some sensible educational principles are noted, such as the employment of learning processes, a focus on the learner, and the use of qualitative and expressive objectives. An active involvement in music and dancing is to be encouraged as well as an articulation by learners involving appraising and communicating 'their understanding, thoughts and feelings about what they are doing' (p. viii).

Obviously, this informative book focuses on Namibian musical instruments as stated in its title; but it does much more than that. In addition to an introduction (Chapter 1), notes on orthography, an 'annexure', 'addendum', references and a glossary, the writer adopts a broad ethnomusicological approach. In so doing, she devotes a chapter to each of the four classes of musical instruments – idiophones (Chapter 3), chordophones (Chapter 4), membranophones (Chapter 5) and aerophones (Chapter 6).

The notes on orthography, preceding the first chapter of the book, are based on Bantu languages. The information includes the various types of clicks used and gives an indication of the difficulty that teachers not conversant with the languages have to deal with. These notes are welcome as they give some guidance on how the vernacular words should be pronounced.

The first chapter, titled 'Teaching African music', is a particularly useful one as it outlines some general principles, problems and issues that need to be considered, including the adoption of a holistic approach. The chapter is divided into ten short sections as follows: 'main principles', 'music as a teaching/learning

medium', 'instrumental music', 'contextualising curriculum content', 'authenticity and context', 'the use of audio-visual materials', 'the vernacular of original materials', 'the temptation to "adapt" original materials', 'transcribing music and dance of oral cultures' and 'some musical characteristics'.

At the end of the rather short second chapter, on the classification of instruments, the author includes 'tasks for the class' (as she does for the following four chapters). I see this chapter as a prelude to the main chapters (3–6). Although its contents can easily be adapted for classroom teaching, it seems to sit a little uneasily within the structure of the whole work, mainly because it has no introductory, explanatory or contextual setting but launches straight into a discussion of the four ethnomusicological classes of instruments.

In the chapters on the different instrumental classifications, each instrument is described in terms of how it is made, played and used. Information is also given on the broader cultural context involving dances and also on other cultural contexts in which particular instruments are used.

The Annexure, subtitled 'music and tradition', deals with 'two different Namibian cultural music practices' (p. 103), the *epera* and *uudhano* dances, which feature in earlier chapters. In the description, there is a discussion of their cultural and historical background and 'material traits'. There are also helpful notes on drumming, singing and dancing including the sequence of foot movements used.

Although the Addendum is entitled 'The teaching of African drums' and consists of notes 'compiled by Dominic Lunenge' (p. 119), it is in fact devoted to the playing of specific Namibian drums. It has some useful suggestions on hand drumming techniques, although the ways in which these can be applied to classroom work are not explored. Also, it might

have been more useful for teachers if the specific rhythmic patterns mentioned had been presented in written or recorded notation.

Finally, the useful glossary, which concludes the book, gives vernacular names, their English equivalents and where they are cited in the book.

Within the ethnomusicological parameters defined by the author there is an attempt to avoid a Western music bias. However, the extent to which a broader, more interculturalist stance can be taken is limited bearing in mind the title and subject matter. A criticism that could be made is that the book is too specific and specialised in terms of general curricular usage and applicability. Although a minor point, more musical examples could have been given. The presentation of notation in a more neutral way of representation as outlined is helpful for the generalist teacher. However, for some music teachers this may sometimes be cumbersome, notwithstanding the arguments tendered in favour of authenticity and context. I believe teachers would welcome the inclusion of a discography, and recorded examples (on a CD); perhaps this needs to be considered in a future revision or addition to the work.

I do not think this book is quite 'an introductory resource book for teachers', as stated in its sub-title. Its avoidance of specificity and prescription partly accounts for this view, although one can identify with the writer's reasons for adopting a more general stance with regard to curricular applications. I am sure many teachers would appreciate more phase-specific examples in the tasks given. Also, there is a need for teachers to adopt a broader and more interculturalist stance if the materials are to have a more extensive applicability. Nevertheless, as I have outlined above, there is much in the book to commend it. I see it as a useful addition to my library of books on the musics of Africa, and as a resource into which teachers can dip for information and advice about classroom activities in music irrespective

of whether this be at the primary or secondary level.

ROBERT KWAMI

University of London Institute of Education

---

**Tuning In: Practical Psychology for Musicians who are Teaching, Learning and Performing. Handbook and Home Study Course** by Lucinda Mackworth-Young.

Swaffham, Norfolk: MMM Publications, 2000. 137 pp, £12.99 paperback.

This book is aimed at instrumental and singing teachers and performers. It is relevant to all age groups and levels of pupils and to both individual and small group teaching.

What marks this book as exceptional is that it draws on both the right brained, holistic, creative and affective areas and on the left brained, methodical, analytical and cognitive areas of psychological research. Many other authors concentrate on one area to the neglect of the other. Since it makes the fruits of research readily available to the reader in clear, jargon-free language, no previous knowledge of psychology is necessary in order to benefit from this book.

The book is designed to promote productive reflection on experience in the light of various psychological principles explained. Each section starts with an exploration of the reader's own personal experience by working through the exercises provided, then the underlying psychological principles are explained in a way that is relevant and easy to grasp. Practical suggestions are then given for improving teaching, learning and performing in the light of the psychological understanding gained. Most chapters end with a summary and practical checklist and all allow space for personal reflection and its recording.

Various important areas are explored, beginning with the pupil's emotions and the role of the teacher. First impressions, learning

anxiety and the teacher as care-giver and critic are discussed. Insight is given into the 'inner child' in the role of the pupil and the transference of the 'inner parent', 'inner carer' and 'inner critic' role from the teacher to the pupil. In the chapter on learning and teaching, useful explanations of both the cognitive/intellectual and affective/emotional principles related to teaching are given. The inclusive approach used here enables teachers to reinforce what they are already doing well in their teaching and to pay attention to those areas in which they fall short. Teaching styles (teacher-directed, pupil-directed) are also discussed, again in a usefully inclusive way. The writer avoids appearing to have the 'right' answer, but encourages the reader to select methods as they are appropriate in a variety of circumstances and with a variety of pupils.

The chapter on emotions, motivation and practice explores useful suggestions about imagery and self-report and considers in depth the mechanisms involved in motivating pupils to practise. Chapter 4 is particularly important, dealing with the somewhat nebulous, but crucial, area of inter-personal energy and its role in the teacher-pupil relationship. The chapter provides a framework in which positive and negative feelings can be articulated and discussed and thus be brought under control and harnessed for the good of pupils and teachers alike. Internal pressures, fears and insecurities on the part of pupil and teacher are discussed and gain, to my mind, very considerably from being brought out into the open in a manageable way.

The next two chapters, practical activities for fun and energy raising, and group teaching, as well as the chapters on age-related guidelines and action research, are straightforward and useful. The following chapter looks in greater depth at the teacher-pupil-parent relationship. The concepts of 'inner parent', 'inner carer' and 'inner critic' outlined in the first chapter are taken up again

to inform thinking. The mutual, but sometimes conflicting, needs of parents and teachers are explored and useful examples are given of ways of dealing with difficulties. The chapter on anxiety, communication and safety in performance again draws on all the psychological concepts previously discussed. This is a valuable chapter, equally useful for performers themselves and for teachers encouraging pupils to become performers.

The lack of any obvious coherent sequence to the chapters could perhaps be criticised. It is not easy, on the other hand, to propose a logical framework that could have been used. It does, one hopes, leave the way open to the inclusion of further areas in future publications.

This book would, in my opinion, be equally useful to the beginning teacher and to the vastly experienced one. It would be equally useful to an individual seeking to gain fresh ideas and to the serious student undertaking a higher degree or engaging in pedagogical research. The final chapter on action research is particularly valuable to the latter category. I most strongly recommend this book, a bargain at the price of £12.99, and will most certainly include it in my own students' lists of required reading.

PHILOMENA ALSTON  
P. M. Consultancy

---

**Touching Eternity: The Enduring Outcomes of Teaching** by Tom Barone. New York: Teachers College, Columbia University, Columbia, 2001. 208 pp, \$50 hardback, \$22.95 paperback.

This book is about the long-term influences on his pupils of one highly regarded North American arts teacher, Don Forrester, who lived and worked in a small-town high school of 500 students in the Appalachian mountains. It should be made clear that Forrester worked in

the visual arts: music, we are told, was catered for through the school band programme. Readers might wonder therefore about the relevance of a review such as this in a music education journal. In fact I suggest the book presents a model we could apply to possible research in our own field, through its judicious use of life story, life history and narrative methodologies, not only applicable to school music teachers, but also to studio music teachers.

The book is in four parts. The first introduces us to the teacher and his students, whom Tom Barone, a university researcher, met in the early 1980s. Arts and crafts were valued in the school because they provided a possible escape from unemployment, which regionally stood at 26.2 per cent. Forrester was the only art teacher, a self-reliant man, independent in thought and action. He managed, in a high profile arts programme, to attain some sort of balance between the competing claims of aesthetic and utilitarian values. In doing so he developed a course that was instructive and inspirational. Students were motivated by working hard at self-expression; the freedom to do what they wanted was channelled into purposeful actions. They talked of a process of personal unfolding.

In the second part of the book we are introduced to the voices of nine adults, former students of Forrester, whom Barone interviewed during the late 1990s. In these stories and recollections we meet with descriptions of the teacher as hero. Forrester encouraged his students to look at things differently, and to regard their lives as artistic works in progress. Among others we are introduced to a waiter, a parole officer, a magician and a fashion designer. Barry's story in particular sticks in the memory. He was a student 'in a hurry' who loved cookery and photography. In the art class he felt born again. Forrester expected the extraordinary from him. Barry eventually became a waiter in San Francisco, and came to

realise that one's own life could be an artistic achievement. For him the aesthetic pleasures derived from a round of waiting on dinnertime tables had a fulfilment that made him feel fully alive.

The tables are turned in the third part of the book, and we encounter Forrester himself. Since childhood he had sought asylum in the woods surrounding his home, and at the age of seven entered them equipped with his sketch pad and pencil. What motivated him was a love of the natural environment, and a desire to recast this into craftsmanship. Forrester's job was his life. He not only invested all his time into it, but also thousands of dollars over the years in buying materials for his teaching. But he showed a general lack of deference to those in authority, symbolised by his long hair and manner of dress. By the 1990s he was becoming disenchanted with the takeover of Appalachian life by corporate America, including MTV, standardised testing, test scores and grades. He was chagrined that few of his students had been engaged in the making of art when they left school, and instead had been tempted by corporate business and smart entrepreneurship.

Barone then invites the reader to decide on two theoretical perspectives in the analysis of Forrester's work. On the one hand we can either support the notion of Forrester as a singular hero, or be more sceptical about the long-range results. The dualisms are apparent: the contrast between the useful and the beautiful, and between Forrester's personal magnetism and pedagogical prowess and the hegemony of utilitarian culture. And here Barone touches perhaps on the weakness of Forrester's position: he refused to enter the realm of the political, and to draw a link between art and politics. Barone asks whether this was one of the reasons why Forrester's students were unable to resist the temptations of individualistic and corrosive culture.

Finally, Barone tells us something of the

methodology he employed. He contrasts those researchers who refuse to allow the stories of school people to stand alone, unadorned, with those who privilege the voice of the informant. Barone reaches a reasonable compromise, he believes, by turning a collection of life stories into a collective life history through critique. He is open about the tacit research bargain he struck: he contributed writing skills and access to publishing venues, while the participants contributed autobiographical data and interview time. This resulted in the patchwork of impressions we encounter in the book through verbatim transcripts, life stories and literary constructions.

But what potential is there in all this for music educators? Perhaps the book provides a model for exploring the question 'How do you define a good music teacher?' We need to know how music teachers function within their social structure: one of the great strengths of this book is that it provides a vivid portrait of the place in which Forrester situated himself.

We also want to believe we can make a significant difference through our work. Is it possible that our students are able to transfer the effects of our teaching to other areas of their lives, as happened to some of Forrester's alumni? Barone's long-term look at the influences of one teacher provides us with grounds for hope, but also prompts us to question the relationship between our own work as music educators and explanatory concepts like power, ideology and marginalisation.

The book provides, for arts educators, a model for developing narrative research and a chance to encounter an eloquent exposition of some elements of postmodernism. But ultimately it is essential reading for those who want to face the Big Questions that Barone poses, which interrogate Henry Adams's remark, 'A teacher affects eternity; he can never tell where his influence stops'.

GORDON COX  
University of Reading